

BEFORE THE PUBLIC EDUCATION COMMISSION

STATE OF NEW MEXICO

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS
OPEN PUBLIC MEETING

January 14, 2022

9:00 a.m.

Via Zoom Webinar Video Teleconference

REPORTED BY: Cynthia C. Chapman, RMR-CRR, NM CCR #219

Bean & Associates, Inc.

Professional Court Reporting Service

201 Third Street, NW, Suite 1630

Albuquerque, New Mexico 87102

JOB NO.: 6171N (CC)

2	<p>1 APPEARANCES</p> <p>2 COMMISSIONERS:</p> <p>3 PATRICIA GIPSON, Chair</p> <p>4 GLENNA VOIGT, Vice Chair</p> <p>5 REBEKKA BURT, Secretary</p> <p>6 MELISSA ARMIJO, Member</p> <p>7 STEVEN CARRILLO, Member</p> <p>8 MICHAEL CHAVEZ, Member</p> <p>9 GEORGINA DAVIS, Member</p> <p>10 KT MANIS, Member</p> <p>11 DAVID ROBBINS, Member</p> <p>12 MICHAEL TAYLOR, Member</p> <p>13</p> <p>14 PED STAFF:</p> <p>15</p> <p>16 CORINA CHAVEZ Director</p> <p>17 Charter School/Options for</p> <p>18 Parents and Families Division</p> <p>19</p> <p>20 MISSY BROWN Technical Assistance and Support and</p> <p>21 Training Administrator</p> <p>22 Charter School/Options for</p> <p>23 Parents and Families Division</p> <p>24 BEVERLY FRIEDMAN, Custodian of Record</p> <p>25 Liaison to PEC</p> <p>COUNSEL TO THE PEC:</p> <p>JULIA HOSFORD BARNES, ESQ.</p> <p>Barnes Mediation and Law, PC</p> <p>200 W. DeVargas Street, Suite 7</p> <p>Santa Fe, New Mexico 87501</p>	4
3	<p>1 INDEX TO PROCEEDINGS</p> <p>2 PAGE</p> <p>3 1 Call to Order, Roll Call, 5</p> <p>4 Pledge of Allegiance,</p> <p>5 Salute to the New Mexico Flag</p> <p>6 2 Approval of the Agenda 6</p> <p>7 3 Open Forum - No Speaker Requests 8</p> <p>8 4 Approval of the Open Meetings Act 8</p> <p>9 Resolution for 2022</p> <p>10</p> <p>11 5 PEC Election of Officers for 2022 9</p> <p>12</p> <p>13 6 Consent Agenda 13</p> <p>14</p> <p>15 7 Discussion and Possible Action on 16</p> <p>16 Item(s) Removed from the Consent Agenda -</p> <p>17 Not Applicable</p> <p>18</p> <p>19 8 Discussion and Possible Action on 16</p> <p>20 Cesar Chavez Community School Not</p> <p>21 Returning to In Person Learning</p> <p>22</p> <p>23 9 Discussion and Possible Action on 96</p> <p>24 New Charter Application Kit</p> <p>25 10 Discussion and Possible Action: 126</p> <p>The GREAT Academy Corrective Action Plan</p> <p>Update</p> <p>11 Report from Charter Schools Division 132</p> <p>12 Discussion and Possible Action on 143</p> <p>PEC Meeting Calendar</p> <p>13 Discussion and Possible Action on 148</p> <p>Legislation</p> <p>14 Reports from PEC Liaisons 149</p> <p>15 Report from the Chair 158</p> <p>16 PEC Comments 161</p> <p>17 Adjourn 173</p>	5
2	<p>1 INDEX TO PROCEEDINGS, Continued</p> <p>2 PAGE</p> <p>3 REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE 175</p> <p>4</p> <p>5 ATTACHMENTS:</p> <p>6 1 Attendees List</p> <p>7</p> <p>8</p> <p>9</p> <p>10</p> <p>11</p> <p>12</p> <p>13</p> <p>14</p> <p>15</p> <p>16</p> <p>17</p> <p>18</p> <p>19</p> <p>20</p> <p>21</p> <p>22</p> <p>23</p> <p>24</p> <p>25</p>	4
3	<p>1 THE CHAIR: So good morning once again.</p> <p>2 Happy New Year to everyone. Good to see you all.</p> <p>3 I'm going to bring to order this meeting</p> <p>4 of the Public Education Commission. It is Friday,</p> <p>5 January 14th, 2022, and it is 9:00 a.m. I am going</p> <p>6 to ask Commissioner Burt to take roll.</p> <p>7 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Armijo.</p> <p>8 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Here.</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Burt,</p> <p>10 here.</p> <p>11 Commissioner Carrillo.</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Present.</p> <p>13 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Chavez.</p> <p>14 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Here.</p> <p>15 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Davis.</p> <p>16 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Here.</p> <p>17 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Gipson.</p> <p>18 THE CHAIR: Here.</p> <p>19 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Manis.</p> <p>20 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Here.</p> <p>21 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Robbins.</p> <p>22 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Here.</p> <p>23 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Taylor.</p> <p>24 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Here.</p> <p>25 COMMISSIONER BURT: And Commissioner</p>	5

6

1 Voigt.
 2 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Here.
 3 COMMISSIONER BURT: There is a quorum of
 4 ten.
 5 THE CHAIR: Thank you so much. We're now
 6 on to the Pledge of Allegiance. I'm going to ask
 7 Commissioner Manis to lead us in the Pledge and
 8 Commissioner Carrillo to lead us in the New Mexico
 9 Salute.
 10 (Pledge of Allegiance and Salute to the
 11 New Mexico Flag conducted.)
 12 THE CHAIR: We are on to Item No. 4
 13 (verbatim), which is Approval of the Agenda.
 14 Does anyone have any changes to the
 15 agenda?
 16 (No response.)
 17 THE CHAIR: If not, I'll entertain a
 18 motion.
 19 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: I move we accept --
 20 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Move to approve.
 21 THE CHAIR: I'm sorry. I didn't catch who
 22 that was.
 23 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: It was Steve.
 24 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: I think that there
 25 were two of us at the same time.

7

1 THE CHAIR: I think that's why it kind of
 2 moved into a voice I didn't recognize at all.
 3 So there's a motion by Commissioners
 4 Carrillo and Davis.
 5 Do I have a second?
 6 THE CHAIR: I'll second it.
 7 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: I'll second -- okay.
 8 THE CHAIR: There's a second by
 9 Commissioner Gipson. If there's no further
 10 discussion?
 11 (No response.)
 12 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Burt.
 13 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Voigt.
 14 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes.
 15 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Taylor.
 16 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Yes.
 17 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Robbins.
 18 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes.
 19 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Manis.
 20 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Yes.
 21 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Gipson.
 22 THE CHAIR: Yes.
 23 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Davis.
 24 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Yes.
 25 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Chavez.

8

1 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes.
 2 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Carrillo.
 3 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Yes.
 4 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Burt,
 5 yes.
 6 Commissioner Armijo.
 7 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Yes.
 8 COMMISSIONER BURT: All right. That
 9 passes unanimously, ten-zero.
 10 THE CHAIR: Thank you. We are on to Item
 11 No. 3, Open Forum.
 12 Missy, do we have anyone that signed up?
 13 Or Bev, do you know?
 14 MS. MISSY BROWN: We do not, Madam Chair.
 15 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you very much.
 16 We're on to Item No. 4, which is the Approval of the
 17 Open Meetings Act Resolution for 2022.
 18 This is a process that we do every year.
 19 The document is in your -- in our working papers.
 20 So I will move to approve the Open
 21 Meetings Act Resolution for 2022.
 22 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: I'll second.
 23 THE CHAIR: Motion by Commissioner Gipson,
 24 a second by Commissioner Carrillo.
 25 Commissioner Burt.

9

1 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Davis.
 2 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Yes.
 3 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Gipson.
 4 THE CHAIR: Yes.
 5 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Chavez.
 6 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes.
 7 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Robbins.
 8 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes.
 9 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Manis.
 10 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Yes.
 11 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Carrillo.
 12 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Yes.
 13 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Taylor.
 14 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Yes.
 15 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Armijo.
 16 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Yes.
 17 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Voigt.
 18 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes.
 19 COMMISSIONER BURT: And Commissioner Burt,
 20 yes.
 21 That passes unanimously, ten-zero.
 22 THE CHAIR: Thank you.
 23 We are on to Item No. 5, which is Election
 24 of Officers for 2022.
 25 So I'm going to open up nominations for

10	<p>1 Chair.</p> <p>2 Commissioner Burt?</p> <p>3 COMMISSIONER BURT: Thank you. I would</p> <p>4 like to nominate myself for Chair.</p> <p>5 THE CHAIR: Thank you.</p> <p>6 Do I have any other nominations?</p> <p>7 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Doesn't a</p> <p>8 nomination -- does it need a second?</p> <p>9 THE CHAIR: No, not according to our</p> <p>10 rules.</p> <p>11 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Oh, okay.</p> <p>12 THE CHAIR: Hearing no other nominations,</p> <p>13 I would just ask, Commissioner Burt, to text a vote</p> <p>14 to Julia just to make it official.</p> <p>15 COMMISSIONER BURT: All right. Thank you.</p> <p>16 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Patti, you're</p> <p>17 going to step down. It would seem you're stepping</p> <p>18 down in the role that you've had for so long.</p> <p>19 THE CHAIR: Sometimes you stay too long at</p> <p>20 the party.</p> <p>21 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Are you going to</p> <p>22 travel with all of your free time?</p> <p>23 THE CHAIR: I certainly will have a</p> <p>24 significant amount of free time, yes.</p> <p>25 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: All right.</p>	12	<p>1 I lose you temporarily.</p> <p>2 So I would like to nominate Commissioner</p> <p>3 Voigt for Vice Chair.</p> <p>4 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you. I accept.</p> <p>5 THE CHAIR: Do I have any other</p> <p>6 nominations?</p> <p>7 (No response.)</p> <p>8 THE CHAIR: If not, Commissioner Voigt,</p> <p>9 I'd ask you to do the same thing. Text Julia a vote</p> <p>10 to make it official. Thank you.</p> <p>11 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Okay, will do.</p> <p>12 Thanks again.</p> <p>13 THE CHAIR: And, finally, position of</p> <p>14 Secretary.</p> <p>15 I'll open up nominations for Secretary.</p> <p>16 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: I'll nominate Melissa</p> <p>17 Armijo. Sorry. You were drinking coffee right when</p> <p>18 I said that.</p> <p>19 I -- I'd like to nominate you as</p> <p>20 Secretary, Melissa, Commissioner Armijo.</p> <p>21 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Thank you for that.</p> <p>22 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Do you accept?</p> <p>23 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Okay. Thank you.</p> <p>24 THE CHAIR: Is that an acceptance?</p> <p>25 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Yes, it is.</p>
11	<p>1 THE CHAIR: So it does. And that's a big</p> <p>2 consideration.</p> <p>3 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Well, thank you</p> <p>4 for the years of service.</p> <p>5 THE CHAIR: Thank you.</p> <p>6 We are on to the position of Vice Chair.</p> <p>7 So I would like to nom- -- oh, okay.</p> <p>8 Commissioner Voigt?</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Shouldn't there be</p> <p>10 a vote, though?</p> <p>11 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Go ahead.</p> <p>12 THE CHAIR: I'm sorry.</p> <p>13 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Here I'm the one</p> <p>14 that said I should raise my hand. There we go.</p> <p>15 Doesn't this need a vote? Even though</p> <p>16 there's no opposition, doesn't there need to be a</p> <p>17 tally?</p> <p>18 THE CHAIR: I did. I just asked Rebekka</p> <p>19 to text a vote to Julia, just to make it official.</p> <p>20 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Oh, got it. Got</p> <p>21 it. Thank you.</p> <p>22 THE CHAIR: You're welcome.</p> <p>23 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Lowering my hand.</p> <p>24 THE CHAIR: And it's hard for me</p> <p>25 because -- yeah. You move up to that top screen and</p>	13	<p>1 THE CHAIR: Okay. Just double-checking.</p> <p>2 If there are no other nominations, Commissioner</p> <p>3 Armijo, I would ask you to text Julia a vote just to</p> <p>4 make it official.</p> <p>5 All right. Thanks, everyone.</p> <p>6 We are on to Item No. 6, which is the</p> <p>7 Consent Agenda.</p> <p>8 Do we have any changes to the Consent</p> <p>9 Agenda?</p> <p>10 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: I put my hand up.</p> <p>11 I know it's hard to get used to all this. But I had</p> <p>12 my hand up just to congratulate the three of you --</p> <p>13 THE CHAIR: Oh, I'm sorry.</p> <p>14 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: -- and looking</p> <p>15 forward to the next year. And so way to go. That's</p> <p>16 what I -- here we go. I'll put my hand down now.</p> <p>17 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thanks. There was</p> <p>18 someone else up there that had their hand -- oh.</p> <p>19 Director Chavez?</p> <p>20 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes. Thank you.</p> <p>21 Good morning, Commissioners. A couple of</p> <p>22 things. I also want to congratulate the new</p> <p>23 executive team members and say I look forward to</p> <p>24 working with you.</p> <p>25 And for Chair Gipson, going to miss you</p>

