

2020 Instructional Material Summer Review Institute

Review Team Appraisal of Title
(9-12 English Language Arts)

This appraisal form is provided for use by educators responsible for the selection of instructional materials for implementation with districts and charter schools across New Mexico to meet the need of their student populations.

This appraisal form should be used in conjunction with the publisher provided Form D: Research Based Effectiveness Determination that supports this reviewed material which can be found on the Instructional Material Bureau website.

<https://webnew.ped.state.nm.us/bureaus/instructional-materials/the-adoption-cycle/>

Text Title	Mirrors & Windows: Connecting with Literature - Grade 10	Publisher	Carnegie Learning, Inc.
SE ISBN	9781533836670	TE ISBN	9781533836748
SW ISBN		Grade Level	10

Core Instructional Material Designation (Core Instructional Material is the comprehensive print or digital educational material, including basal material, which constitutes the necessary instructional components of a full academic course of study in those subjects for which the department has adopted content standards and benchmarks.)

Recommended
(90% and above)

Recommended with Reservations
(80-89%)

Not Recommended and Not Adopted
(below 80%)

Total Score - Below is the final score for the materials averaged between the team of reviewers.

Average Score
78%

Cultural and Linguistic Relevance Recognition - Materials are reviewed for criteria pertaining to the support for teachers and students in the material regarding cultural relevance and the inclusion of a culturally responsive lens. Those materials receiving a score of 90% or above on the CLR portion of the review receive this recognition.

CLR Recognition

Average Score
85%

Materials take into account cultural perspectives.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence (autofilled from All Content Appraisal tab):

The materials take into account cultural perspectives of the authors and students. The theory of being open minded to diverse views, is reflected in the title, Mirrors & Windows: 'The whole purpose of education is to turn mirrors into windows,' by Sydney J. Harris. This idea is embedded into every lesson presented in the curriculum in multiple facets such as the, "Mirrors & Windows," History to Text," World to Text," or "Cultural Connection" prompts and activities. These hallmarks direct students to reflect on their own biases and perspectives, by teaching them to keep an open mind to other cultural views through empathetic examination of another's experiences, background, belief system etc. Many of the activities ask students to tie their culture to the text under study, and further evaluate how and why we all view things differently.

Materials include a culturally responsive lens.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence (autofilled from All Content Appraisal tab):

Materials support culturally and linguistically responsive pedagogy including language objectives and resources for differentiated instruction in a "Visual Planning Guide" (e.g. 1A-1F) that maps the resources available in both print and digital interface. Each lesson has a small preview window that cross references the guide books (e.g. p 93). Particularly, enrichment activities (e.g. p 126, organizing a nonviolent protest against something students oppose in their community and persuading others to join in their cause) and differentiated instruction (e.g. p 124, where kinesthetic learners are supported in roleplaying the memoir in a reader's theatre) provide the well-ranged culturally and linguistically responsive instruction. Materials include tools such as the feature titled, "Cultural Connection." This draws the students' attention to cultural themes and resources. For example, the cultural connection based on the poem, "Remember," introduces the tool "creation stories" (p. 250) that is a common expression in Native American literature to celebrate the existence of a supreme being and appreciating man's unity with nature. Another example that is found throughout the materials is "Lifelong Learning," which provides varied opportunities to appreciate real-life experiences across cultures and linguistic backgrounds. For example, students are supported in researching and creating a presentation on "Coming of Age" ceremonies to celebrate young adulthood across various cultures (p 37).

Standards Review - Materials are reviewed for alignment with the state adopted content standards, benchmarks and performance standards.

Average Score

75%

Materials align with grade level standards overall.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials address ELA grade level standards and touch upon the New Mexico Standards. Language learning expectations are balanced across reading and writing skills while speaking skills are emphasized slightly more than the listening skills.

