

2020 Instructional Material Summer Review Institute

Review Team Appraisal of Title  
(9-12 English Language Arts)

This appraisal form is provided for use by educators responsible for the selection of instructional materials for implementation with districts and charter schools across New Mexico to meet the need of their student populations.

This appraisal form should be used in conjunction with the publisher provided Form D: Research Based Effectiveness Determination that supports this reviewed material which can be found on the Instructional Material Bureau website.

<https://webnew.ped.state.nm.us/bureaus/instructional-materials/the-adoption-cycle/>

Text Title	Paths to College and Career in English Language Arts Digital Student Edition (Online Platform/Digital and Print Curriculum)	Publisher	Wiley/Jossey-Bass
SE ISBN	0000426855124	TE ISBN	0000426855123
SW ISBN		Grade Level	12

**Core Instructional Material Designation** (Core Instructional Material is the comprehensive print or digital educational material, including basal material, which constitutes the necessary instructional components of a full academic course of study in those subjects for which the department has adopted content standards and benchmarks.)

Recommended  
(90% and above)

Recommended with Reservations  
(80-89%)

Not Recommended and  
Not Adopted  
(below 80%)

**Total Score** - Below is the final score for the materials averaged between the team of reviewers.

Average Score
70%

**Cultural and Linguistic Relevance Recognition** - Materials are reviewed for criteria pertaining to the support for teachers and students in the material regarding cultural relevance and the inclusion of a culturally responsive lens. Those materials receiving a score of 90% or above on the CLR portion of the review receive this recognition.

CLR Recognition

Average Score
45%

Materials take into account cultural perspectives.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence (autofilled from All Content Appraisal tab):

Texts, such as "A Daily Joy to Be Alive" by Jimmy Santiago Baca and "Yellow Woman and a Beauty of the Spirit" by Leslie Marmon Silko, take cultural perspectives into account in a limited, broadstroke manner. Evidence of this can be seen in Module 2, TRB pg.176, Model 12.2 Performance Assessment Exit Slip : "Explain an important new insight you learned from discussing the prompts from the perspective of your assigned specific author/character. How did perspectives presented by your peers during discussion affect your understanding of the module texts?"

Materials include a culturally responsive lens.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence (autofilled from All Content Appraisal tab):

There is little instructional material that has students engage in learning through a culturally responsive lens. Examples of these materials are the poem "A Daily Joy to Be Alive" by Jimmy Santiago Baca and "Yellow Woman and a Beauty of the Spirit" by Leslie Marmon Silko. These two texts have students explore Native American and Chicano "identity" themes. Lessons that follow have students investigate their own identity in the format of addressing Common College Prompts, such as seen in the Module 1 TRB: p.10: Common Application Prompts - "Recount an incident or time when you experienced a failure. What prompted you to act? Would you make the same decision again?" and "Reflect on a time when you challenged a belief or idea. What prompted you to act? Would you make the same decision again?" Unfortunately, the lack of materials utilized to explore various cultural lenses would inhibit an important skill students need to develop to be successful in a global society.

