

BEFORE THE PUBLIC EDUCATION COMMISSION

STATE OF NEW MEXICO

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS  
OPEN PUBLIC MEETING  
VOLUME TWO

December 10, 2020

9:02 a.m.

CONDUCTED VIA VIDEO TELECONFERENCE

REPORTED BY: Cynthia C. Chapman, RMR-CRR, NM CCR #219

Bean & Associates, Inc.

Professional Court Reporting Service

201 Third Street, NW, Suite 1630

Albuquerque, New Mexico 87102

JOB NO.: 3829N (CC)

284

1           A P P E A R A N C E S  
 2   COMMISSIONERS:  
 3   MS. PATRICIA GIPSON, Chair  
 4   MS. TRISH RUIZ, Vice Chair  
 5   MS. KARYL ANN ARMBRUSTER, Secretary  
 6   MR. R. CARLOS CABALLERO, Member  
 7   MR. MICHAEL CHAVEZ, Member  
 8   MR. TIM CRONE, Member  
 9   MS. GEORGINA DAVIS, Member  
 10   MS. M. SONIA RAFTERY, Member  
 11   MR. DAVID ROBBINS, Member  
 12   MS. GLENNA VOIGT, Member  
 13  
 14   PED STAFF:  
 15   MS. KAREN WOERNER, Deputy Director,  
 16           Options for Parents and Families  
 17   MS. MELISSA BROWN, Technical Assistance  
 18           and Training Administrator  
 19  
 20   PEC COUNSEL:  
 21   AMI JAEGER, ESQ.  
 22   ELIZABETH JEFFREYS, ESQ.  
 23  
 24  
 25

285

1           I N D E X   T O   P R O C E E D I N G S  
 2   PAGE  
 3   6   Discussion and Action on Charter School   337  
 4        Renewal Applications - Continued  
 5   6A   North Valley Academy - Albuquerque   337  
 6   6B   Red River Valley Charter - Red River   384  
 7   6C   Six Directions - Gallup                442  
 8   9   Discussion and Possible Action on        287  
 9        the Perkins Annual Report Submission  
 10        Due December 31, 2020  
 11   REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE                 541  
 12   ATTACHMENTS:  
 13   1   Zoom List of Attendees  
 14  
 15  
 16  
 17  
 18  
 19  
 20  
 21  
 22  
 23  
 24  
 25

286

1           THE CHAIR: So we have everyone here. So  
 2   I'm going to call back into session this meeting of  
 3   the Public Education Commission. It is Thursday,  
 4   December 10th, and it is 9:02 a.m. So, Commissioner  
 5   Armbruster, will you do roll, please?  
 6           COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Absolutely.  
 7   Commissioner Robbins?  
 8           COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Present.  
 9           COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  
 10   Crone?  
 11           COMMISSIONER CRONE: Here.  
 12           COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  
 13   Ruiz?  
 14           COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Here.  
 15           COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  
 16   Voigt?  
 17           COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Here.  
 18           COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  
 19   Davis?  
 20           COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Here.  
 21           COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  
 22   Gipson?  
 23           THE CHAIR: Here.  
 24           COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  
 25   Chavez?

287

1           (No response.)  
 2           COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: He's coming  
 3   late.  
 4           THE CHAIR: He's coming late.  
 5           COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  
 6   Armbruster is here.  
 7           Commissioner Raftery? You were here.  
 8           THE CHAIR: She's here.  
 9           COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: She's muted.  
 10           Commissioner Raftery?  
 11           COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: I'm here. Sorry.  
 12   I was muted.  
 13           COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: You were.  
 14           COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: I'm here.  
 15           THE CHAIR: So there's nine Commissioners  
 16   present at this moment.  
 17           COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Nine present.  
 18           And we're going to start with Dr. Perea?  
 19           THE CHAIR: Yes, yes.  
 20           COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: I am leaving for  
 21   a few minutes. I have to give the dog insulin.  
 22   Sorry. I'll be right back. I'm not leaving.  
 23           THE CHAIR: Thanks. So, Commissioners, as  
 24   I mentioned yesterday, Dr. Perea, who is No. 9 on  
 25   the agenda, had asked if it would be possible for

288

1 her to come Thursday morning. So we're going to  
2 hear our first school of this morning, North Valley  
3 Academy, after Dr. Perea.

4 So, Karen, do you want to bring Dr. Perea  
5 in, please?

6 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Absolutely. Good  
7 morning, Elaine. I love your picture.

8 DR. ELAINE PEREA: That's my high school  
9 graduation picture.

10 Commissioner Voigt, just for you, I put my  
11 background -- that's a Kenya photo from --

12 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Oh, nice.

13 THE CHAIR: Oh, my goodness.

14 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you. I've  
15 still been reading about some trips out there.

16 DR. ELAINE PEREA: I've looked through all  
17 my pictures. We have amazing memories.

18 THE CHAIR: So, Dr. Perea, thanks for  
19 giving us the time this morning. You know, since  
20 I've been on the Commission -- and a lot of my  
21 schooling on the Perkins Grant came as a result of  
22 former Commissioner Toulouse, who it was always near  
23 and dear to her heart, as it is with most of us.

24 But because she also sat on the CNM Board,  
25 and the CNM Board was the receiving agent of the

290

1 certainly haven't voted on any of them. And I know  
2 when you came to a work session not that long ago,  
3 you kind of alluded to a -- a recycling or a  
4 rebooting of it.

5 So I'm just a little concerned, because  
6 these are funds that are very important to the State  
7 and to our schools. And I'm a little concerned as  
8 to why we haven't been given the reports and the  
9 opportunity to vote on them, as I understand --  
10 well, I don't understand; I know -- it's part of our  
11 duty to do that.

12 So I -- you know, anything that you can  
13 offer us to enlighten us on that, we'd really  
14 appreciate it.

15 DR. ELAINE PEREA: Thank you for the  
16 opportunity to present today. I did prepare a draft  
17 of the narrative and the performance indicators to  
18 present to you all today. So happy to -- to kind of  
19 give you an overview of the Annual Report.

20 The -- the Perkins V, as it's commonly  
21 known, which is The Expanding Career-Technical  
22 Education for the 21st Century Act (verbatim), went  
23 into effect in July of '19. The Perkins V law  
24 changed some of -- some definitions and some  
25 practicalities of how the -- how the funds are

289

1 monies, she was always very attuned to the cycling  
2 of the Perkins Grant. And it was, for most of the  
3 years, the common practice for your division to come  
4 to us in December with the -- with the report.

5 And I know, in particular, Commissioner  
6 Caballero would go through that Perkins report with  
7 a fine-tooth comb, that that was -- and he always  
8 wanted sufficient time to be able to look at it so  
9 that he could ask questions. So that it's always  
10 been something that was on our minds and interested  
11 us, and we wanted to make sure that we were good  
12 stewards of it.

13 When the State -- so for Commissioners who  
14 may not be aware, the State School Board used to be  
15 the receiver of the Perkins funds. And when the  
16 State School Board was disbanded, the PEC was  
17 created. And there still needed to be a board to be  
18 the serving agent for the money. So that was given  
19 to the PEC.

20 And it was the common practice for the  
21 division to come to us with that report, and we  
22 would vote on it and accept it. And I even signed,  
23 I think, the one year when I was chair that it was  
24 brought to us.

25 But now, we haven't heard the reports. We

291

1 administered. And, most importantly, the State  
2 plan, which we developed in consultation with many,  
3 many stakeholders across the state, the State plan  
4 spells out how the funds are going to be  
5 administered.

6 As I told this body the last time that I  
7 was here, we have made significant changes in the  
8 eligibility and have expanded delivery  
9 substantially.

10 This report is for the school year  
11 '19-'20. So it precedes the period where we have  
12 had a massive increase in participation. So this  
13 report is for school year '19-'20.

14 We had about one-third of eligible  
15 districts participating during '19-'20. '19-'20 is  
16 a transition year, where we were coming off of  
17 Perkins IV and on to Perkins V. Because of that,  
18 there are a variety of reporting anomalies, both  
19 last December and this December, because of the  
20 reauthorization.

21 So there were many things that were --  
22 reporting requirements that were not required last  
23 December, and this December as well. The reporting  
24 requirements are different than they have been  
25 historically, as the -- as the U.S. Department of

292

1 Education is transitioning from one set of laws to  
2 the other.

3 THE CHAIR: So I'm sorry. I don't mean to  
4 interrupt. But I just need to make it clear. So  
5 you're saying that the Department of Education has  
6 changed the requirements, and the Perkins money does  
7 not have to flow through a board or commission as  
8 the receiving agent. Is that what -- because that's  
9 what currently has happened.

10 We, as the Commission, have not been a  
11 part of that process. And it had been -- up until a  
12 year-and-a-half ago, we voted on it, and we signed  
13 it as the receiving agent, our understanding that a  
14 board or commission has to be the receiving agent.

15 So you're saying that that has now changed  
16 and someone else can sign off on the report?  
17 Because we haven't.

18 DR. ELAINE PEREA: The report itself is  
19 signed by me as the director and by Marian Rael, as  
20 the chief financial officer of the agency.

21 The award letter --

22 THE CHAIR: It's always been signed by  
23 the -- after a vote by the Commission, it's been  
24 signed by the Chair of the Commission, as well,  
25 because we are the board that is the receiving

294

1 think probably two -- where the presentation  
2 occurred, and we voted on it.

3 And I know I sent an e-mail two years ago  
4 asking, "How come this isn't coming to us, and how  
5 come we're not voting on this, and why isn't this on  
6 the agenda," because it has always been, since the  
7 inception of the Commission, that the report came to  
8 the Commission, and the Commission voted to approve  
9 the report.

10 And we got no response to that --

11 DR. ELAINE PEREA: I'm here today to do  
12 that, as you've requested. I really -- that's --  
13 that's why I'm here. I'm happy to do that at this  
14 time, if you would like to hear the report.

15 THE CHAIR: But the problem is if I hadn't  
16 asked, and the expectation -- see, here's where  
17 the -- here's where the root of this lies. The  
18 expectation is that the Commission has been taken  
19 out of the process and there's no expectation that  
20 the Commission needs to vote on this report.

21 If I hadn't asked, it never would have  
22 happened. In prior years, we were always reminded  
23 for this to go on the agenda, because we needed to  
24 vote on this. And now we have just been removed  
25 from the entire process. And that's the root of the

293

1 agent. And then the monies do -- you're absolutely  
2 right -- the monies go to PED as the fiscal agent.

3 DR. ELAINE PEREA: I'm not familiar with  
4 that policy or those procedures in the time that  
5 I've been working in the agency. My understanding  
6 is that preceding me, the prior two directors also  
7 were the signators, and the award letter has always  
8 been directed to the Secretary of the PED, as far as  
9 I know.

10 I'm sorry that -- I'm -- I'm not more  
11 versed in the history of the responsibilities. But  
12 I can tell you that the -- that the award letter  
13 that is issued by the Department of Education is  
14 issued to the Public Education Department and that  
15 the Secretary's name and my name are on those award  
16 letters.

17 I do not know if there's some -- I  
18 don't -- I don't know if the PEC Chair has ever been  
19 on the award letters; but not to my knowledge in the  
20 last six years.

21 THE CHAIR: I have signed as -- after we  
22 have voted and accepted the report that would go,  
23 that's where the signature of the Chair went. And  
24 that -- and you were maybe not the head of the  
25 division. But you were present at at least one -- I

295

1 concern.

2 DR. ELAINE PEREA: So I am here today to  
3 present as requested. I don't know what else to say  
4 to you. I'm sorry that -- that that's not a  
5 satisfactory response. But I am here, happy to tell  
6 you what the report says and --

7 THE CHAIR: So you have no -- you have no  
8 response to the fact that the -- that your division  
9 has stopped presenting, for a vote, the report.  
10 That's the concern.

11 DR. ELAINE PEREA: Yeah. I do not have a  
12 response for your concern.

13 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Madam Chair, it's  
14 in statute. It hasn't been removed.

15 THE CHAIR: And it's a federal law.

16 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: And the Secretary  
17 of Education knows that, or should know that.  
18 And -- and that -- this department that we're  
19 talking to should have -- or should have -- should  
20 know, if it doesn't know already. But the fact that  
21 it's in statute, they are presumed to know that we  
22 review and approve, and that's in the realm of our  
23 authority.

24 I, for one, have been pushing for constant  
25 reporting. And I would like to see the copy of

<p style="text-align: right;">296</p> <p>1 the -- of the report she's alluding to.</p> <p>2 THE CHAIR: Absolutely. Absolutely.</p> <p>3 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Madam Chair?</p> <p>4 THE CHAIR: I'm sorry.</p> <p>5 MS. KAREN WOERNER: I'm sorry,</p> <p>6 Madam Chair, Commissioner Caballero. The report is</p> <p>7 in your packet of information.</p> <p>8 THE CHAIR: It's in the SharePoint.</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Okay. I missed</p> <p>10 it.</p> <p>11 THE CHAIR: But, Dr. Perea, if there's</p> <p>12 something -- I don't know if you want to share a</p> <p>13 screen. So whatever you would like to offer. And</p> <p>14 Commissioner Caballero certainly, after the fact, or</p> <p>15 after he's had a chance to look at it, can address</p> <p>16 questions to you.</p> <p>17 But I'm going to publicly address my</p> <p>18 serious concern over the Perkins grant, because we</p> <p>19 have not -- we have been removed from the process.</p> <p>20 And it is in -- as Commissioner Caballero said, it</p> <p>21 is in statute; it was specifically given to us, and</p> <p>22 the federal reporting requires that it -- that it be</p> <p>23 the receiving agent is the -- is a board or a</p> <p>24 commission.</p> <p>25 And then, you're absolutely right. As I</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">298</p> <p>1 of particular classifications that are required by</p> <p>2 the -- by the Act.</p> <p>3 And so the -- the first section talks</p> <p>4 about how -- how state institution awards are</p> <p>5 determined. That's -- because we only give \$10,000</p> <p>6 a year, we award every other year, and we give the</p> <p>7 state institutions a two-year grant.</p> <p>8 The next section talks about</p> <p>9 non-traditional fields. Non-traditional fields are</p> <p>10 fields where less than 25 percent of one gender is</p> <p>11 represented.</p> <p>12 So classic examples of this are welding,</p> <p>13 where most employees are men; firefighting, where</p> <p>14 most employees are men; many STEM careers.</p> <p>15 And then there are also some</p> <p>16 non-traditional careers where men are</p> <p>17 under-represented. And so that would be teaching</p> <p>18 and nursing in particular are examples of the</p> <p>19 careers where less than 25 percent of employees are</p> <p>20 male.</p> <p>21 So we have supported non-traditional</p> <p>22 fields with a grant. This was a competitive grant</p> <p>23 that several schools applied for. And we awarded</p> <p>24 that grant to the Las Cruces Public Schools, because</p> <p>25 it is one of the larger post-secondary districts --</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">297</p> <p>1 said, the monies do go to PED for distribution,</p> <p>2 because we don't have -- we are not a Board of</p> <p>3 Finance. So -- but the reports are supposed to be</p> <p>4 accepted by us. And it had been the practice. And</p> <p>5 it's just disappointing and concerning.</p> <p>6 Oh. Commissioner Voigt? Sorry. You're</p> <p>7 muted.</p> <p>8 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Dr. Perea -- so</p> <p>9 when -- this is a draft. When does the final get</p> <p>10 submitted to the feds?</p> <p>11 DR. ELAINE PEREA: The final is due</p> <p>12 December 31st. We may have to ask for an extension.</p> <p>13 And I'd be happy to talk through that. I was</p> <p>14 intending to explain to you why that may be the</p> <p>15 case.</p> <p>16 If you would like -- I can address that</p> <p>17 right now, or I can kind of go somewhat in order</p> <p>18 of -- of what I've provided for you.</p> <p>19 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Sure. Whatever is</p> <p>20 easier for you. I was just curious. Thanks.</p> <p>21 DR. ELAINE PEREA: Let me just kind of</p> <p>22 walk you through the narrative. What I've provided</p> <p>23 in the narrative is answers to the questions that</p> <p>24 the federal government asks of us describing our</p> <p>25 leadership activities and our results in a variety</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">299</p> <p>1 I mean secondary districts. And so they got a</p> <p>2 \$60,000 award that allowed them to hire a work-based</p> <p>3 learning coordinator specifically addressing</p> <p>4 non-traditional learners and helping with</p> <p>5 non-traditional placements.</p> <p>6 So the goal there was to get, especially</p> <p>7 female students, into STEM positions. Las Cruces</p> <p>8 has a robust STEM economy, and so this work-based</p> <p>9 learning person helped girls get work-based learning</p> <p>10 experiences.</p> <p>11 So there was also a smaller \$10,000 award.</p> <p>12 We gave two of those, one to Northern New Mexico and</p> <p>13 the other to San Juan Colleges. In both cases,</p> <p>14 those awards were for marketing efforts to help</p> <p>15 recruit females into high-wage, high-in-demand,</p> <p>16 high-skilled positions.</p> <p>17 The next part is about state institutions.</p> <p>18 The Perkins Act does require us to provide funding</p> <p>19 specifically to state institutions. '19-'20 was the</p> <p>20 second year of a two-year award to the Department of</p> <p>21 Corrections.</p> <p>22 And the Department of Corrections used</p> <p>23 \$10,000 to support female inmates who were</p> <p>24 incarcerated for a year or more. And those female</p> <p>25 inmates took a program at NMSU Grants, where they</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">300</p> <p>1 got -- they worked towards a computer science 2 certificate so that they would be in a better 3 position to pursue employment after -- after their 4 incarceration time.</p> <p>5 The next section asks about 6 preparing/retaining CTE teachers, specialized 7 instruction support personnel and paraprofessionals. 8 And for three years, we have used leadership funds 9 in New Mexico for what we call the Work-Based 10 Learning Initiative. Nine subgrantees received 11 those awards. They were \$60,000 per subgrantee. 12 And those funds were used to hire work-based 13 learning coordinators.</p> <p>14 Those coordinators were specifically 15 tasked with finding employers in the community so 16 that students could have a learning experience in an 17 authentic workplace environment. This was the third 18 year of that program.</p> <p>19 So the next section asks about technical 20 assistance. This is the core of the work of my 21 team. We provide extensive technical assistance all 22 across the state. In a non-pandemic year, my team 23 puts on thousands of miles driving all over the 24 state to provide technical assistance to CTE 25 teachers and administrators. They make sure that</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">302</p> <p>1 means is that they could have taken any three 2 courses within one of the 16 career clusters that 3 are identified by the Department of Labor.</p> <p>4 I'll use agriculture as an example. It's 5 a broad field that includes energy; it includes 6 forestry; it includes all kinds of farming and 7 ranching, as well as food systems, which is the 8 delivery, the slaughter, the packaging. The whole 9 processing of food systems is all encompassed in 10 that cluster called "Agriculture."</p> <p>11 In Perkins IV, a student could take three 12 introductory classes in fairly varied courses that 13 were all within the agricultural cluster, and they 14 would be considered a concentrator.</p> <p>15 Perkins V has significantly tightened that 16 definition. So now a concentrator need only take 17 two courses. But they must be sequential. They 18 must be in a program that is directed. For example, 19 forestry versus food systems; they're very different 20 programs. They're both within agricultural cluster.</p> <p>21 A student in the past could have taken one 22 food systems course, one basic intro-to-ag course 23 and one forestry course, and that student would be 24 considered a concentrator.</p> <p>25 Now, in Perkins V, they have to take two</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">301</p> <p>1 funds are being used appropriately and provide 2 coaching for best practices and continuous 3 improvement.</p> <p>4 So that's pretty much what that section is 5 about.</p> <p>6 The next section is another part about 7 recruiting special populations and what are the 8 results of that. So we -- we do know that targeted 9 recruiting makes a difference. We see, in districts 10 that have robust non-trad and special population 11 recruiting, that they do get more students to 12 participate. So we have been working on that for 13 several years, and we use those pilot projects to 14 make decisions going forward.</p> <p>15 The next section -- and this really leads 16 into the next part of what I'm going to present -- 17 is the performance goals.</p> <p>18 As I mentioned, we moved from Perkins IV 19 to Perkins V. The actual items that are being 20 measured, which we call the "performance 21 indicators," changed fairly significantly between IV 22 and V. And that starts with the definition of what 23 a CTE concentrator is.</p> <p>24 In Perkins IV, a concentrator was a person 25 who took three courses in a cluster. And what that</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">303</p> <p>1 aligned courses; two forestry courses or two food 2 systems courses. One-plus-one is no longer a 3 concentrator.</p> <p>4 That's conceptually not that hard to 5 explain or to understand. Technically, for our 6 calculations, it is a major, major shift in how all 7 of the data are actually calculated. And so a big 8 part of what we did in '19-'20 and what we are still 9 doing in '20-'21 is trying to get our systems, our 10 IT systems, reprogrammed to reflect that major shift 11 in definition, because the performance indicators 12 rest on this idea of who a concentrator is.</p> <p>13 And so we have -- we have gotten a long 14 way, and I have some data to show you. But what is 15 due in December is actually the '19-'20 data. And 16 so I'm going to show you the '18-'19.</p> <p>17 Commissioner Voigt, I see you're waving at 18 me.</p> <p>19 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yeah. Just to follow 20 up the question about the two sequential courses 21 now, how is that affecting schools? Well, I guess 22 it hasn't ruled out yet two schools, right, this 23 requirement?</p> <p>24 DR. ELAINE PEREA: It is ruled out. As I 25 mentioned the law went into effect in '19, in July</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">304</p> <p>1 of '19. But we didn't know about it until January 2 of '19. So as you know, the cycle of courses, there 3 was no way that July and August of '19's courses 4 were going to reflect the new law; because now in 5 '20-'21, we are starting to see that.</p> <p>6 But I would say one of the biggest impacts 7 that the law is having is that it is helping schools 8 focus and clarify and really become more 9 laser-focused on jobs and on pathways that lead 10 somewhere, which was the point of the law.</p> <p>11 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yeah. Thanks. 12 Because it seems like -- I know students, they would 13 come in and -- they would just take a smattering of 14 all different introductory-level classes. But now 15 they're going to be more successful, because they're 16 going to hone in and really commit to a pathway. 17 So --</p> <p>18 DR. ELAINE PEREA: Yes, ma'am. And, 19 actually, the schools have a role in that, too; 20 because, inadvertently, Perkins IV may have 21 incentivized offering those -- you know, a 22 cornucopia of intro classes. And now, because of 23 the change in data structure and how we know that 24 what gets measured matters -- and so when a Perkins 25 administrator sits down and puts a plan together,</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">306</p> <p>1 you a map and explained a little bit more about 2 this. But in every region, they voted on between 3 two and four priorities. And now what's fundable 4 for two years is only what's in those priorities.</p> <p>5 And so just this week, for example, we 6 have been doing a monitoring visit in West Las Vegas 7 High School and district. And they had -- they had 8 several different introductory courses, as we've 9 just described.</p> <p>10 And as a result of that monitoring and the 11 CLNA process, we're helping them focus their efforts 12 really on skilled trades and recognize that the 13 Perkins funds need to be used to build a very strong 14 program that's well aligned to industry and 15 post-secondary that has a student organization.</p> <p>16 And so rather than having a scattershot 17 approach, we're helping them really use these funds 18 for a singular vision that is aligned with what the 19 industry in that area has asked.</p> <p>20 So that was the point of the CLNA 21 meetings.</p> <p>22 The last thing that's in this narrative 23 that is -- that I want to tell you guys about, I 24 think most of the people -- at least the people who 25 have been on the Commission for a while have a</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">305</p> <p>1 they're more likely to have a narrower, more 2 directed plan instead of -- to just use the same two 3 examples again.</p> <p>4 Instead of offering food systems and 5 forestry, they're more likely to offer two forestry 6 or two food systems, because that's going to -- it's 7 going to get funded, ultimately.</p> <p>8 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yeah. Thanks.</p> <p>9 DR. ELAINE PEREA: So just to finish up 10 with this narrative, that's really the -- the bulk 11 of the IT work that we've done.</p> <p>12 There's also a section in here about the 13 Comprehensive Local Needs Assessment, which was the 14 stakeholder meetings that we held in the winter and 15 spring. And the last couple of those got moved to a 16 virtual environment because of the pandemic.</p> <p>17 But the Comprehensive Local Needs 18 Assessment, it's another part of the law. It says 19 in addition to the way that we find concentrators 20 changing, what's now fundable is only the priorities 21 of the region. And so in every region, they had to 22 have meetings and vote on priorities and choose what 23 would be fundable in that area.</p> <p>24 And there are ten CTE regions. As I 25 presented the last time I was with this body, I gave</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">307</p> <p>1 copy -- a hard copy of the Career Clusters Guide. 2 It's a 150-page document that is colorful; it's made 3 for students. It walks through each of the 4 16 clusters that the Department of Labor has 5 established.</p> <p>6 And it provides New Mexico-specific data. 7 It provides data about what the entry wages are, 8 what the median wages are, what the number of 9 projected openings in the next ten years will be and 10 the level of academic attainment that's required in 11 order to be successful in that career.</p> <p>12 It also provides the post-secondary 13 information for those same careers so that students 14 know what they actually should major in. Because 15 one of the things that we've learned, especially for 16 first-generation students, is that there's different 17 vocabulary. And a student -- a student may be -- 18 have a clear vision of what they want. But if they 19 don't know the vocabulary of what it's called at the 20 post-secondary level, they can waste a lot of time 21 in the wrong major or undeclared.</p> <p>22 So one of the things the guidebook does is 23 it lays out what the post-secondary choices are and 24 where in New Mexico the students can study that. 25 So we have -- we did a run of</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">308</p> <p>1 30,000 copies in '19-'20 and distributed those. We  2 have, over than the summer and into this fall, done  3 a third -- third edition of the guidebook, which now  4 has the new concentrator definitions in it and a  5 much clearer explanation for districts of what a  6 pathway should look like.  7 And we are now in the process of  8 translating that into Spanish, and have budgeted for  9 15,000 Spanish copies to be printed and distributed  10 this spring.  11 So I'm very excited about that. It's been  12 a massive undertaking. Translating a document of  13 that length into Spanish with so much technical  14 language is -- has been a challenge. But we have  15 got a full translation. We've now had it back  16 translated by two different native Spanish-speakers  17 have back-translated it and given the original  18 translator feedback. And we're in the process of  19 making final edits to that.  20 So the rest of the -- oh, there is one  21 more little thing here and that's about reserve.  22 Reserve is another part of the law that's  23 administered slightly differently.  24 And so with our reserve funds, we launched  25 a three-year program back in '17-'18, using -- using</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">310</p> <p>1 So that's the narrative.  2 Before I move into the data, maybe it  3 would be appropriate to pause for questions on what  4 I've covered so far.  5 THE CHAIR: Sure.  6 Commissioner Armbruster?  7 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Yes. This is  8 only because I probably missed what you said. So  9 let me say that I'm sure you said it.  10 So on the prisons, you were talking about  11 women and doing computer classes for people who are  12 going to be there for a year -- I think that's  13 correct. So are these private prisons or state  14 prisons?  15 DR. ELAINE PEREA: It's the -- it's the  16 State correctional facility for youth. So it's --  17 it is incarcerated young people who are going to be  18 incarcerated for more than a year who are high  19 school -- who are finishing their high school  20 program when they come into this.  21 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Perfect. And  22 the other thing is, so on this guide, is it online  23 as well? Or will it be online?  24 DR. ELAINE PEREA: It is online. It's  25 posted on the College and Career Readiness Bureau's</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">309</p> <p>1 funds to support hiring for computer science and  2 information technology employees. We partnered with  3 Computer Science Teachers Association and doing a  4 summer teaching program and cohorted the incoming  5 teachers so that they had peer support.  6 And we have had a significant increase --  7 this has been a very successful initiative for us.  8 The computer science -- AP Computer Science  9 Principles is sort of that capstone course at the  10 high school level. And you don't get more students  11 in that without having a pipeline.  12 And so the work that we've been doing has  13 been building the pipeline from middle school into  14 high school and also building the teacher  15 infrastructure. Teachers have to have some  16 experience with computer sciences before they're  17 really ready to teach that AP course.  18 And so this initiative has built teachers'  19 abilities, and it has built schools' abilities put  20 kids in that pipeline. We've almost doubled the  21 number of students taking that capstone course over  22 the last three years. And we are getting ready to  23 launch a revised new version of this initiative for  24 this spring as we come out of pandemic and build  25 more capacity in that.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">311</p> <p>1 website.  2 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Oh, great.  3 Okay. Thank you. This is great. I'm not sure I  4 will be able to understand all those words, either.  5 You know, life has changed since the 1900s when I  6 was in school. But thank you very much.  7 DR. ELAINE PEREA: Sure.  8 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Voigt?  9 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you. I just  10 want to say that I really -- I really like that  11 CLNA, because I think it's great that the -- that  12 we're looking at local communities, and we're  13 looking at the strengths within each diverse  14 community within our state and really trying to  15 build on those. So that's great that you did  16 that -- those community input hearings or meetings.  17 And I'm glad you didn't have to revise  18 your whole book, because that guide is really a nice  19 piece of work. And that's awesome that you're  20 getting it into another language.  21 DR. ELAINE PEREA: Thank you.  22 THE CHAIR: Commissioners, any other  23 questions?  24 Okay.  25 DR. ELAINE PEREA: All right. I'm going</p>

312

1 to present a little bit now on data -- oh, sorry.  
 2 Commissioner Voigt?  
 3 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Oh, that's okay. I  
 4 was going to -- sorry. I thought we were done.  
 5 Never mind.  
 6 DR. ELAINE PEREA: I won't -- I won't --  
 7 I'll try not to kill you guys with sweating the  
 8 small stuff here on the details. I'm going to make  
 9 this big enough that maybe you can actually see it.  
 10 So the big change is in how we calculate  
 11 concentrators. And the -- and another smaller, but  
 12 significant, change was in some of the particular  
 13 subpopulations.  
 14 So as we -- as I scroll across here, you  
 15 can see the subpopulations that we have to measure.  
 16 And most of them, as we move through race, have not  
 17 really changed.  
 18 But then back over here on the back end,  
 19 there's a few new things. We went from -- this is  
 20 our English Learners. These are the students who  
 21 are in special education. These are pregnant and  
 22 parenting -- they actually don't have to be  
 23 unmarried, although IT likes the term "single  
 24 parent." But it's any -- any high school student  
 25 who is either expecting or has a young child.

313

1 Economically disadvantaged. That is  
 2 defined as being on Free or Reduced Lunch.  
 3 Then we have a few new ones. Military  
 4 families. And so this is obviously especially  
 5 important because we have a fair member of military  
 6 bases in our state. And so one of the things that  
 7 we're looking for is representation.  
 8 And the next one is homelessness. So any  
 9 student who is receiving McKinley-Vento funds or  
 10 otherwise identified as homeless is identified in  
 11 our system, and we're identifying whether they're  
 12 participating in CTE.  
 13 And foster. And foster has been an  
 14 especially challenging dataset for us because of the  
 15 requirements for privacy. And so we've had to  
 16 develop some -- some additional protocols around  
 17 this, because in the past, districts could pull up  
 18 their reports, and they could see the exact kids who  
 19 were in different categories.  
 20 And as you can see, the numbers here are  
 21 very low. And so you might have one Native American  
 22 foster child in a district. And we have to be very  
 23 careful about privacy in that situation. And so  
 24 that's one of the reasons that this reporting has  
 25 taken so long.

