

BEFORE THE PUBLIC EDUCATION COMMISSION

STATE OF NEW MEXICO

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS
OPEN PUBLIC MEETING
VOLUME THREE

December 11, 2020

9:04 a.m.

CONDUCTED VIA VIDEO TELECONFERENCE

REPORTED BY: Cynthia C. Chapman, RMR-CRR, NM CCR #219

Bean & Associates, Inc.

Professional Court Reporting Service

201 Third Street, NW, Suite 1630

Albuquerque, New Mexico 87102

JOB NO.: 3830N (CC)

543

1 APPEARANCES
 2 COMMISSIONERS:
 3 MS. PATRICIA GIPSON, Chair
 4 MS. TRISH RUIZ, Vice Chair
 5 MS. KARYL ANN ARMBRUSTER, Secretary
 6 MR. R. CARLOS CABALLERO, Member
 7 MR. MICHAEL CHAVEZ, Member
 8 MR. TIM CRONE, Member
 9 MS. GEORGINA DAVIS, Member
 10 MS. M. SONIA RAFTERY, Member
 11 MR. DAVID ROBBINS, Member
 12 MS. GLENNA VOIGT, Member
 13
 14 PED STAFF:
 15 MS. KAREN WOERNER, Deputy Director,
 16 Options for Parents and Families
 17 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN, Custodian of Record
 18 and Liaison to the PEC
 19
 20 PEC COUNSEL:
 21 AMI JAEGER, ESQ.
 22 ELIZABETH JEFFREYS, ESQ.
 23
 24
 25

544

1 INDEX TO PROCEEDINGS, Continued
 2 PAGE
 3 6 Continued Discussion and Action on 548
 4 Charter School Renewal Applications
 5
 6 6A Taos International School - Taos 548
 7
 8 6B J. Paul Taylor Academy - Las Cruces 644
 9
 10 6C La Academia Dolores Huerta - 690
 11 Las Cruces
 12 7 Report from Options for Parents and 768
 13 the Charter School Division - Discussion
 14 and Possible Actions
 15 8 Discussion and Possible Action on 773
 16 the 2021 PEC Meeting Calendar
 17
 18 10 Discussion and Possible Action on 775
 19 Legislative Priorities
 20 11 Report from the Chair 779
 21 12 PEC Comments 785
 22 13 Executive Session 809
 23 14 Adjourn 816
 24 REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE 817
 25
 26 ATTACHMENTS:
 27 1 Meeting Attendees List
 28
 29
 30
 31

545

1
 2 THE CHAIR: Okay. So good morning once
 3 again, everyone. I hope everyone got a little bit
 4 of rest last night. And thank everyone once again
 5 and all those that were attendees that hung in
 6 through the meeting yesterday, because, once again,
 7 it was a very long day.
 8 So I am going to bring back into session
 9 this -- or out of recess -- this meeting of the
 10 Public Education Commission. It is Friday,
 11 December 11th, and it is 9:04 a.m.
 12 Before we begin the regular order of
 13 business, I'm going to ask and propose a motion to
 14 make some changes in the agenda, because I don't
 15 feel that we're going to have an opportunity to get
 16 to a couple of items that are on the agenda. And I
 17 hate to see schools waiting all day and we aren't
 18 able to give them the time needed to hear their
 19 information.
 20 And, in one case, we're not going to have
 21 all the information that we need until January,
 22 anyway; so I think it would be difficult for us to
 23 make a complete decision.
 24 So, at this point in time, I am going to
 25 move that the Public Education Commission remove

546

1 from the agenda the following items:
 2 Item No. 7C, the Special Education
 3 Corrective Action Plan, ACES Technical Charter
 4 School; and D, the Status Update on PEC Corrective
 5 Action Plans for 21st Century Public Academy and
 6 Monte del Sol Charter School.
 7 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Second.
 8 THE CHAIR: So there's a motion by
 9 Commissioner Gipson and a second by Commissioner
 10 Voigt. Is there any discussion?
 11 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: I have a
 12 question.
 13 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Armbruster?
 14 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Did you want
 15 attendance before we take this vote?
 16 THE CHAIR: Yeah, I guess we should. We
 17 did yesterday. I guess that makes more sense. Or
 18 can we consider attendance through the roll that
 19 we're taking now?
 20 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: It's fine. It's
 21 fine.
 22 THE CHAIR: I don't know. I don't know.
 23 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay. I'm set.
 24 It's fine. I'll just go ahead and do this.
 25 Commissioner Robbins?

547

1 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes.
 2 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner
 3 Crone?
 4 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Yes.
 5 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner
 6 Ruiz?
 7 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes.
 8 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner
 9 Voigt?
 10 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes.
 11 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner
 12 Davis?
 13 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Yes.
 14 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner
 15 Gipson?
 16 THE CHAIR: Yes.
 17 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner
 18 Chavez?
 19 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes.
 20 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner
 21 Armbruster votes "Yes."
 22 Commissioner Raftery?
 23 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: Yes.
 24 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner
 25 Caballero?

548

1 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes. Yes.
 2 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Thank you. It's
 3 a ten-zero vote, and the motion passes.
 4 THE CHAIR: Thank you. So all ten
 5 Commissioners are in attendance, and the motion
 6 passed, ten-zero. Thank you.
 7 So now we are on to the renewal
 8 applications. And the first school up for this
 9 morning is Taos International School.
 10 MS. KAREN WOERNER: So, Nadine, I'm moving
 11 you to the panel.
 12 Nadine, if you could tell me who else in
 13 the Attendees list is going to be joining you for
 14 the presentation from the school?
 15 Okay. Nadine, can you unmute yourself?
 16 MS. NADINE VIGIL: And then tell me, how
 17 do I put my picture, my profile picture?
 18 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Ms. Vigil, we can see
 19 and hear you. Not see you; we can hear you.
 20 Can you tell me who else from your school
 21 we should add to the panel?
 22 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Okay. Okay. There I
 23 am. Okay. Thank you.
 24 Good morning, everyone. This is Nadine
 25 Vigil. I'm the head administrator and director of

549

1 Taos International School. With me, I have
 2 Ms. Yvette Driskell.
 3 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Okay. Wait a minute.
 4 Let me find them.
 5 I'm going to promote Yvette Driskell to
 6 the panel. Who else?
 7 MS. NADINE VIGIL: I have Mr. Gerrit
 8 VanEvery.
 9 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Okay.
 10 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Ms. Tanya Abeyta.
 11 And then I have our GC president, Clifford
 12 Johnson. Anna Parras Romero, vice president.
 13 MS. KAREN WOERNER: What was the first
 14 name? I'm sorry.
 15 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Amalia -- I mean -- I'm
 16 sorry -- Anna -- Anna Parras Romero.
 17 And then Amalia Martinez.
 18 I also have Michael Vigil, business
 19 manager, and Patty Matthews.
 20 MS. KAREN WOERNER: And is it Michael
 21 Vigil and Michael Vigil II? Or both of them?
 22 MS. NADINE VIGIL: It's Michael Vigil and
 23 Ryan Fox. And Patty Matthews.
 24 MS. KAREN WOERNER: So we have Yvette,
 25 Gerrit, Clifford, Michael Vigil, Sr., Ryan Fox,

550

1 Tanya Abeyta, Anna Romero, Amalia Martinez, Patty
 2 Matthews. Did I get everybody?
 3 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Did you get Clifford
 4 Johnson?
 5 MS. KAREN WOERNER: I did.
 6 MS. NADINE VIGIL: And Lynell Vigil; she's
 7 our tech.
 8 MS. KAREN WOERNER: I missed that one.
 9 Lynell should be added now. Yes, she's on the --
 10 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Madam Chair, I think
 11 everyone's here from the school now.
 12 THE CHAIR: Good morning. And welcome,
 13 everyone. Thank you for the time. Thank you for
 14 hanging in there if you've been listening in. And
 15 we truly do appreciate all the time and effort that
 16 you put into the renewal application, especially
 17 during these particularly trying times, how
 18 difficult it must be to try to navigate everything
 19 you're doing and also be able to complete the
 20 renewal application. So we appreciate your time
 21 throughout all of this.
 22 And, you know, for us, it's -- this is a
 23 time we get to, once again, reconnect with the
 24 schools. So it's an enjoyable time to have these
 25 conversations. So we appreciate the time today as

551

1 well.

2 So, as you're probably familiar, CSD will

3 present their brief report. And then the school

4 will have their 15 minutes to present whatever they

5 wish to.

6 And, Nadine, I'm sorry. I don't remember.

7 Do you have a presentation for the -- for the second

8 15 minutes? Or was it just a narrative?

9 MR. VIGIL: Yes, we do. We have a

10 presentation.

11 THE CHAIR: Okay. So then we'll move into

12 that 15-minute presentation as well, and then we'll

13 do public comment and then the PEC comments.

14 So, Karen, whenever you are ready?

15 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: And who's

16 timing, Madam Chair?

17 THE CHAIR: Karen doesn't get timed.

18 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Beverly's

19 timing.

20 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Beverly is here today,

21 and she's going to do the timing.

22 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN: I've got the timer.

23 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Good morning,

24 Madam Chair, Commissioners, school representatives.

25 Before you is Taos International School, as we've

552

1 already said. This school first opened, I believe,

2 in 2014, and sought a renewal in 2018, I believe,

3 and was on a two-year renewal with conditions. So

4 this is -- would be their second renewal, if

5 renewed.

6 The PED's recommendation, as indicated in

7 your report, is for a renewal term for five years

8 with conditions, or a Corrective Action Plan that

9 includes specific goals for each of the first three

10 years regarding demonstrating growth in math and

11 reading, increasing academic proficiency in both

12 math and reading, and positive year-end operational

13 fund balance.

14 The school earned 44 points in the most

15 recent School Accountability Report, which, as you

16 know, is in the middle 50 percent, towards the lower

17 end of the middle 50 percent. The cutoff for the

18 lowest 25 percent, as you know, is 42 points that

19 year.

20 The school is also identified as a school

21 in need of targeted support and improvement. Both

22 reading and math proficiencies are below the local

23 and State averages.

24 And the school's current contract was

25 for -- actually, was for three years, I think. My

553

1 correction. I said two earlier. I believe it was

2 for three years. But, of course, we only have data

3 for one of those years, because the second year,

4 last year, we didn't have State assessments or even

5 Short Cycle Assessments at the end of the year due

6 to the pandemic.

7 The current contract for the school had

8 three conditions: They had -- that I listed also on

9 Page 1 -- earn an overall score of "C" or better.

10 And as you know, the school -- State's rating system

11 changed from those letter grades. The school did

12 earn a "C" in '17-'18, and 44 points was in the

13 middle 50 percent in '18-'19. Not sure how to

14 relate that to a letter grade since the system has

15 changed. And then last year there was no State

16 assessment available.

17 The school was also required, as a

18 condition, to obtain their International

19 Baccalaureate certifications. And as this

20 Commission knows, they obtained their Middle Years

21 Program certification last December and are

22 pending -- unless that's changed this week,

23 Ms. Vigil -- pending the Primary Years program.

24 The delay in that was also due to the

25 COVID. They were supposed to visit the school in

554

1 the spring. That was canceled due to the COVID

2 closures. And it did actually happen in October,

3 but virtually, and the school is still awaiting the

4 final report for the Primary Years program

5 certification.

6 The third condition was to Meet or Exceed

7 the State Proficiency averages. And as this body

8 knows, the goal was not met in '18-'19, but cannot

9 be verified for '19-'20 due to the delay in the

10 State assessments.

11 The school's audit findings have been

12 stellar, with zero findings for the past two years.

13 There are some concerns related to declining

14 membership numbers and how that may affect their

15 cash balance and the need to address that as they --

16 either with a membership increase or making

17 adjustments in their spending as they move forward.

18 The school spent an average of 62 percent

19 of its budget on instructional costs, which, as you

20 know, is very close to the goal of 68 percent. And

21 their spending on administrative support was -- was

22 low, which is what we like to see, at 19 percent.

23 The school does not have the support of a

24 foundation specifically to support the school.

25 And then moving on, if I may share the

<p style="text-align: right;">555</p> <p>1 screen, on Page 2 of your report, you have the 2 Evaluation Summary of their Part B Progress Report, 3 which, as you can see, the school has met the 4 standard in most areas, demonstrating Substantial 5 Progress on their goals. But the main concern is 6 around the academic performance, where they're 7 failing to demonstrate Substantial Progress. 8 The Accountability Data from the most 9 recent report of '18-'19 is shown here, where you 10 can see that the reading and math proficiencies are 11 below both the local district and the State 12 averages, as well as science proficiency. The 13 school, however, does have a large EL population. 14 And as you can see by the score here, they are 15 exceeding the progress for EL students as compared 16 to both the local district and the State. 17 You will see on their Organizational 18 Performance framework ratings on Page 3 that they 19 are doing very well organizationally with very few 20 areas that are not Meets Standard -- or, rather, 21 Workings to Meet Standard -- on those. 22 The school did provide a response in your 23 packet on Pages 4 through 7. And then I want to 24 just jump to a couple of other things in the packet 25 that we shared with you.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">557</p> <p>1 within the school year. They have very low 2 withdrawal rates during the school year. And then 3 between school years, you can see that it took quite 4 a hit one year, I believe that was the year during 5 the potential non-renewal of the school, and then 6 have been increasing their enrollment between the 7 years since that time. 8 Their teacher retention rate has been at 9 or above -- around or above 80 percent, which is a 10 good retention rate for their teachers. 11 I already mentioned their audit findings. 12 You see in the first year, they had several; one was 13 a repeat. But they have done an excellent job with 14 no audit findings the last two years that are 15 published. Of course, we don't know the most recent 16 report. 17 And they -- last but not least, you all 18 have, on Page 30, a larger version of their 19 organizational chart that's much easier to read. 20 So, in closing, again, we do recommend a 21 renewal for the school, but ask that we have some 22 conditions to be able to monitor the academic growth 23 and performance of their students. 24 Thank you, Madam Chair. 25 THE CHAIR: Thank you. And good morning</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">556</p> <p>1 The -- when I was speaking about the 2 financial performance, as we did with all the 3 schools, compared their operational expenses to 4 their operational revenue. And though the school 5 has a cash balance the last few years, this is a 6 predicted -- we don't have the actual final cash 7 balance. But, as you can see, their expenses have 8 exceeded their revenue, and they've had to dip into 9 their cash balance. I think that's somewhat 10 attributable to the declining enrollment, perhaps. 11 But they did have, at 40-day, 190 students 12 enrolled, which exceeds the budgeted membership for 13 this year and so is in a better standing. But we do 14 have some concerns and want to watch the spending in 15 this area to be sure that they -- the revenues 16 exceed or match the expenses. 17 Again, I pointed out earlier that they 18 have been spending the majority of their -- 19 64 percent of their funding on instructional costs 20 and only 17 percent on admin costs, which is a good 21 balance. 22 Sorry. Scrolling down to -- sorry to make 23 you seasick on this here. 24 So their enrollment numbers. As you can 25 see, their students do remain enrolled in the school</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">558</p> <p>1 once again. Nadine, I'm just going to ask you to 2 please, for the record, introduce everyone that's 3 here and the role that they hold with the -- related 4 to the school. 5 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Okay. Again, good 6 morning, Madam Chair, Commissioners. On behalf of 7 Taos International School, we'd like to thank you 8 all for letting us be here today. 9 With me is Mrs. Yvette Driskell, Primary 10 Years Program coordinator and kindergarten teacher; 11 Mr. Gerrit VanEvery, Middle Years Program 12 coordinator, sixth-grade teacher, and administrative 13 intern; and Ms. Tanya Abeyta, Community Schools 14 coordinator; Ms. Lynell Vigil, she's our S.T.A.R.S. 15 tech person. And I also have Mr. Clifford Johnson, 16 GC at the present time. He's there. Okay. And 17 Anna Parras Romero, GC vice president. And Amalia 18 Martinez, council member. 19 And then I do have parents. I don't 20 know -- do I need to mention the parents? And I do 21 have Patty. 22 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: You're muted, 23 Patty. 24 THE CHAIR: Sorry. 25 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Patty Matthews, school</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">559</p> <p>1 attorney. Michael Vigil, business manager. Ryan 2 Fox, business manager. 3 THE CHAIR: Okay. So we've -- that covers 4 everyone? 5 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Yes, I believe so. 6 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thanks. So, Beverly 7 does time this 15-minute portion. And she has some 8 warning signs that she does put up if you -- as you 9 get close to the expiration of the time. 10 So welcome once again. And whenever 11 you're ready, you can begin. 12 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Okay. I would like to 13 begin with our GC president, Mr. Clifford Johnson. 14 MR. JOHNSON: Good morning. I am Clifford 15 Johnson. I am president of the governing council. 16 I am a retired attorney, retired after 40-plus 17 years' active practice in Taos. 18 My engagement with the school has been 19 very enlightening. I have to admit when I first 20 started on the governing council, I didn't really 21 understand what an IB school was. Mr. VanEvery made 22 an excellent presentation to our governing council, 23 and I understand now that the IB school -- "IB" not 24 necessarily meaning "inquiry behavior" -- meaning 25 the International Baccalaureate.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">561</p> <p>1 25-and-a-half years. 2 It got a little daunting towards the end 3 of my career. I felt it was time to step aside and 4 let someone younger and with more energy come into 5 the picture and take over. But when I was asked -- 6 you know, when I decided to become a GC member for 7 Taos International School, oh, my gosh. You know, 8 the way the school presents or teaches or instructs 9 students is amazing. 10 I wish I could have had something like 11 that when I was teaching, because I ran the 12 classroom. I taught the students. This method of 13 teaching, where the kids actually take control of 14 their education, I feel, is amazing. And Ms. Vigil 15 and her staff, they've made that very easy to 16 understand. And she -- every meeting that we have, 17 she presents something that's going on in the 18 school, and we are always invited to come in and 19 just observe and find out how these kids are 20 working. 21 Unfortunately, with the pandemic, the 22 situation, we haven't been able to do that this 23 year. But we have had that chance in the past. 24 Thank you. I don't know who else is going to speak 25 next, but that's all I had to say.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">560</p> <p>1 But in the course of Mr. VanEvery's 2 explanation, I realized that the inquiry type of 3 instruction that is given at the Taos International 4 School is strikingly similar to the type of 5 instruction I received in law school. 6 In law school, there was no mention of IB. 7 But we were told that it was the Socratic Method of 8 instruction. But driven by inquiry from the 9 students, I realized that my law school education 10 method was very similar to the IB method being 11 delivered at Taos International School. 12 So I'm quite pleased with that. It's 13 quite interesting to wonder how many of these IB 14 students will be future lawyers because of that 15 similarity. But, of course, we can't make that 16 determination and we leave that up to the future. 17 I would like to turn over this 18 presentation to Anna Romero, who is our 19 vice president and a valued member of the governing 20 council. 21 MS. ANNA ROMERO: Good morning. Thank you 22 for that introduction, Mr. Johnson. My name is Anna 23 Parras Romero. I have lived in Taos my entire life. 24 I am the only one that completed a college education 25 from my family. I, too, was an educator for a good</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">562</p> <p>1 MR. JOHNSON: Next we'll have Amalia 2 Martinez speak, who is a new but a wonderful 3 addition to our governing council. Mali, turn that 4 over to you. 5 MS. AMALIA MARTINEZ: Good morning to 6 everybody. My name is Amalia Martinez, and I am 7 also a retired educator. I taught 18 years, and I 8 taught kindergarten. I did teach at Taos 9 International School for the -- for the first two 10 years that it opened. 11 And I was very excited with the new 12 concepts, with the way that they were going to be 13 teaching. And then introducing the IB curriculum, I 14 just thought that was wonderful. 15 I have been in the school and I have 16 visited -- talked to parents and teachers, and the 17 students, most importantly, and they just love what 18 they're learning. I am very excited because they 19 use a lot of best practices, and the teachers are 20 just excellent, and everything I've heard in the 21 community are good things. 22 And I truly support this school. And I 23 just want to thank all the teachers and the 24 administrator for taking on this -- this endeavor, 25 and thank you for letting me speak this morning.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">563</p> <p>1 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Okay. Thank you, 2 Mr. Cliff. Thank you, GC members, for being there 3 and always being supportive of us. Thank you. 4 I'll move on. Our school mission is, "We, 5 at Taos International School, through inquiry-based 6 learning, will acquire languages and the academic 7 and social skills necessary to function in our 8 local, national, and international community." 9 And we provide -- we are fulfilling our 10 school mission through the programs that we provide. 11 We, right now, consist of 190 students. Those are 12 the students that are enrolled. And we do provide a 13 passionate commitment to teaching and learning 14 through -- by the bilingual programs that we offer. 15 Right now, we are offering the 50/50 16 dual-language model, which means kindergarten 17 through third-grade students get 50 percent of their 18 instruction in English and 50 percent in Spanish. 19 Fourth- through eighth-grade students participate in 20 the Heritage Language model, and this model is 21 designed to provide language instruction to students 22 in the home, or "heritage" language, of their 23 family. 24 So we also have an EL program, an hour 25 daily, that our TESOL teachers provide ELD, which is</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">565</p> <p>1 occurring locally, nationally, and globally. 2 And like one of our GC members mentioned, 3 you know -- well, all three of them -- we do give 4 the students the opportunity to take ownership of 5 their -- of their learning through the inquiry-based 6 teaching that we do and through the inquiry units of 7 teaching that the teachers present. 8 And, with that, I do want to say that we 9 are totally on remote learning right now. Our 10 students are -- receive their schedules from the 11 teachers, and they participate in school from -- our 12 daily schedule is 8:00 to 4:00, and they participate 13 Monday, Tuesdays, Thursdays, and Fridays. 14 Wednesdays are being utilized as check-ins, office 15 hours, prep time for the teachers. Social-emotional 16 learning programs are in place at that time. 17 We -- we did do a survey, a parent survey, 18 earlier on and asked to see what the needs of our 19 parents were going to be. Do they have Internet? 20 Do they have technology devices? Through that data, 21 we were able to provide all our students with a 22 tablet and/or a computer, and also hotspots. We 23 were able to purchase those through the CARES Act 24 and the Veer and the Community Schools Grant. 25 Again, we are a community school. And I</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">564</p> <p>1 English Language Development, a program for our 2 students. 3 We do have 38 ELs, English Learners. So 4 we try to bring in the aspects of the home culture 5 of the heritage language. And we want our 6 students -- our goal is for them to become 7 bilingual, bi-literate. We teach our linguistically 8 culturally relevant education is what we provide for 9 our students. We're very excited. And, of course, 10 along with the principles and philosophies of the 11 IB, the International Baccalaureate organization. 12 So through these programs, our focus 13 areas, which is the dual-language programs, the 14 bilingual programs, and the IB, we encourage our 15 students to grow intellectually, gain knowledge of 16 events that occur locally, nationally, and globally, 17 to appreciate and reflect on their learning and/or 18 improve proficiency in a second language, which is 19 Spanish that we're offering, think critically, build 20 problem-solving skills, and work collaboratively 21 together, acquire a balanced education that includes 22 social studies, math, science, art, music, language 23 arts, technology, fine arts, and physical education. 24 I should say "physical health education." And 25 increase understanding of current events that are</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">566</p> <p>1 will have my community school coordinator talk a 2 little bit about that. But we did receive an award 3 for \$150,000, and that we are using as well as we 4 can right now because of the pandemic. But we're 5 very proud of that, because with the community 6 schools, we are a hub to bring -- you know, bring in 7 educators, families, and community partners together 8 to offer them a range of opportunities, supports, 9 and services to children. 10 So I will have my Community Schools 11 coordinator, like I mentioned, tell you what we're 12 doing now with how we're providing services for the 13 students now that we are in this pandemic. 14 And -- but before I do that, I will go 15 ahead and let Mr. Gerrit go ahead and speak also. 16 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: Yeah. And can I get 17 a read on how much time we have? Sorry. You're on 18 mute. 19 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN: You have three 20 minutes and 45 seconds. 21 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: Okay. So I don't 22 want to necessarily go through everything if we're 23 going to have our Community Schools coordinator talk 24 as well. 25 But I want to just point out, three years</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">567</p> <p>1 ago, we were in a rough spot with the Commission 2 here. And when we managed to secure our renewal, we 3 walked away from that, and I think we all felt a 4 sense of urgency to get to work. We knew we had a 5 pretty tough road in front of us. 6 And I do want to point out just a little 7 correction to the Part A. Our 134 students -- we 8 had that the year immediately following the renewal. 9 And I know in that chart it showed it as the most 10 recent year last year. 11 But we went from -- we lost one-third of 12 our students with the threat of closure. As you can 13 imagine, that was a huge hit for our school. We had 14 a staff member to retire over that time. We had one 15 leave. We weren't able to replace those people; we 16 shuffled around. 17 But I think the big takeaway on that is 18 that we all kind of coalesced, and we realized that 19 we had an important mission in front of us. We even 20 had one teacher who wasn't willing to go along with 21 that mission. That teacher is gone. We all had to 22 get on the same page. 23 And we knew that the only way to push this 24 school and our students forward was to get that IB 25 authorization, to become an official IB World</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">569</p> <p>1 balanced, principled, open-minded, thinker, caring, 2 inquirer, knowledgeable, and a risk-taker. 3 It encourages students to ask questions. 4 It encourages them to learn through units of inquiry 5 where there's real global context and 6 interdisciplinary themes, and they can explore big 7 questions. It's not enough to be academically 8 proficient in the IB program. Students are expected 9 to engage in service learning as well and to be good 10 global citizens. 11 Okay. One minute. I'll cede my time to 12 whoever -- to Tanya, I think, for The Community 13 schools. 14 MS. TANYA ABEYTA: Hello. I know there's 15 not much time. But if there's something that I can 16 add, is, as a community school, it's really awesome 17 to have these extra funds, because we are able to 18 see the needs of our families and students, and 19 we're really able to do all that we can do to make 20 our families and our students a success. 21 And to -- especially in these trying 22 times, we're able to conduct a needs assessment and 23 really take that extra step into their lives and 24 make sure that we are doing all that we can do to 25 ensure that, not only our school is a success, but</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">568</p> <p>1 School. 2 And as I reported to the Commission 3 earlier this year, we are tremendously proud that 4 our Middle Years Program achieved authorization. 5 And I'm -- after working with my Primary Years 6 colleagues, I have no doubt in my mind that, in the 7 coming winter months, we are going to be able to 8 celebrate their achievement of that title as well. 9 As you guys know, I'm sure you're aware, 10 the IB program is a rigorous academic program, you 11 know. It's not something that is generally 12 available to students. It's generally available to 13 students of privileged background who are 14 high-achieving. And our demographics are special, 15 not of the typical IB school. 16 And the IB organization has expressed a 17 lot of interest in expanding this program, because 18 it's a -- a holistic education. Ms. Vigil talked 19 about the mission statement that we have at our 20 school. And that's not something we say; we sing it 21 every morning. We know -- the IB education is a 22 holistic education that encourages learners to be -- 23 and I'm just going through my notes here, since I 24 don't have a lot of time -- to be a well-rounded 25 learner; you know, reflective, communicative,</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">570</p> <p>1 that they carry on in their future and in their 2 education. 3 And I'm just glad that I have the staff 4 that I can work with. I mean, it's an amazing team. 5 So thank you for hearing us out. 6 THE CHAIR: Thank you so much. 7 So, Nadine, whenever you're ready, is it 8 you that's going to share the video presentation, or 9 someone else for your team? 10 MS. NADINE VIGIL: It's going to be 11 Lynell. It's going to be Lynell Vigil. She's going 12 to be able to put it up for us. 13 MS. LYNELL VIGIL: Do I start now? 14 THE CHAIR: Karen is going to give you a 15 little bit of direction that might help you. 16 MS. KAREN WOERNER: I know Lynell is 17 technology-savvy. So, Lynell, we've run into some 18 issues when you're sharing. If there's sound in 19 your presentation, make sure when you share the 20 screen, you choose the computer sound at the bottom. 21 There's an option for computer sound. 22 MS. LYNELL VIGIL: Yeah. 23 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Yeah. I thought you 24 might know. 25 MS. LYNELL VIGIL: Okay. So let's see.</p>

571

1 (Video is presented.)
 2 MS. NADINE VIGIL: And that's the end. We
 3 wanted you all to get a feel of what it looks like
 4 when we have face-to-face instruction with all the
 5 students and what our rooms look like now in
 6 preparing for if and when we can do our hybrid
 7 model. So we are ready and prepared with our shield
 8 and everything in our classrooms.
 9 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you for that. So
 10 we've got eight minutes now for Public Comment.
 11 And, Bev, is it still eight people? Or are there
 12 more?
 13 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN: No. I have eight
 14 people that are listed.
 15 THE CHAIR: Okay.
 16 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN: So each person will
 17 not have any more than a minute.
 18 MS. KAREN WOERNER: So, Bev, the first
 19 person would be?
 20 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN: The first person is
 21 Julie Kay Vigil-Romero.
 22 MS. KAREN WOERNER: So, Julie, I'm going
 23 to move you to the panel so you can address your
 24 comments to them. Hold on one second.
 25 Okay, Julie. You've been added to the

572

1 panel. If you would unmute yourself, you can make
 2 your comments.
 3 PUBLIC COMMENTER: Good morning, everyone,
 4 and thank you for the opportunity to speak on behalf
 5 of Taos International School. I think, because I
 6 have such a short period of time, I just want to go
 7 ahead and say I'm the director of the Northern
 8 New Mexico Children's Advocacy Center. So my job
 9 entails working with children who are abused
 10 throughout seven counties in the northeast quadrant
 11 in the state of New Mexico.
 12 Previous to my children attending Taos
 13 International School -- I have one child who is on
 14 an IEP and who is autistic and another child who has
 15 a severe heart condition. And they had experienced
 16 lots of bullying throughout their public school
 17 education. And I had come to the decision that I
 18 was going to have to leave my job, because I did not
 19 feel like I could leave my kids at school and be
 20 sure that they were safe. Thank God for Taos
 21 International School.
 22 The video brought tears to my eyes. My
 23 kids love the school, as do I. And they're safe and
 24 growing. And they have the opportunity to be
 25 inquiry-based learners and to learn how to be good

573

1 global students in our community. It means the
 2 world to me that you support this school to protect
 3 the children in a small town like Taos. Thank you
 4 for your time.
 5 THE CHAIR: Thank you so much.
 6 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: Can we prioritize
 7 our students? Can we prioritize our students?
 8 THE CHAIR: Certainly.
 9 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: I think Evie
 10 Trujillo may be on. And I was talking with the
 11 other speaker, Isabella Garcia.
 12 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN: They are the next
 13 names on the list. So Evie Trujillo. And you have
 14 six minutes and 30 seconds left.
 15 MS. KAREN WOERNER: I don't see Evie
 16 Trujillo. Sorry. Hold on.
 17 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: I'm talking with
 18 another teacher who's talk- -- Evie is trying to get
 19 on.
 20 Is Isabella on?
 21 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN: Isabella Garcia.
 22 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Not if she's -- not
 23 under her name.
 24 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: Is she under a phone
 25 number? Or no.

574

1 MS. KAREN WOERNER: There's no phone
 2 numbers.
 3 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: We're working on
 4 getting them on. Sorry.
 5 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN: The next speaker,
 6 then, would be Christina Gonzales.
 7 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: Okay. Okay.
 8 MS. KAREN WOERNER: We'll go with
 9 Christina Gonzales while you get the children on.
 10 Christina Gonzales.
 11 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Yes. Christina, are
 12 you on?
 13 MS. KAREN WOERNER: She's coming.
 14 Christina, you're on the panel. If you would unmute
 15 yourself, please?
 16 PUBLIC COMMENTER: Hello. I'm Christina.
 17 And this is our family. This is (indiscernible due
 18 to audio distortion) Sandoval, Jasmine Sandoval, and
 19 David Sandoval.
 20 We love Taos International. We wouldn't
 21 want our kids (indiscernible due to audio
 22 distortion) anywhere else.
 23 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Ms. Gonzales, it's
 24 really hard to hear you. Maybe you should turn off
 25 the video.