<b>Standards Review</b> - Materials are reviewed for alignment with the state adopted content standards, benchmarks and performance standards.	
	Average Score
	69%
Materials align with grade level standards overall.	
<i>Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:</i>	
Although the materials are partially aligned with ELA grade level standards, they do not fully address the New Mexico Standards. While the reading, speaking and listening modules are moderately aligned to the standards and the writing module comes close to complete alignment, the materials present insufficient evidence for alignment with the language standards. The format and organization of the Student Journals and their correlation with the Teacher Guide is counterintuitive to the overall purpose of a seamless teaching and learning experience. Lessons in the Student Journals (SJ) are not sequential and are sometimes missing. For example, in the SJ Module 2, lessons are ordered 4, 15, 16, 11, 16 (again), 21, and 22.	
Materials align to reading standards.	
<i>Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:</i>	
Many modules and lessons, including instructional activities, align with the reading standards moderately well. The text selections are reasonably well-ranged across varied genres, exposition styles, and themes to account for teaching and learning textual analysis in a sophisticated and extensive manner. For example, the reading activities across lessons (e.g Module 1 SJ: p 20-23) that utilize the "Style and Content Tool" identify and analyze the rhetoric and style that supports the author's purpose. However, the material does not foreground the period nor does it provide insight into the biographical identities of authors, as a way to contextualize the literature. This limits exploration of intertextuality as an important reading skill that could lead towards a more holistic appreciation for literary and informational works.	
Materials align to writing standards.	
<i>Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:</i>	
The materials generally meet grade level writing standards. In fact, the research writing modules, accompanied by strategic tools and rubrics, are the highlight of this material. This is evidenced by a well-ranged spread of writing activities. For example, text-based analytical responses using the "Evidence-based Perspective and Outline Tool" help students collect, evaluate and organize evidence to distinguish between claims and counterclaims (Module 3, TRB, p 142-144), as well as support topic development based on selective information and most relevant examples (Module 3, SJ, p 92-95). Moreover, writing prompts, together with the checklist (p. 155) and research frame/peer review accountability tools, help students perceive writing as a process that requires planning, revising, editing, getting feedback, and the like.	
Materials align to speaking and listening standards.	
<i>Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:</i>	
The materials generally address the speaking and listening standards. There are multiple, well-ranged speaking and listening opportunities available to the students. Examples include common application interview questions (Module 1 SJ: pp. 10-11), Think-Pair-Share (Module 1 TG p. 151), and Claims and Evidence Small Group Discussion (Module 3 TG: pp. 90-91). The standards are integrated in reading activities and writing prompts based on the seed texts to provide a holistic language learning experience to students. This is accomplished through practice of advanced skills such as making claims, posing counter claims, reasoning, and presenting ideas. The "Speaking and Listening Checklist" and "Presentation Checklist" are available for students to evaluate a speaker's point of view and to revisit their reasoning in the light of alternate perspective (Module 2 SJ: p. 125). Particularly Module 3, which is focused on research practices, introduces the students to research-focused presentation skills. For example, students are guided to craft a 5-10 minute multimedia narrative on the progression of their research process that they present using the Checklist (Module 3 SJ pp. 55-56) and the "Speaking and Listening Rubric" (pp. 50-54). The "Presentation Checklist" along with worked models (Module 3 TRB p. 134-135) are also available to guide students in communicating the findings from their inquiry projects. Also, speaking and listening rubrics using 4-point scales help students focus on making strategic use of digital media in order to collaborate and present findings and reasoning (e.g. Module 3 SJ: p. 53). For speaking and listening standards, the missing link is the lack of modification and accommodations for linguistically and culturally diverse student populations, including ELL students and special needs students.	
Materials align to language standards.	
<i>Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:</i>	
The material is most limiting in its alignment to language standards. Language instruction, particularly morphology, etymology, vocabulary development, functional grammar, and syntax, do not feature in the lessons, with only vocabulary lists (e.g. Module 2 TG 135-136) compensating for the huge gap. With a well-ranged selection of representative texts across varied genres and exposition styles, it is a missed opportunity to not tap into the linguistic affordance provided by works such as "Civil Disobedience" and "Guns, Gems, and Steel". The material serves as a reasonable support towards accommodations and modifications in instruction. For example, vocabulary lists are available in each lesson and have been modified for ELL students. Prompts are provided for learners with learning difficulties. However, the accommodations should move beyond prompts and vocabulary lists towards pedagogical support for teachers engaging with ELL students and culturally/linguistically diverse student populations.	
Materials align to New Mexico content standards for ELA.	
<i>Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:</i>	

The material does not align with the New Mexico Content Standards for ELA (NM B1, NM B2, NM C1, NM C2). Although the material includes British texts, such as "Julius Caesar", American texts, such as "A Streetcar Named Desire", Russian Literature - "The Overcoat", and immigrant voices in texts like "The Namesake", it lacks a sincere investment in the rigor and depth to engage with regional Native American texts, such as "Yellow Woman and a Beauty of the Spirit" and "A Daily Joy to be Alive." For example, textual analysis tools, such as the "Style and Content Tool" (Module 1 SJ: pp. 20-23), were not utilized for the local and regional texts. The use of this tool could provide a better understanding of local works, along with exposing students to cultural and historical experiences and provide pedagogical support to teachers new to the local culture. Also, texts from Hispanic literature are scant. In sum, the material presents insufficient evidence of pedagogical efforts towards teaching literary characteristics, stylistics, and syntax unique to the rich literature generated by New Mexico during the past decades.