314

1 So just to give you a very broad overview,  
 2 this report is by cluster. It's the 16 career  
 3 clusters. And the counts here are duplicative,  
 4 which means that this is not individual students. A  
 5 student might have taken two courses that make them  
 6 an agricultural concentrator. And then they've also  
 7 taken two courses that make them communications --  
 8 arts and communication concentrator.  
 9 And this is sort of analogous to majors in  
 10 college, which many of you may be familiar with. If  
 11 we try to figure out what a person's majoring in by  
 12 what course patterns they've taken, there's going to  
 13 be a lot of noise in that data, because a lot of  
 14 course taking overlaps.  
 15 And so a student who's interested in --  
 16 for example, they want to learn how to market their  
 17 family ranch, they may end up taking courses in both  
 18 the agricultural cluster and in the arts,  
 19 technology, and communications cluster. And so in  
 20 this table they would be counted in both sets of  
 21 data.  
 22 These are '18-'19 data. We are still  
 23 working on '19-'20 data. The reason we had to  
 24 calculate '18-'19 data is because we have to set  
 25 targets. And then, eventually, each LEA will be

315

1 responsible for their performance in relation to the  
 2 state target.  
 3 So the next data I'm going to show you are  
 4 those -- those where the targets come in.  
 5 So let me zoom out just for a minute so  
 6 you get an overview of what this whole report looks  
 7 like. You should have copies of this in your own  
 8 packets so that you can zoom in and see it in  
 9 more -- so that you can actually read it, because  
 10 I'm sure that it's fairly small on your screen right  
 11 now.  
 12 But what I want to show you is that  
 13 there's the indicators. There's a short name for  
 14 them. There's what goes into the numerator and what  
 15 goes into the denominator. Then what the actual  
 16 measures are. And then that gives us a baseline.  
 17 And this baseline here becomes the basis  
 18 for targets. And as I mentioned now, we are still  
 19 trying to calculate our '19-'20 numbers. The -- the  
 20 intended trajectory is that we get the '18-'19  
 21 numbers and the '19-'20 numbers, and from that, then  
 22 we have an idea of the trajectory for '20-'21.  
 23 And we propose targets for the Department  
 24 of Education. Once they approve those targets, then  
 25 each of the districts is responsible for meeting the

<p style="text-align: right;">316</p> <p>1 targets at the district level.</p> <p>2 So just to give you -- without even</p> <p>3 talking about what they all mean, if the target is</p> <p>4 25 percent, like this, if that were our State</p> <p>5 target, then any district that exceeds that is fine.</p> <p>6 Any district that does not meet that, if short by</p> <p>7 more than 10 percent -- so if the target was</p> <p>8 25 percent, and they were below 20 percent, that</p> <p>9 would be a fail, and they would have to go on a</p> <p>10 corrective action plan in order to address why they</p> <p>11 missed that target.</p> <p>12 So getting our targets right is very</p> <p>13 important, because it has a massive impact</p> <p>14 downstream on programmatic choices. And so that is</p> <p>15 why we are still working on this. We are not the</p> <p>16 only state that is really struggling with getting</p> <p>17 these calculations done and getting them right.</p> <p>18 It is -- it is challenge.</p> <p>19 So I'm just going to zoom in a little bit</p> <p>20 to give you a little bit more of a feel for what</p> <p>21 this is about.</p> <p>22 So the first two indicators are about</p> <p>23 graduation rates. The first one is a four-year, and</p> <p>24 the second one is the six-year, the six-year cohort.</p> <p>25 And so with that new definition of</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">318</p> <p>1 This is in line with our State averages.</p> <p>2 This is not something about CTE. It's actually a</p> <p>3 little bit higher than the State numbers, but</p> <p>4 certainly something that I am very concerned about.</p> <p>5 Being mathematically inclined, I am really hoping</p> <p>6 that we can make this move up.</p> <p>7 And then the third one is science. This</p> <p>8 is a new measure for us, science proficiency. At</p> <p>9 40 percent, we're looking at, again, about like the</p> <p>10 State looks.</p> <p>11 The next indicator is placement. So this</p> <p>12 is looking at the number of students who left high</p> <p>13 school who were CT concentrators. They didn't have</p> <p>14 to graduate. So the definition is, "enrolled in the</p> <p>15 lag year, but not enrolled in the reporting year";</p> <p>16 in other words, this year they're not there anymore.</p> <p>17 So they left last year one way or another.</p> <p>18 Then we look at Higher Ed and Department</p> <p>19 of Workforce Solutions to see if we can find those</p> <p>20 students in their dataset, which would mean that</p> <p>21 they are either enrolled in post-secondary, or</p> <p>22 they're earning wages.</p> <p>23 In the past, this was a simple yes/no on</p> <p>24 wages. So even a student who worked for one week at</p> <p>25 Burger King would be counted as a "yes." Now, that</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">317</p> <p>1 concentrator, that tightened-up definition of</p> <p>2 concentrator, you can see that our graduation rates,</p> <p>3 which have always been very high in CTE -- we've</p> <p>4 always been, in New Mexico, between 92 and</p> <p>5 95 percent -- tightening up that definition takes us</p> <p>6 even higher, 98 percent in four years and 99 percent</p> <p>7 in six years.</p> <p>8 So students are absolutely much, much more</p> <p>9 likely to finish high school if they have identified</p> <p>10 a CTE pathway and taken the classes to become a</p> <p>11 concentrator on that.</p> <p>12 The frustrating thing is these</p> <p>13 denominators, very small. In a typical year, we</p> <p>14 have somewhere between 17- and 20,000 graduates.</p> <p>15 And so having only 4,000 of those students be in CTE</p> <p>16 is a -- it's an opportunity for a lot of growth for</p> <p>17 us.</p> <p>18 The next set of indicators, the second</p> <p>19 ones are about academic achievement. The first one</p> <p>20 is reading and language arts. The second one is</p> <p>21 mathematics. The third one is science.</p> <p>22 So you can see here a much broader</p> <p>23 variation. Almost half of CTE concentrators test</p> <p>24 proficient in eleventh grade, but only a quarter of</p> <p>25 students test proficient for math.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">319</p> <p>1 has tightened up; so the wages have to be 75 percent</p> <p>2 of full-time minimum wage.</p> <p>3 So if a student is not in college, the</p> <p>4 only way their wages count is if they were employed</p> <p>5 for a large portion of that quarter. And the</p> <p>6 quarter that we test is October through December.</p> <p>7 So for '18-'19, that is just over</p> <p>8 40 percent.</p> <p>9 The next indicator is the non-trad. This</p> <p>10 is where we're looking at students who are of the</p> <p>11 non-traditional gender, divided by students who are</p> <p>12 in a gendered program. So you take all the kids</p> <p>13 that are in the welding class, and you look at how</p> <p>14 many of them are female. You take a look at all of</p> <p>15 the kids that are in a nursing class and how many of</p> <p>16 them are male.</p> <p>17 And so for '18-'19, as we're working on a</p> <p>18 baseline, this is actually quite a bit higher than</p> <p>19 we were seeing with the old definition of</p> <p>20 concentrators. And we're really pleased about this,</p> <p>21 because we've been working for years with our CTE</p> <p>22 instructors to make sure that when they have a</p> <p>23 non-traditional student taking an intro class, that</p> <p>24 they really are nourishing that student and</p> <p>25 supporting that student to go on.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">320</p> <p>1 And so love seeing this. It really does 2 suggest that our efforts are working, especially 3 with girls in skilled trades and STEM, computer 4 science. We've got some great results happening 5 there. 6 The next set of indicators, the 5s, 5S1 7 through 5S4 are measures of quality. 8 So the first one is students who earned a 9 credential. The second one is students who earned 10 dual credit. And the third one is students who 11 participated in work-based learning. 12 All three of those are indicators of 13 quality. And so we want to see districts building 14 programs of study that culminate with one of these 15 capstone experiences. So we've split them out, 16 broken them into three pieces. 17 And then we have a fourth one, and this is 18 the number of unique students who have one or more 19 of those indicators of quality. 20 And so this is really where we, as a State 21 agency, are going to be focusing, is helping get 22 this number up. We want CTE students who are 23 concentrators to have experiences with one or more 24 of these quality indicators. 25 As you can see, dual credit is our highest</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">322</p> <p>1 have to have more kids in CTE in order for us to be 2 impacting the State graduation rate. 3 So that's the data I have to show you. I 4 did give you the post-secondary as well. If you're 5 interested, the post-secondary indicators did not 6 change as much. And so there they are. I won't 7 take your time with that right now, but happy to 8 answer questions about that. 9 So as I said, those are the '18-'19 data I 10 just showed you. The '19-'20, we are still trying 11 to calculate. We're desperately trying to get them 12 done before December 31st, which is when we're 13 supposed to report on them. 14 We have distributed the '18-'19 data to 15 the field so that they can compare their own 16 performance against the '18-'19 and start to get an 17 idea of whether they may be in position to meet the 18 targets or whether they're going to be short on the 19 targeting. 20 Because those are the averages for the 21 whole state, you see -- you see a bell curve 22 distribution, with some districts doing much better 23 than the numbers I just showed you, some districts 24 doing much worse. Again, those districts that are 25 not doing as well, and if they're not within</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">321</p> <p>1 one right now. Work-based learning and earning 2 credentials are very important. And we -- 3 especially because we've had this work-based 4 learning initiative for a few years now, we are 5 really hoping to see this number go up. 6 And then the last thing that we're working 7 on -- and this data is not right; I know that, just 8 in my heart. This last indicator, Program Reach, in 9 some ways is perhaps the most important, because 10 it's looking at the number of CTE completers, which 11 is a more robust definition; it's a concentrator 12 plus a capstone. 13 And so that student has to take three 14 sequential courses. But really, that is the 15 definition of a high-quality CTE program. So we're 16 looking at the number of CTE completers over the 17 number of students enrolled. 18 So we really want to see this be quite a 19 bit larger, because this number is going to make 20 this first one that I told you about so much more 21 profound. 22 If we can increase the number of students 23 who are concentrators and completers in here, and if 24 we maintain this graduation rate, that's going to 25 push the graduation rate for the entire state. We</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">323</p> <p>1 90 percent of the State average, they have to use 2 their funds proactively to address whatever 3 indicator they've missed. So that's -- that's what 4 we're working on right now. 5 So I've already talked to the Department 6 of Ed and queued up a possible extension because of 7 our data. And the last days of December, I'll have 8 to give them an ETA if I can't meet the December 31 9 deadline. I'm working very actively with the 10 Information Technology department to try to complete 11 those calculations and get them submitted to DE on 12 time. 13 THE CHAIR: So thank you once again, 14 because this -- we were excited when the changes 15 started to take place, because, as you know, for so 16 many years, a lot of our charters couldn't 17 participate. And when the changes started to take 18 place, that was going to hopefully open the door for 19 more students in charter schools to be able to 20 access these opportunities, which we've always been 21 very supportive of. 22 So I appreciate the time and all the 23 effort and energy and work that goes into it, 24 because we are firmly in support of CTE. You know, 25 the express- -- yesterday, with schools that -- you</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">324</p> <p>1 know, college is important. But there are other 2 opportunities where students can see their successes 3 in life and not have to go to college. And those 4 licensure trainings are equally as important. 5 And as all of us, in particular, that are 6 homeowners, know how difficult it is to get 7 qualified, trained folks to come in and do a lot of 8 the work. And there's good pay in it as well. 9 And I know there's frustration that's been 10 expressed by some of those tradespeople that have 11 come in to do work at the house and say, "We can't 12 find, you know, kids that want to do this." And 13 it's -- you know, we're -- they're always short. 14 So it's something that we -- like I said, 15 we've always been supportive. The concern is the -- 16 what apparently is happening with the reporting and 17 our not being able to fulfill our responsibility 18 with that reporting. And that's where the concern 19 is. 20 Commissioner Voigt? 21 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you, 22 Madam Chair. So regarding the reporting, and to go 23 forward and ensure that we do receive a finalized 24 report from the CCRB, is that somebody that, Elaine, 25 on your end, that you can ensure, as the director,</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">326</p> <p>1 DR. ELAINE PEREA: I'm -- I -- I am 2 presenting the data. The agenda says that you all 3 are going to vote on it. So I guess it would be up 4 to you guys if you want to vote or table -- 5 THE CHAIR: We can't vote on -- we don't 6 have the finalized copy. So how can we vote on a 7 preliminary copy? 8 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: So I guess my 9 question is, so once you get that finalized copy, 10 the report done that you're going to submit to the 11 feds, Elaine, then we can vote on that hopefully in 12 our January meeting? Since your due date is 13 December 30th or December 31st, if you could 14 immediately share that with the PEC, then we could 15 move it to our January agenda. 16 THE CHAIR: But it's too late then. The 17 approval is supposed to happen before the copy goes 18 to the feds. That's the process. 19 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Okay. 20 THE CHAIR: So if we do it in the January 21 meeting, we've abrogated our responsibility in that. 22 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Now, the extension 23 that you were going to request, Elaine, would that 24 move it beyond January? 25 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Madam Chair,</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">325</p> <p>1 to carry forward from year to year? 2 I mean, that's something -- because it is 3 in statute, it just seems like it's something that 4 got overlooked within the transition from the 5 previous director to you, maybe? I don't know. I 6 don't know where -- 7 THE CHAIR: Oh. And I'm going to say -- 8 and I'm going to step in and say this was not 9 overlooked. I'm going to step in and say that. But 10 we need more than a finalized copy. We need to be 11 able to vote -- the responsibility is to vote on it. 12 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Right. So I was 13 going to suggest, then, also, if we can get the 14 finalized copy before our January meeting, that's 15 something that we can move to the January agenda to 16 make that -- to vote on the finalized copy. 17 I mean, obviously, we can't vote on it now 18 since we don't have one. 19 THE CHAIR: Right. And the finalized copy 20 is due December 31st, as it was last year, and as it 21 was the year before. 22 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yeah. So I think the 23 CCRB, it's just a matter of them sharing that report 24 with us and making that process happen to approve or 25 vote on it. Right, Elaine? Is that right?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">327</p> <p>1 do -- 2 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: I'd just like. 3 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: I'd just like to 4 ask our attorney some questions. Is it possible to 5 move to -- to -- what do you call it -- private 6 executive session? 7 THE CHAIR: No, no. It's not on our 8 agenda on this particular item. 9 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Right. I think 10 this needs to be voted on, a final copy. And if we 11 don't, we need to let the federal government know 12 that we were unable to approve the final copy. And 13 I think that would do it. Because by submitting 14 something without us, it tells the feds that it's 15 okay. 16 But not every state has this type of 17 structure that we have that has a board, aside from 18 a secretary of education that approves this 19 particular area. 20 And so prior years, it made the assumption 21 that we don't exist so we don't have that authority 22 anymore. 23 THE CHAIR: So I want to make it clear 24 that the federal government's requirements is that 25 it goes through a board or commission. So states</p>

328

1 have to create -- have to use something. So as an  
 2 example, CNM always used the CNM Board for their  
 3 CT- -- so the requirements are for -- that it's a  
 4 board or commission. So states have to provide that  
 5 mechanism, however that -- however that is.  
 6 And you're right. Not every state has a  
 7 state school board. But they have to have some  
 8 board or commission set up in the state, whether  
 9 it's through, you know, a university, or, you know,  
 10 some agent like that.  
 11 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yeah. I had a -- I  
 12 had a question that I had asked Elaine.  
 13 So that extension that you're going to be  
 14 asking for with the feds about your -- your report,  
 15 would that be -- the extension be past January 2021?  
 16 DR. ELAINE PEREA: So what my grant  
 17 monitor has told me is that, if we need an  
 18 extension, that I need to reach out to him by  
 19 December 29th and tell him when the data can be  
 20 available. And the only -- that would be all that  
 21 we would be extending is the un- -- the parts of the  
 22 data have not been calculated yet. The narrative is  
 23 complete, as far as I'm concerned. And --  
 24 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: So when do you think  
 25 that your extension would be? Do you think it would

329

1 be, like --  
 2 DR. ELAINE PEREA: It would be, like, a  
 3 week. If IT gets it done -- like I said, I'm  
 4 getting data every single day. We are working  
 5 really hard to meet the December 31st deadline.  
 6 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: The reason I ask  
 7 that, that would give us a chance to see the report  
 8 before it went to the feds in order to vote on it.  
 9 That's why I was asking that question, just to try  
 10 to sync up some process here for the PEC to approve  
 11 that report before it goes to the feds.  
 12 And then regarding Commissioner  
 13 Caballero's comment about us reporting this to the  
 14 feds, I don't know if we want to even open up that  
 15 can of worms.  
 16 THE CHAIR: But it is our responsibility  
 17 to do it. It is clearly stated in statute. So if  
 18 we simply ignore it and allow it to continue, we are  
 19 not fulfilling our responsibility with this.  
 20 And there is a significant amount of  
 21 money, and there is a process that's supposed to be  
 22 followed established by federal guidelines.  
 23 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Okay. So --  
 24 THE CHAIR: And it would technically be on  
 25 us.

330

1 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yeah. Okay, I  
 2 understand that. I get that. So have we ever had  
 3 to do that before?  
 4 THE CHAIR: Do what?  
 5 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Report to the feds  
 6 that we didn't get a report?  
 7 (Commissioner Chavez enters meeting.)  
 8 THE CHAIR: No. Because we regularly got  
 9 the reports. I'm going to -- it was last year that  
 10 all of a sudden, it just stopped.  
 11 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Huh.  
 12 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: So I would just --  
 13 THE CHAIR: I asked for it and asked why  
 14 we weren't on the agenda. And my e-mails were not  
 15 responded to.  
 16 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: So I just --  
 17 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: My first --  
 18 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: So with Elaine --  
 19 sorry, Georgina. Just a sec.  
 20 So -- but, Elaine, do you understand that  
 21 whole process then? CCRB makes a report to the PEC.  
 22 PEC signs off on it? Then the CCRB submits that  
 23 finalized report to the feds?  
 24 DR. ELAINE PEREA: I understand that's  
 25 what the PEC believes to be the process. I am not

331

1 sure that that is the actual required process. But  
 2 I do understand Chairwoman Gipson's position.  
 3 THE CHAIR: No. It's -- I mean, it is  
 4 clear to me what PED's position is on this now. And  
 5 it has changed substantially since I came on this  
 6 Commission and for the entire time the PEC was --  
 7 has been in -- in existence.  
 8 And it is clear that the PED has made a  
 9 decision to not bring the PEC -- I'm sorry -- the  
 10 PEC into the -- the process, which they always have  
 11 before, willingly.  
 12 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Would it help --  
 13 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: I like to hear  
 14 from Davis, if you don't mind, Commissioner Voigt.  
 15 I would like to hear from Commissioner Davis.  
 16 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Thank you,  
 17 Commissioner.  
 18 So I just wanted to say that January 2018  
 19 was my very first meeting. And we got the report,  
 20 and there was a conversation that this report was  
 21 late. We never had a chance to review it. We  
 22 couldn't sign it because it was already submitted.  
 23 So that was '18.  
 24 2019, we had this very same presentation.  
 25 We received a lovely book, but there was no report.

<p style="text-align: right;">332</p> <p>1           So now, in 2020, we're having the same 2 conversation, and we -- and there is nothing really 3 more than what we got in 2018. So I just wanted to 4 state that.</p> <p>5           COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: And in one of 6 those years, I suggested we send a letter -- I can't 7 remember which year -- to the feds. Because my 8 experience with federal government and nonprofit was 9 that -- that -- and I was on the governing board of 10 a nonprofit that dealt with millions of dollars. 11 And we were very careful as a board to report and be 12 accountable, because the director just -- at times, 13 would forget that it had a governing board.</p> <p>14           THE CHAIR: I think we've been more than 15 generous in giving time for PED to rethink their 16 strategy on this.</p> <p>17           COMMISSIONER VOIGT: So just one other 18 quick question to follow up. And we know the 19 history of the problem.</p> <p>20           I remember, from 2018, getting a book and 21 all that stuff. So -- but going forward, would it 22 help if Ami sent a link to the statute that is 23 required by federal law to Elaine so that she could 24 read it and maybe -- because I don't know if this 25 is -- if it's -- you know, if there's -- where the</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">334</p> <p>1           THE CHAIR: All right. Dr. Perea -- oh, 2 I'm sorry.</p> <p>3           Commissioner Armbruster?</p> <p>4           COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: I just wanted to 5 go back to one of the things that said 6 (indiscernible due to audio distortion) education 7 it's more women than men, so they can kind of 8 qualify if they went into education? Am I correct 9 on that? I was trying to listen hard.</p> <p>10           DR. ELAINE PEREA: Teaching is 11 non-traditional male.</p> <p>12           COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Right.</p> <p>13           DR. ELAINE PEREA: So those funds are to 14 recruit boys and men into the teaching profession.</p> <p>15           COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Well, what I 16 wanted to add to that, as just a thought, would be 17 an area where we have incredible difficulties is in 18 special education. So if it were -- and I can't 19 even talk about possibilities. I'm just saying 20 this, and you can do with it as you wish.</p> <p>21           But encourage men, boys, whatever, to not 22 only be in education, but to be in special 23 education. That could be really helpful, not just 24 about charter schools; it's about all schools. They 25 sort of are like the gold -- you know, you'd give</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">333</p> <p>1           break is in understanding.</p> <p>2           So, I mean, would that be a step to help 3 understanding of this requirement? Would that 4 help --</p> <p>5           THE CHAIR: Well -- and I appreciate the 6 suggestion. I think the link needs to go to someone 7 else.</p> <p>8           COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: It probably needs 9 to go to Secretary Stewart or a deputy secretary to 10 point out to them; because, again, Elaine is -- you 11 know, I hate to say -- she's kind of caught between 12 a rock and a hard spot. If she's been given 13 directions to go ahead and submit it and everything, 14 they sign off, it's not our authority to tell her to 15 do something; she's not our employee.</p> <p>16           But I think it's fair, and I think it's 17 good, that we have this information. And I think, 18 you know, the Chair and our legal counsel can follow 19 up with PED to attempt to correct what we perceive 20 as an overreach in the submitting of this report. 21 I'll leave it at that.</p> <p>22           COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Super. Thanks a lot.</p> <p>23           THE CHAIR: It's -- all right. So, 24 Commissioners, any other questions? 25 (No response.)</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">335</p> <p>1           your left arm for one.</p> <p>2           So I thought if you're going into 3 education, maybe pushing them towards special 4 education might be something that they'd like.</p> <p>5           That's just a comment. It's not a -- 6 anything other than a comment. Thank you. And 7 thank you for your presentation, it was really so 8 much clearer than in previous people who were doing 9 this. Thank you.</p> <p>10           THE CHAIR: And it's odd -- in the high 11 school world that I was in most of the time, females 12 were the minority. But then when you went down to 13 the elementary school, it was the males. So it's -- 14 you know, it's -- education is a tough world when 15 you look at non-traditional, because it was 16 considered high school, "Oh, that's where the men 17 teach, you know."</p> <p>18           Okay. Dr. Perea, once again, thank you. 19 And we do thank you for all the work on this. And 20 we certainly support all of the efforts and 21 initiatives that are included in it.</p> <p>22           As I said, it's really important for our 23 students to be able to access these opportunities. 24 So thank you for your time and all the work that you 25 do do on it.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">336</p> <p>1 DR. ELAINE PEREA: Thank you all for 2 having me. I appreciate your attention and wish you 3 continued health and wellness during these difficult 4 times. And I hope for all of our sake that we get 5 to see each other in-person before too long. 6 THE CHAIR: Yes. Hopefully not too far 7 down the road now. Thank you. 8 DR. ELAINE PEREA: Thank you. 9 THE CHAIR: So, Commissioners, before we 10 take a short break, I would like to recognize once 11 again that we have three of our new Commissioners in 12 attendance today: Steve Carrillo, Rebekka Burt, and 13 Michael Taylor. But, very importantly, we have the 14 new -- the incoming CSD Director, who is also in 15 attendance. So I want to say welcome, and welcome, 16 and welcome, to Corina Chavez. 17 And with that, let's take -- before -- as 18 Karen is bringing in North Valley Academy, let's 19 take a five-minute break. Thanks. 20 And do we want to make an announcement 21 about signing up for and -- and open up Public 22 Comment time again for the school? 23 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Absolutely, 24 Madam Chair. 25 Attendees, if you are interested in making</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">338</p> <p>1 spend a lot of time talking about what goes into it. 2 So we thank you for this. 3 And do you have an attorney that was going 4 to come on this morning? 5 MS. SUSAN McCONNELL: We have a school 6 attorney who, I'm sure, is in the participants. Do 7 you want to add her to the panel? 8 THE CHAIR: That's up to you. Do you want 9 your attorney on the panel? That's up to the 10 school. 11 MS. SUSAN McCONNELL: We certainly can. 12 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Is that Abby? 13 THE CHAIR: Abby, yes. 14 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Commissioners, you may 15 want to note that Commissioner Chavez joined us. 16 THE CHAIR: Thank you for reminding me of 17 that. He was there through most of what we did, and 18 I forgot to note it. So thanks for reminding me. 19 Okay. So I think we're good to go now. 20 So, Karen, if you want to start? 21 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Absolutely. Thank 22 you, Madam Chair. 23 This next school, of course, is 24 North Valley Academy, located in Albuquerque, 25 serving Grades K through 8. The school can correct</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">337</p> <p>1 a public comment for the North Valley Academy, or 2 for the other schools later today, you are welcome 3 to do so now in the Chat. Just simply put in your 4 name, the school's name, and whether you're in favor 5 or opposed to the school's renewal; again, your 6 name, school's name, and whether you're in favor or 7 opposed. 8 Susan, I'm going to add you to the panel 9 for your school. And I know you sent me a list. 10 (Recess taken, 10:14 a.m. to 10:28 a.m.) 11 THE CHAIR: Here we go. Okay. So 12 welcome, everyone. And thanks for hanging in there 13 this morning with our starting a little late. We 14 truly do appreciate it. 15 But welcome, and thank you for all the 16 time and effort and thought that you put into the 17 renewal application. We appreciate that and know, 18 especially now through these times, how difficult it 19 is. People think it's easier when you're not 20 traveling and when you're home more that you can get 21 more done. And as we know, it's not the case, that 22 it just -- it's just harder to do the everyday 23 things when we're doing it digitally. So it takes 24 more time, not less time. 25 So thank you, because we do read them. We</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">339</p> <p>1 me if I'm wrong here, but I believe they opened in 2 2003, first as a local charter. And I believe this 3 will be their fourth renewal, if approved by the 4 Commission. 5 I do know the school has a cap of 534, 6 and, this year, currently had, at 40th day, 7 437 students. 8 The PED recommends a full renewal of the 9 five years for this school. The school earned -- in 10 the last Accountability Report from the State, the 11 school earned 52 points, which is just shy of the 12 Spotlight designation at 53.33; so very strong 13 Accountability Report. 14 They also received a designation of 15 excellence in math growth, and they met or exceeded 16 all four of their charter goals during that same 17 year, the last year we have data. 18 The organizational performance of the 19 school has been excellent, as indicated on the 20 ratings chart. 21 The school's most recently published audit 22 did have two findings, but they were both "Other" 23 matters, which are the lesser of the findings. They 24 had zero repeats and no material weaknesses or 25 deficiencies.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">340</p> <p>1 It's also important to note that this 2 school, based on the operating budget and revenue 3 and expenses, spent an average of just over 4 76 percent on instructional costs. And, as you 5 heard yesterday, 68 percent is the goal; and so far 6 exceeding that on their spending in the 7 instructional area, which is a credit to the school. 8 The school does not have the support of a 9 foundation. 10 And if you don't -- I've been having 11 trouble opening my -- my file. I wanted to share as 12 I did yesterday, but it wasn't opening just as we 13 were getting started today. So let me just see if 14 it will open; otherwise, I'm going to reference your 15 materials. 16 On Page 2 of the packet is the Evaluation 17 Summary for the school. As we talked about 18 yesterday, that chart at the top of the page is how 19 we are to assess -- that's the ratings based on the 20 rubric when the CSD assesses their Part B Progress 21 Report. 22 And as you see there, the school has met 23 the standards in most of the areas. Had a couple of 24 Demonstrates Substantial Progress and no concerns at 25 this time, very good evaluation there.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">342</p> <p>1 Evaluation Summary I spoke of and the chart I was 2 speaking to with the proficiency rates, and then the 3 ratings chart that I just talked about. 4 Moving on, I just wanted to highlight 5 Page 7, which is the financial chart that the team 6 prepared. And this is where you can see that the 7 school has spent over 75 percent of their 8 operational budget on instructional costs. The 9 school did respond to this one deficit -- comparing 10 operational expenses to revenue, they did address 11 this one here on their school's response, and the 12 rest you can see has been surplus. 13 On Page 20, you will see the charter 14 goals. And as discussed, the school has 15 Demonstrated Substantial Progress, because we're not 16 able to say Meets Standard if they did not meet it 17 throughout the contract term. So, in 2018, there 18 were some Does Not Meet. But as you can see here, 19 they met or exceeded all of those charter goals in 20 the last year we were able to measure. 21 Obviously, nothing from last year, because 22 we don't have assessments. They were waived last 23 year. 24 Moving on, on enrollment, I would like to 25 just point out that the school has no (indiscernible</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">341</p> <p>1 The next chart, on Page 2, is the 2 reading -- trying to multi-task here -- reading 3 proficiency, math proficiency, science proficiency. 4 As you can see, the school is about in line with the 5 local district in reading, exceeding in math, 6 exceeding in science, exceeding in EL progress, and 7 certainly exceeding in their reading and math 8 growth. 9 And that green box there indicates that 10 the school got the designation of excellence in math 11 growth that I already mentioned. 12 The other chart there, again, is a page 13 later in the packet as well, so you can see it a 14 little more clearly. But as you can see, the school 15 has gradually moved to almost all green, which we 16 like to see, all Meets Standards, speaking to the 17 organizational performance of the school. 18 I did manage to get my file open, so I'm 19 going to scroll down to the next -- the sections I 20 was just talking about. It's not wanting to 21 display, it looks like. 22 It says I'm sharing, but you're not seeing 23 anything; is that correct? 24 There it goes. Told you I was having 25 technical difficulties today. This is the</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">343</p> <p>1 due to audio distortion) with enrollment during the 2 school years. They maintain their students 3 throughout the school year. And their attendance 4 rate has been at or around 80 percent throughout the 5 term of the contract. 6 Teacher retention has also bounced a 7 little bit, 74 to 87 -- 74 to 87 percent retention. 8 On the audit findings, as you see here, 9 they're listed and described. These two findings 10 are "other matters" findings. No repeats, no 11 significant deficiencies. 12 And, as always, this is a little easier to 13 read than the small thumbnail that you saw earlier 14 showing the areas that the school -- the ratings 15 they received in their organizational framework. 16 I do want to point out that, on Page 3, 17 the school provided a brief response to the analysis 18 of their application. And there are two things in 19 there that were in error on our report. We had the 20 actual count for 40-day incorrect. It was 437. 21 Your packet has been corrected to reflect 22 that feedback from the school. And the school 23 noted, on the bottom of Page 3, that there were some 24 areas that the school actually got a Meets Standard, 25 had been rated as Working to Meet. And that was</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">344</p> <p>1 because the documentation or evidence we needed was 2 not observed on the site visit. 3 But they provided it later. And it was 4 available at the site visit; we just didn't observe 5 it. So we corrected those as well. 6 And the rest of it was the school pointing 7 out some things, explaining about the financial area 8 that I just mentioned and the Does Not Meet 9 standards on their goals were because they moved to 10 a new Short Cycle Assessment. 11 And they clarified a statement in the 12 stakeholder interviews that they wanted to be sure 13 was corrected for you that was actually an admission 14 that they don't have all their -- all their EL 15 students with TESOL-certified. 16 And with that, I say that we do recommend 17 a renewal for this school. And that's the end of 18 our presentation. Thank you, Madam Chair. 19 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you. And good 20 morning, everyone. 21 Susan, I don't know how you had planned on 22 doing this. But if someone, if not you, could 23 introduce everyone from the school that's here, we 24 would just appreciate it so that the record is 25 clear.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">346</p> <p>1 Claudia Zamora is our governing council 2 president. And Will Duran, governing council 3 member, and also renewal committee representative. 4 And then Abby Lewis is our school 5 attorney. 6 We're really, really happy to be here this 7 morning. And we do have a couple of things for you 8 before we move into the questions. 9 So, Madam Chair, do you want us to move 10 into those now, based on the agenda that we have? 11 THE CHAIR: Correct. So you'll have your 12 15 minutes; use all of it or part of it. And then 13 you do have -- my understanding is from the renewal 14 application you have a video presentation you want 15 to share. So then we'll move into that, and then 16 we'll do the public comment. 17 MS. SUSAN McCONNELL: Okay. So we do -- 18 during our school presentation, I would like to 19 offer that Will Duran has some remarks for 20 North Valley Academy. 21 MR. WILL DURAN: Thank you, Susan. Good 22 morning, Madam Chair and members of the Commission. 23 My name is William Duran, I'm, as Susan said, a 24 governing council member, also a member of the real 25 committee (verbatim) and a member of the finance</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">345</p> <p>1 MS. SUSAN McCONNELL: Yes, I'm happy to. 2 Good morning, Commissioners and other 3 distinguished participants. We're excited to be 4 here this morning. "Anticipatory" might be a better 5 term. I would love to introduce my team. 6 As Karen said, I brought an army. And 7 I've learned over my 16 years at NVA that it takes 8 an army. 9 So myself, Dr. Susan McConnell. I've been 10 at North Valley Academy since 2005, been principal 11 since 2012 or '13, depends on how we look at the 12 records. Amanda Catanzaro is our Chief Operations 13 Officer. But I want to add that she is also student 14 data; she's our registrar; and she's also our 15 testings coordinator. 16 Sarah Piña, who is our Chief Financial 17 Officer. And she is also -- although several of us 18 on the faculty are on our equity council, Sarah acts 19 as the main liaison to our equity council. 20 Julie Geldmacher is our Chief 21 Instructional Officer. 22 Laurie Erickson, Special Education 23 Director. She's new to us this year, but has 24 certainly earned her spot on the team working very 25 hard.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">347</p> <p>1 committee. 2 I want to thank you for giving me this 3 opportunity to talk to you all. I also want to 4 thank you for the work that you do as a Commission, 5 not just for NVA, but for improving education in the 6 state of New Mexico, specifically in the areas of 7 charter schools. 8 I know it's a tough job; it's huge. There 9 are schools all over. I just want to take a moment 10 and thank you for what you do. 11 I just started my 35th year in public 12 service in the state of New Mexico, currently 13 serving as the Director of Operations for the 14 New Mexico Board of Nursing. Prior to that, I was 15 director of the MVD for the State of New Mexico. 16 And I offer that so you have a good understanding of 17 the perspective that I'm going to talk about the 18 school. 19 My background is in change management and 20 in organizational leadership. And that's what I 21 want to talk about today. 22 I have five grandchildren who attend NVA. 23 The eldest child, the first child to go there, she's 24 a lifer. She started in pre-K, and now she's in her 25 last year. And I've seen her flourish from this</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">348</p> <p>1 spunky little girl in pre-K to this strong young 2 individual -- and if I get choked up, it's because 3 I'm proud of her -- to who she's become today. 4 And, you know, although I'd like to think 5 that it's the family we raised her in and the morals 6 that we've taught her. But I realize it's also the 7 educational environment that she was raised in at 8 NVA. 9 NVA is like a family. And I've been on 10 the council for a little over three years. My 11 previous job didn't allow me -- I couldn't commit to 12 it. But I always wanted to get involved in the 13 council, because I saw what they did for my 14 granddaughter. 15 My other four granddaughters and my 16 grandson -- or three granddaughters and grandson -- 17 they're getting their work, and they work through 18 the school. I have two more that are probably going 19 to start in the next couple of years, I hope. But 20 I've seen them grow as children and as students. 21 In the last several years, I've seen the 22 school grow under the leadership of Dr. McConnell. 23 She's developed a leadership staff there that has a 24 primary focus of fostering a strong culture of 25 learning for the students, a very supportive and</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">350</p> <p>1 the mission of the organization. And that's what 2 Susan has done over the last several years. It's an 3 honor for me to serve on the council. 4 One thing I want to talk about, this 5 pandemic, the current pandemic situation has given 6 me a great opportunity -- you know, when I would go 7 pick up my children -- my grandchildren three or 8 four times a week at school, the staff used to -- I 9 saw that commitment. But I always thought, or I 10 often thought, that maybe they recognized me as a 11 council member, and they were just doing it because 12 it was me, right? 13 But this pandemic situation is something 14 unique. Working for the State, my wife and I work 15 from home. And four of those five grandchildren are 16 attending online school from my home. So it's us 17 two working, and the children are there. 18 And I occasionally will sit in on the 19 classes, and I listen to the different teachers. 20 And I'm amazed at the commitment that these teachers 21 have. And it tells me that given this pandemic and 22 all the hardships that the teachers are going 23 through, and the students, they're still committed 24 to providing that great educational experience for 25 the students.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">349</p> <p>1 inclusive culture for the staff -- and not just 2 educational staff, all the staff -- and then a very 3 powerful culture of engagement for the entire 4 community. And when I say "the entire community," I 5 mean the entire community. 6 There is days that I would go prior -- I 7 would go pick up my grandkids. And at Bernalillo 8 County, our Sheriff's Department would be out there 9 because Susan had them out there. The fire 10 department would be out there. And it's just an 11 environment that I am so glad that my children chose 12 to get my grandchildren in. 13 The other thing about the culture of the 14 school for staff, Dr. McConnell is always 15 encouraging her staff to do more for themselves, to 16 better themselves. Julie Geldmacher is a perfect 17 example of that. She enrolls in classes and goes to 18 programs to better herself, all with the focus of 19 improving the school. And then they come back to 20 the school, and they share with other staff, 21 because, obviously, they can't all go at the same 22 time. 23 And that creates this environment that 24 I've tried for create over the 35 years with the 25 organizations that I've headed of -- of ownership in</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">351</p> <p>1 So that told me it wasn't just because I 2 was a council member and they saw me and recognized 3 me. That's what they do. That's their commitment 4 to the school. And it really impressed me. 5 And I'm not going to take up a lot of 6 time, because I know we're pressed for time. But I 7 want to tell you how strong our council is, our 8 governing council. We are engaged heavily in what 9 goes on with the school. We are committed to 10 holding -- unfortunately for Susan, we are committed 11 to holding Susan accountable to what we, as a 12 council, believe the school, the direction they 13 should be going. And Susan is very responsive to 14 that. 15 And this pandemic has also showed me if we 16 tell Susan, "This is the direction we want to go," 17 offer, "This is what we think we need in the best 18 interest," in listening to the teachers and how they 19 talk to each other and how they talk to the 20 students, she's passing that information down. 21 So that consistent flow of information is 22 getting from the council all the way down to the 23 students and creating an environment of a buy-in, a 24 complete buy-in from top to bottom. And that has 25 just impressed me over the last three-and-a-half</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">352</p> <p>1 years.</p> <p>2 And I'll end with this. We have a legal</p> <p>3 counsel, she's brilliant. She keeps us on our toes.</p> <p>4 And I bring that up, because she's the one that</p> <p>5 holds us, the governing council, accountable. She</p> <p>6 guides us in our decisions. She's got a vast</p> <p>7 knowledge of the charter school environment.</p> <p>8 And when we come up with some crazy ideas,</p> <p>9 she's quick to put us back in line and say, "No, no,</p> <p>10 no, you can't do that."</p> <p>11 So we need that. So the accountable is</p> <p>12 from the council all the way down to the students.</p> <p>13 And for the last three-and-a-half years, it has been</p> <p>14 an honor for me to serve on the council. I hope I</p> <p>15 get to serve longer. I know I'm probably going to</p> <p>16 have another five or six grandchildren that go to</p> <p>17 the school, as long as the school is in operation.</p> <p>18 So, again, thank you, Commission, for</p> <p>19 taking the time to let me speak. And with that, if</p> <p>20 you have any questions of me, you can ask them now.</p> <p>21 THE CHAIR: Well, we don't want to eat up</p> <p>22 your time.</p> <p>23 MR. WILL DURAN: No, no. I'm -- okay,</p> <p>24 that's fine. Thank you.</p> <p>25 THE CHAIR: You're welcome.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">354</p> <p>1 happen yesterday.</p> <p>2 MS. SUSAN McCONNELL: Amanda Catanzaro.</p> <p>3 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Amanda, what we had</p> <p>4 happen yesterday was you need to close out and go</p> <p>5 back into Share. And there's an option -- I forget</p> <p>6 the wording, but there's an option of using the</p> <p>7 computer sound or the computer speakers.</p> <p>8 MS. AMANDA CATANZARO: I just found that.</p> <p>9 Let's try once more.</p> <p>10 (Video presentation shown.)</p> <p>11 MS. SUSAN McCONNELL: I want to thank</p> <p>12 Amanda for putting that together. It was not really</p> <p>13 spur-of-the-moment. It was something that we</p> <p>14 planned on for a long time. But we had to change</p> <p>15 how we did it. And so I think it's a -- I think</p> <p>16 it's a great culmination.</p> <p>17 And really, what you're seeing there,</p> <p>18 obviously, some of that is pre-pandemic. But some</p> <p>19 of it has been during this school year. And what</p> <p>20 that really is -- those beautiful kids -- is the</p> <p>21 culmination of the most dedicated faculty that I</p> <p>22 have ever worked with. We strive every single day</p> <p>23 to figure out a better way to engage our kids,</p> <p>24 especially now that things are a little bit</p> <p>25 different.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">353</p> <p>1 MS. SUSAN McCONNELL: That is all we have</p> <p>2 for the school presentation --</p> <p>3 THE CHAIR: Oh.</p> <p>4 MS. SUSAN McCONNELL: -- for the 15</p> <p>5 minutes. So this might be a time for questions, if</p> <p>6 you had them now, or if you want to wait.</p> <p>7 THE CHAIR: Yeah, I think it's better if</p> <p>8 we stick with our normal routine. And we'll do any</p> <p>9 questions that we have after the presentation and</p> <p>10 the public comments.</p> <p>11 MS. SUSAN McCONNELL: Okay. So we do have</p> <p>12 a slide show to share with you. It felt like,</p> <p>13 through the renewal process and the application</p> <p>14 process, that it was pretty easy to get data on</p> <p>15 paper for you. And I know that you guys are well</p> <p>16 versed at reading through those things.</p> <p>17 This felt like a way that we could share</p> <p>18 our school with you, the parts that you don't see in</p> <p>19 the data.</p> <p>20 MS. AMANDA CATANZARO: Is everybody seeing</p> <p>21 my screen?</p> <p>22 Let me know if the volume works.</p> <p>23 MS. KAREN WOERNER: If there's sound,</p> <p>24 we're not hearing it. Who is doing the presenting?</p> <p>25 I can send you some instructions. We had this</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">355</p> <p>1 So I hope that gives you a little bit of</p> <p>2 insight into the faces that are North Valley</p> <p>3 Academy. And that is what we have for our school</p> <p>4 presentation today.</p> <p>5 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you. And that</p> <p>6 is, you know, so much what we were looking for. I</p> <p>7 love to hear those little tiny voices. And that's</p> <p>8 when I say, "Oh, why didn't I teach that?"</p> <p>9 And then I remember why I didn't teach</p> <p>10 that. It's, like, wait a minute. Snap out of it.</p> <p>11 But it is -- you know, you just have to laugh. It</p> <p>12 was really -- it was thoroughly enjoyable, and also</p> <p>13 informative as well. So appreciate it.</p> <p>14 We're moving into Public Comment now. So,</p> <p>15 Missy, I don't know how many have signed up.</p> <p>16 MS. MELISSA BROWN: There was nobody</p> <p>17 signed up for public comment.</p> <p>18 THE CHAIR: Oh, okay. Thanks. So we're</p> <p>19 on now to our questions.</p> <p>20 So thanks once again. Like I said, this</p> <p>21 was thoroughly enjoyable. And I actually enjoyed</p> <p>22 the fact that that is the yoga workout I do every</p> <p>23 morning. And I groan as much as that young kid.</p> <p>24 And I feel a whole lot better about myself now. I</p> <p>25 was, like, "Oh, I sound like that." So I appreciate</p>

