

2020 Instructional Material Summer Review Institute

Review Team Appraisal of Title

(9-12 English Language Arts)

This appraisal form is provided for use by educators responsible for the selection of instructional materials for implementation with districts and charter schools across New Mexico to meet the need of their student populations.

This appraisal form should be used in conjunction with the publisher provided Form D: Research Based Effectiveness Determination that supports this reviewed material which can be found on the Instructional Material Bureau website.

<https://webnew.ped.state.nm.us/bureaus/instructional-materials/the-adoption-cycle/>

Text Title	Mirrors & Windows: Connecting with Literature - Grade 9	Publisher	Carnegie Learning, Inc.
SE ISBN	9781533836663	TE ISBN	9781533836731
SW ISBN		Grade Level	9

**Core Instructional Material Designation** (Core Instructional Material is the comprehensive print or digital educational material, including basal material, which constitutes the necessary instructional components of a full academic course of study in those subjects for which the department has adopted content standards and benchmarks.)

**Recommended**  
(90% and above)

**Recommended with Reservations**  
(80-89%)

**Not Recommended and Not Adopted**  
(below 80%)

**Total Score** - Below is the final score for the materials averaged between the team of reviewers.

Average Score

78%

**Cultural and Linguistic Relevance Recognition** - Materials are reviewed for criteria pertaining to the support for teachers and students in the material regarding cultural relevance and the inclusion of a culturally responsive lens. Those materials receiving a score of 90% or above on the CLR portion of the review receive this recognition.

**CLR Recognition**

Average Score

77%

Materials take into account cultural perspectives.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence (autofilled from All Content Appraisal tab):*

There are a variety of cultural perspectives offered in the material. The premise of the curriculum is reflected in the title, Mirrors & Windows -- 'The whole purpose of education is to turn mirrors into windows,' by Sydney J. Harris. This idea is embedded into every lesson presented in the curriculum, simply framed as, "Mirrors & Windows." This aspect of the material directs students to reflect on their own biases and perspectives, and potentially how these biases could be changed after viewing other cultural perspectives through another's experiences, background, belief system etc. The Mirrors & Windows asks or prompts hard questioning of oneself, which is what is needed if people are to let go of biases. Evidence of this in the electronic TE, page E141: "This is Not Who We Are," an account of an Arab woman and her experience of being an Arab while living in the United States during 911. The teacher is prepared for the conversation with this: "Mirrors and Windows at the end of the selection focuses on the idea of pride in our culture or family background. Before students read the essay, discuss ways in which their culture or family pride might be tested or challenged." There are also "Text to Text Connections" embedded in every lesson. These often have students relate one cultural perspective (found within a text) to another text, and/or at times, to students' cultures or backgrounds. Lastly, there are Discussion Guides for teachers to use to engage the class in the evaluation of cultural perspectives and biases, such as that found in the TE, page 68: "Take a moment to discuss with students the stereotypes that are present in this story. [question] 3. Ask students if they have made or heard similar assumptions to those the black girls made about Elena. Discuss the danger of making such assumptions."

Materials include a culturally responsive lens.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence (autofilled from All Content Appraisal tab):*

While the curriculum does include a culturally responsive lens, as discussed above, cultural perspectives of Chicanos and Native Americans, is not as prevalent as it needs to be, in order to meet the New Mexico Based Standards. Supplementary works, lessons, and/or tweaking of the use of the works provided would have to be done so the materials would comprehensively support that of a culturally responsive lens.

**Standards Review** - Materials are reviewed for alignment with the state adopted content standards, benchmarks and performance standards.

Average Score

75%

Materials align with grade level standards overall.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

Materials address ELA grade level standards at a bare minimum and slightly touch upon the New Mexico Standards. Language learning expectations are balanced across reading and writing skills but are skewed towards speaking skills with listening skills not being emphasized.

The Teacher Edition is in sync with the Student Edition and provides annotations, responses, and margin-notes to serve as instructional support for teachers. Teacher's Edition provides a full walkthrough of integrated standards in the form of guided, directed and independent reading models, cross-curricular connections, language skills, writing and speaking performance tasks, and assessment practice.