<p style="text-align: right;">575</p> <p>1 PUBLIC COMMENTER: The girls love the 2 school. We love the school. (Indiscernible due to 3 audio distortion) there's no other place that we 4 feel comfortable. 5 PUBLIC COMMENTER: Can you hear us better 6 now? 7 THE CHAIR: Yes, I believe so. Cindy, can 8 you hear her better? 9 THE REPORTER: There's quite a bit of 10 distortion, but I'll do my best to record what 11 you're saying. 12 PUBLIC COMMENTER: So we love this school. 13 Our girls love this school. They love this school. 14 It's family to us. And there's nowhere else we'd 15 want our girls to be. 16 PUBLIC COMMENTER: The girls get a chance 17 to learn, like everyone has said, you know, 18 inquiry-based learning. They get to basically 19 choose what they want to learn in and pursue it. 20 And no one's in a -- you know, going to stop them. 21 They have the attitude of, "I'm going to start and 22 I'm not going to stop. I want to continue my 23 learning education." 24 And we see that every single day with them 25 growing. They come -- they're home, and it's hard</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">577</p> <p>1 it's hard to hear Ms. Gonzales. But the Sandoval 2 names that were with her? 3 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN: Nathaniel -- I have 4 Jasmine Sandoval, and Jaylene [ph] Sandoval. Are 5 those the people who were speaking? Jasmine -- 6 Jasmine Sandoval, Jacqueline [ph] Sandoval, and 7 Nathaniel Sandoval. 8 THE CHAIR: Okay. All right. Thank you. 9 Thank you so much. 10 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Okay. So Christina, 11 we're going to move you to the Attendees again, and 12 we will add -- I do see the students that you were 13 looking for, Mr. VanEvery. 14 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: Yes. 15 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Evie and Isabella are 16 on. 17 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: So how much time do 18 we have? 19 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN: You have four 20 minutes and 14 seconds. 21 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: Perfect. I think 22 Evie is going to speak slightly shorter. So why 23 don't we put her on first, and then we'll put 24 Isabella on? 25 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN: Can I give each of</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">576</p> <p>1 to be on the computer all the time now. But even 2 doing computer, you know, being on the computer, 3 they still are not, like, "Oh, I don't want to go to 4 school. I don't want to" -- they want to be on with 5 their teachers as much as possible, you know. 6 They're even doing their after-school 7 program, when they could say, "Oh, I'm just going to 8 just relax at home." 9 No. They want to continue their education 10 and better themselves and better their -- their 11 students, their fellow students. They push each 12 other. They help each other out, even in these hard 13 times. 14 THE CHAIR: Thank you. And time -- 15 PUBLIC COMMENTER: I really love the 16 school. Well, I really love the school, and we hold 17 each other up. 18 MS. NADINE VIGIL: We hold each other up. 19 THE CHAIR: So I just need to double-check 20 and make sure that we have the names of everyone 21 that spoke. So can we do that? Because I think the 22 only thing we have is Christina Gonzales. Is that 23 not correct, Cindy? 24 MS. KAREN WOERNER: We have -- we have the 25 names -- Bev, do you want to read them off? Because</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">578</p> <p>1 you one minute? And at the end of the one minute, I 2 will put up the sign, "Out of Time," so that -- 3 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: Yeah. Because I 4 think that theirs should take no more than a minute 5 or two, from what I've seen what they're going to 6 say. So -- and I don't know that we have any other 7 speakers, do we? 8 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN: You have Anna 9 Romero. 10 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: Anna Romero is on 11 our board. 12 MS. ANNA ROMERO: I already spoke. 13 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: She already spoke. 14 So I think the rest of the time, we can use for 15 these two students. So I would say if we can give 16 them the balance of the time. 17 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN: That will be fine. 18 The first speaker is Isabella Garcia. 19 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: Why don't we do 20 Evie's first, and then Isabella's? 21 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Evie, I'm going to 22 move you to the panel, and you can make your 23 comments in just a second. 24 Evie, you're on the panel now. If you 25 could unmute yourself, we would love to hear your</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">579</p> <p>1 comments.</p> <p>2 PUBLIC COMMENTER: Okay. I think the</p> <p>3 school has changed me in a good way. I have</p> <p>4 definitely learned and grown as a person. Before I</p> <p>5 came, I was a follower and let people push me</p> <p>6 around. They told me to stick up for myself and</p> <p>7 what is right.</p> <p>8 The people showed me kindness and care.</p> <p>9 They showed me compassion when I made mistakes.</p> <p>10 From that simple show of kindness, I've become an IB</p> <p>11 kid.</p> <p>12 When we first started remote learning, I</p> <p>13 was having a really hard time with my mental health;</p> <p>14 it was at an all-time low, and so were my grades.</p> <p>15 They picked me up and had me try again. They gave</p> <p>16 me encouraging words. They made me believe I could,</p> <p>17 so I did.</p> <p>18 I learned from this school that life is a</p> <p>19 journey and not a destination. What IB means to me</p> <p>20 is to be knowledgeable, to have integrity, and to be</p> <p>21 an inquirer.</p> <p>22 What I miss most about being in my</p> <p>23 classroom is my peers and to see my teachers. I</p> <p>24 miss the meetings we had in the morning to keep us</p> <p>25 updated and being able to eat lunch and breakfast as</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">581</p> <p>1 grade, and I have been here since my fifth-grade</p> <p>2 year. It was introduced to me through my younger</p> <p>3 sister.</p> <p>4 Some things that I have really understood</p> <p>5 and appreciated in the past years are learning about</p> <p>6 writing. I may not have the -- it may not make the</p> <p>7 most sense, and I apologize for that. But in the</p> <p>8 past years, I would like to believe that I have</p> <p>9 become a better writer. The opportunity began in</p> <p>10 fifth grade from my homeroom teacher, and now my</p> <p>11 English or language and literature teacher.</p> <p>12 Since then, I have enjoyed writing, even</p> <p>13 if it's just short stories or something related. I</p> <p>14 write on my own occasionally. I do enjoy writing</p> <p>15 when I have something fresh in my head; although I</p> <p>16 would like to learn more in this. I am very</p> <p>17 grateful that I got this door opened in the first</p> <p>18 place.</p> <p>19 I have met a lot of new people these past</p> <p>20 years and learned tons of new things, like being IB.</p> <p>21 It's really a skill that everyone should have or</p> <p>22 work on. Just the general idea of knowing how to</p> <p>23 get through life in a world where things are always</p> <p>24 changing, evolving, really.</p> <p>25 School, in general, is not easy. There</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">580</p> <p>1 a group.</p> <p>2 What I look forward to next year, since I</p> <p>3 am in eighth grade, I will be leaving the school</p> <p>4 behind, sadly. But I am glad I can try to</p> <p>5 experience life more and use the skills they taught</p> <p>6 me. I hope in the future I will be able to attend</p> <p>7 an IB college. I'm not really sure what I want to</p> <p>8 do, but I do know I want to go to another IB school.</p> <p>9 THE CHAIR: Thank you so much.</p> <p>10 PUBLIC COMMENTER: Thank you for letting</p> <p>11 me speak.</p> <p>12 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Isabella Garcia.</p> <p>13 PUBLIC COMMENTER: Thank you. Sorry. I</p> <p>14 have been at Taos international for the past three</p> <p>15 years. This is my fourth and --</p> <p>16 THE CHAIR: Okay. Can I just stop for a</p> <p>17 second? Because we're really having a lot of</p> <p>18 difficulty in hearing. So the volume has to be</p> <p>19 turned up some.</p> <p>20 PUBLIC COMMENTER: Okay. On my side?</p> <p>21 THE CHAIR: Okay. That's a little bit</p> <p>22 better. Try again, please.</p> <p>23 PUBLIC COMMENTER: Okay. I have been at</p> <p>24 Taos International for the past three years. This</p> <p>25 is my fourth and last year. I am now in eighth</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">582</p> <p>1 may always be something that just doesn't sit right</p> <p>2 or you just can't seem to get by. I would be lying</p> <p>3 if I said it was not hard, because it is.</p> <p>4 And I will miss this school next year,</p> <p>5 moving up to high school, beginning in a new and</p> <p>6 unfamiliar place where people do not recognize me as</p> <p>7 an individual, like what has been done at a smaller</p> <p>8 school like Taos International. I will miss seeing</p> <p>9 the familiar faces around the halls and a familiar</p> <p>10 place, even though this year has definitely been a</p> <p>11 weird one, school and out-of-school. But you cannot</p> <p>12 stay in the same place forever.</p> <p>13 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: Good job.</p> <p>14 PUBLIC COMMENTER: Thank you.</p> <p>15 THE CHAIR: Thank you so much.</p> <p>16 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN: That's all the</p> <p>17 speakers.</p> <p>18 THE CHAIR: That's all the speakers?</p> <p>19 Okay. Thank you.</p> <p>20 And, certainly, thank all of you, and</p> <p>21 thank everyone that spoke. I think I've said</p> <p>22 before, it's not fair when you put those little tiny</p> <p>23 voices in the presentations. And then when you</p> <p>24 throw in the pictures of the smiling toothless</p> <p>25 faces, it's, like, that's -- you know, that's not</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">583</p> <p>1 fair, you know. High schools don't get to do that, 2 generally. So -- but we appreciate that. 3 But, most of all, we appreciate the fact 4 that your governing council is not only just here, 5 but it's obvious that they're present. And they're 6 part of this presentation. They can speak 7 confidently about the workings of the school. And 8 that shows the capacity of a school as well. And 9 that's absolutely what we need. 10 So I truly do appreciate every one that is 11 here and you showing that. 12 So just a couple of things. I mean, 13 obviously, we mentioned that there was that little 14 bit of a hiccup a couple of years ago. And we 15 actually looked at another school that didn't have 16 as big of a hiccup, but they did have a little bumpy 17 road with their renewal about four years ago. And 18 they did. They -- they did a reset for themselves. 19 And it was a big move. They've had four years to be 20 able to show us how that -- how that reset has 21 worked. 22 You have not had that time. And this was 23 a huge reset for you. So I'd appreciate it if you 24 could just spend some time -- because, you know, 25 we've seen some progress. There are absolutely</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">585</p> <p>1 gained authorization, and we know we made huge 2 improvements. 3 And like the Commissioner-Chairwoman 4 stated, you know, the goals that were set, you know, 5 of doubling, tripling our proficiency, in some 6 cases, were -- I would say, a tad too ambitious for 7 the short term of our contract. And we had this 8 very short contract. Like you said, we only have 9 these two years of data at all. 10 And we do -- and I -- I will say that it's 11 not all bad. When we look initially at the 12 proficiency level, that tells part of the story. 13 And in Part B of the application, we sort of wanted 14 to outline the rest of that story, because -- and I 15 can share my screen and go over a couple of these 16 things, if it pleases the Commission. 17 THE CHAIR: If you want to, absolutely. 18 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: Okay. And let me 19 pull up the -- I guess I need permission, right? 20 Okay. Ah. Okay. Okay. 21 So when we look at what we have submitted 22 in the renewal application, I just wanted to make a 23 couple of points. One was, we look at Part A of the 24 Accountability Report, and we look at our growth 25 scores. And that means, you know, how we're normed</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">584</p> <p>1 challenges still with some of the growth. There is. 2 And that was a big benchmark to make that, 3 "We're going to be proficient." That was a -- that 4 was huge benchmark. 5 But can you talk about, maybe, through -- 6 and I know you also haven't had a whole lot of time, 7 even with short cycles and the IB program. So I 8 don't know how much you can offer us. 9 But talk about, any way that you can, 10 where this reset, you can really see where those 11 differences are being made. Because it is. It's a 12 big challenge, and it's a big challenge, considering 13 the -- what's gone on this past year, to really be 14 able to adequately show the effects of it. 15 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: And if you want, I 16 can speak to that point, maybe, Nadine? 17 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Yes, Gerrit. Go ahead, 18 Gerrit. 19 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: I think, obviously, 20 the pandemic has presented some unique challenges. 21 We did not have an opportunity to do our short cycle 22 assessments at the end of last year; nor did we have 23 the opportunity to take the PARCC test or the NMSBA. 24 And it was a disappointment for us, because, you 25 know, with our Middle Years Program, we had just</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">586</p> <p>1 against the rest of the State and the district, we 2 see that in five out of six of the subgroups, we 3 actually had average or above-average growth. 4 And I do want to point out that our 5 highest growth came in mathematics, which is our 6 lowest level of proficiency. I know we are -- and 7 we own it. We know. We are far below where we 8 would like to be with our proficiency levels. 9 But, again, it tells only part of the 10 story. And the other part of that story is, like 11 when you look at our Istation scores, for 12 instance -- this is an example. These are our K-3 13 students -- I'm sorry. This may be K-5. Sorry. 14 So a lot of these students come to us as a 15 Level 1 on the Istation. And I know this is a 16 confusing graph. It was kind of hard to figure out 17 how to present this in an interesting way. 18 But we have -- and this is last year, fall 19 to winter. Obviously, we have incomplete scores 20 here as well. 21 But you can see -- and we're working on 22 compiling these scores this year. Just as another 23 note, getting through the testing cycle remotely was 24 somewhat of a challenge, and getting all of our 25 students tested this year has been an incredible</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">587</p> <p>1 challenge. But we're working through that now and 2 analyzing and compiling that data.</p> <p>3 But if you look, what I want to point out 4 is the overall proficiency levels don't always show 5 things like, we have students at a Level 1. And 6 Level 4 is considered proficient.</p> <p>7 So if a student goes from a Level 1 to a 8 Level 2, or a Level 2 to a Level 3, that student 9 does not show up in our proficiency data. So I 10 think that that is problematic for us, because when 11 we have a large number of Level 1 students coming to 12 us, we don't always see that growth and proficiency 13 immediately, and it takes several years.</p> <p>14 When we look at our language arts scores 15 as well, again, this data was compiled winter to 16 winter. That was the best sort of compilation we 17 could come up with. Because on math -- some of you 18 guys have mentioned -- I know you're former 19 educators and some of you are current educators or 20 working with the schools.</p> <p>21 And you understand math measures a set of 22 contents for the year, right? And so sometimes when 23 we take a math assessment in the fall, and we take 24 one in the winter, we're getting an incomplete 25 picture.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">589</p> <p>1 like crazy to get those down.</p> <p>2 But the IB program helps develop students.</p> <p>3 And we know that if we can get that program 4 developed more and implemented more, that we will 5 continue to see growth.</p> <p>6 So while our proficiency levels are not 7 where we want them to be -- I mean, no one's going 8 to sit up here and say, "Wow, we're really proud of 9 the fact that this number of students are 10 proficient." We're not here to tell you that.</p> <p>11 But we are proud of our growth, and we are 12 proud of the fact that, for instance, Ms. Woerner 13 pointed out, our EL students achieve at higher rates 14 than the State and district.</p> <p>15 And, you know, that represents over 16 20 percent of our school population is EL students. 17 And we're -- we have -- as you heard in the video, 18 one of our eighth-grade students who was speaking, 19 you know, came from Mexico last year.</p> <p>20 We serve a diversity of students. And 21 those students are being served well. And having 22 that model of K-8 dual-language education, which is 23 research-based, which is the only model of education 24 for English Language Learners that shows closing, 25 long-term, the achievement gap between their</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">588</p> <p>1 The most complete picture we can get is 2 from fall to spring, because that -- that measures 3 all the content taught through the entire year. So 4 sometimes -- so it's very hard to, you know, compare 5 apples to oranges.</p> <p>6 But if we go winter-to-winter, we can get 7 close. And you can see, we have our projected 8 growth and our observed growth. So, I mean, we fell 9 short in a couple of areas there. But, overall, we 10 exceeded that growth. And this is math. And the 11 math has definitely been our area of challenge and 12 the area where we're lower.</p> <p>13 But I want to show -- I want to emphasize 14 for the Commission that we are making growth in 15 these areas, that we're not sitting back. We are 16 implementing data tracking with our students. We 17 are implementing different math intervention 18 programs.</p> <p>19 We are -- we've hired a math coach. We've 20 hired a reading coach. And, number one, I think the 21 most important thing for us is that, you know, the 22 IB program is a research-based program that 23 increases these things.</p> <p>24 And our students need the basic literacy 25 and math skills. And so we're -- we are working</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">590</p> <p>1 English-speaking peers.</p> <p>2 So with -- with our low proficiency levels 3 scores, we have areas of -- we have bright spots in 4 areas of growth. And I don't think that there's 5 anywhere in the growth department where there's a 6 huge red flag.</p> <p>7 I know that if we go forward over the next 8 five years, we'll have the opportunity to increase 9 those proficiency scores. I think what we need is 10 more time to let that play out. I don't know if I 11 answered your question; but, hopefully.</p> <p>12 THE CHAIR: You did. So you mentioned 13 that you've hired the reading coach and the math 14 coach. So in the virtual world that we're in now, 15 how are supports being offered to students?</p> <p>16 I know you mentioned that kids are in 17 classes Monday, Tuesday, Thursday, Friday. But what 18 does your support services look like at this point 19 in time through the student's day?</p> <p>20 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Okay. With the -- we 21 did hire a part-time math coach and a part-time 22 reading coach. So what we do is, of course, they 23 assist the teachers that work with them on 24 Wednesdays. But with the students, they do have 25 their little, like, tutoring groups with them.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">591</p> <p>1 So we have them tutoring. We have an 2 after-school program tutoring. So the teachers 3 themselves are tutoring. 4 But the math coach and the reading coach, 5 what they do is analyze, you know, the data we have 6 right now, and they're pulling small groups 7 throughout the days. They will get their groups and 8 differentiate their instruction and start working 9 with them more on an individual basis. 10 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thanks. And let me 11 just ask you. Has the IB -- the implementation of 12 the IB program presented any additional challenges 13 through what we're going through now? 14 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: I could speak as the 15 IB coordinator for middle school. I would say 16 absolutely. You know, our program is built on 17 inquiry-based learning and lots of sort of group 18 work, service learning, things that are difficult to 19 achieve during remote learning. 20 So it's certainly been a challenge. We 21 are adapting constantly to the needs of our 22 students. 23 I know my Middle Years Program colleagues, 24 you know, we started with one plan. And we saw that 25 our students -- it wasn't working for our students.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">593</p> <p>1 correctly, was financial, that the costs of 2 maintaining that IB program became almost 3 prohibitive to the school. 4 So does someone want to talk a little bit 5 about that? Because I'm just wondering if that's 6 why you're needing to dip into reserves a little 7 bit, because, you know, maybe some strains because 8 of those costs. 9 MS. NADINE VIGIL: I'll have Michael speak 10 on behalf of the budget. But before he does, I want 11 to say that it is. It is expensive. You know, we 12 pay a fee of \$9,500 per program for the Primary 13 Years, and for the -- so it's a total of \$18-, 14 \$19,000 a year. 15 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: Plus trainings. 16 Plus trainings. 17 THE CHAIR: I'm sorry. Plus what? 18 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Plus trainings that we 19 do also. We do also have to do trainings. 20 But because we, as the staff, because we 21 want to keep doing what we're doing because of what 22 we're seeing with our students, it's important to 23 us. 24 It is expensive. We cut in other areas. 25 But we love what we're doing.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">592</p> <p>1 We've been changing. We've been adjusting. 2 One of the things we've learned about our 3 population is they need that time on Zoom. We have 4 to be there with them, like, they need that teacher. 5 Our students are coming from backgrounds where they 6 don't have someone at home with them to support 7 them, for the vast majority of our students. And I 8 think, during remote learning, we've seen that that 9 is a huge equity issue. So getting as much time as 10 we possibly can. 11 And is it -- are we able to do something 12 as enriching in terms of the holistic education what 13 we did in the classroom before? No. I don't think 14 that online learning is as conducive to that sort of 15 learning. 16 However, you know, we are just -- that's 17 what we do. We work; we problem-solve. We work 18 with our students; we work with our staff to try and 19 come up with solutions to those problems. 20 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thanks. I appreciate 21 that. 22 And just one last question. We haven't 23 had that many IB schools. And the one or two that 24 we've had aren't IB any longer. They may keep it an 25 "inspired." And part of the decision, if I remember</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">594</p> <p>1 Just in listening to the governing council 2 members that were speaking earlier, we all learned, 3 we all went to traditional schools. We learned 4 traditionally; we were taught traditionally; we 5 taught traditionally. 6 With the inquiry-based learning that we're 7 doing with our students and the teaching methods 8 that we use and strategies, it's way different. And 9 we see it with the kids, that they are engaged, and 10 they love this. 11 And this is where we're going to start 12 seeing progress with the kids, because they're 13 taking ownership. But it is. It is a budget 14 constraint on us. 15 Michael, I don't know if you want to add 16 anything to that. 17 MR. MICHAEL VIGIL: Good morning, 18 everyone, Commissioner Gipson, members of the 19 Commission. I appreciate the opportunity. 20 So, yes, this is just part of our regular 21 budgeting process. We just need to make sure we 22 have the correct priorities in place and we do 23 balance the budget. 24 You know, it hasn't really been a decrease 25 in revenue, per se, for our cash balances. What</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">595</p> <p>1 really impacted us last year, to be honest with 2 you -- and the information that was provided to you 3 is not technically correct. What you are being 4 given is budget balance, not cash balance. And 5 there's a big difference in the numbers. 6 So I did provide the Charter School 7 office -- kind of modified their report so that it 8 shows true cash balance. At the end of the year for 9 2020, our actual cash balance in the Operational 10 Fund was \$95,845. That's the reconciled cash 11 balance. The difference between that and what the 12 number that's being reported is the accruals that we 13 do for financial statement purposes. 14 So, as you all know, schools have the 15 option of paying their teachers out at the end of 16 June, or we -- but this school, like most -- like 17 many schools, pay out throughout the summer and 18 into -- it's kind of dovetailed, so you don't stop 19 paying in the paycheck. 20 So when we place all the accruals onto the 21 financial statements, it takes our cash basis 22 requirements during the year and moves it into a 23 modified accrual for financial statement purposes. 24 That's where you see the decrease. 25 I also wanted to point out that RFRs in</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">597</p> <p>1 degree -- I have to work with PED, David Craig and 2 his group -- it's a -- we're monitoring cash 3 constantly. We watch it daily. But we want to make 4 sure that -- you know, we can't control how fast 5 they're going to get us our Requests for 6 Reimbursement into the school. But we will 7 guarantee that the school will have cash and will 8 meet all its obligations. 9 I will report to you that all invoices are 10 current; all bills are paid. No one -- all tax 11 liabilities have been made. There has been no 12 issues. 13 And I think that's one of the reasons for 14 the past two years we've received no findings. We 15 really work hard with Nadine. And I will say the 16 school -- and I know there's a lot of "Vigils" on 17 this call. I'm not related to any of them, I want 18 to let you know. 19 But I know -- so we -- we work hard. And 20 I wanted to give -- I want to give the school 21 credit, because those that follow what we say, we 22 minimize audit findings. And that is really the 23 true test of the school's financial viability, when 24 we can get a minimal amount of findings. 25 I'm working with schools in districts</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">596</p> <p>1 the 2018-'19 school year were very slow in coming to 2 the school. And I've talked to districts -- I work 3 for a number of school districts and other charters. 4 The school had outstanding RFRs, as of 5 June 30 of '19, of over \$170,000 that the State 6 hadn't processed. We push and push, and we can't 7 get the money down. 8 Just as an example with the virtual 9 environment, we watch the cash, and I want to make 10 sure that the school always has cash. And I will 11 report to you that the school is financially stable. 12 Now that we have 190 kids, we're reaching that 13 number where it's not going to be difficult to 14 really prioritize our budgets and go forward. More 15 kids makes it easier for financial purposes, as we 16 all know. So it's doing very well in that respect. 17 However, just for this year, for example, 18 the Public School -- PSFA has not yet submitted, to 19 any school, its lease reimbursement for this year. 20 They -- every school has submitted its first 21 quarter, and we've even submitted second quarter's, 22 and we've received notice from the PSFA people that 23 they're working to try to get the first quarter's 24 out. We're already in December. They are late. 25 So the State has to understand to some</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">598</p> <p>1 throughout the State. I found out the districts 2 were averaging 11, 12 findings per district. We're 3 trying to decrease the ones we're working there, 4 too. 5 So our goal is to have good audit reports 6 so that it does not reflect badly on the PED or the 7 State and to maintain that cash as appropriate. So 8 I think we are in compliance. And it's just the 9 understanding the difference between cash basis 10 accounting and -- you know, we've talked about this 11 in the past -- versus modified accrual of the 12 financial statements. 13 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thanks. And it's good 14 to see you. So thank you. I don't think we've seen 15 each other in a while. 16 MR. MICHAEL VIGIL: Right. 17 THE CHAIR: And I appreciate this. 18 Commissioner Armbruster? 19 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Yes. Of course 20 this is my strength, this financial business. Not. 21 I just wanted to clarify something I 22 thought you said. So let's say a teacher gets a 23 \$12,000 salary. So that teacher really gets \$1,000 24 each month, so it's paid for the whole year. Is 25 that kind of what you're saying?</p>

599

1 MR. MICHAEL VIGIL: That is exactly
2 correct. So the teachers' salaries -- let's say you
3 hired a brand new teacher that began in August. So
4 their first paycheck starts in September, just to
5 make it easy.

6 Usually, it's the last paycheck in August,
7 they'll get it. But they get it in August. They
8 continue getting paid all the way to the following
9 August. And so the accruals that we put against
10 that.

11 Also, for example, some of the other
12 accruals that we would have is the school will get
13 its bills for the electrical, the water bill, the
14 utilities, and stuff. We don't receive those bills
15 until July. We can't -- we don't know what the
16 amount is going to be. It's based on usage.

17 So when we get all those July bills that
18 come in for the prior year, we do book them into the
19 prior year for financial statement purposes, because
20 they were actually incurred in the prior year. But
21 we'll pay them in the subsequent year.

22 So for financial statement purposes, we do
23 the accrual method of accounting, and we push them
24 in there so that they reflect on the books that way.

25 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: It's an

601

1 But, anyway, thank you, Ms. Vigil and
2 Mr. VanEvery, for your description and for the video
3 presentation. I was really impressed to see so many
4 kids of color within an IB school. Most IB schools
5 that I know of that are in existence still are not
6 as demographically diverse as this school. So I
7 commend you on that.

8 And I just had a question -- I'm going to
9 save all the dual-language questions for another
10 Commissioner. But I just had a question regarding
11 your language goal. It says "languages." So I know
12 right now you're offering Spanish. Is there any
13 consideration, because of your proximity to tribal
14 lands, of offering Diné or Towa [verbatim]?

15 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: I might speak to
16 that.

17 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Go ahead, Garrett.

18 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: I want to make one
19 mention of the tribal lands piece. Our closest
20 member is Taos Pueblo and Picuris. And they both
21 speak Tiwa. In fact, we have several students from
22 our school that are from Taos Pueblo. Tiwa is not
23 really a language of the Taos Pueblo necessarily
24 being taught openly. It's more of a guarded -- I've
25 spoken with a lot with a lot of people at the pueblo

600

1 interesting way of paying teachers. I think that's
2 good. So that's why I just wanted to check, make
3 sure I had heard it correctly. Thank you.

4 MR. MICHAEL VIGIL: Just to give a little
5 historical -- many years ago -- I've been around
6 forever -- we used to pay teachers only over nine
7 months. And what happened was is that teachers did
8 not budget or had issues with summer pay. And so
9 some of them did not save the money to carry them
10 through June, July, and August; and, so, therefore,
11 teachers' unions at the time asked us -- by the
12 Payroll Fair Labor Standards Act, you're required to
13 pay timely on the payroll, as you earn it. But they
14 made an exception for teachers so that we could pay
15 them out over 12 months, versus over nine months, so
16 that we could take care of the teachers so that they
17 could spread -- they don't lose a paycheck.

18 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Sounds good.

19 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Voigt?

20 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you,
21 Madam Chair. And thank you, Mr. Vigil, for those
22 clarifying descriptions.

23 You have been around since fire. And I
24 remember teachers having to go to Alaska and working
25 in the fishing canneries over the summer.

602

1 about this; so it's a little more difficult.

2 I have not considered Diné. I know we
3 have had one student who speaks Diné in our
4 student -- in our school. We have one right now.
5 And it's great, because she gets up there and she'll
6 share all this stuff with us. And it's amazing to
7 see that child light up when she shares these things
8 with the whole school. Like, she sings the Diné
9 birthday song, because we do sing birthday songs in
10 English and Spanish.

11 And even Swedish. Our fifth-grade teacher
12 has introduced Swedish. And then we get our Diné
13 song, so it's great.

14 But I did want to mention that one piece
15 about the tribal lands, that we don't necessary have
16 that opportunity; although, I think it would be
17 awesome. I'll let Ms. Vigil speak to the rest of
18 that.

19 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Yes. And earlier on,
20 last summer, I was in contact with the liaison at
21 the Taos Pueblo that assisted the different public
22 schools. And we were already in contact for her to
23 help us even with tutoring and because of the
24 language and everything.