14	<p>1 working directly with you, because you have been</p> <p>2 incredible in terms of the guidance and support and</p> <p>3 collaboration with me and helping me really to</p> <p>4 become oriented in this position.</p> <p>5 So I just wanted to say that, recognize</p> <p>6 you.</p> <p>7 And then as we transition to the Consent</p> <p>8 Agenda, I wanted to just point out on the request to</p> <p>9 amend the charter school contracts, there's two</p> <p>10 categories. I think the pagination on the agenda</p> <p>11 made it look as if The GREAT Academy has a new</p> <p>12 business manager. I don't think it was scooted over</p> <p>13 as much in at least one version of the agenda.</p> <p>14 So I just want to be clear that the three</p> <p>15 schools we're looking at are -- for new board</p> <p>16 membership is Aldo Leopold, North Valley and The</p> <p>17 GREAT Academy.</p> <p>18 And then the fourth amendment is a school</p> <p>19 business manager change at Raíces.</p> <p>20 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thanks for that</p> <p>21 clarification.</p> <p>22 So if there are no changes, I will move</p> <p>23 for approval of the Consent agenda.</p> <p>24 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: I'll second.</p> <p>25 THE CHAIR: So a motion by Commissioner</p>	16	<p>1 COMMISSIONER ARMILLO: Yes.</p> <p>2 COMMISSIONER BURT: All right. That</p> <p>3 passes unanimously, ten-zero.</p> <p>4 THE CHAIR: We can move past Item No. 7,</p> <p>5 because we did not have anything moved off of the</p> <p>6 Consent Agenda, so we left that as a placeholder.</p> <p>7 We are on to Item No. 8, which is</p> <p>8 Discussion and Possible Action on Cesar Chavez</p> <p>9 Community School not returning to in-person</p> <p>10 learning.</p> <p>11 So, Missy, is Tani here?</p> <p>12 MS. MISSY BROWN: Yes, ma'am.</p> <p>13 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thanks. So just bring</p> <p>14 anyone from that school that's here. Or once she</p> <p>15 gets in, she can let us know if there's anyone else</p> <p>16 here.</p> <p>17 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: May I open this</p> <p>18 item?</p> <p>19 MS. MISSY BROWN: Okay.</p> <p>20 Tani, let me know if there's anybody else</p> <p>21 I should move on.</p> <p>22 MS. TANI ARNESS: Hi. I'm Tani Arness.</p> <p>23 For those who don't know me, Principal and Executive</p> <p>24 Director. And we also have, representing our school</p> <p>25 today, Anacelie Verde-Claro and Nathan Everett.</p>
15	<p>1 Gipson, a second by Commissioner Voigt.</p> <p>2 If there's no further discussion,</p> <p>3 Commissioner Burt?</p> <p>4 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Gipson.</p> <p>5 THE CHAIR: Sorry. Yes. Yes.</p> <p>6 COMMISSIONER BURT: I'll come back to you.</p> <p>7 Okay. Yes.</p> <p>8 Commissioner Davis.</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Yes.</p> <p>10 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Manis.</p> <p>11 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Yes.</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Chavez.</p> <p>13 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes.</p> <p>14 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Robbins.</p> <p>15 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes.</p> <p>16 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Carrillo.</p> <p>17 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Yes.</p> <p>18 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Taylor.</p> <p>19 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Yes.</p> <p>20 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Burt,</p> <p>21 yes.</p> <p>22 Commissioner Voigt.</p> <p>23 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes.</p> <p>24 COMMISSIONER BURT: And Commissioner</p> <p>25 Armijo.</p>	17	<p>1 MS. MISSY BROWN: Thank you.</p> <p>2 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: And so while</p> <p>3 they're joining and being brought on to the panel, I</p> <p>4 would like to just say that I asked that the school</p> <p>5 be invited to the PEC meeting this month not because</p> <p>6 I wanted to play a "gotcha" game with the school,</p> <p>7 but because I think that the school -- I thought</p> <p>8 that the PEC might appreciate hearing from the</p> <p>9 school and where they're at.</p> <p>10 As everybody knows, the COVID has been the</p> <p>11 most challenging time in education for all schools</p> <p>12 and school leaders. And the PED, last year,</p> <p>13 moved -- asked schools to move in and out of remote</p> <p>14 learning rather swiftly, and, towards the end of the</p> <p>15 year, asked schools to come back to in-person.</p> <p>16 Cesar Chavez Community School is a -- one</p> <p>17 of our older charter schools. And Tani can share</p> <p>18 with us exactly how old it is, but it is a school</p> <p>19 that came into APS to address the needs of a</p> <p>20 population of students whose needs I would say were</p> <p>21 not being met at the time.</p> <p>22 And just so the Commission is aware, the</p> <p>23 mission of Cesar Chavez Community School is that it</p> <p>24 offers intensive support to students entering or</p> <p>25 reconnecting to high school through flexible and</p>

18

1 personalized programs during non-traditional hours.
2 They prepare graduates for their next steps,
3 including education training, work, family, and
4 participation in the community.

5 I -- I have not been to the school since I
6 took this position, or quite a while. But when I
7 did know the school a number of years ago, it really
8 was doing some great things for students that we
9 might call at risk, including having the day care
10 center similar to the New America-Las Cruces program
11 that they talked about at the time.

12 So -- so there has been some shift in
13 leadership. There has been the COVID to contend
14 with. There has been some remote learning and some
15 remote learning lessons learned from the school and
16 the desire to continue remote learning.

17 At the same time, at the State level, the
18 Governor and the Secretary of Education and
19 everybody at the PED has -- has been encouraging
20 schools to move towards in-person learning to the
21 greatest extent possible.

22 And that's been difficult, as we know.
23 Right now I would say that schools are moving
24 towards remote learning at a faster pace than ever
25 since this COVID hit, voluntarily, because of the

20

1 for -- thanks for being here. And could you just
2 once again introduce the folks from your school that
3 are here, because they were just kind of moving in
4 and we kind of lost it.

5 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yeah. Sure. Again, I'd
6 like to introduce our governance council president,
7 Anaelie Verde-Claro. And our school dean of
8 students, Nathan Everett.

9 THE CHAIR: Thanks so much -- thanks once
10 again for being here. And here we are.

11 So, you know...

12 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yeah. Madam Chair and
13 Commissioners, if I could take some time, I would
14 like to read a presentation that I have prepared.
15 And I will be sending you a copy of the presentation
16 after today's meeting as well so you'll have that.

17 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thanks so much.

18 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yeah. So I just wanted
19 to start by saying thank you, Director Chavez, for
20 your introduction, and thank you to the
21 Commissioners for taking the time to meet with us
22 today and for holding this meeting on Zoom.

23 We know that we're all here because we
24 care about students. And I know that we all want to
25 ensure that we have excellent school choices for all

19

1 high numbers of positive cases both with staff and
2 students and the shortage of staff. So this is a
3 really difficult time.

4 I had a conversation with Tani this fall
5 semester when I realized that the school had chosen
6 to remain remote for the semester with a plan to
7 revisit that. And I -- and I asked Tani to consider
8 moving back towards in-person learning.

9 And I know that she did. And this is why
10 we want to hear from the school about their decision
11 to remain remote, while at the same time -- so
12 there's two items in the PEC materials. One is the
13 memo that Tani shared with me about the
14 consideration that the school made in choosing to
15 remain remote. And the other is the memo that came
16 from Deputy Secretary Katarina Sandoval, which is
17 just a reminder to districts and charter leaders
18 about moving towards in person as much as possible.

19 So I just wanted to preface this. This is
20 not a "gotcha." This is really, I think, an
21 opportunity for us to listen to the school and to
22 have this discussion and to lean into, sort of like
23 the -- lean into the -- the place where things are
24 right now.

25 THE CHAIR: Sorry. So, Tani, thanks

21

1 the students in New Mexico.

2 Commissioners, I really appreciate that
3 you volunteer your time. And that does not go
4 unnoted. And, Chair Gipson, now Commissioner
5 Gipson, I do want to just acknowledge your years of
6 service. I know how many hours you've put into the
7 position; so thank you for that.

8 And as principal of Cesar Chavez Community
9 School for -- which we call CCCS -- for the past
10 eight years, I would like to take some time to give
11 you some more information about our school during
12 the pandemic of the last two years.

13 In reviewing our history, you will see
14 that we do have a long record of being a
15 consistently exemplary school and a leader in
16 innovation for schools across the state.

17 The heart of Cesar Chavez Community School
18 has, since 2004, as we've been for 18 years, been
19 about building relationships, supportive community,
20 and providing excellent learning opportunities for,
21 quote, "at-risk" students.

22 CCCS has always required teachers who are
23 committed to the extra effort it takes. Our
24 students must develop and implement creative,
25 relevant, nurturing, and rigorous lessons, as well