1 that.

2 And I think we, as a group, probably  
3 embraced the school yesterday that was teaching the  
4 kids distillery. So it's, like, "Oh, I think we  
5 should go have a visit with that."

6 But I truly do appreciate this and the  
7 time and effort. And this -- I think, really, your  
8 presentation, not only through the video but through  
9 your first presentation, is so informative for us,  
10 because we see the governance council. I so like  
11 the fact that the governing council said, "When we  
12 got into this pandemic it's, like, well, what are we  
13 going to do about it? And this is what we have to  
14 do."

15 And that's -- that's truly what a great  
16 school does. You know, it's that combination of the  
17 board that's having those thoughtful discussions and  
18 the feedback from -- you know, I'm sure sometimes  
19 it's like, "No, that won't work."

20 But that fact that you've got an exchange  
21 of minds, and you can come to a common decision as  
22 to what's going to work best for your school shows  
23 in your data.

24 And I really appreciate -- and I was  
25 trying to remember, because you were one of the

1 first schools that I did contract negotiations with  
2 when Carolyn was still the Chair.

3 And I want to say -- and I could be wrong;  
4 but I want to say it wasn't great.

5 MS. SUSAN McCONNELL: I feel like I have a  
6 long relationship with the PEC. And, truly, those  
7 of you Commissioners that have been on the PEC a  
8 little bit longer, I believe, have watched  
9 North Valley Academy go through a tremendous  
10 transformation.

11 THE CHAIR: And that's what I was getting  
12 to. The fact that it wasn't great, and the fact  
13 that the school itself did that reset, as you  
14 mentioned in the renewal application, that you --  
15 you weren't just looking for excuses as to why the  
16 school wasn't performing.

17 Because it's not just about the numbers  
18 and providing good numbers. You understand that  
19 those numbers mean what kids are actually able to  
20 do. And that's what's really important.

21 And you recognized that. And the school  
22 as a whole was able to recognize that things weren't  
23 working well. And you did that reset. And, you  
24 know, boy, you can't ask -- you can't ask for  
25 better, you know. You really can't.

1 And I'm sure, as a group, you do, you  
2 know. And I appreciate that. But this is -- this  
3 really is a school that tells a journey which is --  
4 oh, sorry. The dog has bells on. Sorry.

5 The -- it's a journey that you hope every  
6 school can look at and learn something from, you  
7 know, "How did you do this," and be able to take it  
8 back and work it for what's best for them.

9 But for this governance council to serve  
10 as, you know, an example of what works best, and the  
11 staff. And, you know, your numbers also in terms of  
12 retention are a testament to this as well.

13 So I appreciate this more and more.

14 I just have one simple question.

15 When we're looking at the audit findings,  
16 and one audit finding dealt with something --  
17 something related to -- there was cash and -- I  
18 guess there weren't -- taxes weren't reported or  
19 something. And that's not my issue. It was for a  
20 capital improvement.

21 So I went back, and I did see that you  
22 were in a lease. And now you've got the  
23 lease-to-purchase. And I saw in the  
24 lease-to-purchase -- and I'm just asking, and I've  
25 got lawyers on both sides that can probably better

1 answer this.

2 But when you went from lease to  
3 lease-to-purchase, the lessee becomes responsible  
4 for improvements. And I don't know if that's normal  
5 in lease -- when it goes to lease-to-purchase. And  
6 I'm guessing it is. But I'm just asking. Because I  
7 saw that that was the change in the old lease. The  
8 owner was responsible. And now you're responsible.  
9 So that's my simple question.

10 MS. SUSAN McCONNELL: Thank you. I'm  
11 going to let our chief Financial Officer, Sarah  
12 Piña, answer that for you.

13 MS. SARAH PIÑA: Good morning. Thank you  
14 for your question. So, yes. Upon execution and  
15 approval of the lease-purchase, the school is  
16 responsible for the leaseholder improvements; in  
17 this particular instance, with the audit finding,  
18 the purchase that was made was for water fountains.  
19 And I did not include the sales tax in the total  
20 when I added it to the capital asset listing. And  
21 so that was -- it was corrected. But it did result  
22 in a finding.

23 THE CHAIR: Yeah, you know. And I know  
24 Commissioner Robbins will disagree with me. I'm not  
25 as concerned about the mistake. It was the -- it

<p style="text-align: right;">360</p> <p>1 was the fact that when you look at the 2 lease-to-purchase, the -- you've now become 3 responsible for the capital improvements. 4 So I just looked at the capital 5 improvement. And that piqued my interest, because 6 most of our schools are in just leases, not in 7 lease-to-purchase. So they -- it is the owner that 8 is responsible. 9 So when you transitioned from lease to 10 lease-to-purchase, you become responsible for the 11 capital improvements. And I see Abby saying "yes." 12 And that was -- that was my simple question, trying 13 to dig for a question. 14 MS. ABBY LEWIS: Madam Chair? 15 So one of the reasons that that happens, 16 under the Lease Purchase Act, is because that's how 17 we get that access to that SB-9 -- or, Sarah -- 18 HB 33. I always mix them up. There is one of those 19 we can only access if we're in an LPA. And part of 20 that requirement is that one of those is that we're 21 responsible for the maintenance that the landlord 22 used to be responsible for. So that's why that 23 happens when we transitioned from lease to LPA. 24 THE CHAIR: And that's what I thought. 25 But, like I said, we don't see that many of the</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">362</p> <p>1 Commissioner. You know, one of the things that I 2 feel that we've done that is the most important 3 puzzle piece instructionally was to have a good 4 instructional coach. 5 So Julie Geldmacher is our second coach, 6 and we call her "Chief Instructional Officer." And 7 I'm going to let her talk to you just a little bit 8 about consistency and about strategies as opposed to 9 curriculum, specifically. 10 But that -- having a good instructional 11 coach for your teachers has -- and I just -- I want 12 to make one comment about what Chairwoman Gipson 13 said about when we negotiated our contract those 14 years ago, and I asked her, pleaded with her, "Just 15 give us some time." 16 And it turns out we had a plan. It's 17 taken a while, as I think anything worth the growth 18 is to invest some time into some things that are 19 consistent and to stay the course in the things that 20 we believe in instructionally. 21 And I feel like that's what we've done. 22 And I feel like we're finally starting to see the 23 fruits of that consistency and really translating 24 into our kids. 25 But, Julie, do you want to talk just a</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">361</p> <p>1 lease-to-purchase, unfortunately. So I just wanted 2 to -- to ask that. So thanks. I appreciate that. 3 Commissioners, any other questions? 4 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Chair Gipson, if I 5 could follow up on that. Failing to report a tax is 6 not the same as not having an invoice, not having 7 documentation. It's an easy thing to correct. And 8 so those are things that, yes, they get noted in an 9 audit. But, to me, it's not a fatal audit finding. 10 THE CHAIR: Yeah. Thanks. 11 Commissioner Caballero? 12 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes. It was 13 brought -- one of the questions -- and Madam Chair 14 brought it up a little while ago, but I wanted to 15 ask specifically -- during that term that the school 16 did, in its stand- -- educational attainment for the 17 kids, what did you do -- a few things that you did, 18 either what new things did you try or reaffirm from 19 previous that were not done, just to get an idea. 20 Because you went -- you dipped a little, 21 and then you picked up the following year, and 22 you've been very strong. And I just want to get a 23 sense of what schools need to do to rebound and be 24 successful. That's my question. 25 MS. SUSAN McCONNELL: Thank you,</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">363</p> <p>1 little bit about our belief in terms of strategies 2 and how we're working with our kids and how we 3 articulate from kindergarten through eighth grade? 4 MS. JULIE GELDMACHER: Thank you. We 5 absolutely have beautiful curriculum that's backed 6 by tons of research. But in addition to that, as a 7 professional learning community, we've really come 8 together and had lots of conversations about what's 9 happening in our classroom and the way that we're 10 working with our students, as well as, you know, 11 what we're seeing, the results that we're seeing. 12 So in our professional learning community 13 each week, we have discussions where we bring 14 student work, and we take a look at what we're 15 seeing, and we share ideas with each other about 16 what's working and things that we might try in the 17 classroom. 18 We also have a really great balance 19 between whole group instruction and small group 20 instruction, as well as individual conferencing with 21 our students. And I think that that helps the 22 teachers get a better idea of exactly where the 23 students are and what their individual needs are and 24 how to address those in their instruction. 25 And, you know, then, as we assess students</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">364</p> <p>1 and we come back together, we can really take a look 2 at -- at the results of -- of what we've done in 3 instruction and kind of move on from there. 4 And so I really feel like our teachers are 5 very collaborative, and I think that that's made a 6 really big difference in what we're seeing with -- 7 with student work and with learning. 8 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: And it shows in 9 your teacher retention. 10 MS. JULIE GELDMACHER: Absolutely. 11 Because teaching is not an independent sport. And 12 we really need each other. And I think that -- I 13 think that when you have a strong grade level, and 14 even when you can come together laterally and have 15 these conversations about what you're seeing and 16 about what kids need, I just think that -- I think 17 that's the only way to teach; so... 18 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Thank you. 19 THE CHAIR: Thanks. 20 MS. JULIE GELDMACHER: Thank you. 21 THE CHAIR: Could you just talk a little 22 bit about what some of those strategies that you 23 implemented with the pandemic and a little bit about 24 how much actual time teachers are on with their 25 students during a -- you know, an average day or</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">366</p> <p>1 Academy. And we built everything off of that. 2 So then when the pandemic hit, and we were 3 trying to figure out how to create learning 4 opportunities for our students, we created two 5 models: one which families could choose, which was 6 fully remote no matter what the health order was so 7 that they could plan, so that they knew that that's 8 what they would be doing for the year; and another 9 model, our hybrid model with the anticipation that 10 those kids might be coming back on campus. 11 But what really happened, as we worked 12 through that, is as we created synchronous and 13 asynchronous learning opportunities, Julie and I 14 attended a national seminar over the summer that 15 talked a lot about the COVID slide and equity in 16 access, things that we felt were really important 17 that we had to build a plan around. 18 And we felt like it was very important to 19 still be able to hold our families and kids 20 accountable, that they can learn. It's going to 21 look different, but they can do this. And so we 22 kept our expectations of our kids pretty high, all 23 the while trying to figure out ways to support how 24 we want to do that. 25 And our teachers right now -- Julie can</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">365</p> <p>1 week? 2 MS. JULIE GELDMACHER: Sure. Oh, I'm 3 sorry. 4 MS. SUSAN McCONNELL: Yeah. Let me -- 5 Julie, let me answer just briefly, and then I'll let 6 you add if you have something to add. 7 When we first started to develop the 8 academic model for this coming school year, we were 9 very intentional about a few things, because we 10 didn't really know what was going to happen. And so 11 it's like what Will Duran was talking about, those 12 conversations with the board and how we can offer 13 stability to our families and our students and our 14 faculty. And that was really part of it. 15 So those strategies, if I go back 16 pre-pandemic, some of the strategies we had when we 17 were creating an educational or instructional 18 philosophy had to do with consistency. So we were 19 very intentional about incorporating small group in 20 classrooms. That's the only way that you can offset 21 teacher student ratios. 22 And so that direct instruction with kids 23 where you only have three, four, or five kids at the 24 table and have that kind of face-to-face interaction 25 with students is really important to North Valley</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">367</p> <p>1 talk a little bit more about this. But they are in 2 class with their kids at least twice a day for 3 direct instruction. I feel like -- according to our 4 families, I think that that has been really 5 important for kids to still get that direct 6 instruction. 7 They do breakout rooms so that kids are 8 still being involved in small group instruction. So 9 you might have a leveled reading group that breaks 10 out and is in a virtual room with teacher with only 11 three or four kids in there, and they're getting 12 that direct instruction. 13 And then we chose, very carefully, our 14 supplemental curriculum that we would use for 15 asynchronous learning, so that your kids can still 16 get in there. A lot of it is interactive so they 17 are being met where they are and can build and 18 continue to thrive and grow. 19 It's really hard to keep things engaging 20 when kids are all over the place, not only 21 academically, but with access issues as well. And 22 so we don't want to penalize kids who have Internet 23 issues or technology issues; but we also don't want 24 to hold kids back that are really in class every 25 single day and thriving and growing.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">368</p> <p>1 And for some kids, this has turned out to 2 be a great learning model. So we've learned a lot. 3 Julie, do you want to talk a little bit 4 about specifically what our teachers are doing and 5 how that schedule looks? 6 MS. JULIE GELDMACHER: Yes. I definitely 7 think that the teachers meeting live with the 8 students every day has made a huge difference. We 9 are seeing it in really good attendance. We believe 10 that, you know, it's really important that we be 11 there for our kids live every day, knowing them, 12 supporting them socially, emotionally. And so there 13 is live instruction going on every day, whole group, 14 as well -- and the teachers have also created times 15 to -- to meet with smaller groups, where they can do 16 interventions or even have individual conferences 17 with students. 18 So I think that the live instruction has 19 been probably our greatest support with the 20 students. And it's also -- we've also carved out an 21 hour a day of social-emotional time, where we're 22 delivering -- you know, we have a social-emotional 23 learning curriculum as well as just giving the 24 students time to really connect with each other and 25 have some of that social time with one another.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">370</p> <p>1 And I'm just so impressed with the amount 2 of attention that they're getting from their 3 teachers. And, you know, my daughter -- I have not 4 seen a struggle. In fact, you know, they just did 5 their Istation. She scored 5's in math. And, you 6 know, that was a huge -- not a huge improvement; but 7 it was a very big improvement. She's never got 5s 8 before. 9 For us, it's working. And my daughter is 10 a very social child. So I was really worried about 11 how this was going to affect her. But I've just 12 been so impressed with the work that the teachers 13 are doing and the support that Ms. Geldmacher gives 14 them and the tools that they're using to really be 15 responsive to each student's need. Because 16 everybody is different. And I just really have seen 17 that, and they should all be commended. It's been 18 really awesome. 19 MS. SUSAN McCONNELL: Thanks, Sarah. Kind 20 of put you on the spot there. But thank you. 21 THE CHAIR: Thanks. I know Commissioner 22 Ruiz has something she wants to ask. 23 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Good morning. Not a 24 question, just really a couple of comments. 25 I wanted to commend you and give you kudos</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">369</p> <p>1 And even outside of class time, we're also 2 carving out time for -- you heard the kids mention 3 lunch bunch and bingo nights and things like that. 4 So I think the teachers' presence with the students 5 has been really powerful in this remote environment. 6 MS. SUSAN McCONNELL: Before we move on 7 from that question, Sarah, would you like to talk a 8 little bit about your perspective as a parent who 9 has kids in class? 10 MS. SARAH PIÑA: Sure. So my daughter is 11 in class with her teacher most of the day. She's in 12 fifth grade now; so starting at about 8:30 to 2:30. 13 She's in class most of the day, but she does have a 14 lot of well-timed breaks. 15 Her teacher does study hall at the end of 16 the day to give students the opportunity to ask 17 questions. She's one of the teachers that also does 18 the lunch bunch and the bingo nights. And so I feel 19 like there's been a lot of in-person support. 20 And I think the teachers are a little 21 maybe self-conscious about how they're doing. And I 22 share an office with my daughter. I'm sitting out 23 in front of my fireplace, because they're in class 24 right now. But I kind of listen in to what's 25 happening during the day.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">371</p> <p>1 for the tremendous work that you have done and that 2 you put into the changes and the challenges that 3 teaching in the time of COVID 19 has presented. 4 I've looked at you-all's plan, and I know 5 that Commissioner Chavez and I, being still fully 6 employed with the schools, are aware of the work and 7 time that is put in that it requires to make that 8 successful. And you all have a very clearly 9 delineated plan, and I want to thank you all for 10 that. 11 And the other comment I just wanted to say 12 is thank you, because I -- in looking at your 13 accountability data, you beat every district and all 14 the State statewide numbers: 52 overall reading 15 proficiency -- well, statewide not in the reading. 16 But in math, you're higher than the State and local, 17 and in science and your ELL progress and your 18 reading and your math growth. So I wanted to 19 commend you and give you kudos for that. 20 Thank you. 21 MS. SUSAN McCONNELL: Thank you, 22 Commissioner. 23 THE CHAIR: Thanks. Commissioner Voigt? 24 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you, Madam 25 Chair. I just want to resonate on what Commissioner</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">372</p> <p>1 Ruiz was speaking to; and that is your excellence in 2 existence for this duration of time. You've had 3 such consistent -- a consistent track record 4 throughout the whole longevity of North Valley 5 Academy. 6 I remember when you were actually part of 7 the Horizon network. And I don't know, Susan, if 8 you've been around since that long. But I do 9 remember when you were the assistant principal. And 10 now stepping up and creating such a close-knit 11 learning community, I can feel the sense of your 12 community through this Zoom platform. 13 And you've done an outstanding job. Your 14 team has done amazing work. And just 15 congratulations for such an excellent track record. 16 And that student that was doing the yoga 17 really made we want to get up and get out of this 18 chair. But job well done. Thank you so much for 19 everything that you're doing. 20 MS. SUSAN McCONNELL: Thank you. 21 THE CHAIR: Commissioners, any other 22 questions? 23 Commissioner Armbruster? 24 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Yes. I will not 25 repeat all that everyone else has said; although I</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">374</p> <p>1 everyone improve, not just this charter school, "I 2 want to be better than every other charter school," 3 it's really not that. I mean, that's nice. You 4 should definitely aim for that. 5 But I think it's about sharing and about 6 taking care of children. So I am hoping always to 7 see both charters and traditional public schools 8 share more successes of what they did that really 9 worked. 10 So that's just my comment, and I do thank 11 you for everything you have done. 12 MS. SUSAN McCONNELL: Thank you. 13 THE CHAIR: Thanks. 14 Commissioners, any other questions or 15 comments? 16 Commissioner Voigt? 17 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Just to -- 18 Commissioner Armbruster reminded me that there is a 19 community of practice that's currently going on with 20 the UNM ECHO. Michael Stanton heads that up, 21 Dr. Stanton. 22 And I know the Future Focused Education 23 group is doing a lot of COP statewide with districts 24 and charter schools around presentations of 25 learning.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">373</p> <p>1 thought about doing that yoga, and then I thought, 2 no, I wouldn't be able to get up. So I didn't. But 3 I did stand up. 4 But what I wanted to do besides commend 5 you on such fabulous work, because I think I was at 6 the first renewal as well as Chair Gipson, is that, 7 you know, even though your reading is a little bit 8 low, and, of course, I know that you're working on 9 it, it's amazing that your math is so good. Because 10 that seems to be the area where a vast majority of 11 schools, traditional public schools as well as 12 charters, struggle greatly. Is that right? 13 Struggle greatly? 14 Anyway, I was hoping that you could share, 15 not -- it doesn't have to be with us -- but whether 16 it's Matt Pahl and through that network, but, even 17 better, with superintendents of traditional public 18 schools. Because when you find something that is 19 working -- and, obviously, whatever it is you're 20 doing is -- I think it needs to be shared with 21 everyone. Because our job is -- on PEC -- is to 22 deal with schools. 23 But, overall, many of us have been 24 teachers. I was a teacher for 39 years. So it's 25 only -- it's really about children, about helping</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">375</p> <p>1 I don't know if you've heard about the 2 ECHO program, Susan. It's great. It started out 3 with -- with the nursing and the health programs at 4 UNMH. But Dr. Stanton has kicked that off statewide 5 around teaching. 6 MS. SUSAN McCONNELL: Okay. Thank you. 7 THE CHAIR: Okay. So I am going to move 8 that the Public Education Commission enter into a 9 Closed Session, pursuant to NMSA Section 10-15-1 10 (H)(1). The subject to be discussed pertains to 11 issuance of North Valley Academy charter license 12 renewal. 13 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Second. 14 THE CHAIR: There's a motion by 15 Commissioner Gipson and a second by Commissioner 16 Voigt. 17 Roll, please? You're muted. Commissioner 18 Armbruster, you're muted. 19 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: I feel like I 20 have a flat learning curve here. I'm sorry. 21 Commissioner Caballero? 22 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes. 23 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 24 Raftery? 25 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: Yes.</p>

376	<p>1 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 2 Armbruster votes "Yes." 3 Commissioner Chavez? 4 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes. 5 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 6 Gipson? 7 THE CHAIR: Yes. 8 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 9 Davis? 10 You have to unmute. 11 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Davis? She's 12 otherwise -- Commissioner Davis? 13 MS. KAREN WOERNER: She appears to be 14 struggling with her headset. She has taken it off. 15 So maybe come back to her. 16 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 17 Voigt? 18 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes. 19 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 20 Ruiz? 21 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes. 22 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 23 Crone? 24 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Yes. 25 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p>	378	<p>1 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Okay. I'm leaving. 2 I'll be back in a bit. 3 (Closed Session conducted.) 4 THE CHAIR: So we have each Commissioner 5 in that needs to be in; correct? Okay. 6 So I move that the Public Education 7 Commission end Closed Session. The matters 8 discussed in the closed meeting were limited only to 9 those specified in the motion for closure, and no 10 vote was taken during the Closed Session. 11 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Second. 12 THE CHAIR: There's a motion by 13 Commissioner Gipson, a second by Commissioner Ruiz. 14 Commissioner Armbruster? 15 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Yes. I'm just 16 looking to see if I see Commissioner Crone. Do you? 17 But, I mean, I've got everyone on my screen. 18 THE CHAIR: Let's do this vote, and we 19 won't do anything else. But, hopefully, he can get 20 back in while we're doing this. 21 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Sure. 22 Commissioner Ruiz? 23 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes. 24 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 25 Robbins?</p>
377	<p>1 Robbins? 2 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes. 3 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: I'll try 4 Commissioner Davis. 5 THE CHAIR: Still occupied. We'll let her 6 off. 7 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: The motion 8 passes, nine-zero. Will that be okay? 9 THE CHAIR: The motion passes, nine-zero. 10 Karen, will you watch for Commissioner 11 Davis and let her know we've moved into Closed 12 Session? 13 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Yes. I'm going to 14 make Missy the host. I will. 15 THE CHAIR: Thanks. I appreciate it. 16 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: Karen, I'm going to 17 try to call in so I don't lose you on this -- 18 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Make sure you mute and 19 turn off your video for this one. 20 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: I don't know if I 21 have the number. I'm going to try real quick now. 22 I'm going to mute myself and turn off video. 23 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Okay. 24 Missy, you are host now; right? 25 MS. MELISSA BROWN: Yes.</p>	379	<p>1 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes. 2 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 3 Voigt? 4 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes. 5 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 6 Davis? 7 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Yes. 8 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 9 Gipson? 10 THE CHAIR: Yes. 11 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 12 Cha- -- 13 THE CHAIR: And Commissioner Crone is 14 coming on now. 15 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay. I'll go 16 back. 17 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Crone, we're 18 voting just to come out of Closed Session. 19 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Okay. 20 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Do you vote yes 21 or no? 22 COMMISSIONER CRONE: I voted "Yes." 23 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay. Thank 24 you, Commissioner. 25 Commissioner Chavez voted "Yes"?</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">380</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes.  2 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay. Thank  3 you. Commissioner Armbruster votes "Yes."  4 Commissioner Caballero?  5 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes.  6 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  7 Raftery?  8 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: Yes.  9 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay. It's a  10 ten-to-zero vote. Motion passes.  11 THE CHAIR: Okay. Motion passes,  12 ten-zero.  13 Commissioner Voigt?  14 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you,  15 Madam Chair.  16 I would like to move that the Public  17 Education Commission renew the charter for  18 North Valley Academy for a five-year term, effective  19 July 1st, 2021, through June 30th, 2026.  20 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Second.  21 THE CHAIR: There's a motion by  22 Commissioner Voigt, a second by Commissioner  23 Robbins.  24 If there's no further discussion,  25 Commissioner Armbruster?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">382</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  2 Gipson?  3 THE CHAIR: Yes.  4 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: The motion  5 passes, ten-to-zero.  6 THE CHAIR: Motion passes, ten-zero.  7 Congratulations. Thank you, thank you, thank you.  8 This was a pleasure, a delight. It was refreshing.  9 I enjoyed the discussion, and, hopefully, we will be  10 able to do this in person sooner rather than later  11 at this point in time, because that's truly what I  12 miss about these meetings is to be able to see  13 everyone and often see students that are able to  14 come up and do miss that, as well as Commissioner  15 Robbins' cookies during this time period as well.  16 But that -- you know. So thank you so  17 much. Thank you for everything you do every day.  18 You're working hard. You're being asked to do  19 things that no one ever thought we'd have to be  20 asking schools to do, and you stepped up, and you're  21 serving those kids as well as anyone can ever ask.  22 So thank you.  23 MS. SUSAN McCONNELL: Commissioners, on  24 behalf of the North Valley Academy, thank you so  25 much. You're appreciated in the work that you do,</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">381</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  2 Voigt?  3 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes.  4 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  5 Ruiz?  6 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes.  7 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  8 Robbins?  9 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes.  10 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  11 Crone?  12 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Yes.  13 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  14 Caballero?  15 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes.  16 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  17 Armbruster votes "Yes."  18 Commissioner Raftery?  19 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: Yes.  20 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  21 Davis?  22 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Yes.  23 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  24 Chavez?  25 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">383</p> <p>1 and thank you for your belief in NVA.  2 THE CHAIR: Well -- and we will see you  3 during contract negotiations sometime in the spring.  4 MS. SUSAN McCONNELL: And it'll be so  5 good.  6 THE CHAIR: It will be. Yes, it will be.  7 Thanks. Stay safe, everyone. Have good holidays.  8 MR. WILL DURAN: Thank you, Commissioners.  9 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Folks from the  10 schools, I'm going to be moving you as an attendee,  11 in case you want to stay for the meetings. But it  12 suddenly will send you off. So congratulations.  13 MS. SUSAN McCONNELL: Thank you. Thanks,  14 Karen.  15 THE CHAIR: Commissioners, I'm going to  16 ask if you want a short break before we start the  17 next school.  18 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes, please.  19 THE CHAIR: So do we want to do  20 15 minutes?  21 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes, please.  22 THE CHAIR: Okay. All right. So we'll  23 see you all back in 15 minutes. Thanks.  24 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: So I just want to let  25 everyone know that I have to leave about 1:00.</p>

384

1 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thanks.  
 2 (Recess taken, 12:04 p.m. to 12:31 p.m.)  
 3 THE CHAIR: So next on our agenda is Red  
 4 River Valley. So, Karen, do you want to bring them  
 5 in, please?  
 6 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Kimberly, I'm going to  
 7 start with you, move you to the panel, and you can  
 8 let me know who else I need from your school.  
 9 Kimberly, I see you there. If you could  
 10 unmute yourself.  
 11 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: So Liz Tate,  
 12 Kinsey Webb, Sarah Parker, Courtney Henderson,  
 13 Heather Larson.  
 14 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Hold on one second.  
 15 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Oh, sorry.  
 16 MS. KAREN WOERNER: That's okay. Heather  
 17 Larson. Okay.  
 18 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Lost my train  
 19 of thought. Hang on. I'm sorry. I think Crystal  
 20 Lancaster is going to be on her phone.  
 21 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Would that end in  
 22 -0979? Do you know?  
 23 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: I can check  
 24 right now.  
 25 That's it. Yeah, that's her.

