

2020 Instructional Material Summer Review Institute

Review Team Appraisal of Title
(9-12 English Language Arts)

This appraisal form is provided for use by educators responsible for the selection of instructional materials for implementation with districts and charter schools across New Mexico to meet the need of their student populations.

This appraisal form should be used in conjunction with the publisher provided Form D: Research Based Effectiveness Determination that supports this reviewed material which can be found on the Instructional Material Bureau website.

<https://webnew.ped.state.nm.us/bureaus/instructional-materials/the-adoption-cycle/>

Text Title	Mirrors & Windows: Connecting with Literature - Grade 11	Publisher	Carnegie Learning, Inc.
SE ISBN	9781533836687	TE ISBN	9781533836755
SW ISBN		Grade Level	

Core Instructional Material Designation (Core Instructional Material is the comprehensive print or digital educational material, including basal material, which constitutes the necessary instructional components of a full academic course of study in those subjects for which the department has adopted content standards and benchmarks.)

Recommended
(90% and above)



Recommended with Reservations
(80-89%)



Not Recommended and Not Adopted
(below 80%)



Total Score - Below is the final score for the materials averaged between the team of reviewers.

Average Score
90%

Cultural and Linguistic Relevance Recognition - Materials are reviewed for criteria pertaining to the support for teachers and students in the material regarding cultural relevance and the inclusion of a culturally responsive lens. Those materials receiving a score of 90% or above on the CLR portion of the review receive this recognition.

CLR Recognition



Average Score
81%

Materials take into account cultural perspectives.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence (autofilled from All Content Appraisal tab):

Materials provide some cultural perspectives and have students compare different perspectives to their own culture. Cultural diversity is limited in the reading selections in the text, although the online platform provides more diversity for teachers to utilize. While the text does meet the expectation for cultural diversity in regard to selections offered, the overall look and feel of the book is not as diverse in design.

Materials include a culturally responsive lens.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence (autofilled from All Content Appraisal tab):

Materials are limited in supporting cultural values and literature. When addressing cultural perspectives, the text presents questions in a non-affirming or "othering" lens. Online literature selections provide more diverse options, but do not always acknowledge cultural strengths and values.

Standards Review - Materials are reviewed for alignment with the state adopted content standards, benchmarks and performance standards.

Average Score

90%

Materials align with grade level standards overall.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials align with grade level standards overall, especially when using the eSelections online resources. This is evidenced through anchor texts with Depth of Knowledge (DOK) questions at the end of each reading selection and through writing, grammar/vocabulary, and speaking/listening workshops.

Materials align to reading standards.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials show alignment through a wide variety of reading selections and genres, although many of the more diverse offerings are only available online. Reading selections are rigorous, as evidenced through the choice of anchor texts and the variety of selections from the Grade 11 College and Career Readiness (CCR) text complexity band. There are also fluency reading activities available online for diverse reading levels.

Materials align to writing standards.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials show attention to the development of writing skills, as evidenced through writing workshops at the end of each unit. These workshops teach informative, expository, narrative, argumentative, and rhetorical writing, all necessary for the Grade 11 standardized tests. Writing is also enhanced through the material's focus on vocabulary, grammar, and spelling skills. Materials also contain extensive writing rubrics online, as well as more basic rubrics embedded in the writing workshops.

Materials align to speaking and listening standards.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials include frequent speaking and listening workshops focused on the skills addressed in the standards and providing opportunities for collaborative group work. These workshops are engaging, allowing for in-depth teacher/student discussion and demonstration of deeper understandings. Often, presentations encourage students to explore contemporary issues.

Materials align to language standards.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials provide a varied selection of exercises related to language standards, including prefixes/suffixes, cognates, compound words, connotative/denotative words, spelling, figurative language, and grammar conventions. There are also supplemental language activities online. The online Language Handbook is a great learning tool for student reference. It is offered in a print format, but it's unclear if it is a supplemental text or add-on text.