Materials provide supportive resources for differentiated instruction ranged across beginners/intermediate/advanced abilities. These include scaffolds (visual strategy, guided questions, organizers) to help culturally and linguistically diverse students including ELLs and SLDs (students with specific learning difficulties). For example, in the ebook "Differentiated Instruction for ELLs" students work on text based questions focused on 'pre/during/post reading strategies' from the text "My Left Foot" (pp. 133-137) and in the ebook "Differentiated Instruction, Reading Strategies &Skills", students respond to guided questions and visualize poetic imagery using an organizer for the poem "miss rosie" (pp. 28-30). Also, in the ebook on "Enrichment Projects," advanced students work on a Political Science research project "Tyranny versus Democracy" (p. 24) based on the text "Antigone". This is good instructional content that could be harnessed for alternative assessment if teachers create their own scoring rubrics.

'Teacher Edition' is in sync with the 'Student Edition' and provides annotations, responses, and margin-notes to serve as instructional support for teachers. There is a full walkthrough of standards integrated in the form of guided, directed and independent reading models, cross-curricular connections, language skills, writing and speaking performance tasks, and assessment practice.

The print version presents a well-organized spread of diverse text selections with extended exposure made available through the digital interface. The digital interface is an impressive repository with a treasure trove of supportive texts, activities, practice exercises, and assessments in the form of ebook titles such as: Unit & Selection Resources (separate booklets on: Fiction, Nonfiction, Poetry, Drama, Folk Literature), "Writing & Grammar", "Close Reading", "Vocab & Spelling", "Speaking & Listening", "Differentiated Instruction: ELLs", "Differentiated Instruction: Reading Strategies and Skills", and "Extension Activities". However, these ebooks are not prominently cross-referenced in the main print version.

Materials align to reading standards.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Reading instruction including texts, activities and assessments show the most explicit and logical alignment with the Reading standards. Text selections form an impressive spread across varied genres, themes, exposition styles, and periods across classical (e.g. treatises, epics, ballads, etc.) and contemporary works (e.g. graphic novels, free-verse, news articles, memoirs, one-act plays, etc). These are channelized towards thorough, meaningful reading instruction on textual analyses integrated with writing and speaking skills based on the five tiers of Anderson's Taxonomy (Remembering, Understanding, Applying, Analyzing, Evaluating, and Creating). The curriculum comes equipped with text-dependent activities, annotations, and margin-notes to help interact with the author's purpose, writing style, and the insightful themes rooted in the sociopolitical realities depicted by the texts. Students are provided guidance in identifying, citing, and supporting explicit and inferential textual evidence, for example in the poem, "Students are introduced to the concept of conflict and its types (internal and external) as linked to 'plot' in literary texts (p. E2). This is further established within the context of the short story "Through the Tunnel" (p. 26) where students analyze the 'internal conflict' Jerry's mother faces in relation to Jerry's safety (p. 28) juxtaposed with Jerry's own conflict (p. 31) with nature (external) and himself (internal). Students are then guided through a set of four analytical prompts to understand how Jerry's conflicts and the resolution advance the plot (p. 34).

There are some missed opportunities particularly where the curriculum does not orient students to the domain-specific language upfront. For example, in the poem titled "I Am Offering" (TE/SE: p. 239) students respond to the text-specific question to "list the objects to which the poem is likened" (1a, p. 241) instead of being guided to identify the poet's use of 'simile'- a technical/domain-specific term.

Materials align to writing standards.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Writing instruction is integrated with reading skills through activities based on the text selections.

Materials are balanced across relatively conventional forms of writing (e.g. narrative, informative, and argumentative) and mix-media writing (brochures, posters, profile, bibliographies, content for podcasts and websites, etc.). For writing instruction, students are supported through the process of: Pre-write (select topic, gather information, organize ideas, evaluate model), Draft (introduction, body, conclusion) and Revise (evaluate, revise for content, organization and style). For example, the instructional support for narrative/personal writing includes the 'Details chart' (TE/SE: p. 223) that provides sentence frames for beginning and ending, and adding sensory details to the story. This is further illustrated through the evaluation of a student write-up.

Assessment of content is aligned with specified standards through varied formative (questions, text-dependent tasks, multiple choice questions, reflective prompts, quick practice exercises, writing options, etc.) and summative assessments (End-of-Unit Test Practice Workshop, multiple choice questions, passage prompts, short essays, error identification and correction, group projects, etc.). These are available in the lessons within TE and SE and the ebook titled 'Assessment Guide'.