385

1 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Okay. So let me move  
 2 her.  
 3 Let's see.  
 4 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: And I said  
 5 Courtney Henderson, correct?  
 6 MS. KAREN WOERNER: You did. There's  
 7 Courtney.  
 8 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: And let me see  
 9 if I'm miss- -- oh -- Zach Kirchgessner.  
 10 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Zach. Got it.  
 11 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: And then I'm  
 12 not sure if Joe Ben Maldonado made it. He was going  
 13 to try to.  
 14 MS. KAREN WOERNER: I don't see him.  
 15 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: All right.  
 16 Reed Weimer.  
 17 MS. KAREN WOERNER: No.  
 18 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: I just don't  
 19 want to leave anyone out.  
 20 MS. KAREN WOERNER: So, Kimberly, if you  
 21 go down to the bottom of your screen and click on  
 22 Participants now that you're on the panel, you can  
 23 see, under Attendees, any names that appear familiar  
 24 to you.  
 25 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Thank you very

386

1 much. I'll give that a quick look. Courtney's  
 2 there. Heather's there. Liz. Sarah. All right.  
 3 I think that's it, Karen.  
 4 MS. KAREN WOERNER: And the person on the  
 5 phone, what was their name?  
 6 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Crystal  
 7 Lancaster.  
 8 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Crystal,  
 9 C-R-Y-S-T-A-L, Lancaster. So let me just change her  
 10 name there.  
 11 Okay. I think we're all here,  
 12 Madam Chair.  
 13 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Karen,  
 14 Courtney, will Samantha will be with you? Thumbs up  
 15 if Samantha will be with you? That's one of our --  
 16 MR. COURTNEY HENDERSON: She's actually  
 17 upstairs in her room right now so that we don't  
 18 echo.  
 19 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: So we need to  
 20 put her on, though, as an Attendee.  
 21 MR. COURTNEY HENDERSON: Let's see. I  
 22 don't see --  
 23 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Samantha  
 24 Henderson.  
 25 MS. KAREN WOERNER: She's in the

387

1 Attendees. Is she going to be part of your school  
 2 presentation or public comment? We'll add her to  
 3 the panel when it's time for her to speak, okay?  
 4 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Thank you.  
 5 Thank you.  
 6 MS. KAREN WOERNER: You're muted,  
 7 Madam Chair.  
 8 THE CHAIR: Melissa Armijo, who is also  
 9 one of our new coming-in Commissioners, is also on  
 10 today. So I wanted to recognize that.  
 11 So thanks very much. Welcome, all. And  
 12 we'll just continue with our usual procedure here.  
 13 The Charter School Division will offer  
 14 their report. The school will have their 15 minutes  
 15 to present additionally whatever they want to.  
 16 I'm trying to remember -- I don't think  
 17 you've got a 15-minute presentation. Did you not do  
 18 a narrative, if I remember correctly? I could be  
 19 wrong.  
 20 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Yeah,  
 21 Madam Chair. We'll start with a 15-minute  
 22 discussion of our school and then move to a video  
 23 for the equity --  
 24 THE CHAIR: Oh, thanks. I appreciate it.  
 25 And then we'll do the public comment.

<p style="text-align: right;">388</p> <p>1 So, Karen, whenever you're ready.</p> <p>2 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Absolutely. So,</p> <p>3 Madam Chair, Commissioners, the group you have</p> <p>4 before you is from Red River Valley Charter School.</p> <p>5 They serve students in Grades K through 8, a</p> <p>6 rural -- another rural school in Red River, I guess</p> <p>7 were under the Questa district in the past, I</p> <p>8 understand -- with 74 students enrolled this year at</p> <p>9 40-day.</p> <p>10 They are a small rural school also on the</p> <p>11 Enchanted Circle. We love to go visit Roots &amp; Wings</p> <p>12 and Red River up there. And the classrooms are</p> <p>13 multi-age and multi-grade levels. They were first</p> <p>14 chartered -- and the school can correct me if I'm</p> <p>15 wrong when we get to their presentation.</p> <p>16 But I think they were first chartered in</p> <p>17 2001 and was with the local district for the first</p> <p>18 ten years and then switched to the PEC as a</p> <p>19 State-authorized charter. And this should be their</p> <p>20 third renewal with PEC, I think.</p> <p>21 But if you refer to your packet, the</p> <p>22 recommendation from the PED is for a full renewal</p> <p>23 for the five years. The school did earn 52 points</p> <p>24 in the last State Accountability System report,</p> <p>25 which was for the '18-'19 school year. As you know,</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">390</p> <p>1 is admirable.</p> <p>2 The school does not have the support of a</p> <p>3 foundation, but they've -- the school leader did</p> <p>4 mention that they have received support from the</p> <p>5 community through some foundations, through grant</p> <p>6 process and things like that. But they don't</p> <p>7 actually have a foundation specifically to support</p> <p>8 the school.</p> <p>9 Like the other schools, I want to share,</p> <p>10 on Page 2, you'll see that they -- their Evaluation</p> <p>11 Summary of their Part B is all Meets Standards or</p> <p>12 Demonstrating Substantial Progress.</p> <p>13 As you recall, the rubric is pretty</p> <p>14 stringent, and if they didn't Meet Standard all the</p> <p>15 way across, it's a Demonstrates Progress would be</p> <p>16 the maximum they can receive, which explains why.</p> <p>17 Though we were very pleased to see the progress.</p> <p>18 It's not quite a Meets Standards.</p> <p>19 Their Accountability data, as you see</p> <p>20 here, their overall score was a 52. Reading</p> <p>21 proficiency, very high. Math proficiency, better</p> <p>22 than the local district, but still needing some</p> <p>23 focus there. Science proficiency, very similar to</p> <p>24 the local district. And their English Learner</p> <p>25 progress is masked because they have so few EL</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">389</p> <p>1 there wasn't a report for last year due to the State</p> <p>2 assessments being waived.</p> <p>3 And as you also know, I mentioned with</p> <p>4 another school, 53.33 was the cutoff for Spotlight</p> <p>5 designation; so it's just a short hair away from</p> <p>6 that Spotlight's designation.</p> <p>7 But the school did receive designations of</p> <p>8 excellence in reading growth and math growth. And</p> <p>9 they exceeded all three of their charter school</p> <p>10 goals during that same '18-'19 school year.</p> <p>11 The school's organizational performance</p> <p>12 ratings have been excellent, meeting standards in 17</p> <p>13 of the 18 indicators. The remaining one was a</p> <p>14 Workings to Meet, and it was around -- I think that</p> <p>15 might have been around the financial audit.</p> <p>16 Their audit did contain two findings.</p> <p>17 Zero were repeats, and none of them were material</p> <p>18 weaknesses or significant deficiencies.</p> <p>19 And I would like to note that that's a</p> <p>20 significant reduction in audit findings over the</p> <p>21 term of this contract.</p> <p>22 The school spent an average of 59 percent</p> <p>23 of its annual operating budget on instructional</p> <p>24 costs. Again, you know that the goal is 68 percent.</p> <p>25 But with a low enrollment of 74 students, 59 percent</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">391</p> <p>1 students.</p> <p>2 And, of course, the ratings chart clearly</p> <p>3 shows an improvement over the course of the contract</p> <p>4 year and a very clear Meeting Standards pretty much</p> <p>5 across the board.</p> <p>6 Again, the first couple of grayed out</p> <p>7 areas are due to the fact that we didn't have State</p> <p>8 assessments last year.</p> <p>9 Moving on to Page 6 of the -- sorry to</p> <p>10 scroll here; should have typed the number in.</p> <p>11 But this is where we were talking about</p> <p>12 the percentage of their money spent on instructional</p> <p>13 costs and the percentage spent on admin costs. The</p> <p>14 rest is falling in these areas of maintenance</p> <p>15 operations, food service, and other; again, pretty</p> <p>16 good percentages there.</p> <p>17 The charter goals are on Page 18 of this</p> <p>18 packet. And they had, as you know, the reading and</p> <p>19 math goals that were required in the prior</p> <p>20 contracts. And you can see here that they've done</p> <p>21 very well, other than the first year, a little</p> <p>22 shortcoming in the reading goal, but other than</p> <p>23 that, have met or exceeded all their charter goals</p> <p>24 during the duration of the contract.</p> <p>25 Enrollment numbers. On the next page, you</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">392</p> <p>1 see their demographics and their retention. So 2 within the school year, you can see that students 3 stayed there during the school year. Very low 4 withdrawal numbers. And then remaining enrolled 5 between school years has been on a steady increase 6 all the way to 100 percent. 7 We see a dip for this year that I think 8 the school has concerns about the pandemic and COVID 9 response, but I'll let them speak to that if they 10 wish. 11 Teacher retention has been very good. 12 Small staff. So a change in staff can have a 13 dramatic effect when the staff is so small. 14 And also, again, the audit findings. As I 15 mentioned earlier, they had more findings with 16 material weaknesses and significant deficiencies, 17 but, in the last published report, really reduced 18 those. No repeats and no significant findings, 19 which is nice to see. So kudos to their business 20 team on that. 21 And then, of course, you do have your -- 22 the ratings chart, again, is on Page 17, if you want 23 to see more clearly. The thumbnail doesn't quite 24 cut it. So I also want to mention that the school 25 did not provide any response to the preliminary</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">394</p> <p>1 Crystal Lancaster is one of our parents 2 and also took a position this year as an EA. 3 And we have -- I think that's it for the 4 panel. I don't think I missed anyone on the panel. 5 And then myself, Kimberly Ritterhouse. 6 THE CHAIR: Thank you. And thank you all 7 for all the time and energy that we know went into 8 doing this application and the challenges it 9 normally has; but, certainly, challenges during this 10 time period. So we appreciate it. And this is the 11 time we really like so we can get to see the schools 12 and talk with them. So thank you for that time as 13 well. 14 So Missy Brown is actually timing. So 15 she'll put up a little friendly note -- and I think 16 she's got -- yeah, that -- do you have a little 17 sound? (Timing sound.) 18 Yeah. So -- so whenever you're ready to 19 start. 20 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: All right. 21 That's awesome. Thank you very much. We're going 22 to begin with Courtney Henderson. 23 MR. COURTNEY HENDERSON: Hello, 24 Commissioners. I'm Courtney Henderson, I'm 25 president of the Red River Valley's governing</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">393</p> <p>1 analysis, other than to say that they had no 2 corrections, didn't have anything that they wanted 3 to dispute in the preliminary analysis. 4 So we do recommend, as I said, a renewal 5 of five years. 6 THE CHAIR: Thank you. And welcome once 7 again. So -- and, Kimberly, I'm just going to ask 8 if you or -- I don't know if you've chosen someone 9 else from your school to introduce everyone that's 10 on the screen and their role, so that we have that 11 for the record? 12 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Yes, ma'am. 13 I'll be happy to do that. 14 We have Courtney Henderson. And he is our 15 governing council president. 16 Heather Larson is our governing council 17 treasurer. 18 Liz Tate is our governing council 19 secretary. 20 We have Zach Kirchgessner, who is our 21 business manager. 22 Kinsey Webb is our fifth-sixth-grade 23 teacher. 24 Sarah Parker is our special education and 25 student services coordinator.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">395</p> <p>1 council. I've been on the board for seven years, 2 and I have three daughters who attended the charter 3 school from pre-K through their eighth-grade 4 graduation. 5 I've got, proud to announce, two that are 6 going to be attending college the next year. The 7 youngest is a sophomore. And all of them excel 8 academically. I believe it's a value that was 9 instilled in them by the charter school's culture 10 and success. 11 Before my wife and I moved to New Mexico 12 14 years ago, we researched the local schools. And 13 we found that Red River had a small class sizes, and 14 the staff was loaded with teachers that have 15 master's degrees. 16 After we moved here, we also came to know 17 that it's a very close-knit group of highly 18 qualified individuals who could really teach 19 anywhere they wanted, but, thankfully, they happened 20 to love Red River. 21 And we also saw a very diverse group of 22 students who are considerate to others, really took 23 pride in their school. And I believe that under the 24 stewardship of Kimberly Ritterhouse, I think the 25 school is even better today.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">396</p> <p>1 We'll soon be starting the second phase of 2 construction to replace a few portable buildings 3 that we have left, and we'll finish out the campus 4 for all our grades.</p> <p>5 We've got five upstanding members of the 6 community that are serving on the governance 7 council; they've done a really good job with the 8 finances. Of course, I'd like to give a big 9 shout-out to our business manager, Zach Kirchgessner 10 of the Rael group, who's done an excellent job. And 11 I understand he'll be available for questions later.</p> <p>12 And we remain focused on our mission 13 statement, which reads that, "Students will fulfill 14 their potential as scholars and become self-reliant 15 and productive members of society. They will be 16 adept at creative thinking and critical problem 17 solving, and will be fully prepared to succeed in 18 future schools, careers, and civic life."</p> <p>19 Our test scores are varied, but they 20 remain above the New Mexico State average, 21 particularly our reading scores. Despite the 22 challenges, we're educating a fairly transient 23 population with year-to-year turnover. It's -- it's 24 the nature of working in a tiny town that relies 25 pretty exclusively on tourism.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">398</p> <p>1 coming back to teach in the school where I grew up, 2 I was so excited about it. And coming back, I could 3 see how much the school had grown and strengthened 4 since my time there; but I also saw many things that 5 had remained the same in all the best possible ways, 6 such as the close relationship between the staff and 7 the students and the teachers.</p> <p>8 And the students were so eager and excited 9 to come to school, which I had not seen often in my 10 previous experience. And the staff, it was truly 11 happy and joyful to be where they were. And to see 12 these close, tight-knit groups that had remained the 13 same throughout the years as new students and new 14 staff and families had come in was really 15 refreshing.</p> <p>16 And one thing I noticed that was -- I was 17 so in awe of was the extensive foundation of 18 knowledge that my students had. Having taught sixth 19 grade before, I had never experienced a group of 20 students that could have such deep discussions about 21 such a vast array of topics. And I was so impressed 22 by this.</p> <p>23 And as I was trained more in our 24 Core Knowledge curriculum, I realized that was the 25 basis of Core Knowledge, was that these students</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">397</p> <p>1 But that said, I think the school has been 2 a great boon to Red River and its economy. It's 3 constantly attracting young families who continue to 4 revitalize the town. And I think without the 5 charter school, I'd be worried about the town and 6 our children's future. But I believe that with it, 7 I think our prospects are bright.</p> <p>8 I'd like to introduce our next speaker, 9 fifth-grade teacher Kinsey Webb, who also happens to 10 be a former student of the Red River Valley Charter 11 School. And she'll be followed by Sarah Parker who 12 heads up reading intervention, special ed. Kimberly 13 Ritterhouse, of course, our school administrator. 14 And then public comment from former students, 15 Crystal Lancaster and Samantha Henderson. And I'd 16 like to thank you all for your time and 17 consideration.</p> <p>18 THE CHAIR: Thank you.</p> <p>19 MS. KINSEY WEBB: Hi. Again, my name is 20 Kinsey Webb, and I teach fifth and sixth grade at 21 Red River Valley Charter. And this is -- I've been 22 teaching for ten years. This is my third year at 23 Red River Valley Charter School, that, as Courtney 24 said, I also went to school here.</p> <p>25 So when I had this special opportunity of</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">399</p> <p>1 have such an extensive foundation of knowledge that 2 transfers across subjects and from grade level to 3 grade level.</p> <p>4 So that was just, you know, very exciting 5 as a teacher to be able to experience that in my 6 classroom and to see them so eager and excited to be 7 there and to be learning.</p> <p>8 So as we began this year and navigating 9 some challenging times, I was so thankful to be at 10 this school, because I knew that as challenging as 11 it was going to be, we had formed such a close bond 12 as a staff, but also with our students and their 13 families, that we would be able to make this 14 transition a successful one. And I truly believe we 15 have, through remote learning.</p> <p>16 So I also was able to, with this charter 17 renewal coming up, reflect on some of the many ways 18 that our school is special. And I documented that 19 and wanted to share that with you. So I'm going to 20 read what I wrote, quickly.</p> <p>21 During my teaching career, I have taught 22 at different schools, grade levels, departments, and 23 subjects. My experience prior to this was in large 24 schools with large class sizes. I found it so 25 difficult to establish close relationships with</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">400</p> <p>1 students and rarely knew the parents, if at all.  2 When I first started teaching here, I was  3 struck by the stark contrast with this school and my  4 past experience. The students were so eager to  5 learn, so excited to be here, so friendly and  6 polite. It was like taking a step back in time,  7 where teaching is as I imagined it would be.  8 With small class size, I was able to  9 quickly establish close relationships with students,  10 learning their individual personalities and learning  11 styles, allowing me to help them based on their  12 individual needs.  13 I was able to get to know parents and  14 families much more quickly and, having a multi-grade  15 level, was able to have my students for two years in  16 a row. This established a trust and a familiarity  17 between us.  18 This school is so unique in that we are  19 surrounded by nature. We are able to take nature  20 walks, sparking the imagination and interest of our  21 students. We are able to take our students skiing,  22 watching them learn a new skill while being active  23 and outdoors.  24 I immediately noticed my students were  25 more imaginative and creative, often choosing to be</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">402</p> <p>1 unique in so many ways. But, specifically, our size  2 and close-knit community allows us to support  3 students and families. More quickly. It's speed  4 now. Especially because they're gone; they're not  5 here all the time. So we -- but because we're so  6 close-knit, we know what's going on for the most  7 part.  8 So because of the size, I'm able to drive  9 to families' homes to help with technology, as well  10 as just support them if they need other types of  11 support, and to be sure that the kids can get  12 connected for their classes and for their -- for  13 their ancillary services, for their special ed  14 content services, for their reading intervention.  15 I also check in with families and try  16 to -- try to connect them with more emotional  17 supports through other agencies.  18 But, you know, in a larger school, I don't  19 know that I would be able to do that, because it's  20 partially proximity and knowing all of the families.  21 Other teachers do more to provide  22 supports, like their -- they build in time for the  23 kids constantly because of our size and just our  24 closeness.  25 And we're able to -- because we're small,</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">401</p> <p>1 outside playing rather than inside watching  2 television.  3 Being such a small school offers us the  4 opportunity to know all students, not just our own  5 grade levels. This creates a safe environment where  6 all adults are aware of where each child needs to  7 be, who they belong to, who they can be picked up by  8 and so on.  9 This has been the best teaching experience  10 of my career. The staff and students create a  11 feeling of being one big family. Each and every day  12 feels like a new adventure awaiting us.  13 Thank you.  14 THE CHAIR: Thank you.  15 Missy, how much time is left?  16 MS. MELISSA BROWN: Six minutes and  17 23 seconds.  18 THE CHAIR: Okay. All right.  19 MS. SARAH PARKER: My name is Sarah  20 Parker. I do special ed, and I also do technology.  21 I do other things. You know, in a small school, you  22 end up doing a lot of different things.  23 But I want to kind of address equity. And  24 because of COVID, it looks a certain way right now.  25 So Red River Valley Charter School is</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">403</p> <p>1 we're able to pivot quickly and change anything  2 that's not working, especially within our  3 boundaries, our federal boun- -- you know, whatever  4 those expectations are.  5 And I also want to say the ski program,  6 you know, in all of the schools in the area,  7 every -- it's dependent on whether the kid can pay  8 to go skiing for the day in the ski program. But  9 for us, we raise the money to ensure that everyone  10 in the school is able to go skiing, because it's  11 such an important experience that a lot of kids  12 would not normally have. And it builds confidence  13 in them, and it creates other peer, just,  14 connections.  15 So I may have missed something, but I  16 wanted to be sure to give other people time.  17 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Thanks, Sarah.  18 I'm just going to cut to the chase and say  19 that I'm just so very proud of the staff, the  20 students, the families, our governance council, and  21 the improvements that we've made together over the  22 past two-and-a-half years.  23 It really is important to us that we  24 support our students academically, physically, and  25 socially. And I'm just really proud of what we're</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">404</p> <p>1 doing here.</p> <p>2 Thank you.</p> <p>3 MS. MELISSA BROWN: There's three minutes</p> <p>4 and 27 seconds left. So...</p> <p>5 THE CHAIR: Has everyone spoken during</p> <p>6 this time?</p> <p>7 I just wanted to make sure. So thanks so</p> <p>8 much.</p> <p>9 So, now, you do have a video that you</p> <p>10 wished to share with us?</p> <p>11 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Yes.</p> <p>12 Ms. Parker is going to share, if she can have the</p> <p>13 Screen Share.</p> <p>14 MS. KAREN WOERNER: You should be able to</p> <p>15 share now. Make sure when you -- if it's a video,</p> <p>16 that when you open it, you have an option to choose</p> <p>17 the computer sound. Make sure you do that at the</p> <p>18 bottom, as you share.</p> <p>19 MS. SARAH PARKER: So it gave me a message</p> <p>20 about restarting something. I could try one more</p> <p>21 time or exit out and come back in, if that's --</p> <p>22 MS. KAREN WOERNER: I don't think you need</p> <p>23 to exit out. How about sharing again? And when</p> <p>24 that screen opens to choose the screen you're going</p> <p>25 to share, make sure at the bottom that you have</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">406</p> <p>1 PUBLIC COMMENTER: Hello, everybody. I am</p> <p>2 a parent, and now I work at the school. I was born</p> <p>3 and raised in Red River, as was my husband. And we</p> <p>4 left the community in 2014 and found out we were</p> <p>5 going to have a child.</p> <p>6 And we've moved to the big city. We moved</p> <p>7 a couple of times to a couple of big cities. And by</p> <p>8 the time we finally rolled around to 2018, 2019, our</p> <p>9 child was approaching school age, and we had to</p> <p>10 decide what to do. We didn't want him in a big city</p> <p>11 school.</p> <p>12 And then we remembered our hometown and</p> <p>13 the wonderful school that is here and all the</p> <p>14 wonderful teachers and programs they had available.</p> <p>15 So we moved home. We dropped everything. My</p> <p>16 husband quit a job he was making good money at. We</p> <p>17 moved in with my in-laws that lived in Costilla and</p> <p>18 we brought our son home so that he could go to the</p> <p>19 best school that we knew.</p> <p>20 So we are just so grateful for all the</p> <p>21 teachers, the administrators, the community who</p> <p>22 welcomed us back, that our child has the best</p> <p>23 opportunity to learn, and that now I have an</p> <p>24 opportunity to be part of that experience as well.</p> <p>25 That's basically all I have.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">405</p> <p>1 Computer Audio selected, or something about computer</p> <p>2 sound.</p> <p>3 MS. SARAH PARKER: It says, "Share</p> <p>4 computer sound."</p> <p>5 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Yeah, that one.</p> <p>6 MS. SARAH PARKER: Let me -- I hope it --</p> <p>7 and then let me tell you if it gives me a message.</p> <p>8 Hopefully, you can hear it.</p> <p>9 (Video played.)</p> <p>10 THE CHAIR: Thank you so much. These</p> <p>11 truly are becoming the highlights of our days. And</p> <p>12 they're enjoyable and informative as well. So</p> <p>13 thanks a lot for that.</p> <p>14 Missy, how many do we have signed up for</p> <p>15 public comment?</p> <p>16 MS. MELISSA BROWN: We have three,</p> <p>17 Commissioners.</p> <p>18 THE CHAIR: Okay. So there's eight</p> <p>19 minutes.</p> <p>20 MS. MELISSA BROWN: Three minutes and</p> <p>21 40 seconds, yes.</p> <p>22 THE CHAIR: If they want to take that</p> <p>23 amount of time -- but that's fine.</p> <p>24 MS. MELISSA BROWN: So first on the list</p> <p>25 is Crystal Lancaster.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">407</p> <p>1 THE CHAIR: Thanks so much.</p> <p>2 FROM THE FLOOR: Thank you.</p> <p>3 MS. MELISSA BROWN: Next we have Heather</p> <p>4 Larson.</p> <p>5 THE CHAIR: And I saw in the chat that she</p> <p>6 put a comment in that she's having trouble with her</p> <p>7 microphone and won't be able to comment. I don't</p> <p>8 know if that's -- so I'm assuming it's still the</p> <p>9 case. But if it's not --</p> <p>10 MS. MELISSA BROWN: I did not see that.</p> <p>11 Next is Samantha Henderson. Oh. Wait a</p> <p>12 second. Liz Tate asked if she could speak in</p> <p>13 Heather's place. So Liz Tate is next.</p> <p>14 PUBLIC COMMENTER: Thank you,</p> <p>15 Commissioners. I appreciate your time and</p> <p>16 consideration. I know yesterday was a very long</p> <p>17 day, and I had the luxury of skipping out on the</p> <p>18 last half of -- of it, unlike you folks.</p> <p>19 So I just wanted to say coming from -- I'm</p> <p>20 going to read what I wrote. Coming from a small</p> <p>21 community, in a similar in size K-through-8 school,</p> <p>22 I naturally embraced the opportunities offered by a</p> <p>23 small school surrounded by a supportive local</p> <p>24 community.</p> <p>25 Although one aspect of Red River Valley</p>