25 And then all this happened. And I still

<p style="text-align: right;">603</p> <p>1 have, you know, that hope that we will be able to 2 work closely with her.</p> <p>3 And we also have sign language. We have a 4 NECS teacher, a retired teacher, that comes in to do 5 sign language. She does it with our kindergarten 6 through our second-graders. It's just awesome, too.</p> <p>7 So during -- like Gerrit says -- when we 8 would have our morning meetings, we'd have our sign 9 language kiddos. We'd have the different languages. 10 Yeah. And we do have a diverse population. We do 11 have.</p> <p>12 We have an African-American student that's 13 my grandchild. And we have Native Americans and 14 Caucasians. And we just -- we include, and we 15 encourage all the students from our community to 16 come to our school. We want all our students to 17 respect each other.</p> <p>18 And that's our vision, where the students 19 will, you know, respect themselves, the community, 20 and the larger diverse world that we live in, and -- 21 you know, by developing, you know, the necessary 22 goals and everything that we instill at our school.</p> <p>23 So that's what that means, is what we tell 24 them, that we just take care of each other, and we 25 love who we are, you know.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">605</p> <p>1 But just the idea that linguistic 2 diversity is something to be celebrated, that that 3 is something that is in the mission of the IB. 4 Bilingualism is a key component of IB schools. They 5 have to foster bilingualism. So I would love to get 6 a third language at our school.</p> <p>7 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Okay. Thanks for 8 that. And I just want to finish with the Community 9 Schools focus that you have. I think it's wonderful 10 that you're providing the holistic learning for your 11 students. And I'm sure that includes some 12 percentage of 360-degree support for your community.</p> <p>13 And so I commend you on that, because that 14 also is a huge piece for your equity council to be 15 looking at as well.</p> <p>16 I think that the two- to three-year CAP 17 that you just completed and that reset within that 18 time frame was a huge lift. And I want to commend 19 you on your completion of those three pieces within 20 that super-condensed time frame. I think that it 21 was almost unreasonable to ask that a school have 22 that short of a data collection time to demonstrate 23 a completion of a Corrective Action Plan. So 24 congratulations on pulling that off. 25 I think that's all I have. So thank you</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">604</p> <p>1 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: Commissioner Voigt, 2 can I add one more thing?</p> <p>3 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yeah.</p> <p>4 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: I just want to say 5 that one of the things that makes our school unique 6 and I think that makes the IB program unique is that 7 language is really seen as a resource. So we 8 recognize that some of our students bring other 9 languages.</p> <p>10 And, obviously, Spanish is our main 11 linguistic pursuit at our school. And we have -- 12 and I have some information -- I'm kind of 13 anticipating Commissioner Caballero's questions, 14 because I know he's going to ask them, so I was 15 going to save it for him.</p> <p>16 But, you know, just -- we have a huge 17 focus on Spanish language, because that is a home 18 language for many of our students and a heritage 19 language for many of our students.</p> <p>20 But oftentimes we do get students who 21 bring in other -- we've had a Chinese-speaking 22 student. We've had Diné-speaking students. I'm 23 trying to think -- but, again -- and we don't always 24 have the ability to do dual language for those 25 students. And we do ESL or Tiwa.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">606</p> <p>1 very much.</p> <p>2 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Thank you.</p> <p>3 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Chavez?</p> <p>4 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Thank you. Good 5 morning, everyone. I had a couple of questions, but 6 they've -- a lot of them have already been answered. 7 And so I just want to thank everyone for your 8 thoroughness in your responses.</p> <p>9 But I did have a question regarding your 10 bilingual program. And I saw that in K-3, you run a 11 dual-language model. But then in 4-8, you run a 12 Heritage-language model.</p> <p>13 And so I wanted to know why -- why do you 14 offer two different models? It just seems like it 15 would be a smooth transition to continue with the 16 dual-language component. So I'm just wondering why 17 the two different models.</p> <p>18 And then I also wanted to know -- because 19 somebody had mentioned about serving your ELs 20 through the program, which is good. But I wanted to 21 know, then, if your -- if your models, your 22 bilingual models, were -- if they were two-way or if 23 they were one-way programs.</p> <p>24 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Okay. Bilingual -- go 25 ahead, Gerrit.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">607</p> <p>1 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: I was just going to 2 answer the last question you had about the two-way 3 and the one-way. It's two-way. We have -- we've 4 moved -- we had 90/10 in the K-3 cohort, and we've 5 moved to a 50/50, just because of the needs of our 6 students. 7 The -- I guess I won't speak too much 8 about the Heritage. I'll let Ms. Vigil talk about 9 that. I will point out it's a three-hour program in 10 both the dual and the Heritage. 11 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Yes. Yeah. And the 12 reason was -- is, Commissioner Chavez, is that we 13 did start off strong with the 90/10 throughout the 14 school. And then we started revisiting it and 15 resetting ourselves to say, "We can't do it this 16 way." 17 We know the research. We know that's the 18 best model we should have in place. But when our 19 kids would get to the third grade, and they're being 20 taught more in Spanish and they're tested in 21 English, that is where we started saying, "We're 22 doing an injustice to our students." 23 We know the research. They transition 24 over in third grade to the English. But they're not 25 quite prepared in English, because they've been</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">609</p> <p>1 academics. 2 I -- you might know, Mr. Chavez, 3 Commissioner Chavez, that in order for students to 4 test in Spanish, they would have to totally be 5 fluent in Spanish for us to ask for those waivers 6 and all that. So that is one of the reasons why we 7 said, you know, "Let's just give them the 50/50 and 8 do the Heritage model," and it's working wonderfully 9 for us. 10 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: One piece to tag on 11 to that is, for instance, in our Middle Years 12 Program -- and this relates more to IB with the 13 structure of the IB program -- you know, we have 14 eight subjects in the Middle Years Program. And 15 figuring out the English-Spanish split in those 16 subjects, because in our Heritage model, we have our 17 fine arts as a component for the third hour of 18 Spanish language instruction, which is much easier 19 for us to accommodate in the scope of that Middle 20 Years Program as well. 21 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Yeah. And with the 22 kindergarten-to-third-grade social studies, language 23 arts, and math are taught in Spanish and in English. 24 And we have the highly qualified teachers that can 25 do both. They work together closely.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">608</p> <p>1 taught so much in Spanish that we felt that's why 2 our scores were so low. 3 So we did change it to a 50/50, because me 4 being an advocate for bilingualism, I don't want to 5 do away with it at all. We do believe in 6 bilingualism. So we went to the 50/50 model; so 7 with 50 percent being taught in Spanish and 8 50 percent in English with the lower grades. And 9 that's giving them that opportunity that when they 10 get to third grade, they'll have more English also. 11 So it gives them more of the opportunity 12 that they're going to be ready to be tested in 13 English. 14 Our fourth-through-eighth grade, we 15 thought let's do the -- it's still a three-hour 16 program. Both programs are three hours. Heritage 17 model, they already have that Spanish piece in them, 18 and it's to maintain their heritage language. We 19 went through this together as a staff. We decided, 20 "Let's do it this way," again, thinking of our 21 students' needs. 22 Like Mr. Gerrit -- Mr. VanEvery just 23 mentioned, thinking of their needs, thinking of the 24 school's needs, thinking of us as a whole, so we can 25 start showing more progress in our -- in our</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">610</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Okay. Thank you for 2 that clarification. 3 The other question that I had was you 4 talked a little bit about how expensive it is to run 5 your IB program. And I'm just wondering -- you 6 know, we spent a lot of time, and Mr. Vigil did a 7 really good job of explaining, you know, the budget. 8 But I'm also curious as to do you all receive 9 Title I, II, III, and IV monies? 10 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Yes. Yes, we do. 11 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Do you use those 12 funds for your IB costs for training and for 13 registration of the program? 14 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Yes. Title I. We use 15 Title I for that, plus some of our other programs 16 that we can offer. Professional development that we 17 can pay from there? We use those grants also. 18 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Okay. Thank you. 19 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Robbins? 20 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Thank you. I 21 appreciate the presentation and everything that 22 you're doing. And, again, I appreciate the focus 23 that you said you realize the proficiency in reading 24 and math for overall students is not where you'd 25 like to see it, and science also.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">611</p> <p>1 One of the things you mentioned was 2 student support. And this is the thing that I've 3 stressed for years, that if students are coming to 4 school, and they don't -- if they don't have a 5 parent at home who has much education or any higher 6 education, they -- as students progress through 7 school, the parents are not really able to help the 8 student at home, either because they're 9 illiterate -- and that's not any fault of their 10 own -- and that schools -- you know, we've been 11 focusing on early childhood education for the last 12 couple of years, and they just started this whole 13 new program. 14 And I'm saying that's fine. But if you 15 look at what early childhood education is all about, 16 it's about working with the parents to help their 17 kids. And this is the thing that -- you know, do 18 you have any sort of outreach, evening programs, 19 things like that, helping your parents of the 20 students to help them learn? 21 Maybe, you know -- we talk about, you 22 know, having -- having them get their GEDs, things 23 like that. But the thing is if parents are not 24 able -- and, again, they're working full-time or 25 doing things -- if they're not able to help their</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">613</p> <p>1 the beginning, before we got started that we were 2 distributing out the computers that they were coming 3 in, we would sit with them. 4 I have Ms. Tanya. And she has an 5 assistant that helps her. They would sit together 6 with the parent and go through the process. They 7 made little cheat notes for them on how to get in, 8 you know, how to manipulate, because it is 9 difficult. And we do also have students living with 10 grandparents. So it is. 11 But what they do, we have -- during my 12 newsletters every week, we have a communication 13 piece that I will tell them, "Let us know what you 14 need. Contact us." 15 They contact us. We -- I get Ms. Tanya 16 on. And Tanya can speak a little bit more on that 17 behalf. And her and her assistant get on. And they 18 walk them through at the beginning when we were 19 letting parents still come in. But now, of course, 20 we don't. But, still, if they call, they can go; 21 they can Zoom. They do Zoom meetings with parents. 22 So -- because they're frustrated. They do 23 get frustrated. We still hear a lot of parents -- 24 like with the kindergarteners, they're right there 25 helping them get on. You can see them sitting there</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">612</p> <p>1 students and they're not savvy working with students 2 or things like that, the students are, like, I can 3 only get help when school is in session or things 4 like that. 5 Are you able -- is it really just a 6 funding constraint of being able to support the 7 parents? And, again, I think we do a disservice to 8 our students when we are not supporting the parents 9 also. 10 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Exactly. 11 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Can you address 12 that? 13 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Yes. We do have 14 student support. We forgot to mention all that. 15 But in fact, Commissioner -- Robbins -- right? 16 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes. 17 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Through our Community 18 Schools grant, we have opened up a lot of our 19 programs to assist our parents. For example, we had 20 to train our parents on how to even get -- open up 21 the computer, how to get the kids in, how to get 22 them to manipulate Google Classroom or Canvas, you 23 know, what the students use as a learning management 24 system. 25 And the teachers have been awesome. In</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">614</p> <p>1 next to the student. 2 And then they'll say, Ms. Driskell, 3 Ms. Gallegos, can I stay afterwards so that you can 4 show me how we need to do what we're doing? 5 So we are. We're providing all that 6 student support to our parents, grandparents, so we 7 can assure that the kids are getting on. The kids 8 are doing the work. 9 And to release some of that stress, 10 because it is very stressful. Like I always start 11 my meetings with the parents, "We understand, in 12 these challenging times, and we're here to help 13 you." 14 So, yes, they are doing that. We are in 15 the process also of getting a parents -- 16 after-school, in-the-evenings classes. With our 17 Community Schools grant money, we are going to have, 18 for example, some ex-educators teach classes in 19 Spanish, teach classes in English, to our 20 monolingual parents. 21 So all that is in the works. We are doing 22 everything possible to make these challenging times 23 a little easier for our students and our parents. 24 Yes. 25 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Thank you,</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">615</p> <p>1 Ms. Vigil. I think those community programs, those 2 after-school programs for the parents will really 3 pay off tremendously over the next couple of years. 4 And this is a thing that I wish more students would 5 do with the parents, especially if they have, you 6 know, non-English speaking children, and the parents 7 don't speak or read English, getting them integrated 8 is very important. And I think your 50/50 model is 9 a good way of doing that.</p> <p>10 Addressing Mr. Michael Vigil's thing about 11 the finances, I just want to get clarification. Are 12 you telling me that the schools, charters, have 13 still not received their first-quarter lease 14 payments from PSFA?</p> <p>15 MR. VIGIL: Yes. Yes.</p> <p>16 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Okay. I'm on the 17 Public School Capital Outlay Council. I will 18 contact Jonathan Chamblin today, find out what's 19 going on, and I will raise this as a concern in our 20 Monday meeting.</p> <p>21 I think that is a disservice. It simply, 22 I think, has to do with -- I don't know if it's DFA 23 that's holding it up. But, you know, us 24 Commissioners, you know, we get a small stipend to 25 attend these meetings, you know. I've gotten paid</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">617</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Thank you. 2 THE CHAIR: Thank you. Commissioner 3 Caballero, I think, has been preparing himself. 4 So...</p> <p>5 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Well -- yes, 6 thank you. I will ask my ongoing question about 7 demographics, what kind of students they have and 8 whether they feel that their school mirrors the 9 demographics, and, if not, what are their challenges 10 and how do they figure to bring other students in. 11 Because, again, it helps all students. Students 12 that may or may not need the charter school will 13 benefit from -- from other type of students, their 14 interaction.</p> <p>15 So that is one question. 16 I have a couple more, not big questions. 17 Thank you.</p> <p>18 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Mr. VanEvery can 19 address the demographics.</p> <p>20 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: And I want to 21 address that question, because I think it's really, 22 really -- it's always a relevant question, 23 particularly with charter schools. I just have a 24 little graphic I want to share. Let me see if I can 25 figure this out.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">616</p> <p>1 for my September and October meetings. It's now 2 December.</p> <p>3 So over the last two years, we've seen -- 4 and I'll say this. We've seen a degradation in the 5 financial capability of the State paying their bills 6 in a timely manner. That is a huge concern, because 7 it puts stress on the schools, and it requires them 8 to carry higher cash balances than may otherwise be 9 necessary just so that they can continue making 10 those lease payments.</p> <p>11 And it prevents them from starting 12 programs or continuing programs when they have to 13 just cover their lease payments with those funds 14 rather than other programs. So I will address that, 15 and I appreciate your clarification on that.</p> <p>16 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Thank you.</p> <p>17 MR. VIGIL: Thank you, 18 Commissioner Robbins.</p> <p>19 MS. NADINE VIGIL: I also want to mention 20 all our correspondence goes out in English and 21 Spanish. We have -- probably 90 percent of our 22 staff is bilingual, maybe 100 percent. We're all 23 bilingual. So we have translators in place if we 24 need to translate in Spanish to anybody. So it's 25 great.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">618</p> <p>1 Okay. There we go. Give me just a second 2 here. All right. Let me just -- current slide. 3 Okay.</p> <p>4 I just want to point this out. It's kind 5 of like the elephant in the room in Taos charter 6 schools; because we have six charter schools in the 7 Taos Municipal School District, within those 8 boundaries. Five of those serve K-8 students. So I 9 have not included the one that is just a high school 10 here.</p> <p>11 However, you can see the demographics of 12 those charter schools is somewhat problematic, 13 because the -- you can see we have three groups 14 here. And the reason these three groups are 15 included is because these are all groups that are 16 identified as high-risk. And then the 17 Yazzie/Martinez lawsuit. And then there's also 18 groups that are highly represented at our school.</p> <p>19 So -- you know. And when we look at the 20 other charter schools in Taos, we can see the 21 percentage of Hispanic students. You know, we're at 22 88 percent. And, actually, I think this is -- this 23 data is two years old. I think it's -- from the 24 New Mexico schools. But I was looking at another 25 one that said 89. So we're up there. We're at</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">619</p> <p>1 98 percent economically disadvantaged, and we're at 2 20 percent ELL.</p> <p>3 When you compare those numbers to the 4 other charter schools in Taos, you can see there is 5 a huge difference between the populations that they 6 serve and the population that we serve.</p> <p>7 Now, I'm not here to try to uncover the 8 meaning of all of that. But what I am here to say 9 is that when we look at the Taos Municipal Schools, 10 K-8, if you look at all the Taos Municipal School 11 data, it will include the district charters and the 12 high school, which tend to be a little bit more 13 diverse.</p> <p>14 But when you look at just K-8, which is 15 their three non-charter elementaries and their one 16 charter middle school, the demographics are 17 77 percent Hispanic, 98 percent economically 18 disadvantaged, and 10 percent EL.</p> <p>19 I want to point those numbers out, because 20 I think, having worked in two charter schools and 21 having worked also in two of the Taos Municipal 22 Schools, I've worked in two of the elementary 23 schools, the big difference between the charters and 24 the municipal schools is that the charters offer 25 students an innovative educational program.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">621</p> <p>1 for these students who are otherwise not served by 2 charter schools at the level they should be.</p> <p>3 Because I think that it presents -- like 4 we all know here, we're all proponents of the 5 charter schools. And I was not a proponent of 6 charter schools. I was dead-set against them at one 7 point in my life until I went and worked in one and 8 realized, "Oh, man, this is awesome."</p> <p>9 So having -- in answer to your question, 10 Commissioner Caballero, we would love to have a more 11 reflective mix of students from our community. Even 12 when we're compared to the Taos schools, we are 13 predominantly Hispanic. We are predominantly -- we 14 have a lot of EL students, and we're 15 disproportionately high in both of those 16 departments.</p> <p>17 I think one of the reasons is because we 18 are the only school in Taos that offers a culturally 19 and linguistically relevant education to Hispanic 20 students. And I think about Six Directions 21 Indigenous School in Gallup and their emphasis on 22 that for their Native American students, and I see a 23 similar pattern occurring with us.</p> <p>24 And here, students are validated; their 25 culture is respected, taught. And when the students</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">620</p> <p>1 And I know when I had the opportunity to 2 go work for -- I actually worked for Roots & Wings. 3 But when I had that opportunity to leave the public 4 school, I was actually laid off as a first-year 5 teacher. But I had done my student teaching there. 6 But to come to the charter schools and see that 7 mission and innovation that's occurring in the 8 charter schools, and to contrast that with my 9 experience in other schools was mind-blowing.</p> <p>10 And I think what's critical to understand 11 here is that we are out of whack when it comes to 12 the demographics; right? Like, we are 13 disproportionately Hispanic, economically 14 disadvantaged, and ELL. We're great with that, 15 because, you know, these -- we love our students. 16 You know, this is wonderful for us. But we're the 17 only charter school in Taos that is serving these 18 students at this level.</p> <p>19 And so, for me, it just -- it reminds me 20 that there's -- there's been a criticism in Taos of 21 charter schools always serving a more privileged 22 demographic and a more Caucasian demographic. And 23 so I just want to point that out that we -- for some 24 reason, we have attracted a different group of 25 students. And I think it's a tremendous opportunity</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">622</p> <p>1 look at the staff, you know, they see a reflection 2 of themselves.</p> <p>3 We have a very diverse staff. Most of our 4 staff is Hispanic; most are from Northern 5 New Mexico. But we also have staff from Mexico. We 6 have Native American; we have Caucasian; "Anglo" in 7 Taos is the word; but, you know, Caucasian.</p> <p>8 So we have a reflective mix of people in 9 our staff that the students can see themselves in. 10 And I think, you know, I teach at the middle-school 11 level, and we get a lot of these students coming in 12 from the middle school who transfer in. And there's 13 no bilingual program; there's no three-hour program 14 at the middle school. So many of them come here. I 15 think that's why our ELs are disproportionately high 16 because they're validated.</p> <p>17 Like Ms. Vigil said, most of our staff 18 speak Spanish. And the ones who don't have their 19 TESOL.</p> <p>20 So we have a staff that is compassionate 21 and offers a level of -- an ethic of care and 22 compassion for these students.</p> <p>23 So I'm not sure if I totally answered your 24 question, Commissioner Caballero, because I know 25 your concern is mixing -- is getting a</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">623</p> <p>1 representative mix of students. Am I correct?</p> <p>2 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Right. And you</p> <p>3 totally answered -- I -- you answered what I</p> <p>4 suspected. And I suspected that you're a magnet</p> <p>5 for -- for that type of student. And the parents</p> <p>6 taking their kids to your school just speaks and</p> <p>7 yells very loud that you provide the type of</p> <p>8 education that their children, who are primarily</p> <p>9 Spanish-speaking, need.</p> <p>10 And so it does -- so it still gives you a</p> <p>11 challenge trying to bring in other type of students.</p> <p>12 And it would depend on how you market to those</p> <p>13 parents.</p> <p>14 And it is a challenge. I know -- I went</p> <p>15 to 100 percent predominantly Spanish schools in</p> <p>16 El Paso. And there wasn't -- there was one Anglo</p> <p>17 kid in my school, only because his father was a</p> <p>18 preacher, and he chose to set up his church in the</p> <p>19 neighborhood to help out the drug addicts and the</p> <p>20 alcoholic addicts in that area, and he did a</p> <p>21 fantastic job. But Gerald Smith became Hispanic.</p> <p>22 He spoke Spanish, and he was just like us. He was</p> <p>23 just very light.</p> <p>24 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: Anglo-Hispano como</p> <p>25 yo.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">625</p> <p>1 and help each other. Because community help by</p> <p>2 students is what's understood and is a given in</p> <p>3 Mexico. We had to help each other out.</p> <p>4 And teachers had to encourage that,</p> <p>5 because there were 40, 50 students in each class.</p> <p>6 And we would hide when we were helping each other,</p> <p>7 when a teacher would go by, thinking that it was</p> <p>8 cheating.</p> <p>9 So by the time I got to sixth, seventh</p> <p>10 grade, the teacher encouraged that openly. And he</p> <p>11 would even put us in little groups so that we could</p> <p>12 get used to doing that.</p> <p>13 And we did very well. We would get</p> <p>14 together before school, during lunch, after school,</p> <p>15 the weekends. And that teacher was teaching -- by</p> <p>16 the time we got to seventh grade, he was teaching</p> <p>17 eighth- and part of ninth-grade math. And we didn't</p> <p>18 know. But he gave us the challenge. Bringing in</p> <p>19 books from other schools that were no longer being</p> <p>20 used.</p> <p>21 And they were terrible. They were. Some</p> <p>22 had no covers. By the time we got to high school,</p> <p>23 we were going over stuff that we had already gone</p> <p>24 through.</p> <p>25 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Great.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">624</p> <p>1 MS. NADINE VIGIL: It's like Mr. VanEvery.</p> <p>2 He has become one of us.</p> <p>3 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Right. In math,</p> <p>4 that's probably the only area that parents can be</p> <p>5 very instrumental in. And one of the Commissioners</p> <p>6 mentioned already parents and using the Community</p> <p>7 School.</p> <p>8 And I can -- by experience, I can tell you</p> <p>9 my parents couldn't help me. But they took out the</p> <p>10 whip, and they understood math very well. And if I</p> <p>11 wasn't doing math at home, if I didn't have to, I</p> <p>12 had to bring in books home for homework, and I had</p> <p>13 to show them. And if I had done all my homework,</p> <p>14 they would give me more.</p> <p>15 And the only thing they could understand</p> <p>16 was math, because it's worldwide. Everybody has to</p> <p>17 understand it.</p> <p>18 And so did you mention that Spanish can</p> <p>19 also be taught -- math can be taught in Spanish?</p> <p>20 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Yes. Yeah.</p> <p>21 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Oh, okay. That's</p> <p>22 fantastic. That's fantastic.</p> <p>23 The other experience that I had growing up</p> <p>24 in a totally Hispanic school was that as an</p> <p>25 immigrant, all of us, as immigrants, we would try</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">626</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: And so the lesson</p> <p>2 that I learned was that all of us help each other</p> <p>3 with math. We continued through high school. We</p> <p>4 continued through the university. We all enrolled</p> <p>5 for engineering. Of course, I didn't stay in</p> <p>6 engineering. I went to social science.</p> <p>7 But they all graduated with engineering</p> <p>8 degrees, and they all stayed helping each other as</p> <p>9 groups, even through the four years of engineering,</p> <p>10 and which, in this day and age, how do you -- how do</p> <p>11 you encourage students to help each other out as</p> <p>12 they're moving up? Maybe just in math, can it be</p> <p>13 done through Internet? I don't know.</p> <p>14 But I know it was -- it was an enriching</p> <p>15 and very helpful way of -- of staying up in math,</p> <p>16 helping the students. I know that also in the</p> <p>17 seventh grade, we were asked to tutor some of our --</p> <p>18 the lower-grade kids, the next grade down. And some</p> <p>19 of our very, very bright students would hook up with</p> <p>20 one or two students during lunch hour and help them</p> <p>21 out. And teachers had to do that, because our</p> <p>22 schools were packed with students. We didn't see</p> <p>23 that in the Anglo schools.</p> <p>24 But we saw that very much in the Hispanic</p> <p>25 schools. We were packed, hand-me downs and -- the</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">627</p> <p>1 one thing that I have to say is that you guys keep 2 the same teachers. And I would say that because we 3 had teachers that stayed there till way after 4 retirement age, that made a difference for us. It 5 provided us with very, very good education, with all 6 the challenges that we had. And I commend you for 7 keeping that.</p> <p>8 And the rest of my questions were answered 9 through other Commissioners, and I thank you.</p> <p>10 I do -- one little last question. Does 11 the program, IB, require a certain type of level 12 progress by students to stay within the program? Or 13 not?</p> <p>14 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: Well -- and I know 15 what you're getting at, because oftentimes -- I know 16 Sandia High School in Albuquerque has an IB program, 17 and I think there's a magnet school in Santa Fe, 18 right? It's often an enrichment track for students 19 who are pursuing, at a high level, college and 20 career, those types of the things.</p> <p>21 Because we don't offer the IB Diploma 22 Programme, and because we don't offer five years of 23 the Middle Years Programme, we are not required to 24 necessarily have our students engage in the types of 25 E-assessments and things that would require that</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">629</p> <p>1 code, based on their demographics, based on, you 2 know, their circumstances. And so offering them 3 that.</p> <p>4 And I agree with Chairwoman Patricia in 5 that -- sorry -- that, you know, not everyone goes 6 to college, right? That's not what we're advocating 7 is that everyone -- but everyone should have a fair 8 shake and a fair opportunity to go, regardless of -- 9 so the equity piece.</p> <p>10 But, no, there's nothing to preclude those 11 students from participating whatsoever. But it is a 12 high -- it's a demanding course. It's rigorous. 13 And, you know, the students have to want to be 14 there. A student who doesn't want to be there, it's 15 going to be tough.</p> <p>16 And we support them. But, generally, we 17 found our students, they want to be in the school. 18 They like it there. It's a good environment for 19 them.</p> <p>20 MS. NADINE VIGIL: And, Commissioner 21 Caballero, just to your other comment about working 22 groups, through the inquiry-based instruction that 23 we do, the teachers encourage the students to work 24 in groups. And now that we are on remotely, thank 25 God for Zoom has breakout rooms, so they work on</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">628</p> <p>1 they pass these things to receive the IB diploma. 2 So, no.</p> <p>3 However, when we design our units of 4 inquiry, you know, the learning units, they are 5 designed with certain specifications in mind, right? 6 Like, we have to teach certain concepts. And also 7 we use rubrics to assist students.</p> <p>8 So we have rubrics where we can show 9 achievement at different levels. And we're 10 transitioning into that method of reporting with 11 students and to parents and all that.</p> <p>12 And it is a huge transition. Because it's 13 less of, you know, like, "You did these assignments, 14 you got this completion percentage," to, "How are 15 you truly demonstrating mastery of the subject?"</p> <p>16 And so IB has qualifications.</p> <p>17 Now, there's nothing to preclude a student 18 who is not functioning at a high level from that 19 program. But, oftentimes, because it is rigorous, 20 and it has these higher levels of achievement, we 21 see it used as a college preparatory program.</p> <p>22 So I think what's exciting about our 23 school is that we have students who aren't on the 24 college track, but who maybe could be, you know, and 25 have been excluded from that based on their ZIP</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">630</p> <p>1 that. They work in groups, you know, together. And 2 it's exciting to see that.</p> <p>3 They're still working in groups. They 4 still develop or come up with their projects or 5 whatever it is that the teachers are expecting of 6 them. And so they still have that opportunity to 7 work in the break-out rooms and in groups.</p> <p>8 THE CHAIR: Thank you.</p> <p>9 Commissioner Armbruster?</p> <p>10 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: I remembered to 11 unmute.</p> <p>12 Yes. I have a number of questions. I 13 want to, first of all, congratulate you on how well 14 you are doing. Seems like a large improvement in 15 the last few years. And, of course, the one part of 16 your CAP which we can't really address at this 17 moment for numerous reasons is the Exceed or Meet 18 the State proficiency for ELL and math -- not ELL -- 19 ELA. And so that's sort of just hanging in there.</p> <p>20 But the number of things -- I have a 21 number of questions here, so let me go through them.</p> <p>22 So are you involved in New Mexico DASH, 23 NM DASH?</p> <p>24 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Yes, we are. We are 25 involved with the New Mexico DASH, yes. Everything</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">631</p> <p>1 has been provided to them and everything has been 2 approved. 3 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Great. So then 4 for -- to increase the original thing that I 5 mentioned about State proficiency, so are you 6 adopting some different programs or some different 7 approaches or something along that line to kind of 8 help? 9 MS. NADINE VIGIL: We have, as a staff, 10 worked together on our ongoing strategic plan. I 11 don't know, Gerrit, if you have it on PowerPoint. 12 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: No, I didn't pull 13 that one up. I would say, just to mention, the IB 14 program, our focus has been just to implement that 15 with fidelity as much as possible, because it is a 16 research-based program that is shown to generate 17 long-term student improvement. 18 However, we -- it's not limited -- 19 certainly not limited to that. I know in math -- 20 and there's different groups -- I mean, pullout 21 groups, small groups. Tutoring has been a big one 22 with the Community Schools program that we've 23 implemented, and then a math coach. 24 One of our former teachers who always 25 managed to get her students super-proficient on the</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">633</p> <p>1 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: And like 2 Commissioner Caballero said about -- you know, 3 holding these high expectations for students -- and 4 I think the IB has those high expectations -- and 5 that they can achieve. Like, once even these 6 students that are coming in low, if we can get them 7 to buy in. 8 Because I think we have -- we get students 9 transferring in, particularly at the middle-school 10 level, who have not had success before in the 11 schools. And so, you know, our main focus is to get 12 students motivated to learn. Because I think 13 once -- once you're motivated, I think that's what 14 lies in the success of the IB is that when you have 15 that intrinsic motivation to learn, you can 16 accomplish anything. 17 I mean, you can make up those deficiencies 18 or not -- gaps, learning gaps, whatever you want to 19 call them. But no. We're just constantly trying to 20 improve. 21 I was even going to say, maybe we could 22 get Commissioner Caballero to come over and work 23 with some of our students in building the community 24 of math. 25 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: About what</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">632</p> <p>1 NWEA, especially, we've got her working with -- her 2 student teacher actually took over her position when 3 she retired, which was exciting. And so she's 4 working with us as sort of an area of strength for 5 her. 6 She knows the school; she knows the 7 students. So I'm not sure which -- which PowerPoint 8 you were talking about, Ms. Vigil. 9 MS. NADINE VIGIL: I don't know if you had 10 put our ongoing strategic plan that we all worked on 11 and that we say is not limited to, but teachers are 12 using the data, of course, to customize and 13 differentiate instructional planning for their 14 class; individual students in groups, our attention 15 to increasing rigor for low-achieving students, 16 low-income students, students with disabilities, 17 English Learners, students of color and 18 high-achieving students, you know, ongoing -- 19 ongoing professional development. 20 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: Oh, yeah. I know 21 which one you're talking about. 22 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: I think that 23 kind of covered everybody in that group. I was 24 reading that, and I thought, is there somebody else 25 who fits in there?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">634</p> <p>1 percentage of special ed do you have? About what 2 percentage are identified as special ed students? 3 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Our special ed 4 students, we have a total of 13 students right now 5 that are on IEPs. So, basically -- 6 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: I can get the exact 7 number, if you want. 8 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Is it more like 9 B-level students? 10 MS. NADINE VIGIL: We have some A's, and 11 we do have some B, yeah. 12 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: And this is just 13 a question for someone who truly wishes she were 14 bilingual. That would be me who I'm talking about. 15 So, in a sense, at your school, isn't 16 everyone an EL student? Because I, as an 17 English-only speaker, being in a classroom of 18 50 percent Spanish, would be equally a disadvantage 19 as the opposite way. Is that right? 20 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: I have to speak on 21 this one, because I totally agree with you, right? 22 All of our students are English Language Learners. 23 And the criteria that the State uses is, when 24 students come to us, if they indicate another 25 language on the language usage survey, they're given</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">635</p> <p>1 what's called the WAPS test; you guys probably know 2 this, but in case you don't. And they have to score 3 a certain number. And if they don't, they're put in 4 EL. 5 Consequently, some students who don't 6 speak Spanish, but have some Spanish spoken in their 7 home, get identified as English Language Learners 8 because they're unable to pass that WAPS test. 9 So we -- it's interesting, because we do 10 have students that fall into that category and all, 11 that they're not fluent in Spanish, but they're 12 designated as ELs. And it's because -- and, you 13 know, rightly so. You've had language shift over 14 generations. 15 But, yeah, definitely, everyone is a 16 language learner at our school. And language 17 informs language. That's what we believe. We 18 believe if you learn in your home language, you will 19 learn in your second language. 20 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: I think it's 21 wonderful to learn it, particularly when you start 22 at third. 23 So this is a -- I'm sorry I'm jumping 24 around with these questions, but I put them down as 25 I remembered them.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">637</p> <p>1 Nadine Vigil. 2 I'm -- somewhere in my mind, I remember -- 3 and I'm glad that it's incorrect at the moment -- 4 that you were mentioning that the kids were going to 5 learn Mandarin. Was that true? Or am I actually 6 making that up? 7 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Yes, we did have 8 Mandarin at the beginning, when we started back in 9 2014. We had it through the first two years. And 10 then we dissolved it through IB. We did dissolve 11 it, and through the Public Education Commission, 12 also, because our Mandarin Chinese teacher left. 13 She was a really young, young woman. And her and 14 her husband left to another state, and it was really 15 difficult to get a Mandarin Chinese teacher. 16 But we did have it. We did have it at the 17 beginning. 18 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: That's fine. 19 Because I kept remembering that. And I kept saying, 20 "I don't see this, so how is that possible?" 21 Okay. I think I did it. Thank you very 22 much. 23 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Thank you. 24 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you. 25 If there's no other questions, I am going</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">636</p> <p>1 With this year beginning in -- whenever -- 2 August, September -- did the kids come to school at 3 all? The K-5s? 4 MS. NADINE VIGIL: No, they've never been 5 in school. We have been totally remote. 6 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: But everyone is 7 seen -- all kids are seen four days a week. 8 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Yes. 9 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Just wanted to 10 be sure I had that correct. 11 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Also on Wednesday, when 12 they do check-ins with them. So they're still 13 checking in with them. 14 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Yes, that's 15 great. So I just wanted to see about that. 16 And this is just a comment. But 17 oftentimes the Native American languages are really 18 quite guarded. I know around where I live, it is, 19 so that only Tiwa speakers can even take that class. 20 So somebody asked a question about that. And I 21 think that's pretty widespread in terms of doing 22 that. 23 The other one -- let me see. I did this 24 one, this one. I just wanted to chat with you, 25 Ms. Vigil. I hope there's only one Ms. Vigil on.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">638</p> <p>1 to move that the Public Education Commission enter 2 into a Closed Session, pursuant to NMSA Section 3 10-15-1(H)(1). The subject to be discussed pertains 4 to issuance of a charter license renewal for Taos 5 International School. 6 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Second. 7 THE CHAIR: There's a motion by 8 Commissioner Gipson, a second by Commissioner Voigt. 9 Commissioner Armbruster? 10 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 11 Caballero? You're on mute. One second. We're 12 waiting for -- 13 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes. 14 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay. That's 15 fine. 16 Commissioner Raftery? 17 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: Yes. 18 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 19 Armbruster votes "Yes." 20 Commissioner Chavez? 21 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes. 22 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 23 Gipson? 24 THE CHAIR: Yes. 25 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p>

639	<p>1 Davis?</p> <p>2 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Yes.</p> <p>3 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>4 Voigt?</p> <p>5 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes.</p> <p>6 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>7 Robbins?</p> <p>8 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes.</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>10 Crone?</p> <p>11 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Yes.</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>13 Ruiz?</p> <p>14 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes.</p> <p>15 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay. Motion</p> <p>16 passes, ten-to-zero.</p> <p>17 THE CHAIR: Thank you. Commissioners,</p> <p>18 we're still using the same link. So see you in a</p> <p>19 few minutes.</p> <p>20 (Executive Session held.)</p> <p>21 THE CHAIR: So I move that the Public</p> <p>22 Education Commission end Closed Session. The</p> <p>23 matters discussed in the closed meeting were limited</p> <p>24 only to those specified in the motion for closure,</p> <p>25 and no vote was taken during the Closed Session.</p>	641	<p>1 Davis?</p> <p>2 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Yes.</p> <p>3 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>4 Chavez?</p> <p>5 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes.</p> <p>6 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>7 Armbruster votes "Yes."</p> <p>8 Commissioner Raftery?</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: Yes.</p> <p>10 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>11 Caballero?</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes.</p> <p>13 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: That is</p> <p>14 ten-to-zero, and the motion passes to come out.</p> <p>15 THE CHAIR: Okay, thank. You.</p> <p>16 Commissioner Crone?</p> <p>17 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Yes. Thank you. I</p> <p>18 move that the New Mexico Public Education Commission</p> <p>19 renew the charter of Taos International School for a</p> <p>20 period of five years, beginning July 1st, 2021, and</p> <p>21 extending to June 30th, 2026.</p> <p>22 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Second.</p> <p>23 THE CHAIR: There's a motion by</p> <p>24 Commissioner Crone, a second by Commissioner</p> <p>25 Caballero.</p>
640	<p>1 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Second.</p> <p>2 THE CHAIR: There's a motion by</p> <p>3 Commissioner Gipson and -- I didn't hear. Sorry.</p> <p>4 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Second.</p> <p>5 THE CHAIR: There's a second by</p> <p>6 Commissioner Voigt.</p> <p>7 Commissioner Armbruster?</p> <p>8 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>9 Ruiz?</p> <p>10 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes. I'm glad you can</p> <p>11 hear me.</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: I can. Quite</p> <p>13 well, as a matter of fact.</p> <p>14 Commissioner Crone?</p> <p>15 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Yes.</p> <p>16 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>17 Voigt?</p> <p>18 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes.</p> <p>19 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>20 Robbins?</p> <p>21 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes.</p> <p>22 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>23 Gipson?</p> <p>24 THE CHAIR: Yes.</p> <p>25 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p>	642	<p>1 If there's no further discussion,</p> <p>2 Commissioner Armbruster?</p> <p>3 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>4 Voigt?</p> <p>5 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes.</p> <p>6 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>7 Ruiz?</p> <p>8 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes.</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>10 Crone?</p> <p>11 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Yes.</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>13 Robbins?</p> <p>14 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes.</p> <p>15 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>16 Caballero?</p> <p>17 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes.</p> <p>18 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>19 Raftery?</p> <p>20 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: Yes.</p> <p>21 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>22 Armbruster votes "Yes."</p> <p>23 Commissioner Chavez?</p> <p>24 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes.</p> <p>25 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p>