**ELA Content Review** - Materials are reviewed for relevant criteria pertaining to the support for teachers and students in the specific content area reviewed.

Average Score

95%

Materials provide a selection and range of high-quality texts worthy of students' time and attention, exhibiting exceptional craft and thought and/or providing useful information.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

The literary and informational texts provided in the four 12th grade *Paths to College and Career, English Language Arts* modules span multiple genres and authors. The variety of texts showcase many cultures, genders, and time periods. Literary works include classics, such as Shakespeare's "Julius Caesar" and Tennessee Williams's "A Streetcar Named Desire." Students are exposed to contemporary works, such as Jhumpa Lahiri's "The Namesake" and Karen Russell's "St. Lucy's Home for Girls Raised by Wolves." Seminal documents, like Dr. Martin Luther King Jr.'s "Letter from Birmingham Jail", are particularly worthy of students' time and attention as this text's events have impactfully changed the history of civil rights. Texts, including "Yellow Woman and a Beauty of the Spirit" by Leslie Marmon Silko and the poem "A Daily Joy to be Alive" by Jimmy Santiago Baca, engage students in a basic overview of New Mexico culture, while guiding them to explore the theme of identity, including their own, through culture, heritage, and language.

Questions in the materials are high-quality text-dependent and text-specific questions. The overwhelming majority of these questions are text-specific and draw student attention to the particulars in the text.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

Questions utilized in the materials are both explicit and inferential. Text dependent questions provide accompanying page numbers for student reference. Questions are used to facilitate a deeper level of comprehension and to synthesize central ideas presented in one or multiple texts. For example, in the Teacher Guide, Module 1, pp. 49-54, Activity 3: Reading and Discussion, questions are framed in this way: "How does the description of Malcolm X on page 35 demonstrate his character at the beginning of his journey to Boston?" and "What does Malcolm X mean by saying that Mr. Ostrowski's advice was 'in his nature as an American white man' (p. 37)?" Found in all modules are "Reading and Discussion" activities that chunk complex texts and/or ideas. There is also an opportunity in Module 3 for students to write their own inquiry questions based on the ideas and themes brought to the surface during different text analyses.

Materials provide scaffolding and supports to enable students' learning of English language arts.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

The materials provide a very basic scaffolding system to support students. Supports for ELL learners are scant. The majority of support for ELL learners comes in the form of chunking texts and providing students with vocabulary words and definitions to be copied into their Student Journals. Support during Reading and Discussion activities are framed like the following two examples from the Module 3, Teacher Guide: p. 77: Unit 1, Lesson 5: 1. "Differentiation Consideration: Consider posting or projecting the following guiding question to support students in their reading throughout the lesson: What does Diamond mean by 'proximate causation (p. 78)?" 2. "Differentiation Consideration: For additional support, consider providing students with copies of the Surfacing Issues Tool. See the 'Model Surfacing Issues Tool' for possible student responses." A Central Ideas Tracking Tool is found in the Module 1 Student Journal, on page 18. Other graphic organizers in the Student Journals are designed for students to collect relevant information needed to meet the standards and expectations found in the various types of assessments, such as the, 12.2 Performance Assessment Exit Slip, on page 161 in Module 2 Student Journal.

**All Content Review** - Materials are reviewed for relevant criteria pertaining to the support for teachers and students in the material regarding the progression of the standards, lesson structure, pacing, assessment, individual learners and cultural relevance.