The print version is well-organized and includes diverse text selections with extended exposure made available through the digital interface. The digital interface is a repository containing supportive texts, activities, practice exercises, and assessments in the form of ebook titles such as: Unit & Selection Resources (separate booklets on: Fiction, Nonfiction, Poetry, Drama, Folk Literature), "Writing & Grammar", "Close Reading", "Vocab & Spelling", "Speaking & Listening", "Differentiated Instruction: ELLs", "Differentiated Instruction: Reading Strategies and Skills", and "Extension Activities".

Unfortunately, these ebooks are not prominently cross-referenced in the main print version, making it burdensome for teachers to spend their planning hours in accessing these titles.

Similarly, materials provide supportive resources for differentiated instruction ranged across beginners/intermediate/advanced abilities. These include scaffolds (visual strategy, guided questions, organizers) to help culturally and linguistically diverse students, including ELLs and SLDs (students with specific learning difficulties). However, these resources are lean on providing explicit ideas on alternative assessment options. For example, in the ebook "Differentiated Instruction for ELLs" students work on text based questions focused on 'figures of speech' from the text "Inspector General" (p. 280-281) and in the ebook "Differentiated Instruction, Reading Strategies & Skills", students respond to guided questions and visualize poetic imagery using an organizer (p 25-27). This instructional content could be used for alternative assessment if teachers create their own scoring rubrics.

Materials align to reading standards.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

Reading instruction, including texts, activities and assessments show the most explicit and logical alignment with the Reading standards. Text selections are varied in genres, themes, exposition styles, and periods. These are channelized towards thorough, meaningful reading instruction on textual analysis integrated with writing and speaking skills based on the five tiers of Anderson's Taxonomy (Remembering, Understanding, Applying, Analyzing, Evaluating, and Creating). The curriculum comes equipped with text-dependent activities, annotations, and margin-notes to help interact with the author's purpose, writing style, and the insightful themes rooted in the sociopolitical realities depicted by the texts. Students are provided guidance in identifying, citing, and supporting explicit and inferential textual evidence, for example in the poem, "Ballad of Birmingham" (TE/SE p. 223), 'Refer to Text/question 2a', students cite textual evidence for the child's reason to attend the Freedom March while 'Reason with Text/ question 3b' asks students to cite textual evidence from the news article "Birmingham bomb kills....(TE/SE: p. 224)" to substantiate the violation of the mother's expectations (i.e. for her child to be safe in a Church). There are missed opportunities where the curriculum does not orient students to the domain-specific language upfront. For example, for the text titled "The Obligation to Endure" (TE/SE: p. 146) students are guided to find words and phrases with negative connotations that the author utilizes to impress on the readers the seriousness of environmental pollution (TE/SE: p. 152). However, the term 'rhetoric' is neither introduced nor used until the first instance of 'rhetorical' or 'rhetoric' on page 160 with reference to the analysis of Dr. Martin's speech.

Materials align to writing standards.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

Writing instruction is integrated with reading skills through activities based on the text selections. For example, a predictable learning loop for 'informational texts/informative writing' introduces students to informational texts and their types (articles, how-to writing, websites, and graphic aids) which is linked to the importance of recognizing bias and distinguishing fact from opinion (TE: E125). This is connected to types of argument (glittering generality, spin, stereotype, circular reasoning, loaded words, and bandwagon appeal) with examples and analyses (TE: E 126), after which students engage with a representative informational text titled, "History of Samara" followed by text dependent questions including a written comparison with a fable titled "Maugham's fable". This allowed better student motivation for writing.

Materials are focused on relatively conventional forms of writing (e.g. narrative, informative, and argumentative). For writing instruction, students are supported through the process of: Pre-write (select topic, gather information, organize ideas, evaluate model), Draft (introduction, body, conclusion) and Revise (evaluate, revise for content, organization and style). For example, the instructional support for argumentative writing includes the 'Pro and Con' chart (TE/SE: p. 193) which models how a topic could be based on 'Claims' (pro) and 'Counterclaims' (cons).