643	<p>1 Gipson?</p> <p>2 THE CHAIR: Yes.</p> <p>3 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>4 Davis?</p> <p>5 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Yes.</p> <p>6 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: I think I got</p> <p>7 everybody. Ten-to-zero vote to pass.</p> <p>8 THE CHAIR: Motion passes, ten-zero.</p> <p>9 Congratulations. Thank you.</p> <p>10 Thank you. Thank you for everything that</p> <p>11 you do every day. This truly is the story of two</p> <p>12 completely different schools from three years ago,</p> <p>13 and we appreciate everything that you've done for</p> <p>14 this reset and everything that you're going to</p> <p>15 continue to do.</p> <p>16 And no doubt about the fact what you're</p> <p>17 being asked to do and how you're continuing to meet</p> <p>18 the needs of the kids and families during this</p> <p>19 particularly trying time. We really do appreciate</p> <p>20 this. And thank you, thank you, thank you. And we</p> <p>21 will see you in the spring for contract negotiations</p> <p>22 in some format; so we look forward to that.</p> <p>23 Congratulations once again.</p> <p>24 MS. NADINE VIGIL: Thank you. Thank you,</p> <p>25 all.</p>	645	<p>1 this time, the additional effort and energy and</p> <p>2 burden that it created, we truly recognize the</p> <p>3 challenges that were presented through this early</p> <p>4 fall.</p> <p>5 So thank you.</p> <p>6 So as normal, CSD will offer their --</p> <p>7 whatever information they want to guide us through</p> <p>8 with. The school will have the 15 minutes to</p> <p>9 present whatever they wish.</p> <p>10 And I apologize. I don't remember from</p> <p>11 your renewal application. Do you have a separate</p> <p>12 presentation?</p> <p>13 MR. ERIC AHNER: Madam Chair and the</p> <p>14 Commission, we do have a presentation that we'd like</p> <p>15 to present after our --</p> <p>16 THE CHAIR: All right. So then you'll</p> <p>17 have that additional 15 minutes. Then we'll do</p> <p>18 public input, if there's anyone that has signed up.</p> <p>19 And then we'll move into our questions.</p> <p>20 And, of course, your 15 minutes, the two</p> <p>21 sets of 15 minutes and the public comment, is being</p> <p>22 timed by Beverly. And she has little nudges that</p> <p>23 she will put up letting you know if you're coming</p> <p>24 close to the expiration of your time.</p> <p>25 So thank you once again.</p>
644	<p>1 MR. GERRIT VanEVERY: Thank you.</p> <p>2 THE CHAIR: Thank you. Stay safe.</p> <p>3 MS. KAREN WOERNER: School</p> <p>4 representatives, if you don't leave, I will be</p> <p>5 moving you to the Attendees list so you can still</p> <p>6 watch the meeting if you wish. But you will be</p> <p>7 cyber-Zoomed off.</p> <p>8 THE CHAIR: Commissioners, while Karen is</p> <p>9 doing that, do we want to take a 10-, 15-minute</p> <p>10 break between schools?</p> <p>11 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes, please.</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes.</p> <p>13 THE CHAIR: All right. Let's do that.</p> <p>14 Thanks.</p> <p>15 (Recess taken, 11:37 a.m. to 12:05 p.m.)</p> <p>16 THE CHAIR: So now that we've, you know,</p> <p>17 tried to solve the problems of the world here,</p> <p>18 welcome, everyone. Thanks for indulging us. Good</p> <p>19 to see everyone. And thanks for all your time and</p> <p>20 effort and energy that you've put into this renewal</p> <p>21 application.</p> <p>22 We spend quite a bit of time revising it</p> <p>23 all the time, so we do know the extra challenges it</p> <p>24 takes to try to get it done in -- if there is normal</p> <p>25 times -- in normal times. But, certainly, during</p>	646	<p>1 Karen, you ready?</p> <p>2 MS. KAREN WOERNER: I am ready,</p> <p>3 Madam Chair. Thank you.</p> <p>4 Madam Chair, Commissioners, school</p> <p>5 representatives, the J. Paul Taylor Academy, as you</p> <p>6 know, serves K through eighth grade in Las Cruces,</p> <p>7 New Mexico.</p> <p>8 As I understand, their first charter</p> <p>9 contract, they opened their school in 2011 and were</p> <p>10 renewed in 2016. So this would be their second</p> <p>11 renewal before the Commission.</p> <p>12 And as you saw in your packet, their --</p> <p>13 PED recommends a renewal term of five years.</p> <p>14 The school earned 55 points, Spotlight</p> <p>15 School designation, which is worthy of celebration,</p> <p>16 in 2018-'19, the most recent year with State data.</p> <p>17 In addition, they received designations of</p> <p>18 excellence in science proficiency and English</p> <p>19 Learner progress. And the school met its four</p> <p>20 charter goals during that same year.</p> <p>21 The school's organizational performance</p> <p>22 ratings are very good, with mostly Meeting</p> <p>23 Standards. The aud- -- most recent published audit</p> <p>24 had three findings; zero were repeat. But this is</p> <p>25 an improvement over prior years, where there were</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">647</p> <p>1 some material weaknesses or significant 2 deficiencies. And those have been corrected and not 3 repeated. 4 The school spends an average of just over 5 70 percent of its budget on instructional costs, 6 which exceeds the expectation of 68 percent. And 7 they also have -- their administrative support is 8 approximately 21 percent. 9 They've had a consistent enrollment 10 throughout the contract term of 200 students. And, 11 as I understand, they usually have a waiting list 12 because that is their cap. 13 The school previously had a nonprofit 14 foundation, but it's since been dissolved. In lieu 15 of that foundation, the school did form a committee 16 of community members that does provide some support 17 for the school, but not as a separate nonprofit 18 foundation. 19 Also -- I want to share my screen. As you 20 see in your packet, their evaluation of their Part B 21 Progress Report shows Meets Standards or 22 Demonstrating Substantial Progress. And I remind 23 you that if they don't meet the full standard each 24 year of the contract, they have -- the highest they 25 can earn is Demonstrates Substantial Progress.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">649</p> <p>1 instructional costs versus administrative costs. 2 And, as you can see, they had to dip a 3 little bit into their reserves in terms of comparing 4 operational revenue to expenses in the '18-'19 5 school year, but are doing well. 6 Next, on enrollment, on Page 22 -- trying 7 to put the numbers in so you don't have to scroll -- 8 so within the school year, you can see that 9 retention within the school year is extremely high, 10 93 to 98 percent throughout the contract term. 11 Students stay enrolled. 12 And then between school years, also well 13 over the -- the current contract says 85 percent. 14 They have been at 87 to 91 with a slight increase 15 there. So students are remaining enrolled between 16 school years as well. 17 Teacher retention has been good. As you 18 know, small schools and staff changes have a big 19 impact. 20 The audit findings. As I mentioned 21 earlier, they had some that were considered material 22 weaknesses or significant deficiencies early in the 23 contract term. But those have been removed; there 24 are no repeats. And the three findings are listed 25 out here on Page 24. All of them are other</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">648</p> <p>1 We have no financial concerns to share at 2 this time. 3 Here is their Accountability Data, as I 4 just reported. As you can see, it's higher than the 5 local district and the State in both reading and 6 math proficiency. And those green boxes indicate 7 the areas of excellence or designations that they 8 received. 9 The dash, or hyphen, under English Learner 10 Progress is due to the fact that they don't have a 11 large population of EL students. So revealing the 12 numbers would be potentially a violation of FERPA. 13 So though the number isn't given, they earned a 14 designation of excellence; so you know it's good. 15 Then, here, you see their organizational 16 performance framework. And you can see that in this 17 most recent year, all are green or a few Working to 18 Meet Standards. 19 Scrolling through to the next -- Page 6 of 20 your packet, 200 pages, this is the financial chart 21 that we've been referring to. As you see, they've 22 had 200 straight across their entire contract term 23 in terms of funded and actual membership of 24 students. You can see that here's where the 25 percentages are, what has been spent on</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">650</p> <p>1 non-compliance or other matters. 2 As I said before, we don't want to say 3 we're not concerned about those. But they're not 4 major findings. 5 And then, lastly, of course, on Page 27 is 6 the chart that's larger, so if you really want to 7 see the specific areas, it's a little easier to read 8 on this rather than the thumbnail. 9 And with that, I, again, recommend -- PED 10 recommends a renewal term of five years. And with 11 that, I conclude my report, Madam Chair. 12 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you so much. And 13 welcome once again to the school. 14 So, Eric, I'm going to ask that you 15 introduce everyone from the school so that we have 16 everyone correctly identified for the record. 17 MR. ERIC AHNER: Madam Chair and members 18 of the Commission, thank you so much. My name is 19 Eric Ahner. I'm currently the executive director of 20 J. Paul Taylor Academy. 21 Today I have Stephanie Haan-Amato, who 22 joined us in February of '17. And she's currently a 23 governance council member after serving two years as 24 the chair. 25 Our current chair, Robyn Rehbein. She</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">651</p> <p>1 joined us in January of '17. 2 Jerry Wallace is our GC secretary, and he 3 joined us in the '18-'19 school year. 4 And lastly, Cynthia Risner, who is our 5 founding director of the school, is currently the 6 assistant director of the school. 7 THE CHAIR: So welcome, everyone. And 8 welcome back to a number of you. 9 So, Eric, whenever you're ready, you've 10 got your 15 minutes of fame here now. 11 MR. ERIC AHNER: Thank you. I love the 15 12 minutes of talking. I'll try to fill it as best I 13 can. I'm sure you guys are not exhausted after 14 eight schools. 15 Actually, I think our narrative is 16 relatively short, Madam Chair, and members of the 17 Commission. I am very proud to be representing a 18 school who's made nice steps forward over the last 19 five years. And it's -- it felt like a fairly 20 seamless renewal process on our end, hopefully the 21 same on your end, looking at the data of how we did 22 on the performance contract. 23 Before I go into some of the details, I 24 want to take a moment to express gratitude to the 25 Charter School Division. Ms. Woerner, I think, has</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">653</p> <p>1 keep it brief. I think that the video does a good 2 job of who we are in a broad stroke. And, 3 hopefully, our data in the renewal speaks for itself 4 as well. So I don't want to keep you guys hostage 5 too much. 6 When I first began in the 2016-'17 school 7 year, I had come from a charter school in 8 Silver City, Aldo Leopold Charter School, where I 9 served for seven years. After two years of being 10 the director of J. Paul Taylor, I stepped down, 11 decided I wanted to take a break from school 12 leadership, and I went back to the classroom. And 13 after two years of teaching math, I decided that I 14 did not choose an easier job. I really needed to go 15 back to school administration. 16 The two years was really informative to 17 me. It was a very nice break to not be the school 18 leader, and it was very eye-opening to really focus 19 on what's most important, which was the instruction 20 in the classroom. And I think after many, many 21 years in school administration, taking a moment to 22 step back and understand the validity and the 23 necessity of being a good teacher and having good 24 teachers in the school is so much more important 25 than just the leadership of any school.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">652</p> <p>1 done a great job of being a liaison; along with her 2 staff, has been extremely helpful in getting back to 3 us, not only with the charter renewal process but 4 with multiple strands. So thank you. I really 5 appreciate having you there and being able to 6 contact you and hearing back almost immediately, 7 which I don't know how you do that, but you do. 8 And, secondly, I want to take a moment to 9 recognize that I believe, in my opinion, that the 10 Public Education Commission and the Charter School 11 Division has worked hard to gain a stronger 12 alliance. I see that. It doesn't mean it's not 13 difficult or challenging. I think the circumstances 14 of a Commission, coupled with members who are hired 15 by the Public Education Department, makes it very 16 difficult to create that strong alliance. And I see 17 that alliance, and I feel that alliance as a school 18 leader. So I commend all of you for really building 19 that relationship, which really does have a very 20 positive effect on all of us in the charter schools, 21 particularly, obviously, State-authorized. So thank 22 you. 23 What I'm going to do is quickly talk about 24 some key points. We do have a video that speaks to 25 who we are as a charter school. But I do want to</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">654</p> <p>1 So it was really humbling to do that. And 2 I did ache to get back to school administration, 3 much to my own surprise and my wife's surprise. So 4 I returned this year to J. Paul Taylor after two 5 years having Christy Takacs, who I feel did a 6 spectacular job with our school in the two years 7 that she was between us. 8 When I first stepped in in 2016-'17, our 9 school had gone through some significant hardships 10 with finances. Business practices were not where we 11 wanted them to be. And we'd hired the REC, Vicki 12 Chavez, to represent us as our business manager, and 13 we've really made incredible gains financially since 14 that time. 15 Coming into the '16-'17 school year, we 16 thought we were tight with our carryover budget, 17 and, in fact, we were actually entering the school 18 year with a deficit that we didn't know about until 19 my first month in school session. 20 And that's an immediate audit finding. We 21 can't run a public school in a deficit situation. 22 We worked tirelessly with the Public Education 23 Department to really step up what we're doing with 24 our finances. We were put on a plan where we would 25 report to the PED on a quarterly basis instead of an</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">655</p> <p>1 annual basis.</p> <p>2 And after Mr. Craig released us from that</p> <p>3 expectation, our school chose to stay on the</p> <p>4 quarterly reporting for many reasons. But more than</p> <p>5 anything, I think, as all you Commissioners know, if</p> <p>6 we can't keep our finances straight, we can't exist</p> <p>7 as a charter school. It seems like the far majority</p> <p>8 of charter schools who really have not made it has</p> <p>9 been the result of poor financial management.</p> <p>10 So staying on that quarterly system</p> <p>11 starting in an actual deficit in the 2016-'17 school</p> <p>12 year, and, in my position, returning as executive</p> <p>13 director now, I'm coming in with \$198,000 carryover,</p> <p>14 which is absolutely fantastic. That means I have</p> <p>15 leverage to invest money into our program, into our</p> <p>16 students, into what we're doing as a school without</p> <p>17 the fear of covering payroll, so to speak.</p> <p>18 So we have made incredible gains with that</p> <p>19 aspect.</p> <p>20 When I think back through the last five</p> <p>21 years, I would say that our Spanish language</p> <p>22 acquisition program has been probably the area of</p> <p>23 our charter that's been our greatest weakness. And</p> <p>24 when we first started as a charter school, we had a</p> <p>25 strong desire to be a bilingual program, and we</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">657</p> <p>1 students who learn. I know that at the end of the</p> <p>2 day. However, being in a fully adequate building is</p> <p>3 incredibly important. And, again, I consider it a</p> <p>4 true blessing for us as a school.</p> <p>5 Also in an area that I would like to move</p> <p>6 our needle forward is with regards to equity. We've</p> <p>7 convened our equity council not as much I would like</p> <p>8 to have done. When we knew we were coming back into</p> <p>9 a full remote environment this year, I switched a</p> <p>10 little bit from an equity council to a reentry task</p> <p>11 force. And a big facet of that task force was</p> <p>12 looking at the equity aspects of how we offer online</p> <p>13 instruction and being mindful of how we reach our</p> <p>14 families.</p> <p>15 And I think that those conversations were</p> <p>16 very fruitful. I think they were also ideal -- or</p> <p>17 maybe idealistic -- in that the practice has been so</p> <p>18 incredibly challenging in making sure we meet the</p> <p>19 needs of those students who have the highest need</p> <p>20 has been, in fact, the biggest challenge.</p> <p>21 And I certainly hear that across the</p> <p>22 board. That was our fear with full remote learning,</p> <p>23 that it would create a larger divide.</p> <p>24 So I'm glad that we're very intentional</p> <p>25 talking about equity when we're talking about</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">656</p> <p>1 expected to have a high number of English Language</p> <p>2 Learners in our school, thinking that the two-way</p> <p>3 model would be pretty ideal. And, in fact, we</p> <p>4 didn't have as many EL students as anticipated.</p> <p>5 And, actually, our population has grown this last</p> <p>6 year, which I appreciate.</p> <p>7 Similar to that, the diversity of our</p> <p>8 school, the demographics of our school, are actually</p> <p>9 far more parallel to Las Cruces and Las Cruces</p> <p>10 Public Schools than has our demographics been in the</p> <p>11 past. So I think that we now match the neighborhood</p> <p>12 of where we have landed in our beautiful permanent</p> <p>13 building.</p> <p>14 And, again, thinking back to my seven</p> <p>15 years at Aldo Leopold, I fought tirelessly to find a</p> <p>16 building that we could call home and that felt</p> <p>17 adequate for our educational practices. And</p> <p>18 stepping into the building that Las Cruces Public</p> <p>19 Schools was gracious enough to build for us and</p> <p>20 lease to us has been a dream come true and really</p> <p>21 brings to mind the importance of all students having</p> <p>22 the ability to be in a facility that really offers</p> <p>23 the opportunities of education.</p> <p>24 It isn't the building that makes</p> <p>25 education. It's the individuals who teach and the</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">658</p> <p>1 reentry plans. But that said, I think that we have</p> <p>2 a way to go to really fully realize how we can</p> <p>3 better be mindful of the practice of equity as a</p> <p>4 school and where we stand in Southern New Mexico and</p> <p>5 in Las Cruces.</p> <p>6 I think that that hits, by and large, on</p> <p>7 the points that I wanted to talk about briefly. I'm</p> <p>8 going to introduce Stephanie Haan-Amato. She's a</p> <p>9 member here, and she has a couple of comments. And</p> <p>10 then I'll ask any of our GC members to speak if they</p> <p>11 have something that they would like to add.</p> <p>12 And then, lastly, I'll have Ms. Risner</p> <p>13 speak to pick up any of the pieces of items that I</p> <p>14 might have overlooked or not covered in as much</p> <p>15 depth.</p> <p>16 So Ms. Haan-Amato.</p> <p>17 MS. STEPHANIE HAAN-AMATO: Thank you.</p> <p>18 Good afternoon, Commissioners, and thanks for</p> <p>19 allowing me to speak on behalf of J. Paul Taylor</p> <p>20 Academy.</p> <p>21 My name is Stephanie Haan-Amato. I'm the</p> <p>22 immediate past chair of the governance council. I'm</p> <p>23 an educator and the assistant director of a</p> <p>24 nonprofit organization in Las Cruces. We bring</p> <p>25 hands-on education to more than 20,000 students</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">659</p> <p>1 annually.</p> <p>2 And I visit a lot of schools. So I could</p> <p>3 see that J. Paul Taylor Academy was different on my</p> <p>4 very first visit.</p> <p>5 My first interaction with the school was</p> <p>6 as a visiting educator in the middle-school science</p> <p>7 classroom in 2013. I was so highly impressed and</p> <p>8 blown away by the students. They were genuinely</p> <p>9 enthusiastic about learning. They were</p> <p>10 super-inquisitive. They were ready to jump right</p> <p>11 in.</p> <p>12 So I saw firsthand how the project-based</p> <p>13 learning approach that is at the center of the</p> <p>14 instructional program at the school put the</p> <p>15 construction of knowledge back into the hands of the</p> <p>16 students and truly empowered them.</p> <p>17 Another thing that really struck me about</p> <p>18 the school is that with a very, you know, small</p> <p>19 student body of 200, the students are able to really</p> <p>20 know the teachers and the teachers are really able</p> <p>21 to know the students. So many of the teachers greet</p> <p>22 every student by name, even the ones who aren't in</p> <p>23 their class.</p> <p>24 So there's a level of care that isn't</p> <p>25 really typically seen at traditional public schools</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">661</p> <p>1 really healthy shift for us, which was much more</p> <p>2 aligned to our practices.</p> <p>3 We only had two teachers who were not</p> <p>4 bilingual-certified. But both were very -- are very</p> <p>5 strong Spanish-speaking teachers. I think that</p> <p>6 we'll look at changing the expectation of having</p> <p>7 bilingual-certified teachers, because it's a</p> <p>8 challenging test and it takes time and such.</p> <p>9 So I do think that we really have moved</p> <p>10 the needle, and we're going in a direction that's</p> <p>11 more true to who we are with regard to Spanish</p> <p>12 language acquisition.</p> <p>13 I also think, based on where we landed in</p> <p>14 our desire to be SLA, or Spanish language</p> <p>15 acquisition, our use of the IPT test was not ideal.</p> <p>16 The test in itself is designed for Spanish-speaking</p> <p>17 students. So as we used that for students who were</p> <p>18 emerging with Spanish skills, it tested them at the</p> <p>19 very low end, giving us a challenging disaggregation</p> <p>20 of data. And as a result of that, I don't think we</p> <p>21 used a tool that was well aligned to us growing with</p> <p>22 regard to acquiring a second language.</p> <p>23 So as we move forward into the renewal</p> <p>24 process, we'll examine that much more closely and</p> <p>25 hopefully choose much more wisely as we do that.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">660</p> <p>1 that that small school really fosters.</p> <p>2 So when I was invited in 2017 to become a</p> <p>3 member of the governance council, I was glad to</p> <p>4 help. And I really wanted to help ensure that the</p> <p>5 amazing teachers and staff could continue to carry</p> <p>6 out the mission of the school and do so much to</p> <p>7 improve the lives of the children of our community.</p> <p>8 So thank you so much for your</p> <p>9 consideration today.</p> <p>10 MR. ERIC AHNER: And Mr. Wallace or</p> <p>11 Ms. Rehbein, if either one of you would like to add</p> <p>12 comments, you certainly have the opportunity to do</p> <p>13 so. If I see motion, I'll slow down. I don't feel</p> <p>14 like I tied the knot with regard to Spanish language</p> <p>15 acquisition. I talked briefly about that being an</p> <p>16 area that I wish we had moved forward on.</p> <p>17 And I think going from a bilingual</p> <p>18 program, which we had envisioned early, to a Spanish</p> <p>19 language acquisition program, was a good move. I</p> <p>20 think we have done a great job with the culture of</p> <p>21 New Mexico in Mexican culture as well. But we</p> <p>22 weren't doing what we wanted to do with regard to</p> <p>23 the bilingual aspect of the program.</p> <p>24 So letting go of that funding and focusing</p> <p>25 more on conversational Spanish and culture was a</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">662</p> <p>1 Lastly, I would like to invite Ms. Risner</p> <p>2 on to, again, pick up any pieces that I might have</p> <p>3 left out and to add anything that she would like to</p> <p>4 add.</p> <p>5 MS. CYNTHIA RISNER: Good afternoon,</p> <p>6 Commissioners. I appreciate you giving us this</p> <p>7 opportunity to speak briefly. I promise I'll be</p> <p>8 brief.</p> <p>9 It was really interesting to come back to</p> <p>10 a charter school that I had founded -- co-founded</p> <p>11 and was the first administrator of -- to come back</p> <p>12 after four or five years out and see where it was.</p> <p>13 And to be very honest, I was delighted.</p> <p>14 I find that J. Paul Taylor is still very</p> <p>15 child-centered. The school is much more focused on</p> <p>16 teaching children than teaching subject matter</p> <p>17 areas.</p> <p>18 I also found that service projects were</p> <p>19 still an important part of the school. I believe</p> <p>20 strongly that children need to learn that they can</p> <p>21 make contributions to the greater world as children</p> <p>22 and continue it throughout their life.</p> <p>23 One example that just delights me is our</p> <p>24 fifth-grade -- some of our fifth-graders have</p> <p>25 decided that our medical professionals in the area</p>

663	<p>1 are stressed and not receiving the recognition they 2 need. So these students, with their tech skills, 3 have developed a QR code that stressed medical 4 professionals at their work sites can access to see 5 videos of our children wishing them a merry 6 Christmas with their pets. Just a nice little 7 downtime to celebrate that somebody appreciates 8 them.</p> <p>9 I also found that the themes of projects 10 was still very strong. Yes, projects are important, 11 but unifying them in a school theme is important. 12 And some of you may remember our wonderful namesake 13 J. Paul Taylor. And this is his 100th birthday. So 14 the students have done various projects around 15 100 years ago and 100 years in the future. And they 16 have just been phenomenal.</p> <p>17 Just one small example. The third-grade 18 class interviewed their family members to find out 19 what they could about their families for 100 years 20 ago, compiled it into a book, and gave it to 21 Mr. Taylor for his birthday.</p> <p>22 So it's just a very community-type feel 23 with these projects.</p> <p>24 I'm also pleased to see, even though money 25 is always tight in schools, that arts and physical</p>	665	<p>1 are correct so you can hear. So if you don't hear 2 audio, Ms. Woerner, let me know, give me a 3 thumbs-down, and I'll adjust it.</p> <p>4 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Go ahead. 5 (Video is played.)</p> <p>6 THE CHAIR: So thank you for that. I 7 guess it's becoming more and more of a game-changer. 8 You take those tiny tikes with those little voices, 9 toothless tiny tikes. It gets even tougher when 10 they have those little fake mustaches on.</p> <p>11 And I've had the joy of being there at 12 some of those. And it's just -- you just can't. 13 And I'm not an elementary school person. But you 14 can't stop -- and I also have -- I guess I have to 15 publicly admit. I have two totems in my yard that I 16 purchased at an art fundraiser that the school did. 17 They did projects and cultural explorations and then 18 they had a fundraiser, and I still have two totems 19 in my yard from students.</p> <p>20 So it's always exciting when I can also 21 share, with folks, that.</p> <p>22 And this has been quite a journey. You 23 know, this is quite a difference from the last 24 renewal. I think I was just -- I just took over as 25 Chair when I got the call from then Deputy Secretary</p>
664	<p>1 education are still very important.</p> <p>2 Okay. I'm out of time. Thank you.</p> <p>3 One last thing. I have to say that 4 Mr. Ahner is the perfect person to guide this school 5 in its mission.</p> <p>6 Thank you.</p> <p>7 THE CHAIR: Thank you. And thank you all 8 once again for everything that you said.</p> <p>9 Bev, how many people do we have signed up? 10 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN: None.</p> <p>11 THE CHAIR: Oh, okay. Thank you. So 12 welcome once again.</p> <p>13 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Madam Chair? 14 THE CHAIR: I'm sorry.</p> <p>15 MS. KAREN WOERNER: I think the school 16 does have a presentation they want to share.</p> <p>17 THE CHAIR: Oh, I'm sorry. I'm getting 18 ahead of myself. I apologize. So you do have a 19 video for us that you're going to share? 20 MR. ERIC AHNER: Madam Chair, members of 21 the Commission, I do, in fact, have a video. And we 22 managed to fill our time in spite of what I said. 23 So I spoke to you as long as I possibly could. 24 Ms. Woerner, when you're ready, I'll try 25 to take over the screen and make sure the settings</p>	666	<p>1 Aguilar. And it was not a good phone call. He was 2 actually at the school, and he was yelling at me, "I 3 could close this school now if I wanted to."</p> <p>4 So it was, like, "Holy cow." 5 So, you know, that was -- and I appreciate 6 the fact that Eric took the leadership of that 7 school, not knowing those struggles that were going 8 to come, and he stayed. And that's a testament to 9 him that he righted that school.</p> <p>10 And it was -- there were a lot of issues 11 that were going on. And it was -- it truly was; it 12 was tough times. And how the school has progressed 13 is amazing.</p> <p>14 And I am also so pleased that the 15 demographics have changed, because I think there was 16 a thought in some people's minds, probably five, six 17 years ago, "Oh, that's that little private white 18 school." 19 And it's -- it's, like, "No, it's a public 20 school." 21 And it has -- it has changed. And that 22 was never the intent of that school. But I think 23 that's -- in some part of the community, that was 24 the reputation that it achieved. 25 And I was walking my dog in the</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">667</p> <p>1 neighborhood, and I had a new neighbor. And they 2 stopped me and said, you know, "We're looking for a 3 school and want to make sure the kids are in a 4 diverse school. We found this school. And, you 5 know, it's free." 6 And it's like, "Really." 7 It's, like -- they were so -- so just that 8 change. 9 And, certainly, the move was more than 10 helpful to the school and helps to -- I think the 11 location also helps in rooting it into the 12 community, as opposed to where it was up there on 13 Del Rey. 14 So I want to applaud the school for 15 everything that it's been able to do over these 16 years. 17 But could you just briefly talk to us 18 about what a day looks like now that we're virtual, 19 for most of your kids? 20 MR. ERIC AHNER: Madam Chair, members of 21 the Commission, thank you. Appreciate those 22 compliments, and I certainly will speak to what 23 we're doing. 24 All of our students are in a full remote. 25 We had begun providing some small-group instruction</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">669</p> <p>1 for the social-emotional components of our 2 populations. 3 THE CHAIR: Commissioners? 4 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Madam Chair? 5 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Voigt? 6 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you, 7 Madam Chair. 8 And thank you, faculty from J. Paul 9 Taylor. It's -- this school speaks to everything 10 that I feel is valuable in education and for 11 learners. 12 The social justice piece is huge. 13 Project-based learning, seeing students 14 stand up and present their learning is wonderful and 15 refreshing. 16 I think you speaking so proactively to the 17 challenges that you faced, instead of, you know, 18 shirking behind any excuses is commendable. So 19 thank you for being so upfront and forthright with 20 the challenges that you've had coming onboard. 21 I think it's refreshing that a school -- a 22 charter school within a school district that's a 23 State-authorized school, to have that opportunity to 24 collaborate with their district, especially about a 25 facility, that's wonderful. I wish more districts</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">668</p> <p>1 to our special ed population, and then we also 2 started to serve our EL population when we're 3 allowed to do that. And then we folded in a few 4 kindergarteners in small groups. 5 And then I had to pull the plug because 6 the case counts down south were just too high. And 7 I have to say that the ability to have students come 8 into those small groups was making the difference 9 that we couldn't bridge at the time that we started 10 that process. And, obviously, out of the well-being 11 of our community members, going backwards has been 12 very painful because we're missing some of those 13 kids. 14 So all of our students will Zoom, I would 15 say, at least one time -- pretty common to do two 16 times in whole-class Zoom. And then almost every 17 grade level will do small-group instruction in 18 reading and math. 19 And then we also have specials that do 20 more activities outside of Zoom. Because of the 21 demand on the Zoom schedule for kids and teachers, 22 they've done a lot more of asynchronous instruction 23 for art and music and PE. But they're beginning to 24 go more toward a Zoom environment, knowing that that 25 face time with their kids is so incredibly important</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">670</p> <p>1 would look at that as a model to help out their 2 communities. 3 The -- the development committee that you 4 have going on with your reentry task force also, is 5 there any kind of triangulation with your equity 6 council in, like, the reentry or the development and 7 equity? Is there any kind of cross-collaboration 8 going on between those three entities? 9 MR. ERIC AHNER: Madam Chair? 10 Commissioner Voigt, thank you again for 11 the compliments and your comments about our 12 progress. 13 There is some triangulation between those, 14 probably not as much as I would like. And, again, 15 our need to reformulating the equity council, we 16 reconvened not too long ago, and we ended up with 17 all staff and no parents and students on it. So 18 that was a sure show that we needed to step back and 19 realign or reinstate new members of the equity 20 council; because it had changed and shifted as we 21 did the reentry plan, where we did have more 22 collaboration, as it should be. 23 I believe that the PAC, our parent 24 advisory council, brings a lot of elements in from 25 the parent voice of what we need to look at as a</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">671</p> <p>1 school.</p> <p>2 The development committee. Just as a</p> <p>3 quick explanation, the development committee is now</p> <p>4 what used to be the J. Paul Taylor Foundation. That</p> <p>5 used to be our 501(c)(3). We dissolved that based</p> <p>6 on that it's extremely expensive to run a 501(c)(3)</p> <p>7 for not bringing in much money.</p> <p>8 There's an audit cost, a public school</p> <p>9 with a foundation. And we had to pay for financial</p> <p>10 service for the foundation. And when we looked at</p> <p>11 that more closely, we weren't making enough money in</p> <p>12 the foundation to warrant those expenditures; so we</p> <p>13 dissolved the 501(c)(3) and rolled it into a</p> <p>14 development committee in the school. And that saved</p> <p>15 us a lot of money, and that's created an opportunity</p> <p>16 for the development committee to do a lot of</p> <p>17 fundraising efforts on behalf of the school.</p> <p>18 And a lot of times, it's for the arts. I</p> <p>19 would have to say that the funding, certainly, the</p> <p>20 school leaders who are here know that the funding is</p> <p>21 never enough for fully staffed programs in the arts.</p> <p>22 And anytime we look at cutting back on finances,</p> <p>23 which is inevitable, it seems like, in public</p> <p>24 schools, the first thing we cut tends to be the arts</p> <p>25 program. And as a result of that, we end up losing</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">673</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes. Thank you.</p> <p>2 I really enjoyed the -- the review of the history of</p> <p>3 the school and going from bilingual to Spanish</p> <p>4 acquisition. And, you know, as an immigrant from</p> <p>5 Mexico, I surely would have loved for the bilingual</p> <p>6 to stay. But you have to face your own reality and</p> <p>7 the reality of the kids.</p> <p>8 But I do want to ask, how intensive is</p> <p>9 your Spanish acquisition as the kids start moving up</p> <p>10 the grade levels?</p> <p>11 And I will ask another question after</p> <p>12 that.</p> <p>13 MR. ERIC AHNER: Madam Chair and</p> <p>14 Commissioner Caballero, thank you for your question.</p> <p>15 Last year, Director Takacs put together a</p> <p>16 schedule that incorporated one hour at the end of</p> <p>17 the academic day that was specifically for Spanish</p> <p>18 language acquisition. And I think that that was the</p> <p>19 first time that we had formalized a schedule where</p> <p>20 that hour was common across the board.</p> <p>21 And, again, that created an alignment</p> <p>22 school-wide that I think that we had failed to do</p> <p>23 prior to that. And I can certainly say that during</p> <p>24 my first couple of years, where I had relied on</p> <p>25 teachers to build in their hour of bilingual</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">672</p> <p>1 the zest and the engagement of our students because</p> <p>2 we're driving so hard at math and reading that we</p> <p>3 forget about rounding our educational practices</p> <p>4 across.</p> <p>5 So I think there's more opportunity for us</p> <p>6 to really build on how we look at equity. And I</p> <p>7 think we do it well. But I don't think it's been</p> <p>8 intentional enough to really pull in the strings of</p> <p>9 where we can grow and dig deeper to look at equity</p> <p>10 issues in our school community.</p> <p>11 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you for</p> <p>12 addressing that and for your honesty about that.</p> <p>13 And also I really appreciate the fact that</p> <p>14 you are focusing on arts. And that's a priority for</p> <p>15 your school.</p> <p>16 I also believe that students' engagement,</p> <p>17 not only their creativity, lends to their</p> <p>18 development overall, just as civic engagement. It</p> <p>19 really adds to them being able to express</p> <p>20 themselves. So thank you very much.</p> <p>21 And the video, that was excellent drone</p> <p>22 camera work, whoever did that. Very impressive.</p> <p>23 Thank you. Great work, everyone.</p> <p>24 THE CHAIR: Commissioners?</p> <p>25 Commissioner Caballero?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">674</p> <p>1 education or two hours of bilingual education</p> <p>2 specifically into the classroom.</p> <p>3 So having that common hour made it very</p> <p>4 easy for us administratively to walk through the</p> <p>5 school building and know that Spanish language</p> <p>6 acquisition was present and happening in that</p> <p>7 moment.</p> <p>8 And the other significant benefit is we</p> <p>9 were no longer bound by students meeting with only</p> <p>10 their teacher who's teaching Spanish in their</p> <p>11 classroom. We could set up groups where you could</p> <p>12 have abilities by group, abilities by doing projects</p> <p>13 within the Spanish culture. So it really varied how</p> <p>14 we could serve the growth of our Spanish language</p> <p>15 acquisition program by doing that.</p> <p>16 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Right. And the</p> <p>17 challenge in Las Cruces is, of course, you mentioned</p> <p>18 New Mexican Spanish. But also in Las Cruces, for a</p> <p>19 long time, you had a 30 percent growth rate. And it</p> <p>20 wasn't through birth; it was by a lot of people</p> <p>21 moving into -- into Las Cruces. And a lot of those</p> <p>22 folks were from El Paso or new immigrants.</p> <p>23 So the Spanish began to shift from</p> <p>24 New Mexican Spanish, which is very different from</p> <p>25 the formal Spanish. And so I'm sure what you're</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">675</p> <p>1 teaching is the formal Spanish.</p> <p>2 And so my interest is, I was invited to</p> <p>3 several graduation ceremonies here in Albuquerque as</p> <p>4 a Commissioner, some with charter schools. But for</p> <p>5 some reason, I got invited by public schools.</p> <p>6 And I was -- I was amazed as the -- as the</p> <p>7 number of kids graduating with a Spanish</p> <p>8 certificate, which was one of the things that</p> <p>9 El Paso tried to do, and we were never successful.</p> <p>10 And they would always point to New Mexico as an</p> <p>11 excellent example of -- of kids graduating from high</p> <p>12 school with the Spanish certificate.</p> <p>13 And I took Spanish all the way to</p> <p>14 Spanish IV. I was a B student, and I could never</p> <p>15 get to A, because the A students were just</p> <p>16 fantastic. And those -- and those -- those students</p> <p>17 ended up getting degrees in Spanish and being</p> <p>18 translators and what-have-you. And it was very --</p> <p>19 very tough getting a C.</p> <p>20 So I took a lot of pride for my B. But --</p> <p>21 and I've regretted not being able to get the</p> <p>22 certificate and make it available to us in El Paso.</p> <p>23 And I talked to a couple of young ladies,</p> <p>24 and they had been offered jobs right out of high</p> <p>25 school because of the Spanish certificate. You go</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">677</p> <p>1 masters of both languages in this industry.</p> <p>2 And I -- and one of my good friends that I</p> <p>3 mentioned earlier, Jerry Smith, who was the only</p> <p>4 Anglo in the school, he learned Spanish so well that</p> <p>5 when I was in college, he called me trying to sell</p> <p>6 me whatever he was in charge of selling. He was in</p> <p>7 sales. And he had moved up to regional director of</p> <p>8 his company within two years because he was truly</p> <p>9 bilingual.</p> <p>10 And I talked to him in Spanish, and he</p> <p>11 insisted that we should speak in English, because</p> <p>12 all the salesmen around him didn't know that he was</p> <p>13 that bilingual.</p> <p>14 But he was put in charge. And the sales,</p> <p>15 because of his bilingual master, the sales in his</p> <p>16 company tripled because they were able to sell. He</p> <p>17 hired people that were truly bilingual, and the</p> <p>18 sales tripled because he was able to target a</p> <p>19 population that has not been targeted by the</p> <p>20 company.</p> <p>21 And so in the whole notion of Spanish</p> <p>22 acquisition, I hope that it becomes a little bit</p> <p>23 more rigorous as the kids move up to fourth, fifth,</p> <p>24 sixth, seventh, and eighth, or might be sixth to</p> <p>25 eighth, and prepare them to -- if they want to take</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">676</p> <p>1 to El Paso, and you walk into any bank, and all</p> <p>2 transactions are transacted in Spanish. All</p> <p>3 transactions, all the tellers are speaking Spanish</p> <p>4 and English.</p> <p>5 And that's going to be Las Cruces, if not</p> <p>6 now, very, very soon, because the International Port</p> <p>7 of Entry there in that area is now one of the</p> <p>8 largest in the region.</p> <p>9 And so you're -- you're going to -- if not</p> <p>10 already, you're getting a lot of the traffic from</p> <p>11 all of Latin America, not just Mexico. And the need</p> <p>12 for certification is going to be very, very great.</p> <p>13 The ones that are going to take the -- the</p> <p>14 opportunities are the students that -- from El Paso</p> <p>15 that are now being truly bilingual.</p> <p>16 And so I put out a challenge that --</p> <p>17 from -- as kids are moving up, maybe that's</p> <p>18 something that each student has the opportunity to</p> <p>19 do, individually, with the help of the school, so</p> <p>20 that by the time they move into high school, they</p> <p>21 may not be ready for certification, but they may be</p> <p>22 ready to enter the program, because it's voluntary,</p> <p>23 to end up with a Spanish certification.</p> <p>24 And it's not easy. It is not easy. But</p> <p>25 the doors open to those that are truly, truly</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">678</p> <p>1 the option to get the certificate. Because it's --</p> <p>2 I don't know if it's available in El Paso. I have</p> <p>3 asked and nobody has said yes.</p> <p>4 And it's still New Mexico, and that's a</p> <p>5 big plus. That's a big, big plus that the State</p> <p>6 still offers it.</p> <p>7 That's all I have, Madam Chair. Thank</p> <p>8 you.</p> <p>9 MR. ERIC AHNER: Madam Chair and</p> <p>10 Commissioner Caballero, thank you for your comments.</p> <p>11 I really resonate with the belief that the</p> <p>12 importance of Spanish as a language is incredibly</p> <p>13 important, certainly down south here close to the</p> <p>14 border, close to El Paso.</p> <p>15 And I also have to say that I agree that</p> <p>16 Southern New Mexico culture and Spanish is very</p> <p>17 different than Northern New Mexico, which is</p> <p>18 obviously very different than Mexican culture and</p> <p>19 Spanish.</p> <p>20 So it's an interesting mix. The bilingual</p> <p>21 certification is -- I believe, La Prueba, if I'm</p> <p>22 correct, largely based on Northern New Mexico</p> <p>23 dialect. And a lot of teachers down south have a</p> <p>24 challenging time with that test because of the</p> <p>25 differences in the dialect between Southern</p>

679

1 New Mexico and Northern, even though a lot of our
2 teachers grew up speaking Spanish right here in
3 Las Cruces as a primary language.