<p style="text-align: right;">22</p> <p>1 as individualized support to meet very high student 2 needs.</p> <p>3 In the 21 months since the current health 4 emergency struck, our school community has been in 5 constant dialogue about how best to meet the needs 6 of our students, families, teachers, and community. 7 We have been gathering and analyzing multiple 8 sources of input and data during this entire 9 pandemic time. As the situation in our community 10 has evolved, the school has, in response, also 11 evolved.</p> <p>12 I would like to share various components 13 of our developments over the past two years so that 14 you can really understand our progress in dealing 15 with the pandemic. I'm going to go through several 16 categories.</p> <p>17 Technology.</p> <p>18 CCCS has provided free Chromebooks to 19 every student and staff member as well as training 20 for using them.</p> <p>21 CCCS provides free support to all families 22 in signing up for T-Mobile's Project 10 Million, 23 through which students receive free hotspots and/or 24 Wi-Fi.</p> <p>25 Over the past 21 months, our teachers and</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">24</p> <p>1 Since transitioning to an online modality, 2 discipline issues have all but disappeared, with 3 only one discipline referral required for the entire 4 2020-to-'21 school year.</p> <p>5 Mentoring.</p> <p>6 The CCCS mentoring program which has for 7 many years provided every student with a trained 8 CCCS staff mentor, has expanded with great success. 9 We now include weekly classes as well as one-on-one 10 check-in meetings at a minimum of once a week and up 11 to once a day for each student.</p> <p>12 Family communication and accessibility has 13 also been expanded. CCCS has provided every student 14 and parent with every staff person's e-mail and 15 Google Voice number for easy and direct contact.</p> <p>16 Educational assistance.</p> <p>17 CCCS has increased the number of Level 3 18 EAs in classrooms during this pandemic time to help 19 support differentiated lessons and use of breakout 20 rooms. CCCS has also significantly increased the 21 number of hours that one-on-one and small-group 22 tutoring is available each day for all students.</p> <p>23 In academic achievement, we have been 24 thrilled to see that our average interim assessment 25 scores, growth scores, did not fall during the</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">23</p> <p>1 students have mastered new challenging technologies. 2 This was no small thing for our students. We've 3 seen a lot of growth in this area.</p> <p>4 And teachers have been innovating in their 5 online lesson planning and delivery.</p> <p>6 Teachers are facilitating classes with 7 100 percent engagement, differentiation, and small 8 group and one-on-one coaching.</p> <p>9 Synchronous classes are being used 10 successfully to help students interact with each 11 other and share ideas in realtime.</p> <p>12 In social work and mental health, we have 13 increased our social work and mental health 14 counseling staff, and we are creating telehealth 15 counseling models that are proving to be powerful 16 and effective with our students.</p> <p>17 CCCS has also implemented new student-led 18 electives, as well as daily social-emotional 19 learning classes.</p> <p>20 Discipline issues.</p> <p>21 Discipline issues in a typical 22 pre-pandemic year resulted in approximately 23 100 student-to-staff discipline referrals. Past 24 issues have involved class disruption, illegal 25 substances, and physical assaults.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">25</p> <p>1 2020-to-'21 school year. Average math and reading 2 growth for students have both remained strong. 3 Further, average growth scores in reading increased 4 22 percent.</p> <p>5 Amidst all the extra stressors of the 6 2020-to-'21 school year, CCCS even managed to meet 7 and exceed both of its mission-specific charter 8 contract goals.</p> <p>9 Student surveys.</p> <p>10 In two surveys of CCCS students taken in 11 the past 21 months, students have reported learning 12 the same amount or even greater amounts in their 13 online classes than on-campus classes. In the first 14 survey, 62 percent of students reported their 15 classroom engagement in online classes was equally 16 high or higher than their engagement in on-campus 17 classes.</p> <p>18 In the second student survey, 80 percent 19 of students reported learning the same amount or 20 more, and 58 percent of students reported learning 21 even more in their online classes than in their 22 on-campus classes.</p> <p>23 In both student surveys, comments have 24 been made that many students have enjoyed the 25 increased flexibility and accessibility of being</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">26</p> <p>1 able to work from home.</p> <p>2 In mobility rate and attendance,</p> <p>3 incredibly, our annual student mobility rate, which</p> <p>4 is traditionally approximately 80 percent due to our</p> <p>5 at-risk population of students, fell to just over</p> <p>6 34 percent in the 2020-to-'21 school year.</p> <p>7 Our average attendance rate, which is</p> <p>8 traditionally one of the biggest challenges with any</p> <p>9 reengagement school, has not decreased during this</p> <p>10 health emergency.</p> <p>11 Enrollment.</p> <p>12 Our overall student enrollment has also</p> <p>13 remained solid. There was no decrease in enrollment</p> <p>14 in 2020 to '21. And in 2021 to '22, there has been</p> <p>15 a decrease of only ten students, with variations</p> <p>16 anticipated by the end of this school year.</p> <p>17 Parents.</p> <p>18 During this pandemic, parents continue to</p> <p>19 report that they are grateful for the school's high</p> <p>20 levels of communication, nurturing, and support.</p> <p>21 CCCS students enter with an average of eleven</p> <p>22 failing grades already on their high school</p> <p>23 transcripts. Parents repeatedly tell staff how</p> <p>24 happy they are to see their children enjoying school</p> <p>25 and being successful, especially after having had</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">28</p> <p>1 online program.</p> <p>2 The Cesar Chavez governance council,</p> <p>3 administration, and many consultants have reviewed</p> <p>4 our charter contract and have concluded that we are</p> <p>5 meeting all commitments in our contract and</p> <p>6 education plan. The direction we are going in is to</p> <p>7 identify ourselves as an online school.</p> <p>8 Thank you for being receptive to the</p> <p>9 information we have provided here, and we look</p> <p>10 forward to your support of Cesar Chavez Community</p> <p>11 School as a fully online school.</p> <p>12 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you for that.</p> <p>13 I'm going to say for myself this response was a</p> <p>14 little unexpected. The application process</p> <p>15 identifies the educational programming of a school.</p> <p>16 And your application process did not, in any way,</p> <p>17 for me, identify it as a completely online school.</p> <p>18 We've had at least one school come before</p> <p>19 us already a couple of months ago and make that --</p> <p>20 wanted to start -- stay in person, but also have an</p> <p>21 online component. And the direction by the</p> <p>22 Commission was that's a whole new application</p> <p>23 because that's a separate school.</p> <p>24 So for me it goes far beyond amending the</p> <p>25 cons- -- "the constitution." It goes far beyond --</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">27</p> <p>1 long periods of, quote, "failure" in more</p> <p>2 traditional programs.</p> <p>3 In summary, you can see the Cesar Chavez</p> <p>4 Community School has stood up to the challenges of</p> <p>5 this pandemic and become an even stronger school.</p> <p>6 We have worked very hard and are thrilled by our</p> <p>7 successes. We are continuing to grow beyond what</p> <p>8 many have thought was possible for schools during</p> <p>9 this pandemic, and our online program continues to</p> <p>10 meet the needs of students with multiple risk</p> <p>11 factors, extreme trauma, histories of disengagement,</p> <p>12 and complex problems in school and community.</p> <p>13 During all the instability and</p> <p>14 distractions of this ever changing health emergency,</p> <p>15 CCCS has been able to provide safety, stability, and</p> <p>16 support. We have guided students in regrouping and</p> <p>17 staying on track toward their goals. We have</p> <p>18 continued meeting our mission by focusing on giving</p> <p>19 highly vulnerable students maximum flexibility,</p> <p>20 personalization, safety, and wraparound supports.</p> <p>21 After much discussion and input from our</p> <p>22 stakeholders, the CCCS governance council and</p> <p>23 administration have decided that the best next step</p> <p>24 for our school is not to attempt to go backward, but</p> <p>25 to continue moving forward and building our unique</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">29</p> <p>1 it goes beyond amending the constitution, too. It</p> <p>2 goes beyond amending your contract to go completely</p> <p>3 online.</p> <p>4 So that's -- I'll be honest; that's</p> <p>5 troubling for me. So I'll just -- I'll just say</p> <p>6 that.</p> <p>7 And I have to -- you know, this was truly</p> <p>8 unexpected. So I have to chew on this for a little</p> <p>9 while.</p> <p>10 So, Commissioners, anyone else?</p> <p>11 Oh. Commissioner Robbins. You've got the</p> <p>12 bookcase there.</p> <p>13 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Thank you. If you</p> <p>14 look at that -- your upper left corner, that's</p> <p>15 usually the people who have their hands up.</p> <p>16 THE CHAIR: I get that. But you move, so</p> <p>17 I lose you from it.</p> <p>18 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Okay. Like the</p> <p>19 Chair, I'm concerned that this school did not come</p> <p>20 with a new application and did not come to the</p> <p>21 Commission prior to deciding on its own. And I</p> <p>22 appreciate the fact that you believe your lawyers</p> <p>23 think that it's within your contract to do this. I</p> <p>24 disagree.</p> <p>25 You talk a lot. You know, in due respect,</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">30</p> <p>1 Ms. Arness, you gave a lot of flowery language. You 2 talk about how you've only lost ten students. 3 What is your enrollment? What was your 4 enrollment in 2019? The 2018-'19 school year? The 5 '19-'20 school year? The '20-'21? I would like to 6 see what the enrollment is. To say you've lost ten 7 students, if you only had 40 students and you lost 8 ten, that's huge. 9 And I'm a former statistician. So it's 10 easy -- you've used physical numbers for some things 11 and used -- you've used percentages for other. So 12 my first question is what has been your enrollment 13 over the last three years? 14 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yes. Thank you, 15 Commissioner Robbins, for that question. I 16 appreciate that. 17 Yes, statistics are important. And 18 enrollment of our school tends to vary from 200 to 19 203; it's been solid for about ten years. And we 20 are currently -- right now, we have 196. 2019, I 21 believe, was 203 or 202. '19-'20, I believe, was 22 maybe 201. So we're right in that window. 23 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Okay. How -- I 24 mean, you talk about your teachers touching -- you 25 know, touching in, you know, checking in with the</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">32</p> <p>1 look into that. If you wanted to e-mail me a 2 question regarding that, I could look into that 3 further. 4 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Because I think, 5 you know, that's one of the important things that 6 PED -- you know, all of the education experts 7 indicate it's really preferred to have in person 8 where you can. 9 Now, some students -- obviously, we do 10 have some virtual schools -- this school was 11 never -- the application and your current contract 12 doesn't set this school up as a virtual school. 13 And students at risk -- I think, you know, 14 as a large population, the majority of your 15 students -- you said, you know, many of -- most of 16 your students have failed eleven classes prior to 17 coming to Cesar Chavez. 18 And so that's a concern that, you know, a 19 little bit more hands on and physically seeing the 20 students to make sure that their needs really are 21 being met, I think is very important. So that's a 22 concern I have. 23 And you mentioned that you're doing 24 student surveys, and that the students, when 25 surveyed, they went from 60 percent thinking they're</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">31</p> <p>1 students once a day. 2 How can we be sure that the students are 3 actually receiving the required number of hours of 4 instruction when they only touch base with -- 5 MS. TANI ARNESS: No. We have scheduled 6 Zoom classes. Our synchronous class schedule, 7 students attend Zoom classes. 8 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Okay. So there are 9 scheduled classes that the teachers take attendance 10 in and everything. Good. 11 Again, that wasn't really mentioned. You 12 mentioned touching in once a day. To, me that was 13 the teachers only saw the students once a day. 14 MS. TANI ARNESS: Sorry for that 15 confusion. That's the mentoring program beyond the 16 classroom, yes. 17 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Great. The -- how 18 many cases of COVID have there been among students 19 and among staff, of total staff? So of 200 20 students, how many of them have had positive COVID 21 tests? 22 MS. TANI ARNESS: Because we are not -- 23 students aren't on campus, they're not reporting 24 those numbers to us if they're not on campus. So we 25 don't have, at this moment, that number. We could</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">33</p> <p>1 learning more to 80 percent saying that they learn 2 more. 3 A survey of an individual, how they feel, 4 is nice in terms of how they feel, but that doesn't 5 indicate that they're actually learning. 6 So what -- what metrics and what tools are 7 you using to actually measure student growth and 8 student learning? 9 MS. TANI ARNESS: Well, we mentioned our 10 interim assessment scores, the growth scores, for 11 math and reading. So that would be the short cycle 12 assessments three times a year. 13 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Okay. The -- I 14 guess the last thing I have, the -- the T-Mobile 15 hotspots and things like that, you know, it's great. 16 But my understanding is these hotspots, are they 17 providing sufficient speeds for students to actually 18 participate fully? 19 With just a meeting, it's fine. But can 20 they download and see the appropriate amount of 21 information? Any videos used in instruction that 22 they can have access to in a realtime-type fashion? 23 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yes. We've been able to 24 get -- it's -- our students are in Albuquerque, so 25 that helps. But the T-Mobile program does offer the</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">34</p> <p>1 free Wi-Fi. So we've been able to, yeah, have that 2 work fine for our classes. 3 Nate, did you have anything you wanted to 4 add on that one? 5 MR. NATHAN EVERETT: No. It -- a lot of 6 our students have their own Internet. And the 7 students that we're struggling to get Internet were 8 helped with T-Mobile. So some have high-speed 9 Internet of their own as well as some have hotspots. 10 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Okay. That's all I 11 have at this time. Thank you. 12 THE CHAIR: Thank you. 13 Commissioner Chavez? 14 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: So much of what I 15 want to say has already been said. I just want to 16 say that I stand in agreement with Commissioner 17 Gipson and Commissioner Robbins. This is -- this 18 was not what was presented to us. 19 And there has been a call. There has been 20 a call from the Secretary and from the Governor for 21 all schools to go back to in-person learning. 22 So I'm just in agreement with both -- as I 23 stated, Chair Gipson and Commissioner Robbins. 24 THE CHAIR: Thanks. 25 Commissioner Voigt?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">36</p> <p>1 decision. 2 But I think, you know, we're here to 3 support you and, in any way we can, to help you meet 4 the needs of your community. But from what you've 5 said, your kids are doing better in the home 6 environment. And I know the personal and social 7 dynamics of your school have been a challenge when 8 you have been face to face. 9 The student discipline alone can be all 10 consuming for some communities. And that speaks 11 volumes. 12 I'm sure, Mr. Everett, as the dean of 13 students, you are really tapping into that 14 social-emotional support for the kids. And that's a 15 lot. That's big. 16 So I just wanted to thank you for taking 17 the time to give us all of that great information. 18 And great job on your interim assessments. 19 MS. TANI ARNESS: Thank you, Commissioner 20 Voigt. Appreciate that. 21 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Carrillo. 22 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Yes. Thank you. 23 Hi, Tani. We never have met. I'm up in 24 Santa Fe and cover kind of Santa Fe north to the 25 border.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">35</p> <p>1 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: You're on mute. 2 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: I got that. Thank 3 you, Madam Chair. 4 Hi, Tani. It's good to see you. Happy 5 New Year. 6 So, you know, I really appreciate your 7 report. And I know your school and your community. 8 And I think you're doing the best thing for your 9 community. By what you stated and the appreciation 10 that you have from your stakeholders for the way you 11 were able to shift for your students, it says a lot. 12 And that's a huge decision to make. 13 So -- and I'm sure it was stressful and, 14 you know, all that. 15 I think in stating that you want to 16 reidentify as an online school, you might give that 17 a little more consideration before being really 18 decisive about that. 19 I really do think that COVID is going to 20 be with us in some form or another. But your 21 student body will change over time. You know, the 22 value of online learning might change over time. 23 And you might go with the flow, so to speak, and 24 just do your online while you can during COVID and 25 see how things shift before making another big</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">37</p> <p>1 MS. TANI ARNESS: Okay. Nice to meet you. 2 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: You as well. And 3 thank you for your presentation and certainly for 4 the work you do at the school. 5 I tend to agree with Commissioner Gipson 6 and the others that spoke up. This is not in your 7 charter. If you want to be an online school, 8 reapply to be an online school. 9 And I'll get to other things. It's as if, 10 you know, a school that we approved, had a mission 11 statement and an entire plan that they presented to 12 us, all of a sudden decided mid-semester, you know 13 what? We're going to drop that. We're going to now 14 be a STEM -- we're going to now be solely STEM -- 15 whatever it might be -- or, you know, that's kind of 16 what this is. 17 So when I first learned about this, it 18 definitely caught me by surprise. 19 I would tend to disagree with your counsel 20 if they said this is not a contract violation, 21 because this is not in your contract or in your 22 mission. 23 I'm happy to hear that you think your kids 24 are doing well. So I'd be wanting to ask, where 25 are -- where are your proficiency scores? Where</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">38</p> <p>1 were they a couple of years ago when you were doing 2 short cycle, and where are they now? Proficiency 3 for reading and math.</p> <p>4 MS. TANI ARNESS: So we look at individual 5 growth scores, because we do have high mobility. So 6 students come in. And you can't really compare 7 apples to oranges from year to year with different 8 students. So we have to look at where they come in 9 and where they grow to. And we look at at least 10 having one year's growth in math and reading as 11 measured each fall to spring on the short cycle 12 assessments.</p> <p>13 So our math has stayed solid at a year's 14 growth averaging of all the students' different 15 growth scores. And our reading is up to two years' 16 growth.</p> <p>17 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Okay. So that 18 measures the growth. But if they're growing -- if 19 they come in at Grade 9, and they're at a 20 fourth-grade reading level and they grow to fifth or 21 sixth grade reading, by the time they graduate high 22 school, they're going to be seriously deficient in 23 their ability to read and write.</p> <p>24 And if they even decide to do anything 25 next, it's going to be remedial. And we know what</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">40</p> <p>1 could get back with you.</p> <p>2 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: You don't need to 3 do that. Even post-PARCC, that was a while ago. 4 Wow. I'm just remembering the protest we had up 5 here at PED and the sit-ins that kids did at 6 Santa Fe High. It was exciting.</p> <p>7 But even after that, I would think that, 8 just off of -- that one of you, just kind of off the 9 top of your head, would know where your students are 10 in their proficiency rates as a whole.</p> <p>11 MS. TANI ARNESS: I can tell you that 12 they -- we are not -- let's see. We've got students 13 coming in -- again, I don't want to give you any 14 false information. I want to look up the actual 15 numbers.</p> <p>16 But we have students coming in at an 17 average of about a fifth- to sixth-grade level. And 18 we're working on meeting them where they're at and 19 helping them grow as quickly as possible.</p> <p>20 So, yeah, proficiency is difficult to 21 attain for a lot of our students. But we stay with 22 them to make progress in that direction.</p> <p>23 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Okay. Thank you 24 for your answer; although I'm having trouble with 25 it, because I guess when there are parent-teacher</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">39</p> <p>1 happens generally to kids in remedial; they drop out 2 of college at an alarm- -- like, 80 percent or so. 3 If they start in remedial, they don't finish.</p> <p>4 I'm curious as to proficiency rates as 5 opposed to growth. Do you have averages -- once 6 they're -- you know, it's interesting sometimes when 7 people come to us and the way they want to use data 8 and the way -- I'll say it.</p> <p>9 There's a school up here in the north. 10 They came to us to try to be -- I was on the 11 Santa Fe School Board for years.</p> <p>12 They came to us to try to be a local 13 charter. They kept using these numbers as if they 14 had 10 percent growth here and there. Yeah, your 15 growth went from 20 percent to 22 percent. So 16 you're fudging all the numbers.</p> <p>17 You're making it look like you had this 18 amazing breakthrough. 22 percent is nothing to be 19 proud of in terms of, like, their proficiency.</p> <p>20 So where are your proficiency scores? 21 Where were they, and where are they?</p> <p>22 MS. TANI ARNESS: I will have to get those 23 numbers to you. We'd be having to go back to PARCC 24 on that. And so I'd have to go back and look at 25 those. If you wanted to e-mail me that question, I</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">41</p> <p>1 conferences, if there's a parent or a guardian or 2 anyone, we would be addressing around a little round 3 table in the classroom with a student, you know, 4 "You're 15 percent proficient right now in math, and 5 you're 21 percent proficient in English, so we're 6 very concerned. This is our prescription for you 7 for these coming years, parent and kid. You need to 8 agree, because for you to be able to work a -- you 9 know, a minimum-wage job, there are certain things 10 you're going to have to be able to do, let alone 11 fill out a job application."</p> <p>12 So that's a concern of mine.</p> <p>13 MS. TANI ARNESS: Right. And we take 14 those conversations on an individual basis. So we 15 will say, with a parent and student, "Your student's 16 math is at a fifth-grade level right now. We want 17 to see that grow as quickly as possible. Here's the 18 steps we're taking."</p> <p>19 So we do have those conversations.</p> <p>20 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Okay. So I'm 21 going to -- I have to surmise from your answer that 22 we -- that neither you nor Nathan really have a 23 general idea, averaging proficiency rates 24 specifically. Because as -- I know up north in many 25 schools, they look at their graduation rates, which</p>