Assessment of content is aligned with specified standards through varied formative (questions, text-dependent tasks, multiple choice questions, reflective prompts, quick practice exercises, writing options, etc.) and summative assessments (End-of-Unit Test Practice Workshop, multiple choice questions, passage prompts, short essays, error identification and correction, group projects, etc.). These are available in the lessons within TE and SE and the ebook titled 'Assessment Guide'.

Moreover, the materials include a set of four scoring rubrics for teachers in the extended format of 'Google documents'. These rubrics are generic and do not assist teachers in interpreting student performance on the following writing genre: Informative Writing (missing factors include structural organization including introduction and conclusion), Narrative Writing (missing factors include: character development, dialogues, pacing, plotlines, etc.), Literary nonfiction/Argumentative Writing (missing factors include: claims, counterclaims, evidence, and reasoning).

Materials align to speaking and listening standards.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

Materials address the speaking and listening standards with a visible emphasis on the speaking aspect. The instructional activities and oral assessments for speaking and listening skills are integrated with reading activities and writing prompts based on the seed texts to provide student-practice in making claims, posing counter claims, reasoning, and presenting ideas. The activities spread across varied grouping strategies such as paired discussions, small group discussions, and solo/group presentations. For example, students work with a partner or in a small group to use digital media for presenting a research on "how developing nations might benefit from the immediate effects of a pesticide/DDT" (TE/SE: p. 157). Another example is where students advertise a mock event by presenting a research-based poster on the life, accomplishments, and themes of a Misty Poet based on a poetic selection penned by one of China's lesser known 'Misty Poets' (TE/SE: p. 215). It is noteworthy that despite a relatively decent exposure to speaking and listening, there are no scoring rubrics for these skills.

Materials align to language standards.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

Materials address the language standards quite comprehensively. Language instruction, particularly morphology, etymology, vocabulary development, and syntax feature in the lessons as explanations, models and practice tasks under exclusive sections subtitled "Word Knowledge" and "Language Conventions". Moreover, vocabulary lists precede each Unit in the Teacher's Edition. For example, the section titled 'Building Vocabulary' before each Unit contains comprehensive lists of: 'Preview Vocabulary' (Tier 1 words that are highlighted and defined in the side margin), 'Selection Words' (Tier 1 words that are challenging but not central to the text selection and are not focused in explicit instruction), 'Academic Vocabulary' (Tier 2 words that are used for instructional purpose), 'Key Terms' (Tier 3 words that are domain-specific, are repeated and cross-referenced and are included in the Teacher Edition). This is a recurring organization for each unit, presenting a predictable format to be used conveniently by teachers.

Materials align to New Mexico content standards for ELA.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

Materials reflect New Mexico content standards but in a very limited manner. There are only a few text selections included in the print and digital formats written by Native American authors. For example, the poetic selections "Cold as Heaven" by Ortiz and "Gentle Communion" by Mora (p. 216) illustrate the cultural realities and relationships experienced by immigrant families of Native Americans and "Poetry" by the Nobel laureate Pablo Neruda (E 169) helps students discuss social and political struggle through the lens of a Native American's social experiences. These text selections interweave the themes critical to the Native American identity; however, they limit student's exposure to actual Hispanic and Native American literary characteristics, stylistics, and syntax captured in the oral and literary tradition of NM.

**ELA Content Review** - Materials are reviewed for relevant criteria pertaining to the support for teachers and students in the specific content area reviewed.

Average Score

93%

Materials provide a selection and range of high-quality texts worthy of students' time and attention, exhibiting exceptional craft and thought and/or providing useful information.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

The materials do provide a range of high-quality texts. There are strong examples of Hispanic and Native American oral and written works found in both the print format, and via the electronic format that is included with the curriculum. There are a variety of genres such as memoirs, speeches, biographies, poems, short-stories, journals, graphic stories and essays for students to engage in. Not all of the works are considered to be the usual traditional texts, as the publisher integrates a variety of eras and perspectives from more modern authors or translations of "old" texts. Examples of some of the texts are the following: *Trapped New Orleans Pets Still Being Rescued*, by Laura Parker and Anita Manning; "American History," by Judith Ortiz Cofer; "AHA Moment," by Julia Alvarez;; "The Gift of the Magi," by O. Henry; "Only Daughter," by Sandra Cisneros; "Gentle Communion," by Pat Mora; and "The Censors," by Luisa Valenzuela. Since many of the text options are more modern and culturally diverse, they will be worthy of students' time and attention.