Moreover, the materials include a set of four scoring rubrics for teachers in the extended format of 'Google documents'. These rubrics are generic (exception being Informative writing) and do not assist teachers in interpreting student performance in: Narrative Writing (missing factors include: character development, dialogues, pacing, plotlines, etc.), and Literary nonfiction/Argumentative Writing (missing factors include: claims, counterclaims, evidence, and reasoning).

Materials align to speaking and listening standards.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials address the speaking and listening standards with a visible emphasis on the speaking aspect. The only explicit instruction available on 'listening skills' is on p. 221 of TE/SE titled 'Listen Actively and Take Notes' and a few points on pg 641 "Analyze a Media Presentation". It is noticeable that instructional activities and oral assessments for speaking and listening skills are integrated with reading activities and writing prompts based on the seed texts to provide student-practice in making claims, posing counter claims, reasoning, and presenting ideas. The activities spread across varied grouping strategies such as paired discussions, small group discussions, and solo/group presentations. For example, based on a seed text, students organize themselves in peer groups for a panel discussion to debate MacNeil's assertion that television is decivilizing (TE/SE: p. 179). Students create the ground rules and adapt the speech to the style of panel discussions i.e. opening, moderation, elaboration, and restatement. Similarly, students are supported to prepare for a debate on "high school sports offer young people valuable preparation for the game of life" (TE/SE: p. 270) through a process of evaluating speaker's point of view, reasoning, evidence and rhetoric and are prepared to look out for logical fallacies or distorted evidence.

Materials align to language standards.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials address the language standards comprehensively and make a visible effort to teach language in the context of literature. For example, students practice the use of various types of phrases and clauses (coordination, subordination, and apposition) through error identification and error correction in the context of sentences from 'Antigone' (TE/SE: p. 497). Also, language instruction, particularly morphology, etymology, vocabulary development, and syntax feature in the lessons as explanations, models and practice tasks under exclusive sections subtitled "Word Knowledge" and "Language Conventions". Moreover, vocabulary lists precede each Unit in the Teacher's Edition. For example, the section titled 'Building Vocabulary' before each Unit contains comprehensive lists of: 'Preview Vocabulary' (Tier 1 words that are highlighted and defined in the side margin), 'Selection Words' (Tier 1 words that are challenging but not central to the text selection and are not focused in explicit instruction), 'Academic Vocabulary' (Tier 2 words that are used for instructional purpose), 'Key Terms' (Tier 3 words that are domain-specific, are repeated and cross-referenced and are included in the Teacher Edition). This is a recurring organization for each unit, presenting a predictable format to be used conveniently by teachers.

Materials align to New Mexico content standards for ELA.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials align with the New Mexico Content Standards for ELA (NM B1, NM B2, NM C1, NM C2). For example, a speech "Yonder Sky That has Wept Tears of Compassion" by Chief Seattle is included to represent the Native American oral tradition (TE/SE: p. 193-196). Students engage with the theme of 'connection with nature' as they cite strong and thorough textual evidence (p. 196) to analyze the speech. Another prominent example is the cultural connection based on the poem "Remember", where the Native American writer (Cherokee descent) introduces the tool of "creation stories" (TE/SE: pp. 248-. 250) which is a common expression in Native American literature to celebrate the existence of a supreme being and appreciating man's unity with nature. Other examples include the translation of a narrative poem "Magic Words" from the oral tradition of the Inuit people (TE/SE: p. 517) and Santiago Baca's poem "I am Offering this Poem" (TE/SE: p. 239-241).

ELA Content Review - Materials are reviewed for relevant criteria pertaining to the support for teachers and students in the specific content area reviewed.