Materials align to New Mexico content standards for ELA.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials partially align to New Mexico content standards for ELA. Materials present some Native American literature at the beginning of the textbook, but do not provide many Hispanic selections. The online resources do provide more Hispanic literature than the textbook. The online resources also provide an All Standards tab that shows each NM standard and the pages in the text which correlate with that standard.

ELA Content Review - Materials are reviewed for relevant criteria pertaining to the support for teachers and students in the specific content area reviewed.

Average Score

93%

Materials provide a selection and range of high-quality texts worthy of students' time and attention, exhibiting exceptional craft and thought and/or providing useful information.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials provide a range of high quality texts in anchor text, which is enhanced when the online materials are used. The anchor texts provide a foundation for each unit to build upon, and supplemental selections connect and extend the anchor texts through poetry, drama, and informational texts.

Questions in the materials are high-quality text-dependent and text-specific questions. The overwhelming majority of these questions are text-specific and draw student attention to the particulars in the text.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Questions in the materials are of high quality and occur after each reading selection, and they focus on Bloom's taxonomy. Students are asked to reference and reason with the text, allowing for text-dependent answers and critical thinking, as well as group discussion. Extension questions allow for creative projects and presentations. Text-to-Text and Mirrors & Windows questions provide opportunities for students to relate the material to their own experiences and to other texts.

Materials provide scaffolding and supports to enable students' learning of English language arts.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

The materials show an awareness for the need to address special needs and English Language Learner differentiation, but the accommodations and scaffolding are limited. This is evidenced through accommodations that include "rereading slowly," working with more advanced students and drawing pictures, rather than more hands-on learning support. Many of the differentiation strategies require one-on-one support. The online materials provide a selection of audiobooks that support reading fluency and disability issues.

All Content Review - Materials are reviewed for relevant criteria pertaining to the support for teachers and students in the material regarding the progression of the standards, lesson structure, pacing, assessment, individual learners and cultural relevance.

Average Score

88%

Materials are coherent and consistent with the high school standards that all students should study in order to be college and career ready.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials are consistent with grade 11 standards. A reference to college career readiness skills is evidenced by the Applied English skills sections that address applications, resumes, media literacy, and lifelong learning skills.

Materials are well designed and take into account effective lesson structure and pacing.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials provide a pacing guide in writing and picture format in the textbook. At the beginning of each unit, a Scope and Sequence timeline offers a big picture of where the learning is headed and supports teacher instructional design. A customizable online pacing guide supports lesson plans. The structure of lessons is relevant and clear for 11th grade standards. Text provides suggestions to the teacher for structuring discussions and assessing student understanding; these suggestions include ways to incorporate critical thinking, extend the text assignments, and make text-to-text connections.

Materials support teacher planning, learning, and understanding of the standards.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials include an extensive lesson plan section online that is editable to support teacher planning. The teacher marginal notes throughout the text provide guidance during instruction to draw out student learning and engagement. The material also gives teacher guidance through "Teach the Selection" teacher notes that address a specific skill, vocabulary, or connection to a text or historical event.

Materials offer teachers resources and tools to collect ongoing data about student progress on the standards.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials offer an online reading fluency assessment section, as well as online grading, that tracks student progress on skills and content.

Materials support effective use of technology to enhance student learning. Digital materials are accessible and available in multiple platforms.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials address media literacy and provide multiple opportunities for students to research online and create multimedia presentations using digital resources. Materials themselves contain digital resources, such as audio books, video clips and annotation tools. These are available in both HP and MAC platforms.

Materials can be easily customized for individual learners.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials provide a degree of customization through resources online and by using differentiated workbooks. There is a wide variety of choices in assignments that teachers can choose from to customize appropriately for individual learners.

Materials give all students extensive opportunities and support to explore key concepts.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials give opportunities through a variety of methods to support all students' exploration of key concepts. Methods include: discussion, creative writing, analysis of literary terms, and role playing activities.