Questions in the materials are high-quality text-dependent and text-specific questions. The overwhelming majority of these questions are text-specific and draw student attention to the particulars in the text.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

There are text-dependent and text-specific questions for each lesson in the "Refer to Text/Reason with Text," feature sections. The questions are categorized by "Understand (find meaning), Apply (use information), Analyze (take things apart), Evaluate (make judgements) and Create (bring ideas together). While the questions do spark critical thinking, they do not specify for students to use textual evidence from the text to support their reasoning. The other types of text-dependent questions are those prompted by the teacher "Discussion Question" sections, those found in the "Extend The Text" sections after each reading, and some of the "Mirrors & Windows" prompts.

Materials provide scaffolding and supports to enable students' learning of English language arts.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

The materials provide supportive resources for differentiated instruction that include scaffolds (visual strategy, guided questions, organizers) to help culturally and linguistically diverse students including ELLs and SLDs (students with specific learning difficulties). However, these resources all lean on providing explicit ideas on alternative assessment options. For example, in the ebook *Differentiated Instruction for ELLS*, students work on text based questions focused on "figures of speech" from the text, "Inspector General" (p. 280-281). In the ebook "Differentiated Instruction, Reading Strategies & Skills," students respond to guided questions and visualize poetic imagery using a graphic organizer (p 25-27). The instructional content integrated with support could be harnessed for alternative assessments if a teacher chose to go that route. Teachers will need to create their own scoring rubrics because the ones provided are not adequately aligned to the CCSS. There is some scaffolding for the Close Reading, but the material lacks models for students to use as an anchor. Many of the "Extend the Text" activities give students a choice in how to respond, which speaks to generating student interest.

**All Content Review** - Materials are reviewed for relevant criteria pertaining to the support for teachers and students in the material regarding the progression of the standards, lesson structure, pacing, assessment, individual learners and cultural relevance.

Average Score

81%

Materials are coherent and consistent with the high school standards that all students should study in order to be college and career ready.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

Materials appear to be consistent with ninth grade high school ELA standards, however, the standards are not attached to any of the physical materials/lessons in the TE or SE, nor are they easy to access on the digital platform that accompanies the materials. This poses a potential problem for teachers who are new to the grade level, or to the content area, as it takes experience before one could read a lesson and know exactly which CCSS a lesson is addressing. Consistently the team noted that the NM Based Standards were not utilized even though there are diverse multicultural works interspersed into the curriculum. The most beautiful aspect of Carnegie's Mirrors & Windows curriculum is the, "Mirrors & Windows" discussion pieces accompanying each lesson. These provide students an invaluable opportunity to reflect on personal biases, and turn the egocentric perspective into a broad world view, thus, preparing them to be open minded, critical thinkers, who have the potential to positively impact global society. The critical thinking expectations set out in the curriculum alone, will prepare students for college and a career, in that, they will encounter many belief systems and types of people.

Materials are well designed and take into account effective lesson structure and pacing.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

The physical materials are adequately designed in regard to their pacing and structure, as designated in the TE's Scope and Sequence provided for each unit. The issue with the lesson planning structure is that the electronic platforms for the digital materials are cumbersome at best, and require an extraordinary amount of time to navigate through in order for teachers to preview the "E" lessons students need to engage in. The E Lessons/readings are an essential component of the curriculum, as they are exceptionally designed to meet the overarching theme(s) of each unit. Opting out of using them is not a viable option, since the CCSS being addressed in each lesson are not indicated anywhere in the physical planning structures. Hence, in doing so, students could potentially miss the opportunity for mastery of grade level requirements.