Average Score

92%

Materials provide a selection and range of high-quality texts worthy of students' time and attention, exhibiting exceptional craft and thought and/or providing useful information.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

The materials provide a selection and range of high-quality texts that are worthy of students' time and attention. There is variety of both texts and genres. There are more cultural options online in the Selection and the online Library. There are independent reading suggestions (mostly available on the eSelection online) that are interesting and high quality. The curriculum has text-to-text connections that give students more information on historical, cultural, or supplemental information to increase understanding. Hispanic and Native American texts are present in both the digital and printed versions, but they do not cover all strands adopted by NM standards. The variety of different texts, genres and authors shows diversity in culture, traditions, and beliefs within community, state and nation. For example: Unit 1: The Open Window by Saki, Catch the Moon by Ortiz-Cofer, Two Friends by Guy de Maupassant; Unit 2: Desert Exile: The Uprooting of a Japanese-American Family by Yoshiko Uchida, Keep Memory Alive by Elie Wiesel, Getting It Right at Ground Zero by Rudolph Giuliani; Unit 3: from Holidays, Jamaica Kincaid, Dream Variations, Langston Hughes, and Ocho perritos by Dana

Questions in the materials are high-quality text-dependent and text-specific questions. The overwhelming majority of these questions are text-specific and draw student attention to the particulars in the text.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

The materials provide questions that are high-quality text-dependent such as the "Refer to Text/Reason with Text" with specific sections "Understand, Apply, Analyze, Evaluate, Create". However, at some places the questions do not ask students to specifically cite evidence to support answers. This is a huge focus required by state standards. If it is not specifically stated, then students will not automatically cite evidence. For example, on p.66, the 'Analyze' question states: "Relate the two paired pieces in the piano songbook at the end of the story to Jing-mei's life." This question is an opportunity to request a citation, but that is not part of the prompt. This flaw will not be overlooked by educators.

Materials provide scaffolding and supports to enable students' learning of English language arts.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

The digital version has 3 "Differentiated Instruction" books with options for English Language Learning Support, Enrichment Projects and Activities, and Reading Strategies & Skills.

These tools help and support students' understanding of complex literature. The variety of differentiated learning suggestions is apparent in almost all lessons. For example "Special Needs/Learning Styles for the following categories: Auditory, Visual: "Remind students to visualize imagery as they read poetry. They may draw pictures to represent what they "see" in each poem.", Kinesthetic, Reading Proficiency, and English Language Learning: "Share the following vocabulary with ELL students..." Other examples are...ELL: "Use strategic learning techniques such as concept mapping, drawing, memorizing, comparing, contrasting, reviewing and use visual, contextual, and linguistic support to enhance and confirm understanding.....Conduct a classroom discussion on their feelings and opinions. Then have students evaluate how Seattle's method of text organization underscores the chasm that exists between the cultures and why Seattle is therefore resigned to the proposal.", and Enrichment: "Students may research the growth of the city of Seattle since the time of Chief Seattle. What is the city like today? Would Chief Seattle be satisfied with its development? Why or why not? Have students create a multimedia presentation based on their research."

All Content Review - Materials are reviewed for relevant criteria pertaining to the support for teachers and students in the material regarding the progression of the standards, lesson structure, pacing, assessment, individual learners and cultural relevance.

Average Score

82%

Materials are coherent and consistent with the high school standards that all students should study in order to be college and career ready.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

The curriculum includes ACT and SAT preparation, found in the digital resources section, and the regular inclusion of, "Test Practice Workshop" found in the physical text, which are important for preparing students for Standardized Test they may need to take in order to graduate, and/or to enter college. The materials appear to be consistent with the high school standards needed for adequate college and career readiness except for the preparation in the area of having students write and speak objectively. Much of the engagement with, and beyond the texts are premised so that students write about "their opinions," or "make judgements. Examples of this type of prompting are often found in the "Text-to-Text Connection" sections, the "Extend The Text" activities/lessons, and "Mirrors & Windows" The demand of rigor regarding the use of academic language is missing, which is a hindrance to students who plan on going to college, as terms/phrases like, "rhetorical appeals," fallacious reasoning," "Ethos, Pathos and Logos," and "Seminal Documents," are scant, missing, or replaced with lower level terms. Often, there is a lack of course content with application of content, coherence. This does not support student mastery of high school standards. For example, after Act I of the play, "Julius Caesar," students engage in an activity called "Grammar & Style - Active and Passive Voice." While this activity is a valid skill for strengthening students ability to identify active and passive voice in sentences from, "Julius Caesar, Act I," dropping it into the middle of a complex piece of literature is not a coherent organization of material. Doing so, does not increase students' comprehension of themes, ideas, or historical context of the play.