42	<p>1 is -- you know, to me, you can graduate with a 2 D average. So that doesn't really say much of 3 anything. It's really all about their skills in 4 English language arts and math.</p> <p>5 So I want to move on. I have a 6 question -- discipline has been brought up a couple 7 of times. I would tend maybe to disagree with the 8 other Commissioner.</p> <p>9 Well, of course discipline stuff has gone 10 down, because they're really not having any social 11 interaction. And that's the hardest part about high 12 school is being with other kids that are bouncing 13 off the walls just like you are and confronting 14 their -- you know, their daily aggressions; I mean, 15 not violence or anything, but their daily 16 aggressions, their sexuality, their maturity. 17 That's all the stuff that leads to discipline 18 issues.</p> <p>19 If they're home, of course they're going 20 to go down. To me that underscores even further the 21 need for them to be in the classroom. Because if 22 they're going to be out there in the world, they're 23 going to need to know conflict resolution in person, 24 like sitting down with their counselor at your 25 school with the person who they're in conflict with</p>	44	<p>1 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: It does say it 2 there. I'm sorry. I missed it. Sorry. Thank you.</p> <p>3 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: To answer your 4 question, Commissioner Carrillo, I wanted you to 5 hear firsthand from the school. One of my goals is 6 to always have a school at the meeting for you all 7 to hear from.</p> <p>8 And, frankly, I was -- I had initially had 9 a conversation with Tani about considering an 10 amendment to the charter contract if the school 11 wished to remain remote. And that was an option at 12 the time. And then I received her memo.</p> <p>13 And so I wasn't sure how you wanted to 14 proceed. But I felt it was important that she had 15 an opportunity -- she and her team had an 16 opportunity to speak directly with you all moving 17 forward.</p> <p>18 So I don't have a particular 19 recommendation at this point. I -- this is a pretty 20 open-ended conversation for you all to consider.</p> <p>21 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Okay. Thank you 22 for that answer. So I am noticing, when the issue 23 comes up again, I see that Ms. Susan Fox is in the 24 attendees. And my assumption there, of course, is 25 that she's there -- Ms. Fox is counsel for the</p>
43	<p>1 and saying, "Okay, how are you guys going to work 2 this out without coming to blows? How can you 3 accept one another's point of view without -- you 4 know, without being aggressive or without being 5 condescending?"</p> <p>6 So I think that -- disciplinary issues 7 make the arguments for more in person, and also, I 8 would think, underscores the work in social and 9 emotional learning.</p> <p>10 On the discipline -- sorry about that. I 11 want to ask Corina a question, and then I want to 12 come back.</p> <p>13 So, Corina, for today -- or I'm sorry, 14 because it's a formal meeting, Director Chavez.</p> <p>15 So for today, what's the ask? Are we just 16 being given information today? Is there going to be 17 an ask? Because it doesn't say anything about 18 possible action.</p> <p>19 So I imagine if we would surmise something 20 and discuss this, we might put something on the next 21 agenda. So if you would touch on that for me, that 22 would be great. And then I want to go back to the 23 other questions that I have.</p> <p>24 THE CHAIR: Can I just interrupt for a 25 sec? It does say "Possible Action."</p>	45	<p>1 school.</p> <p>2 So I don't have a question for Ms. Fox 3 right now because I know that, Tani, you said 4 earlier that your advice from counsel was that this 5 is all within the scope of your contract.</p> <p>6 THE CHAIR: I'm sorry. Not to interrupt. 7 But Ms. Fox is, I believe, here for The GREAT 8 Academy.</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Oh, okay. In that 10 case, terrific. Is Ms. Fox your counsel? Just 11 curious. Because there's so few people in the state 12 that do this work.</p> <p>13 MS. TANI ARNESS: We haven't retained 14 counsel yet on this issue.</p> <p>15 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Got it. Thank you 16 very much.</p> <p>17 Okay. And thank you, Commissioner Gipson. 18 Okay. And thank you, Director Chavez, for that, 19 because that makes me think about what's next so -- 20 and if this can be done with an amendment.</p> <p>21 Okay. In terms of -- let's see. I know 22 that -- to me, PED created a massive failure last 23 year by not making it mandatory that kids be on 24 screen if they're going to be remote. They were 25 allowed to just have their name or background up or</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">46</p> <p>1 something like that. That was just so laughably -- 2 I'm going to use the word "stupid" -- that I just 3 couldn't believe that happened. 4 So in your remote program, do you require 5 the kids actually be on screen to be counted in 6 attendance and have to stay on screen? 7 MS. TANI ARNESS: We are allowing students 8 and teachers to create a plan together for how 9 students will be seen and heard to participate in 10 their various classes. 11 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Got it. So I'll 12 take that as a no, it's not a requirement to be on 13 screen. 14 MS. TANI ARNESS: It's not a school-wide 15 requirement that students be on screen the entire 16 time. 17 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Got it. Thank 18 you. 19 Now, one of the things that I would 20 imagine -- and I'm not even saying that we would 21 approve. I would think that you would have to come 22 in for a new contract or something to be a 23 100 percent remote school. 24 And I don't know. Have you and your board 25 thought about what that means? Because if -- you're</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">48</p> <p>1 It would not be just enroll as many people for 2 asynchronous classes as possible. 3 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: So then the 4 challenge with that, to me, would be -- because 5 legally, you have to lotto in kids -- you might have 6 families and kids that go there now, and they might 7 not be able to get in next time because other kids 8 from further away, if you're offering an online 9 program, are going to be able to take that spot. 10 And as a State charter, you're not allowed 11 to have a boundary, per se. You're not allowed to 12 just say, "You can only be within these couple of 13 ZIP Codes." 14 So I would be super concerned about that. 15 And then, honestly, I would -- you know, I 16 would disagree relative -- when you said about 17 creating community and relationship -- you know, I 18 love Zoom calling, which I don't. I can't stand it. 19 I would always love to be with people around a table 20 in a room. And, especially, I would think that for 21 kids that are in those Grades 9-12, boy -- and even 22 middle school -- those are hard years. 23 And I just think that having an adult just 24 looking you in the eye and just -- you know, are 25 holding your hand getting through something, it's --</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">47</p> <p>1 a State charter. So even right now, somebody that 2 lives down in Hatch or Jal or way up there in Aztec 3 could come to your school. 4 So if you're going to be an online school, 5 like the K12 school and the other one that -- 6 Connections Academy -- and these other schools, have 7 you even thought -- have you and your board thought 8 about kind of a rush of possible enrollment and how 9 would you even deal with this relative to staffing, 10 kind of -- running an online program, the expertise 11 to run a school that could easily double in size? 12 These other schools have 2,000 kids. If 13 you're going to be here in Albuquerque -- so, you 14 know, what consideration have you and your board 15 given to that issue? 16 MS. TANI ARNESS: Our model for an online 17 school is very different than a traditional online. 18 We are shaping -- our thinking right now is to shape 19 this directly around high-needs students, where you 20 need to build relationships, you need to have 21 synchronous classes, you need to have a small 22 community where you can get to know each other and 23 meet wraparound needs. 24 So we would cap enrollment and continue 25 with the structured time to get to know students.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">49</p> <p>1 that's what's needed. 2 And even community events relative -- all 3 the things that happen in high school that bring 4 people together as a community and socially. And 5 sometimes it's crisis. So I'd be concerned about 6 that. 7 The next thing I had here is I would agree 8 with Commissioner Robbins. And I -- not -- so far 9 all of the data I've read and the studies that I've 10 looked at -- not studies, articles I've looked at, 11 and there's not one that has contradicted this -- 12 they all say that the safest place for kids is in 13 school relative to COVID. Schools have the most 14 structured safety measures. 15 And when we look at where kids are getting 16 COVID, they're not getting it in school. They're 17 getting it from their unvaccinated parents and 18 people that are in their lives at home. School is 19 the safest place. 20 So I know that there might be different -- 21 there might be a lot of parents and things, and 22 maybe there's a lot of parents who are not vaxxed. 23 I don't know about your population. And, actually, 24 I am totally open to the fact that I do pass 25 judgment on people that aren't vaxxed, severe</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">50</p> <p>1 judgment. I'm very open about that. 2 And -- but school is the safest place for 3 kids. So this is a tough one for me that you have 4 all decided kind of unilaterally to do this. I mean 5 you could have come to us in October and say, "Look, 6 you know, something -- this is kind of working" -- 7 or November -- "it's something we want to do for the 8 following semester," I think that would have been a 9 much better approach. 10 I'm going to look at my notes and see if 11 there's anything else I want to touch on here. 12 Not yet. But that doesn't preclude me 13 from wanting to jump in again later. 14 So thank you for being here. And thank 15 you, Nathan. 16 THE CHAIR: Thank you. Commissioner 17 Carrillo always has that one last word. 18 So Commissioner Armijo? 19 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Thank you. First of 20 all, I just want to thank you for being here as 21 well. 22 I just want to start off by saying that, 23 you know, you and your dean of students and your 24 board president know your students the best. So I 25 commend you for having courage to see that this is</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">52</p> <p>1 something with their teacher or counselor that they 2 wouldn't maybe necessarily do in an in-person 3 setting. 4 So -- and those are just coming from what 5 I've heard from, like I said, the school that I deal 6 with that's an APS charter. 7 It was a little bit of a shock that you 8 just wanted to switch this up in the middle of a 9 school year, or -- so I'm kind of on the fence about 10 that. 11 I do have a question about what your 12 school offers in the way of, like, dual credits or 13 any career readiness for, like, CNM or UNM or 14 anything like that. 15 MS. TANI ARNESS: Thank you, Commissioner 16 Armijo. We do offer two classes that have CCCS dual 17 credit -- well, sorry -- that have a dual credit 18 with a CCCS teacher facilitating them for extra 19 support. And that's the financial literacy and 20 college success courses. 21 And then we do offer CCCS -- I'm sorry -- 22 CNM dual credit classes as well, and we help 23 students to get enrolled for those when they're 24 ready for that stuff. 25 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Great. Thank you.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">51</p> <p>1 working for you. 2 I do agree with most of the other 3 Commissioners that it may not be the right timing, 4 and maybe you -- as Vice Chair Voigt suggested, you 5 know, look at this a little further and then maybe 6 come back to us. 7 But I sort of disagree with Commissioner 8 Carrillo regarding the discipline. I understand 9 that people need to learn about conflict resolution. 10 But I also know -- I also deal with an APS-chartered 11 charter school that probably serves the same 12 demographic of youth that you serve. 13 And they're -- they're not completely 14 online, but they have had some really serious issues 15 around discipline, and, you know, some -- I don't 16 want to say violent acts, but acts that could be 17 considered very dangerous at school. 18 And so, you know, noticing that, that, you 19 know, you don't have to deal with that on a daily 20 basis because they're online, I would think is a 21 little helpful in learning, for the students to 22 learn. 23 I also know that students learn and 24 sometimes feel more safe when they're on an online 25 setting where they're able to probably discuss</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">53</p> <p>1 I guess just the last thing I want to say is, you 2 know, the surveys. I was -- I -- when you hear from 3 the students themselves or the parents themselves, I 4 find that to be the most helpful when it comes to 5 education. 6 You know, usually, a school is -- you 7 know, the school that you have is very similar to 8 the school that I'm with. It's about 200 students; 9 they're like a family. The teachers are so engaged 10 with their students. 11 And I -- and maybe I'm a little biased in 12 that way, so I'm leaning towards your -- you know, 13 feeling your pain and feeling how you want to, you 14 know, move forward with your educational plan. 15 So I just wanted to say thank you for 16 bringing this to us and letting us know how your 17 students are doing. And I really hope that they 18 continue to -- to thrive, either in this 19 environment, or if -- you know, if -- I always do 20 like to see students at school. It is -- it is a 21 little -- you know, I'm older, so I know that -- or 22 that's what I grew up with. But I do know that that 23 doesn't always mean that it's the better way to go. 24 So thank you so much for, you know, just 25 trying to do what's best for your students. Thanks.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">54</p> <p>1 THE CHAIR: Thanks. 2 Commissioner Burt? 3 COMMISSIONER BURT: Thank you. All right. 4 So I think after just, you know, kind of -- I think 5 it was good to take a second and just, like, process 6 it, because I think -- what I believe about what I 7 heard is if we were getting an update on, you know, 8 how you were responding to COVID, I would -- you 9 know, the work that you're doing with your students, 10 the mentorship program that you have, where every 11 student has someone, I think is -- I mean, it is so 12 important, especially right now; right? 13 While students who were -- they were in 14 class, they had -- they had six, seven teachers 15 telling them every day, you know, "You have to -- 16 you've got to get things done," and then they go to 17 nothing. So having that one-to-one engagement with 18 the mentorship part, I think is -- I mean -- I wish 19 that's something that, you know, every school was 20 able to do, especially -- like I said, especially 21 during this transition to COVID, just so students 22 did get that one-to-one. 23 Hearing all the things that you're doing 24 after the pandemic and after going to online 25 learning, I mean, there's nothing -- those are the</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">56</p> <p>1 anymore. It's just about what's best for our kids. 2 That's when I believe it should have come 3 forward. That's when I think -- if I look at it 4 very black and white, that's where I am frustrated. 5 So. 6 I believe that you really -- I believe the 7 school should be following the guidance and the data 8 supports coming back into the classroom. That's 9 what you're there to do. That's what your program 10 is. That's what we know your program is. And so 11 not doing it, for me, is really not an option. 12 There has been plenty of data from 13 New Mexico, from the Feds, from -- saying that, you 14 know, students should go back to school now. And so 15 I think, at that point, it should have happened. 16 And then -- but -- and then, once again, 17 if you're like, "You know what, we really like 18 that," bring it forward. Bring it to the PEC. Go 19 through the right channels. There is a structure on 20 how to do that. 21 I don't think it's that you shouldn't 22 consider it or you shouldn't be like, "Oh, you know 23 what, this actually was really great, we should like 24 actually do this." I don't think there's anything 25 wrong with that.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">55</p> <p>1 kind of things that we want to hear from schools; 2 right? The engagement that you have. We're seeing 3 better -- we're seeing better; right? We're 4 actually seeing improvements. We're not seeing, you 5 know, a lack of all these different things. 6 So I am grateful for that. 7 That being said, I'm going to kind of 8 sandwich it; the good, then I'm going to say what 9 I'm frustrated about, and then I'm going to some 10 more good in a second. 11 There's a right way and a wrong way to go 12 about it. And that's at the end of the day, I think 13 there's a right way and wrong way to go about it. 14 And I think if you're doing it based off of pandemic 15 response, that's one thing. But it's not a part of 16 your educational program that's approved. 17 And so I think that that's something that 18 should have come forward right away. As soon as 19 there was any kind of discussion from the governing 20 board, from you all to the governing board, any 21 discussion in that kind of case, and you're, like, 22 you know what, this is something you want to 23 progress with further. It's not based off of COVID 24 anymore, it's based off of the success we saw from 25 moving this transition. It's not about the pandemic</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">57</p> <p>1 But I think just going, "You know what, 2 we're just going to stay doing this, because it's 3 working," I don't think that's the appropriate way 4 to have gone about it. 5 So I think that's kind of -- I think what 6 you're doing, fine. But I don't think you should 7 continue doing it just because that's -- you know, 8 you decided that's what you want to do. So I think 9 that's where I'm struggling. 10 I also -- I would say, you know, I 11 think -- you know -- and I know we have several 12 charter folks who are in charter schools, and then 13 we have our superintendent here. You know, high 14 schools especially were really struggling with 15 attendance when they went to online because a lot of 16 students, they went and got jobs or they started 17 working during the day. 18 It's really hard. Especially the students 19 that you have, you know, if you're getting them back 20 in and they're coming in and they're lower and 21 you're trying to get them to graduate, you're 22 getting them through into that, I could imagine your 23 school struggles with that heavily. 24 So I am a little -- I'm a little 25 concerned -- just in general, just, you know, when</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">58</p> <p>1 it comes to the place where you're even going to 2 consider doing this permanently, having that not the 3 synchronous class, but it be kind of optional how 4 that works, it is concerning for me. 5 Because, you know, I had -- I had 6 students -- my own -- my own kids, my students, my 7 children, who did not want to be on camera. And 8 they weren't paying attention when they weren't on 9 camera; right? And when they had a teacher who 10 said, "Hey, I require you to be on camera," guess 11 what? They were on camera; they were engaged; they 12 were talking to other students then. 13 Leaving it optional to high schoolers, I 14 want to believe that every student is just going 15 to -- any opportunity they get, they're just going 16 to jump on it. I also know I have a high schooler. 17 She's not going to do it. You tell her she's going 18 to turn her camera off, she's turning her camera 19 off. 20 Not only that, she could be at work, put 21 her phone in her pocket, and be at school while 22 she's doing other things. 23 And so I think -- I am concerned about the 24 attendance part of online learning. And so I 25 think -- I wonder if that's a place where you all</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">60</p> <p>1 But I still believe there was a right way 2 and wrong way to continue doing that online 3 learning. So that's my -- that's, at the end of the 4 day, what I'm going to keep it as. 5 THE CHAIR: Thanks. Before I go to 6 Commissioner Taylor, could I just ask Commissioners 7 to please check your e-mails? 8 Thanks. 9 Oh. Commissioner -- I'll come back to 10 Commissioner Taylor when -- I guess when he finishes 11 his text messages. 12 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: No, I'm good. I'm 13 good. 14 THE CHAIR: Do you want to talk? 15 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Me? 16 THE CHAIR: Your hand was up. 17 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Yes. Yes, I do. 18 THE CHAIR: Okay. You're next then. 19 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: I took it down 20 because you said we were moving to me next. So I -- 21 THE CHAIR: Okay. 22 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: So, yeah. Tani, 23 thank you for being here. Thank you for your 24 presentation. I really do appreciate that. 25 It sometimes can feel like going into a</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">59</p> <p>1 can consider and maybe improve on, just so that you 2 have that engagement with students. 3 And especially -- from what it sounds 4 like, you have students that need intensive 5 engagement; right? You're not having the average 6 student come in. You're having students who are 7 already behind, and you're bringing them up, so 8 they're going to need extra. I mean, they just need 9 extra. 10 So if you have the staff who they're 11 willing to do it and they're going to put in the 12 work that's not being heard on the other side, like 13 you don't see that that student is understanding 14 this, I mean, it's just -- that's a flaw in 15 synchronous learning to me. 16 So that's -- that's kind of my two cents 17 about that. 18 But I'm going to keep it really simple. I 19 think -- like I said, I'm really grateful for the 20 extras that you did based off the pandemic. Going 21 into online, it sounds like you really took it. 22 You're doing extra. You're putting in the work. 23 Your teachers are putting in the work. Ideally, 24 your students are putting in the work, and it's 25 working. That's great.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">61</p> <p>1 lion's den a little bit, and certainly don't want 2 that to be the case, you know. People need to be 3 able to come to this committee and tell us what's 4 going on. So I really do appreciate that. 5 I do want to just say ditto on what 6 Commissioner Burt just said. Almost everything she 7 said was one of the things on my list that I felt 8 like I wanted to communicate. 9 I don't know that I understand completely 10 what the primary reason -- or what the reasons 11 are -- for you to remain virtual. What -- did you 12 give us those? Like, "Hey, this is why we're doing 13 it"? Or, "It's just we just decided to do it"? 14 MS. TANI ARNESS: Well, as -- I think the 15 reasoning was spelled out in the presentation to 16 some degree. But, yes, I mean we started this as 17 part of the pandemic. And then we saw some of the 18 benefits that were happening. And so it was a -- it 19 was kind of a mix of things, I think, that brought 20 us to this. 21 But it's -- yeah, it's something that 22 we've been considering during these whole last two 23 years, is looking at what are the implications of 24 this modality. 25 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Okay. So I -- I</p>