Average Score

62%

Materials are coherent and consistent with the high school standards that all students should study in order to be college and career ready.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

The literary and informational texts provided in the four 12th grade *Paths to College and Career, English Language Arts* modules include multiple genres and authors. The provided texts meet the standards appropriately. Other materials, such as graphic organizers, rubrics, checklists, and reference handouts, are provided in a consistent format allowing students to become adept at using them with each module they are studying. The activities found in the modules prepare students for the skills required in college including, independent thinking, reading and writing, independent research, presentations, peer reviews, and collegial collaboration (fishbowl, peer reviews, annotating text, creating discussion questions). Evidence of this can be seen in Module 2, TG p.x: Standards Assessed and Addressed - "Paths includes frequent and varied opportunities to assess student learning and track their progress toward...the standards. These assessments can and should be used for formative purposes". Educators also may choose to select specific assessments for determining student progress...including rubrics and other tools that give the teacher data that may drive instruction or serve as a summative assessment."

Materials are well designed and take into account effective lesson structure and pacing.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

Each Module provides teachers with a Curriculum Map, a list of the Module-Specific Assessed CCSS, Mid and End-of-Unit assessments, a Module Performance Assessment, Module-at-a-Glance Calendars, an Introduction to each lesson and how it is connected to preceding and proceeding lessons, and an Agenda to be presented to students before each lesson. Each Unit within the Module supports the criterion that are outlined in the Curriculum Map. Lessons build on each other and concepts are revisited in order to allow for mastery of a Standard or a cohort of standards. Lessons provide an introduction, the standards within the lesson, the assessment students are working towards, vocabulary, agenda/overview, materials needed, and a Learning Sequence. Each unit has several activities for students to engage with in order to meet one or multiple standards. Activities include independent learning, partner learning, and small group or whole group learning. An example of this can be seen in the Module 1, TG, p.169: Activity 2: Homework Accountability - "Instruct students to talk in pairs about the discussion questions they developed for homework, specifically analyzing how individuals, ideas, and events interact and are developed." Further evidence includes such as seen in the Module 2 Teacher Guide, p.9, Lesson 2: "In Lesson 2, students participate in a fishbowl conversation in which a representative from each group discusses each of the Performance Assessment prompts from the point of view of the group's assigned author or character." Student Journals for each Module are hard to navigate and are frequently missing the lesson which correlates with the activities designated in the Teacher Edition; thus, relying on the teacher to have students "listen" to instructions rather than providing a reference for students to refer to as they complete, or engage in, a lesson within a small group or independently.

Materials support teacher planning, learning, and understanding of the standards.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

Each activity within a lesson has scripted instructions for teachers to follow. For example, Supporting Evidence: Module 2, Unit 1, Lesson 8 TG, pg.100: Activity 4 Quick Write - "Instruct students to look at their annotations to find evidence. Ask students to use this lesson's vocabulary wherever possible in their written responses. Remind students to use the Short Response Rubric and Checklist to guide their written responses." Facilitation for comprehension and application of the standards is apparent in most activities. This is often Indicated with an "i" (information), where the standard is given within an explanation of how it is being taught or addressed in a particular activity. Evidence of this can be seen in Module 2, Unit 1, Lesson 8 TG, pg.101: Activity 5 Closing - "Consider drawing students' attention to their application of standard L.11-12.4.c through the process of determining word meanings by consulting reference materials." The design of the materials make assumptions that students are adept at deciphering and applying the language designated in the CCSS.

Materials offer teachers resources and tools to collect ongoing data about student progress on the standards.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

Graphic organizers in Student Journals, Mid-Unit Assessments, and End of Unit Assessments offer teachers the tools to collect ongoing data about student progress on the standards. There is no formal data collection tool or support in place within the curriculum. Teachers are left to navigate data collection in their own manner. Evidence of this is found in Module 1 Student Journal, p.70: Central Ideas Tracking Tool on page 11, "Text-Focused Questions" and in Module 1's Student Journal, page 12: 12.1.1 Mid-Unit Assessment.