Materials take into account cultural perspectives.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials provide some cultural perspectives and have students compare different perspectives to their own culture. Cultural diversity is limited in the reading selections in the text, although the online platform provides more diversity for teachers to utilize. While the text does meet the expectation for cultural diversity in regard to selections offered, the overall look and feel of the book is not as diverse in design.

Materials include a culturally responsive lens.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials are limited in supporting cultural values and literature. When addressing cultural perspectives, the text presents questions in a non-affirming or "othering" lens. Online literature selections provide more diverse options, but do not always acknowledge cultural strengths and values.

Reviewers' Professional Summation - These materials are reviewed by Level II and Level III educators from across New Mexico. The reviewers have brought their knowledge, experience and expertise into the review of these materials. They offer here their individual summary of the material as a whole.

Reviewer #: 13

Background and experience:

Level III teacher with 20 years experience in teaching English Language Arts in grades 7-12, masters degree in Pedagogy and Instructional design. Endorsed in History, English, and TESOL certified.

Professional summary of material:

This curriculum provides teachers and students alike with texts rich in complexity and historical connections. The scope and sequence guide offers an organized and broad overview of each unit's pacing which helps teachers with lesson planning and instructional design. Both printed and digital resources are loaded with ample creative activities to support and grow student mastery of content knowledge and skills. Each lesson offers multiple opportunities for written expression of knowledge that scaffold and spiral to ensure student progress through the various levels of critical thinking and writing practice aimed toward student growth and understanding. Text selection is anchored on traditional literature pieces, while also incorporating newer and more diversified texts by authors of varied cultural backgrounds to support anchor pieces and better connect with learners. However, the majority of those texts are only offered in the electronic version of the curriculum. The instructional design of the curriculum balances a need for teacher preparedness with student engagement and learning.

Reviewer #: 14

Background and experience:

Level III teacher with 20 years of experience in both Middle School and High School English Language Arts and Social Studies. Licensed for both special education and general education. Endorsed in ELA, SS, Business. National Board Certified teacher (original and renewed.)

Professional summary of material:

Overall, this material covers the CCSS well and has a great online program that offers full text versions of materials, teacher guides, assessments, differentiation and reading proficiency materials. A teacher should fully use the eSelections, which include audio versions with real voice actors instead of a robotic voice, for special needs and ELL students. The pacing guide and editable lesson plans are a plus for a new teacher. The Language Arts Workshops listed on xxxi make finding a specific workshop easier, but the Range of Reading on T30-31 would be more friendly if it were alphabetized within the genres. The workshops offer units on writing, vocabulary and grammar, speaking/listening and language skills that are presented in an easy to use format. The anchor texts are well chosen and offer a variety of Native American, Hispanic, and African American literature, but the core is still British literature. The Text-to-Text features are a plus and make connecting text easier. As a special education teacher, I would like to see more color and creative pictures to engage my students. The section on Refer to Text and Respond to Text are well written and cover a range of Bloom's DOK skills. To make full use of the text, a teacher should be aware that they need to use the online platform.

Reviewer #: 15

Background and experience:

Level III teacher with 30 years of experience in 9-12 English, including ELD, honors, and AP classes. Currently serving as Humanities Department Chair.

Professional summary of material:

This is an effective curriculum with extensive online resources. There is a lot of teacher support, ranging from suggestions for discussion questions to numerous group activities and creative options. The materials are high quality and appropriately rigorous with plenty of guidance for differentiation and enrichment. At the end of each unit, Writing, Speaking/Listening, and Vocabulary/Grammar workshops focus on standards-based skills. The materials include diverse authors and perspectives, but the majority of the diverse literature, including those by Hispanic authors, is limited to the online materials. It is there if you look for it, but teachers should know to make full use of the eSelections to increase the diversity of the curriculum. Similarly, there are separate workbooks for ELL differentiation, enrichment, and reading proficiency. If teachers want to include full length texts, the online resources include many titles from the Gr. 11-CCR text complexity band.