62

1 mean, I -- I guess I didn't pick up on enough of the
 2 benefits during your presentation, because it seemed
 3 like your -- your defense, or your reasons, seemed
 4 to be, like, "We're doing all right in the midst of
 5 the pandemic, you know, in a virtual setting."
 6 It wasn't like, "Wow, we really excel by
 7 doing this. We've improved this area or this facet
 8 of our educational platform or performance by this
 9 much by being virtual."
 10 So to me, there's not -- there certainly
 11 isn't -- it wasn't made clear to me, anyway. Maybe
 12 I just didn't understand. But it wasn't made clear
 13 to me that there were really great reasons to remain
 14 virtual, you know, because it's not like
 15 everything -- or even many things -- have improved
 16 in the virtual platform.
 17 Have you lost any -- you said you're down
 18 ten students this year. Were those students lost
 19 due to the new platform, the virtual platform? They
 20 were looking for in-person education? Do you know
 21 that? Are families responding in a way that, "Hey,
 22 we're not -- we don't want to do this, it's not
 23 right for us"?
 24 MS. TANI ARNESS: So some students have --
 25 a handful of students have made a choice to -- yes,

63

1 go to an in-person program. Then we have a handful
 2 who are wanting to get a GED or who just fell off
 3 the radar, and we haven't been able to contact them.
 4 Or some of those things that we see every year,
 5 really, with our students is sometimes, all of a
 6 sudden, none of their contacts work, emergency
 7 contacts, all the phones, we can't reach anybody,
 8 and we just don't know where they went.
 9 So that -- that sometimes happens as well.
 10 And then there has been an increase of
 11 students, as we've seen across the state and nation,
 12 high school students, working, especially with the
 13 lower income families.
 14 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Sure. Do you think
 15 you've seen an increase, also a faction of people, a
 16 group of people, that have said, "Hey, this online
 17 thing is great for us, let's go to this school"?
 18 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yes, we've seen some
 19 students enrolling throughout our school year. We
 20 have students who -- always our students have tended
 21 to come from word of mouth. So we get a lot of
 22 family members. We've had generations of students
 23 who tell friends and family about the school, and
 24 that's where we get a lot of our new enrollees. And
 25 that is continuing to happen.

64

1 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Okay. But it seems
 2 to me -- I might be making this too simplistic. But
 3 it seems like all the normal stuff has been
 4 happening except you've lost a few students, five or
 5 six students or whatever, due to the online -- or
 6 the remote platform. That's kind of what it sounds
 7 like to me. The rest of the things are sort of as
 8 usual. "We get students this way. We enroll
 9 students this way," and so forth.
 10 MS. TANI ARNESS: I'm not sure how to
 11 respond to that. I'm not sure what "all the normal
 12 things" -- how to think of that right now.
 13 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: I'm sorry. The
 14 things that you were just saying that, "We -- by
 15 word of mouth, we get students," and so forth. But
 16 it hasn't been -- the virtual platform, the remote
 17 platform has not been a new sort of -- I don't want
 18 to say recruiting -- but a new source of new
 19 students enrolling. Just the fact that you're
 20 remote hasn't -- hasn't brought new students in just
 21 by that -- you know, because of that.
 22 MS. TANI ARNESS: It's hard to say,
 23 because I think it's a mix of -- like I said, it's
 24 hearing good things about the school from other
 25 people. And then, yes, you know, they want -- they

65

1 want to try the online program. Or they -- or they
 2 don't enroll because we are, you know, enrolling
 3 them in an online program. So they are choosing
 4 that, yeah.
 5 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Sure. Okay. All
 6 right.
 7 I do have some concerns about some of the
 8 things that Commissioner Carrillo brought up about
 9 proficiency and metrics and growth metrics and so
 10 forth.
 11 You know, I feel like I want to see -- I
 12 want to see more specific metrics. What you gave us
 13 was things are the same, or things are -- may have
 14 improved or whatever. But it doesn't -- that --
 15 that -- that doesn't help me with -- with my -- with
 16 my thought processes.
 17 I want to see more specific metrics about,
 18 "This is what was happening prior to us going to a
 19 remote learning platform, and this is how things are
 20 going now that we're in -- you know, in a remote
 21 learning platform."
 22 So I would like to see more information
 23 about that.
 24 I am very concerned that students don't
 25 have to be on camera. I mean, as Commissioner Burt

<p style="text-align: right;">66</p> <p>1 said, that is -- that is just a license to steal or 2 a license to not pay attention, you know. So I 3 really do think that that's important. 4 And I would -- I would do that first thing 5 Monday morning, require all of your students to be 6 on camera regardless, you know, just -- I -- that's 7 my -- that's my feeling on that. 8 So -- but having said that, I do 9 appreciate the fact that -- like I said, that you 10 are -- you are attempting to meet the needs of your 11 community. And so I don't want to reiterate 12 everything Commissioner Burt said. But she was 13 spot-on as far as my opinion. 14 So thank you again for being here. 15 MS. TANI ARNESS: Thank you. 16 THE CHAIR: Thanks. Commissioner Voigt. 17 You're muted again. 18 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thanks. Sorry. I 19 had to go off camera earlier. I had a little coffee 20 crisis in my kitchen. 21 The benefits of Zoom. 22 So I wrote some things down as I was 23 listening to some of the other Commissioners. 24 I think that -- because I do know the 25 population of the CCCS students. By making this</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">68</p> <p>1 And then, you know, online is everywhere. 2 It's everywhere. There are mostly for-profit 3 schools that conduct online, multiple CMOs. 4 So that's not what Tani is doing here. 5 That's not what CCCS -- that's not their intentions. 6 I just spoke for you, Tani. I hope that's true. 7 MS. TANI ARNESS: And that is true. Thank 8 you, Commissioner. 9 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: So also, you know, 10 when we -- when we talk about proficiency, I'm 11 sorry. But that is something that is so irrelevant 12 for most schools, because -- I don't know how many 13 of you have seen that cartoon that shows four kids 14 lined up trying to look over the fence to watch a 15 baseball game, okay? 16 One kid is two feet tall. Another kid is 17 three feet tall. Another one is five feet tall, 18 okay? Every kid has different levels and abilities. 19 They could never be expected to achieve a -- the 20 same proficiency that is so arbitrarily determined, 21 anyway, as we discussed yesterday in our training, 22 you know. 23 So when we look at growth, that is an 24 indicator that is so much more meaningful, valuable, 25 relevant to our schools in New Mexico. The bar of</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">67</p> <p>1 online transition temporarily, for now, students 2 have been able to work. 3 They have an older population of students. 4 They do have students that come in, I think, that 5 are even over 20 years old. Is that right, Tani? 6 And they're parents also; some of the students are 7 also parents. So this does open up more opportunity 8 for them. 9 I do agree with Commissioner Burt, though. 10 I think there is a process that should be in place. 11 And I think, you know, whether it's a charter 12 amendment -- we can discuss that. But I think 13 there's a process that should be communicated and 14 put into place on how you go forward, if you decide 15 to stay completely online. 16 And I just wanted to say, to respond to 17 Commissioner Carrillo, that existing students that 18 are enrolled in a school would never be shoved out 19 if another online student wanted to enroll, because 20 they have that matriculation process. 21 I'm sure you understand that. You might 22 have just misstated that. So there is that. There 23 is the lottery process that guarantees that equity. 24 Returning students coming back would never be 25 disenrolled, just to clarify what you had said.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">69</p> <p>1 proficiency is something that is going to be, mark 2 my words, changing in the near future. 3 So I think, as Commissioners, we need to 4 be a little more broad-minded and progressive in our 5 thinking about speaking about proficiency levels, 6 especially in the narrow, narrow context of reading 7 and math. 8 That's all I have. 9 THE CHAIR: Thank you. 10 MS. TANI ARNESS: Thank you, Commissioner. 11 THE CHAIR: Sorry. So thanks. It took me 12 a couple of minutes -- more than a couple of 13 minutes -- to process all this, because, like I 14 said, your response was really surprising to me. So 15 I had a little bit of time to think about this. 16 So I'm going to ask, first off, is there 17 anyone at the building right now? 18 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yes. We have staff 19 going in at -- for different assigned times. 20 THE CHAIR: I'm sorry. You have staff 21 coming in for what? 22 MS. TANI ARNESS: We have staff going in 23 at different assigned times. 24 THE CHAIR: For? 25 MS. TANI ARNESS: It varies. We have a</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">70</p> <p>1 receptionist, a registrar, counselor, different 2 people that rotate through.</p> <p>3 THE CHAIR: Because my understand- -- part 4 of the concern I know that was brought to us was 5 there was difficulty in reaching someone because it 6 didn't appear that there was anyone there, that it 7 went automatically to a voice mail.</p> <p>8 So -- but beyond that, let's just say a 9 skeleton staff is coming to the school. The school 10 is getting lease reimbursement money for that 11 facility to provide instruction to students. So I 12 have a concern about, you know, any -- I guess a 13 question that niggles at me is, is there a fiscal 14 concern because there's lease reimbursement for this 15 instruction model that's in your contract, and 16 you're not providing that instruction there?</p> <p>17 So that does -- that worries me.</p> <p>18 Your contract does clearly say that you're 19 doing instruction at the site. So that is 20 potentially a contract violation, all right, getting 21 down to nitty-gritties.</p> <p>22 And your contract does say that you're 23 going to follow rules, regulations from PED. And 24 there's a concern that this -- not that you've -- 25 not that you've pivoted and you provided the online</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">72</p> <p>1 we're -- you know, it is. It's -- who knows what 2 someone is doing.</p> <p>3 And I know that for high school in 4 particular and for students whose families I fully 5 understand were so -- have been so negatively 6 affected by this time, some have simply said, "Hey, 7 yeah, I'm going to go to school. And I can just log 8 in, and they don't know where I am or exactly what 9 I'm doing."</p> <p>10 And I need to put out there that, you 11 know, your school's been a -- a guiding light -- 12 sorry -- for how to truly reach these challenging 13 students. You've been that point of contact for us 14 to say, you know, this is how you're doing it well. 15 Let's look at those more -- you know, as 16 Commissioner Voigt was pointing out, let's look at 17 those different ways that we can measure the success 18 of our students, especially those students that we 19 reach.</p> <p>20 And I -- and I get concerned when -- 21 because I've read all -- so many of those studies of 22 how this virtual -- even synchronous -- learning has 23 negatively impacted students, especially students 24 that have challenging social-emotional issues. 25 So that worries me. But I -- as I said</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">71</p> <p>1 instruction during this pandemic. We have all 2 agreed that there was no amendment required for 3 schools to go virtual because of the public health 4 orders, and potentially have to offer a hybrid model 5 at times because of the health concerns at the 6 school.</p> <p>7 But the clear guidance from PED was that 8 you have to move to in-person learning as much as 9 you possibly can.</p> <p>10 And the response -- I truly anticipated 11 that your response was going to be, "Yes, we haven't 12 done it, but this is the plan that we're going to 13 move to once things settle down here."</p> <p>14 I know this is tough times. We've got 15 surges. I get that. But the response was, "No, 16 we're going completely virtual forever."</p> <p>17 And that, to me, is not -- is not 18 following PED regulations and requirements.</p> <p>19 So there's -- there's that possible or 20 potential violation of the contract through that.</p> <p>21 As I stated before -- and I'll -- you 22 know, I own my biases against virtual learning. I 23 do. I put it out there.</p> <p>24 But if it has to happen, I am in complete 25 agreement it has to be synchronous. Otherwise,</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">73</p> <p>1 before, I think this goes beyond an amendment to the 2 contract. If we had a -- you know, we've had a 3 school as an example, that, you know, let's say you 4 opened up as an arts integrated school, and then you 5 said, "Hey, you know what? We had so many kids come 6 here that don't like the arts, so we're not going to 7 do that anymore. We're going to go off and we're 8 going to focus more on science and math."</p> <p>9 You can't do that. That's not what the 10 application was about. Your application was not for 11 a virtual school. So it's not just amending the ed 12 plan. You wouldn't need to amend the ed plan for 13 this year for virtual and hybrid. But to say, 14 "Going forward, we're not going to go in person any 15 longer," that's a completely different school than 16 what the Commission back -- voted on.</p> <p>17 So, you know, my recommendation is for a 18 Letter of Concern to go to the school and an 19 Intervention -- and we start the Intervention 20 Ladder, and those discussions can then go further as 21 the school response to that.</p> <p>22 Commissioner Robbins?</p> <p>23 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Well, as I said, 24 that was all the questions I had at that time. Some 25 of the things that others have brought up have</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">74</p> <p>1 raised other issues.</p> <p>2 What percentage of your students have</p> <p>3 IEPs?</p> <p>4 MS. TANI ARNESS: 24 to 25 percent.</p> <p>5 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: How many of them</p> <p>6 have physical disabilities?</p> <p>7 MS. TANI ARNESS: I don't think we have</p> <p>8 any currently.</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: So 24 percent of</p> <p>10 your students, or roughly 50 -- 45 -- 45 to 50 of</p> <p>11 your students have IEPs. That's a very high</p> <p>12 percentage. And it's very difficult to meet the</p> <p>13 needs of individuals, whether it's a learning</p> <p>14 disability or some other social-emotional reason for</p> <p>15 having that IEP, very difficult to do it remotely.</p> <p>16 You know, everyone in this Commission</p> <p>17 knows I have a disabled son. He went a year and a</p> <p>18 half without receiving in-person therapy, physical</p> <p>19 therapy, speech therapy, and such. He digressed.</p> <p>20 He's 38 years old, but he digressed.</p> <p>21 My wife and I are not professionals in</p> <p>22 this area with these, and we did the best that we</p> <p>23 can. But he digressed. My fear is that those</p> <p>24 students who have IEPs, you may think they are doing</p> <p>25 fine, but they probably are not. And without</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">76</p> <p>1 school, given that you've now come five -- almost</p> <p>2 five months into the school year without, you know,</p> <p>3 making any notification to PSFA or to the Public</p> <p>4 School Capital Outlay Council of what you're doing.</p> <p>5 That's a real concern.</p> <p>6 You talk about -- you know, you have</p> <p>7 200 students. You've only lost -- or 190 students.</p> <p>8 You've only lost about ten.</p> <p>9 One of the things we look at in terms of</p> <p>10 efficiencies and growth is cohort. How many</p> <p>11 students start, and did that group of students that</p> <p>12 start with you, do they end up?</p> <p>13 You may have 190 students. How many of</p> <p>14 those students were there last year? How many did</p> <p>15 you lose from last year this year? You could pick</p> <p>16 up -- let me -- I'll try to make it clear.</p> <p>17 You could have 190 students, but maybe</p> <p>18 only 130 students of them were the same students you</p> <p>19 had last year. And you lost 10 or 20 because of</p> <p>20 graduation. But you lost not just 10, but you've</p> <p>21 lost 30 or 40 or 50 students that didn't want to be</p> <p>22 in this, and you've picked up some students who</p> <p>23 wanted to be online.</p> <p>24 So my question is -- this is a thing</p> <p>25 that's going to have to maybe come back. Because I</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">75</p> <p>1 in-person evaluations, that is a real concern,</p> <p>2 because you're receiving additional dollars for</p> <p>3 those students that have IEPs.</p> <p>4 The other concern, because I'm on the</p> <p>5 Public School Capital Outlay Council, is the issue</p> <p>6 of lease reimbursement that Commissioner Gipson just</p> <p>7 raised. You are technically in violation of</p> <p>8 receiving those funds when you have not reopened and</p> <p>9 you have not received a waiver from PED to not be</p> <p>10 using that space.</p> <p>11 Because if -- the way PED -- or the PSCOC</p> <p>12 does lease reimbursements for charters, they don't</p> <p>13 just say, "Well, you have a building; here's your</p> <p>14 lease; this is what we pay." It's a per MEM, but</p> <p>15 it's reduced if a percentage of your space is not</p> <p>16 being used consistently for education.</p> <p>17 And so if you have literally no physical</p> <p>18 space that's being used for education, you're not</p> <p>19 allowed to receive -- you know, that might be</p> <p>20 90 percent of your lease reimbursement. Only the</p> <p>21 space -- a small amount of space for administration</p> <p>22 would be allowed.</p> <p>23 So that is a clear -- not only a</p> <p>24 violation, but it is a fiscal mismanagement which</p> <p>25 could rise to a very serious charge against the</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">77</p> <p>1 don't think you probably have these numbers. Of the</p> <p>2 students you have right now, how many of them</p> <p>3 started the year? How many did you lose over the</p> <p>4 last four months? How many did you lose -- other</p> <p>5 than graduation, how many did you lose from last</p> <p>6 year to this year?</p> <p>7 I mean, those are real important questions</p> <p>8 and issues that, going to this pure virtual model,</p> <p>9 is an issue.</p> <p>10 And I'll second the views of the</p> <p>11 Commissioners. Giving the teacher and the student</p> <p>12 the ability to determine if they're going to have</p> <p>13 face time or not, turn the cameras off and things</p> <p>14 like that, if you don't have the proper tools to</p> <p>15 measure and actually observe that the student is</p> <p>16 physically present, as Commissioner Burt even talked</p> <p>17 about, how do you know they're not just on their</p> <p>18 phone and they're out -- they could be anywhere</p> <p>19 doing anything and have their phone and just be</p> <p>20 listening with earbuds or whatever. And if their</p> <p>21 name is called, oh, yeah, they do this.</p> <p>22 I mean, I have -- my oldest son is gifted</p> <p>23 intellectually. He probably could have taken the</p> <p>24 GED his second year in high school and passed. He</p> <p>25 graduated high school with a C average, even though</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">78</p> <p>1 he was gifted in math, and he got C's in math. 2 But he was gifted in math. And so I'm 3 sitting there thinking, you know, grades don't 4 necessarily tell you everything. 5 But, you know, the concern I have is some 6 of the information that you've gathered to talk with 7 us today has been lacking. And I think, you know, I 8 agree with Chair Gipson that a Letter of Concern to 9 start the Intervention Ladder needs to go forward. 10 You really need to seriously consider 11 getting kids back in the classroom. 12 We need information of the number of cases 13 of COVID and everything, if that has caused you to 14 go that -- you indicated -- what I've heard right 15 now is COVID has not been the leading reason to go 16 remote. But if that is an issue, then I think we 17 need to have that information to know. And PED 18 should have that information also. 19 And then you have to have a plan to get 20 back into the classroom. Because, again, as 21 Commissioner Carrillo and others have stated -- 22 Commissioner Taylor -- in-person education is so 23 important, and students are losing that 24 social-emotional connection. And high school 25 students, especially, they're going to go to</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">80</p> <p>1 The following violations of the contract 2 should be identified in the letter of intervention: 3 Failure to follow directives of the Public 4 Education Department regarding instruction during 5 COVID, as shown in the January 4th, 2022, memorandum 6 provided to all superintendents and charter 7 directors, Document 8.A PED Memo on Remote 8 Instruction, as required in Section 8X of the 9 contract. 10 2. Failure to provide instruction at the 11 school site, pursuant to Section 11 of the contract. 12 3. Possible fiscal violation regarding 13 acceptance of funds for the building as an 14 educational facility if the facility is not used as 15 such. 16 And, 4. Failure to propose an amendment 17 to these sections as required in Section 62 and 18 violating the contract by implementing the amendment 19 without an approved amendment. 20 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Second. 21 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Second. 22 THE CHAIR: There's a motion by 23 Commissioner Gipson, a second by Commissioner 24 Taylor. 25 Commissioner Voigt?</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">79</p> <p>1 college; they're going to go into the workforce. 2 They need to know how to deal with others 3 in a -- in a positive way, to where, you know, if 4 they have aggressive behaviors, they need to be 5 dealt with. If they have disabilities to 6 communicate, those need to be dealt with and 7 everything. Otherwise, they get into the real world 8 when they graduate and they're going to struggle 9 from then on. 10 And I'll leave it at that. But, you know, 11 we need to have some of this information, because, 12 you know, we can't sit there and say, you know, we 13 have 25 percent, 24 percent of our students have 14 IEPs, and we really aren't sure if their needs are 15 being truly met and their physical and emotional 16 needs are truly being met, because we can't see 17 them. 18 Thanks. 19 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you. 20 Commissioners, I'd like to make a motion. 21 So I move that the Chair of the Public 22 Education Commission issue a Letter of Concern, 23 pursuant to the Intervention Ladder, to Cesar Chavez 24 Community School considering their statements that 25 they are intending to provide online education only.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">81</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you. 2 THE CHAIR: And then Comm- -- 3 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: So I just wanted to 4 ask Tani. Do you have a Plan B? Or did you have 5 something on the back burner that you could bring 6 forward in light of this meeting? 7 Given that, is there anything that you 8 wanted to respond to as far as this motion? 9 THE CHAIR: Okay. I'm going to -- I'm 10 just going to ask -- because there's a motion on the 11 table, my understanding is the only people that can 12 speak -- 13 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Okay. 14 THE CHAIR: -- when a motion is there are 15 people who can vote. 16 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Okay. Then I'll just 17 say, Tani, you should have a Plan B. And, 18 hopefully, you will in light of this conversation 19 from the Commission that -- you know, and I think, 20 hopefully, it's a possibility that you don't want to 21 go exclusively online forever, because "forever" is 22 a big word, given how we know, as educators and 23 administrators, how education is always, always 24 evolving with -- with politics, with the weather, 25 with -- it can be anything.</p>