Materials support effective use of technology to enhance student learning. Digital materials are accessible and available in multiple platforms.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

Specific websites accompanying the lessons are listed at the beginning of some units. A multimedia journal is referenced throughout all Modules, but the description/format of this multimedia journal is not evident. Students watch *A Streetcar Named Desire* directed by Elia Kazan and record directorial and cinematic choices into a physical (not digital) journal. Students are encouraged to post assignments online in a "writing community", but technology and digital materials do not come across as a high priority. Evidence of this is found in the TRB, Module 4, Lesson 12 pp. 19-20: *A Streetcar Named Desire* Film Viewing Tool - "Use this tool (graphic organizer) to record your observations about Elia Kazan's directorial choices in the film, *A Streetcar Named Desire*. What do you notice about the characters, setting/set design, and cinematic choices the director makes in the film?". Other uses of technology are found in the format of Google Docs, as a way for students to work collaboratively on the writing process. The example shows students are to use the commentary function for "peer reviews". Evidence of this is found in the Student Journal, Module 3, pp. 121-129: "Sample Student Research-Based Argument Paper with Revisions: What Are the Best Ways for Developing Nations to Increase Economic Prosperity?" This task has the accompanying 'Peer Review Tool' on page 130. The last mention of technology comes from Module 3, where students are independently conducting a research project preceded by the tasks that accompany this process.

Materials can be easily customized for individual learners.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

There are "Differentiation Considerations" and "High Performance" options provided within some of the activities, as seen in the Teacher Edition Modules. Evidence of this can be seen in Module 2, Unit 1, Lesson 13 TG, pg. 152: Activity 4: Quick Write Differentiation Consideration: "If students need additional support in developing their discussion questions, distribute and review the Text-Focused Questions Handout." Options to assess students with disabilities (SWD), or customize lessons to meet the accommodations for SWD, are not available and could only be done as annotations *directly* in the physical materials by hand.

Materials give all students extensive opportunities and support to explore key concepts.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

The materials give students opportunities and support to explore key concepts, but not extensively. Evidence of this can be seen in Module 4, TG, Unit 1, Lesson 13, pgs. 141-142: Reading and Discussion, such as "Differentiation Consideration: "If students struggle, consider posing the following scaffolding question: How do lines 1–3 and the title relate to the rest of the poem?"

Materials take into account cultural perspectives.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

Texts, such as "A Daily Joy to Be Alive" by Jimmy Santiago Baca and "Yellow Woman and a Beauty of the Spirit" by Leslie Marmon Silko, take cultural perspectives into account in a limited, broadstroke manner. Evidence of this can be seen in Module 2, TRB pg.176, Model 12.2 Performance Assessment Exit Slip : "Explain an important new insight you learned from discussing the prompts from the perspective of your assigned specific author/character. How did perspectives presented by your peers during discussion affect your understanding of the module texts?"

Materials include a culturally responsive lens.

*Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:*

There is little instructional material that has students engage in learning through a culturally responsive lens. Examples of these materials are the poem "A Daily Joy to Be Alive" by Jimmy Santiago Baca and "Yellow Woman and a Beauty of the Spirit" by Leslie Marmon Silko. These two texts have students explore Native American and Chicano "identity" themes. Lessons that follow have students investigate their own identity in the format of addressing Common College Prompts, such as seen in the Module 1 TRB: p.10: Common Application Prompts - "Recount an incident or time when you experienced a failure. What prompted you to act? Would you make the same decision again?" and "Reflect on a time when you challenged a belief or idea. What prompted you to act? Would you make the same decision again?" Unfortunately, the lack of materials utilized to explore various cultural lenses would inhibit an important skill students need to develop to be successful in a global society.

**Reviewers' Professional Summation** - These materials are reviewed by Level II and Level III educators from across New Mexico. The reviewers have brought their knowledge, experience and expertise into the review of these materials. They offer here their individual summary of the material as a whole.

Reviewer #: 48

**Background and experience:**

Ph.D in Education Sciences (USA) \*Masters in Educational Research (UK) \*Masters in English Linguistics (UK)

Level 3A Teaching License

Experience:

Teaching ELA at High School-12th grade (2 yrs);

University Faculty in M.Ed. program (6 yrs);

Project Head, Edu Research (2 yrs)

**Professional summary of material:**

*Paths to College and Career in English Language Arts* requires further thought and development. At this point, this curriculum cannot be recommended. Despite having a reasonably good spread of solid and engaging text selections that lend themselves to effective teaching and learning opportunities in ELA, the material considerably falls short in addressing Language Standards and New Mexico Standards. Technological affordances have not been utilized to make the learning process engaging and gratifying for the new age learners. My biggest concern is that the accommodations and modifications provided in the material are sparse and disregard the presence of integrated pedagogical approaches for culturally and linguistically diverse student populations, including ELLs and students with IEPs.