The two strongest college and career readiness preparation tools found in the curriculum, are the "Mirrors & Windows (M&W)" questioning and discussion prompts, and the "History Connection" pieces. The M & W practices provide students an invaluable opportunity to reflect on personal biases, biases and stereotypes seen in society, and other types of close viewed thinking. In doing so, students have the opportunity to turn an egocentric or skewed perspective into an objective view, thus, preparing them to be open minded, reflective thinkers. The History Connection pieces allow students a different bit of framework -- other than just the author's background -- which provides them with some understanding on the verbiage, and context of a how and why the text is presented in the form it is.

Materials are well designed and take into account effective lesson structure and pacing.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

The physical materials are adequately designed in regard to their pacing and structure, as designated in the TE's Scope and Sequence provided for each unit. The Curriculum provides a Scope and Sequence for each of its six Units, and a Visual Planning Guide. The Scope and Sequence breaks a unit down Lesson by Lesson, and lists the general skill, (reading, writing, speaking and listening, language/grammar) being addressed. General text resources (e.g. "Text-to-Text Connections" and Close Reading) plus the assessment types are also listed for each Unit. The list of texts found in the Scope and Sequence include the Electronic Readings students will need in addition to those provided in the physical textbook. The issue with the lesson planning structure is that the electronic platforms for the digital materials are cumbersome, at best, and require an extraordinary amount of time to navigate through in order for teachers to preview the "E" lessons students are expected to use. The E Lessons/readings are an essential component of the curriculum, as they are thoughtfully designed as an integral part of a unit in meeting the overarching theme(s) and skills. Opting out of using them is not a viable option since the CCSS being addressed in each electronic lesson is not indicated anywhere in the physical planning structures, nor in the digital "Waffle Menu" (see next section of appraisal for details). Hence, in opting out of using any of the ELessons, students could potentially miss the opportunity to meet all of the grade level standards/requirements.

Materials support teacher planning, learning, and understanding of the standards.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

The curriculum does not provide the instructor support in the understanding and "learning" of the standards. It does, however, give general sweeping coverage of most of the standards. In the digital platform is a function that allows teachers to look up the standards (Courses> Mirrors & Windows Grade 10 National > Teacher's Edition Grade 10 > Resources > Waffle Menu > Search All Standards). The search function lists the standards by noting a correlating page number, not lessons. This requires the teacher to go through the list, page by page, scanning each lesson to see if in fact ALL of the standards are met. In the "All Standards" tab, the publisher failed to list any of the W.1 standards (W1a-W1e), W.8 standard and the New Mexico Based Standards, NM.C.1 or NM.C.2. The practicality of going page by page to see how the publisher is tying a standard to a lesson makes it difficult for a teacher to learn, plan and understand how the standards for each lesson are implemented. This poses a challenge to new teachers, or those new to the content area, and an inconvenience for the Master teacher.

Materials offer teachers resources and tools to collect ongoing data about student progress on the standards.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Without the explicit listing of standards per each lesson or unit, it is difficult to fully inform instruction and monitor student progress. There appears to be an electronic function in the student and teacher dashboard (after a class is created and lessons and assessments are assigned) which shows completed, scored, and pending assignments. This is a limited resource as far as data collection of any sort is concerned.

Materials support effective use of technology to enhance student learning. Digital materials are accessible and available in multiple platforms.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Digital materials are accessible and available on multiple platforms. The material includes suggestions for technology integration into lessons. Media Literacy is a regular practice that is embedded in the student "Extend the Text" features. This aspect of the content gives students a regular opportunity to use technology in learning. An example of this is found on page 169, of the Student Edition. Students are asked to create a website regarding the history of Gospel and Spiritual Hymns. EReading Selections with adjoining lessons, tools for annotation, audio support for the texts designated for whole class learning, an online library for independent reading, a grammar handbook, SAT and ACT practice, and Differentiated Instructional resources are all provided for the enhancement of learning. Assessments and lessons can be done online if the teacher has assigned them to students. Other technology available to enhance student learning is linked to online resources not provided directly within the materials.