408	<p>1 Charter School that I wish I had been exposed to is 2 the Core Knowledge curriculum. As I have learned 3 more about Core Knowledge, and I have much more to 4 learn, I see the value of understanding the 5 chronological timeline of how subject contents 6 align.</p> <p>7 Studying literature and art pertinent to 8 the Civil War, for example, while studying the Civil 9 War, would have been enriching -- would have 10 enriched my learning experience greatly.</p> <p>11 I commend Red River Charter School for 12 embracing the Core Knowledge curriculum and using 13 that curriculum to lay foundational, educational 14 blocks for the students at the school.</p> <p>15 So on a side note, I am honored to be part 16 of the governance council. I have learned so much 17 about the school and from the other council members, 18 and it is truly a blessing to be part of it. And, 19 once again, I thank you for your consideration.</p> <p>20 THE CHAIR: Thank you. And we have one 21 more person?</p> <p>22 MS. MELISSA BROWN: We do, Commissioner 23 Gipson. We have Samantha Henderson, and I'll 24 promote her to the panel.</p> <p>25 MS. KAREN WOERNER: I did just promote</p>	410	<p>1 to communicate and work with other people. This is 2 another invaluable skill that I learned in the 3 tight-knit community of the charter school.</p> <p>4 My experience is so unique. In the past, 5 before COVID 19, we would go skiing every Thursday 6 in January. The whole school had lessons as well as 7 some extra free time. By giving the kids time off 8 to get to know each other, all the students had the 9 chance to bond.</p> <p>10 Fostering friendships and collaboration in 11 my opinion is the most important aspect of school. 12 We were all able to teach each other and grow.</p> <p>13 I loved my time at Red River Valley 14 Charter School, and I am absolutely positive that 15 there are many others that would say the same.</p> <p>16 THE CHAIR: Thank you so much. And 17 thanks, everyone, for your comments.</p> <p>18 So while Missy moves everyone that needs 19 to be out -- and I think there's only two, I guess.</p> <p>20 MS. KAREN WOERNER: I think that the 21 others were part of the school group for answering 22 questions as well. So -- is that right? Kimberly, 23 Heather, and Crystal should stay in the panel?</p> <p>24 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Sorry about 25 that. No. Crystal can go. And then Heather was</p>
409	<p>1 her. There's Samantha.</p> <p>2 PUBLIC COMMENTER: Hello. Okay. I'm 3 actually one of the kids that was in the class 4 promoted in the video. So I have a lot to say.</p> <p>5 My name is Samantha Henderson. I would 6 like to speak to the skills that the school has 7 given me.</p> <p>8 I attended Red River Valley Charter School 9 from the start of kindergarten to the end of eighth 10 grade. I am now a high school senior at Moreno 11 Valley High School in Angel Fire, and I'm in 12 UNM-Taos dual-credit classes.</p> <p>13 The charter school has done so much to 14 thoroughly prepare me for my high school education. 15 The small class sizes and the fantastic learning 16 environment have particularly benefited me. Not 17 only have I gone on to earn a GPA above 4.0, but I 18 generally feel that I gained a mindset that helps me 19 tackle all my problems in all classes and subjects.</p> <p>20 Learning is something I was very well 21 taught how to do, especially by the awesome and 22 experienced teachers, teachers that I loved that are 23 still at the school today, including Ms. Ritterhouse 24 and Ms. Parker.</p> <p>25 I have also become confident in my ability</p>	411	<p>1 having microphone problems, but I know she'd still 2 like to listen in.</p> <p>3 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Okay. So we can move 4 them to the Attendees then.</p> <p>5 THE CHAIR: Okay. All right. Thanks.</p> <p>6 So, once again, thanks, welcome, and thank 7 you for everything that you've done. It is -- and, 8 actually, thank you for -- I'm not even sure if it's 9 reminding. We talk all the time about conversion 10 schools. And we've kind of lost track of what all 11 the conversion schools are.</p> <p>12 So a reminder that this actually was a 13 conversion school was a nice reminder, because we 14 kind of forget that. So thanks for that.</p> <p>15 And the history, it is really -- as 16 we've -- as so many more traditional districts are 17 moving into the what they think is the 18 innovativeness of community schools, those that are 19 in the charter community are saying, "Hey, wait a 20 minute. We've been doing this now since we 21 started." So there's nothing new about it.</p> <p>22 So we appreciate the fact that you are 23 truly an integral part of that community and 24 representative of what truly a community school is, 25 and the fact that you've shown that you've taken a</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">412</p> <p>1 look at some of those times when you may have dipped 2 a little bit in your data. 3 And you did mention that you worked 4 through the NM DASH system, and the work showed 5 within that year. So that's really important for us 6 to see. 7 And I know Ms. Parker talked a little bit 8 about what she's been able to do during these trying 9 times in terms of being able to go to school -- go 10 to houses and help with technology. 11 But could you just talk a little bit about 12 what the school day looks like now for your kids and 13 how much time they're actually still spending with 14 the teacher? 15 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Sure. We have 16 the K through eighth grade. And the teachers vary 17 their live sessions depending on the age level of 18 the child. 19 So, for instance, our kindergarten-first 20 grade combination class, they have two -- they have 21 three live sessions a day. However, they have other 22 activities that they can work through as well. 23 Since I have Ms. Webb here, I'd like her 24 to address what's going on in the upper grade levels 25 also.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">414</p> <p>1 text; it's home visits from Sarah and the teachers, 2 myself, whoever can get out there and get that 3 support that they need. 4 So I'm bragging on my teachers because 5 they've been doing awesome. 6 THE CHAIR: That's okay. That's okay. 7 That's what this time is for. I appreciate that. 8 And I certainly love the fact that the 9 school is small. I graduated public high school 10 with 95. So -- and that's big in comparison to you. 11 That's your total population, plus a couple. But I 12 understand the -- that connectivity that you 13 develop. 14 But it also, in this day and age, creates 15 challenges for sustainability, you know. And you 16 have to walk that fine line of how do you stay 17 viable but still be able to stay true to yourself 18 and stay small. 19 And I don't know what the likelihood is 20 that you would be able to grow much more in terms of 21 your -- you know, the community really being able to 22 support, you know, that many more students coming 23 in. 24 So what does the future in terms of that 25 look like for you?</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">413</p> <p>1 MS. KINSEY WEBB: So for fifth and sixth 2 grade, we -- I have my students divided into small 3 groups. I felt that was the best way to serve them 4 online. 5 And I see them -- all of my students come 6 to two live sessions a day. And then in between 7 that, they have other technology stations and 8 enrichment activities; and so they're not getting -- 9 I -- we try to mix in things that they can do with, 10 you know, art and physical education so they're not 11 just getting screen time. But they do come for two 12 live sessions a day for core subjects. 13 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thanks so much. 14 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: And then -- 15 sorry, Chairwoman Gipson. They also -- the teachers 16 have such a strong desire to help all of these kids 17 in this distance learning situation. And every 18 single one of them is providing an extra -- 19 after-school tutorials and study hall. 20 And then we even have teachers that have 21 Q-and-A for parents and families that are having 22 issues. So they have an office hours, if you will, 23 where parents can reach out. 24 Communication has been key this year. 25 It's class dojo. It's e-mail; it's telephone; it's</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">415</p> <p>1 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Well, I'm 2 excited to say that, first of all, I -- I am happy 3 with our hundred cap, because there are choices in 4 our community. There -- there are one, two, three, 5 four schools that K through 8 can choose from. And 6 we just are dedicated to sticking with our mission, 7 advertising what we have to offer, and encouraging 8 families to take a look at us. 9 I'm also excited to say that there seems 10 to be a baby boom in Red River. And so we've got a 11 lot of young families that have come back. And now 12 they're having babies, two, three. One of our 13 teachers this year -- actually two of our teachers 14 are due in January. And of one of those, her oldest 15 starts pre-K next year. 16 So I understand the concern and the 17 sustainability. But I feel like what we have to 18 offer is different and enticing, and that 19 communication, connection, and the curriculum are 20 going to -- to pull families in and have them stay. 21 THE CHAIR: Thanks. And, certainly, the 22 fact that families are willing to drive 45-plus 23 minutes one way to bring their child to the school 24 says a lot, because we all know what a commitment 25 that can be, especially when you're looking at the</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">416</p> <p>1 potential weather issues that you can deal with. So 2 it's not that easy. 3 So thank you. 4 Commissioners -- Commissioner Voigt? 5 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you, 6 Madam Chair. Thank you for the presentation. It's 7 always great to see the kids in action and hear from 8 your community. And I'm really impressed that every 9 kid skis. That's awesome. That's really great. 10 I remember taking ski lessons as an adult 11 and seeing these little kids zip by me with no ski 12 poles, just (indicates). So that's really awesome 13 that they're getting out to do that. 14 And it's very touching that you are 15 inhabiting the one-room Little Red Schoolhouse. I 16 never knew that about the history of Red River. And 17 I appreciated hearing from the historian on that 18 presentation of Red River, because it's a great 19 community of -- I haven't been up there probably in 20 at least seven years. But this makes me want to 21 come visit again; and so that was a great 22 presentation. 23 Now, you're doing the Love &amp; Logic student 24 discipline. I love Love &amp; Logic. Can you just cite 25 an example of -- of a success story within your Love</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">418</p> <p>1 "Well, what's going on? Why do you think I called 2 you..." -- having him think it through. And he 3 couldn't answer me. 4 And so I said, "Well, gosh, that's a real 5 bummer. Why don't you just stay here with me and 6 kind of think about it, process it, and then we'll 7 have a conversation." 8 And as soon as I said that, he said, "Oh, 9 I know what I did. I know exact-- I did this." 10 So he just said, "Okay," and told me what 11 it was. 12 And so then there wasn't a consequence 13 that was, "Oh, now, you've got to do this." 14 It was, "Okay. So now what do you think 15 we should do about that?" 16 And so putting it back on the child to 17 have to come up with the consequence for the action 18 is -- is pretty powerful, especially because some of 19 these kids will go to an extreme I would never think 20 of. I would -- no, I shouldn't -- I think he told 21 me, "I shouldn't slide for the rest of the month," 22 or something like that. 23 I was, like, "No, no, no, no. Let's think 24 about something else." 25 So I think the Love &amp; Logic provides that</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">417</p> <p>1 &amp; Logic student discipline program? 2 I've heard of it for parenting, but I 3 haven't encountered it within a school setting. And 4 I've -- I love what I've seen in the parenting side. 5 So do you have any great success stories around 6 that? 7 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Yeah, yeah. 8 Actually, Commissioner Voigt, something that I 9 really wanted to implement this year, and the COVID 10 slam kind of slammed it, was I want to offer 11 parenting classes here on our campus. 12 And since taking the -- we've had Love &amp; 13 Logic from the beginning. But I feel like the 14 connection between staff and parents and kids when 15 we're all on the same page and parents understand 16 the terminology that we're using in school and are 17 able to use that at home benefit not only the child, 18 but the adults that are working to help these 19 children have appropriate social skills. 20 One of my favorite stories -- and 21 Ms. Parker might want to add one, too, though. But 22 one of my favorite stories was there was a child on 23 the playground. And he wasn't following the rules, 24 the playground rules. 25 So I called him over. And it's, like,</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">419</p> <p>1 opportunity for children to solve their own 2 problems, to identify their problems, and to have a 3 conversation that is beneficial for them doing 4 better as they get older. 5 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you. That's 6 super. And to be starting this at so young. I've 7 seen parents try to implement it with their 8 13-year-old as they're going through puberty, and 9 it's not as successful. 10 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Exactly. 11 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: It's really great to 12 see the generational growth that you have in your 13 school community and the kids coming back and the -- 14 you know, it's just -- it provides so much -- you 15 know, so much depth within the culture of your 16 school. So that's really great. 17 And it's really, really great to see how 18 there's a -- a channel for your kids to attend 19 Moreno Valley, another small charter school in your 20 community. 21 So that's great. Your kids have a really 22 special opportunity there. So thank you for doing 23 such a phenomenal job. 24 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Robbins? 25 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Thank you. I</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">420</p> <p>1 appreciate the presentation. I appreciate the 2 comments from the staff and from the community. 3 A couple of observations and a couple of 4 questions. 5 I notice the attendance. You kind of 6 struggle getting attendance above 95 percent. I 7 know it's a small school, and if you have, you know, 8 a family with two or three kids, and they all get 9 colds or something like that, it's going to affect 10 it tremendously. But it seems like it's 11 consistently below 90 percent. You're struggling to 12 get it above that. 13 The -- you're also 100 percent Free and 14 Reduced Lunch, I noticed. That might be the 15 semi-rural nature of Red River. There's not a lot 16 of industry up there. I don't think the gold and 17 silver mines are operating anymore. 18 What are the things that you're doing with 19 regard to attendance and engaging the parents to 20 make sure the kids are in school? Right now with 21 pandemic, I know it's difficult. 22 But also -- I mean, you received some 23 exemplary kudos for your increase in your math 24 proficiency. But it's still pretty low. And the 25 science proficiency is relatively low vis-a-vis</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">422</p> <p>1 that's actually in the -- depending on differences 2 in visions of education, it can -- it can -- it can 3 build up, especially for if a family of seven has a 4 hard time getting up or making it. 5 So we do -- I spend a lot of time really 6 working with certain families. And, hopefully, 7 it -- I also am working with other agencies, like 8 Taos Behavioral Health, to provide emotional support 9 through counseling and things. 10 So that -- I feel like you gave the best 11 example, because that's really what -- you have a 12 large family of seven or another large family of 13 five that they all have strep, then it makes a big 14 difference for a few days. 15 So did I answer that question? 16 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: You did. You did. 17 And I guess now Ms. Ritterhouse, you'll address the 18 academic. 19 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Yes, sir. And 20 I will tell you that we implemented, in '18-'19, 21 data gathering and collaboration. We had always 22 before -- when I was a classroom teacher, we talked 23 about data, but we didn't really dig into it. 24 And so the first year that I was the 25 administrator, we started looking at our data, put</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">421</p> <p>1 other areas of the state. And to me, math and 2 science kind of work very closely together. 3 Reading is pretty good. It's improving. 4 But what are you doing to address the attendance, 5 the math and science scores to help your students? 6 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Thank you for 7 those questions. I'll let Ms. Parker address the 8 attendance, and then I'll address math and science. 9 MS. SARAH PARKER: Well, with attendance, 10 I mean, right now, where attendance is all online, 11 would you like me to speak to that? Or would you 12 like me to speak to during the school year that 13 we're -- 14 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Well, previously, 15 what were the underlying issues of not getting above 16 90 percent? I understand with pandemic right now is 17 kind of an issue. But statewide, they say we've 18 lost 12- or 15,000 students. Are you seeing a 19 similar dropoff in being able to contact your 20 students? 21 MS. SARAH PARKER: We do -- we have a 22 few -- you mentioned two families. You mentioned 23 people with, you know, two and three kids, if they 24 both are gone. But we have a few families with 25 seven kids. So it's -- and if you can imagine that</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">423</p> <p>1 it up on a wall, made sure that we were seeing kids 2 that were progressing or those that were dropping 3 back. 4 My theory on math is that we have had -- 5 I've been here at the school for 16 years, 14 as a 6 teacher, first through eighth grade. And the 7 curriculum for math changed constantly. And you 8 could tell that because of those changes, there were 9 gaps that were occurring. 10 So this year, we implemented i-Ready 11 across the grade levels K through 8. And then next 12 year, we hope to implement MidSchoolMath through 13 fifth through eighth so that we have a better 14 understanding of where these kids are. 15 Additionally, with i-Ready, we have -- the 16 diagnostic tests are K through 8. So we'll be able 17 to use the same data, the same tool, and watch the 18 kids as they progress and not have to look at 19 Istation for K through 3 and then Renaissance for 4 20 through 8. So we're trying to get that consistency 21 so we can really see what we have, where the kids 22 are and where we need to put the extra supports. 23 In reading, yes, we've done better in 24 reading, but we want to do even a better. We have 25 adopted CKLA this year, which is the Core Knowledge</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">424</p> <p>1 Language Arts, that puts specifics on skills and 2 knowledge, so that we hope to see those scores 3 increase as well. 4 And I agree with you that science and math 5 go together and are complementary of one another. 6 So the hope is that through this new i-Ready and 7 having that across the board, that the connections 8 with the science and math will become greater and 9 the scores will rise. 10 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Thank you. 11 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: You're welcome. 12 THE CHAIR: Thank you. Commissioner 13 Caballero? 14 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Thank you, 15 Madam Chair. 16 My question is the demographics. And not 17 familiar with that area -- maybe Commissioner Crone 18 can help me out framing the question and the issues. 19 But the question is are you satisfied with the 20 demographics of your student body? And, if not, 21 what do you perceive are the challenges to your 22 school? 23 And, again, I'm not that familiar with the 24 rural setting, so you would have to enlighten me. 25 And maybe Commissioner Crone can do so also.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">426</p> <p>1 1 percent Native American. 2 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: And does that 3 reflect the area that you've targeted or you're 4 drawing from? 5 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Pretty close. 6 I mean, when you look at the demographics of Red 7 River and the Taos County, would we love to have 8 more culture in our school? More demographics? 9 Yeah, because that's what the world is. 10 But I think this is a pretty good 11 reflection of what our community has. Would you 12 agree, Commissioner Crone? 13 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Yes, I would. 14 Commissioner Caballero, I have a long 15 history with Red River. Part of the demographic 16 there is that Red River and Ruidoso are the closest 17 mountain communities to a very hot part of the 18 world, which is Texas. And so people would come in 19 the summer. 20 So one of the very first pictures of me 21 was in December of 1947. And I was born in May of 22 1947. And I've been going to Red River off and on 23 all these years. By the way, in the video, you 24 answered one of my questions, which is I wondered if 25 you were using the Little Red Schoolhouse.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">425</p> <p>1 Thank you. 2 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Absolutely. We 3 have currently 71 of our -- 71 percent of our 4 students come from the Questa-Costilla area, 5 26 percent in Red River, and less than 1 percent 6 from Angel Fire and Eagle Nest. So we are grabbing 7 in students from around our community. 8 But I agree. You know, I would like to 9 have a full school. I'd like to have my class cap 10 at 18, every classroom full. But, no, we have a 11 little bit of advertising to do, and we hope to use 12 our video that we created for the Commissioners 13 today to help to do that, to pull more students in. 14 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: And my question 15 is beyond the count of students coming in is the 16 breakdown of Hispanic, African-American. And, 17 again, I'm not -- 18 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Sure, sure, 19 sure. You muted yourself. 20 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Again, I'm not 21 sure what the breakdown of these demographics are in 22 that particular area that you draw from for your 23 school. 24 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Sure. We have 25 35 percent Hispanic, 61 non-Hispanic, and less than</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">427</p> <p>1 The other part of it is that I'm wondering 2 if you can still dance the "Put Your Little Foot" at 3 the community center. I sure hope so. 4 So, Carlos, back to your question. The -- 5 from Red River north is wilderness. From Red River 6 east is more wilderness and prairie. To the south 7 is wilderness. 8 So the communities of -- well, Angel Fire 9 is a new community. And it, like Red River, the 10 population just explodes in the summer. 11 Eagle Nest traditionally was a ranching 12 area with the lake there. The lake is attractive. 13 The nearest towns on the other side are 14 Cimarron and small communities there. 15 So I think the demographic that the 16 director just mentioned is -- is pretty good for 17 that area. You do have large Hispano communities in 18 Costilla. And I mentioned Amalia. I don't think 19 there's any community very much in Amalia. I forgot 20 to mention San Cristobal. But part of it is 21 economic and geographic. 22 So it seems to me that this school has put 23 out a pretty good effort to try to recruit students. 24 And the -- it is a recreational area, primarily; 25 still some farming and ranching, but primarily</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">428</p> <p>1 recreational.</p> <p>2 And so I would think in that regard,</p> <p>3 they're doing a fairly --</p> <p>4 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: And it comes to</p> <p>5 mind, Commissioner, and school director, is that I</p> <p>6 put my youngest son in the magnet school in El Paso</p> <p>7 County. And they had very good intentions. The</p> <p>8 school originally was supposed to be built in a</p> <p>9 predominantly low-income barrio. But it ended up --</p> <p>10 because of availability of land, so they say, it</p> <p>11 ended up (audio distortion)-5 miles away from that</p> <p>12 community.</p> <p>13 And so the only ones that could take</p> <p>14 advantage of that charter school -- or magnet</p> <p>15 school -- was me, you know, the middle class, very</p> <p>16 well educated with the ability to take the kid and</p> <p>17 drive them to school, pick them up.</p> <p>18 And, sadly, it became the magnet school</p> <p>19 for the very rich from across -- from Juarez.</p> <p>20 And so the intent was very good. They</p> <p>21 named the school after a very famous woman</p> <p>22 commissioner for the county and became a judge</p> <p>23 eventually. And so it came to my mind when somebody</p> <p>24 said, "Well, the parents are willing to drive</p> <p>25 75 miles or 45 minutes, something like that, to the</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">430</p> <p>1 was even more diverse.</p> <p>2 And I had a best friend who, at the end of</p> <p>3 the three years that I was there, I discovered that</p> <p>4 he was Jewish, and he discovered that I was</p> <p>5 Catholic. And at that point, it didn't matter.</p> <p>6 And the only reason I discovered that was</p> <p>7 because he told me goodbye in Yiddish, and I had to</p> <p>8 ask him, "What the hell is that?"</p> <p>9 And so that's why -- I had had the richest</p> <p>10 experience with -- of my fellow students that were</p> <p>11 from all over the world. And I think -- I think it</p> <p>12 helps humanity as a whole by having those</p> <p>13 experiences.</p> <p>14 And you guys provide a fantastic school.</p> <p>15 And I just -- I would like for you to think about it</p> <p>16 and offer that opportunity to others somewhere else.</p> <p>17 I don't know how you might want to do it; but...</p> <p>18 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Thank you.</p> <p>19 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Think about it.</p> <p>20 Make an effort, and you would make the world a</p> <p>21 little better. Thank you.</p> <p>22 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: And I thank</p> <p>23 you, Commissioner. Thank you.</p> <p>24 THE CHAIR: To remind the Commissioner,</p> <p>25 also, they do have 100 percent Free and Reduced</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">429</p> <p>1 school."</p> <p>2 And so there's a challenge to you. If you</p> <p>3 want to recruit people from the areas where it's</p> <p>4 low-income or very few students have an opportunity</p> <p>5 to go to your fantastic school, I may say -- you're</p> <p>6 a fantastic school. So you might want to consider a</p> <p>7 way to get those kids up there.</p> <p>8 I don't know -- you're the one that has to</p> <p>9 come up with imagination. But I'm just throwing it</p> <p>10 out there. If you're close to your demographics,</p> <p>11 that's fine. But if you want to exert yourselves</p> <p>12 and reach out to some -- some -- and they don't have</p> <p>13 to be Hispanic. As long as they're low-income, as</p> <p>14 long as they're low-income and they need a fantastic</p> <p>15 school to go to, I'm all for it.</p> <p>16 And figure out a way to bring them in and</p> <p>17 take them back. Because that way, those kids learn</p> <p>18 from a diversity of the students, and the students</p> <p>19 that are going there from a little bit more</p> <p>20 well-to-do families learn from them.</p> <p>21 And that's my take is that a well diverse</p> <p>22 population learn from each other. And that's a life</p> <p>23 lesson, that I didn't have White students in my</p> <p>24 classroom until I got to college. And that was an</p> <p>25 experience. Then I went to graduate school, and it</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">431</p> <p>1 Lunch. So that really, I think, is even more of a</p> <p>2 testament to the fact that the families that are</p> <p>3 making the sacrifice to drive the students in -- you</p> <p>4 know.</p> <p>5 But there is no doubt that students' lives</p> <p>6 are enriched by the diversity of the population that</p> <p>7 they -- they get to experience. And the earlier the</p> <p>8 better. It really is.</p> <p>9 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: And if I may</p> <p>10 say, too, I'd like all the Commissioners to know</p> <p>11 that we do provide a bus from Questa to Red River;</p> <p>12 that's part of our budget. We make sure that we can</p> <p>13 offer that. I think that makes a really big</p> <p>14 difference, as you said, because the ones that are</p> <p>15 driving in the distance are our Angel Fire and</p> <p>16 Eagle Nest kids, because we can't provide a bus from</p> <p>17 that way in to Questa. We pull more from the</p> <p>18 Questa-Costilla-Amalia area. So we do -- we do</p> <p>19 offer that as well.</p> <p>20 THE CHAIR: Thank you for reminding us of</p> <p>21 that.</p> <p>22 Commissioners, any other -- Commissioner</p> <p>23 Armbruster?</p> <p>24 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Yes. Thank you.</p> <p>25 I just had a couple of questions.</p>

432

1 So under school size, since you have  
 2 70-something -- 74 -- in K-8 -- so classes are  
 3 combined into what number do you have generally in a  
 4 class?  
 5 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: So we don't go  
 6 over 18 students in a class. And I keep my K-1 at  
 7 14, just to make it smaller so that they can have  
 8 the more individualized instruction at that very  
 9 impressionable age.  
 10 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Yes. Thank you.  
 11 And so are you pretty close to -- I haven't really  
 12 been up there. But are you close to where Roots &  
 13 Wings is?  
 14 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: We are about  
 15 17 miles away from Roots & Wings.  
 16 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: That's a  
 17 significant difference. I just know that they were  
 18 drawing from Questa -- or part of Questa. It was  
 19 kind of iffy who was where, for us, anyway. So  
 20 that's why I was asking.  
 21 And maybe, Ms. Parker, since you were  
 22 talking about this; so when you're online now, do  
 23 you meet -- you and the other teachers -- meet with  
 24 all kids, like, four or five days a week? Online,  
 25 I'm talking about.

433

1 MS. SARAH PARKER: Yeah, we do. We -- so  
 2 like Ms. Webb was talking about, she has two live  
 3 sessions with each group. And then I meet with  
 4 her -- for example, with the students that qualify  
 5 for special ed at least once a day for her. I do  
 6 content.  
 7 Right now, I'm focusing on math with the  
 8 students. And then they also meet -- if they have a  
 9 reading goal, then they also meet with the reading  
 10 interventionist once a day.  
 11 So we meet every day. And then once a  
 12 week, they fulfill their minutes through ancillary  
 13 services, if they have OT or speech. So we are  
 14 meeting every day with -- the students with the  
 15 teacher every day, and with their supports every  
 16 day, and then ancillary supports once a week.  
 17 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: They're being  
 18 seen every day. That's what I was just checking on.  
 19 I thought that was kind of what you were saying.  
 20 But I thought before I repeated it, I ought to  
 21 check. Thank you very much, and thank you for all  
 22 you're doing.  
 23 THE CHAIR: Commissioners, anyone else?  
 24 (No response.)  
 25 THE CHAIR: Okay. So I move that the

434

1 Public Education Commission enter into a Closed  
 2 Session pursuant to NMSA Section 10-15-1(H)(1). The  
 3 subject to be discussed pertains to the issuance of  
 4 a charter license renewal for Red River Valley  
 5 Charter School.  
 6 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Second.  
 7 THE CHAIR: Motion by Commissioner Gipson,  
 8 a second by Commissioner Ruiz.  
 9 Roll, please? You're muted, Commissioner  
 10 Armbruster.  
 11 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay. I'm  
 12 sorry.  
 13 Commissioner Caballero?  
 14 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes.  
 15 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  
 16 Raftery?  
 17 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: Yes.  
 18 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  
 19 Armbruster votes "Yes."  
 20 Commissioner Chavez?  
 21 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes.  
 22 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  
 23 Gipson?  
 24 THE CHAIR: Yes.  
 25 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner

435

1 Davis?  
 2 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Davis, if you  
 3 remember, needed to leave at 1:00; so she's not  
 4 here. She won't be here for the remainder of the  
 5 day.  
 6 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Right.  
 7 Commissioner Voigt?  
 8 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes.  
 9 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  
 10 Ruiz?  
 11 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes.  
 12 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  
 13 Crone?  
 14 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Yes.  
 15 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  
 16 Robbins?  
 17 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes.  
 18 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Motion passes,  
 19 nine-to-zero.  
 20 THE CHAIR: Motion passes, nine-zero. So,  
 21 Commissioners, we'll see you in a few minutes.  
 22 Thank you.  
 23 (Executive Session conducted.)  
 24 THE CHAIR: So we are good to go. So I  
 25 move that the Public Education Commission end Closed

<p style="text-align: right;">436</p> <p>1 Session. The matters discussed in the closed 2 meeting were limited to only those specified in the 3 motion for closure, and no vote was taken during the 4 Closed Session. 5 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Second. 6 THE CHAIR: There's a motion by 7 Commissioner Gipson, a second by Commissioner Ruiz. 8 Commissioner Armbruster? 9 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 10 Robbins? 11 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes. 12 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 13 Crone? 14 Where are you? I'm sorry. I can't -- 15 THE CHAIR: He still has to come back in. 16 That's okay. We can vote through this, and he'll 17 come back in. 18 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 19 Ruiz? 20 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes. 21 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 22 Voigt? 23 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes. 24 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 25 Gipson?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">438</p> <p>1 River Valley Charter School, beginning July 1st, 2 2021, and ending June 30th, 2026, for a five-year 3 renewal. 4 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Second. 5 THE CHAIR: There's a motion by 6 Commissioner Crone, a second by Commissioner 7 Caballero. If there is no further discussion, 8 Commissioner Armbruster? 9 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Yes. 10 Commissioner Crone? 11 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Yes. 12 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 13 Robbins? 14 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes. 15 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 16 Voigt? 17 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes. 18 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 19 Ruiz? 20 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes. 21 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 22 Gipson? 23 THE CHAIR: Yes. 24 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 25 Armbruster votes "Yes."</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">437</p> <p>1 THE CHAIR: Yes. 2 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 3 Chavez? 4 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes. 5 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 6 Armbruster votes "Yes." 7 Commissioner Raftery? 8 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: Yes. 9 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 10 Caballero? 11 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes. 12 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: That would be an 13 eight-to-zero vote to pass the motion. 14 THE CHAIR: Correct. The motion passed, 15 eight-zero. Commissioner Crone is still getting 16 back into the meeting, so we'll wait a few seconds. 17 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: He's there. 18 THE CHAIR: Here he is now. So 19 Commissioner Crone is back. There he is. 20 Okay. So, Commissioner Crone, we have 21 already voted to come back out of closed session. 22 So whenever you are ready. 23 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Let me unmute. Okay. 24 I move that the New Mexico Public 25 Education Commission renew the charter of the Red</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">439</p> <p>1 Commissioner Chavez? 2 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes. 3 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 4 Raftery? 5 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: Yes. 6 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: And Commissioner 7 Caballero? 8 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes. 9 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay. The 10 motion passes nine-to-zero. 11 THE CHAIR: Nine-zero. 12 Thank you very much. And congratulations. 13 Thank you once again for everything that you do 14 every day. And, hopefully, we'll actually see you 15 soon in person. So happy holidays to everyone. 16 Continue to stay safe and serving those kids. We 17 truly do appreciate it. So thank you. 18 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Thank you, 19 Chairwoman Gipson and Commissioners. We appreciate 20 you. Have a good day. 21 MS. KAREN WOERNER: School people, I'm 22 going to change you back to an Attendee if you care 23 to stay at the meeting. But you'll suddenly be 24 thrown off. So -- 25 MS. KIMBERLY RITTERHOUSE: Throw me</p>