Materials support teacher planning, learning, and understanding of the standards.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

As noted above, there is no designated mention, discussion of, or even a listing of the Standards available for teachers to easily reference for planning and/or to gain a deeper understanding of how the standards are used and met within the curriculum. There is a function in the digital platform where a teacher could look up a standard and see which page numbers are associated with a given individual standard. However, the practicality of going Standard by Standard and viewing each page for which they are listed, and then having to scan the page, find the aspect of the lesson that addresses the standard, then preview the lesson to see if the standard is fully met, would take a master teacher days to do. The NM.B9.1 was not found at all in the digital listing of standards, and several of the citations provided by the publisher for the NMBS were incorrect. Without the explicit listing of standards per each lesson or unit, it is difficult to fully inform instruction and monitor student progress. In accordance with state statutes, teachers are required by law to implement a curriculum that is aligned to the grade level CCSS being taught (NMAC 6.29.13.10 for grades 9-12). This is a gross oversight in the design of the curriculum.

Materials offer teachers resources and tools to collect ongoing data about student progress on the standards.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

There are no formal tools provided within the curriculum that can be used to collect data and track student progress related directly to the ELA CCSS, nor the NMBS.

Materials support effective use of technology to enhance student learning. Digital materials are accessible and available in multiple platforms.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

The materials do support the effective use of technology to enhance student learning. EReading Selections with adjoining lessons, tools for annotation, audio support for the texts designated for whole class learning, an online library for independent reading, and a grammar handbook, are provided for the enhancement of learning. Assessments and lessons can be done online if the teacher has assigned them to students. It appears that students can access many of the materials online via phone, tablet, or laptop. There are links to additional online resources for students to access if need be.

Materials can be easily customized for individual learners.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

The digital materials can be customized for individual learners in that they provide a generous number of differentiated instructional activities and strategies that include scaffolds (visual strategy, guided questions, organizers) to support the learning needs of all students. There are separate ebooklets on differentiated instruction, reading strategies and skills and extension activities. The differentiation found in the physical TE does provide some differentiation options for Enrichment, Struggling Readers, EL, and provides multiple modality options to support, visual, kinesthetic and auditory learners.

Materials give all students extensive opportunities and support to explore key concepts.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

The curriculum includes differentiated instructional activities that support: multiple modalities (auditory, kinesthetic, and visual), enrichment, ELL, and struggling readers. There are extensive learning opportunities for the general populous of students -- these include the "Text to Text Connections," "Mirrors & Windows" prompts, and, the "Extending The Text" activities and lessons. The assumption is made that all students can learn at or above proficiency. Scaffolding is provided where the publisher has deemed it necessary, but can be added at any point in the curriculum if the teacher wishes to do so.

Materials take into account cultural perspectives.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

There are a variety of cultural perspectives offered in the material. The premise of the curriculum is reflected in the title, *Mirrors & Windows* -- 'The whole purpose of education is to turn mirrors into windows,' by Sydney J. Harris. This idea is embedded into every lesson presented in the curriculum, simply framed as, "Mirrors & Windows." This aspect of the material directs students to reflect on their own biases and perspectives, and potentially how these biases could be changed after viewing other cultural perspectives through another's experiences, background, belief system etc. The Mirrors & Windows asks or prompts hard questioning of oneself, which is what is needed if people are to let go of biases. Evidence of this in the electronic TE, page E141: "This is Not Who We Are," an account of an Arab woman and her experience of being an Arab while living in the United States during 911. The teacher is prepared for the conversation with this: "Mirrors and Windows at the end of the selection focuses on the idea of pride in our culture or family background. Before students read the essay, discuss ways in which their culture or family pride might be tested or challenged." There are also "Text to Text Connections" embedded in every lesson. These often have students relate one cultural perspective (found within a text) to another text, and/or at times, to students' cultures or backgrounds. Lastly, there are Discussion Guides for teachers to use to engage the class in the evaluation of cultural perspectives and biases, such as that found in the TE, page 68: "Take a moment to discuss with students the stereotypes that are present in this story. [question] 3. Ask students if they have made or heard similar assumptions to those the black girls made about Elena. Discuss the danger of making such assumptions."