Materials can be easily customized for individual learners.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials can be customized for individual learners in that they provide a wealth of differentiated instruction activities and strategies that include scaffolds (visual strategy, guided questions, organizers) to support the learning needs of all students. There are separate ebooklets on differentiated instruction, reading strategies and skills and extension activities. For example, in the ebook Differentiated Instruction for ELLS, students are supported through guided text based questions focused on pre/while/post reading strategies from the text "My Left Foot" (pp 133-137) and in the ebook "Differentiated Instruction, Reading Strategies & Skills," students respond to guided questions and visualize poetic imagery through the use of a graphic organizer (p 28-30) for the poem "Miss Rosie." Also, in the ebook on "Enrichment Projects," advanced students are guided to work on a Political Science research project "Tyranny versus Democracy" (p. 24) based on the text "Antigone."

Materials give all students extensive opportunities and support to explore key concepts.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Found in the hard copy of the TE, the materials provide general differentiation opportunities for Struggling and Accelerated learners, and EL support. Physical materials are accompanied by digital ebooks on differentiated instruction for ELLs, extension activities, guided reading, and resource booklets for writing, reading, speaking & listening, vocabulary, spelling, and grammar. These serve as helpful resources to provide learners the confidence they need to become active participants in and enable their learning. The assumption is made that all students can learn at or above proficiency. Scaffolding is provided where the publisher has deemed it necessary.

Materials take into account cultural perspectives.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

The materials take into account cultural perspectives of the authors and students. The theory of being open minded to diverse views, is reflected in the title, Mirrors & Windows: 'The whole purpose of education is to turn mirrors into windows,' by Sydney J. Harris. This idea is embedded into every lesson presented in the curriculum in multiple facets such as the, "Mirrors & Windows," History to Text," World to Text," or "Cultural Connection" prompts and activities. These hallmarks direct students to reflect on their own biases and perspectives, by teaching them to keep an open mind to other cultural views through empathetic examination of another's experiences, background, belief system etc. Many of the activities ask students to tie their culture to the text under study, and further evaluate how and why we all view things differently.

Materials include a culturally responsive lens.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials support culturally and linguistically responsive pedagogy including language objectives and resources for differentiated instruction in a "Visual Planning Guide" (e.g. 1A-1F) that maps the resources available in both print and digital interface. Each lesson has a small preview window that cross references the eguide books (e.g. p 93). Particularly, enrichment activities (e.g. p 126, organizing a nonviolent protest against something students oppose in their community and persuading others to join in their cause) and differentiated instruction (e.g. p 124, where kinesthetic learners are supported in roleplaying the memoir in a reader's theatre) provide the well-ranged culturally and linguistically responsive instruction. Materials include tools such as the feature titled, "Cultural Connection." This draws the students' attention to cultural themes and resources. For example, the cultural connection based on the poem, "Remember," introduces the tool "creation stories" (p. 250) that is a common expression in Native American literature to celebrate the existence of a supreme being and appreciating man's unity with nature. Another example that is found throughout the materials is "Lifelong Learning," which provides varied opportunities to appreciate real-life experiences across cultures and linguistic backgrounds. For example, students are supported in researching and creating a presentation on "Coming of Age" ceremonies to celebrate young adulthood across various cultures (p 37).

Reviewers' Professional Summation - These materials are reviewed by Level II and Level III educators from across New Mexico. The reviewers have brought their knowledge, experience and expertise into the review of these materials. They offer here their individual summary of the material as a whole.

Reviewer #: 4

Background and experience:

I have taught ELA at the secondary level for 21 years, including grades 8-12. I have taught Advanced Placement English Language for 18 of those years and have been a Reader for the AP English Language exam for the College Board for the past 11 years. I have also taught AP English Literature for three years

Professional summary of material:

I enjoyed the variety of selections in this title but felt the publisher didn't include teacher-friendly support. For example, there is no explicit listing or correlating of standards on either the Scope & Sequence or individual lessons. There are a variety of online resources, but the interface is clunky. Student instructions are vague and/or unsupported (like "write a conclusion" without explaining what a strong conclusion looks like). The writing instruction is general, and relies heavily on the teacher to supplement. There is a nice variety of activities suggested, including media literacy, collaboration, creative, informational, and persuasive writing, and presentations, but many of them rely upon the teacher for detailed support and instruction so that students will successfully complete the product.