4 So I, too, resonate with the idea and hope
5 that we can increase the rigor. And I had to agree
6 to back off. And it was a humbling moment for me as
7 a director to say maybe what my desire is for a
8 bilingual program doesn't align with the staff in
9 the school.

10 And that's where I had to do a give and a
11 take and be a member of the community as a whole to
12 make sure we move forward as a whole. But it's near
13 and dear to my heart. Thank you.

14 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Robbins?

15 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes. Thank you.
16 Just three quick points.

17 Even though proficiency is good at the
18 school, you have wonderful results. I notice from
19 '18 to '19, there was a significant drop in
20 proficiencies in reading and math. So I'd like you
21 to address that, what's taken place since then.

22 A decline in enrollment -- or attendance.
23 Seems like in the last three or four years, the
24 attendance rates, even though you're still above or
25 right at 95 percent, it seems like it's going down

680

1 slightly each year. So maybe there's not as much
2 commitment for the students and the parents. What's
3 being addressed -- done to address that?

4 And then the final thing. This year you
5 had a very large drop in teacher retention over last
6 year. I think some of that might be
7 pandemic-related. Maybe you could address if there
8 were any unusual things that caused the teacher
9 retention to drop to 77 percent.

10 MR. ERIC AHNER: Madam Chair, Commissioner
11 Robbins, thank you. First, with the performance.
12 One of the challenges, which I assume you all have
13 seen, is sometimes changing between tests. I do
14 believe that in the anomaly in the 28 (verbatim)
15 test, I think that that was consistent in Istation
16 testing from the previous year to that year.

17 I have seen, in my ten years as director
18 in New Mexico, that there seems to be an ebb and
19 flow. If you have one year that seems particularly
20 high, I've commonly seen a drop the next year. So I
21 can't speak specifically to why that drop might have
22 occurred.

23 I hope that we saw that in -- the next
24 year's increase would be seen in relevant (verbatim)
25 based on the adjustment and paying attention to the

681

1 data. And, again, that's tricky, because I do want
2 us to pay attention to short cycle assessment and
3 what that offers, while not losing the zeal of being
4 committed to our charter and making sure we're
5 serving our kids at an organic level. It's a give
6 and a take, and it's a dance.

7 Attendance. I think we became more
8 critical of how we take attendance and where. We
9 dug in deep, and we've rolled into the new
10 attendance law that we've reexamined how we do that.
11 I think we're more stringent now on where the
12 attendance is taken and how that's accumulated. So
13 that certainly is an area that I would like to see
14 as a priority, to get that attendance up.

15 And, right now, if I could have 75 percent
16 attendance on all of our Zoom calls, I would be
17 ecstatic. And I can't speak to my level of concern
18 of the damage that we're doing in not being in full
19 school, not because I'm saying we should or we
20 shouldn't be. I think there are pros and cons.
21 But, yes, you can't learn if you're not present.

22 I came from a high school background my
23 entire career. I always told my students, "I can't
24 teach you if you're not here. Just show up, and I
25 will bend over backwards to try to assist you to

682

1 learn the material. But if you're not here, you're
2 missing these pieces."

3 And that's all I'm asking for. It seems
4 simple. But sometimes we know that the realities
5 behind being able to attend simply isn't there for
6 kids under various circumstances.

7 And then, lastly, I believe the drop in
8 attendance, teacher retention, was one more teacher
9 not returning. Because we have so few teachers, it
10 happened to be a year that we lost not just one
11 teacher, but two, that that percentage looks
12 extremely low compared to previous years where I
13 don't think we've lost more than one teacher up
14 until last year, over the five-year term.

15 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: All right. Thank
16 you.

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you. Thank you.
18 Commiss- -- oh. Karen?

19 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Thank you,
20 Madam Chair. I also wanted to -- in answer to
21 Commissioner Robbins' question, Mr. Ahner, the --
22 your school is K-through-8, and you use Istation for
23 all of the grades? Or which grades do you use
24 Istation?

25 MR. ERIC AHNER: Correct. Madam Chair,

<p style="text-align: right;">683</p> <p>1 members of the Commission and Ms. Woerner, we do use 2 Istation for K-8.</p> <p>3 MS. KAREN WOERNER: So the decrease in 4 reading from the '18 to the '19 school year, 5 Commissioner Robbins, would also be attributable to 6 a higher cutoff score required to be proficient on 7 Istation that occurred between those years. So if 8 you notice, any schools that service the lower 9 grades, depending on which grades are participating 10 in Istation, I think K-to-2 has to; K-to-3, maybe. 11 Some schools have it for other grades as well.</p> <p>12 But that decrease probably is not really 13 truly a decrease in the proficiency rate; but, 14 rather, the proficiency score became more stringent. 15 And so students who were considered proficient in 16 2018, with the same score, would not be proficient 17 in the next year.</p> <p>18 So I just want to point that out they are 19 using that data, K-through-8. And that's part of 20 that score there is in the reading piece.</p> <p>21 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Thank you. And I 22 appreciate that. I think you mentioned that last 23 year when it came up also. So I appreciate the 24 reminder on that. Thank you.</p> <p>25 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you. So, if</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">685</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 2 Gipson?</p> <p>3 THE CHAIR: Yes.</p> <p>4 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 5 Chavez?</p> <p>6 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes.</p> <p>7 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 8 Armbruster votes "Yes."</p> <p>9 Commissioner Raftery?</p> <p>10 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: Yes.</p> <p>11 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 12 Caballero?</p> <p>13 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes.</p> <p>14 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Ten-to-zero 15 vote. The motion passes.</p> <p>16 THE CHAIR: Okay. We'll see you back in a 17 little bit.</p> <p>18 (Executive Session conducted.)</p> <p>19 THE CHAIR: Sorry. I made the motion and 20 I was muted. Sorry. Sorry.</p> <p>21 I move that the Public Education 22 Commission end Closed Session. The matters 23 discussed in the closed meeting were limited to only 24 those specified in the motion, and no vote was taken 25 during the closed session.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">684</p> <p>1 there are no other questions, I'm going to move that 2 the Public Education Commission enter into a Closed 3 Session, pursuant to NMSA Section 10-15-1(H)(1). 4 The subject to be discussed pertains to the issuance 5 of a charter license renewal for J. Paul Taylor 6 Academy.</p> <p>7 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Second.</p> <p>8 THE CHAIR: So a motion by Commissioner 9 Gipson, a second by Commissioner Ruiz. 10 Commissioner Armbruster? 11 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 12 Robbins? 13 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes. 14 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 15 Crone? 16 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Yes. 17 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 18 Ruiz? 19 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes. 20 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 21 Voigt? 22 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes. 23 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 24 Davis? 25 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Yes.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">686</p> <p>1 And I don't know whose feedback that is. 2 I know it's not mine. But -- sorry.</p> <p>3 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Second.</p> <p>4 THE CHAIR: Glenna, did you second? 5 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes. 6 THE CHAIR: Okay. There's a motion by 7 Commissioner Gipson, a second by Commissioner Voigt. 8 Commissioner Armbruster? 9 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Yes. 10 Commissioner Robbins? 11 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes. 12 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 13 Crone? 14 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Yes. 15 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 16 Ruiz? 17 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes. 18 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 19 Voigt? 20 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes. 21 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 22 Davis? 23 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Yes. 24 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 25 Gipson?</p>

687

1 THE CHAIR: Yes.
 2 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner
 3 Chavez?
 4 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes.
 5 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner
 6 Armbruster votes "Yes."
 7 Commissioner Raftery?
 8 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: Yes.
 9 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner
 10 Caballero?
 11 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes.
 12 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: That's a
 13 ten-to-zero vote. The motion passes.
 14 THE CHAIR: So I move that the Public
 15 Education Commission renew the charter of J. Paul
 16 Taylor Academy for a five-year term, beginning
 17 July 1st, 2021, and ending June 30th, 2026.
 18 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: I second.
 19 THE CHAIR: There's a motion by
 20 Commissioner Gipson and a second by Commissioner
 21 Raftery.
 22 If there's no further discussion,
 23 Commissioner Armbruster?
 24 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Yes.
 25 Are there any abstentions?

688

1 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes, I will abstain
 2 from voting due to my wife's involvement with the
 3 school through the Southwest REC.
 4 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay. Any other
 5 abstentions?
 6 Here we go, guys.
 7 Commissioner Caballero?
 8 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes.
 9 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner
 10 Raftery?
 11 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: Yes.
 12 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner
 13 Armbruster votes "Yes."
 14 Commissioner Gipson?
 15 THE CHAIR: Yes.
 16 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner
 17 Davis?
 18 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Yes.
 19 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner
 20 Voigt?
 21 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes.
 22 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner
 23 Ruiz?
 24 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes.
 25 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner

689

1 Crone?
 2 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Yes.
 3 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner
 4 Robbins?
 5 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes.
 6 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: That is a
 7 nine-to-zero vote, and the motion passes.
 8 THE CHAIR: The motion passes, nine-zero.
 9 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: With one
 10 abstention. Maybe I'm saying that wrong.
 11 THE CHAIR: With one abstention. So thank
 12 you very much. Congratulations. Thank you every
 13 day for everything that you're doing in normal
 14 times. But, like I've said, no one could have ever
 15 anticipated being asked to do the things schools are
 16 being asked to do right now.
 17 So what you're doing for the community
 18 shows and is appreciated, and, hopefully, we'll be
 19 on the other side of this reasonably soon now. And
 20 there's no definition of "reasonable." So we will
 21 see you in the spring in some form for contract
 22 negotiations. And thank you and congratulations
 23 once again.
 24 MR. ERIC AHNER: Madam Chair and members
 25 of the Commission, I appreciate your time, your vote

690

1 of confidence, and your service as well. Thank you
 2 very much.
 3 THE CHAIR: Thank you.
 4 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Thank you.
 5 MS. KAREN WOERNER: So school
 6 representatives, if you don't leave, I'll be
 7 dropping you off to Attendee. So hang on.
 8 THE CHAIR: So, Commissioners, while Karen
 9 is doing that, I'm going to ask once again, do you
 10 want to take like a 15-minute break before the next?
 11 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes, please.
 12 THE CHAIR: Okay. All-righty.
 13 (Recess taken, 1:27 p.m. to 1:47 p.m.)
 14 THE CHAIR: We're all back then. Thank
 15 you. And thanks for all your time and patience. We
 16 always appreciate it.
 17 It's really difficult for us to figure out
 18 the timing of it. And we have those aspirations of
 19 getting so many in in a day, and sometimes it
 20 doesn't happen. So thank you for indulging us and
 21 being willing to come back today. We really do
 22 appreciate that.
 23 So welcome once again. Thank you. It
 24 does seem like we were just here, 'cause we were,
 25 unfortunately. So thanks. And appreciate the time

<p style="text-align: right;">691</p> <p>1 and effort and energy that goes into doing one of 2 these applications. 3 Even though it was not that long ago, they 4 do change. And Sylvy was not the head administrator 5 at the time, so she may not have been that involved 6 in it. So we really do appreciate it. 7 So as I'm sure you've heard, CSD is going 8 to give their report, and then you'll have your 9 15 minutes. 10 And I do believe you've got some video; 11 correct? 12 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Correct. 13 THE CHAIR: Yeah. So then we'll do 15 14 minutes of video, and then we'll do the public 15 comment, if I remember the order correctly. That's 16 always -- you know -- that's always the variable 17 here. 18 So, Karen, whenever you're ready. 19 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Thank you, 20 Madam Chair, Commissioners. 21 As you know, La Academia Dolores Huerta, 22 located in Las Cruces, is before you today. They 23 serve students in Grades 6 through 8, and their 24 enrollment this year at 40th day was 71 students. 25 As reported in our report, the PED</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">693</p> <p>1 The school's financial audit report does 2 indicate -- the most recently published one -- does 3 indicate four findings, two which are repeats and 4 one was a material weakness. So there are concerns 5 there. The membership has been declining, and, as a 6 result, the school has been over-budgeted in terms 7 of their SEG funding. 8 As you know, I think that's based on the 9 prior year attendance and how the school is funded 10 for each year. 11 The school does spend an average of 53 -- 12 no, not an average -- just the one year, 53 percent 13 on its instructional costs, which is lower than the 14 68 percent recommended. And their administrative 15 support was pretty high at 39 percent. And they had 16 a funded membership of 122 students -- excuse me -- 17 120 students in 2019-2020. 18 The school does not have a -- the support 19 of a foundation. And, somehow, my document 20 disappeared. Sorry. I want to share. But I want 21 to share -- referencing on Page 3 of your report, 22 the -- you'll know that the first indicator, 1.a. is 23 left blank, because the -- there was no State 24 Accountability system in '19-'20 or a report in 25 '19-'20, and, therefore, not able to give an</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">692</p> <p>1 recommends non-renewal of this contract due to the 2 school failing to meet or make substantial progress 3 toward education standards and the standards in the 4 performance framework; in addition, the financial 5 concerns. 6 The school earned -- in the last school 7 report for Accountability, the school earned 8 36 points, which is below the -- the cutoff for the 9 lowest 25 percent of the schools at 40 points. And 10 the school has been identified as a school in need 11 of targeted support and improvement. 12 As you know, the reading and math 13 proficiencies have been below the district and 14 statewide averages. However, the current contract 15 was for only a two-year renewal, and, therefore, 16 there's no assessment data from their current 17 contract term. The first year was last year; the 18 second year is this year. And we, of course, don't 19 have data for those two years. 20 Also the school did not elect to include 21 any mission goals, as those were optional at the 22 time the school entered into the contract with you 23 all. 24 But, nevertheless, we do have some 25 concerns I'd like to go through:</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">694</p> <p>1 accurate rating for that indicator. 2 And the specific charter goals were not 3 applicable due to the fact that the school didn't 4 include those in their contract. 5 So -- but for the rest of the chart, 6 you'll see that we have concerns with the finances; 7 so that's a Failing to Demonstrate Adequate 8 Progress. 9 Board of Finance meets the standard, as 10 you know. The school maintained its Board of 11 Finance throughout the year, contract term, so that 12 it is Meets Standard. And we do have financial 13 concerns. 14 For their material terms, the school has 15 met the standards of their material terms, mainly 16 around their education program and mission of the 17 school. We do have some concerns about the 18 organizational performance. And the governance 19 responsibilities includes head administrator 20 evaluations, governing board mandatory training, 21 reporting changes, and those sort of things. And 22 that was a Demonstrates Progress. 23 We did provide the -- as we do with all 24 schools, the last Accountability Report. But I do 25 remind the Commission that this was the year prior</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">695</p> <p>1 to the contract year.</p> <p>2 And I'm trying to get it to show here. So</p> <p>3 sorry. Let me share. Why is it doing that? I'm</p> <p>4 having some technical difficulties this time, and I</p> <p>5 apologize.</p> <p>6 Okay. See if this works this time. There</p> <p>7 we go. Were you seeing my -- are you seeing the</p> <p>8 evaluation summary now?</p> <p>9 THE CHAIR: Yes, we are.</p> <p>10 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Okay. Thank you.</p> <p>11 Sorry.</p> <p>12 So I went over this verbally with you.</p> <p>13 And then this part here on the Accountability data</p> <p>14 for '18-'19, as you can see, the reading, math, and</p> <p>15 science proficiency and the EL progress was lower</p> <p>16 than the local district and State averages.</p> <p>17 And this here reflects the school's</p> <p>18 organizational performance framework, primarily.</p> <p>19 '18-'19 is not part of this contract term, but is</p> <p>20 provided as a source of reference to compare how the</p> <p>21 school is doing this last year.</p> <p>22 As we mentioned before, these are gray,</p> <p>23 because we don't have the school report for '19-'20</p> <p>24 due to the waiver of State assessments. And you can</p> <p>25 see the ratings and the rest of the organizational</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">697</p> <p>1 from other funds, like the RFRs.</p> <p>2 So this reflects their cash balance. This</p> <p>3 one in yellow is a prediction because we didn't have</p> <p>4 the actual number at the time of preparing the</p> <p>5 report.</p> <p>6 As you see here, the instructional costs</p> <p>7 are 53 percent of the budget and 39 percent to admin</p> <p>8 support.</p> <p>9 Goals. As I said -- I think I misspoke.</p> <p>10 I apologize, Ms. Lucero. I think the school did</p> <p>11 have a goal. The reason it wasn't reported was that</p> <p>12 it was unable to be measured due to the COVID</p> <p>13 closure at the spring semester; is that right?</p> <p>14 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: That is correct.</p> <p>15 MS. KAREN WOERNER: My apologies. They</p> <p>16 did have a school goal. But the goal could not be</p> <p>17 measured, similarly as the State assessments, due to</p> <p>18 the COVID. Apologize.</p> <p>19 Page 30 has the enrollment number. So you</p> <p>20 can see that students do remain enrolled within the</p> <p>21 school year. And they have been increasing across</p> <p>22 the years in who stays -- recurrent enrollment</p> <p>23 returning back the next year, which is a positive</p> <p>24 trend.</p> <p>25 Teacher retention rates, you see here, 64</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">696</p> <p>1 performance framework for '19-'20 here.</p> <p>2 Moving on to the financial chart on</p> <p>3 Page 12, I think it is -- 14 -- 15. Sorry. The</p> <p>4 school -- what we have here -- and I think there was</p> <p>5 some misunderstanding in the last school, so I want</p> <p>6 to explain a little bit more here.</p> <p>7 What we have here is showing the</p> <p>8 operational expenses and revenue. What's here is</p> <p>9 the funded membership. So that's based on the</p> <p>10 enrollment the prior year. So in '18-'19, they were</p> <p>11 funded for 163; in '19-'20, 120. For this year,</p> <p>12 they were funded for 81, based on last year's</p> <p>13 enrollment. And they had 71 students at 40-day.</p> <p>14 Also you'll see that we are comparing</p> <p>15 operational expenses to operational revenue. And</p> <p>16 indicating the surplus and the year-end cash</p> <p>17 balance. This part in yellow is the only part</p> <p>18 that's a prediction amount, because we didn't have</p> <p>19 the final numbers from School Budget.</p> <p>20 This is from School Budget Bureau, and it</p> <p>21 does include -- and I do have Melissa here if I need</p> <p>22 help answering some of the questions. But when</p> <p>23 determining the cash portion, we did use the</p> <p>24 modified accrual approach. But it looks at current</p> <p>25 cash and adds the accrued payroll and anything due</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">698</p> <p>1 to 73 percent.</p> <p>2 The audit findings, I mentioned already.</p> <p>3 The school, in this last published report,</p> <p>4 which is FY '19, which is the one that's reported in</p> <p>5 the '19-'20 school year, was four total findings,</p> <p>6 three repeats, one material weakness. These are</p> <p>7 listed here on Page 32 for you.</p> <p>8 And then, lastly, the organizational</p> <p>9 performance framework is on Page 35 so that you can</p> <p>10 read it a little bit better than the thumbnail in</p> <p>11 the earlier version.</p> <p>12 I also want to point out to the</p> <p>13 Commissioners that -- because I know many of you</p> <p>14 started reading these materials early on -- the</p> <p>15 school did submit a response to our recommendation.</p> <p>16 And that is in your packet on Pages 4 through 7, in</p> <p>17 addition to the response to the preliminary analysis</p> <p>18 that is on Pages 8 to 11.</p> <p>19 And with that, again, the school has been</p> <p>20 in Las Cruces -- I think it first opened in 2004.</p> <p>21 It was a local charter with the Las Cruces Public</p> <p>22 Schools for ten years. It was then, I think, first</p> <p>23 renewed with the PEC in 2014, had a five-year</p> <p>24 contract, and then the current contract of two</p> <p>25 years.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">699</p> <p>1 And they are -- as you recall, there was a 2 vote of non-renewal, but it was appealed and 3 overturned by Secretary Trujillo. And now they're 4 up for their -- what would be their second renewal 5 with the PEC. 6 Because of that, the school does -- the 7 PED does recommend non-renewal based on the concerns 8 that I have shared. 9 And thank you, Madam Chair. 10 THE CHAIR: Thank you. And, Sylvy, 11 welcome once again. And thank you for being here. 12 I'm just going to ask you, if you will, before we 13 start anything, to introduce everyone that's here 14 from the school and what role they hold. 15 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Okay. I will begin 16 with myself. 17 Sylvy Galvan de Lucero. I'm the head 18 administrator currently at La Academia. We have, in 19 the room with us -- so we kind of take our masks on 20 and off as we need to -- I have Ms. Mirna Rodriguez. 21 I have Michelle Paz, who is our AP, or assistant 22 principal, and now also acting science teacher as 23 well. We have, online with us, Robert Palacios, who 24 is our GC member and the head of the finance 25 portion. We have Elaine Palma, who is our GC</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">701</p> <p>1 to take up all your time and get through these 2 relatively quickly. 3 So La Academia Dolores Huerta, we just 4 wanted to give you a snapshot on reflecting on the 5 progress that we've made over the past year of our 6 two-year contract and how we're beginning to look 7 towards our future. 8 We were under a Corrective Action Plan. 9 We were granted a two-year conditional contract 10 requiring the school to meet very specific criteria 11 set forth in that plan, beginning with an academic 12 indicator that was set forth that -- with a 13 definition of growth as 10 percent. 14 So 65 percent of the lowest 50 percent of 15 our students in each grade level were asked to show 16 10 percent growth in both ELA and math from fall 17 administration of our Illuminate assessment, short 18 cycle assessment program, to winter administration, 19 and an additional 10 percent to the spring 20 administration, which, unfortunately, due to COVID, 21 we were not able to complete. 22 These data charts have been presented to 23 you all before, and they are also in our application 24 packets. So I will try and not take up too much 25 time.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">700</p> <p>1 secretary. We are expecting Ms. Yoli Silva; she's 2 caught up in another meeting right now, but she will 3 be joining us as soon as she can. Mr. Mike Vigil 4 from the Vigil Group. Mary Hagemann. She is our 5 business manager, also from the Vigil Group. And 6 Ms. Natasha Cuylear, who is our attorney here with 7 the Dumas Law Firm. 8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, all. So, once 9 again, Beverly will time the 15 minutes for this 10 portion of the presentation. And then we'll move 11 into whatever video that you have. And that's an 12 additional 15 minutes. And then we've got eight 13 minutes for anyone that has signed up for public 14 comment. 15 So whenever you're ready, you can begin. 16 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Okay. I just need 17 the ability to share my screen. 18 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Sylvy, you should have 19 that. Does it have sound in it? 20 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Not this portion. 21 I see -- 22 MS. KAREN WOERNER: You'll probably want 23 to play from current slide. 24 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Let me get it 25 started over here for just a minute. I will try not</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">702</p> <p>1 But as you can see, these are our math for 2 eighth, seventh, and sixth grade. They all met 3 their -- excuse me, I misspoke -- not all. But the 4 required percentage did meet their actual 10 percent 5 projected increase at the mid-point. And most of 6 them, at that point, had also increased more than 7 10 percent in math. 8 We didn't quite reach the 20 percent 9 total. But we always understood that math is a 10 challenge, and we are adapting new systems within 11 our math program to increase math retention and 12 academic performance in that area. 13 Our ELA data, again, as I had mentioned we 14 have presented this to you all, and it is included 15 in your packets. Our students were, in the 16 identified group, able to not only meet but exceed 17 their 10 percent at mid-year, some of them even more 18 than the 20 percent overall at this point. 19 Our ELs, CAP requirement was that the 20 school would meet or exceed its WIDA goal of 21 .5 percent growth. 70 percent of our EL students 22 either met or exceeded that goal. After doing 23 research, those that did not are also identified as 24 special ed students on IEPs. And they're the only 25 ones that did not completely meet that goal.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">703</p> <p>1 Looking back at the Department of 2 Excellence standards in our Part A data, although we 3 did not reach the 40-point cut score that is 4 required by the State, you can see from the previous 5 year of 2018, where we were at an 18.3 to '19-'20, 6 where we grew to 36 points, just four points shy of 7 the cut score, that is a 17.67 point growth in one 8 year.</p> <p>9 It is our belief that if we were allowed 10 to finish out that year and COVID wouldn't have kind 11 of put a damper on things, that we feel confident 12 that we would have been able to continue to grow in 13 a positive direction.</p> <p>14 Part of the Corrective Action Plan 15 reflected upon the administration at the current 16 time. "The principal must seek out leadership 17 development opportunities on a quarterly basis and 18 report on the attempt to find and participate in 19 such programs to the PEC."</p> <p>20 I came into this position on November 25th 21 of last year; so it's just barely been a year. And 22 in that time, I have attended the new administrator 23 training presented by PED for teacher evaluations; 24 the Superintendent's finance and budget training, 25 presented by CES; the NMPED Identity, Equity and</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">705</p> <p>1 LADH was also asked to budget resources to 2 support academic growth. We were able to set aside 3 and purchase the Springboard ELA and math curriculum 4 that is aligned for the SATs. It is designed by the 5 College Board for the AP exams.</p> <p>6 So we purchased the middle school 7 component of the ELA in math and have been working 8 rigorously to make sure that our teachers are up to 9 speed and supporting our students as best as 10 possible with the new implementation of the 11 curriculum.</p> <p>12 We also purchased a high-quality 13 curriculum for our Spanish language arts and 14 science, along with all the supporting resources 15 necessary for effective implementation.</p> <p>16 During our two-year conditional approval, 17 LADH was able to focus on all of the areas laid out 18 within the Corrective Action Plan that were deemed 19 essential, and we were able to successfully complete 20 those conditions developed by the PEC through the 21 Corrective Action Plan.</p> <p>22 With reference to some of the financial 23 findings, our administration has worked closely with 24 the Vigil Group to correct several business issues. 25 We were in a transitional period. The current</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">704</p> <p>1 Transformation Forum; and I am also pursuing 2 membership in professional development opportunities 3 afforded by the National Association of Secondary 4 School Principals.</p> <p>5 I also applied to and was accepted to the 6 RISE program, Resilience Instruction Support and 7 Excellence, which was formerly known as the 8 Principals Pursuing Excellence, or the PPE program.</p> <p>9 And I also have completed the Texas A&M 10 University Educational Administration PD for 11 bilingual education.</p> <p>12 Some of the organizational indicators 13 within our Corrective Action Plan reflected on our 14 governing body. They were asked, members, to 15 complete training provided by the PEC.</p> <p>16 All of our GC members were able to 17 successfully complete that training, and most of 18 them in the early spring.</p> <p>19 For the upcoming school year, the GC was 20 asked to work on developing an administrator 21 evaluation tool and implement that. And they were 22 able to successfully collaborate with LCPS to 23 develop and implement that evaluation tool, and 24 completed the first successful evaluation at the end 25 of the 2020 school year.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">706</p> <p>1 financial audit has not been completely finalized. 2 But based on our periodic check-ins with the 3 auditors and the audit committee, all of the 4 feedback has been positive, and we feel that all of 5 these issues have been successfully resolved.</p> <p>6 However, since the audit reporting is 7 always a year behind, it's hard to be able to give 8 accurate information as to what the final audit will 9 reflect.</p> <p>10 With regard to the concerns in the 11 operating budget and percentages on administration 12 versus instructional, we have been making changes in 13 the current year in order to address some of these 14 concerns. One of our big ones is that our assistant 15 principal is also serving as our science teacher. 16 Our previous science teacher, due to unforeseen 17 circumstances, was not able to return this year, and 18 our assistant principal is also a certified science 19 teacher and has stepped up to split her time doing 20 that as well.</p> <p>21 So looking forward, in the '20-'21 school 22 year, that's shifted our percentages currently -- 23 these are all estimations, of course -- to 24 56 percent spent on instructional and 38 percent on 25 administration. It's about a 3 percent shift. And</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">707</p> <p>1 we're constantly looking for ways to improve upon 2 these shifts moving forward.</p> <p>3 Our assistant principal also supports the 4 school, serving as our student nutrition 5 coordinator, our DTC, our SAT chair. She is our 6 McKinney-Vento liaison and our eighth-grade Next 7 Step Plan coordinator. So providing several 8 instructional support services within her daily 9 duties. We all wear many hats.</p> <p>10 I, myself, serve as the bilingual 11 coordinator and continue to provide instructional 12 coaching services to all of our staff, as that was 13 my initial job duty when I first came to the 14 La Academia family.</p> <p>15 We also, because of our lower enrollment, 16 we're very aware that we needed to make some 17 adjustments. We identified our English language 18 arts teacher and recognize that she is 19 dual-certified for both ELA and social studies; so 20 she is teaching a combined unit currently of English 21 language arts and social studies.</p> <p>22 So our current social studies teacher last 23 year was -- was not returned for this year, just 24 because of financial issues when we had to tighten 25 our belts a little bit moving forward. So as I</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">709</p> <p>1 benefited from a smaller student body that allows 2 them to grow and establish their identity, build 3 confidence in themselves and their academics, while 4 learning to respect those around them.</p> <p>5 The difference in our enrollment can 6 sometimes present some challenges for the school, of 7 which we are well aware. But we are always looking 8 to constantly improve and find ways to better 9 support our students' needs.</p> <p>10 Membership. This one is one we're not too 11 happy about ourselves across the board. But due to 12 the challenges presented with this lovely pandemic, 13 the COVID-19, our recruitment has definitely 14 struggled this year.</p> <p>15 Traditionally, the spring is when students 16 and families are making choices for their next steps 17 in education. And we take our students out into the 18 community where we get to make connections, personal 19 connections, with members of the community. We 20 shake hands and participate in several community 21 events. We had even organized a recruiting night 22 for all of the charter schools in our area to take 23 place on the Plaza in Downtown Las Cruces that had 24 to be canceled due to that closure. So, again, 25 several things that would have gotten us out and</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">708</p> <p>1 mentioned, we're always evaluating our operating 2 expenses and looking for ways to make adjustments in 3 ways that will best support our students and the 4 academic advancement that we have laid out for them.</p> <p>5 Looking at the community we serve, some 6 charts that are also available in the renewal kit in 7 the Part A data.</p> <p>8 But, overall, La Academia tends to serve a 9 much higher percentage of Hispanic, low-income, ELL 10 and SpEd students than not only LCPS but the State 11 as a whole. And if you notice on the chart, 12 100 percent of the students that attend La Academia 13 are on Free and Reduced Lunch. 32 percent of them 14 are English Language Learners in contrast to 15 14 percent across the state and in the Las Cruces 16 public school system.</p> <p>17 80 percent of our students are Hispanic, 18 the highest ratio of all of the other areas across 19 the board.</p> <p>20 At LADH, all of our students are part of a 21 full bilingual school that offers a focus on 22 academics supported by multiculturalism and 23 performing arts. Many of the students that come to 24 us were struggling and a little lost in the larger 25 school communities and were falling behind; so they</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">710</p> <p>1 about.</p> <p>2 LADH, however, has continually worked to 3 change course and explore new ways of recruiting 4 students. We have increased our social media 5 presence. We've also worked with local media, print 6 and radio. We've provided recruiting and enrollment 7 information to area community organizations, such as 8 the Boys and Girls Club and CYFD. And we've also 9 begun reaching out to the church communities in our 10 area to provide them with registration information 11 as well.</p> <p>12 We've had radio spots on our local public 13 radio station, KRWG. Articles in the Sun News. 14 We've run regular recruiting ads on La Equis, which 15 is one of the local radio stations.</p> <p>16 There's a sample there of our recruiting 17 flyer that's been up on several businesses around 18 town and in LasCrucesToday.com as well.</p> <p>19 Enrollment has been, and continues to be, 20 a topic across the state, as COVID-19 has helped to 21 create a large group of students that aren't 22 attending school anywhere or have switched to home 23 school depending on their family situation.</p> <p>24 "Remote learning" has become a common 25 phrase among everyone across the state, or across</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">711</p> <p>1 the world, right now, I believe. La Academia had 2 originally designed a remote learning plan that also 3 reflected what a hybrid in-person learning would be. 4 It was always our plan to return to in-person 5 learning the minute we were given the green light 6 from the State. However, that keeps being pushed 7 back further and further. 8 We had not made any immediate changes to 9 our class schedule, only because we didn't want to 10 always be presenting new changes to the students in 11 hopes that we were coming back in person. However, 12 now that we know that that's not going to happen 13 anytime soon, we have presented an updated schedule 14 for remote learning to our governing council to 15 begin in January when we come back in the spring. 16 We are, however, offering in-person 17 tutoring and support to our students on a 18 five-to-one ratio for those students who are on 19 IEPs. 20 Moving forward, we have discussed the 21 concept of implementing a tutoring contract with our 22 students who are struggling. And we're asking 23 parents to sign off on that contract, allowing 24 them -- or allowing us to present mandatory 25 tutoring.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">713</p> <p>1 implementing a summer academy as we move forward, 2 focused on core classes in order to help close any 3 remaining learning gaps at the end of the school 4 year that students might be still struggling with. 5 The summer academy slots will prioritize 6 our struggling at-risk eighth-graders and then open 7 up to the lower grades if there's availability at 8 that time. 9 LADH is focused on the areas in which 10 progress was essential and successfully met those 11 conditions. 12 LADH continues to be committed to reset 13 and adjust course whenever necessary in the best 14 interests of our students' growth. 15 We have worked diligently to either meet 16 or make substantial progress toward achievement on 17 the PED's minimal education targets that were 18 identified within the charter contract, despite the 19 challenges provided with a two-year conditional 20 contract. 21 LADH respectfully requests that the PEC 22 renew our school's contract on a longer term basis 23 so that we can continue to improve and serve the 24 Las Cruces community. 25 Thank you, members of the Commission, for</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">712</p> <p>1 Parents will be asked to commit to 2 ensuring that their student attends at least a 3 minimum of two hours per week of tutoring, whether 4 virtual, or, if we're allowed to, in-person, if they 5 qualify for that as well. That will be focused 6 first on our at-risk students and our eighth-graders 7 as they prepare to move on. But as we have space 8 available and the ability, we will open it to all of 9 our students. 10 We have also partnered with ENGAGE 11 New Mexico so that they have been facilitating the 12 process of reaching out to families of our students 13 who we're having trouble getting ahold of. And 14 we've been sending those reports and reviewing those 15 weekly with Mr. Nate Viegas from ENGAGE New Mexico. 16 We have also applied to and been accepted 17 for the Extended Learning Time program in order to 18 help cover some of that learning loss that happened 19 in the spring. 20 We are also going to begin collaborations 21 with New Mexico Spaceport in offering the SEMAA 22 learning program provided to our students in 23 after-school/virtual environments focused on math 24 and science and digital arts. 25 We are also researching the possibility of</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">714</p> <p>1 allowing us this time. 2 THE CHAIR: Thanks. So now -- 3 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: If I can get out of 4 it. 5 THE CHAIR: -- do you -- have you got your 6 second presentation ready? 7 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Let's see. Good 8 old technology. 9 Oh, yeah. Let me do a Stop Share here and 10 switch screens. 11 The next one does have audio. So let me 12 make sure that -- 13 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Right. So when you 14 share, Sylvy, at the bottom, there should be an 15 option to share your sound or something like that. 16 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Yes, I've got that. 17 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Awesome. Thanks. 18 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Ooh. My gosh. 19 It's asking for a password that I don't think I 20 have. No, no, no. 21 So I'm going to preface this with a small 22 intro. 23 We chose this opportunity to share our 24 beginning phases of our work towards a more specific 25 (audio distortion) defined, as the totality of</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">715</p> <p>1 improved spots (audio distortion). 2 THE CHAIR: Sylvy? 3 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: I can't hear. 4 THE CHAIR: Sylvy, I hate to interrupt 5 you. But it's difficult to hear you. 6 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Yeah. Could you 7 start over again? 8 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: We switched to the 9 computer audio, and now it's -- 10 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: I actually 11 couldn't hear any of it. 12 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Is that better? 13 THE CHAIR: Just a smidge. 14 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: I'll get real 15 close. Sorry, guys. 16 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Sylvy, maybe you 17 should stop sharing and come back in, because it's 18 hard to hear you. Do your preface now and then -- 19 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: How's that? Is 20 that better? Okay. 21 I'll start over. Sorry. 22 Culture has been defined as the totality 23 of a group's thoughts, experience, patterns of 24 behavior, and its concepts, values, and 25 (indiscernible due to audio distortion) about life</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">717</p> <p>1 together a little video. This is created by our 2 newly developed Creative Media class. And it's all 3 student work that we wanted to share with you. 4 (Video played.) 5 THE CHAIR: Yes. All right. Just in 6 case. 7 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Sort of. It's kind 8 of a weird audio change today. Oh, no. 9 We wanted to keep it short and sweet, 10 especially because we know that you all have been 11 very patient and had a long few days in front of 12 you. So with that, it comes back to you all. 13 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you. So, Bev, 14 how many do we have signed up for public comment? 15 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN: At this point, we 16 have no one. 17 THE CHAIR: Okay, all right. You are 18 keeping it short and sweet. 19 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Yeah, unfortunately 20 those we did have lined up for public comment 21 couldn't make it today once we changed the schedule, 22 but it's okay. 23 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thanks. Thanks. So 24 thank you, once again; although, I have to be 25 brutally honest. The presentation is great. But</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">716</p> <p>1 that guide behavior, and how those evolve with 2 contact with other cultures. 3 Culture is formed by our programs and 4 practices that create an inclusive and open 5 educational environment for every person to be fully 6 present in their authentic selves every day. 7 We guide our students through identity, 8 which is defined, simply, as who we are. The 9 concept of identity is a complex one, shaped by 10 individual characteristics, family dynamics, 11 historical factors, and social and political 12 contexts. 13 Who am I? This is a very heavy, weighted 14 question sometimes, and we encourage our students to 15 ask themselves this and reflect on it on a daily 16 basis. 17 Equity is defined as intentional practice 18 of creating structures and systems to correct 19 historical inequalities that limit the success and 20 potential of each member of our community. We think 21 about the difference between equality and equity as 22 ensuring that everyone gets what they need. 23 Equality means everyone gets a T-shirt; 24 but equity means everyone get a T-shirt that fits. 25 With that, we asked our students to put</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">718</p> <p>1 you can't beat those little four-year-olds with the 2 fake mustaches that the elementary schools bring in. 3 It's just -- 4 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: I know. 5 THE CHAIR: Those middle-schoolers just 6 don't -- just not the same. But it's always 7 enjoyable. And it is sad, because I always enjoyed 8 seeing the school performing throughout the 9 community during the year. And we've, certainly, 10 you know, missed those presentations and those 11 times. 12 So thanks for reminding us of what it used 13 to be like, you know. So thank you and we 14 appreciate it. 15 So I have just a couple of questions. And 16 I guess -- and the concern was raised by the Charter 17 School Division -- that the students at this point 18 in time are only meeting in classroom twice a week. 19 And it was -- from the very beginning, it was highly 20 unlikely that down here, we were going to be able to 21 go into a hybrid. I mean, that was really almost a 22 nonissue. 23 So there is a concern, because we know 24 that the students are being lost and connection is 25 really important and that face time, as best you can</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">719</p> <p>1 with the teacher, is really important. And the fact 2 that the school does have struggles with -- with -- 3 with growth with the students. 4 We -- we've looked at the Corrective 5 Action Plan. And I need to make clear that the 6 Corrective Action Plan is a separate entity from the 7 renewal. But we have acknowledged, and we did close 8 out the math portion -- the English portions of 9 the -- the reading portion of the Corrective Action 10 Plan. But there are still struggles there. 11 And there are certainly struggles with 12 math. So there is that concern as to why the 13 additional face class time really wasn't a 14 consideration, or it wasn't -- not necessarily that 15 it wasn't a consideration, but that it didn't seem 16 that that was the appropriate way to go at this 17 point in time, for the -- for this semester. 18 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Right. So if I can 19 kind of clarify that a little bit? 20 THE CHAIR: Okay. Sylvy, I'm sorry. But 21 your audio was really hard. And we really need to 22 make sure that Cindy can hear it well. 23 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Let me -- I'm going 24 to disconnect my projector here, because I think 25 that might be -- I don't know. Is that any better?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">721</p> <p>1 submitted to both CSD and PED that had been 2 approved. So that is what we started the year with. 3 It's a little misleading, in the sense 4 that it's two days of direct instruction for an hour 5 per class period; so all of their classes, first 6 through seventh period. 7 Then there is a day of direct one-on-one 8 with the teacher on Wednesdays with their advisory 9 teacher. So it's actually three days of full 10 interaction. And then the other two days were 11 optional, where students could log in if they needed 12 clarification, if they needed extra support. If 13 they were absent and missed something, they had the 14 option of logging in with the alternate days with 15 the other class to join in on that instruction. 16 So with A group Monday and Tuesday, B 17 group on Thursday and Friday, and everyone on 18 Wednesday. So they're getting that minimum three 19 days of face-to-face virtually, and then two days to 20 work on assignments and activities with the option 21 to log in for extra support and tutoring. 22 Now, moving forward, starting in January, 23 it will be four days of direct face-to-face 24 instruction for the duration of the closures, with a 25 mandatory -- or not a mandatory -- but with two</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">720</p> <p>1 THE REPORTER: (Indicates.) 2 THE CHAIR: I think, yes. And Cindy is 3 shaking her head "yes." 4 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Sorry about that. 5 We were connected to an overhead projector here, so 6 I think it was trying to pick up that audio. 7 So let me clarify a little bit on what our 8 schedule was -- or -- and will no longer -- 9 THE CHAIR: Okay. Now you're frozen. 10 Sorry. 11 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: So we had a 12 schedule, face-to-face direct instruction -- 13 THE CHAIR: Sylvy, I'm sorry. Now you're 14 freezing. 15 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Sylvy, I suggest -- 16 THE CHAIR: Not that we don't like to look 17 at you. But if you turn off your video, we might be 18 able to hear it better. 19 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Okay. Sorry about 20 that. Got to love these technology challenges. 21 Here we go. 22 So we were on a hybrid A-B schedule, 23 because, as we had mentioned, we were planning to 24 come back in person as quickly as possible. That 25 was the approved reentry schedule that we had</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">722</p> <p>1 hours of tutoring time every morning before classes 2 start. 3 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you so much for 4 that clarification. 5 And I guess the -- an additional ongoing 6 concern is the consistent overestimating the number 7 of students. I mean, I understand, to some degree, 8 with the prior administrator. I don't understand 9 why the -- why the governance council didn't know 10 that she wasn't actively recruiting. So I -- and 11 the governance council approved a budget based on 12 that projected number. 13 So if you don't -- if you know that the 14 head administrator isn't recruiting, there's a 15 concern. That was a big over-projection. 16 And, then, once again, last year, there 17 was another significant over-projection. And there 18 appears to be just eating down reserves, which we 19 know isn't financially the best practice. And I 20 know Commissioner Robbins can probably speak to this 21 certainly better than I can. But I know that's not 22 a good practice. 23 And there is that -- the school is not 24 meeting the target level of dollar support for 25 academics that's recommended by this state, SB 5. I</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">723</p> <p>1 think those fundings, they put at 68 percent, I 2 believe.</p> <p>3 So there is that concern that there's 4 going to continue to be challenges with a low 5 student enrollment, an enrollment that consistently 6 gets over-projected every year, and that has serious 7 financial consequences.</p> <p>8 So I don't know whether you want to speak 9 to that, whether Mike wants to speak to that, 10 whether someone from the governing council wants 11 to -- you know, anyone that wants to speak to it, 12 certainly.</p> <p>13 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: I can speak to a 14 little bit of it briefly. And then if anyone from 15 the governance council or Mr. Vigil wants to step 16 in, by all means.</p> <p>17 So, you know, as you mentioned, there 18 wasn't a lot of recruitment under the previous 19 administration. Along with that was a moving to a 20 new location that was out of the way for a lot of 21 our families, which caused them to withdraw and move 22 to somewhere else, with some negative press based 23 on -- on the fact that word spread quickly that we 24 were at risk of not being renewed.</p> <p>25 So parents just went ahead and put their</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">725</p> <p>1 consideration? We moved. There's an understanding 2 that stuff happened and there is bad press. But 3 there was a big over-projection for that year.</p> <p>4 That's where the concern is, the good 5 decision making. And that's the concern; not 6 that -- we understand the loss. But somewhere, 7 someone didn't understand the loss. That's what 8 we're looking at, the -- you know.</p> <p>9 Yes, we had these losses. But we're -- 10 our expectation is we're going to have, you know, 11 almost as many kids.</p> <p>12 So that's -- that's where the concern is, 13 that the decision making seems to be disjointed 14 somehow from the reality.</p> <p>15 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: I completely 16 understand what you're saying, Madam Chair. I don't 17 know if anyone else wants to speak to that. I 18 wasn't part of that decision making process at the 19 time, so I can't really speak to that.</p> <p>20 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Madam Chair, if I 21 may suggest, I would like to hear from Mr. Vigil. I 22 know that there's ways to negotiate paying them back 23 to where the finances could be healthy enough for 24 growth and immediate attention. So -- and I 25 remember asking the man that's in charge of the</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">724</p> <p>1 kids somewhere else because they were convinced we 2 were closing down.</p> <p>3 Now, currently, in my position that I'm 4 at, you know, before COVID, we had, you know, pushed 5 really hard to recruit and to get the word out that 6 we are in a new location, we're here, we're ready to 7 support everyone. I think we even bumped into you 8 at a parade in Old Mesilla when we were handing out 9 flyers to students, to anyone we saw that might be 10 of school age that could come to us.</p> <p>11 And I think we were just in the perfect 12 storm of different things coming across that just 13 really knocked our enrollment down right now. 14 Unfortunately, there's no really other way to put 15 it, from my perspective, anyways.</p> <p>16 THE CHAIR: Okay. I -- so I just need to 17 be refreshed a little bit. Because if I remember 18 correctly, the school moved. And the school was in 19 for a year before the non-renewal came; correct?</p> <p>20 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Well, yes and no.</p> <p>21 THE CHAIR: No? You moved the same year 22 of the renewal application. When we voted in 23 December, you had just moved in in August. I get 24 that, and I fully understand what a move does.</p> <p>25 But why isn't that taken into</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">726</p> <p>1 Department, the finance -- I forget his name -- and 2 because I was concerned that he set a very rigorous 3 payback.</p> <p>4 And I brought it up with another charter 5 school, that issue. And he said yes, it was left 6 open that we could extend it a little bit more, the 7 payback. But he felt that he could pay it back 8 within that time limit that he was given. And he 9 did. And great for him.</p> <p>10 But --</p> <p>11 THE CHAIR: And I understand that. But 12 the pattern continues. That's the problem. You 13 can't keep making the same mistake budget year after 14 budget year after budget year, because then it does 15 accumulate, you know.</p> <p>16 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Right.</p> <p>17 THE CHAIR: You keep paying the minimum on 18 your credit card and still keep going out and 19 spending a lot.</p> <p>20 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: I believe 21 Mr. Palacios, who is a member of our GC, is trying 22 to unmute. But he's having some trouble. So I 23 don't know if it's on that side. He just sent me a 24 message.</p> <p>25 THE CHAIR: Let me see.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">727</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: He's there. 2 THE CHAIR: Oh. You're unmuted now. 3 MS. KAREN WOERNER: And I don't hear him. 4 THE CHAIR: No. You show unmuted, but we 5 can't hear you. 6 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Robert, you need to 7 raise your volume, maybe? 8 MR. ROBERT PALACIOS: (Indicates.) 9 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Alternatively, 10 Mr. Palacios, you could go down by the microphone 11 and choose switch to phone audio, and it'll give up 12 the information to call in. You may want to try 13 that if we don't get the unmuting working. You're 14 unmuted, but we don't hear you. 15 MR. MIKE VIGIL II: Madam Chair, while 16 he's attempting to unmute, maybe I could speak a few 17 words to the budget and the cash concerns that are 18 arisen. 19 Madam Chair, members of the Commission, I 20 am Mike Vigil. We began working with La Academia 21 October 2018. I believe myself and another business 22 manager drove down and met with the school during 23 the time of some turmoil. 24 So at that time, we spent the remainder of 25 FY '19 trying to get the finances, just from the</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">729</p> <p>1 because that doesn't, you know, happen until January 2 or February, when the PED comes saying, "Get your 3 final unit value," and you didn't meet your 4 projection. 5 So what we are doing is more monitoring on 6 this school because of the situation of not 7 (indiscernible) a projection. This is not our first 8 go-round in which this school has done this. 9 Fortunately for this one, this one does have a 10 healthier cash balance than you see some that do 11 this on a year-to-year basis. 12 The unaudited cash balance that we have 13 going into Fiscal Year '21 was a little under 14 \$300,000. So that does have only the operational 15 funds. So they're not floating on any capital at 16 that point. 17 So what that means, though, we are likely 18 going to cut way into that cash carryover to make 19 ends meet for Fiscal Year '21 and likely going into 20 Fiscal Year '22. 21 One thing to mention as far as the count 22 for the 40-day of this year is that I did see the 23 PED presented to the LFC that they're asking that 24 they hold harmless any schools that have significant 25 losses from the current fiscal year, because there</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">728</p> <p>1 day-to-day, back in order. And then we were right 2 into budget season and then right into audit season. 3 So for us, it was a quick, trying to 4 basically put a Band-Aid on it and move forward. 5 And that gave us to Fiscal Year '19-'20, our first 6 full fiscal year, to put the finances in a situation 7 where they would have an understanding at the 8 administrative and governing council level to 9 achieve their goals and not have these issues as far 10 as over-projecting on budget and things of that 11 nature. 12 Unfortunately, we cannot speak to that 13 FY '20 budget to see how it went as far as 14 (indiscernible) year. But we can tell you that, 15 from our perspective, they are progressing in that 16 area. 17 When it comes to the over-projection on 18 students, this is something we always do not 19 recommend that the schools do, in general. Unless a 20 school is growing robustly and they have people 21 knocking down the door, we request that they assume 22 no growth and then they take growth as a plus when 23 those students come through as fruition, basic 24 reason being we don't want to cut checks back to the 25 PED, and it really puts a strain on the budget,</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">730</p> <p>1 are 12- to 15,000 students statewide that are 2 essentially missing. 3 So big chunks -- APS has a lot of those 4 schools. But I think every single charter feels a 5 little impact, and there is a handful that saw some 6 increases due to enhanced hybrid models or other 7 models that were more successful. 8 If that "hold harmless" comes through, or 9 if we're able to have a small dent into the cash 10 carryover, we can build the next few years on a 11 number of things, one being on projections. The 12 school needs to be realistic when it comes to how 13 many students they'll see in the seats. That comes 14 with the recruitment being bolstered, which our 15 current administration has done. 16 And that also includes the administration 17 being stable. You know, you don't want to see 18 somebody being turned over, and the next person 19 says, "You know what? Recruitment isn't working; 20 we're not going to do it." And so once again you're 21 going back to enrollment issues. 22 But what we see and what's current and 23 going forward is that there should be some 24 stability. The finances are on the right track. We 25 do have a cash balance that should be able to take</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">731</p> <p>1 this what I would think would be a momentary hit. 2 And then, I think, you know, over the two or three 3 years, we'd be back to a fund balance where the 4 school is comfortable, where if there is a rainy 5 day, if there is another pandemic, whatever it might 6 be, the cash balance will once again be restored to 7 a level to where the school can operate the program 8 and the students will not be affected in a negative 9 way. 10 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you so much. So 11 let me just -- Mike, let me just ask you a question. 12 Because maybe I'm -- and it's not just on this 13 school. but when you're talking about "hold 14 harmless," so if, as an example, a school -- a 15 charter school over-projected -- or even a 16 traditional school over-projected -- is there -- for 17 this year, is there a chance that because PED's 18 going to say, "Well, that's because of COVID, and, 19 therefore, we're going to hold harmless for any 20 payback for this year," is that kind of what you're 21 saying? 22 MR. VIGIL: I don't believe so. They have 23 not been, from my understanding, given their actual 24 layout for what that means. But I think this is 25 going to go towards your 80-120 counts and not the</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">733</p> <p>1 two-year contract. The other schools were on 2 five-year contracts, so we had all of those prior 3 years. But this school only had a two-year 4 contract. So the only thing that could be uploaded 5 was information for this -- for this current 6 contract term, which is unfortunately not a lot. 7 That's the problem. 8 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Okay. Karen? 9 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Madam Chair, 10 Commissioner Robbins, yes, Chairwoman Gipson is 11 absolutely correct. Because of the contract term, 12 we're very limited. 13 I did want to point out, though, that if 14 you are looking for the financial statements that 15 they did provide, they're on Pages 60 and 61. But, 16 of course, it's only the one year, because this is 17 their second year of the contract. 18 Also, on Page 15, we did provide '18-'19 19 and '19-'20 as a comparison for you. 20 But '19-'20 is the only year in this 21 contract term. And because of that, if you -- if 22 the Commission is so inclined to renew the school, I 23 would ask that you do no less than three years, 24 because it gives -- it makes it really difficult. 25 In a two-year contract, we only have one year of</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">732</p> <p>1 growth units that are affected on 40-day. I think 2 they're going to especially go after those that 3 severely over-projected and say, "You didn't earn 4 those new growth units." (Audio distortion) you're 5 going to be hurt. But I think in future years is 6 where the "hold harmless" will take effect. 7 THE CHAIR: All right. Thanks. I 8 appreciate that. 9 Commissioners? 10 Commissioner Robbins? 11 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Thank you. And I 12 appreciate, Michael, what you had to say. 13 One thing I noted, and maybe Karen could 14 mention this, I noted in all the stuff that we have 15 on SharePoint, virtually every other charter we had 16 up for renewal, we had three or four years of their 17 budget expenditures so we could kind of look at 18 them. 19 I didn't see that for this school. Did 20 they just not provide it? Or did it not get 21 uploaded? I saw a lot of stuff about petitions from 22 teachers and parents and a lot of stuff about -- but 23 I didn't see a lot about actual performance, 24 financial or otherwise. 25 THE CHAIR: It's because they're a</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">734</p> <p>1 data. 2 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Well, can you tell 3 me which file? Because we don't have that big file, 4 that single file that has 200-and-some-odd pages. 5 It was broken down in the SharePoint. And I don't 6 see page numbers on what I'm looking at in 7 SharePoint. Give me a file name. 8 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Sure. If you go into 9 the SharePoint, Commissioner, the reason you saw 10 them broken down, is, as you know, we've been 11 uploading them throughout the process all fall. So 12 you've been reviewing them as they've come in, and 13 they were all separate pieces. 14 But if you would go into your SharePoint 15 to the materials for this meeting, there's a listing 16 for today. If you go down to 06 -- because it's 17 Item No. 6 -- for 2020 December -- it was the 9th, 18 because the school was supposed to be on 19 December 9th, see "La Academia Dolores Huerta 20 Packet," that one is numbered with all the numbers 21 I've been referencing. 22 Do I need to repeat that? 23 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Well, I see the 24 packet, and I'm in the packet. But I don't have a 25 file with everything in it. I have Progress Report,</p>