440	<p>1 gently. Thank you.</p> <p>2 THE CHAIR: Okay. And while Karen is</p> <p>3 doing that and getting the next school in, we can</p> <p>4 take a ten-minute break.</p> <p>5 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Yeah. And maybe give</p> <p>6 me a couple of minutes, too, okay?</p> <p>7 THE CHAIR: Yeah. If you want to do 15,</p> <p>8 that's fine.</p> <p>9 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Please.</p> <p>10 (Recess taken, 2:08 p.m. to 2:28 p.m.)</p> <p>11 THE CHAIR: Okay. So we've got all of us</p> <p>12 back.</p> <p>13 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Madam Chair,</p> <p>14 Ms. Allison -- or Dr. Allison -- I think she's</p> <p>15 Dr. Allison; I'm not sure -- is joined by phone,</p> <p>16 because her sound was not working on her computer.</p> <p>17 So she will not see her -- you see her, but not see</p> <p>18 her, if you know what I mean. And I'm not sure</p> <p>19 about the others.</p> <p>20 I know that Ms. Lewis is -- was -- is</p> <p>21 legal counsel, and she was visible earlier.</p> <p>22 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: There she is.</p> <p>23 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Here they come. Here</p> <p>24 they come.</p> <p>25 THE CHAIR: So I'm just going to ask the</p>	442	<p>1 MS. MELISSA BROWN: Yes. And we could</p> <p>2 have Ms. Yazzie go last.</p> <p>3 THE CHAIR: Okay. I think we're -- we're</p> <p>4 all here, then, correct? And ready? All right.</p> <p>5 So...</p> <p>6 MS. KAREN WOERNER: It would help if I was</p> <p>7 ready.</p> <p>8 THE CHAIR: Are you ready?</p> <p>9 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Just about.</p> <p>10 THE CHAIR: Okay.</p> <p>11 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Sorry.</p> <p>12 THE CHAIR: I'll take up a little bit of</p> <p>13 time.</p> <p>14 So thank you once again. It's good to see</p> <p>15 some familiar faces. It's been a while, so it's</p> <p>16 always nice for that check-in. It's good to see</p> <p>17 everyone and see that everyone is hopefully healthy</p> <p>18 and safe.</p> <p>19 So we appreciate your time and effort with</p> <p>20 this renewal application. We're excited for it.</p> <p>21 Just so that Commissioners are aware, if</p> <p>22 you're not, this is the -- the first renewal. So</p> <p>23 Six Directions is one of our new schools, was</p> <p>24 actually one of the -- I think that year, you were</p> <p>25 the only school that we actually authorized. You</p>
441	<p>1 school, because I know, for example, that Wilhelmina</p> <p>2 Yazzie is on your governing council. I don't know</p> <p>3 whether you've got a bunch of people that have</p> <p>4 signed up for Public Comment. She's more than</p> <p>5 willing to come in to this meeting as a panelist.</p> <p>6 She does serve on your governance council.</p> <p>7 MS. MELISSA BROWN: Five people signed up.</p> <p>8 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Should I add</p> <p>9 Ms. Yazzie to the panel? Yes?</p> <p>10 MR. LANE TOWERY: I see no harm. Sure.</p> <p>11 Yeah.</p> <p>12 MS. KAREN WOERNER: And she could still</p> <p>13 speak during Public Comment, Madam Chair?</p> <p>14 THE CHAIR: Sure. But she's allowed to</p> <p>15 speak whenever, for the most part.</p> <p>16 Certainly, you know. It would make it</p> <p>17 easier, if we -- if we were tight on Public Comment</p> <p>18 time, she would have more opportunity to talk during</p> <p>19 this time and allow for -- you know, allow an</p> <p>20 opportunity for someone else to speak. Because,</p> <p>21 honestly, I haven't been paying attention to how</p> <p>22 many people have signed up. So I don't know if</p> <p>23 we're tight for time with that.</p> <p>24 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Missy has been trying</p> <p>25 to say there's five. I think five, still, Missy?</p>	443	<p>1 had another fellow, who, unfortunately, that</p> <p>2 application didn't go forward, so that this was the</p> <p>3 only new applicant the first year Commissioner</p> <p>4 Armbruster and I were on the Commission.</p> <p>5 So it's always nice to see that full</p> <p>6 circle as well and hear and see what's been going</p> <p>7 on.</p> <p>8 So welcome. And we're going to start with</p> <p>9 the Charter School Division. Then you'll have your</p> <p>10 15 minutes of fame. And then we'll move on to the</p> <p>11 second piece and the Public Comment, and then we'll</p> <p>12 move to questions.</p> <p>13 So, Karen, if you're ready now?</p> <p>14 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Thank you for that</p> <p>15 delay for me, Madam Chair.</p> <p>16 Madam Chair and Commissioners, yes. And</p> <p>17 I'm glad that you mentioned about this being the</p> <p>18 school's first renewal, because we did take that</p> <p>19 into consideration in our recommendation.</p> <p>20 Six Directions Indigenous School is</p> <p>21 located in Gallup, serving grades -- authorized to</p> <p>22 serve grades six through twelve, but is currently</p> <p>23 serving grades six through eleven; at 40-day count</p> <p>24 had 78 students enrolled, and, as you indicated,</p> <p>25 2016 was their first charter with the PEC, and this</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">444</p> <p>1 is their first renewal.</p> <p>2 Of course, I believe the Commission is</p> <p>3 well aware, if not by the name, by your familiarity</p> <p>4 with the school, that one of the uniquenesses is</p> <p>5 that it serves 97 or greater percent Native American</p> <p>6 students and addresses both culture and language</p> <p>7 needs of that community.</p> <p>8 So an argument could have been easily made</p> <p>9 for a recommendation of non-renewal just looking at</p> <p>10 strict data on this school. But we do recognize two</p> <p>11 things: One, it is the first renewal, and they've</p> <p>12 been improving through that first contract term.</p> <p>13 And we do recognize the recent growth under the new</p> <p>14 head administrator and want to support the school's</p> <p>15 continued progress.</p> <p>16 At the same time, to ensure continued</p> <p>17 progress and improvement, we do recommend a renewal</p> <p>18 term with some contract conditions or a Corrective</p> <p>19 Action Plan or whatever the Public Education</p> <p>20 Commission determines is appropriate that would</p> <p>21 include some specific goals.</p> <p>22 We're asking for goals over the first</p> <p>23 three years -- at least the first three years -- to</p> <p>24 ensure improvement along the way. And those were</p> <p>25 primarily -- they're listed on your packet,</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">446</p> <p>1 meeting standards. The school leadership has been</p> <p>2 inconsistent through the first few years of the</p> <p>3 school, has been somewhat unstable with several</p> <p>4 changes.</p> <p>5 The school has demonstrated a commitment</p> <p>6 to address those weaknesses through the hiring of</p> <p>7 the new administrator who's here today, Tamara</p> <p>8 Allison. And they also had some contracted support</p> <p>9 to help support the school in getting their</p> <p>10 procedures and processes identified and in place.</p> <p>11 The new administration has instituted many</p> <p>12 of those, and we do hope to see a gradual increase</p> <p>13 to meeting the standards as a result of that work in</p> <p>14 a very short amount of time. This new head</p> <p>15 administrator started in, I believe, July of this</p> <p>16 past year.</p> <p>17 The school's most recent published</p> <p>18 financial audit report had only one finding, and it</p> <p>19 was a minor finding. Their audit findings have been</p> <p>20 minimal through the contract term.</p> <p>21 The school did spend an average of</p> <p>22 approximately 45 percent of its annual budget on</p> <p>23 instructional costs, which is, as you know, lower</p> <p>24 than the 68 percent, and has spent about 34 to</p> <p>25 35 percent on administrative costs, the rest being</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">445</p> <p>1 Page 1 -- primarily, the continued academic growth</p> <p>2 in reading. Some significant growth is needed in</p> <p>3 math, as we've heard that math is kind of an issue</p> <p>4 across our state, but particularly at this school as</p> <p>5 well. And, of course, raising the academic</p> <p>6 proficiency rates in both reading and math.</p> <p>7 And then we also ask that we include</p> <p>8 something that evidences action steps that have been</p> <p>9 implemented that lead to compliance in the</p> <p>10 organizational performance. And I'll address that a</p> <p>11 little bit later when we get to that section.</p> <p>12 In the last State Accountability Report,</p> <p>13 the school earned 39 points, which, as you know,</p> <p>14 puts them just under the 40 points cutoff for the</p> <p>15 lowest 25 percent in the State.</p> <p>16 The school was identified as a -- in need</p> <p>17 of comprehensive support and improvement. And as I</p> <p>18 mentioned, the proficiency rates are below the local</p> <p>19 and State averages.</p> <p>20 The school was not able to meet all of its</p> <p>21 charter goals throughout the contract term. And</p> <p>22 I'll be showing you that in a bit.</p> <p>23 The school's organizational performance</p> <p>24 ratings were -- we did have lots of issues with this</p> <p>25 school over the term of the contract in terms of</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">447</p> <p>1 in those other areas that we'll look at in the</p> <p>2 chart; maintenance, operation, food service,</p> <p>3 et cetera, other.</p> <p>4 I will mention that the school has -- as</p> <p>5 it is their first contract term, they have been</p> <p>6 increasing the amount spent on instructional overall</p> <p>7 and decreasing the amount on administration. So</p> <p>8 that's a good trend.</p> <p>9 The school does not have the support of a</p> <p>10 foundation; although I do understand that they have</p> <p>11 some support or collaboration with the NACA-Inspired</p> <p>12 Schools Network.</p> <p>13 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you.</p> <p>14 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Oh, I'm sorry. I just</p> <p>15 wanted to go over the -- application.</p> <p>16 THE CHAIR: Sure.</p> <p>17 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Again, this is related</p> <p>18 to the Part B Progress Report. And as indicated</p> <p>19 earlier, these cannot be a Meets Standard unless</p> <p>20 showing Meeting Standard throughout the contract</p> <p>21 term. And we've had, as I said, some issues through</p> <p>22 the term with lots of improvement this last year.</p> <p>23 Here you have the proficiency rates. And</p> <p>24 as you can see, their reading has grown. You can't</p> <p>25 tell from this chart, but it has. And then the math</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">448</p> <p>1 is still is a concern; science, a little bit low; 2 and EL progress.</p> <p>3 And here's the chart where you see a 4 drastic change this last report, because the current 5 administration is the one to respond to the site 6 visit reports from last year and get this cleaned up 7 by quite a lot.</p> <p>8 We think the school needs an additional 9 time to improve, that these things that have been 10 implemented will actually lead to a Meets Standard. 11 And that's yet to be determined till we see the 12 results of their effort from this last year.</p> <p>13 The financial chart on Page 12 -- oh. And 14 I know you all have seen this, Commissioners. But 15 these next few pages are the school's response and 16 explaining some of the things that the head 17 administrator has done or working on or wanted to 18 respond to.</p> <p>19 But on Page 12 -- let me just jump to it 20 so you're not watching me scroll. The first year, 21 there was quite a bit spent on instructional 22 compared to administrative. But you can see that 23 they have been, since then a dip, but going back up 24 on what's spent on instructional costs, and a little 25 bit of a decline on administrative costs, which is</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">450</p> <p>1 86 percent of students remaining enrolled throughout 2 the school year. And then between school years, you 3 can see quite a jump in -- upward trend in retaining 4 those students between school years; so really nice 5 to see that 80 percent have returned this school 6 year.</p> <p>7 The audit reports, as I shared, have not 8 been -- they did have not one material weakness or 9 significant deficiency in the first year of the 10 contract term. But, as you can see, have not had 11 those in the published audits thus far, and only had 12 one other non-compliance finding in the last 13 published audit.</p> <p>14 On Page 33 is the detailed chart, which 15 you can read much better than the little thumbnail, 16 if you wish to review any of that.</p> <p>17 So, in closing, I just reiterate that we 18 do see improvement this last year with the new 19 administration, hope that that will continue to be a 20 strong leadership in this school. And, with that, 21 an opportunity for them to demonstrate continued 22 improvement is what we would request.</p> <p>23 Thank you.</p> <p>24 THE CHAIR: Thank you. And thank the 25 school once again for this.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">449</p> <p>1 what we hoped to see.</p> <p>2 The school -- these negative numbers 3 indicate just comparing your operating expenses 4 versus operational revenue. So you can see that 5 they were -- their expenses exceeded their revenue, 6 which means they have to dip into their cash 7 balance. That's part of -- part of the reason that 8 there's some concern about finances that were noted. 9 But, as I said, there were not audit findings 10 concerns.</p> <p>11 The charter goals on Page 24. Again, as 12 you know, the school's had reading and math goals 13 around their NWEA testing, and they've struggled to 14 meet those. Again, I do think the change in 15 administration and the -- has not been helpful for 16 them. But we really want to see a focus -- even 17 though the goals won't be math and reading in 18 charter goals, we want -- mission goals -- we do 19 want to see some increase in their reading and math 20 growth for all students.</p> <p>21 The enrollment has been increasing 22 slightly over the years. Of course, they've been 23 adding grade levels as well as they go.</p> <p>24 You can see that within the school year, 25 their retention is pretty good in the 80 to</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">451</p> <p>1 I'm not sure who wants to speak first for 2 the school or to lead this. But I will ask that 3 whoever is going to do that, that you first 4 introduce everyone that's here from the school and 5 their role so that we do have that for the record.</p> <p>6 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Okay. Yeah. I'm 7 going to go ahead and speak during this part. My 8 name is Tamara Allison, and I'm the new head 9 administrator of Six Directions Indigenous School. 10 And I'd like to introduce who's on with us.</p> <p>11 Let me see. So I see we have our chair of 12 the governing council, Lane Towery, on with us. We 13 have our attorney, Abby Lewis. We have one of our 14 board members, Wilhelmina Yazzie. Our business 15 manager, Amber Peña, from the Vigil Group. And we 16 also have -- yeah, I'm just not seeing everybody on 17 the chat.</p> <p>18 I know we have Scott Peina on. He is our 19 instructional -- our IT support specialist, and he's 20 also an educational assistant. He's on our core 21 team.</p> <p>22 And then we have other core team members 23 on right now, too. There's Tyla Kanteena. She's 24 been with the school. She's our lead teacher, and 25 she's a science teacher. We also have our math</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">452</p> <p>1 teacher, Wesley Bobelu. And then we have some of 2 our office assistants. 3 We have Marilyn Reeves. She's -- and then 4 also Renee Cleveland. And we also have, from the 5 NACA network, our S.T.A.R.S. person, data 6 compliance, Tom Genne, is on with us. 7 And am I missing anyone? Lane, am I 8 missing anyone? 9 MR. LANE TOWERY: I don't believe so. 10 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Okay. So that's our 11 team, everyone from Six Directions Indigenous 12 School. 13 THE CHAIR: So just so that you know, 14 Missy will be doing the timing and does have a -- 15 a -- a note and also a sound to give you a warning 16 for that. 17 And just so that I don't overlook it, is 18 this school -- this school does not have any kind of 19 video presentation after this? I know that you did 20 a response in the renewal application. But I don't 21 want to jump over if there's something that you want 22 to do. 23 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: I am prepared with 24 two -- with the school comment part, and then also 25 I'm going to do the equity part myself.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">454</p> <p>1 MS. KAREN WOERNER: And when you do, if it 2 asks you about -- at the bottom when you go to 3 share, if it says something about computer sound, 4 please select that option so if there's sound in it, 5 we'll be able to hear it. 6 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Okay. 7 MS. KAREN WOERNER: You should be able to 8 share. 9 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Okay. Let's see. 10 Try this again. 11 So -- okay. You said to choose the one -- 12 there's Whiteboard. I'm not familiar with Zoom. 13 I'm sorry. I haven't had to share with Zoom. We 14 use Google Meets at our school. 15 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Click the Share. When 16 you go to Share, there should be something that says 17 Whiteboard and other things on your computer. You 18 select the one that is your presentation. But at 19 the bottom -- 20 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Do you see it? 21 MS. KAREN WOERNER: We do see it. But do 22 you have sound in it? 23 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: At the end, there 24 will be something that will require sound. I don't 25 know if you'll be able to hear it. I don't know.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">453</p> <p>1 THE CHAIR: Okay. All right. Thanks. 2 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: But I do want to 3 mention that at the end of the school comment part, 4 I would like for Abby Lewis to have the last three 5 or four minutes. So if I can be reminded at 6 10 minutes into so I give her time. 7 MR. LANE TOWERY: I don't mean to 8 interrupt, Ms. Allison. You have a PowerPoint. Was 9 that the question, if there is a visual 10 presentation? 11 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Two PowerPoints: One 12 PowerPoint for the scope comment part, and a 13 PowerPoint for the equity. On the PowerPoint, there 14 is going to be a picture show for the school comment 15 part. And then there's a video message on the 16 second PowerPoint. 17 THE CHAIR: Okay. So you need a shared 18 screen now for this piece of your presentation as 19 well? 20 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Yes, I do. 21 THE CHAIR: Okay. 22 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Dr. Allison, are you 23 going to be sharing your screen? 24 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Yeah. I need to 25 share the screen.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">455</p> <p>1 MS. KAREN WOERNER: I think we may have 2 missed our opportunity. So if you want to try 3 stopping the Share and let's try this again, just to 4 make sure. So before -- you'll click the Share at 5 the bottom. And before you select the -- 6 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Oh, I see it. 7 Optimize Screen Share or Share -- 8 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Does it say "Share 9 computer sound" or something like that? 10 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: I think we got it. 11 Okay. I got it. Sorry about that. 12 THE CHAIR: That's no problem. 13 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Okay. All right. So 14 are we -- when does the -- when does the time start? 15 THE CHAIR: Whenever you start. 16 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Okay. Okay. Hi. 17 Hello, everyone, Public Education Commission. I am 18 Tamara Allison, head administrator, and I'm here to 19 present on our school, Six Directions Indigenous 20 School. 21 And just to really -- just really quick, 22 I'm going to run through this -- is that my 23 background, I am Navajo, and my clans are (Navajo 24 language spoken). And my family is from Ganado, 25 Arizona, and also from Tohatchi, New Mexico.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">456</p> <p>1           Okay. So I want to explain, just 2 highlight, just why the school -- this is a basic 3 information of the history and the need for Six 4 Directions Indigenous School. I'll get into more of 5 this in the equity presentation. 6           But I want to point out that -- that 7 assessment scores -- I think statewide in Gallup -- 8 in the Gallup area have been low for Native American 9 students, and especially when compared to other 10 race -- other ethnicity of students. That's 11 something that we are facing with all -- with 12 educating all our Native students, and it's 13 something that, you know, we're trying to address at 14 Six Directions. 15           Though a Western education is necessary 16 and has been supported by our leaders, like Chief 17 Manuelito of the Navajo, schooling for Native 18 Americans as a result of Western colonization has 19 had a tragic history, which is carried over and felt 20 today by our students as part of intergenerational 21 trauma. 22           Though New Mexico, in particular, the 23 Gallup area, has had a high number of Native 24 American students, students have not been provided 25 culturally relevant education that builds upon their</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">458</p> <p>1           Some examples of curriculum lessons that 2 are culturally relevant and are related to our theme 3 is, like, in our science class, we have comparing of 4 indigenous and Western science, natural traditional 5 sources of energy versus sources of nuclear energy. 6           And in our language classes, learning to 7 introduce themselves in their Native language, using 8 the indigenous kinship terms of their tribe, and 9 also learning the core values of their tribe. 10           We also observe culturally relevant 11 holidays, like the Shalako Floating Day, and Navajo 12 Sovereignty Day. 13           Some other highlights of cultural 14 relevance of our school is, since 2016, except for 15 this year, we have hosted an Indigenous People's Day 16 celebration put on by students and including members 17 of the community. Since then, the City of Gallup 18 has chosen to acknowledge Indigenous People's Day. 19           We have worked to develop critically 20 conscious students, as our mission implies. One 21 example of that was the Piñon Pipeline Project. 22 This is where students spent a month researching the 23 Piñon Pipeline. They mapped out sacred sites, you 24 know, that would be crossed, you know, by the 25 pipeline. And they had class debates from different</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">457</p> <p>1 self-identity and empowers them as Native Americans 2 with a valuable rich heritage and culture. 3           So from the input of local stakeholders 4 like parents, educators, policymakers, non-profit 5 administrators, chapter houses, and other 6 organizations, the school's mission statement came 7 into fruition. 8           In July 2013, a charter application was 9 submitted to the Public Education Commission, and it 10 was -- it was approved in September 2015. 11           The driving mission of Six Directions is a 12 commitment to culturally relevant education, 13 indigenous education, and interdisciplinary project 14 learning to develop critically conscious students 15 who are engaged in their communities, who 16 demonstrate holistic well-being, and have a personal 17 plan for succeeding in post-secondary opportunities. 18           Our life this year of living out our 19 mission and fulfilling our mission and purpose is, 20 this year, our -- we have cross-curricular themes. 21 And for semester one, right now, our theme is 22 self-identity and family and community 23 relationships. And our essential question is, How 24 does the strength and knowledge of my ancestors and 25 indigenous community play a role in my life today?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">459</p> <p>1 perspectives of the issue. 2           Their culminating trip was a trip to 3 Window Rock, hosted by the Bureau of Land 4 Management, where they were able to attend a public 5 hearing. 6           Another project-based culturally relevant 7 practice that I want to point out was a boarding 8 school project. This was done in humanities, where 9 students studied the boarding school history, and 10 where they conducted interviews of their family 11 members to learn about their family's experiences 12 with schooling. And they compiled their work on a 13 Google website they created. 14           In a science class, there was a lesson on 15 traditional structures and energy. And different 16 the students utilized architecture skills while 17 learning standards about energy by building 18 traditional structures and testing their energy 19 efficiency using heating lamps and thermometers. 20           Part of our mission is our outdoor, 21 land-based education. The National Indian Youth 22 Leadership Project and Cottonwood Gulch have both 23 led outdoor educational experiences for our 24 students. 25           And we provide indigenous language</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">460</p> <p>1 classes. Students take a class in either Navajo or 2 Zuni language as a part of a heritage program model. 3 Other successes that we've had here at Six 4 Directions over the years is, like Karen mentioned, 5 we've been able to expand our grade levels. Student 6 enrollment started out with 50 and is currently at 7 76. The school started with sixth grade and has 8 added a grade level each year, and we will have a 9 graduating class next year for the first time. 10 Other successes we've had is we do work 11 with the AmeriCorps program, where we have three 12 student specialists that assist with outreach and 13 communication and also in the classes. We have a 14 National Free Lunch program that we're a part of. 15 And we also are a part of the NACA-Inspired Network. 16 Though we haven't showed huge gains on the 17 PARCC, NWEA data has shown growth in reading and 18 math for students over the years. I wanted to point 19 out that from 2019 to 2020, that the number of 20 students who met projected growth increased for two 21 of three different grades. I didn't include sixth 22 grade, because there were -- that was their first 23 year. 24 So we had increases for our eighth and 25 tenth grade in meeting their projected growth.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">462</p> <p>1 students do. 2 We're going to have teachers check for 3 understanding and provide additional instruction via 4 whole class or mini-lessons or individual 5 small-group learning to address learning gaps. And 6 we're going to have teachers analyze student work, 7 class assessments, to develop Next Step action plans 8 for math. 9 The plans for ELA. ELA scores were 10 better. There was a 10 percent increase, from 15 to 11 25 percent, from the previous year. We -- the steps 12 that we're going to take is providing and 13 modeling -- provid- -- yeah -- modeling and 14 providing work samples to do check for 15 understanding, providing feedback and additional 16 instruction, develop and implement rubrics to guide 17 students to meet criteria, develop and implement 18 standards pacing, curriculum maps and unit plans, 19 and develop unit assessments or common formative 20 assessments, analyze data and develop and implement 21 action plans for NWEA and CFAs. 22 There's a lot of work to be done, you 23 know. And I've done this type of work my whole 24 career. So I feel like I can guide these processes. 25 In another area of improvement that we're</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">461</p> <p>1 And then, in math, from 2019 to '20, we 2 had students increase, or meet, their projected 3 growth for all three of the grades, and show growth. 4 We are responding to challenges, as Karen 5 mentioned in the report that you heard. Part of the 6 challenge is the PARCC scores. This shows the 7 scores for the past three years, 2017, '18, '19. 8 And as you can see, our math scores have been low. 9 Language was at 21 percent, Fail, but came back up. 10 And this is what we plan on doing about 11 it. 12 So our plan for instructional improvement 13 for the area of math, which has been at 9 percent 14 for two consecutive years, is -- is that we are 15 going to -- we're going to develop curriculum maps 16 for all courses for math, identifying standards and 17 activities and assessments related and aligned to 18 standards. 19 We are going to develop and implement unit 20 lesson plans that provide, you know, activities and 21 assessments aligned -- related and aligned to 22 standards. 23 We're going to implement strategies, 24 different strategies for modeling the guided steps 25 of the mathematical process for the problems</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">463</p> <p>1 working on is our performance framework rankings. 2 And we had a lot of red areas and yellows. So we 3 know what we need to work on. 4 It was helpful to me, as administrator, to 5 know, you know, what our needs were. So this is 6 what I'm focusing on. We've had improvements 7 already, and we've gone through the framework and 8 put in action plans for all the areas that are in 9 need of improvement. And action has been taken and 10 will continue to be taken, you know, to get a Meets 11 score. 12 One of the challenges is providing virtual 13 learning; but we are rising to that challenge. We 14 have used all available funds to provide and set up 15 for virtual learning. 16 Some things we've done is we've increased 17 safety at our school site. We bought plexiglass 18 face shields, touchless sanitizer dispensers for 19 our -- for the staff that are here. We purchased 20 laptops and hotspots for all students for semester 21 one, and will continue to renew our hotspots for 22 semester two for students. 23 We purchased instructional supplies and 24 distributed them at the beginning of the year. We 25 are providing Edgenuity courses for our high school</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">464</p> <p>1 students.</p> <p>2 And we recently purchased some tablets for</p> <p>3 our teachers, so that they can model -- like they're</p> <p>4 used to, you know, on a whiteboard. But they have a</p> <p>5 e-whiteboard now. And we've also purchased Kami for</p> <p>6 our staff so they can convert PDFs to fill in</p> <p>7 documents for students, making it easier for virtual</p> <p>8 teaching. And we are looking for funds you to --</p> <p>9 you know, for different programs to expand.</p> <p>10 Another -- you know, we also are</p> <p>11 supporting our students during this pandemic. We --</p> <p>12 and the staff. For our teachers, this is -- this</p> <p>13 was going to be a whole new style of teaching, and</p> <p>14 for them to do virtual teaching. So we provided</p> <p>15 three weeks of professional development and work</p> <p>16 time before school started, where they were able to</p> <p>17 develop their pacing guides, their curriculum maps</p> <p>18 and their unit plans, and then also to get their</p> <p>19 Google classrooms set up.</p> <p>20 We also had teachers attend the NMPED CNM</p> <p>21 virtual teaching session at the beginning of the</p> <p>22 year, too.</p> <p>23 Another -- we also provided -- or</p> <p>24 continued to provide -- strategies for virtual</p> <p>25 teaching. And we've had certain teachers share out,</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">466</p> <p>1 develop a rigorous and mission-aligned curriculum</p> <p>2 for all grade levels and continue to expand</p> <p>3 opportunities for students that are mission-aligned.</p> <p>4 We are going to incorporate dual-credit</p> <p>5 classes, and, you know, set up an MOU. And I'm</p> <p>6 looking at San Juan College for that. And then we</p> <p>7 will assist students in applying to and preparing</p> <p>8 for post-secondary institutions.</p> <p>9 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Tamara, you may want</p> <p>10 to wrap it up so Abby can speak, because you're</p> <p>11 running out of time.</p> <p>12 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: I'm going to play the</p> <p>13 video. This is the slide show.</p> <p>14 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Is that for the second</p> <p>15 part of the presentation? Or no?</p> <p>16 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Yeah. This is it.</p> <p>17 This is it.</p> <p>18 If it's not wrapping up and playing now,</p> <p>19 that's okay. I'll play it -- I'll have Paige adjust</p> <p>20 this button for us, and you'll see it at -- oh, here</p> <p>21 it goes. It's only a minute-and-a-half.</p> <p>22 (Video plays.)</p> <p>23 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: All right. That's</p> <p>24 the end of the first presentation. Thank you. I'd</p> <p>25 like to turn the time over to Abby Lewis.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">465</p> <p>1 you know, how -- how to do recordings, how to set up</p> <p>2 class assignments, how do you do rubrics in Google</p> <p>3 Classroom. And we'll continue to share new</p> <p>4 strategies as we go.</p> <p>5 We also developed a learning schedule and</p> <p>6 made it available. And we provide frequent updates</p> <p>7 to our families on our Facebook website and also the</p> <p>8 Remind app. And outreach is provided to parents</p> <p>9 informing them of student attendance and missing</p> <p>10 assignments and teachers provide extra instructional</p> <p>11 academic help. There is time designated at the end</p> <p>12 of the day for that, and on Fridays. And we are</p> <p>13 working with NMPED on Wi-Fi connection initiatives</p> <p>14 and initiatives for attendance improvement.</p> <p>15 So those are some of the things that we've</p> <p>16 done.</p> <p>17 The future of Six Directions is that we</p> <p>18 want to be meeting our performance criteria every</p> <p>19 year. We also want to graduate a class of 2022 and</p> <p>20 upcoming cohorts. We would like to increase the</p> <p>21 number of students and staff at our schools.</p> <p>22 I'd like to look for adding on</p> <p>23 college-and-career readiness instructional coach, a</p> <p>24 secondary math teacher, a special ed teacher. We</p> <p>25 will -- I will lead the school in continuing to</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">467</p> <p>1 MS. ABBY LEWIS: Thank you. Can everybody</p> <p>2 hear me okay? Okay. Thank you.</p> <p>3 Good afternoon, Chair, and members of the</p> <p>4 PEC. My name is Abby Lewis, and I'm the school</p> <p>5 attorney for Six Directions Indigenous School. I'm</p> <p>6 just going to take a couple of minutes to correct</p> <p>7 and clarify a couple of things that are in your</p> <p>8 packet from CSD before you. It's only a couple of</p> <p>9 pages. I promise. It'll just be a couple of</p> <p>10 minutes.</p> <p>11 First, I want to say how incredibly proud</p> <p>12 I am to work with this school. I work with a</p> <p>13 handful of charter schools, and I'm incredibly</p> <p>14 particular about the ones I work with. And this</p> <p>15 school just blows me away every month when I see</p> <p>16 them and every week when I talk to them.</p> <p>17 Okay. So this was also sent to you prior</p> <p>18 to the hearing. I just wanted to point out that on</p> <p>19 Page 10 of your packet, CSD states that the school's</p> <p>20 academic performance showed an overall decline</p> <p>21 between SY '17 and SY '18.</p> <p>22 Correction. Not only did academic</p> <p>23 performance not decline, it actually improved one</p> <p>24 letter grade and 20 points between those two years.</p> <p>25 Also, as Dr. Allison had pointed out, our</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">468</p> <p>1 NWEA data is showing enormous growth for our kids, 2 and we are so proud of that. We have to meet and 3 serve our kids where they are. And we're a high 4 school, and some of our kids come to us academically 5 behind. 6 So, of course, 100 percent proficiency all 7 the time in everything is always the goal. But we 8 have to celebrate and encourage our students who 9 have made so much progress since they've come to 10 Six Directions. So it's important that when we 11 speak about these accomplishments of theirs that we 12 be accurate about them. 13 The other one I wanted to mention is 14 financial. And that is on Page 2 of your packet, 15 where CSD states that the previous two years, as 16 well as in the current year, the school's budgeted 17 operational expenses exceeded budgeted operational 18 revenues. 19 And so I just wanted to clarify this, 20 because this statement is a bit misleading, as it 21 makes it appear that the school is not operating in 22 compliance with its budget, or, worse, it makes it 23 appear that the school is unlawfully in debt. But 24 neither are the case here. 25 Like many other schools in districts in</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">470</p> <p>1 And so I just want to close by saying that 2 there wasn't very much time given from CSD to review 3 the very lengthy report and to respond to it; about 4 seven days, and three of those were the Thanksgiving 5 holiday. So if there is anything you see in your 6 packet that gives you pause, I would respectfully 7 ask that you ask the school those questions, just to 8 make sure that the information is accurate and 9 reflective of the school. 10 And as you can see, you've got the whole 11 team here. Our head administrator, business 12 manager, governing council members, and myself are 13 all here and ready to answer any questions you might 14 have. 15 So thank you. That's all. 16 THE CHAIR: Thank you. So now let me ask, 17 because I think I'm slightly confused, does the 18 school have another presentation for the next 19 15 minutes' time? Or no? 20 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Yes. We have -- I do 21 have another presentation for -- 22 THE CHAIR: All right. Okay. 23 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Okay. So when do I 24 start that, Karen? 25 MS. KAREN WOERNER: You can start it now</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">469</p> <p>1 the last few years, Six Directions has been forced 2 to cover shortfalls in areas of its budget that are 3 completely out -- that happened for reasons 4 completely outside of its control. Like right now, 5 we're in a global pandemic. 6 Also there were many months during the 7 time period that CSD reviewed for this where PED was 8 not processing requests and reimbursements in the 9 time required. So what resulted in all schools -- 10 not just Six Directions but resulted in all schools, 11 was that we had to cover those shortfalls in our 12 federal programs until we could get disbursements 13 from the PED that they were running a couple of 14 months late with, I think. 15 So I just bring this to your attention 16 because these changes in the budget are made in the 17 normal course of business. They happen at an open 18 meeting, where the business manager presents the 19 budget adjustment requests, and the board votes on 20 it. And so they're in no way an indication of poor 21 financial performance. 22 It's just -- you know, when we -- like our 23 students, when we speak about a school's finances, 24 we just want to make sure we're as clear and 25 accurate as possible.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">471</p> <p>1 if you have it ready. 2 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Okay. I'll share 3 again. 4 (A discussion was held off the record.) 5 MS. PAIGE BELINTE: Dr. Allison, this is 6 Paige. I can go through the presentation for you, 7 if you'd like. 8 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Okay. For the 9 equity? 10 MS. PAIGE BELINTE: Yes. 11 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Okay. 12 MS. PAIGE BELINTE: One moment. Let me 13 see if I can present it for us. 14 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Paige, be sure that 15 when you share -- you may know this. But there's an 16 option for -- 17 MS. PAIGE BELINTE: The sound. 18 MS. KAREN WOERNER: -- using the computer 19 sound. 20 MS. PAIGE BELINTE: Okay. I'll go ahead 21 and click that. There you go. 22 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Okay. So, Paige, are 23 you just going to move the slides for me then? 24 MS. PAIGE BELINTE: Yes. 25 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Okay. We're ready to</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">472</p> <p>1 begin.</p> <p>2       Commissioners and -- we -- this is our</p> <p>3 equity part of our presentation. And there are some</p> <p>4 guiding words for us, as -- who work in Indian</p> <p>5 education and indigenous education. And we look to</p> <p>6 our chiefs, our leaders. And so I just want to</p> <p>7 point out that Chief Manuelito, after The Long Walk,</p> <p>8 did support education. And his comment was, "My</p> <p>9 children, education is the ladder. Tell our people</p> <p>10 to take it."</p> <p>11       And we also are inspired by Chief Joseph</p> <p>12 of the Nez Percé, where he says that to "Give us the</p> <p>13 freedom to choose our own teachers."</p> <p>14       So as you know, Indian education has --</p> <p>15 is -- has been -- you know, has caused some</p> <p>16 intergenerational trauma from its beginning, and as</p> <p>17 education was used as a means of assimilating Indian</p> <p>18 people. Treaties were made with Native Americans,</p> <p>19 and that obligated the U.S. government to educate</p> <p>20 Native American students.</p> <p>21       However, the schooling provided in the</p> <p>22 early schools, especially, the mission and boarding</p> <p>23 schools, and even carrying over to later public</p> <p>24 schools, has not been designed to affirm or respect</p> <p>25 students' cultural identities. In fact, mission and</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">474</p> <p>1 continued to be viewed as a contentious and</p> <p>2 intimidating place for Native youth.</p> <p>3       So though schools have changed for the</p> <p>4 positive in certain ways, institutional inertia</p> <p>5 persists. These are just some reports that point</p> <p>6 out that, you know, Indian education is still</p> <p>7 behind.</p> <p>8       This one here from the Kennedy Report in</p> <p>9 1969, only one-tenth of BIA teachers mentioned</p> <p>10 academic achievement as an important goal.</p> <p>11       And also the Indian Nations At Risk Report</p> <p>12 in 1991, one of the largest problems found was low</p> <p>13 expectations.</p> <p>14       The next slide.</p> <p>15       This is from the National Indian Education</p> <p>16 Study, 2011. Only 33 percent of American Indian</p> <p>17 eighth-graders had reading teachers who reported</p> <p>18 integrating American culture and history into</p> <p>19 reading and language arts instruction at least once</p> <p>20 a month. And then almost two-thirds of American</p> <p>21 Indian eighth-graders report never talking to a</p> <p>22 school counselor about classes for high school or</p> <p>23 future plans.</p> <p>24       Okay. Next slide.</p> <p>25       Some of our local area challenges for our</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">473</p> <p>1 boarding schools, backed by government policy,</p> <p>2 sought to fix "the Indian problem" by assimilating</p> <p>3 Native youth to mainstream society or to, "Kill the</p> <p>4 Indian and save the man," as Richard Pratt put it.</p> <p>5       We need to remember the trauma that was</p> <p>6 caused by these early schooling. And this is even</p> <p>7 shared by some of our students whose own parents and</p> <p>8 grandparents. So we have to keep that in mind as we</p> <p>9 work with our students.</p> <p>10       Part of what our ancestors, and even my</p> <p>11 own grandparents and parents went through, was just</p> <p>12 some negative -- the negative impacts of schooling,</p> <p>13 like not being allowed to speak their tribal</p> <p>14 language at school, you know, the cutting their hair</p> <p>15 and styling it in Euro-American fashion, separating</p> <p>16 them from their families for long lengths of time,</p> <p>17 and separating them from their tribal structure.</p> <p>18       Students experienced stress and trauma,</p> <p>19 which hindered their learning. Maslow's Hierarchy</p> <p>20 of Needs and later studies on the learning process</p> <p>21 attest to the importance for social-emotional</p> <p>22 well-being in order for the brain to engage in</p> <p>23 academic learning.</p> <p>24       The historical trauma of this time has</p> <p>25 lingered through the generations, with school often</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">475</p> <p>1 Native people in and around Gallup is there has been</p> <p>2 a history of cultural exploitation. In the 1940s</p> <p>3 and '50s, there were many Western films made in this</p> <p>4 area that stereotyped Native American culture.</p> <p>5       We also have -- Gallup is known for its</p> <p>6 Indian trading business that, as you know, they</p> <p>7 report the most per capita millionaires here. And a</p> <p>8 lot of that money has been made off Native culture.</p> <p>9 But in these cases, it's the galleries, not the</p> <p>10 Native American artists, that are profiting from</p> <p>11 their own art.</p> <p>12       As a town bordering the Navajo Nation and</p> <p>13 Zuni Pueblo, the City of Gallup has a high number of</p> <p>14 Native American population within the City, which</p> <p>15 makes up 44 percent of the population.</p> <p>16       Navajo Nation, Zuni Pueblo and Gallup face</p> <p>17 socioeconomic challenges of having high rates of</p> <p>18 unemployment and poverty, homelessness, addiction</p> <p>19 and high cases of COVID 19.</p> <p>20       Gallup is a consumer hub due to the</p> <p>21 businesses and infrastructure of the Navajo Nation</p> <p>22 and Zuni Pueblo, with Gallup, a town of 22,000,</p> <p>23 doubling and tripling in size with out-of-town</p> <p>24 shoppers.</p> <p>25       Navajo Nation has only 13 grocery stores</p>

476

1 for its 173,000 member residents.  
 2 There are also area challenges for our  
 3 Native students at the public schools as well.  
 4 The local public school district,  
 5 Gallup-McKinley County Schools, is the largest  
 6 school district in New Mexico and includes schools  
 7 in Gallup, on areas of Navajo Nation, and near Zuni  
 8 Pueblo. 79 percent of its 11,631 students are  
 9 Native American, 14 Hispanic, 4 Caucasian and  
 10 1 percent other.  
 11 Though 77 percent were Native or are  
 12 Native, 50 percent of the students are part of the  
 13 gifted and talented program. 93 percent have been  
 14 expelled from the schools are Native. And Native  
 15 students had lower test scores than other ethnic  
 16 groups. This is from a 2017 Civil Rights data  
 17 collection report.  
 18 Area challenges for students. Another  
 19 case that happened here in Gallup with the school  
 20 district was in 2012. The Gallup-McKinley County  
 21 School Board approved a new map for school board  
 22 districts which would have changed the school board  
 23 from having two Gallup White members and three  
 24 Navajo members to three Gallup and two Navajo  
 25 members. So redistricting to decrease the number of

477

1 Navajo board members.  
 2 And only after the Navajo Nation Human  
 3 Rights Commission sued under the Voting Rights Act  
 4 did the district change the course. And out of this  
 5 experience, the founders, like Lane Towery, began  
 6 talking about imagining a new school.  
 7 So responding to these challenges of the  
 8 public schools that our Native students were facing,  
 9 the founding team conducted 90 one-on-one meetings  
 10 and a series of community talking circles and  
 11 feedback sessions, where they heard stories of  
 12 crossing borders from reservation communities into  
 13 Gallup for school, feeling unsafe and unsupported,  
 14 of suspensions and expulsions, feeling that students  
 15 carried a presumption of being bad or violent, of  
 16 parents feeling ignored and unheard by the district,  
 17 of frustration at Gallup-McKinley County Schools  
 18 ignoring calls for better access to Navajo language  
 19 instruction.  
 20 The founders wanted to rethink the  
 21 education model serving area youth by centering on  
 22 personal identity and language, addressing health  
 23 and trauma issues directly, and rebuilding trust  
 24 with communities served by public schools.  
 25 With the core commitments of leading --

478

1 with the core commitments of interdisciplinary  
 2 project-based learning, wellness and positive youth  
 3 development, culturally responsive methodologies  
 4 leading to the mission of Six Directions and a  
 5 dedication to culturally relevant education.  
 6 These are what -- some statements that are  
 7 from our students. I went and sent out a survey to  
 8 our students and parents about what they learned in  
 9 Six Directions, and this is what I found out. So  
 10 I'm going to read maybe about three of them here.  
 11 One student said, "There was one time we  
 12 went to Mount Taylor for a school trip. We learned  
 13 what it meant to the Navajo. Though we learned a  
 14 lot about other cultures and other places, that was  
 15 the one that popped into my mind, as it was a trip  
 16 that made me realize how special it was to the  
 17 Navajo culture and what Six Directions was trying to  
 18 teach us."  
 19 And then we had another student say, "We  
 20 went to a field trip where we went to Albuquerque  
 21 and we met other indigenous charter schools and we  
 22 learned about their culture."  
 23 And then we had a student say, "In my  
 24 Navajo class, my teacher, Mr. Hale, is teaching us  
 25 with small but effective booklets that have Navajo