Reviewer #: 5

Background and experience:

I have taught ELA at the secondary level for 21 years, including grades 8-12. I have taught Advanced Placement English Language for 18 of those years and have been a Reader for the AP English Language exam for the College Board for the past 11 years. I have also taught AP English Literature for three years

Professional summary of material:

This material contains a variety of literature suited for tenth grade ELA. There is a helpful scope and sequence, visual planning guide, and a lesson by lesson resource at the beginning of each unit. However, it lacks alignment to any of the material to the Common Core State Standards. As an English teacher, one would strive to align lessons, activities and standards to ensure college and career readiness. This material is extremely difficult for teachers to utilize and be able to create lessons structured for standards-based learning. In addition, it is challenging to assess student learning when the assessments are not connected to the CCSS. There is also an absence of rigor as well as activities for gifted students. For Example students are asked as an enrichment activity to create a brochure that pertains to the study of poetry of two authors. This does not create rigor to develop a deeper understanding of a concept, it adds another assignment.

Reviewer #: 6

Background and experience:

I am a Level II licensed teacher with TESOL endorsement. I have been teaching ELA for 10 years in the secondary level. I have been part of a committee responsible for writing New Mexico standards-based ELA prompts.

Professional summary of material:

The materials contain a set of both literary and informational texts that are engaging for the tenth grade students. The online resources provide opportunity for students to explore more reading options during their independent time. There are also close reading online tools (i.e. "highlighter" that students can use to emphasize important details from the selection and "taking notes" where students can write down significant ideas) that can improve individual understanding of the text. However, it is important to note that some of the reading selections are not aligned with the grade level lexile (e.g. "The Monkey's Paw" at 880L). Also, there are excellent receptive skill activities (e.g. present a horror story p105) that are not tied in with the productive skill activities (e.g. writing a short story p642). Although there are constant text-dependent questions for every selection that enable students to have an in-depth analysis of the text, there are limited opportunities for citing strong and thorough textual evidence. The structure and lesson planning show a careful preparation and organization; however, since the standards are not explicitly stated in the material, it does not give much teacher support.

Reviewer #: 48

Background and experience:

Ph.D. Education Sciences (USA), Masters in Research (UK), Masters in English Linguistics (UK)
Level 3 NM Secondary Teaching License (endorsements: ELA, Reading, Educational Tech Coordinator) Experience:
2 yrs- High School ELA Grade 12
2yrs- Project Head, Educational Research
6 yrs- University Faculty ELA Pedagogy

Professional summary of material:

EMC School/Carnegie Learning's Mirrors & Windows for Grade 10 is a strong curriculum. It addresses the ELA grade level standards along with meeting the New Mexico Standards.

The curriculum presents a diverse array of stimulating and engaging text selections that have been utilized to create skills-integrated teaching and learning opportunities in ELA. For example, reading instruction is integrated with writing and speaking skills through text-dependent questions based on the five tiers of Anderson's Taxonomy namely, Remembering, Understanding, Applying, Analyzing, Evaluating, and Creating. Another element is the 'three tiered vocabulary framework' within each Unit. This can serve as an assistance for teachers in New Mexico high schools struggling to implement this framework. Moreover, the curriculum is balanced across relatively conventional forms of writing (e.g. narrative, informative, literary analyses, and argumentative) and mixed-media writing (brochures, posters, profile, bibliographies, content for podcasts and websites, etc.). This provides students a formal orientation to new-age demands of a multimodal approach to writing.

There are strong elements that channel students' attention towards cultural themes and resources. For example, the cultural connection based on the poem, "Remember," introduces the tool "creation stories" (p. 250) that is a common expression in Native American literature to celebrate the existence of a supreme being and appreciating man's unity with nature. Another element is the section "Lifelong Learning" where students are encouraged to use both micro and macro lenses. For example, students are supported in researching and creating a presentation on "Coming of Age" ceremonies to celebrate young adulthood across various cultures (p 37).