735

1 Data Report.
 2 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Madam Chair,
 3 while he's looking for the information, may I ask a
 4 question?
 5 THE CHAIR: Sure.
 6 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: For the school,
 7 you've been recently -- or maybe for a while now, I
 8 can't remember -- Illuminate. How is that working?
 9 In the past, have you had it for a while, and how is
 10 that working now? And is it working for you to
 11 identify your students that are making progress
 12 super-well and those that are just limping along
 13 with progress? How is that working for you?
 14 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Well, the school
 15 itself only has one year of experience with it. I
 16 myself have multiple years of experience with it
 17 from a prior district. So it does provide a lot of
 18 excellent timely feedback when you are able to use
 19 it properly.
 20 With the COVID closures and the inability
 21 to guarantee test security and test validity, it has
 22 not provided the most reliable or accurate data,
 23 because it doesn't have a lockdown browser. It is
 24 Internet-based, but you can have that screen open
 25 and then have other tabs open behind it.

736

1 So there's no way to ensure that students
 2 aren't Googling answers, that parents aren't helping
 3 them, that their siblings aren't doing it. And even
 4 in regular class during instruction --
 5 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: You froze.
 6 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: -- we've had (audio
 7 distortion) in the background and (audio
 8 distortion). So it's been really tough in the
 9 virtual environment.
 10 I do know that Illuminate is in the
 11 process of developing a lockdown browser for it so
 12 that we can have a little more reliability moving
 13 forward.
 14 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: I had no idea
 15 that that was the case, and I'm glad you illuminated
 16 me on that.
 17 I hope that security comes into play,
 18 because we're going to -- we're going to be living
 19 through COVID and Internet teaching for quite a
 20 while. I hate to say it, but I can say next year
 21 and the following year also, before we actually
 22 secure every citizen with anti-viral.
 23 So we've got to make the best. Thank you
 24 for that information.
 25 THE CHAIR: And I just want to remind

737

1 Commissioners that, once again, that this was not a
 2 Public Education Commission decision that the
 3 two-year contract was put into place. This came
 4 from PED. So I just want to make that clear.
 5 Commissioner Voigt?
 6 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you,
 7 Madam Chair. And thank you for the presentation,
 8 La Academia de Dolores Huerta. I always like seeing
 9 the students. And since that was a student-produced
 10 video, that's even more awesome. So thank you for
 11 that.
 12 I just had a question when you had
 13 mentioned, I think, Sylvy, about mandatory tutoring.
 14 So what if, you know, they don't want to come to
 15 tutoring? So I know they're just hurting themselves
 16 and they wouldn't be getting those extra services.
 17 But what if they don't come to tutoring? What are
 18 you going to --
 19 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Part of the thought
 20 process behind that is that, you know, we talk to
 21 the kid. We schedule some tutoring time, and then
 22 mom has to run off to go run an errand and takes the
 23 kids with them, or they schedule a doctor's
 24 appointment so they don't show up. So there's that
 25 kind of conflict of where the priority is.

738

1 The idea is that if we have the parents
 2 sign the contract and they are aware that this is
 3 allotted time for tutoring for your student, and
 4 they, as the parent, are not making that a priority,
 5 and the teacher can't find any other time or the
 6 student isn't allowing any other time for tutoring,
 7 if we have to, heaven forbid, make a recommendation
 8 for retention at the end of the school year because
 9 they just haven't put forth any effort, we kind of
 10 have this contract of supporting documentation of,
 11 "We have tried as a school and as a staff to do
 12 everything we can for your kid. So you as a parent
 13 and as a student have not put in your two cents to
 14 help us out." So it's a give-and-take.
 15 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: It's a contract.
 16 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Yeah, it's a
 17 contract. So we're hoping, by seeing it on paper,
 18 it's a little more real to them and they put in a
 19 little more effort to ensuring that they're logged
 20 on at the right time; or, if they're on IEPs and can
 21 come in to five-to-one, they show up when they say
 22 they're going to.
 23 Because we have several that we schedule
 24 appointments, and the teacher is here in person,
 25 we've got all our PPE on, and nobody shows up. So

739

1 we're trying to figure things out.
 2 So having that contract in place, I feel,
 3 will give it a little more importance and urgency.
 4 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you. And then
 5 also with your imbalance of admin spending versus
 6 your instructional spending, is some of that, that
 7 39 -- I think it was, like, 39 percent in
 8 administrative costs versus your instructional
 9 student support spending, was it, like, 53 percent?
 10 Is some of that high number any recruitment or
 11 marketing materials?
 12 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: No. Actually, I
 13 paid for it out of my own pocket; so...
 14 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Wow. Okay. So
 15 that's an imbalance you need to be corrected to get
 16 to that House Bill 5 requirement of 68 percent.
 17 And then have you -- I know ENGAGE is
 18 contracting with PED to provide student-finding
 19 services, you know, throughout New Mexico. Have you
 20 actually started working with ENGAGE yet? Or you're
 21 going to?
 22 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: No, we've already
 23 started. We have our first two weeks' worth of
 24 reports. They give us updated reports every Friday
 25 for us to review to see how many kids they've been

740

1 able to get in contact with, how many attempts at
 2 contact. They try via text and phone both. And I
 3 think they have seven tries for each avenue that
 4 they use, seven to ten tries before they move on to
 5 the next or put them in a different category of
 6 unable to communicate.
 7 So we've been getting weekly updates on
 8 that. I just had a meeting with Mr. Viegas the
 9 other day to get a little PD on how exactly to read
 10 that report and the type of information that is
 11 included in that.
 12 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Did they have any
 13 success?
 14 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Yes and no. They
 15 had -- they've been able to contact 29 percent of
 16 our student body. And they did contact and get some
 17 feedback. But the rest, they still are not -- they
 18 can't find them.
 19 We've shared every phone number we have in
 20 our system, and even the neighbors' contacts, you
 21 know, just in case. And so, yeah, I think that it's
 22 a struggle. And I hate to say it. It was a little
 23 reassuring for us to know that we weren't crazy when
 24 we keep trying to call and nobody answers us.
 25 And now, through ENGAGE, we see they're

741

1 having some of the same challenges we've been
 2 having. And our social worker and our SpEd
 3 coordinator have also been conducting home visits
 4 whenever they can to try and reach out to our kids
 5 that we know are really struggling. We have a
 6 couple of foster students that we know are in
 7 difficult situations; so we're trying to make
 8 contact with them as often as possible.
 9 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Super. Thank you.
 10 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: It's been very
 11 difficult for the immigrant community to survive
 12 through COVID. I know that in my neighborhood --
 13 and I live in a predominantly migrant community.
 14 And I see families coming in from other states
 15 having to move in with -- with family here. So
 16 they're doubling up in homes to survive.
 17 Unfortunately, I've seen at least one
 18 family -- and I don't know why -- what family would
 19 decide to go back to Mexico. And I just can't ask
 20 them why. But that's the reality. Or they have to
 21 move to cheaper housing quarters.
 22 And so they're moving about the -- in
 23 Albuquerque, just trying to stay afloat. And we're
 24 going to see that type of movement.
 25 I did check ENGAGE New Mexico in the

742

1 website. And it was in -- all in English, no
 2 translation. And I was really concerned. And I
 3 don't know if it matters out in the real world at
 4 all.
 5 But I was disappointed that there wasn't
 6 something there that says, "Español (indiscernible)
 7 aqui," or something, so that families can go there.
 8 I know that there are very few that can go into the
 9 Internet. But we have some young families, that the
 10 ladies use their cell phone. They've gotten very
 11 good at using their cell phone to get into websites.
 12 But how did you find ENGAGE to be helpful
 13 to you?
 14 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: I was just letting
 15 the Commissioner know that, yes, there is
 16 information made available to our parents in both
 17 English and Spanish. Actually, ENGAGE did send us,
 18 via e-mail, the Spanish correspondence that we could
 19 share the details, what they provide. And we also
 20 informed them that the majority of our parents are
 21 Spanish-speakers. So they make sure that whoever is
 22 making those contacts or making the phone calls is
 23 someone that speaks Spanish so that they can
 24 communicate with them.
 25 So they did make an effort to put that

<p style="text-align: right;">743</p> <p>1 down and make sure that that is a priority within 2 our schools.</p> <p>3 It has been a challenge. And as you were 4 saying, why anyone would move -- I know we have a 5 few students whose parents went and dropped them off 6 with relatives back in Mexico so they can stay here 7 and work. And kids are trying to log on. So it's 8 not always reliable. It's challenging, but we're 9 doing our best to work with them.</p> <p>10 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: The chances of 11 those kids returning gets smaller and smaller and 12 smaller. The COVID is spreading very, very rapidly 13 in Mexico. I talk to relatives, and I can't count 14 on my hand all the ones I've lost already. And it 15 started with the belief, from what Trump was saying, 16 that it was fake. And I don't know Mexicans would 17 take that as true. But I kept hearing that, and I 18 got tired of arguing.</p> <p>19 THE CHAIR: So, Sylvy, you mentioned 20 something about the mandatory time and IEP meetings. 21 And it just -- so IEPs came up.</p> <p>22 So how are you providing services at this 23 point in time for your students with IEPs?</p> <p>24 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: So we give them the 25 option to come in in person if the parents feel</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">745</p> <p>1 person on Wednesdays. The others are logging in 2 virtually via Zoom at their assigned appointment 3 times.</p> <p>4 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay. And so 5 the services that they require, however many hours 6 that is a week, those -- are those on a Zoom -- of 7 course, I'm sure it's a Zoom -- sometime other than 8 the regular classroom? Or how are they getting 9 those services?</p> <p>10 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Yes. Normally, 11 right now, the way our schedule is set, they have 12 Wednesdays open for all of that. So our kids -- all 13 of our kids have to meet with their adviser teacher 14 Wednesday mornings for one hour from 9:30 to 10:30. 15 After that, the rest of the day is open for any 16 other services that need to be provided. So our 17 SLP, our social worker, all of our services are 18 scheduled throughout the day on Wednesdays.</p> <p>19 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: The kids know 20 about that. They're supposed to be there, for 21 example, SLP services.</p> <p>22 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: So far those kids 23 that need those specific services have been very 24 good about showing up; so...</p> <p>25 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay. And I</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">744</p> <p>1 comfortable doing that, since we are allowed that 2 (audio distortion).</p> <p>3 THE CHAIR: Oh, you're freezing.</p> <p>4 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: -- if (audio 5 distortion) with a different service provider. We 6 schedule virtual meetings with all of their service 7 providers if the parents don't feel comfortable 8 coming in.</p> <p>9 THE CHAIR: All right. Thanks. 10 Commissioner Robbins, are you set? Or do 11 you have a question? I don't know whether --</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: No. I was able to 13 get into the packet. And I think my answer -- my 14 question was answered by Ms. Woerner. So...</p> <p>15 THE CHAIR: Okay. All right. Thanks. 16 Commissioners? 17 Commissioner Armbruster?</p> <p>18 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Yes. So -- so 19 how many special education students do you have, 20 total, of these --</p> <p>21 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Currently, have 13.</p> <p>22 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: And of the 13, 23 only four -- according to this report, four are 24 coming in on Wednesdays?</p> <p>25 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Four are coming in</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">746</p> <p>1 guess I'm going to say a couple of comments. I 2 think it's very difficult for us, as well as for 3 you, because you seem to me to be quite competent in 4 kind of knowing what's going on.</p> <p>5 But this school is 16 years old, and it 6 hasn't been doing a good job of educating students.</p> <p>7 I'm not saying that everything is bad. Of 8 course not. The music and how they feel about 9 themselves and the social-emotional learning, all of 10 those are outstanding. But in the end of the day -- 11 and I'll point this out, because I don't know if you 12 knew that. But in the last report cards -- and we 13 can say whatever we want about the report cards.</p> <p>14 But the point is that they went -- and I 15 recall this -- I can't recall exact numbers. But 16 they started out with, like, a "C" in 2015. Then 17 they went to an "F" and an "F" and an "F."</p> <p>18 And the last "F," each "F" was lower than 19 the one before, had 18 points. So on that paper 20 that we got from something -- and at this point, I 21 can't even remember -- it mentioned, "Well, they've 22 gone up from 18 points to 36," or, "They went up 23 36 points to 40," or something like that.</p> <p>24 But the thing is, I looked at those 25 18 points. This was before today; this is a year</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">747</p> <p>1 ago. And of the 18 points, which is what astounded 2 me, is that 10 of the points were from the parent 3 kind of survey, "Do you like this school?" 4 So, yeah, because of course they got all 5 the points, because parents chose to send their 6 children to this school. 7 So that left 8 points that had to be 8 divided through the rest of the report card. So 9 some of the scores, the highest performing, the 10 lowest performing, all of those kinds of things that 11 were on that report card, were less than -- less 12 than one point. 13 So the fact that they have 36 now -- I'm 14 not sure that -- I'm not sure you can measure those 15 two things. I think they were different during 16 that. 17 So I guess the other -- I think it's been 18 interesting and positive that when we placed a CAP 19 on the school that you had to do this. And we -- 20 the PEC, as Commissioner Gipson has said -- we would 21 never have done a two-year -- not because of COVID, 22 but just for this very reason that you only really 23 have a year. But what has shown is that the school 24 is capable of improving, and it hasn't chosen to do 25 that until we closed it, so to speak. And then it</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">749</p> <p>1 days for staff meetings and PD and building 2 sanitization, because we do have kids coming in in 3 person. 4 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Right. But 5 they're only coming on Wednesdays in person. 6 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: So as soon as they 7 leave, we have to be sure everything gets wiped down 8 and cleaned up. 9 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay. Thank 10 you. 11 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Madam Chair? 12 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Voigt? 13 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you. I left 14 something off. I really wanted to hear from the 15 governing board. Are there any governing board 16 members that have been active since the inception of 17 the school? 18 THE CHAIR: Oh, no. 19 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Okay. So the 20 governing board really is the entity that should 21 have been digging in on the challenges as they were 22 arising from the school, you know, to fully try to 23 protect their school. So I was just -- is there 24 anyone from the governing board who can speak to any 25 of these topics that we've been discussing?</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">748</p> <p>1 was reopened. And I find that, in a sense, 2 confusing as to why that had to occur before they 3 could do that. 4 And that's just a comment. 5 But let me see. We did the IEPs. The 6 kids are coming in. Do you have transportation? 7 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: No, we do not 8 provide transportation. And that, I think, has been 9 a bit of a challenge. 10 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Everything is a 11 challenge, I'm sure. But you have -- you have food 12 service. 13 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: We do. And ongoing 14 during COVID, we ensure that all of our students 15 have breakfast and lunch, those that wish to come by 16 and pick it up. 17 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay. So in 18 January, I guess is when we're talking about, you're 19 going to four days in -- I don't call it 20 in-person -- in Zoom. And then Wednesday. 21 So Wednesday is going to be a check-in 22 with the advisory. You're working with the special 23 ed kids in person. And what else happens on 24 Wednesday? 25 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Those will also be</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">750</p> <p>1 MR. ROBERT PALACIOS: Madam Chair, 2 Commissioner Voigt. 3 THE CHAIR: I can actually hear you. 4 MR. ROBERT PALACIOS: You can hear me now? 5 Madam Chair, Commissioner Voigt, thank you 6 for this opportunity. And I did want to touch on 7 this. This governing council, you know, as 8 Commissioner Armbruster was pointing out, is -- 9 there has to be something more behind the school 10 than the head administrator. And to see those "F"s, 11 "F"s, "F"s, as a school, is very concerning. 12 And I'm proud to say that the mission of 13 this GC, and now with our amazing head 14 administrator, are able to meet those goals that 15 were put in the CAP and to push to grow the school. 16 It's not fair to our youth, to our 17 students, to have subpar education. And so our goal 18 is to improve on it. 19 And this GC has been together for about 20 three years now, going on our fourth year of the 21 same members involved in this school's progress. 22 And being able to hold a head administrator 23 accountable and to push towards those goals that 24 have been set has not been easy. But we are up for 25 the task, and we are here to help this school grow</p>