479

1 words. Each day Mr. Hale has us, with students,  
 2 introduce ourselves in Navajo. This is what I have  
 3 learned, along with a lot more, with Mr. Hale. He's  
 4 an awesome teacher."  
 5 Our parents and guardians, I sent a survey  
 6 out to them of why they choose Six Directions. This  
 7 is what some of them had to say.  
 8 Parents said, "This is the first year that  
 9 my child is attending this school. But I was  
 10 looking for a school that would only provide -- that  
 11 would not only provide my child with education that  
 12 was required and needed so that they are prepared to  
 13 attend college or work; but I also wanted my child  
 14 to have a better understanding about traditional  
 15 culture and some of the values that provide us the  
 16 strength and skills needed to be a successful  
 17 adult."  
 18 Another parent wrote, "This is the first  
 19 school in the area, Gallup, New Mexico, to have a  
 20 charter to educate the students of Native Americans  
 21 and to learn the diversity in all aspects of higher  
 22 learning and learning life skills as they grow  
 23 independently."  
 24 Okay. The last comment I want to share  
 25 is, "I have been happy with the work that Six

480	<p>1 Directions has gone through to remain true to their 2 mission statement. Before COVID 19 virus, my child 3 attended experiential class trips, such as camping 4 with others. To some, this may seem to be a waste 5 of time. To me, it's important, as my child has 6 established long lasting, positive peer 7 relationships from these trips. This has built my 8 child's self-confidence. I've also witnessed my 9 child's ability to try out something new, to 10 experience learning with deep attachments to 11 indigenous culture."</p> <p>12 I want to read a quote from our indigenous 13 language teacher, because I think it perfectly 14 epitomizes equity of our Native students.</p> <p>15 Our Diné culture teacher here at Six 16 Directions, Mr. Benny Hale, wrote, "It is a place 17 where indigenous language and culture are taught. 18 It is a place for students where they get 19 opportunity to learn when they have trouble 20 attending the public and other schools. Teachers 21 can give individual attention to students so they 22 can succeed in learning. My teaching philosophy is 23 that all students can learn. My role as a Navajo 24 language and culture teacher is to teach students to 25 have the skills to help their communities.</p>	482	<p>1 MS. MELISSA BROWN: Yes, five with 2 Ms. Yazzie.</p> <p>3 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Okay. So five with 4 Ms. Yazzie.</p> <p>5 Can you put up -- shoot me the names in 6 the Zoom chat? Give me the names, because we can't 7 hear you. Or just say it. Maybe I'll understand 8 it. The first name.</p> <p>9 MS. MELISSA BROWN: Sheryl Livingston. 10 MS. ABBY LEWIS: "Sheryl Livingston" is 11 what she's saying.</p> <p>12 THE CHAIR: Wow. You're good. 13 MS. ABBY LEWIS: I just know who's on our 14 list.</p> <p>15 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Thank you, Abby. 16 I'm going to move you to the panel. 17 Sheryl Livingston. Sheryl, you're on the panel now. 18 And could you please unmute yourself and make your 19 comments?</p> <p>20 We see you, but you appear to be muted. 21 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Caballero, you 22 are unmuted.</p> <p>23 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: I'm sorry. 24 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Sheryl, can you hear 25 us? You appear to be unmuted. But I don't hear</p>
481	<p>1 "Teaching them the Navajo language and 2 culture is intended to have the students to identify 3 themselves as Navajo and to be proud of it. It is 4 part of teaching the students to be holistically 5 well. The teaching of (Navajo language spoken) is 6 the individual that can determine what they become 7 as a person is what the student must work towards to 8 in their school learning experiences."</p> <p>9 So we'd also like to share another message 10 from our Zuni culture teacher with his message. 11 (Video played.)</p> <p>12 MR. ALBRIGHT: Okay. That ends the equity 13 presentation. Thank you.</p> <p>14 THE CHAIR: Thank you. So, Missy, how 15 many do we have signed up again?</p> <p>16 MS. MELISSA BROWN: (Indiscernible due to 17 audio distortion.)</p> <p>18 THE CHAIR: Okay. Missy, you're really 19 garbled. We're not --</p> <p>20 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Yeah, we can't hear 21 you at all. It's like a robot.</p> <p>22 MS. MELISSA BROWN: Does that sound any 23 better?</p> <p>24 MS. KAREN WOERNER: No. 25 So were there five with Ms. Yazzie?</p>	483	<p>1 her, do you?</p> <p>2 THE REPORTER: (Indicates.)</p> <p>3 MS. KAREN WOERNER: No. Sheryl, I'm going 4 to let you see if we can figure out the audio, and 5 let me get someone else in the meanwhile.</p> <p>6 Missy, do you want to try to say another 7 name, and maybe Abby could help me understand it.</p> <p>8 MS. MELISSA BROWN: Look at the Zoom Chat. 9 MS. KAREN WOERNER: I have it now. 10 Aaron Billie. Aaron, I'm going to go 11 ahead and add you to the panel while Sheryl tries to 12 see what's going on with her audio.</p> <p>13 So, Aaron -- I don't see him yet. Oh, 14 there you are. Okay. Aaron, you're unmuted, I 15 think. Can you hear us?</p> <p>16 PUBLIC COMMENTER: Yes. Can you all hear 17 me?</p> <p>18 THE CHAIR: Yes. Absolutely. 19 PUBLIC COMMENTER: (Navajo language 20 spoken.)</p> <p>21 I'd just like to greet each and every one 22 of you, Chair, leaders of the PEC, PED, SDICS staff, 23 parents, and everyone who's listening in as well. 24 My name is Aaron Billie. I'm currently serving in 25 the role of Director of School Support from the</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">484</p> <p>1 NACA-Inspired Schools Network.  2 And I'm also filling in for (inaudible)  3 Duta as well, who is our currently Acting Executive  4 Director for NISN.  5 And I'm here to support Six Directions and  6 their journey as far as their renewal phase of their  7 charter. I've been able to work with the school for  8 the past year and two months since I've joined the  9 team with NISN.  10 Prior to joining NISN, I was a teacher for  11 a BIA school; I was an assistant principal and a  12 principal. So I come with good thoughts. And being  13 able to work with Dr. Allison has been extremely  14 awesome. But even before Dr. Allison joined  15 Six Directions, I was able to collaborate with the  16 teachers as well of Six Directions.  17 I know that times are challenging, or  18 just, like, how everyone has been sharing, and, not  19 only with the pandemic, but even prior to the  20 pandemic, not recognizing the challenges our  21 indigenous youth face.  22 So being pre-COVID, I was able to visit  23 the school consistently, being amongst the students  24 and just being amongst the camaraderie. And that  25 was so amazing to see. I look forward every time</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">486</p> <p>1 So just recently, Lane offered me the  2 opportunity to be a school board member as well.  3 And I have taken that offer in October. But I'd  4 like to speak as a parent, if that's okay, and  5 choose that role right now.  6 THE CHAIR: You can. Can I stop you for  7 just a second? There is big feedback, so your other  8 device must still be on.  9 MS. KAREN WOERNER: You need to mute the  10 speakers. Yeah. I think you got it.  11 PUBLIC COMMENTER: Is that better?  12 THE CHAIR: Yes.  13 PUBLIC COMMENTER: Okay. I've been trying  14 to get on in all these areas; so -- okay. So I  15 think what is important to me as a parent is a lot  16 of what Dr. Allison said just a few minutes ago. I  17 also -- I am a product -- or I graduated from high  18 school from Gallup-McKinley County Schools. And I  19 can say that my parents didn't have the best  20 interactions with Gallup-McKinley County Schools.  21 It is a border town. And, unfortunately,  22 I hate to put this label out there. But it is --  23 there's a lot of racism still. And in our political  24 climate now, we see that a lot. And it impacts our  25 children.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">485</p> <p>1 I'm able to visit Six Directions seeing their art,  2 seeing their projects, being excited for the way  3 that they greeted one another, the way that they  4 greeted me.  5 And I know they miss that community; they  6 miss their school. And so all of the engagement  7 that I have seen was amazing, and I hope for that to  8 continue. (Navajo language spoken.)  9 THE CHAIR: Thank you.  10 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Madam Chair, I believe  11 that Sheryl Livingston has joined by phone. Was it  12 "Livingston"? I'm going to allow this phone number  13 to talk and see if that's Sheryl.  14 Sheryl, is that you on the phone? Could  15 you unmute?  16 PUBLIC COMMENTER: Hello.  17 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Yes, we can hear you.  18 PUBLIC COMMENTER: Okay. Hello,  19 Commissioner, Commissioners, and Public Education  20 Department Charter Review Team. My name is Sheryl  21 Livingston. I am a parent of a student who attends  22 Six Directions.  23 Are you -- am I still connected?  24 MS. KAREN WOERNER: You are.  25 PUBLIC COMMENTER: Okay. Okay.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">487</p> <p>1 And, unfortunately, again, American  2 Indians, Native Americans, are always put to the  3 last.  4 I'm happy that African-Americans have a  5 big voice out there; but, unfortunately, we don't.  6 And sometimes that scares me as a parent that we  7 don't have a voice out there to speak for us and our  8 children.  9 And so education is extremely important to  10 me. And with that being said, I -- you know, being  11 a product of Gallup-McKinley County Schools, I found  12 it to be a hostile environment when I went to school  13 there, with bullying and all kinds of other issues  14 when we were there. I know that my parents, when  15 they tried to advocate for me in that area, being  16 parents --  17 MS. ABBY LEWIS: Missy, she can't see  18 that, because she's not on the TV -- or on the  19 thing. Sheryl, Missy is telling you that  20 unfortunately your time is up.  21 PUBLIC COMMENTER: Oh, okay.  22 MS. KAREN WOERNER: It's my fault. I  23 thought she was also seeing on the computer, so when  24 I took her off, she'd notice. So --  25 The next one is Clarence Hogue? Is that</p>

488

1 pronounced correctly? I'll move you to the panel.  
 2 PUBLIC COMMENTER: Yes. Good afternoon,  
 3 everybody, PEC members, Madam Chair, and all the PEC  
 4 members.  
 5 I just wanted to just quickly just express  
 6 my support to the Six Directions Indigenous School  
 7 for their charter renewal. I am a community member  
 8 myself and on another sister school's GC board as  
 9 well. So I understand all the work and effort that  
 10 it takes to run a school, especially one that is  
 11 based -- founded on culture and language.  
 12 So I just wanted to express my support  
 13 publicly at this time. Thank you.  
 14 THE CHAIR: Thank you.  
 15 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Next is Adam Piestewa.  
 16 I'm not sure how to say your name; I'm so sorry.  
 17 But I'm going to promote you to Panelist and move  
 18 Clarence back to Attendee.  
 19 Adam, if you could unmute yourself? There  
 20 you go.  
 21 PUBLIC COMMENTER: Yes my name is Adam  
 22 Piestewa. I'm actually a parent -- actually,  
 23 George -- when they first opened up the Six  
 24 Directions Indigenous School; he's been there since  
 25 the beginning.

489

1 It's a great school. I sincerely want to  
 2 express my, you know, opinion that this school is  
 3 really amazing. It's done some really amazing  
 4 things for a lot of the kids that go there.  
 5 The parent involvement is always at an  
 6 all-time high, either with surveys or calls or texts  
 7 or e-mails. They never skip a beat, either from the  
 8 students or from the faculty, from the  
 9 administration, even the office workers. It's so  
 10 easy to stay in communication with all of them.  
 11 The teachers have been outstanding,  
 12 especially throughout the pandemic, with the new  
 13 learning systems. They've done very well with  
 14 communicating with the students, the outdoor  
 15 activities. The learning, when they were doing  
 16 in-school learning, was amazing. It's helped  
 17 both -- I actually had two children go there. It's  
 18 helped their confidence in both, you know, just  
 19 academic levels, personal levels. It's done an  
 20 outstanding job.  
 21 The cultural diversity in the area has  
 22 always been a high priority for our family and their  
 23 teachings. Both for Navajo/Zuni as well as  
 24 incorporating other indigenous cultures throughout  
 25 the area has always been high on the school's

490

1 priority list, again, which is just another huge  
 2 bonus for us.  
 3 But, yes, I'd really like to, you know,  
 4 not only thank, but advocate for the school.  
 5 They've done a very good job and continue to do a  
 6 great job, again, from the faculty, the office  
 7 workers, and the administration.  
 8 THE CHAIR: Thank you.  
 9 MS. KAREN WOERNER: And next is  
 10 Ms. Wilhelmina Yazzie. And I think you're already  
 11 on the panel somewhere, Ms. Yazzie?  
 12 THE CHAIR: Yes, she is.  
 13 PUBLIC COMMENTER: (Navajo language  
 14 spoken.)  
 15 Good afternoon. My name is Wilhelmina  
 16 Yazzie. I am a mother and advocate, a governing  
 17 board member of Six Directions Indigenous School,  
 18 and I'm also one of the plaintiffs from the  
 19 education lawsuit, Yazzie/Martinez v. New Mexico.  
 20 First, I would like to thank you, the  
 21 New Mexico Public Education Commission, Madam Chair,  
 22 and members, for giving me the opportunity to speak  
 23 today in favor of Six Directions Indigenous School.  
 24 I respectfully ask that Six Directions  
 25 Indigenous School be renewed because their mission

491

1 is one of our fight in the education lawsuit for  
 2 public schools in New Mexico. It is imperative that  
 3 our children receive culturally relevant indigenous  
 4 education. Being culturally connected to our  
 5 language and culture helps us find purpose and  
 6 guidance, gives us confidence and, among other  
 7 things, to excel in all that we do.  
 8 It also teaches our children our way of  
 9 life and the meaning of our existence, gives us  
 10 pride in who we are and where we come from. Most of  
 11 all, our children are sacred, and it is our  
 12 responsibility to guide and protect them and prepare  
 13 them for (Navajo language spoken), that what we call  
 14 "life" in our language, because they're the future  
 15 of our nation.  
 16 Six Directions Indigenous School is a  
 17 school that is necessary for our town and the  
 18 surrounding communities. For too long our children  
 19 have struggled in the public schools that surround  
 20 us. And Six Directions Indigenous School provides  
 21 an equitable education opportunity for indigenous  
 22 children that is not provided in other schools.  
 23 Six Directions Indigenous School focuses  
 24 on a holistic approach to education and also the  
 25 well-being of our children. They provide full

<p style="text-align: right;">492</p> <p>1 support to our children, academic preparation with 2 hands-on projects, all while incorporating our 3 culturally relevant curriculum. 4 I support Six Directions Indigenous School 5 because I believe that our children deserve an equal 6 opportunity to good quality education, one that 7 recognizes them and respects them to be 8 college-career ready, because they're all just as 9 capable as other children in our state, and they 10 should be given a chance, an opportunity to succeed. 11 I appreciate your time. And the decisions 12 that we make today will affect the future of our 13 children. (Navajo language spoken.) 14 Thank you and blessings to all. 15 THE CHAIR: Thank you. It -- does that 16 include the Public Comment list? 17 MS. KAREN WOERNER: I do not have any 18 other names. 19 THE CHAIR: Okay. All right. Thank you. 20 I thank everyone who took the time. And not taking 21 any other time -- I didn't want to take time from 22 the school's time. But I want to acknowledge that I 23 received a letter just the other day. And it's from 24 Tony Archuleta, which -- who was the previous 25 interim director. And I will scan it and send it in</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">494</p> <p>1 And going back to your community input 2 hearing, the community input hearing, which was one 3 of the first that we had attended, is always what I 4 reflect back on and use as the hallmark for other 5 schools. 6 And I wish I had a video or snapshots of 7 it, because I remember pulling into the -- into the 8 college parking lot and walking into that very large 9 room. I don't remember what exactly the purpose 10 was. But it was a very large room. And it was 11 standing room only. And that's what -- that's the 12 purpose of charter schools, to be the face of the 13 community. 14 And it does -- it continues to sadden me 15 when there's always that reflection back that the 16 local school district does not meet the needs of a 17 significant number of their population. 18 And it not only astounds me, but it 19 appalls me, and that it continues. And that's so 20 discouraging to so many of us that are career 21 educators, because that's not what we're supposed to 22 be about. We are supposed to be here supporting 23 what is best for the community. And it is 24 absolutely -- oh. And there's Lane's new little 25 girl.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">493</p> <p>1 for the record. 2 But I just want to say that he wanted to 3 make sure that his comments were heard and how much 4 he supports this school and encourages our renewal. 5 And it appears that he is a -- is a career 6 interim director. So -- and he has served in a -- 7 he's served at Walatowa and a number of indigenous 8 schools, as well as traditional schools and other 9 charter schools. So he just wanted to make sure 10 that he was heard and that his support is there. 11 So I want to recognize that. And this 12 will go into the record as part of your renewal 13 information. 14 So I want to thank him. And he wanted to 15 make sure that it actually came in paper. So that 16 was important to him, which is so unusual in this 17 day and age. And that's why it was a little 18 delayed, because I said, why "Don't you just send me 19 an e-mail?" 20 "No, I want to send a letter." 21 So it's, like, "Okay." 22 So I did receive the letter. 23 So thank everyone for your -- for the 24 presentation. This is a village here. And we 25 appreciate this.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">495</p> <p>1 So it is -- it is beyond unfortunate when 2 children can't see themselves and see role models 3 for themselves. We do more than a disservice for 4 the students. We deserve to be able to see how we 5 can thrive and that -- the promises within 6 ourselves. And we need to be able to see ourselves 7 in every aspect of a school. And that truly is what 8 this school does. 9 It is also a great example of the -- the 10 difficulties in starting any charter school. I 11 mean, it is a struggle. And those of you that have 12 been on this journey certainly are more than aware 13 of it. 14 And as we move out of urban areas, to be 15 able to start that school, the challenges are just 16 multiplied -- we can't recognize those challenges. 17 And I hope that these are lessons that we also 18 learn; as other schools hopefully open up, what we 19 can do to try to alleviate some of that struggle. 20 And I know staffing was always one of 21 those issues, to find the director that was going to 22 be able to lead the school consistently. And I am 23 so happy that you have apparently found that person, 24 because we know that's -- that's really where it 25 truly all begins.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">496</p> <p>1 But can you speak a little bit -- because 2 your overall staff retention seems to be a little 3 challenging. So does someone want to speak just a 4 little bit to that? 5 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: I'll speak to it. 6 And I'm new here, so some of these things are for me 7 learning the history of the school. 8 But just I know that there has been 9 administrative turnover within the past five years 10 at this school. So I think I'm like the third 11 principal within five years. So it's -- it's been 12 challenging here. 13 And it goes with the teachers, too. 14 There's been a lot of turnover, even with teachers, 15 leaving midyear and then filling in. So just not a 16 consistent instruction time for -- for all subject 17 areas. And the turnover has mainly been in the core 18 subjects. 19 THE CHAIR: So I guess that's what I'm 20 kind of getting at is is there -- can you put a 21 finger on why you've had that -- that movement and 22 haven't been able to keep consistent staffing, not 23 just on the administrative level, but for those core 24 teachers; because, absolutely, the lack of 25 consistency with those core teachers is also</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">498</p> <p>1 we have -- we operate with less funds. And our pay 2 rates are lower than Gallup-McKinley County Schools. 3 And, hopefully, we can do something about that. 4 Our Level 1 pay is pretty comparable for a 5 Level 1 teacher. But once it gets to Level 2 and 3, 6 we are -- we are lower than Gallup-McKinley. And 7 Gallup-McKinley can provide -- if the -- free 8 housing or low-cost housing if a teacher decides to 9 work in a rural area. 10 So those are some tough things to compete 11 with. And then the hires that happen here, the ones 12 that I know of that recently left, you know, one 13 person had to take care of his mother, and, you 14 know, left New Mexico. And then the other person 15 needed to tend to family as well and left teaching. 16 So since I've been here in July, you know, 17 two staff members left. But, you know, it was due 18 to family -- you know, family situations, though, in 19 their case. 20 THE CHAIR: And, of course, when you're 21 talking about a small staff to start with, one or 22 two people leaving for whatever reason has a big 23 impact on the -- on the retention rate. So that -- 24 you know, that also has to be taken into 25 consideration.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">497</p> <p>1 reflected in the data that's presented. 2 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Well, I think -- you 3 know, community -- I mean, nationwide, as you know, 4 we already have a teacher shortage. And every 5 school district I've worked with, Gallup-McKinley 6 County, Central Consolidated Schools, and now Six 7 Directions, it has always been a challenge in every 8 school I've been a principal at to recruit teachers, 9 especially to work on the Navajo Reservation. 10 So -- and I think for Gallup, what I've 11 learned -- I always thought Gallup would have it 12 easier, because I worked on the reservation. So 13 this is -- I'm actually working in town. I made my 14 way back into a town again to be a principal. 15 But I've noticed it's a lot of housing 16 shortage here in Gallup that's very difficult for, 17 like, hospital employees with the two major 18 hospitals here and for our school district to find 19 any housing for our employees. 20 So I think that's one of the hindrances 21 really here. It was definitely something that I had 22 a problem when I got the job, too, was just finding 23 housing. So I think it's a real problem in 24 recruiting teachers for Gallup. 25 And I think as a charter school, you know,</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">499</p> <p>1 I appreciate the fact that you put in what 2 your day -- what the students' days look like now as 3 we're navigating through this pandemic. 4 But can you talk a little bit about loss 5 of contact with students and how many, you know, you 6 might have and, what you're doing to try to, you 7 know, connect back with those students? 8 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Oh, yes. We -- we 9 were doing our own outreach. But we recently now, 10 are partnered with Engage New Mexico, and they're 11 going to start helping us come January. But prior, 12 we were doing our own outreach. 13 So -- and we developed a big spreadsheet 14 that our staff had to fill out about, you know, 15 information regarding students, so that we all could 16 see it, a shared document. And then we had our 17 AmeriCorps helping with that, and our office staff 18 making phone calls, letting parents know that their 19 students weren't logged on. 20 So we're having to do that every week. 21 And we developed these individual tracking sheets 22 for all the students, too, that has a running record 23 of phone calls, you know, that are made by our staff 24 regarding their attendance. 25 And so we -- you know, that happens --</p>

500

1 that happens every week, making that outreach. And  
 2 then, hopefully, with Engage New Mexico helping,  
 3 we'll get -- there are a few students that, yes, we  
 4 haven't been able to, you know, be in contact with.  
 5 I think we've heard from them maybe once or twice.  
 6 And those are definitely more extreme situations,  
 7 and they're in the minority.

8 And -- but we are hopefully -- you know,  
 9 we didn't want to drop them, even though they have  
 10 not successfully completed semester one. But we  
 11 want to have Engage New Mexico continue to reach out  
 12 to them and help us. And we'll -- you know, we'll  
 13 have to kind of go from there on what we're going to  
 14 do.

15 We did issue laptops and hotspots to these  
 16 students. They did pick them up and take them, and  
 17 they signed the contracts that they were going to  
 18 use them for educational purposes. And, you know,  
 19 there's a small handful that, you know, are not.  
 20 You know, they're -- and we're trying to find out --  
 21 you know, we're trying to find out where they are.

22 but I have -- one of our office staff  
 23 members, Renee Cleveland, is on here. She's been  
 24 overseeing all of this. And it's really consumed --  
 25 you know, she runs a lot of different programs.

501

1 But, you know, this attendance one has been a big  
 2 bulk of her work.

3 And I don't know if you want to say  
 4 something, Renee.

5 MS. RENEE CLEVELAND: Ah, yes. My name is  
 6 Renee Cleveland, and I oversee attendance, as well  
 7 as a few of the other programs.

8 One of the other issues about our students  
 9 not attending school, or having a hard time  
 10 attending school, is Internet access because of the  
 11 areas that they live in. And so sometimes those  
 12 hotspots do not work at all.

13 So we have other ways of connecting -- we  
 14 do have free Internet service here at the school.  
 15 They can come to the school here. They were  
 16 provided with other hotspots, like within their  
 17 chapter areas. So they have that as well to --  
 18 their go-to place for Internet.

19 But one of the more profound reasons, too,  
 20 is in some case, some of the families of our  
 21 students, you know, they've all tested positive for  
 22 COVID. And so if the entire family is -- we have  
 23 multiple families living in one household with  
 24 grandparents and children and grandchildren. And so  
 25 we had -- you know. And along with that goes, you

502

1 know, some of them have lost their family members.  
 2 And so they're trying to recoup and, you know, heal.  
 3 And it's an ongoing process, you know.

4 Every -- at least every -- every week, you know, we  
 5 have somebody telling us that, you know, they  
 6 tested. "We're in quarantine," you know. So it's  
 7 really heartbreaking.

8 So -- but, you know, all we can do is  
 9 encourage them and check on them and pray for them.  
 10 And, hopefully, you know, they overcome this, you  
 11 know, without losing family members. It's  
 12 devastating to, you know, hear it.

13 And then -- and we do document it  
 14 privately here and let the teachers know that this  
 15 is happening. They may not be in school if they're  
 16 not feeling well. And so that's, you know, where  
 17 we're at with our students.

18 And I talk to the parents and, you know,  
 19 encourage them, you know, to, "Make sure you send  
 20 them to school," and -- "Cause we're here, and  
 21 we're going to be here for them."

22 THE CHAIR: All right. Thank you.

23 Commissioner Ruiz has a question.

24 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Thank you. You  
 25 answered -- asked, and it was answered, one of the

503

1 questions. But I did have something I needed  
 2 clarification for, please.

3 The attorney for the school brought up  
 4 some things that were different from what we saw in  
 5 the report. And I wanted to know if Deputy Director  
 6 Woerner could just explain some of that for me,  
 7 please.

8 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Madam Chair,  
 9 Commissioner Ruiz, I'm not sure I noted everything  
 10 that Ms. Lewis said. I do know she addressed  
 11 Page 10 -- I made some notes here -- Page 10 of your  
 12 packet about the declining performance.

13 And I'm not sure -- I appreciate her  
 14 wanting to make sure everything was accurate. And  
 15 there is a decline in the performance from one year  
 16 to the next. Though Ms. Lewis is correct that the  
 17 overall school score did go up from those two years,  
 18 the proficiency rates did dip.

19 So if I could just -- let me see if I  
 20 could pull that up and show you where it is. I had  
 21 that open a minute ago. Here.

22 So when we spoke about the decline from  
 23 one year to the next, you can see that the  
 24 proficiency rates dropped. And then I mentioned in  
 25 the report on Page 10 that the math stayed the same,