Also, the online/digital interface is a repository of teaching resources such as extended text selections, ebooks and handbooks containing skills-based tasks, extension activities, and assessment guides. There is extensive support available for teachers in the form of ready-to-use worksheets aligned to texts within each unit and editable lesson plans in the "Program Planning Guide". Material is available in the ebooks titled, "Differentiated Instruction: ELLs", "Differentiated Instruction: Reading Strategies & Skills" and "Assessment Guides" to use towards 'scaffolded instruction' for culturally and linguistically diverse student populations including ELLs and students with IEPs. Moreover, for advanced students, the ebook on "Enrichment Projects," is available, where students are guided to work on projects, for example (on p. 24) a Political Science research project "Tyranny versus Democracy" based on the text "Antigone". All these resources could potentially save teachers a lot of instructional time but unfortunately, these resources are not prominently referenced in the Teacher or Student Edition which would make it burdensome for teachers to use these hidden nuggets in the limited time available for planning.

The technological interface is good but its functionality can be better harnessed for a holistic and interactive teaching and learning experience especially in times where schools will opt to move online. There is a need to improve the exposure to technical/domain-specific terminology along with improvement in the scoring rubrics particularly in writing so that the curriculum meets the purpose of guiding students through a solid skills focused ELA program.

Reviewer #: 49

Background and experience:

Bachelor's Degree
Level 2 NM Elementary and Secondary Teaching Licenses with Endorsements in Business Education and Reading
7 years ELA - 6th Grade
1 year ELA - 7th Grade
1 year ELA - 9th-12 Grades

Professional summary of material:

Carnegie Learning, Inc., Mirrors and Windows -Connecting with Literature Grade 10 is a choice for curriculum adoption. The digital version provides resources to facilitate learning and understanding, beyond the textbook. The material has a good variety of texts and genres, including Hispanic and Native American texts. The majority of Hispanic and Native American texts can only be found in the digital format. The book has "Text to Text Connections" which help connect different genres of texts together having the same theme/topic. This is a benefit for learners and understanding perspectives. There are also "Lifelong Learner" activities which have very creative ideas to engage students with concepts. There are grammar and language convention practices throughout the material. The Differentiated Instruction includes options for ELL, Kinesthetic, Audio, Visual, Extend the Text, and Reading Proficiency - which covers multiple types of learners and learning needs. Objectives are clearly stated for units and lessons, but standards are not listed or stated anywhere within the printed text.

Reviewer #: 50

Background and experience:

MA - Curriculum and Instruction, BS --Psychology & Agriculture
NM Educators License: PreK-12 Specialty, with endorsements in, ELA, TESOL, Psychology, Agriculture, and Science
Teacher of ELA in the NM Public Schools for 9 years and Science for 7 years
Currently: ELA Department Head and Freshman Honors ELA & AVID teacher

Professional summary of material:

The Curriculum, *Mirrors and Windows, Connecting with Literature - Grade 10*, by Carnegie Learning Inc., provides students the opportunity to engage in skills correlated with a rich collection of works from a diverse set of authors. The works provided in the curriculum give a fresh, relevant view, of conceptual ideas dispelling the old linear views found in traditional "textbooks" of the past five decades. Students have opportunities to personally connect with the materials, making learning meaningful. This includes the noteworthy aspects such as, the "Mirrors & Windows" discussion prompts and "Lifelong Learning" supplementations. These features of the curriculum promote expansion of perspectives, and a deeper understanding of how all literary works are an extension of a person's (author's) belief systems, experiences, and motivations. Even though the curriculum is highly engaging and dynamic, I have slight reservations. This is due largely in part to the oversight of the publisher explicitly listing, mentioning or even embedding several of the 9-10 ELA CCSS. An example of this is seen numerous times when the textbook fails to have students write, speak, or view content objectively -- CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.W.9-10.1.D -- one of the standards not listed anywhere in the materials. While the third and fourth levels DOK do have students make judgments, they first need to know how to view content objectively, so they can make sound judgments.