82	<p>1 But it will always be evolving. We know 2 that. So, hopefully, there won't be a really 3 definitive decision on your part that's going to 4 lock you, you know, into something that you wish you 5 wouldn't have done before. So that's all.</p> <p>6 THE CHAIR: Thanks. 7 Commissioner Carrillo.</p> <p>8 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Thank you. I 9 don't have the -- I'm sorry -- the steps of the 10 Intervention Ladder in front of me. I know the 11 first step is, of course, what you just mentioned in 12 your motion, the Letter of Concern. And I'm 13 wondering if you wouldn't remind us what the -- what 14 the subsequent steps are relative to our ability to 15 skip the Letter of Concern and jump to another step.</p> <p>16 And the reason I say that is, you know, 17 this isn't just not getting back to us because of 18 your enrollment cap being violated or whatever. I 19 see this as being far more serious. I just do.</p> <p>20 And so, Ms. Gipson -- or Commissioner -- 21 could you reinform us on that, please?</p> <p>22 THE CHAIR: Sure. Normally, if you had a 23 Letter of Concern, the school would then have the 24 opportunity to respond back to us. They'd come to 25 the next meeting and offer their response. We'd</p>	84	<p>1 situation is such that you skip to the top of the 2 ladder and you get the Notice of Rev- -- so the 3 Commission would then have to vote to hold a 4 revocation hearing.</p> <p>5 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: So then I would 6 ask -- I'm not asking for an amendment to the 7 motion. But I just think I'd love to hear more 8 discussion on the point I'm bringing up. Because so 9 many of us did say this is a breach.</p> <p>10 I mean, my feeling is you all need to come 11 back to class on Monday -- oh. Today's Friday. Or 12 maybe the Monday following. And that's what you 13 need to do to be in compliance. And if you want to 14 change the terms of your contract or offer an 15 amendment or something later, you can all go ahead 16 and do so. But that would be my thought on this at 17 this point.</p> <p>18 THE CHAIR: And I would add -- or 19 answer -- that I would be -- I am open to amending 20 my motion to make it a Notice of Breach.</p> <p>21 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Sorry. What I 22 would ask is that I would offer a friendly amendment 23 that you change the notice to a Notice of Breach, 24 and I would see if there is a second for that for 25 the purpose of discussion.</p>
83	<p>1 have a discussion and make a determination at that 2 point if they -- if they were successful in 3 responding.</p> <p>4 If not, they would then go to a 5 notification of a breach.</p> <p>6 So the notification of a breach is that, 7 you know, we think it's so serious that we believe 8 that you now are breaching your contract with us.</p> <p>9 And the same thing would then happen with 10 the Notice of Breach. They would have the 11 opportunity to respond to it. If the Commission at 12 that point listened to the school's -- heard the 13 school's response and wasn't satisfied, then it goes 14 to a Notice of Revocation.</p> <p>15 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Okay. So I'm 16 wanting to see that I heard correctly, I mean, 17 because -- because a number of us did mention that 18 this is a breach. This is not what the contract is. 19 This is not what the mission was. You know, what is 20 our ability to skip right to that step?</p> <p>21 THE CHAIR: It's -- sorry, I thought you 22 were done.</p> <p>23 It's there. Because there is a clause 24 that says the Commission has, always, that 25 opportunity, if they feel the offense -- the</p>	85	<p>1 THE CHAIR: Okay. 2 Commissioner Robbins, I know your hand is 3 up.</p> <p>4 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes. I would go 5 along with Commissioner Carrillo, because I do 6 believe there have been -- based upon the sections 7 you identified in the contract, there have been 8 several areas of the contract that I believe the 9 school is in breach of. And so I would very much 10 like the motion to be amended that a letter of 11 notice of breach be issued.</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: You would second 13 my friendly amendment.</p> <p>14 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: I would. Thank 15 you.</p> <p>16 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Procedurally, that 17 has to happen. Okay.</p> <p>18 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes.</p> <p>19 THE CHAIR: Okay. Glenna and Julia and 20 then Mike.</p> <p>21 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Okay. Thank you. 22 The reason I don't think this should go 23 straight to breach is because this is the first time 24 that we have heard from the school. In all 25 fairness, I think a Letter of Concern would be</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">86</p> <p>1 sequential, with the opportunity for the school to 2 process and then come back.</p> <p>3 I think that we do not need this to be a 4 shaming, punitive meeting for the school. And in 5 all fairness, give the school the opportunity to 6 work within our request, which has been heard by the 7 school for the first time as of now, and give them 8 the Letter of Concern, being that this is all new 9 information for us and for the school. So in all 10 fairness. Thanks.</p> <p>11 MS. JULIA BARNES: Members of the 12 Commission, I just wanted to highlight for you that 13 the school's contract contains the Intervention 14 Ladder. And for either thing that you are looking 15 at, we would issue the Notice of Concern, provide 16 them with at least ten days' notice, provided we 17 provide the letter sooner, and then notice it at the 18 next PEC meeting.</p> <p>19 So the Notice of Concern or a Notice of 20 Breach would go to the school. They would have ten 21 days' notice before your next meeting. And then you 22 would take action on that letter at the next 23 meeting.</p> <p>24 So just trying to clear up procedure so 25 that we have it clearly, that the school contract is</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">88</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER BURT: Thank you, Chair. So 2 I'm a little -- I don't know who to ask this 3 question to, because I don't know if Director Chavez 4 can answer it right now in the middle of a motion.</p> <p>5 Maybe Julia knows or maybe -- Chair 6 Gipson, maybe you know.</p> <p>7 But is this actually the first time that 8 this school has been aware that they should be going 9 back in person? Like, is this the first 10 conversation that has happened saying, "Hey, we 11 believe you should be going back"?</p> <p>12 THE CHAIR: No. It is not the first 13 conversation. The Director has repeatedly reached 14 out to the school. And the guidance has -- you 15 know, through the Secretary --</p> <p>16 COMMISSIONER BURT: Right. PED guidance 17 yes, but, I mean, just, like, from -- I guess from 18 CSD or from --</p> <p>19 THE CHAIR: No. No.</p> <p>20 COMMISSIONER BURT: So that has been -- so 21 that's where, I guess, I -- at first, I was 22 thinking, you know, a Letter of Concern would be 23 enough to get them to start moving on the process 24 of -- of -- you know, reckoning these things and 25 figuring out how to follow the correct process. And</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">87</p> <p>1 online, as are all school contracts. It's Pa- -- 2 it's kind of deep in the document. It says Page 7. 3 I believe it to be Page 25 of 34.</p> <p>4 THE CHAIR: Julia, are you looking for 5 people to look at -- okay, Mike. Commissioner 6 Taylor?</p> <p>7 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Yeah. Yeah. Thank 8 you.</p> <p>9 I completely 100 percent agree with 10 Commissioner Voigt. You know, our -- there are 11 young people in the midst of their education. And 12 our intent is not to create havoc and chaos for 13 them. They need time to respond to the -- the 14 concerns that we have.</p> <p>15 And I say, you know, a Letter of Concern 16 initially. Give them time to get their processes in 17 order and get kids back, you know, scheduled and -- 18 there's a lot -- there's a lot that goes into that. 19 It's not a matter of saying, "Come back to school in 20 two weeks or a week and a half," you know.</p> <p>21 So I -- I completely agree, Commissioner 22 Voigt. And I would not vote for a Letter of Breach 23 at this point. I would vote for a Letter of Concern 24 for sure. But thank you.</p> <p>25 THE CHAIR: Thanks. Commissioner Burt?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">89</p> <p>1 if they want to simultaneously, on, like, a parallel 2 path, look at what it looks like to go to an online 3 school, then that could work.</p> <p>4 At first, I was okay with a Letter of 5 Concern. But I do -- I mean, we are not brand new 6 into this pandemic. This has been going on for 7 quite some time now. In Albuquerque, schools have 8 gone back in person for some time now. So if we 9 look at the community that this school is in, there 10 has been in-person learning for some time now.</p> <p>11 So I do believe -- because this is not the 12 first time -- I understand the idea that this is the 13 first time the school has spoken to us as a 14 Commission. But this is not the first instance in 15 which this has been -- I mean, this could have been 16 rectified before today. That's how I kind of see 17 it.</p> <p>18 And so because it was not rectified before 19 today, I would say that I would be supportive of the 20 Letter of Breach, just to move the process faster.</p> <p>21 They still -- I believe they still have 22 that response time. But I believe this needs to be 23 rectified very quickly and not taken that extra 24 month that I think a Letter of Concern would 25 ultimately allow.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">90</p> <p>1 THE CHAIR: Thanks. And, you know, I have 2 less of a concern about, oh, they need a plan to 3 come back in, because they were directed. The 4 guidance from back at the start of this current 5 school year was to submit a plan for how you're 6 going to go back to live instruction, to in-person 7 learning, whatever you want to say it. So that plan 8 has to be in effect.</p> <p>9 So I don't think there should be that, oh, 10 now they have to figure this all out. They were 11 asked by PED to figure that all out, you know, a 12 year and a half ago. They had to provide the plan 13 to PED on virtual learning.</p> <p>14 And then as we moved through last spring 15 and early summer, PED provided the guidance that, 16 "You now need to submit the plan."</p> <p>17 And I can remember reports from the 18 Director and so on about how the school -- what the 19 schools are doing and dividing up and looking at all 20 of these plans.</p> <p>21 So this isn't a, "Oh, now we have to 22 figure this out." That should have been figured out 23 last summer on "how we're going to come back in 24 person."</p> <p>25 So, you know, it's -- this is -- this is</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">92</p> <p>1 and do the right thing.</p> <p>2 The -- I think the Letter of Breach does 3 that also. What I think the Letter of Breach does 4 more than anything is it expresses the seriousness 5 of the violation. And now, especially, having 6 heard -- that I was not aware of -- but having heard 7 of those efforts that were made last semester for 8 you to get back to in person and that they were 9 ignored, that, to me, even underscores the 10 seriousness and necessity for a Letter of Breach.</p> <p>11 The Letter of Breach does not preclude you 12 from just honestly bringing your kids back a week 13 from Monday. You could totally do that. You know 14 how to run a school. It's clear. You're just 15 letting kids and parents know, "Hey, we're coming 16 back a week from Monday," and then all of this goes 17 away.</p> <p>18 But I think the breach is necessary here. 19 You know -- yeah. There's a point at which I'm 20 having a memory of -- of a parent. When I had to 21 take my son's car away, it was the most egregious 22 thing that he could think of, because the violation 23 was so serious in terms of his schooling, in terms 24 of his lying to me and his mother, not being in 25 class, going skiing, just all of this.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">91</p> <p>1 serious. Like I said, you know, the concern's been 2 raised. The concern was raised once again to the 3 level that it was going to come to the Commission.</p> <p>4 And the -- you know, the response -- very 5 surprisingly to me. I mean, it did -- it threw me 6 off guard that, "No, we're not going to do this." 7 So that's where I think that the Letter of Breach is 8 warranted.</p> <p>9 And, you know, we've had schools go to 10 revocation hearings without ever coming before us, 11 that the situation was so serious it was presented 12 to us. And it's like we went immediately to -- so I 13 guess we created the Intervention Ladder to try to 14 be as fair as possible.</p> <p>15 But there are always those situations that 16 are presented to us that you -- time is important in 17 terms of responding and acting, because we're -- 18 what? Three quarters -- almost -- we're more than 19 halfway through the school year.</p> <p>20 Commissioner Carrillo.</p> <p>21 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Thank you. So I 22 want to express that I have -- that I've taken to 23 heart what Commissioner Taylor -- Commissioners 24 Taylor and Voigt have said around how this affects 25 the kids and giving people opportunities to step up</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">93</p> <p>1 It was so egregious. It was just like, 2 "Buddy, you're losing your truck for two weeks. 3 There's no two ways about it. You know what you 4 did, and then you're going to get your truck back." 5 This just, to me, recalls that. And there 6 you have it, for now, anyway.</p> <p>7 THE CHAIR: And, Tani, I'm sorry. But the 8 only people that can speak are -- because there's a 9 motion on the table, the only people that can speak 10 are those that can vote.</p> <p>11 So if there's no further discussion -- 12 Commissioner Burt, please, roll.</p> <p>13 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Would you read the 14 motion again, please?</p> <p>15 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: That's what I wanted 16 also.</p> <p>17 THE CHAIR: Sure. Let me go back and get 18 it. Oh, yeah. Sorry.</p> <p>19 And this is -- this motion -- this 20 includes the friendly amendment language.</p> <p>21 I move that the Chair of the Public 22 Education Commission issue a Letter of Breach, 23 pursuant to the Intervention Ladder, to Cesar Chavez 24 Community School considering their statements that 25 they are providing and intend to continue to provide</p>