Materials include a culturally responsive lens.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

While the curriculum does include a culturally responsive lens, as discussed above, cultural perspectives of Chicanos and Native Americans, is not as prevalent as it needs to be, in order to meet the New Mexico Based Standards. Supplementary works, lessons, and/or tweaking of the use of the works provided would have to be done so the materials would comprehensively support that of a culturally responsive lens.

**Reviewers' Professional Summation** - These materials are reviewed by Level II and Level III educators from across New Mexico. The reviewers have brought their knowledge, experience and expertise into the review of these materials. They offer here their individual summary of the material as a whole.

Reviewer #: 4

*Background and experience:*

I have taught ELA at the secondary level for 21 years, including grades 8-12. I have taught Advanced Placement English Language for 18 of those years and have been a Reader for the AP English Language exam for the College Board for the past 11 years. I have also taught AP English Literature for three years.

*Professional summary of material:*

I enjoyed the variety of selections in this title but felt the publisher did not include teacher-friendly support. For example, there is no explicit listing or correlating of standards on either the Scope & Sequence or individual lessons. There are a variety of online resources, but the interface is clunky. Many student instructions are vague and/or unsupported (like "write a conclusion" without explaining how a strong conclusion is put together). The writing rubrics are generic as to be meaningless. Student questions are sometimes general, and don't regularly require students to support their answers with evidence. Overall, it's a nice collection of material with inadequate structure and support.

Reviewer #: 5

*Background and experience:*

I have taught high school English for the past 26 years. I have experience in teaching all levels of high school ELA; however, the majority of the 26 years has been teaching 9th and 10th grade English including Pre AP English 9. I taught on the Navajo Reservation for 12 years which created an awareness of the importance of culturally relevant materials in our New Mexico classrooms. Currently I am a literacy coach for our entire district.

*Professional summary of material:*

This material contains an selection of literature suited for ninth grade ELA. However, it lacks aligning any of the material to the Common Core State Standards. As an English teacher, one would strive to align lessons, activities and standards to ensure college and career readiness. This material is extremely difficult for teachers to utilize and be able to create lessons structured for standards-based learning. In addition, it is challenging to assess student learning due to the lack of assessments connected to the CCSS. Tasks are not rigorous or suited for differentiation for gifted students.

Reviewer #: 6

*Background and experience:*

I am a Level II licensed teacher with TESOL endorsement. I have been teaching ELA for 10 years. I have been a member of the committee responsible for creating ELA writing prompts for the New Mexico standards-based assessment.

*Professional summary of material:*

The material in general has reading selections both in print and e-selections that are on par with the grade level standards. They vary from anthology of the classics to modern literature alongside the categorized activities suggested for each reading selection. It gives teachers the agency to modify the lessons. However, since the standards are not explicitly stated on the material, it takes time for teachers to identify which suggested activities suit a particular standard. The online tools for close reading help in student engagement. There are available activities for speaking and listening, too, although they need more specific instructions with guided rubrics. In terms of writing, there is a need for in-depth lessons for the use of discipline-specific style manuals and identifying/integrating credible sources in student writing activities. In summary, the material has varied and engaging selections and activities, but the structure can be improved to be teacher-friendly, and to be more rigorous in advancing student growth.

Reviewer #: 48

*Background and experience:*

Ph.D. Education Sciences (USA), Masters in Educational Research (UK), Masters in English Linguistics (UK)  
Level 3 NM License, Instructional Leader (endorsements: ELA, Reading, Educational Tech Coordinator)

*Experience:*

2 yrs- High School ELA Grade 12  
2yrs- Project Head, Educational Research  
6 yrs- University Faculty ELA Pedagogy

*Professional summary of material:*

EMC School/Carnegie Learning's Mirrors & Windows for Grade 9 illustrates the ELA grade level standards at a bare minimum while addressing the New Mexico Standards in a limited manner.