In terms of alignment with standards of Reading, Writing, and Speaking & Listening, the curriculum fares moderately well. The highlight of this material is a module dedicated to inquiry and research practice (Module 3) where the text-based guided inquiry process comes across as inclusive, interdisciplinary, and rigorous. The module stands out as an example where pedagogy in the four language skills comes together in a purposeful manner.

In terms of deficiencies, the curriculum misses out on instructional material focused on language development including morphology, etymology, vocabulary, and syntax. There is little to no attention given to New Mexico standards and a few local/regional text selections are included without sincere efforts to design the curriculum for exposure to common literary characteristics, stylistics, and syntax unique to the rich literature generated by New Mexico. Moreover, any reference to 'technology' comes across as cosmetic, since the material fails to take advantage of the interactive abilities afforded by technology, especially in the current global situation where teaching will exclusively or partially move to online platforms.

Reviewer #: 49

**Background and experience:**

Bachelor's degree

Level 2 teaching license

Highly qualified in ELA at the middle level and secondary level, endorsed in Business and Reading

Seven years teaching ELA at the 6th grade level

One year teaching ELA at the 7th grade level

One year teaching ELA at the high school level

**Professional summary of material:**

*Paths to college and Career English Language Arts* has serviceable intentions, but mediocre materials. I do not recommend this curriculum.

The chosen texts are of sound substance, but overall the lessons and the student journal have significant deficiencies. There are many missed opportunities in regards to cultural diversity. Reading and analyzing culturally diverse texts is not integrating community, traditions, or personal experiences. Students learn when they can personally relate to texts and materials. There are minimal and missed opportunities within this curriculum to integrate cultural lessons and activities. The vocabulary activities consist only of copying vocabulary words and definitions into a vocabulary journal. Evidence of grammar content is little to none. There is some mention of "technology", such as listed websites, a multimedia journal, and suggestions of uploading drafts, but that is the extent of integrating technology. There is an online version of the curriculum with no interactive components. This curriculum does not meet 21st century expectations.

For ELL, special needs, and below proficiency students, there is very limited help. Suggestions are very basic, such as "pause frequently when reading", "consider posting or projecting guiding questions", and "provide students with definitions". These suggestions are practices made in classrooms everyday for all students. There are a few suggestions throughout the Modules for High Performance students.

Reviewer #: 50

**Background and experience:**

MA in Curriculum and Instruction

Level 3A NM PreK-12 Specialty Teacher's License, with endorsements in ELA, TESOL, Psychology, Agriculture, and Science. Currently teacher of HS Freshman Honors ELA, and AVID. Language Arts Department Head for Pojoaque Valley High School. Completed nine years of teaching in the NM Public Schools in the content areas of Science, ELA, Mathematics, and AVID. Provided Science PD for teachers affiliated with the LANL Foundation ISEC program. Member of LANL ISEC Teacher Leader Cadre. Additional certifications: GLAD Level 2, and, AVID II

*Professional summary of material:*

The materials provide rich texts that are used to teach students about 18th and 19th century British culture, drama, science, and civil rights. Materials do an adequate job introducing students to New Mexico culture through the lens of Native American and Chicano works. While the curriculum map shows the dynamic array of texts available for students to potentially engage in, only a handful of them are interfaced with the provided Student Materials, as well as used (as denoted in the Teacher Materials) for the depth of studies needed to prepare students fully for the breadth of work required at a collegial level. For schools that lack the capability of having student technology at a 1:1 ratio, these materials would suffice. There are few media opportunities for students, but those provided have tools that support students in how to use technology responsibly and appropriately. The materials would have to be supplemented or tweaked in order to adequately meet the added NM based Standards and the Common Core Language Standards required of 12th grade ELA. There are no opportunities for students to analyze the implications or connotations of pictures or other mediums of art, other than the film *A Streetcar Named Desire* and the BBC production of *Julius Caesar*.