94	<p>1 online education only.</p> <p>2 The following violations of the contract</p> <p>3 should be identified in the Letter of Concern:</p> <p>4 1. Failure to follow directives of the</p> <p>5 Public Education Department regarding instruction</p> <p>6 during COVID, as shown in the January 4th, 2022,</p> <p>7 memorandum provided to all superintendents and</p> <p>8 charter directors, Documents 08.A PED Memo on Remote</p> <p>9 Instruction, as required in Section 8X.</p> <p>10 2. Failure to provide instruction at the</p> <p>11 school site pursuant to Section 11 of the contract.</p> <p>12 3. Possible fiscal violation regarding</p> <p>13 acceptance of funds for the building as an education</p> <p>14 facility if the facility is not used as such.</p> <p>15 4. Failure to propose an amendment to</p> <p>16 these sections, as required in Section 62, and</p> <p>17 violating the contract by implementing the amendment</p> <p>18 without an approved amendment.</p> <p>19 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: I'm sorry. But you</p> <p>20 said "Letter of Breach" in the beginning, and then,</p> <p>21 later on, you said "Letter of Concern" when you</p> <p>22 were --</p> <p>23 THE CHAIR: Oh, I'm sorry. I did --</p> <p>24 MS. JULIA BARNES: Chair. It's no --</p> <p>25 THE CHAIR: -- because that was in the</p>	96	<p>1 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Manis.</p> <p>2 (No response.)</p> <p>3 COMMISSIONER BURT: I'll come back to him.</p> <p>4 He may not be present. I'll come back.</p> <p>5 Commissioner Chavez.</p> <p>6 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes.</p> <p>7 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Gipson.</p> <p>8 THE CHAIR: Yes.</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Davis.</p> <p>10 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Yes.</p> <p>11 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Manis.</p> <p>12 (No response.)</p> <p>13 COMMISSIONER BURT: All right.</p> <p>14 Commissioner Manis is not present.</p> <p>15 So that motion passes, six to three.</p> <p>16 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you very much.</p> <p>17 And, Tani, thank you -- truly, thank you for your</p> <p>18 time today and expressing how you're trying to serve</p> <p>19 the students. We really do appreciate that. And</p> <p>20 you'll be receiving a letter. So thank you so much.</p> <p>21 Commissioners, can I ask for a ten-minute</p> <p>22 break? Thanks.</p> <p>23 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes.</p> <p>24 (Recess taken, 10:58 a.m. to 11:11 a.m.)</p> <p>25 THE CHAIR: So we are on to Item No. 9,</p>
95	<p>1 original motion. So it is a Letter of Breach. So I</p> <p>2 apologize.</p> <p>3 The following violations of the contract</p> <p>4 should be identified in the Letter of Breach.</p> <p>5 MS. JULIA BARNES: Chair, it's a Notice of</p> <p>6 Breach.</p> <p>7 THE CHAIR: Notice of Breach. I'm sorry.</p> <p>8 Okay.</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: And I believe I</p> <p>10 seconded it, but I'll second it with that change.</p> <p>11 THE CHAIR: Yes. Okay.</p> <p>12 If there's no further discussion,</p> <p>13 Commissioner Burt.</p> <p>14 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Voigt.</p> <p>15 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: No.</p> <p>16 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Armijo.</p> <p>17 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: No.</p> <p>18 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Taylor.</p> <p>19 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: No.</p> <p>20 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Burt,</p> <p>21 yes.</p> <p>22 Commissioner Robbins.</p> <p>23 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes.</p> <p>24 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Carrillo.</p> <p>25 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Yes.</p>	97	<p>1 which is Discussion and Possible Action on the New</p> <p>2 Charter Application Kit.</p> <p>3 The kit we did go through last month and</p> <p>4 made changes. And it was, I think, tough to some</p> <p>5 degree, because we had the renewals. And, you know,</p> <p>6 even though I had looked at the kit beforehand, I</p> <p>7 thought about it again, and there was a piece of it</p> <p>8 that I thought I might ask for a change to. And</p> <p>9 then I sort of hesitated.</p> <p>10 But then we had the training yesterday.</p> <p>11 And I so clearly listened to that focus on the</p> <p>12 individual and how you're impacting your community</p> <p>13 and how the school is truly serving the community</p> <p>14 and that how there's not just one right way and</p> <p>15 wrong way and one data point and so on.</p> <p>16 And I went back and I looked at the new</p> <p>17 application kit. And it's always been a challenging</p> <p>18 piece of the kit, anyway. And that's in the Part C</p> <p>19 application in the No. 1, the Academic Framework.</p> <p>20 And Letter B is the Mission-Specific or Student</p> <p>21 Performance Indicators.</p> <p>22 And, you know, the statute requires that</p> <p>23 we incorporate into the performance framework the</p> <p>24 academic performance framework elements that are</p> <p>25 identified in the statute, which did, at one point,</p>

98

1 cover -- was covered in the report card. And now
 2 that PED is pivoting a little bit and using the
 3 short cycle assessments, which I think everyone
 4 thinks is a step in the right direction, there's --
 5 there's going to be the report in some fashion on
 6 the New Mexico Vistas on the short cycle assessment
 7 data. That's going to be there.
 8 We have been moving towards focusing more
 9 on mission-specific and the assurance that the
 10 school is -- is providing the -- the programming
 11 that they promised in their mission and how do they
 12 do it.
 13 And when the new applicants do these
 14 applications, all too often, they fall back on a
 15 short cycle assessment for this piece of the
 16 application, because that's the easiest thing to do.
 17 They don't have to think about, "Oh, how are we
 18 really going to serve the students and show that --
 19 not only the Commission, but the community -- that
 20 we are accomplishing that -- that mission?"
 21 And I think, for me, it would be best in
 22 that new application to remove that "or student
 23 performance indicator," because we're going to have
 24 that student performance indicator in the State
 25 Accountability System, plain and simple. We're not

99

1 disregarding it.
 2 But to focus and to -- I think for me, in
 3 this new application kit in particular, this focuses
 4 the applicants to have to think about that mission,
 5 how they're going to show that they are successful
 6 in that, not only -- once again, not only to us, but
 7 how they're serving their community and how they're
 8 showing their community they're serving it, and to
 9 think about that and to really look at it and not
 10 take the easy way out and say, "Here's a reading and
 11 math goal. There." Boom.
 12 Because to me, it doesn't show me, as the
 13 reader of the application, that they truly
 14 understand what their mission is. If they contrast
 15 that goal, it shows me better how they understand
 16 their mission. So that would be my only potential
 17 change is to take out that "or."
 18 Commissioner Voigt?
 19 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you. I agree
 20 that we should remove that, because also there is
 21 change coming down the chutes. I know PED is
 22 looking at capstones for graduation as an
 23 alternative. There's going to be the allowance of
 24 capstone electives coming into play. Work-based
 25 learning is coming in. We have internships. A lot

100

1 of students are getting paid and getting credit for
 2 internships already.
 3 So I think mission definitely outweighs
 4 and is amongst a lot of the schools' academic
 5 performance already.
 6 Short cycle assessments are a constant.
 7 You know, those are already in place, every school
 8 in the state. Every public school in the state is
 9 administering short cycle assessments, which measure
 10 growth over time and set proficiency goals based on
 11 growth, not an arbitrary bar.
 12 So I think that's definitely the way to
 13 go. I agree with that.
 14 THE CHAIR: Thanks. Commissioner Burt?
 15 COMMISSIONER BURT: Thanks. I definitely
 16 hear you, because I understand that. And I have
 17 actually -- like, in seeing kind of how some of the
 18 schools that have transitioned into a mission
 19 statement, how it kind of is different, it makes
 20 sense.
 21 The one thing I'll bring up, though, is
 22 that I think it would be okay to stay -- and this is
 23 why. Just to leave more options for schools who
 24 their mission is college readiness, or it is, like,
 25 a very academic-focused mission, it would allow them

101

1 to continue that.
 2 But I think -- I think what would better
 3 solve it is that we, as a Commission, and even CSD,
 4 as they're providing guidance to folks, really talk
 5 to them about, "If your mission is not academic --
 6 it's not necessarily, like, college-based, you know,
 7 focused, or that's not -- there's, like, these
 8 additional layers to your school, don't pick the
 9 short cycle assessment for your mission," that, you
 10 know, to kind of guide those schools away from that.
 11 But there -- I would say leave it open for
 12 some schools who that might be the best way to show
 13 their particular mission.
 14 So I would say maybe leave the openness,
 15 but maybe we need to just get more -- more concern
 16 with, like, not approving those ones that where they
 17 do that and we get that attitude of, like, "Oh,
 18 we'll just do it because we're already doing it,"
 19 and it's not thoughtful toward their mission
 20 specifically.
 21 So I would say leave more freedom in
 22 there, more leverage, but let's -- as a Commission
 23 and then CSD, let's bring it tighter when it comes
 24 down to it.
 25 THE CHAIR: Okay. All right.