751	<p>1 and to make sure that the education standards are 2 not only met, but eventually exceeded.</p> <p>3 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you. And so 4 with the governing council, you have an audit 5 committee, a finance committee, and all your 6 different committees that meet and report out to the 7 board. So -- and the administrator does a budgetary 8 presentation at the beginning of every year that you 9 all sign off on and scrutinize and question and all 10 of that?</p> <p>11 MR. ROBERT PALACIOS: Yes. And, for 12 myself, I am the treasurer. I am the head of the 13 finance committee. So I report each board meeting 14 to the GC.</p> <p>15 And we have been focusing very closely on 16 that number. It was a mistake of ours to project 17 120. And we've been watching it all year. Every 18 finance meeting we're looking at that number and 19 seeing what it's going to do to our school.</p> <p>20 And we'll not make that mistake again. If 21 we are able to stay closer to a reasonable number 22 and if we're showing progress for the next year, or 23 growth, then we can project a higher number. But 24 that 120 was a sustainment from the previous year. 25 We did not project growth, but we did keep the 120</p>	753	<p>1 "Freeze."</p> <p>2 THE CHAIR: Apparently, he -- he can't 3 hear us, either.</p> <p>4 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Right. He's in 5 Deming. Not sure how good the Internet is over 6 there.</p> <p>7 THE CHAIR: Well, I think he jumped off to 8 come -- maybe he's trying to come back on, because I 9 don't see him anymore. So maybe he's trying to log 10 back in.</p> <p>11 MS. KAREN WOERNER: I'll watch for him in 12 Attendees just in case he doesn't come back 13 automatically.</p> <p>14 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: So let me just 15 echo what Commissioner Voigt asked from the 16 governing council.</p> <p>17 My experience with organizations is that 18 the organization is as good as the governing -- or 19 board of directors. And if the board of directors, 20 or governing council in this case, is solid and 21 doesn't have a lot of drop and they stay together 22 consistently, go through training, be proactive in 23 asking questions, not take anything for granted, the 24 organization -- in this case, it's a school -- will 25 flourish. Because that's the guide, the guide for</p>
752	<p>1 number.</p> <p>2 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yeah, I see. Yeah. 3 Definitely better to under-project, for sure.</p> <p>4 MR. ROBERT PALACIOS: Yes.</p> <p>5 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Okay. Thank you.</p> <p>6 THE CHAIR: Oh. Commissioner Chavez?</p> <p>7 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes. I just want to 8 echo some of the concerns that we were talking about 9 with the budget. I think that's my biggest concern 10 right now is -- is, you know, the stability of their 11 budget. And I know that we heard from Mr. Vigil 12 talk about their cash reserve.</p> <p>13 But, you know, that's -- that's only going 14 to sustain them for another year, if -- as we're 15 looking at the (feed frozen).</p> <p>16 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Commissioner Chavez, I 17 think we've lost you a little bit.</p> <p>18 THE CHAIR: Yeah. Commissioner Chavez, 19 you've frozen.</p> <p>20 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Commissioner Chavez, 21 you may want to try stopping your video.</p> <p>22 THE CHAIR: Stop your video, and that way 23 hopefully we can still hear you?</p> <p>24 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: It's like one of 25 those games we played when we were children.</p>	754	<p>1 the head administrator. And the head administrator 2 cannot do it by herself. They need a good solid 3 governing council.</p> <p>4 And I think three years with the same 5 board, I see that that's the proven key that has -- 6 is projecting you to a lot of improvement. And the 7 head administrator is very lucky to have this 8 governing council.</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Commissioner Chavez 10 just texted me that he's lost his Internet, and he's 11 trying to get back in.</p> <p>12 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Commissioner Ruiz, I 13 can e-mail him -- maybe he doesn't have the Internet 14 connection to get his e-mail. I can maybe send him 15 the phone number to call in.</p> <p>16 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Okay. Let me text it.</p> <p>17 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Madam Chair?</p> <p>18 THE CHAIR: Welcome back.</p> <p>19 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Oh, he's back.</p> <p>20 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Sorry about that.</p> <p>21 THE CHAIR: That's okay. We're glad 22 you're able to get back.</p> <p>23 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: My Internet was fine 24 all day long, and then -- Murphy's Law; right? 25 So I apologize for that. But I just</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">755</p> <p>1 wanted to just talk again about my concern, given 2 the -- the FTEs -- I think you have, like, 11 FTEs 3 with 71 students -- staff FTEs -- which brings you a 4 ratio of about six, six-and-a-half kids per FTE, 5 staff FTE. 6 And I'm just wondering, you know, given 7 the state of your budget and everything, do you have 8 a -- do you have a plan in place? Because one of 9 two things has to happen, you know. You either have 10 to increase enrollment, or you have to start looking 11 at some type of reduction in expenses. 12 And you're already kind of lopsided with 13 administrative costs versus instructional costs. 14 And so I just -- I'd like to hear, you know, what 15 kind of plans are being thought of at this time. 16 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Well, as I 17 mentioned earlier, we had already started thinking. 18 And that's why this year, we identified a teacher 19 that was dual-certified, and, because we knew we had 20 lower numbers, were able to basically RIF a 21 position. And now we have one person teaching both 22 language arts and social studies. 23 And then our AP is pulling dual duty and 24 teaching science as well. That was another person 25 that we did not replace. We just went ahead and</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">757</p> <p>1 out. 2 So I notice that part of the original 3 Corrective Action Plan was for the school to engage 4 in NM DASH. And I'm assuming that you are doing 5 that; is that correct? 6 So other than NM DASH, do you have some 7 other different, new, unique -- whatever -- ways of 8 teaching that you haven't -- that the staff hasn't 9 been doing before? 10 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Well, we're really 11 pushing to work on differentiated instruction in a 12 more accurate form. I think before, it was just 13 more willy-nilly, here-and-there. So through direct 14 instructional coaching with the teachers, it's 15 focusing on giving them more clear strategies and 16 also looking at standards-based grading and 17 assessments instead of just an overall, did they 18 complete the hundred math problems last night and 19 didn't really get anything out of it. 20 So it's focusing in on what the priority 21 is in instruction, what is it that we're trying to 22 get out of the students, and also helping the 23 students to understand the why. Why are we teaching 24 them what we're teaching them? Why is this 25 important to their future? Because if the students</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">756</p> <p>1 made it a dual title, I guess. 2 And then moving forward, if, heaven 3 forbid, we have to cut a little bit more, it would 4 have to unfortunately start eating into some of our 5 electives. Because we only have -- core classes are 6 priority, of course, and we need at least one person 7 for each. As you know, they need to have 8 eighth-grade certification. And it's more of a 9 specialty certification when you're in the middle 10 school than a neutral, can teach all subjects, like 11 in elementary, since we're six through eight here. 12 But if we can find a teacher that has the 13 ability to teach multiple subjects, that would 14 definitely give them priority as we adjust our class 15 sizes. 16 We also don't want to overwhelm teachers 17 either by overloading them, if that does happen. 18 We'd rather have to open a position and hire down 19 the line, but tighten our belts in the meantime. 20 THE CHAIR: Commissioners, are there any 21 other questions? 22 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: I have one. 23 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Armbruster? And 24 I apologize if I -- if this has been answered. But 25 my head is full. So something may have just fallen</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">758</p> <p>1 don't understand why, they don't care. So it needs 2 to be important to them. 3 So finding those ways to narrow that focus 4 and making it clear to the student and to the 5 teacher what the overall objective is has been one 6 of the big changes we've been working on as part of 7 NM DASH and everything else as a whole. 8 THE CHAIR: So Illuminate, which I know 9 nothing about at all. But I know, for example, NWEA 10 doesn't do well in drawing conclusions or finding 11 the main idea, whatever? Does Illuminate put those, 12 and that's how you're differentiating and doing 13 that? 14 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Yes, it actually 15 breaks it down by standard. So when the assessment 16 is developed, we worked together with Las Montañas 17 Charter High School to develop the top ten 18 Common Core standards or skills that students would 19 need to master as they move into the ninth grade in 20 order to be successful in high school. 21 So then we took those standards that were 22 identified in those skills, presented them to 23 Illuminate, and they created the assessment based 24 off of those standards. 25 So when a student has trouble or when they</p>

759	<p>1 get their test results as well as the teacher, it 2 says, "Okay. For Common Core Standard 4.1, 3 identifying and analyzing informational text, they 4 got it. They're down." 5 "However, for a standard -- you know, 6 whatever -- on annotating and marking text, they are 7 still struggling. So you may want to spend" -- 8 they'll even give you suggestions on how to guide 9 them. 10 It also connects into Khan Academy. So 11 you can take the scores from Illuminate and get into 12 Khan Academy and guide some extra support outside of 13 the classroom. 14 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: I know that PSAT 15 connects to Khan Academy as well. 16 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Correct. Uh-huh. 17 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay. Thank 18 you. 19 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: So you're 20 guaranteeing your students to be able to go into the 21 ninth grade ready to be -- to be at the ninth grade. 22 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: To be successful. 23 That is our goal. That they don't go in there 24 lacking any of the skills that a freshman student in 25 high school would need.</p>	761	<p>1 our teachers. And something that really stood out 2 to myself as a GC member was Illuminate and how it 3 was presented to the GC as an assessment of not only 4 the students, but able to help the teachers educate 5 as well by being able to see those markers. 6 So I look forward to continuing to use 7 that program in the future and really helping not 8 only our students grow, but our educators. 9 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you so much. 10 Sylvy? 11 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Just one last quick 12 comment on that Illuminate assessment I forgot to 13 mention for the Commissioner. 14 It also provides the parents with a 15 detailed report so that they can see where their 16 student's strengths and weaknesses are and gives 17 them some guides to kind of help them at home as 18 well. 19 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Is that in 20 Spanish? 21 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Yes. 22 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: I wanted to beat 23 Commissioner Caballero. 24 THE CHAIR: Commissioners, any other 25 questions?</p>
760	<p>1 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: It would be great 2 if you got your students to come ready to come into 3 the sixth grade. 4 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: That would be 5 great. 6 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: That would be 7 great. Yeah. Maybe in the future, maybe a sister 8 school can do the pre-K to fifth, because, you know, 9 you're teaching the hardest portion -- you know, 10 middle -- those kids at that age, they are tough. 11 They are tough emotionally and tough all the way 12 around. 13 So I commend you for having the strength 14 and fortitude to get into the middle school area. 15 I, for one, as a teacher, avoided that every -- I 16 would teach kindergarten and high school. But the 17 middle school, it was a kicker. Oh, my God. 18 THE CHAIR: Hormones. 19 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes, yes. 20 THE CHAIR: (Audio distortion) hand up. 21 MR. ROBERT PALACIOS: I'm sorry. For me? 22 THE CHAIR: I thought I saw your hand up. 23 MR. ROBERT PALACIOS: Yes, Chairwoman. I 24 was just wanting to speak to what Commissioner 25 Armbruster was saying about academics and helping</p>	762	<p>1 (No response.) 2 THE CHAIR: All right. I move that the 3 Public Education Commission enter into a Closed 4 Session, pursuant to NMSA Section 10-15-1(H)(1). 5 The subject to be discussed pertains to issuance of 6 a charter license renewal of La Academia Dolores 7 Huerta. 8 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Second. 9 THE CHAIR: There's a motion by 10 Commissioner Gipson, a second by Commissioner Ruiz. 11 Commissioner Armbruster? 12 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 13 Voigt? 14 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes. 15 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 16 Ruiz? 17 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes. 18 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 19 Robbins? 20 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes. 21 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 22 Crone? 23 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Yes. 24 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 25 Davis?</p>

763	<p>1 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Yes.</p> <p>2 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>3 Caballero?</p> <p>4 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes.</p> <p>5 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>6 Gipson?</p> <p>7 THE CHAIR: Yes.</p> <p>8 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>9 Chavez?</p> <p>10 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes.</p> <p>11 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>12 Armbruster votes "Yes."</p> <p>13 Commissioner Raftery?</p> <p>14 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: Yes.</p> <p>15 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: That's a</p> <p>16 ten-to-zero vote to go into Executive Session.</p> <p>17 THE CHAIR: Thank you. See you in a few</p> <p>18 minutes.</p> <p>19 (Executive Session conducted.)</p> <p>20 THE CHAIR: So while we're waiting for</p> <p>21 Commissioner Crone to morph his way back, we can do</p> <p>22 the motion to come out of Closed Session.</p> <p>23 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay.</p> <p>24 THE CHAIR: So I move that the Public</p> <p>25 Education Commission end Closed Session. The</p>	765	<p>1 Davis?</p> <p>2 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Yes.</p> <p>3 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>4 Voigt?</p> <p>5 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes.</p> <p>6 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>7 Ruiz?</p> <p>8 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes.</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>10 Crone?</p> <p>11 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Yes.</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>13 Robbins?</p> <p>14 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes.</p> <p>15 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Motion passes,</p> <p>16 ten-to-zero.</p> <p>17 THE CHAIR: Ten-zero. Okay. Thank you.</p> <p>18 Okay. Are we set? Okay.</p> <p>19 So I move that the Public Education</p> <p>20 Commission renew the charter -- the charter for</p> <p>21 La Academia Dolores Huerta for a period of five</p> <p>22 years, beginning July 1st, 2021, ending June 30th,</p> <p>23 2026, with the condition, due to the ongoing audit</p> <p>24 findings and risk of fiscal insolvency, that the --</p> <p>25 the school submit to the PEC their budget at the</p>
764	<p>1 matters discussed in the closed meeting were limited</p> <p>2 only to those specified in the motion for closure,</p> <p>3 and no vote was taken during the Closed Session.</p> <p>4 And Commissioner Crone is here now.</p> <p>5 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Second.</p> <p>6 THE CHAIR: There's a motion by</p> <p>7 Commissioner Gipson and a second by Commissioner</p> <p>8 Robbins.</p> <p>9 Commissioner Armbruster?</p> <p>10 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>11 Caballero?</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes.</p> <p>13 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>14 Raftery?</p> <p>15 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: Yes.</p> <p>16 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>17 Armbruster votes "Yes."</p> <p>18 Commissioner Chavez? I think that was a</p> <p>19 "Yes"?</p> <p>20 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes.</p> <p>21 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay. All</p> <p>22 right.</p> <p>23 Commissioner Gipson?</p> <p>24 THE CHAIR: Yes.</p> <p>25 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p>	766	<p>1 same time they submit their budget to PED. The</p> <p>2 Public Education Commission will review and approve</p> <p>3 the budget -- hold on -- by June 1st. If the PEC</p> <p>4 does not approve the budget, the charter will not be</p> <p>5 renewed.</p> <p>6 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: I second.</p> <p>7 THE CHAIR: I'm sorry. Who was that?</p> <p>8 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: That was Georgina</p> <p>9 seconding.</p> <p>10 THE CHAIR: There's a motion by</p> <p>11 Commissioner Gipson, a second by Commissioner Davis.</p> <p>12 Is there any further discussion?</p> <p>13 (No response.)</p> <p>14 THE CHAIR: If not, Commissioner</p> <p>15 Armbruster?</p> <p>16 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>17 Robbins?</p> <p>18 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes.</p> <p>19 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>20 Crone?</p> <p>21 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Yes.</p> <p>22 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>23 Ruiz?</p> <p>24 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes.</p> <p>25 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p>

767	<p>1 Voigt?</p> <p>2 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes.</p> <p>3 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>4 Davis?</p> <p>5 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Yes.</p> <p>6 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>7 Gipson?</p> <p>8 THE CHAIR: Yes.</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>10 Chavez?</p> <p>11 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes.</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>13 Armbruster votes "Yes."</p> <p>14 Commissioner Raftery?</p> <p>15 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: Yes.</p> <p>16 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>17 Caballero?</p> <p>18 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes.</p> <p>19 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: The motion</p> <p>20 passes, ten-to-zero.</p> <p>21 THE CHAIR: The motion passes, ten-zero.</p> <p>22 So this is a cautionary congratulations, because</p> <p>23 we've expressed our concern over the budget. So</p> <p>24 congratulations. But there's still work to be done.</p> <p>25 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: We understand, and</p>	769	<p>1 of updates for you all.</p> <p>2 I am going to forgo the updates. I would</p> <p>3 like to do a couple of comments. But at this point,</p> <p>4 I don't even remember what to update you on.</p> <p>5 So -- but I would like to just take this</p> <p>6 time to say a couple of things. First and foremost,</p> <p>7 I want to thank the Options for Parents and Families</p> <p>8 Division team. Because I'm sitting here today. But</p> <p>9 the work that they did to prepare for all of you is</p> <p>10 just phenomenal. I rave about the team all the</p> <p>11 time.</p> <p>12 But I just want to acknowledge the team</p> <p>13 and their work behind the scenes for all of the</p> <p>14 hearings and the work they do every day. So thank</p> <p>15 you to the best team at PED.</p> <p>16 Also, want to make sure that the</p> <p>17 Commission is aware that we have two new folks</p> <p>18 starting on Monday at the PED. Dr. Vickie</p> <p>19 Bannerman, who is our Indian -- excuse me --</p> <p>20 Identity, Equity and Transformation Deputy</p> <p>21 Secretary, starts on Monday; and Corinna Chavez as</p> <p>22 our director, on Monday.</p> <p>23 And so, as you know, I'm very eager for</p> <p>24 those two positions to be filled and have that</p> <p>25 support for our group and for you all.</p>
768	<p>1 we greatly appreciate all of your time and the long</p> <p>2 hours you've put in and for giving us a chance to</p> <p>3 prove to you that we can do this.</p> <p>4 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you. Stay safe.</p> <p>5 And hopefully see you soon.</p> <p>6 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Definitely.</p> <p>7 Virtual hugs to everyone.</p> <p>8 MR. ROBERT PALACIOS: Thank you.</p> <p>9 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Thank you.</p> <p>10 MS. KAREN WOERNER: School</p> <p>11 representatives, if you aren't leaving the meeting,</p> <p>12 I'm going to put you back to Attendees, sort of a</p> <p>13 dumps you off and brings you back in.</p> <p>14 MS. GALVAN DE LUCERO: Thank you.</p> <p>15 THE CHAIR: So, Commissioners, can we do a</p> <p>16 ten-minute break before we finish up the rest of the</p> <p>17 meeting? Thanks.</p> <p>18 (Recess taken, 4:18 p.m. to 4:28 p.m.)</p> <p>19 THE CHAIR: Okay. We're all back. All</p> <p>20 right. So thanks, everyone. And we are now on to</p> <p>21 Item No. 7 on our agenda, which we did have</p> <p>22 modifications to.</p> <p>23 So, Karen, any updates that you want to</p> <p>24 offer us, please feel free.</p> <p>25 MS. KAREN WOERNER: I have an hour's worth</p>	770	<p>1 And last, but certainly not least, I want</p> <p>2 to just -- I know Chairwoman Gipson acknowledged</p> <p>3 them at the start on Wednesday. From our division,</p> <p>4 I want to just thank those Commissioners who are</p> <p>5 leaving us after this month: Commissioner</p> <p>6 Caballero, Commissioner Armbruster, Commissioner</p> <p>7 Raftery, Commissioner Ruiz, and Commissioner Crone.</p> <p>8 It's been a pleasure to work with you and to serve</p> <p>9 you.</p> <p>10 And our team -- on behalf of our team, I</p> <p>11 just want to thank you for what you've done to</p> <p>12 improve the charter school sector and to help hold</p> <p>13 schools accountable to our kids in New Mexico. So I</p> <p>14 really thank you from the bottom of my heart for</p> <p>15 your service. I will miss you. Particularly,</p> <p>16 Commissioner Armbruster and Commissioner Ruiz, who I</p> <p>17 meet with every Thursday, I will miss you. And miss</p> <p>18 you all and just wish you well and thank you very</p> <p>19 much for what you have done for charter schools in</p> <p>20 New Mexico.</p> <p>21 And, Commissioner Ruiz, I just have to add</p> <p>22 that I cannot believe your dedication, given your</p> <p>23 health, for sticking out with us this week. It's</p> <p>24 amazing. So thank you all, and that's really all I</p> <p>25 have for my report.</p>

771	<p>1 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thanks.</p> <p>2 MS. KAREN WOERNER: I do have to address</p> <p>3 DEAP as Part B of my report. But, otherwise, I am</p> <p>4 done. Thank you very much.</p> <p>5 THE CHAIR: Okay. So in 7B, as the</p> <p>6 Commission, I'm sure, remembers, we had voted the</p> <p>7 last meeting to send a Letter of Concern to DEAP.</p> <p>8 Right after we voted on that, they did come into</p> <p>9 compliance. So they never did receive the letter</p> <p>10 because we have all the information.</p> <p>11 But because we formally voted to send the</p> <p>12 Letter of Concern, we do have to -- we do have to</p> <p>13 close that out and to restore DEAP to good standing</p> <p>14 once again. So that we're clear with this. So</p> <p>15 we've got feedback from someone. I don't know.</p> <p>16 So I am going to make a motion that the</p> <p>17 Public Education Commission restore DEAP -- and</p> <p>18 Cindy will put the full name into the -- into the</p> <p>19 record -- (Dzil Diti'ooi School of Empowerment</p> <p>20 Action and Perseverance) -- restore DEAP to good</p> <p>21 standing.</p> <p>22 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: I second that.</p> <p>23 THE CHAIR: There's a motion by</p> <p>24 Commissioner Gipson, a second by Commissioner Davis.</p> <p>25 Commissioner Armbruster?</p>	773	<p>1 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>2 Ruiz?</p> <p>3 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes.</p> <p>4 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>5 Crone?</p> <p>6 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Yes.</p> <p>7 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>8 Robbins?</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes.</p> <p>10 THE CHAIR: So I'm going to say that's a</p> <p>11 nine-to-zero motion.</p> <p>12 Can the record reflect, please, that</p> <p>13 Commissioner Chavez appears to be having Internet</p> <p>14 difficulties?</p> <p>15 And the motion passed, nine-zero, with</p> <p>16 Commissioner Chavez -- Commissioner Chavez having,</p> <p>17 apparently, Internet difficulties.</p> <p>18 Okay. I don't think there's been any</p> <p>19 additional feedback, so that the PEC calendar, I</p> <p>20 believe, sits as it has been submitted.</p> <p>21 So if there's -- unless Commissioners have</p> <p>22 any further comment or recommendations for it, we</p> <p>23 can move to approve the PEC calendar for 2021.</p> <p>24 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: I move that we</p> <p>25 approve the calendar for 2021.</p>
772	<p>1 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>2 Caballero?</p> <p>3 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes.</p> <p>4 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>5 Raftery?</p> <p>6 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: Yes.</p> <p>7 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>8 Armbruster votes "Yes."</p> <p>9 Commissioner Chavez?</p> <p>10 I -- he's --</p> <p>11 THE CHAIR: I see him on the --</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: He's muted. Can</p> <p>13 you tell if he's there?</p> <p>14 THE CHAIR: No, he's still muted. So I</p> <p>15 don't know if he's having trouble with his Internet</p> <p>16 connection again, because it's still showing muted.</p> <p>17 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay. I'm going</p> <p>18 to go on in that case, to you, Chairwoman Gipson.</p> <p>19 THE CHAIR: Yes.</p> <p>20 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Yes.</p> <p>21 Commissioner Davis?</p> <p>22 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Yes.</p> <p>23 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>24 Voigt?</p> <p>25 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes.</p>	774	<p>1 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Second.</p> <p>2 THE CHAIR: There's a motion by</p> <p>3 Commissioner Davis, a second by Commissioner</p> <p>4 Robbins.</p> <p>5 Commissioner Armbruster?</p> <p>6 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>7 Voigt?</p> <p>8 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes.</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>10 Armbruster votes "Yes."</p> <p>11 Commissioner Chavez</p> <p>12 (No response.)</p> <p>13 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: I don't think we</p> <p>14 have him, so I'm going on.</p> <p>15 Commissioner Davis?</p> <p>16 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: I texted him. I</p> <p>17 texted him. I'm waiting to hear.</p> <p>18 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Commissioner Davis</p> <p>19 says "Yes."</p> <p>20 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay. Wait just</p> <p>21 one second. Yes, Davis. And we're waiting for</p> <p>22 Chavez.</p> <p>23 Commissioner Robbins?</p> <p>24 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes.</p> <p>25 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">775</p> <p>1 Gipson? 2 THE CHAIR: Yes. 3 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 4 Ruiz? 5 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes. 6 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 7 Raftery? 8 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: Yes. 9 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 10 Caballero? 11 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes. 12 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 13 Crone? 14 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Yes. 15 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: I think that's a 16 nine-to-zero vote. 17 THE CHAIR: Right, with Commissioner 18 Chavez still having Internet concerns. 19 All right. And, actually -- so we removed 20 No. 9. Well, I'm sorry, we didn't remove No. 9. We 21 moved it in the agenda. So we've -- I X'ed it off, 22 because we already did it. It's not like, Oh, no, 23 we didn't do that. But we have. 24 And, No. 10, we had a discussion about 25 what legislative priorities might be. But until we</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">777</p> <p>1 of what the spring even looks like by January, what 2 the spring might look like, and the summer. You 3 know, we just don't know. (Audio distortion due to 4 simultaneous speaking) -- moving quick and not 5 moving quick. 6 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yeah. Something 7 that's come up amongst discussion with some charter 8 schools -- and it came up also with one of the 9 schools we met with this week -- was the serving 10 adult students. 11 THE CHAIR: Yeah. 12 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: I know there's been 13 some discussion about trying to blanket some of that 14 funding for them under Higher Ed. So that might 15 be -- I know that's going to be coming up with some 16 of the charter school lobbyists. 17 THE CHAIR: Yeah. And, you know, they did 18 put -- when they cut it out of the secondaries, they 19 did put some money into the Higher Ed. But, 20 unfortunately, when it gets funneled into the Higher 21 Ed, the challenge is it becomes a focus of GED. 22 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Right. 23 THE CHAIR: And that's not what people 24 wanted. And I think they found after the fact that 25 there were going to be some stumbling blocks to be</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">776</p> <p>1 see what bills are dropped and what this whole thing 2 looks like, I think it's a discussion that moves 3 forward to January so that we have more concrete 4 information on what we -- what we have to move on 5 and not move on and work on. 6 So I -- we were clear in what -- some of 7 the things we would like to see. But, like I said, 8 you know, until we see what the Session looks like, 9 it's really hard to vote on priorities. And we 10 don't know what's coming out of the Legislature. So 11 I think it'll reappear in January. 12 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Madam Chair, I 13 will expect that most of the legislation may be 14 focused on COVID and dealing with it, and very 15 little else, if anything. 16 THE CHAIR: And I suspect that, yeah, that 17 monies and the prioritization of monies towards, you 18 know, learning gaps, if you're looking at schools 19 and so on, and, potentially, maybe some capital 20 money that has to go to schools that have to do some 21 health and safety fixes to their -- to their 22 schools. You know, there's a lot of unknowns at 23 this point in time. But I think you're absolutely 24 right. 25 And who knows if we'll have a better idea</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">778</p> <p>1 able to move that money out of Higher Ed and back 2 down to secondary schools. And then they started to 3 say, "Oh, maybe we shouldn't have done that." 4 So it'll be interesting to see if -- 5 hopefully, there were some lessons learned out of 6 that. And it will -- it will be interesting to see 7 what ends up happening out of it. Because, you 8 know, there's a piece of me that says I really don't 9 care who's serving those people, as long as they're 10 being served the best they can. And GED was not 11 serving them. 12 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Right. 13 THE CHAIR: And they were uncom- -- I hope 14 they understand the intent there. 15 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yeah. 16 THE CHAIR: It wasn't just to grow the 17 student population and somehow be scamming money out 18 of, you know, SEG money. It was truly to give hope 19 and promise to people. 20 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yeah. 21 THE CHAIR: And that's what we want to 22 see. So we'll see. It's something we're just going 23 to have to keep an eye on. 24 Okay. Karen, I don't know if Mike Ogas 25 has --</p>

779

1 MS. KAREN WOERNER: So I did speak to
2 Mr. Ogas this morning. Haven't had a chance to
3 really share with you. But Mike did text me and ask
4 me to share with you that they will wait until
5 January when you might be more willing to listen to
6 what he has to report.

7 He didn't say that. I said that.

8 He said, "We'll hold off presenting today
9 and wait until January (indiscernible due to
10 simultaneous speaking).

11 THE CHAIR: Okay. All right. Thanks.
12 So, I mean, it's been busy times, because there's --
13 you know. And I want to thank Karen. I think we've
14 played, "It's my turn for a phone call," "It's your
15 turn for a phone call."

16 And there's been lot -- there's a lot that
17 goes on. And there's -- when we're getting ready
18 for renewal, and, you know, a lot of questions. So
19 it has -- it has taken up quite a bit of time.

20 I did have an opportunity to have a call
21 with the -- I believe it's the Cypress Group that
22 they're referring -- so I know they've asked to come
23 in January. They asked to meet with -- with me.
24 And we had a pretty good, but brief, discussion, and
25 they're going to come in January.

781

1 I know they don't, but I just wanted to
2 make sure. But -- and I know they don't want them
3 back. But it's just -- you know, I was very --
4 actually, I wasn't surprised, because I understand
5 them -- that it's coming back. So, just, you know,
6 it's unfortunate because they probably could have
7 landed in a better place two years ago. But it's
8 too late now.

9 Karen?

10 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: They probably
11 should contact GSD for proper disposal of government
12 property, because that's who handles the disposal of
13 government property for the State.

14 THE CHAIR: But I would assume -- I
15 shouldn't -- but I would assume that the City of
16 Anthony has probably disposed of other property. So
17 they should understand it. But I will certainly --
18 when I speak to Representative Gallegos again today
19 about this, I'll certainly recommend that she offer
20 that suggestion to them.

21 I'm sorry. Karen?

22 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Thank you,
23 Madam Chair, Commissioner Robbins. Of course, we
24 went through that process to get rid of it to
25 Anthony. But now they have to do something --

780

1 They did do a presentation last month to
2 the LESC. So they would just like to -- to explain
3 what they're hoping to accomplish, especially --
4 they've got some legislative priorities of their
5 own.

6 So that, certainly, was -- it's
7 interesting and always nice to hear folks that
8 are -- that are working on those new initiatives.

9 Just very recently, the gift that keeps on
10 giving is the portables at -- that belong to Anthony
11 Charter School. You think they are done with that?
12 Oh, no.

13 I got a call late last night that the City
14 of Anthony, who literally plagued us for months for
15 those portables. They don't want them any longer.
16 So they wanted to return them to PED.

17 And it's like, no, I don't think PED wants
18 them.

19 So I did call Dr. Briceño this morning and
20 had a quick call with her. We've got PED Legal --
21 we just want to be clear that it's -- they're
22 Anthony's, and Anthony has to -- because they're a
23 public entity, they have to dispose of them, as any
24 public government entity has to, but that we want to
25 be clear that PED doesn't have any stake in them.

782

1 THE CHAIR: Right.

2 MS. KAREN WOERNER: But I just want to
3 know that Dr. Briceño just let me know -- she's
4 observing the meeting right now. But she said that
5 Legal -- our OGC office is working on this. So at
6 least I know that they're aware of it.

7 THE CHAIR: Karen, can you bring her on?
8 It's just easier.

9 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Let's talk to
10 her.

11 MS. KAREN WOERNER: Dr. Briceño, I'm
12 adding you for the panel. Surprise.

13 THE CHAIR: So, thanks. And I know maybe
14 you weren't anticipating being brought on. But it's
15 probably just a little bit easier. So -- and I
16 appreciate your help. But I do know that the two
17 documents that PED Legal sent, they -- that's
18 already been done, you know, so that we don't need
19 direction on how to turn it over. It's already been
20 turned over.

21 We just -- and I don't know whether they
22 can offer it -- just a clear -- they're not PED's.

23 MS. ALISON BRICEÑO: They're working on
24 it. They're still doing some research, because that
25 was, I guess, not particularly recently.

783

1 THE CHAIR: Yeah, it wasn't. I know Aaron
2 was involved in that. But probably not a lot of the
3 other folks.

4 So it's -- yeah, we thought we were done
5 with it. So...

6 MS. KAREN WOERNER: I think the question
7 might be that before Anthony can dispose of it, they
8 want to make sure we don't want it back. But I
9 can't imagine that --

10 THE CHAIR: No. Anthony wants to give it
11 back to PED. That's what they want to do.

12 MS. KAREN WOERNER: We don't have to take
13 it.

14 THE CHAIR: That's what they clearly
15 expressed that was identified to me, that they don't
16 want it, and they want to give it back to PED,
17 because they want PED to remove them. That's the
18 bottom line.

19 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: We don't have any
20 charter schools that might need them?

21 THE CHAIR: Well, I think -- I doubt it,
22 because, honestly, they've been sitting there empty,
23 and they weren't in great shape to begin with. The
24 cost of moving them is just outrageous.

25 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: I think it's

785

1 So it always surprises me when it's, like,
2 yeah, really?

3 So, thank you for working on this.

4 MS. ALISON BRICEÑO: Thank you all for the
5 work that you do, and, in particular, thank you to
6 the Commissioners who will be leaving us after
7 today. We certainly appreciate your service. And
8 thank you, Chair Gipson.

9 THE CHAIR: Thanks. So, you know, I
10 opened the meeting with saying goodbye to the
11 Commissioners. So I just want to, you know,
12 reiterate that. And thank you, thank you, thank you
13 for everything that you've done over the six years,
14 the four years, the two years.

15 So we have a variety of folks here that
16 have offered just a tremendous amount of experience.
17 You've pushed us, and you've helped to make us be
18 better. So we truly do appreciate that.

19 So I will turn it over now to Comments
20 from the Commission.

21 Commissioner Davis?

22 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Hi. So, yeah, I want
23 to say I'm sorry to see you all leave. I've
24 enjoyed -- the time that we've spent together, I
25 enjoyed, okay? And it's too bad that we can't be

784

1 \$5,000 to move each one. And I know when Los Alamos
2 did that -- but they --

3 THE CHAIR: The City of Anthony said it
4 would cost \$800,000. And it's, like --

5 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: No. What
6 happened is they moved them, and they fell apart on
7 the street.

8 THE CHAIR: And they were old when the
9 school got them. And the Water Authority that
10 rented them the property, the Water Authority got
11 the portables for them and moved them at the Water
12 Authority's expense. So they've been more than
13 well-used.

14 So I don't think anyone -- because, you
15 know, in the Albuquerque area, you can get them from
16 APS. You don't have to move them from Las Cruces.