<p style="text-align: right;">504</p> <p>1 but the reading increased.</p> <p>2 What Ms. Lewis is talking about is the</p> <p>3 school grade. And it did indeed show an</p> <p>4 improvement. That takes into account not only</p> <p>5 proficiency and growth, but also the student survey</p> <p>6 and some other components that make the overall</p> <p>7 school grade. We were both right, in that the</p> <p>8 school grade went up. But what I was referring to</p> <p>9 on Page 10 was the proficiency rates declined from</p> <p>10 those two years.</p> <p>11 In addition, she mentioned -- correct me</p> <p>12 if I'm wrong, Abby. I think it was about the</p> <p>13 financial chart on Page 12.</p> <p>14 MS. ABBY LEWIS: It wasn't a chart. It</p> <p>15 was a statement you made on Page 2 that the school</p> <p>16 exceeded its -- that budget and operational expenses</p> <p>17 exceeded the budget and operational revenue. On</p> <p>18 Page 2 of your recommendation is where I was quoting</p> <p>19 from.</p> <p>20 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Yes. Thank you.</p> <p>21 That's in reference to this chart, where we compared</p> <p>22 operational expenses versus operational revenue for</p> <p>23 each year. That is not the total budget of the</p> <p>24 school. But it does make up about 90 percent, as</p> <p>25 you know.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">506</p> <p>1 get delivered until November 13th.</p> <p>2 However, the school's response was</p> <p>3 received late on the 27th. So I understand</p> <p>4 Thanksgiving was in there. But we were following</p> <p>5 the time frame in the renewal kit.</p> <p>6 Was there anything else, Abby, that I</p> <p>7 missed?</p> <p>8 THE CHAIR: I'm sorry. I'm going to take</p> <p>9 part ownership in that, because I -- and I readily</p> <p>10 admit. We didn't look at the calendar and think</p> <p>11 that through when we made this calendar.</p> <p>12 So -- and that's on us. So -- and that's</p> <p>13 all I can say. It was unfortunate that we really</p> <p>14 did -- we didn't look and say, "Oh, you know,</p> <p>15 Thanksgiving is going to drop in the middle of</p> <p>16 that."</p> <p>17 But I appreciate that. And it reminds us</p> <p>18 of what -- you know, some of those mistakes we make</p> <p>19 that we have to try to fix as well.</p> <p>20 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Thank you,</p> <p>21 Madam Chair. We'll make a note for that next</p> <p>22 renewal kit.</p> <p>23 MS. ABBY LEWIS: My point on that was just</p> <p>24 to encourage you all that if you had any questions</p> <p>25 of the packet, that you go ahead and ask the school,</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">505</p> <p>1 And what we were referring to is that, as</p> <p>2 you see here -- we did this with all schools -- the</p> <p>3 surplus of the operational budget has been being</p> <p>4 tapped into. So they're not ending a negative in</p> <p>5 any way. There is no debt involved; Ms. Lewis is</p> <p>6 correct. And I don't want you to feel that that's</p> <p>7 the case.</p> <p>8 Our concern and our warning to the</p> <p>9 staff -- was -- I think on Page 10, also -- that</p> <p>10 during the most recent two years, the school appears</p> <p>11 to be chipping away at the reserves, and the school</p> <p>12 leadership will need to keep a close eye on spending</p> <p>13 and be prepared to make decisions to cut expenses</p> <p>14 while prioritizing spending in the classroom in</p> <p>15 order to avoid decreasing your cash reserves or</p> <p>16 balance that you're ending with.</p> <p>17 It was not -- and Ms. Lewis is correct, it</p> <p>18 was not anything about going into debt. But as you</p> <p>19 can see, the school has had to tap into its</p> <p>20 reserves, if you look at the operational budget.</p> <p>21 And also there was one other comment</p> <p>22 Ms. Lewis made about the timing of the report. And</p> <p>23 I just want to remind you all that we were following</p> <p>24 the renewal application dates. I was one day late.</p> <p>25 It did not get -- the preliminary analysis did not</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">507</p> <p>1 because there just wasn't time to fine-tooth-comb</p> <p>2 the whole thing and make sure we caught everything</p> <p>3 we might need to correct. That was the intent of my</p> <p>4 comment, just to encourage questioning.</p> <p>5 THE CHAIR: Right. And I don't think any</p> <p>6 of us are shy with questioning. So -- but I</p> <p>7 appreciate that. But I also appreciate that</p> <p>8 reminder that we have to look at those dates when</p> <p>9 we're creating our own calendar so that we don't put</p> <p>10 something like, you know, a time period when schools</p> <p>11 are not going to be in session and make it more</p> <p>12 difficult to be able to respond.</p> <p>13 So I do appreciate that.</p> <p>14 Commissioner Voigt?</p> <p>15 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you,</p> <p>16 Madam Chair. I want to thank the school for</p> <p>17 their -- your courage, your strength, and your</p> <p>18 success in showing growth over these past three</p> <p>19 years. It's noticeable.</p> <p>20 And, also, it was very proactive of the</p> <p>21 school to put together a plan for instructional</p> <p>22 improvement. And it looks like a really good plan.</p> <p>23 When you start wrapping your -- your phonetic units</p> <p>24 around core content, and you're using already</p> <p>25 real-world issues, your kids are out in the</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">508</p> <p>1 community doing these projects that are relevant to 2 their world and to their environment, I think that's 3 going to really motivate and increase their learning 4 and their engagement, of course. 5 I think the -- the piece also about 6 identity is huge. And congratulations for spending 7 so much time on that. It's so important for 8 adolescents to have that sense of self and that 9 connection to others. And then also with this 10 real-world learning, they're also bringing in that 11 connection to their world. 12 And it also helps shape their perception 13 of belonging and brings in security and comfort to 14 their lives. So I think those components of your 15 school speak really strongly. 16 The piece, also, though, with your 17 academic challenges, I think you're going to be 18 spot-on if you really continue to map that out over 19 the next five years, or however long, the curriculum 20 mapping, the unit plans. That's going to lay it all 21 out, all the objectives at the end being met, and 22 then continuing with those -- with those projects. 23 Do your students do presentations, 24 cumulative presentations of learning or anything 25 like that at the end of semesters or at the end of</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">510</p> <p>1 their screen, and showing their work, and presenting 2 to their class on their art pieces. 3 So I've seen it there. And I know 4 Ms. Kanteena, also, our science teacher, she's on 5 right now. She does -- she has used presentations 6 as well. And I don't know -- Tyla, do you want to 7 say anything on this? 8 MS. TYLA KANTEENA: Yeah. I just want to 9 say that I think our students are very comfortable 10 with each other, that they are excited about group 11 projects. They're excited to share the information 12 that they find with others. 13 And I do find that students actually ask, 14 "Oh, will we be presenting to our class?" 15 And it doesn't have to be, you know, a 16 culminating project or anything. Just on the daily, 17 there is definitely students that we have that love 18 speaking out, sharing information that they have, 19 and making connections with the information that 20 other students have. 21 So it really is just, you know, a 22 community where our students are very comfortable 23 with each other. And they do like sharing the 24 information that they have with others, because, you 25 know, they just all have very diverse interests.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">509</p> <p>1 the school year? 2 MR. LANE TOWERY: Dr. Allison, you're 3 muted, I believe. 4 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Okay. I can start 5 the response to this. And I'm going to call on 6 someone else to answer this. But as far as, like, 7 presenting, yes. We have student-led conferences 8 that they do every quarter. And students -- they 9 reflect and they present about how they did on 10 assessments for that quarter. 11 You know, they report on their grades and 12 why their grades are the way they are. But they -- 13 they do all that, you know. That's -- they present 14 that, and we set up two days for that. And parents 15 sign up. And we did it virtually this year. 16 There's also individual classroom 17 presentations, too. I was in a walk-through with 18 our art teacher. She's on right now, Paige Belinte. 19 And I saw students presenting their work. 20 She has different art projects that are 21 culturally relevant. And she has them -- they 22 present, share out. They're very comfortable 23 being -- in her class, they're very comfortable. 24 And then, you know, are on video answering her 25 questions, in the Chat box answering, and sharing</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">511</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: That's great. Thank 2 you. 3 When students can find their voice to be 4 able to speak out on issues that are important to 5 them, it just lifts up their empowerment and their 6 self-esteem. I'm sure you've seen it, from year one 7 to the present time, when the first student 8 presented to now. And if they're already asking if 9 they're going to be presenting, then they're excited 10 about it. So that's really great that they're doing 11 that. 12 So great work. It's great to see growth 13 in a new school. And I'm curious, and I want to 14 hear back, about how Engage New Mexico is doing in 15 finding these kids. Because it's going to be 16 interesting. 17 They have their work cut out for them. 18 But it would be interesting to know how they do for 19 you in locating some of our lost students and 20 getting them back into attendance. 21 So thank you. 22 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Robbins? 23 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes. Thank you. 24 And I appreciate the presentation and the comments 25 that have come forward.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">512</p> <p>1 This is actually a question for Ms. Yazzie 2 and Ms. Allison. I applaud Ms. Yazzie for her 3 fortitude in challenging the State of ensuring an 4 appropriate education for all the students, 5 especially our at-risk students. 6 One of the things that I know in the 7 presentation that Ms. Allison had was the antagonism 8 that the Gallup School District had -- the 9 Gallup-McKinley School District has -- towards some 10 of the Native American students. 11 And you're starting in sixth grade. Do 12 you see a cultural shift among your students leaving 13 other schools, coming into your school in sixth 14 grade? Or if they start in other grades, is it 15 difficult making that switch? I mean, pleasant, 16 maybe, that they're seeing something. But is it 17 difficult getting their minds wrapped around, "Hey, 18 my culture is being addressed here where it wasn't 19 before"? 20 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Yeah. I'm sure -- 21 this is my first year at Six Directions. And I 22 just -- you know, I get to see the kids virtually in 23 the classrooms. And Google Classroom is what we're 24 using. 25 And -- but I would think that it would be</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">514</p> <p>1 welcomed by the students who have been at the school 2 more long-term. And they have put down that tough 3 exterior or that really protective shield. And it's 4 those students that decide to stay and integrate 5 with our culture that really benefit from it, 6 because they're finally able to let their guard down 7 and interact with kids their age and be able to 8 enjoy the social interaction that the students who 9 have been at the school here a long time have really 10 set up and established for Six Directions. 11 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Thank you. 12 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: If you don't mind, I 13 just want to end with something on this question 14 here, that, you know, I think, for our students, 15 they're in the regular mainstream, you know, public 16 schools, you know, where even though they're a 17 majority here in Gallup, they are a majority even at 18 Gallup High and Miyamura. But I think they just 19 feel like this town doesn't belong to them still. 20 So in my sense, you know, just some of the 21 activities, the histories, you know, is not really 22 geared to their people, and just some of the 23 comments they might hear of their classmates when 24 topics come up about the Indian Wars, and, you know, 25 some of the stereotypes that get uttered by their</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">513</p> <p>1 very empowering for them. I mean, just when I go 2 into even the Google Classroom for our middle school 3 and seeing them, you know, learning about, you know, 4 ancient cultures and seeing them in the social 5 studies classes and seeing them do research on 6 different tribes and -- so they're getting these 7 opportunities that they normally wouldn't have 8 gotten in the public school. 9 So I'm sure it's very empowering for them 10 and very different for the curriculum to be so, you 11 know, geared to their culture. But I'll let -- 12 let's see. Maybe I'll have Tyla speak on this 13 again. 14 MS. TYLA KANTEENA: Hi. Thank you for 15 that question. I would like to share some student 16 experiences that I've seen over the years. 17 There are some students that have joined 18 during sixth grade that come with a very tough 19 exterior. And I've noticed that with their attitude 20 that they have around other students. They want to 21 make themselves seem bigger so that they aren't 22 bullied so that they aren't pushed around. 23 And there are some students that have -- 24 most students that come and have participated in our 25 activities and our field trips, they have been</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">515</p> <p>1 classmates about, "Drunken Indians," and, "You're a 2 conquered people," and, "You just need to deal with 3 what you have." 4 And so I think our students don't have to 5 hear that, you know. And I guess -- so for them, 6 they get to hear -- they get to hear and be 7 empowered, you know, by a perspective of what 8 happened, you know. Hear the truth. Talk about 9 truth telling. So they get to hear the truth of 10 what happened in this country. And we are allowed 11 to teach it and not be afraid of -- you know, of 12 administrative consequences as well. 13 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Okay. Thank you. 14 On the connectivity issue, I know Six 15 Directions is one of the charter schools in the 16 state that indicated to PSFA a need for connectivity 17 in working with their IT consultant. 18 Have you had contact? Is that an ongoing 19 thing? You know, the next thing would be, 20 obviously, trying to get some funding towards 21 connectivity. And how many of your students did you 22 have an idea? Connectivity to the Internet is one 23 thing. But I know in Indian land, there's an 24 electric connectivity issue also. A lot of the 25 homes don't have electricity.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">516</p> <p>1 So how many of your students perhaps live 2 in homes that don't even have electricity, which is 3 going to be a second -- or a primary issue to 4 Internet connectivity? 5 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Yeah. Well, I 6 conducted a survey back in August. And from that, I 7 did find out that 40 percent of our students do have 8 Internet in the home. We went ahead and provided 9 hotspots to all of them anyway. But 60 percent of 10 them don't have Internet in the home. 11 So that's why we have went with the 12 Cellular One Jetpack hotspots. And we issued those 13 out to them and a laptop. However, like was 14 reported, they still have to drive somewhere 15 sometimes to -- you know, to get connectivity. 16 So we've posted, like, Gallup-McKinley 17 County Wi-Fi buses. We've tried to let them know 18 where they can go. What I would like to buy are 19 these Mophies. They help with really rural areas. 20 And it helps -- it gets them connected. 21 Like Navajo Prep bought quite a bit of 22 them, and they have a bigger budget than we do. And 23 I do know the individual who put that up for them, 24 Native Innovations. 25 So that is something that we want to look</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">518</p> <p>1 don't know whether you applied and whether the time 2 has run out to apply for that. 3 But the CSP Grant, they had -- they were 4 able to get that amended to also make funds 5 available for this specific purpose. 6 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Okay. I'm -- 7 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Madam Chair, if the 8 school did not respond, it was a quick turnaround. 9 It was a couple of weeks in November where it was 10 due. I'm not sure if it's too late. I'll have to 11 check with Dr. (inaudible) 12 MR. SCOTT PEINA: Hi. Thank you for that 13 question. And to answer your question, yes, we did 14 hear back from PSFA -- PSFA. And it is an ongoing 15 process. They're still looking into finding 16 alternative Internet services for our students. 17 In the meantime, we are filling out their 18 surveys. I've reached out to about ten students, or 19 ten families, you know, that completed the survey. 20 Altogether, there are about 12 to 15 students that 21 still don't have Wi-Fi or Internet services at home. 22 And, you know, in the meantime we've given 23 them the option of using the free public Wi-Fi that 24 has been installed by IT- (not discernible due to 25 audio distortion) Project. So they could just drive</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">517</p> <p>1 to in the future. And we are using all our -- we've 2 used our CARES money for this purpose. We had to 3 dip into some of our operational money for semester 4 one, mainly because how it was billed, because we 5 had never done it before. Like our business manager 6 told us, if we want to use CARES money this time 7 around, we're going to have to get billed monthly 8 rather than just getting that one quote for the 9 whole semester. 10 And so this time around, we're not going 11 to -- really not going to use our operational money; 12 we're going to use our CARES money. And then we 13 also have the Geer -- the Geer fund. There's, like, 14 an extra \$2,000 amount. 15 And this next time around is going to be 16 cheaper, because the company -- we're just 17 continuing service. 18 So we do have the funds this next time 19 around to support our Wi-Fi hotspots. But, you 20 know, we -- and, then, also, too, I'm going to let 21 Scott Peina, our IT specialist, talk more about what 22 we're doing and how we're working with PED on some 23 of these Wi-Fi initiatives. 24 THE CHAIR: And before Scott jumps in, 25 there was CSP money also that was available. And I</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">519</p> <p>1 into the school's parking lot and use the Wi-Fi 2 there, or the instructors can print out homework 3 packets for them. 4 So, you know, just to kind of close that 5 gap, those are the alternatives. In the meantime, 6 we've been looking for those other Internet sources 7 for them. 8 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Are you aware -- is 9 anyone aware of any of your students that live in 10 homes that don't have electricity? 11 MR. SCOTT PEINA: Of all the students that 12 I've interviewed so far, all the -- all the 13 households do have electricity. 14 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Okay. Thank you 15 very much. 16 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: I'm still waiting 17 for recognition, Madam Chair. 18 THE CHAIR: Sure. Absolutely. 19 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes. Thank you. 20 Question for the school: Do you do an 21 assessment of where the student is upon coming into 22 the school, where they're at in their true grade 23 level? If you bring in most of your students at the 24 sixth grade, are they truly ready for the sixth 25 grade, or they're just passing through the sixth</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">520</p> <p>1 grade?</p> <p>2 And the reason I'm asking is the -- it</p> <p>3 seemed like, originally, your gains in progress for</p> <p>4 these students was not great. And I'm kind of</p> <p>5 thinking that it was because they were not actually</p> <p>6 close to being ready for sixth grade.</p> <p>7 I had a program, a federal program, and I</p> <p>8 took chicanitos and chicanitas from the barrios in</p> <p>9 El Paso. And what I did was I had assessed where</p> <p>10 they were at at coming into the program so I can</p> <p>11 prove to the federal government that they were</p> <p>12 making progress. And my goal was to get them ready</p> <p>13 for college.</p> <p>14 And so for about 60 percent of my</p> <p>15 students, they were way below ready for high school,</p> <p>16 way below. And so I had to set up goals to get them</p> <p>17 ready for -- for -- let's say they go into the</p> <p>18 eighth. They've got to be ready for the ninth, and</p> <p>19 they've got to be ready to graduate with the skills</p> <p>20 to go to college.</p> <p>21 So some kids had to make two grade-level</p> <p>22 gains within a year. So I had to institute --</p> <p>23 stretch my money and set up summer programs or</p> <p>24 summer tutoring programs so that they can move up</p> <p>25 those grade levels.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">522</p> <p>1 the effort by the school in all aspects; hard copy,</p> <p>2 Internet, radio, television, as more creative as you</p> <p>3 can get in this area.</p> <p>4 And you've got to document what students</p> <p>5 have completely dropped out, because once we start</p> <p>6 getting back to normal, they come back to the</p> <p>7 school, they're not going to be at the grade level.</p> <p>8 I've brought up this problem with our fellow</p> <p>9 Commissioners, that we're going to be behind three</p> <p>10 years by the time we go to normalcy.</p> <p>11 My grandson, in his school, there were</p> <p>12 only three kids that ended up attending school every</p> <p>13 day out of 18 kids. And they all got computers.</p> <p>14 But only three of them presented themselves every</p> <p>15 day to the teacher. And they were the -- they</p> <p>16 passed. And I don't know what happened to the rest</p> <p>17 of the kids.</p> <p>18 But -- and the problem with some of these</p> <p>19 kids in where he's at is that a large percentage are</p> <p>20 immigrant, a large percentage are poor Black, poor</p> <p>21 Hispanic, and the parents have to work. And they</p> <p>22 leave kids with grandma, older aunt. And they just</p> <p>23 don't know. They can't deal with the technology.</p> <p>24 And it gets almost impossible to get those kids to</p> <p>25 comply. And so, consequently, we're going to end up</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">521</p> <p>1 And the majority of the kids did gain that</p> <p>2 progress. Not all. And it had to do with parents,</p> <p>3 has to do with who they hang out with, has to do</p> <p>4 with their own initiative. But you hope that you</p> <p>5 get the majority of them to move up.</p> <p>6 And so I suspect that maybe we know that</p> <p>7 McKinley is not providing the adequate education to</p> <p>8 their kids. So you need to find out how you get</p> <p>9 them, because that's going to be your proof of your</p> <p>10 gains as you move them up to grade level. That's</p> <p>11 one.</p> <p>12 The other one is right now through</p> <p>13 COVID -- I think Mr. Scott Peina brought up</p> <p>14 providing hard copy or just regular homework or</p> <p>15 progress by teachers.</p> <p>16 A friend of mine in a school district here</p> <p>17 in New Mexico, he could only get three students on</p> <p>18 the Internet out of 18. And he tried and tried and</p> <p>19 fried. Finally, he ended up doing paper copy and</p> <p>20 dropping off the homework at their -- at their home,</p> <p>21 picking up homework, giving them tutoring.</p> <p>22 And since the teachers got evaluated on</p> <p>23 how they did in the Internet, he -- his contract got</p> <p>24 canceled.</p> <p>25 And so there's got to be a way to document</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">523</p> <p>1 with tons of kids behind in grade levels.</p> <p>2 And -- and so something -- you have to</p> <p>3 come up with something for the summer; maybe older</p> <p>4 kids tutoring younger kids. I know it's a matter of</p> <p>5 money and faculty and all that. But there's got to</p> <p>6 be a continuation, other than through normal</p> <p>7 school -- school time. So that our kids are going</p> <p>8 to get behind. But let's -- let's try and keep them</p> <p>9 ahead of the game as much as possible.</p> <p>10 I read in the interview with some of your</p> <p>11 students that -- and they voiced that they weren't</p> <p>12 getting challenged in the public schools. They were</p> <p>13 not. And they voiced they want to go to college.</p> <p>14 And so there's a responsibility by all of us to give</p> <p>15 them that, to give them that opportunity.</p> <p>16 That's all I have, Madam Chair. Thank</p> <p>17 you.</p> <p>18 THE CHAIR: Thank you.</p> <p>19 Commissioner Armbruster?</p> <p>20 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Thank you for</p> <p>21 being here today. And -- my addled brain. So if</p> <p>22 you've already answered these, I do apologize.</p> <p>23 One thing I wanted to know -- so your ELL</p> <p>24 students, what language are they speaking?</p> <p>25 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Well, our students</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">524</p> <p>1 are -- they do -- I mean, some of them have had --  2 you know, there is indigenous language in the home.  3 But they themselves are not fluent speakers. That's  4 why we have the Heritage Language model is to bring  5 up that heritage language, because they are not  6 fluent speakers of Zuni. They are not fluent  7 speakers of Navajo.  8 That was probably my parents' generation.  9 And my parents grew up in the '60s. So my parents  10 are fluent speakers, and their first language was  11 Navajo. I'm a first-generation fluent speaker of  12 English.  13 So -- and our students have -- and for me,  14 they're kind of like me. Yeah, there was some  15 Navajo in the home. But I'm not a fluent speaker of  16 Navajo. So our students fall in that same category.  17 So that's why we provided Zuni language, Navajo  18 language, all grades, you know.  19 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Is that one  20 period a day?  21 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: One period, yeah.  22 It's an elective class, one period a day.  23 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: They get to  24 choose whether they want to do that or not?  25 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: It is a requirement</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">526</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay. And I do  2 want to say this, because I know how hard these  3 tests are. I was a special ed teacher for 39 years.  4 And my kids could make enormous progress on NWEA and  5 still not do as well on the PARCC, because they  6 can't maintain that over that amount of time.  7 I think it's always a challenge for those  8 kids, because they can kind of learn it, and they  9 get it, and you keep going over it day and day and  10 day. And then you don't do it for three weeks and  11 they've lost it.  12 I think those NWEA tests are a good way  13 for you to document like, you know, Jane got this --  14 you know, 175, and she went up to 192 or -- you  15 know, those kinds of things. I think those are  16 really good to document. Because in my years, I've  17 just found that, yes, they have grown. It's just  18 that you can't see it on these giant tests.  19 First of all, they get tired. When  20 they're done in 12 minutes, you just know they  21 didn't do well. I'm just going to put that out  22 there for the 12 minutes.  23 The other thing -- let me see.  24 So, Dr. Allison, I hope you plan to be  25 here for a long time; not forever, maybe 50 years,</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">525</p> <p>1 to take electives, yes. But they get to choose  2 which one, Navajo or Zuni.  3 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: I think I read  4 somewhere. But I've read so much I'm not sure that  5 you're looking for -- and I'm not volunteering --  6 but you're looking for a special ed teacher; is that  7 correct?  8 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: No, not currently.  9 Not currently. We have a contract special ed  10 support right now. But in the future, that was --  11 yeah, you saw that in the -- where I said the future  12 of Six Directions? I said that in the future, I did  13 want to hire our own site-based special ed teacher.  14 Right now we have a contract one.  15 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: That means when  16 they're contracted, they're online?  17 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Yeah. They run all  18 the IEPs. They do all the different meetings that  19 have to happen.  20 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Do they do the  21 teaching as well?  22 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Teaching. As far as  23 accommodations that get -- of the IEP and the  24 service hours, that all gets provided by the  25 teacher, and also by a special ed EA.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">527</p> <p>1 because I can see that you're making a big  2 difference, and I think that's what the school  3 needs.  4 Are you all doing NM DASH? Or is that  5 something you're looking into?  6 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Yes, we do. So we do  7 everything that the State -- that State public  8 schools do. Like, we have Frontline. We do the  9 same -- you know, NMTEACH, evaluations.  10 The teachers for semester one, you know,  11 had two walk-throughs. They have their PDPs in  12 there, Professional Development Plans, you know.  13 And they did their self-assessment in Frontline.  14 We also -- that nine-day plan I showed you  15 is in NM DASH. So for the focus areas -- the focus  16 areas are Tier 1 instruction and data-driven  17 instruction.  18 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: So do they --  19 because I understand that they're far behind many --  20 and many are not -- but -- so do they would have  21 extra time where they do math or they're doing  22 Read180 or they're doing something where they're  23 getting the regular class and an extra dose, shall I  24 call it?  25 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Not at this time with</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">528</p> <p>1 remote learning, a lot of us --</p> <p>2 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Wrong question</p> <p>3 to ask you. I'm sorry.</p> <p>4 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Yeah. I think in the</p> <p>5 future, we could definitely look at separate</p> <p>6 interventions like that. Right now, it's -- you</p> <p>7 know, like most high schools, we have a Schedule A,</p> <p>8 Schedule B. So it's two days a week. And then for</p> <p>9 our mid, then two days for our high school and a</p> <p>10 Friday advisory. So they don't have as many days of</p> <p>11 instruction.</p> <p>12 The State of New Mexico did allow, you</p> <p>13 know, us to work schedules, you know, during this</p> <p>14 remote time. So it was -- we have a similar</p> <p>15 schedule actually as NACA's. Ours is a little</p> <p>16 different. I think Gallup-McKinley are running like</p> <p>17 AB-schedule.</p> <p>18 So we're the same way. So, no, we don't</p> <p>19 have a separate intervention class. But, you know,</p> <p>20 students who are -- even within your Tier 1 program,</p> <p>21 your core program, you know, you can -- teachers are</p> <p>22 to assess, you know, the standards, either by</p> <p>23 performance base or, you know, a test that they</p> <p>24 make. And they need to determine, you know, those</p> <p>25 students that need help.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">530</p> <p>1 each group?</p> <p>2 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Well, they all --</p> <p>3 they all take -- like I said, every student takes</p> <p>4 one or the other. But we have most of our Navajo</p> <p>5 students choose Navajo, and our Zuni students, they</p> <p>6 choose Zuni. So the Zuni classes are smaller,</p> <p>7 because we have -- I think we have more Navajo</p> <p>8 students currently.</p> <p>9 But -- but we -- yeah, it's really their</p> <p>10 choice. But, really, one who becomes a student here</p> <p>11 can choose either language.</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Oh, okay. Would it</p> <p>13 be fair to say that the Zuni school district</p> <p>14 provides for their population better than</p> <p>15 Gallup-McKinley?</p> <p>16 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: I don't really know,</p> <p>17 you know, too much about the Zuni Public Schools and</p> <p>18 if they're more, you know, culturally sensitive</p> <p>19 with, you know, all areas of operations.</p> <p>20 I really just don't know enough about Zuni</p> <p>21 Public Schools.</p> <p>22 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Okay. Thank you.</p> <p>23 What about -- you're close to the Arizona</p> <p>24 border. I'm not sure about the -- you know, the</p> <p>25 in-state/out-of-state. I know it applies at</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">529</p> <p>1 And then they work with them during -- we</p> <p>2 have at -- the end of our day, there's an hour. So</p> <p>3 Monday-Tuesday, that hour is for middle school, and</p> <p>4 Wednesday-Thursday, it's for high school, to do</p> <p>5 extra help sessions for, you know, their work that</p> <p>6 they're getting in the classroom.</p> <p>7 And then there's also time that they can</p> <p>8 take advantage of on Friday before the staff go into</p> <p>9 their PD.</p> <p>10 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: So in this</p> <p>11 nightmare scenario that we're currently in, like, a</p> <p>12 sixth-grader is going to school two days -- going --</p> <p>13 not to school -- is on a Zoom call or Google</p> <p>14 Classroom two days a week?</p> <p>15 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Yes. And a Friday</p> <p>16 advisory class.</p> <p>17 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay. Thank</p> <p>18 you. I'm finished, Madam Chair.</p> <p>19 THE CHAIR: Okay.</p> <p>20 Commissioner Crone, are you raising a hand</p> <p>21 or -- okay. I wasn't sure if it was a sci-fi movie</p> <p>22 you were starting there.</p> <p>23 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Thank you. So you</p> <p>24 teach both Zuni and Diné languages. How many</p> <p>25 students from each group are -- what percentage of</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">531</p> <p>1 colleges. But if you had someone who lived just</p> <p>2 across the line in Arizona who wanted to come to</p> <p>3 your Six Directions, would they be able to do that?</p> <p>4 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Well, if they had the</p> <p>5 transportation, they could, technically, because we</p> <p>6 do have students -- or parents -- that work in, you</p> <p>7 know, Arizona, because Navajo Nation -- you know,</p> <p>8 jobs on the Navajo Nation.</p> <p>9 So people commute. People drive long</p> <p>10 distances to go to work and school here in our</p> <p>11 communities. I know people that live an hour or two</p> <p>12 hours actually from their job sites. And they</p> <p>13 commute every single day.</p> <p>14 So we do -- a lot of the students on the</p> <p>15 Navajo Nation, actually, some of them would even</p> <p>16 choose to go to Gallup High/Miyamura because their</p> <p>17 parents worked in Gallup. Or, you know, even</p> <p>18 students from Window Rock, Arizona, Fort Defiance,</p> <p>19 you know, those areas. If their parents worked in</p> <p>20 Gallup, sometimes they would enroll and become</p> <p>21 students, too. So, yes, yeah, we would definitely</p> <p>22 accept them.</p> <p>23 MS. ABBY LEWIS: But just to clarify,</p> <p>24 though, the way the law works in New Mexico, we</p> <p>25 wouldn't be able to get SEG for those kids,</p>

532	<p>1 unfortunately. So the only way we would be able to 2 take on kids from Arizona is if somehow there was a 3 way to get SEG for them or if there was independent 4 funding. If they do live in Utah, Arizona, or 5 anywhere out of state, we would not legally be 6 allowed to get SEG for them. So that does present a 7 barrier.</p> <p>8 MR. LANE TOWERY: If you don't mind my 9 intervening, we do validate residence. When 10 students apply for the lottery, we do validate 11 residence to make sure that this isn't a problem.</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Okay. Do you get 13 applications from, say, like, Jicarilla or -- I know 14 this crosses the out-of-state boundary -- but Utes 15 from Colorado? Do you ever have applications from 16 students like that?</p> <p>17 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: We haven't, not this 18 year that I'm aware of.</p> <p>19 Lane, do you know? Can you answer this?</p> <p>20 MR. LANE TOWERY: Sure. Thanks, 21 Dr. Allison. Sorry I interrupted just a moment ago. 22 We've had students representing a ton of 23 tribal citizenship throughout the years, not usually 24 because they're traveling from Colorado every day, 25 but perhaps for personal reasons, they're living in</p>	534	<p>1 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes. 2 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 3 Armbruster votes "Yes." 4 Commissioner Davis -- oh, I'm sorry. 5 She's not here. 6 Commissioner Chavez? 7 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes. 8 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 9 Gipson? 10 THE CHAIR: Yes. 11 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 12 Raftery? 13 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: Yes. 14 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 15 Crone? 16 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Yes. 17 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 18 Ruiz? 19 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes. 20 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 21 Caballero? 22 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes. 23 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay. We have a 24 nine-to-zero vote. The motion passes. 25 THE CHAIR: Thank you. So we'll see you</p>
533	<p>1 Gallup. 2 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Yeah. Okay. That's 3 all I have, President -- Commissioner Gipson. Thank 4 you. 5 THE CHAIR: Thank you. Commissioners, any 6 other questions or comments? 7 (No response.) 8 THE CHAIR: Okay. So I am going to 9 move -- I should have this memorized. 10 I am going to move that the Public 11 Education Commission enter into a Closed Session 12 pursuant to NMSA Section 10-15-1(H)(1). The subject 13 to be discussed pertains to the issuance of a 14 charter license renewal for Six Directions 15 Indigenous School. 16 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Second. 17 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Second. 18 THE CHAIR: There's a motion by 19 Commissioner Gipson, a second by Commissioner Ruiz. 20 Commissioner Armbruster? 21 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 22 Robbins? 23 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes. 24 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 25 Voigt?</p>	535	<p>1 on the other side in a few minutes, and we'll see 2 you back in a short time. Thank you. 3 (Executive Session conducted.) 4 THE CHAIR: So I think we're all here. 5 Okay. So thank you so much for waiting. And we 6 know -- we more than know that it's been long day, 7 so we appreciate this. 8 I am going to move that the Public 9 Education Commission end Closed Session. The 10 matters discussed in the closed meeting were limited 11 only to those specified in the motion for closure, 12 and no vote was taken during the Closed Session. 13 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Second. 14 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Second. 15 THE CHAIR: There's a motion by 16 Commissioner Gipson and a second by Commissioner 17 Voigt. Commissioner Armbruster? 18 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Sorry. When I 19 came back, it was muted. 20 Commissioner Robbins? 21 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes. 22 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 23 Voigt? 24 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes. 25 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">536</p> <p>1 Armbruster votes "Yes."  2 Commissioner Chavez?  3 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes.  4 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  5 Gipson?  6 THE CHAIR: Yes.  7 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  8 Raftery?  9 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: Yes.  10 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  11 Crone?  12 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Yes.  13 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  14 Ruiz?  15 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes.  16 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  17 Caballero?  18 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes.  19 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Nine-to-zero,  20 the motion passes.  21 THE CHAIR: Passes. Thank you.  22 Commissioner Voigt?  23 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you,  24 Madam Chair.  25 I would like to move that the Public</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">538</p> <p>1 when they are back than all of this craziness right  2 now. But I feel like I want you to know that I am  3 very concerned about the academics. I do expect  4 them to be higher than the local district. So  5 that's my comments. But I am still voting "Yes."  6 THE CHAIR: We haven't -- we're not taking  7 a vote yet.  8 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: I know. But I  9 could say that. I was discussing.  10 THE CHAIR: Sorry.  11 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: I knew that,  12 because I do that.  13 THE CHAIR: Okay.  14 Any other comments?  15 (No response.)  16 THE CHAIR: If not, Commissioner  17 Armbruster?  18 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay.  19 THE CHAIR: You can vote now.  20 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  21 Caballero?  22 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes.  23 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  24 Ruiz?  25 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">537</p> <p>1 Education Commission renew the charter for --  2 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Six Directions.  3 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: -- Six Directions  4 Indigenous School --  5 THE CHAIR: Indigenous School.  6 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: -- for a five-year  7 term, beginning July 1st, 2020, and ending --  8 THE CHAIR: Sorry. 2021.  9 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: -- July 1st, 2021,  10 and ending on June 30th, 2026.  11 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Second.  12 THE CHAIR: There's a motion by  13 Commissioner Voigt, a second by Commissioner  14 Caballero.  15 Any comments?  16 Commissioner Armbruster?  17 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Yes. I want the  18 school to succeed, but I want to express and have  19 this on the record that I'm concerned that we seem  20 to be unable to help you in the way that we'd want  21 to. So I, personally, am very concerned about the  22 academics for this school, and I'm going to be not  23 on this committee, so that's really good for you.  24 But I know that we will be looking closely  25 to see the progress that kids are making, more so</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">539</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  2 Crone?  3 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Yes.  4 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  5 Raftery? Sonia, I can't hear you.  6 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: Yes. Yes. Yes.  7 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Sorry. That's  8 fine. You were muted.  9 Commissioner Gipson?  10 THE CHAIR: Yes.  11 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  12 Chavez?  13 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes.  14 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  15 Armbruster votes "Yes."  16 Commissioner Voigt?  17 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes.  18 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner  19 Robbins?  20 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes.  21 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: It's  22 nine-to-zero, and you have a contract.  23 THE CHAIR: A new charter.  24 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: Thank you all so  25 much.</p>

1 THE CHAIR: Congratulations. And thank  
2 you for everything that you do every day. We truly  
3 do appreciate it.

4 And as I've said to other schools, no one  
5 ever imagined what schools would be asked to be  
6 doing at this moment in time. So it is comforting  
7 to know that even though you have a small school  
8 population, that that does go beyond your school  
9 family, and that you are reaching out to the  
10 community and making sure that the needs of the  
11 community are being met. And we truly do appreciate  
12 that.

13 So congratulations, and we will see you in  
14 the spring in some form for contract negotiations.  
15 DR. TAMARA ALLISON: We will see you then.  
16 Thank you so much.

17 THE CHAIR: So I did have this lofty idea  
18 that we'd be able to plow through some minor things.  
19 But, obviously, it's a quarter to 6:00.

20 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Tomorrow.

21 THE CHAIR: Tomorrow, tomorrow. So with  
22 that being said, we're going to stand in recess  
23 until tomorrow morning at 9:00 a.m. So see you all  
24 tomorrow. Have a good night.

25 (Proceedings in recess at 5:45 p.m.)

1 RECEIPT  
2 JOB NUMBER: 3829N CC Date: 12/10/20  
3 PROCEEDINGS: PUBLIC MEETING  
4 CASE CAPTION: In re: Public Meeting of the Public  
5 Education Commission

6 \*\*\*\*\*  
7 ATTORNEY: MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN - PED  
8 DOCUMENT: Transcript / Exhibits / Disks / Other \_\_\_\_  
9 DATE DELIVERED: \_\_\_\_\_ DEL'D BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
10 REC'D BY: \_\_\_\_\_ TIME: \_\_\_\_\_

11 \*\*\*\*\*  
12 ATTORNEY:  
13 DOCUMENT: Transcript / Exhibits / Disks / Other \_\_\_\_  
14 DATE DELIVERED: \_\_\_\_\_ DEL'D BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
15 REC'D BY: \_\_\_\_\_ TIME: \_\_\_\_\_

16 \*\*\*\*\*  
17 ATTORNEY:  
18 DOCUMENT: Transcript / Exhibits / Disks / Other \_\_\_\_  
19 DATE DELIVERED: \_\_\_\_\_ DEL'D BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
20 REC'D BY: \_\_\_\_\_ TIME: \_\_\_\_\_

21 \*\*\*\*\*  
22 ATTORNEY:  
23 DOCUMENT: Transcript / Exhibits / Disks / Other \_\_\_\_  
24 DATE DELIVERED: \_\_\_\_\_ DEL'D BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
25 REC'D BY: \_\_\_\_\_ TIME: \_\_\_\_\_

1 BEFORE THE PUBLIC EDUCATION COMMISSION  
2 STATE OF NEW MEXICO  
3  
4  
5  
6

7 REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE  
8 I, Cynthia C. Chapman, RMR, CCR #219, Certified  
9 Court Reporter in the State of New Mexico, do hereby  
10 certify that the foregoing pages constitute a true  
11 transcript of proceedings had before the said  
12 NEW MEXICO PUBLIC EDUCATION COMMISSION, held via  
13 video teleconference, in the State of New Mexico, in  
14 the matter therein stated.

15 In testimony whereof, I have hereunto set my  
16 hand on December 21, 2020.  
17  
18  
19

20 \_\_\_\_\_  
Cynthia C. Chapman, RMR-CRR, NM CCR #219  
21 BEAN & ASSOCIATES, INC.  
201 Third Street, NW, Suite 1630  
Albuquerque, New Mexico 87102  
License Expires: 12/31/21

22  
23  
24  
25 Job No.: 3829N (CC)  
Proofed by: KW

## 1                   BEFORE THE PUBLIC EDUCATION COMMISSION

2                                   STATE OF NEW MEXICO

3  
4  
5  
6  
7                                   REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE8                   I, Cynthia C. Chapman, RMR, CCR #219, Certified  
9                   Court Reporter in the State of New Mexico, do hereby  
10                  certify that the foregoing pages constitute a true  
11                  transcript of proceedings had before the said  
12                  NEW MEXICO PUBLIC EDUCATION COMMISSION, held via  
13                  video teleconference, in the State of New Mexico, in  
14                  the matter therein stated.15                  In testimony whereof, I have hereunto set my  
16                  hand on December 21, 2020.17  
18  
19                                   *Cynthia Chapman*  
20                                   Cynthia C. Chapman, RMR-CRR, NM CCR #219  
21                                   BEAN & ASSOCIATES, INC.  
22                                   201 Third Street, NW, Suite 1630  
23                                   Albuquerque, New Mexico 87102  
24                                   License Expires: 12/31/2125                  Job No.: 3829N (CC)  
                    Proofed by: KW

SANTA FE OFFICE  
119 East Marcy, Suite 110  
Santa Fe, NM 87501  
(505) 989-4949  
FAX (505) 843-9492

**BEAN**  
**& ASSOCIATES, Inc.**  
**A**  
PROFESSIONAL COURT  
REPORTING SERVICE

MAIN OFFICE  
201 Third NW, Suite 1630  
Albuquerque, NM 87102  
(505) 843-9494  
FAX (505) 843-9492  
1-800-669-9492  
e-mail: info@litsupport.com