The online/digital interface is noteworthy as a repository of resources such as extended text selections, ebooks and handbooks containing skills-based tasks, extension activities, and assessment guides. I was thrilled to see the extensive support available for teachers particularly in the form of ready-to-use worksheets aligned to texts within each Unit and editable lesson plans in the "Program Planning Guide". Also, a wealth of material is available in the ebooks titled, "Differentiated Instruction: ELLs", "Differentiated Instruction: Reading Strategies & Skills" and "Assessment Guides" to use towards 'scaffolded instruction' for culturally and linguistically diverse student populations including ELLs and students with IEPs. All these resources could potentially save teachers a lot of instructional time. Unfortunately, these resources are not prominently referenced in the Teacher or Student Edition which makes it burdensome for teachers to use these hidden nuggets in the limited time available for planning. Another limitation is presented by the scoring rubrics that do not address listening & speaking skills while those for writing (exception being informative writing) are too generic. This diffuses the purpose of supporting students through a solid skills focused ELA program.

The curriculum presents an array of diverse, stimulating, and engaging text selections that have been utilized fairly well to create skills-integrated teaching and learning opportunities in ELA. For example, reading instruction is integrated with writing and speaking skills through text-dependent questions based on the five tiers of Anderson's Taxonomy namely, Remembering, Understanding, Applying, Analyzing, Evaluating, and Creating.

Another thoughtful element is the three tiered vocabulary framework to introduce, extend, and practice words presented across the text selections within each Unit. This may bring a huge assistance for teachers in New Mexico high schools struggling to implement this framework.

Though the deficits of this curriculum are few, they cannot be disregarded. Particularly, the curriculum comes across as scant with reference to 'New Mexico content standards' - adhering to which is a compulsory requirement for school curricula in New Mexico. Also, the technological interface serves no more than a repository that needs to be better harnessed for a holistic new-age teaching and learning experience especially in times where schools will move online.

Reviewer #: 49

*Background and experience:*

Bachelor's Degree

Level 2 NM Elementary and Secondary Teaching Licenses with Endorsements in Business Education and Reading

7 years ELA - 6th Grade

1 year ELA - 7th Grade

1 year ELA - 9th-12 Grades

*Professional summary of material:*

Both the digital and print versions are, for the most part, user friendly. There are a multitude of grammar, writing, collaborative and differentiated activities. Mirrors & Windows provides students with opportunities to evaluate and reflect on their own perspectives and biases which leads to learning about society as a whole. The materials have a diverse set of authors and texts with creative activities that challenge all learners. This curriculum tries to incorporate NM adopted standards, but doesn't fully integrate them. They have done a great job with a variety of texts and activities.

Reviewer #: 50

*Background and experience:*

MA - Curriculum and Instruction, BS --Psychology & Agriculture

NM Educators License: PreK-12 Specialty, with endorsements in, ELA, TESOL, Psychology, Agriculture, and Science

Teacher of ELA in the NM Public Schools for 9 years and Science for 7 years

Currently: ELA Department Head and Freshman Honors ELA & AVID teacher

*Professional summary of material:*

The premise of the curriculum, Mirrors & Windows, is based on the following idea from Sydney J. Harris: "The whole purpose of education is to turn mirrors into windows." This idea is brilliantly embedded into each lesson within every unit. The "Mirrors & Windows" practice provides students with an invaluable opportunity to evaluate and reflect on their own perspectives and biases. In doing so they could potentially learn to view the world objectively, as a global society, where people are people no matter where they come from - and we are all people. The materials provide students the opportunity to engage in skills correlated with a rich collection of works from a diverse set of authors. There are multiple opportunities for students to personally connect with the materials, making learning meaningful. Unfortunately, the materials cannot be fully recommended. One reason is that the 9-10 ELA CCSS and the NMB Standards are not discussed, embedded or listed anywhere in the physical materials. There is a function in the digital materials where teachers can look up the standards and see which lessons they are attached to. However, trying to use this function to see if the lessons collectively meet all of the standards to ensure students have the opportunity to meet mastery would take a master teacher days to map. It is not evident if all lessons from the physical materials could be assigned digitally, as there are Electronic Lessons noted in the TE that can only be previewed online, consequently, furthering the problem of mapping of the 9-10 ELA CCSS.