17 So it's -- it's really hard to get rid of
18 them. Most school districts have, you know,
19 boneyards of portables hanging around.

20 So I just want to say thank you. I
21 appreciate your help with this; because there's a
22 lot of moving parts. And, you know, a lot of
23 people -- people always expect government -- even
24 people in government expect government agencies to
25 move quickly. And they know that doesn't happen.

786

1 together in person, though.

2 I also want to say that I'm glad that
3 Trish appears to be getting better, and I'm
4 anticipating she'll be better and better every day.

5 And also I want to thank Commissioner
6 Crone for the thank-you card and the kind words that
7 he wrote in that thank-you card.

8 That's -- that's what I have to say.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

10 Commissioner Chavez?

11 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Well, I just have to
12 echo the same sort of thing, you know. I just want
13 to thank Sonia for, you know, the time that we were
14 able to go to dinner when we were up in Santa Fe and
15 the advice that you gave me from her experience as
16 being a superintendent. So that really meant a lot.

17 And so thank you.

18 Commissioner Caballero, just thank you for
19 being such an advocate for -- as you always said,
20 our chicanitos y chicanitas.

21 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Chicanitas.

22 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: So we can always
23 count on you being an advocate for that.

24 And then, Commissioner Crone, I just
25 always enjoyed your perspective of being a

<p style="text-align: right;">787</p> <p>1 super-clean hippy, and I loved it. It's just very 2 cool. I really appreciate it. And, as Commissioner 3 Davis said, thank you for the card and the kind 4 words. We're going to miss you. 5 And let's see. Who else? Who else is 6 getting off besides my dear friend, Commissioner 7 Ruiz, who just has inspired me more than she'll ever 8 know. 9 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Armbruster as 10 well. 11 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Thank you. Thank 12 you. 13 And who else am I missing? 14 Armbruster, yes. I always remember our 15 luncheons over at what they used to call -- what? -- 16 the Round House cafeteria, for lunch -- what was 17 that? -- for lunch over in Santa Fe, across the 18 street. Anyways, I always enjoyed our time together 19 with lunches and spending some time with you. 20 And so thank you -- thank you to all of 21 you. 22 And I know it's hard to serve, you know, 23 as much as you do. And this is all voluntary, 24 right? 25 But thank you for your service. I'm going</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">789</p> <p>1 straight virtual conference. But I always encourage 2 people to attend that particular conference, because 3 of its focus on independent charter schools. 4 And I just want to resonate to 5 Commissioner Crone, Raftery, Commissioner Ruiz, 6 Caballero, and Commissioner Armbruster, you know, 7 your guidance, your patience, your -- your 8 experience and your service speaks volumes to the 9 people that you are. And just wish you the best 10 going forward in your future endeavors in life. 11 So thank you so much for all that you've 12 contributed to the PEC. 13 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Raftery? 14 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Muted. 15 MS. KAREN WOERNER: You're muted, 16 Commissioner. 17 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: I have so enjoyed 18 meeting all of you and knowing all of you and your 19 expertise, your different personalities, how we all 20 meshed together and how we all got along well and 21 came out with the best decisions for our kids. 22 Thank you, Trish. You're my lifeline. 23 Thanks a lot for what you've done for me and with 24 me. 25 Ms. Armbruster, gosh. I hope we see each</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">788</p> <p>1 to miss you guys. 2 THE CHAIR: Thank you. 3 Commissioner Voigt? 4 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: So before I get into 5 the farewells, I had a chance to attend some 6 breakout sessions from the Independent Charter 7 School conference, which was very good. There were 8 some great presentations. 9 And what I really love about this 10 collective of people is that they are -- their focus 11 is around independent charter schools. So you don't 12 see a whole lot -- you don't see any CMOs or EMOs. 13 There's a couple of independent networks 14 that always participate within the -- this 15 conference, including the NISN network, some of the 16 Future Focused Education schools, and then some of 17 the schools around the country. And I think 18 Caballero was in some of those sessions as well. 19 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes. 20 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: So I scrolled through 21 the virtual list to see who else was -- 22 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: I managed to get 23 in, Commissioners. 24 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: They were really 25 good. Of course, it wasn't as rich, being a</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">790</p> <p>1 other on Facebook and keep in touch. I really enjoy 2 you. And some of you, I do have on Facebook, so I 3 will not forget you. I hope that we can cross paths 4 again. 5 Karen, thank you for so much that you do. 6 You're just -- gosh, you're just an army. 7 And, Beverly, we will see each other. I 8 know we will. 9 And, gosh, Mr. Robbins, your knowledge of 10 the budget, I know we'll be okay. I know they will 11 be okay. 12 And I decided not to run because after my 13 husband left to go to a better place, I decided to, 14 you know, move and have two places to live. And I 15 don't think it was ethical or fair of me to run if I 16 was not going to be there 100 percent. 17 But I know Mr. Taylor is a smart, 18 intelligent person. Even though he doesn't have an 19 education, I think he'll do well. And, gosh, I know 20 I'll see you all on Facebook. 21 Tim, hey. Love you, guy. 22 Thanks a lot. Bye. 23 THE CHAIR: Thanks. And I'm sorry. I was 24 trying to do all the -- all the still ongoing 25 Commissioners first. And I skipped Commissioner</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">791</p> <p>1 Robbins. And so I apologize. 2 Commissioner Robbins? 3 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: That's okay. Some 4 of my friends say I'm forgetful. Or I'm very easy 5 to forget. I am forgetful, but -- as I get older, I 6 get more and more forgetful. 7 I want to thank Commissioner Crone, 8 Armbruster, Davis, Raftery, and Ruiz. I have 9 learned from you, from your experience, from your 10 knowledge and education. I never served in the 11 public schools other than as a School Board member. 12 I did teach at the college level over about 13 14 years. 14 And you have given me a great insight and 15 I appreciate from your experience the contributions 16 and comments that you've made during our meetings. 17 I wish each of you the best and pray you 18 have a safe and merry Christmas and happy New Year. 19 You've been tremendous colleagues and friends and 20 hope you stay in touch with us. Thank you, and I 21 wish you the best. God bless you. 22 THE CHAIR: Thank you. 23 Commissioner Crone? 24 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Yes. Thank you. 25 First, Pattie, you were talking about being shifted</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">793</p> <p>1 Sonia. You know, I bonded with Sonia 2 because she's a Norteña. We're almost from the same 3 place at this point. Right on. 4 Carlos, I really appreciate your giving a 5 voice to voices that aren't often heard. A cultural 6 characteristic is a certain amount of modesty and a 7 reluctance to put oneself forward. And so a voice 8 that is now possibly the second largest voice in the 9 United States isn't frequently heard. And so I 10 really appreciate what you did. 11 And, Ms. Ruiz, I actually -- Trish and I 12 were, I guess -- what do they call it? -- we were 13 always in the same crowd, but we never met until she 14 came -- she and I came on the PEC. We immediately 15 became fast friends. Immediately. 16 And then, of course, she was on -- she was 17 appointed by the PEC to NMPSIA, and she and Gene and 18 Carolyn and I have become very close. And I want to 19 echo the admiration I have for your strength. 20 Love you all. Thanks. 21 THE CHAIR: Thanks. 22 Commissioner Caballero? 23 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Thank you, 24 Madam Chair. First of all, I'm really glad to hear 25 that Commissioner Ruiz is getting much, much better.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">792</p> <p>1 from your left hand to your right hand? 2 THE CHAIR: Yes. 3 COMMISSIONER CRONE: And your cursive is 4 bad? So those of you who received thank-you cards 5 from me, here are the notes. Let's see. 6 (Indicates.) And I was never switched from right to 7 left. I was always wrong-handed, either hand I 8 used. 9 Kindly, my wife transcribed all of that. 10 And you'll notice that the name, the signature name, 11 is not the same as the handwriting. 12 I want to -- so I sent all of the current 13 Commissioners and Karen and Alison and Bev. And 14 Cindy -- get this in your notes, Cindy -- thank you 15 cards for the Nambé gift. That was very thoughtful. 16 To my fellow parting Commissioners. I've 17 known Karyl Ann the longest. She and I were AFT New 18 Mexico local president, she in Los Alamos, me in 19 Española. 20 And the greatest gratitude I owe to Karyl 21 Ann is when both my arm and leg were broken, she 22 helped me get back -- back and forth to meetings. 23 I didn't get to help her when she fell off 24 of a chair and had to be airlifted to Denver 25 unconscious.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">794</p> <p>1 I was very, very worried over her health. And so 2 that's first of all. 3 And the -- I just want to comment on the 4 convention I attended. Thank you to Commissioner 5 Voigt's message to get into it. I was already very 6 pessimistic about the future of schools, especially 7 charter schools, in this age of COVID. And 8 attending the conference just gave me a lot of 9 thought to the -- to the many creative ways that 10 charter schools around the nation are dealing with 11 not just COVID, but the charter school and children 12 development. 13 And I think that information should be 14 available through our charter schools in New Mexico. 15 I'm -- I am convinced that that should happen. 16 And I want to thank Madam Chair for her 17 patience with me. I know I can get passionate about 18 stuff. And she never -- she never took it as a 19 personal thing at all. So I do appreciate that. 20 And I give you a big thank you. 21 And thank all the Commissioners, first of 22 all, for teaching me stuff. I learned something 23 from everybody. And some of these Commissioners 24 repeated what they were advocating for. I had very 25 little understanding of special ed, and I'm richer.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">795</p> <p>1 I understand it now.</p> <p>2 I have learned about administration of</p> <p>3 charter schools from Commissioner Voigt. And I'm</p> <p>4 glad she's staying in there and advocating and</p> <p>5 sharing the information of charter school</p> <p>6 administration firsthand, because, as Commissioners,</p> <p>7 we tend to overstep sometimes, and that has to be</p> <p>8 there for -- (cellular phone rings) I'm getting the</p> <p>9 same commercial.</p> <p>10 And some folks that I may have seen to be</p> <p>11 kind of rough, but I -- I have learned the most</p> <p>12 from, is Commissioner Robbins. I get amazed by what</p> <p>13 I pick up from him, and I have to thank him.</p> <p>14 Some of you are very quiet. But when you</p> <p>15 speak, you sound -- very profound stuff. And so</p> <p>16 I -- in the four years that I've been serving, I</p> <p>17 sure have enriched my -- my knowledge of education,</p> <p>18 thinking that all the years that I was an educator,</p> <p>19 I knew a bunch. But to tell you the truth, being in</p> <p>20 the Commission, I found out I really don't know that</p> <p>21 much about education. There's more to learn.</p> <p>22 I did get a little something from the</p> <p>23 Chair. And I will say that, yes, I'm going to</p> <p>24 continue being involved in education.</p> <p>25 My son told me, "Dad, things happen for a</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">797</p> <p>1 put us in the path of redoing our evaluation system,</p> <p>2 which I am very proud of. I am very proud of being</p> <p>3 part of that. And I can tell you the charter</p> <p>4 schools in other states are not going to be what</p> <p>5 charter schools are going to be in this state,</p> <p>6 already, and in the future. And I brag about that</p> <p>7 all the time. So -- and I'm going to continue to</p> <p>8 brag.</p> <p>9 I will only leave you with the thought</p> <p>10 that keep on changing, keep on improving with an eye</p> <p>11 of children, of course.</p> <p>12 And that's been my motto. I -- I was in</p> <p>13 here for children. And I hope I didn't step on too</p> <p>14 many toes. But I can be very -- rather</p> <p>15 compassionate and -- but I did learn a lot, and I</p> <p>16 had to step back and listen to others other than</p> <p>17 myself.</p> <p>18 Thank you, Madam Chair.</p> <p>19 THE CHAIR: Thank you.</p> <p>20 Commissioner Ruiz?</p> <p>21 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Okay. I'm going to</p> <p>22 apologize right upfront, because I don't talk much</p> <p>23 because that's when I start to cough. So please</p> <p>24 forgive my cough.</p> <p>25 But I just want to thank you all, because</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">796</p> <p>1 reason."</p> <p>2 He's my philosopher in the family. And</p> <p>3 I'm not going to be serving with you guys. I'm</p> <p>4 going to do other stuff. You are now, with the new</p> <p>5 Commissioners, with a big task, a big, huge task</p> <p>6 during COVID. And the Legislature is inundated over</p> <p>7 their heads with this dilemma of funding, of caring</p> <p>8 for people, caring for health. And caring for the</p> <p>9 biggest thing that I'm about is education.</p> <p>10 So I will be an advocate for charter and</p> <p>11 education throughout the Legislature, seeing how</p> <p>12 much I can do. And an all-around thank you.</p> <p>13 And you're in good hands with our lawyers.</p> <p>14 I mean with -- gee, fantastic legal backing. And</p> <p>15 that took us through a lot, because we have -- we</p> <p>16 kept getting appeals and appeals and appeals.</p> <p>17 I do regret losing our -- one of the</p> <p>18 lawyers. But we have a replacement, and that's</p> <p>19 going to be great.</p> <p>20 But I can tell you that the PEC got</p> <p>21 stronger with the legal representation that we have</p> <p>22 now.</p> <p>23 And so with the help of the leading</p> <p>24 committee, Armbruster, Madam Chair, and, at the</p> <p>25 time, it was somebody else from, I think, Socorro,</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">798</p> <p>1 it's truly been one of -- one of my greatest</p> <p>2 pleasures to serve with you all and to represent the</p> <p>3 constituents of District 9.</p> <p>4 And I know we've had some challenges. But</p> <p>5 we've had a wonderful four years of a journey, and</p> <p>6 I've forged so many wonderful friendships that I</p> <p>7 will treasure forever.</p> <p>8 And I do want to give a special shout-out</p> <p>9 to Dr. Stewart, Alison Briceño, Beverly Friedman,</p> <p>10 Karen Woerner, everybody at CSD and PED, and the</p> <p>11 entire team that Karen talks to us about every</p> <p>12 month.</p> <p>13 And, of course, Cindy, our wonderful</p> <p>14 transcriber. And Woody, the guys from downstairs.</p> <p>15 They saw me in data -- I don't know what it's</p> <p>16 called, data-something, downstairs in the basement.</p> <p>17 And I visited them many times, and they were so</p> <p>18 kind. So I have so many wonderful, just,</p> <p>19 appreciations for them.</p> <p>20 And just know that I still, even though</p> <p>21 being sick, I still communicate with senators and</p> <p>22 our governor on a frequent basis, and our lieutenant</p> <p>23 governor, and I tell them what a good job the</p> <p>24 Commission is doing and all those that I just named.</p> <p>25 It's a really tough time to be in</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">799</p> <p>1 education on most years. But in the last year, it's 2 been a tremendous, tremendous mountain to climb. 3 And when Dr. Stewart called me last week, I 4 expressed that as well, that he had a wonderful 5 team. 6 So thank you all for that. 7 And, also, really, I told Karyl Ann -- and 8 I think Michael knows this, because I've talked to 9 them. But Wednesday was the first day I had been on 10 any kind of a meeting. And so Wednesday was really 11 hard for me. But I didn't want to miss my last 12 meeting and the last chance to see you all and serve 13 with you. 14 But thank you for the Nambé bowl and the 15 food delivery packet. You have no idea how much 16 that meant to me and my husband. And when you're 17 laying in bed and you just don't even know if you're 18 going to wake up alive the next day, you just give 19 thanks for every single kindness. 20 So thank you from the bottom of our hearts 21 for that. That is just so greatly appreciated, and 22 it's just a testament to the kind souls that you 23 are. 24 And just so you know, I will run into you, 25 I know I will. Maybe not at PEC. But I will</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">801</p> <p>1 to tell this board -- you can tell this to the next 2 one. But the joy of working with everyone here. 3 This is a diverse political group. But never ever 4 in the six years I've been on has there been a vote 5 where it had to do with anything at all with 6 politics, nor asking people for help or asking for 7 advice, or someone asking me, it's never played a 8 part. 9 And I think that is another positive about 10 the PEC. And wouldn't it be nice if we could pass 11 that ability on to other organizations and boards? 12 The Nambé, of course, is gorgeous. I 13 didn't write each of you a note, as Tim did. Should 14 have asked him to write for me, too. But I do want 15 to thank you all for that. 16 I know Beverly ran out immediately, 17 because we were getting shut down, and she wanted to 18 make sure that we got the Nambé. So she ran out of 19 the house and ran over and got it for us. 20 Cindy, I want to thank you for being a 21 part of us, not just there, but a part of us, except 22 for the time when that other lady came and she was 23 not nice to us. 24 The other thing, of course, for Karen and 25 all of the Options for Parents people, I don't know</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">800</p> <p>1 because even sick, I've been working with the 2 Governor and the Lieutenant Governor and still 3 working on NMPSIA, even though I'm not there. And 4 just working on stuff with them. 5 And just want you to know that I 6 appreciate each and every one of you. And sometimes 7 we have various and headstrong opinions. But at the 8 end of the day, I always leave knowing that we did 9 what each of us thought to be the best for kids. 10 And so it's been my distinct honor and thank you. 11 THE CHAIR: Thank you. And I've kind of 12 gone from youngest to oldest in terms of service, 13 not necessarily by age. 14 Commissioner Armbruster? 15 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: That's fine. I 16 don't mind being the oldest, because, you know, the 17 alternative isn't better. I, of course, want to 18 thank all my fellow Commissioners, actually, for 19 opening my eyes to so many things I never even 20 thought about or knew about, and areas where I was 21 clearly deficient in what I knew or what I have 22 thought. 23 And I think it's -- I think it's made me a 24 better person. At least I hope so. 25 The other important part -- and I'm going</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">802</p> <p>1 how you do this. I'm really glad that PED has hired 2 new people. So I hope that you can just do your 3 job, Karen, and not everyone else's as well. I 4 think you deserve a little rest there. 5 And, Alison -- see, she's clapping. And 6 Alison, I barely feel I know you, except for the 7 Executive Committee, of course. It's so kind of you 8 to contribute for all of these things you get in, 9 giving money to this and money to that. Right there 10 with us. I really want to thank you. 11 Of course, for Ami. I want to thank Ami 12 for all of the same things. And I learned not to be 13 arbitrary and capricious. 14 And I understand what "standing" means. 15 Like the Texas lawsuit. I understand that they 16 don't have standing. I understood that one, too. 17 And I thought, "Wow, look what I know 18 now." 19 But, also, Ami, I think we mentioned this 20 to you. But I want to tell you. We used to have 21 someone coming from the AG's office every month or 22 something. I don't know. They didn't stay for 23 long. And this one lady, she was even meaner to us 24 than the lady who took Cindy's place. And so we 25 were -- and we were nice. Really. We were very</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">803</p> <p>1 nice to her. So we really appreciate you. 2 And I wanted to also just keep -- I 3 just -- you know, I -- it's been a very new 4 experience for me. But I've learned so much, and 5 I'm glad to be off in terms of having some free 6 time. 7 But I will miss you. I think it's an 8 important job. I'm really happy -- particularly, 9 Pattie and I kind of came in at a time when it was 10 like, "What's going on here?" 11 And then it's become, I think, one of the 12 very best states, from having gone to NACSA 13 conferences -- and I know Glenna was with us last 14 time, and Danielle was another time. It was like, 15 "What are you all doing, because we don't have those 16 issues." 17 And I think that's really wonderful. 18 I thank all of you again. Maybe I'll just 19 pop in the audience or something. Thank you all. 20 Bless you. 21 THE CHAIR: Thank you. And I wanted to 22 remind you that, actually, that lawyer from the AG's 23 Office stood up and yelled at us and told us we 24 needed a lawyer. "You need a lawyer." 25 Who knew? But I thought that's what you</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">805</p> <p>1 by 100 for what the Charter School Division has to 2 do. 3 And we, obviously -- we can't -- we can't 4 do this without all of that incredibly hard work 5 beforehand. And I certainly know, because I've got 6 phone call logs and text messages, the amount of 7 work that I can measure for what Karen has done, let 8 alone all that other work behind the scenes. 9 So I just want to say thank you, thank 10 you, thank you for all of that, because we just 11 can't -- you know, we can't measure all the hard 12 work that went into it. 13 And Ami, and now Elizabeth, getting us 14 ready as well. It was really -- I mean, Karyl Ann 15 is absolutely right. Sorry. The dog's bells are 16 going off. Sorry. 17 You can't measure the confidence that we 18 have going into these meetings, knowing that we're 19 better prepared and will be better prepared going 20 forward because of the guidance that you offer. 21 So we can't thank you enough for that. 22 Cindy, we thank your fingers. We forget, 23 you know, like I say, that you're always working 24 there behind -- behind the scenes there. And we do 25 tend to forget the amount of effort and energy that</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">804</p> <p>1 were. 2 So, yeah, that was -- that rotation was 3 quite an experience. 4 So thanks, everyone, once again. I did 5 have an opportunity to say thank you individually to 6 all of you. And I publicly apologize once again for 7 the handwriting. 8 So -- and I've given you that excuse for 9 why it is so bad. 10 But I want to thank everyone for these 11 three days. I mean, this has been -- you know, it's 12 more than yeoman's work. Because you can't just sit 13 there and not pay attention. And every -- each and 14 every one of you have given your full attention to 15 the schools. I -- and that's -- that can't be 16 measured for the schools. 17 And this is a lot of work. It's a lot of 18 work not just to be here these three days, but for 19 you to read through all the materials. It's tough. 20 And we're asking a lot of you. 21 And with that being said, there is no 22 measure for the amount of work that the Charter 23 School Division does with this. I mean, there 24 really isn't. It is -- you know, if we consider 25 what we do to get ready, you have to multiply that</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">806</p> <p>1 goes into trying to keep up with us. And we do kind 2 of forget because you are part of us. You're not an 3 extra piece. So we want to thank you. 4 And, Commissioner Ruiz, no one can thank 5 you for the time and effort this week alone. So 6 thank you so much. 7 And before -- 8 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Madam 9 Commissioner, I did forget. I want to thank Beverly 10 and the rest of the Commission for that wonderful 11 gift that I received from all of you. I really 12 appreciate it. It's -- I have it in display. I 13 don't have any visitors. 14 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Nor do I. 15 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: I see it every 16 day, and I pick it up. And for some reason, it has 17 a lot of value to me. So that's why I enjoy seeing 18 it every day. 19 And I hope my good friend Tim Crone got 20 one like mine. He's fantastic. I will miss that 21 guy. 22 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Carlos? 23 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes, sir. 24 COMMISSIONER CRONE: Carlos, if you rub 25 it, a genie pops out.</p>

807	<p>1 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: I pick it up from 2 the edge, so I won't leave marks on it. But I'm 3 going to rub it. That's a good idea. 4 THE CHAIR: Beverly, thank you -- sorry. 5 I didn't mean to interrupt. Bev, thanks for 6 coordinating this whole herd of cats. I know it's 7 extraordinarily difficult trying to keep up with 8 e-mails and getting people to respond, and now 9 trying to -- and I will remind Commissioners, as Bev 10 asked, to please make sure that you do your forms 11 for these three meetings. 12 And I know the outgoing Commissioners that 13 have computers, Beverly did send out an e-mail on 14 how to return those -- those computers and the 15 license plates. There's just so much behind the 16 scenes that truly does go on that Bev helps to 17 coordinate. So thank you for that. 18 Happy holidays to everyone. We're not 19 leaving, because we're going into Closed Session. 20 So -- 21 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN: If I could just say 22 thank you. And I'm going to really miss 23 Commissioner Crone and Commissioner Armbruster, 24 Commissioner Caballero, Commissioner Raftery, and 25 Commissioner Ruiz. It's been wonderful working with</p>	809	<p>1 teachers who work with their students on how to 2 write legibly. 3 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN: Pattie, I'd just 4 like to let Commissioner Raftery know that her Nambé 5 piece is in the mail, and you'll be receiving it 6 sometime next week. Hers was delivered to a house 7 about ten minutes away from her house, and they 8 didn't return it. And so she's getting a brand new 9 one. 10 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: It had to happen to 11 me, of course, you know. You know, I have half a 12 mind to go over there to that address and tell them 13 who I am. They might have a gun or something, you 14 know. 15 But thank you. I look forward to getting 16 it. I do look forward to getting it. Thank you. 17 THE CHAIR: Thanks. And thanks for that 18 extra work as well. 19 So, at this point, I'm going to move that 20 the Public Education Commission enter into a Closed 21 Session, pursuant to NMSA Section 10-15-1(H)(7). 22 The subject to be discussed is 23 attorney-client-privileged issues pertaining to 24 threatened or pending litigation in which the public 25 body is or may become a participant, specifically,</p>
808	<p>1 you, and we will miss you at these meetings. 2 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: I will miss you, 3 Beverly. 4 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN: I will miss you, 5 too. 6 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Miss you, honey. And 7 we'll be keeping up with you and Fred. 8 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN: Okay. 9 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Comment about your 10 handwriting and everything. I don't know if you can 11 see mine. That's my handwriting. I think it's on 12 the screen. 13 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: That looks very 14 good. 15 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: I learned I could 16 not write and take notes cursively and read them 17 later on. So I started printing all my notes. I 18 used to do drafting. Years later, people looked at 19 my handwriting and said, "Are you a drafter?" 20 But I said, "No, that's how I basically 21 learned to print so well." 22 I actually have to go back to my very 23 first first-grade teacher, Mrs. Dailey, who worked 24 on me, and my mom, who really worked on me to print 25 clearly. So that's a -- a compliment to all</p>	810	<p>1 Open Meetings Act NMSA Chapter 10, Article 15, 2 specifically PEC Budget Submission. 3 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Second. 4 THE CHAIR: There's a motion by 5 Commissioner Gipson and a second by Commissioner 6 Voigt. 7 Commissioner Armbruster? 8 You're muted. 9 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 10 Robbins? 11 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes. 12 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 13 Voigt? 14 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes. 15 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 16 Armbruster votes "Yes." 17 Commissioner Davis? 18 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Yes. 19 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 20 Chavez? 21 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes. 22 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner 23 Gipson? 24 THE CHAIR: Yes. 25 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p>

811	<p>1 Raftery?</p> <p>2 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: Yes.</p> <p>3 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>4 Crone?</p> <p>5 COMMISSIONER CRONE: No. My dinner's</p> <p>6 ready. No. I vote "Yes."</p> <p>7 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: I'll just put</p> <p>8 down "Maybe."</p> <p>9 Commissioner Ruiz?</p> <p>10 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes.</p> <p>11 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>12 Caballero?</p> <p>13 COMMISSIONER CABALLERO: Yes.</p> <p>14 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: That's a</p> <p>15 ten-to-zero vote to go into Executive Session.</p> <p>16 THE CHAIR: Okay. See you once again on</p> <p>17 the other side.</p> <p>18 (Executive Session conducted.)</p> <p>19 THE CHAIR: So I move that the Public</p> <p>20 Education Commission end Closed Session. The</p> <p>21 matters discussed in the closed meeting were limited</p> <p>22 only to these specified in the motion for closure,</p> <p>23 and no vote was taken during the Closed Session.</p> <p>24 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: I second that.</p> <p>25 MS. AMI JAEGER: It's like being in a</p>	813	<p>1 THE CHAIR: Okay.</p> <p>2 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: 575, Beverly,</p> <p>3 the people who have that -- does it end 3-9-7-3?</p> <p>4 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN: I can't see the</p> <p>5 number any longer. But I can't see the</p> <p>6 Commissioner. I'm not sure who it is.</p> <p>7 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Michael has a</p> <p>8 575 number. And --</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: This is Mike Chavez.</p> <p>10 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN: Oh, Mike.</p> <p>11 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Right. And the</p> <p>12 other one is Trish. So those are the only three</p> <p>13 that have 575 numbers. And now Michael is here, so</p> <p>14 it's not he.</p> <p>15 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN: We have seven</p> <p>16 Commissioners here now.</p> <p>17 THE CHAIR: So let's take a step back. So</p> <p>18 for the record, I need to make a technical</p> <p>19 correction that the PEC did not discuss the OMA</p> <p>20 complaint because it was not noticed in the public</p> <p>21 notice.</p> <p>22 So now that everyone is back, I will move</p> <p>23 that the PEC end Closed Session. The matters</p> <p>24 discussed in the closed meeting were limited only to</p> <p>25 those specified in the motion for closure, and no</p>
812	<p>1 circus.</p> <p>2 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Is it my turn to</p> <p>3 call names?</p> <p>4 THE CHAIR: No, it's not.</p> <p>5 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay. Sorry.</p> <p>6 MS. AMI JAEGER: Madam Chair, we need a</p> <p>7 technical correction.</p> <p>8 THE CHAIR: Okay.</p> <p>9 MS. KAREN WOERNER: And do you want to</p> <p>10 just let the -- if they're trying to call in, the</p> <p>11 numbers are on the agenda. Maybe they can call in</p> <p>12 if you want the rest to join, if they're still</p> <p>13 trying.</p> <p>14 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: I did call one</p> <p>15 of those numbers on the agenda.</p> <p>16 MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN: Karen, there's</p> <p>17 someone else at 575-494-X X X X.</p> <p>18 THE CHAIR: What's the technical</p> <p>19 correction? Do I have to put it in this motion?</p> <p>20 MS. AMI JAEGER: I think you should say,</p> <p>21 "I need to make a technical correction," so it gets</p> <p>22 into the transcript. It's not a motion, just -- and</p> <p>23 the technical correction is that we did not discuss</p> <p>24 the OMA complaint, since it was not noticed on the</p> <p>25 agenda.</p>	814	<p>1 vote was taken during the Closed Session.</p> <p>2 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Second.</p> <p>3 THE CHAIR: Motion by Commissioner Gipson</p> <p>4 and a second by Commissioner Ruiz.</p> <p>5 Commissioner Armbruster, will you do roll,</p> <p>6 please?</p> <p>7 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Yes, I will.</p> <p>8 Commissioner Robbins?</p> <p>9 (No response.)</p> <p>10 MS. AMI JAEGER: Not here.</p> <p>11 THE CHAIR: No, Commissioner Robbins has</p> <p>12 not been able to get back into the meeting.</p> <p>13 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay. You're</p> <p>14 going to have to tell me, because I can't see</p> <p>15 anybody.</p> <p>16 Commissioner Voigt?</p> <p>17 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes.</p> <p>18 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay.</p> <p>19 Commissioner Armbruster votes "Yes."</p> <p>20 Commissioner Davis?</p> <p>21 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Yes.</p> <p>22 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p> <p>23 Chavez?</p> <p>24 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes.</p> <p>25 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner</p>

815

1 Gipson?
 2 THE CHAIR: Yes.
 3 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner
 4 Raftery?
 5 COMMISSIONER RAFTERY: Yes.
 6 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner
 7 Crone?
 8 (No response.)
 9 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Crone has not
 10 been able to get back in.
 11 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay.
 12 Commissioner Ruiz?
 13 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes.
 14 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Commissioner
 15 Gipson, is she there?
 16 THE CHAIR: She is, but she's -- you're
 17 muted, Commissioner Ruiz.
 18 COMMISSIONER RUIZ: Yes.
 19 THE CHAIR: She said "Yes."
 20 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Yes, I heard
 21 that.
 22 Commissioner Caballero?
 23 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Caballero has not
 24 been able to get back in.
 25 COMMISSIONER ARMBRUSTER: Okay. So we

816

1 have a seven-to-zero vote to come out of the
 2 session. The motion passes.
 3 THE CHAIR: Motion passes, seven-to-zero.
 4 Three Commissioners were unable to get
 5 back into the meeting.
 6 So I am going to adjourn this meeting.
 7 Thank you, all, very much, especially for the last
 8 five minutes. Appreciate this. Continue to stay
 9 safe. Have happy holidays, safer holidays, and we
 10 will see you soon. Thank you, all, everyone.
 11 (Proceedings concluded at 6:08 p.m.)
 12
 13
 14
 15
 16
 17
 18
 19
 20
 21
 22
 23
 24
 25

817

1 BEFORE THE PUBLIC EDUCATION COMMISSION
 2 STATE OF NEW MEXICO
 3
 4
 5
 6
 7 REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE
 8 I, Cynthia C. Chapman, RMR, CCR #219, Certified
 9 Court Reporter in the State of New Mexico, do hereby
 10 certify that the foregoing pages constitute a true
 11 transcript of proceedings had before the said
 12 NEW MEXICO PUBLIC EDUCATION COMMISSION, held via
 13 video teleconference, in the State of New Mexico, in
 14 the matter therein stated.
 15 In testimony whereof, I have hereunto set my
 16 hand on December 28, 2020.
 17
 18
 19
 20
 21
 22
 23
 24
 25

Cynthia C. Chapman, RMR-CRR, NM CCR #219
 BEAN & ASSOCIATES, INC.
 201 Third Street, NW, Suite 1630
 Albuquerque, New Mexico 87102
 License Expires: 12/31/21

Job No.: 3830N (CC)
 Proofed by: KW

818

1 RECEIPT
 2 JOB NUMBER: 3830N CC Date: 12/11/20
 3 PROCEEDINGS: PUBLIC MEETING
 4 CASE CAPTION: In re: Public Meeting of the Public
 5 Education Commission
 6 *****
 7 ATTORNEY: MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN - PED
 8 DOCUMENT: Transcript / Exhibits / Disks / Other _____
 9 DATE DELIVERED: _____ DEL'D BY: _____
 10 REC'D BY: _____ TIME: _____
 11 *****
 12 ATTORNEY:
 13 DOCUMENT: Transcript / Exhibits / Disks / Other _____
 14 DATE DELIVERED: _____ DEL'D BY: _____
 15 REC'D BY: _____ TIME: _____
 16 *****
 17 ATTORNEY:
 18 DOCUMENT: Transcript / Exhibits / Disks / Other _____
 19 DATE DELIVERED: _____ DEL'D BY: _____
 20 REC'D BY: _____ TIME: _____
 21 *****
 22 ATTORNEY:
 23 DOCUMENT: Transcript / Exhibits / Disks / Other _____
 24 DATE DELIVERED: _____ DEL'D BY: _____
 25 REC'D BY: _____ TIME: _____

1 BEFORE THE PUBLIC EDUCATION COMMISSION

2 STATE OF NEW MEXICO

3
4
5
6
7 REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE

8 I, Cynthia C. Chapman, RMR, CCR #219, Certified
9 Court Reporter in the State of New Mexico, do hereby
10 certify that the foregoing pages constitute a true
11 transcript of proceedings had before the said
12 NEW MEXICO PUBLIC EDUCATION COMMISSION, held via
13 video teleconference, in the State of New Mexico, in
14 the matter therein stated.

15 In testimony whereof, I have hereunto set my
16 hand on December 28, 2020.

17
18
19 *Cynthia Chapman*

20 Cynthia C. Chapman, RMR-CRR, NM CCR #219
21 BEAN & ASSOCIATES, INC.
22 201 Third Street, NW, Suite 1630
23 Albuquerque, New Mexico 87102
24 License Expires: 12/31/21

25 Job No.: 3830N (CC)
 Proofed by: KW

SANTA FE OFFICE
119 East Marcy, Suite 110
Santa Fe, NM 87501
(505) 989-4949
FAX (505) 843-9492

**BEAN
& ASSOCIATES, Inc.**
PROFESSIONAL COURT
REPORTING SERVICE

MAIN OFFICE
201 Third NW, Suite 1630
Albuquerque, NM 87102
(505) 843-9494
FAX (505) 843-9492
1-800-669-9492
e-mail: info@litsupport.com