<p style="text-align: right;">102</p> <p>1 Director?</p> <p>2 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: I hope that what</p> <p>3 we get from applicants is some (incomprehensible)</p> <p>4 means of assessing the school is implementing their</p> <p>5 mission and want the Commission to know that plans</p> <p>6 are moving forward that we have facilitated</p> <p>7 discussions around goal setting before contract</p> <p>8 renewals, and certainly before these applications</p> <p>9 come in, because I do think that being able to</p> <p>10 assess the school's mission is really important, I</p> <p>11 think. Whether you've removed that language or not,</p> <p>12 I think we can still achieve that goal.</p> <p>13 One of the things I wanted to make sure</p> <p>14 every Commissioner is aware of right now is that</p> <p>15 this month, we worked really hard to put up all of</p> <p>16 the materials for this meeting, both on the PEC</p> <p>17 webpage for the meetings for 2022 and in the Google</p> <p>18 Drive. So if any Commissioner cannot find the</p> <p>19 documents that we are referring to, I just want to</p> <p>20 make sure that you know where they're at.</p> <p>21 And so those are the two options. And I</p> <p>22 believe Bev Friedman sent an e-mail out to</p> <p>23 everybody. If not, let us know. I want to make</p> <p>24 sure you are looking at the source documents</p> <p>25 themselves. I think that you might have said Part</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">104</p> <p>1 So I'm looking forward to the day -- and</p> <p>2 maybe I'll just start a charter school -- that is</p> <p>3 totally out of the box -- and, you know, something</p> <p>4 that has measurable goals and -- but, anyway -- but</p> <p>5 thanks for mentioning that, because there are</p> <p>6 schools that still do provide rigorous academics and</p> <p>7 do have that written in their mission goals.</p> <p>8 THE CHAIR: Now -- and, you know, I just</p> <p>9 want to say that, for me, leaving that off, if a</p> <p>10 school was college-ready, that would be their</p> <p>11 mission goal. So it -- it would be. So it wouldn't</p> <p>12 have to be the "or the academic performance,"</p> <p>13 because that is their -- absolutely, that fulfills</p> <p>14 that mission.</p> <p>15 But it's for those other schools, the</p> <p>16 fallback is all too often, ah, this is easier</p> <p>17 because they can find it someplace, and it doesn't</p> <p>18 engage the conversation. Although there are</p> <p>19 certainly out-of-the-box mission goals that a</p> <p>20 college preparedness school could create. But it</p> <p>21 wouldn't limit them. Because they've got this in</p> <p>22 their mission, it would align completely.</p> <p>23 But I agree. But we all -- we also know</p> <p>24 how often we hear from Missy, in particular, because</p> <p>25 she does the training, "I've told them, I've told</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">103</p> <p>1 B. So what we're looking at actually is in Part C.</p> <p>2 And it would be on Page 4.</p> <p>3 THE CHAIR: No. I said Part C. But it's</p> <p>4 in Section -- it's Part C application, but it's 1B.</p> <p>5 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: Okay. Thank you.</p> <p>6 THE CHAIR: In there. Yeah. Yeah.</p> <p>7 Commissioner Voigt?</p> <p>8 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thanks. Yeah, just</p> <p>9 to respond to Commissioner Burt, I think a lot of</p> <p>10 schools do incorporate -- you know, they do already,</p> <p>11 still, and don't want to let go of the math and</p> <p>12 reading goals, which is fine. They have that</p> <p>13 freedom and flexibility to do so.</p> <p>14 I think, as you mentioned in the dialogue</p> <p>15 and collaboration between the CSD and the schools,</p> <p>16 that guidance is really necessary. And I know the</p> <p>17 CSD is providing that. Some schools really -- you</p> <p>18 know, they're letting go of this fear more now over</p> <p>19 the years than they had before, but are still kind</p> <p>20 of hesitant to have a real out-of-the-box, creative</p> <p>21 mission goal.</p> <p>22 But, hopefully, that will change. And I</p> <p>23 think that's -- as incubators of innovation, that's</p> <p>24 what charter schools have the liberty to do, and the</p> <p>25 autonomy.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">105</p> <p>1 them, I've told them in training," but this is</p> <p>2 what -- you know, lands on the desk finally.</p> <p>3 So I'm just putting it out there.</p> <p>4 Commissioner Robbins?</p> <p>5 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Thank you. You</p> <p>6 know, I -- I have mixed feelings about taking out,</p> <p>7 you know, the academic -- I'm not opposed to</p> <p>8 removing it. But I want schools, not just charter</p> <p>9 schools, but all of our schools. You know,</p> <p>10 New Mexico is going through this transition of</p> <p>11 adjusting success in terms of education in our</p> <p>12 public schools.</p> <p>13 And one of the international measures is</p> <p>14 the PISA. And the United States has fallen so far</p> <p>15 behind international -- you know, our counterparts</p> <p>16 in terms of student performance. And we talk about</p> <p>17 preparing students to go into the workplace.</p> <p>18 And one thing that they have to realize,</p> <p>19 their workplace is not -- and their competitors in</p> <p>20 finding jobs is not the person who lives next door</p> <p>21 to them. It's the person who lives in Germany or</p> <p>22 South America, Brazil, or somewhere -- maybe</p> <p>23 India -- that's competing with them for those jobs.</p> <p>24 And if those individuals have better</p> <p>25 academic and school readiness, you know, we're</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">106</p> <p>1 basically going to say, well, "Yes, you can find a 2 job, but it's going to pay a lot less than what you 3 could have had had education been more rigorous." 4 And my fear is we're lowering standards to 5 such a degree in New Mexico that we will continue to 6 be 50th in the country in terms of our educational 7 performance, and we -- this country will fall from 8 its 26th position internationally in education. 9 It'll fall down. 10 I mean, we have places like Bosnia and 11 things that I believe they're actually, in some 12 cases, scoring better than our students. And this 13 is a place that 15, 20 years ago was in civil war; 14 and yet their students are actually doing better 15 because they have placed a value on educating their 16 students, and the individuals themselves have placed 17 such a high value. 18 And, yes, we will always have a portion of 19 our students that do well. My concern is that we're 20 going to leave half of our students behind if we 21 lower standards. 22 So taking it out of the kit is fine. But 23 I think it needs to be reinforced that the purpose 24 of education is not just so that they can get any 25 job, but so that they can advance, so that they can</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">108</p> <p>1 overseas job. 2 So I hear you. But I think, you know, 3 technology, STEAM, STEM, all of those things are 4 things that a lot of our charter schools have within 5 their mission goals. And so -- and I just have to 6 say -- and I hope all -- I think most of you know 7 this -- I really -- I start grating my teeth when 8 people start talking about 50th in the country and 9 26th in the world, because our communities are 10 stronger than what is reflected in mainstream media. 11 And when you look at our communities and 12 the strengths and assets that they bring to the 13 table, that is what should be informing education, 14 and disrupting the whole process of what school is 15 and let the learning come from our communities and 16 inform the schools of what should be the outcomes 17 for students. 18 THE CHAIR: Thanks. And I just want to -- 19 my intention here was not to water down anything, 20 because deeply rooted in that application is a 21 section, continued sections, on What is your testing 22 plan? How are you servicing students? 23 And in the Performance Framework, the 24 short cycle assessments for every school will have 25 to be incorporated, because that's part of the</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">107</p> <p>1 provide well for their family, so they're not on 2 public rolls for welfare or for food assistance and 3 things like that; but they can actually grow, not 4 only intellectually, but they can grow in their 5 ability to provide for their family and contribute 6 positively to society. 7 Thanks. 8 THE CHAIR: Thanks. Commissioner Voigt? 9 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you. And 10 thanks, Commissioner Robbins. I hear you. You 11 know, I think also, it's the "what." Because the 12 United States was -- was slow to get on to the STEM 13 bandwagon. And India, China, all the Asian 14 countries, they were on that well before we were. 15 But I just wanted to mention that if you 16 look at the international school network, ISS.edu, 17 international schools, all of those schools, they're 18 modeling after a U.S. curriculum. But what they are 19 also doing is they're bringing in Montessori, 20 International Baccalaureate. 21 And this is prevalent all through the 22 schools within ISS.edu, International School 23 Services, that is like a -- a chartering 24 authority -- worldwide. There are some great 25 schools there, by the way, if you ever want an</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">109</p> <p>1 statute for us to incorporate those elements from, 2 now, New Mexico Vistas, so that it's not -- it's not 3 watering down anything or lowering our expectations. 4 I think it -- to me, it increases our 5 expectation that the governance council and these 6 founders understand what their mission is, and they 7 can -- they can identify it through that goal, which 8 often does not get reflected in just a math and 9 reading goal. 10 And I'm not trying to diminish math and 11 reading goals. So that was my only -- but I'm -- 12 you know, I just wanted to bring it up. I didn't -- 13 I'm fine with it staying there if folks don't want 14 to remove it. 15 I just -- you know, it frustrates me every 16 time I read an application that that's what ends up 17 being there and not a mission goal, for the most 18 part, you know. So that's why I brought it up. 19 But, you know, I'm fine with leaving it there, if 20 that's the will of the group. 21 Okay. So we are on to -- I need to go 22 back very quickly to No. 5, PEC Election of 23 Officers, just so Julia can communicate the results. 24 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: And Bekka had her 25 hand up a second ago.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">110</p> <p>1 THE CHAIR: I don't see it now.</p> <p>2 COMMISSIONER BURT: I'll be really as</p> <p>3 fast -- the only thing I was going to say is I agree</p> <p>4 with you, Patti, that I -- like I said, I do think</p> <p>5 we can leave it. But I agree with the concern of,</p> <p>6 like, if you are an arts-focused school and then</p> <p>7 you're using short cycle assessments, then that</p> <p>8 doesn't match up.</p> <p>9 So I think that's -- that is an issue that</p> <p>10 we should, like, have that conversation with CSD,</p> <p>11 and, like, let's integrate that a little deeper.</p> <p>12 And then, once again as we go through it and we get</p> <p>13 to contract negotiations, then let's really be</p> <p>14 adamant as a Commission that those are not going to</p> <p>15 fly, you know.</p> <p>16 So I would be okay with leaving it, with</p> <p>17 the caveat that that's something we're going to look</p> <p>18 at deeper in the future.</p> <p>19 THE CHAIR: Right. And thanks for that.</p> <p>20 And I'll also say that I think what truly needs to</p> <p>21 be communicated to me more is to those that are</p> <p>22 scoring the rubric, that they don't just say, "Hey,"</p> <p>23 you know, "Oh, you're that arts school. You gave us</p> <p>24 a math and reading goal. You -- you met that," that</p> <p>25 that's not it, that those that are reading and say,</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">112</p> <p>1 application because I don't think -- as one element,</p> <p>2 you didn't adequately give me a mission goal," their</p> <p>3 response is, "Hey, I didn't have to. There's an</p> <p>4 'or' there."</p> <p>5 And the same thing to the scorer -- the</p> <p>6 independent readers, that they score it fully. And</p> <p>7 they have to, because they got the math and reading</p> <p>8 goal, and it was an "or."</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER BURT: So I'm confused why</p> <p>10 they have to score it -- like, that's -- what's the</p> <p>11 point of a rubric if there's not multiple levels and</p> <p>12 if you're not scoring it -- what are -- just for</p> <p>13 having it? That doesn't make sense.</p> <p>14 So, I mean, appropriateness and what</p> <p>15 they're doing it based off of seems to be, like,</p> <p>16 something -- if you put "as appropriate" or -- you</p> <p>17 know, then you can score it in different levels.</p> <p>18 THE CHAIR: It becomes very subjective for</p> <p>19 someone to say it was appropriate.</p> <p>20 COMMISSIONER BURT: Then we can talk about</p> <p>21 that with the whole application. That's the entire</p> <p>22 application, then, is --</p> <p>23 THE CHAIR: I would respectfully disagree</p> <p>24 on that. If you say "as appropriate," that then</p> <p>25 leaves it to the independent scorer -- or the</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">111</p> <p>1 "Wait a minute, they're not addressing" -- but the</p> <p>2 problem is it says "or."</p> <p>3 So that's why it doesn't -- there -- if we</p> <p>4 address it at the community input hearing, their</p> <p>5 response easily can be, "But it was an 'or,' so I</p> <p>6 did the 'or.'" So that's -- you know, that's why I</p> <p>7 cut -- you know. So they can get, still, full mark,</p> <p>8 full score for it, because they did it. You know,</p> <p>9 they met that piece.</p> <p>10 COMMISSIONER BURT: Maybe could we add --</p> <p>11 instead of taking it out could we put, "comma, as</p> <p>12 appropriate," after?</p> <p>13 THE CHAIR: I don't -- but how -- but I</p> <p>14 think a school could say (inaudible due to</p> <p>15 simultaneous speaking) I followed an appropriate</p> <p>16 goal.</p> <p>17 COMMISSIONER BURT: We're negotiating</p> <p>18 anyway; right? We negotiate these goals, and we</p> <p>19 negotiate all these things; so -- I mean, I don't</p> <p>20 know --</p> <p>21 THE CHAIR: But that's after they've</p> <p>22 already been approved. This is for scoring the</p> <p>23 rubric. And the school -- in our decision making on</p> <p>24 the new applicant, if I sit there and I say, "Hey,</p> <p>25 you know, I don't -- I'm not going to approve this</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">113</p> <p>1 school -- for the school to respond back and say, "I</p> <p>2 thought the math and reading goal was appropriate."</p> <p>3 COMMISSIONER BURT: I'm just confused.</p> <p>4 Why don't we just say, as a Commission, it's not? I</p> <p>5 guess I'm --</p> <p>6 THE CHAIR: Well, it becomes -- if the</p> <p>7 scorer scores it completely, but they had the</p> <p>8 option, and they say, "But I think it's</p> <p>9 appropriate," you can say that. But it's not going</p> <p>10 to hold in a -- in all likelihood, in part of an</p> <p>11 appeal.</p> <p>12 So -- but I'm fine. I don't think we need</p> <p>13 to spend any more time on it.</p> <p>14 COMMISSIONER BURT: Okay.</p> <p>15 THE CHAIR: So once again, we're going</p> <p>16 back to --</p> <p>17 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Hold on. Hold on.</p> <p>18 I've got a hand up, and so does David. Commissioner</p> <p>19 Robbins.</p> <p>20 So I'm confused here on the language, the</p> <p>21 way it's gone back and forth.</p> <p>22 So, I mean, I know that you all have</p> <p>23 certainly seen over the last year that decisions I</p> <p>24 make are typically in favor of more accountability</p> <p>25 to goals related to academics.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">114</p> <p>1 And so what I'm understanding -- and I 2 could be understanding this incorrectly -- is that 3 maybe taking out the "or" lessens the stringency of 4 the goals toward academics. Do I got this -- 5 correct me if I -- I see heads going like this. So 6 I want to be -- so I was reading the language, and I 7 brought it up. I need this further explained to me, 8 please.</p> <p>9 THE CHAIR: So let me -- god, I didn't 10 want to -- I didn't realize I was opening Pandora's 11 Box here.</p> <p>12 So the Commission, over the past two, 13 three years, has been focusing more on schools 14 creating these unique and innovative mission goals, 15 recognizing the fact that the academic pieces, the 16 data comes from short cycle assessments in the State 17 Accountability System.</p> <p>18 We get that information. We've got it. 19 So we're not lessening any standards. We 20 acknowledge the fact that these elements, you know, 21 graduation rates, proficiency rates, growth rates, 22 whatever they are, that comes out of the 23 New Mexico -- now New Mexico Vistas. So -- and it's 24 incorporated in our Performance Framework by 25 scoring. But it doesn't show the Commission enough</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">116</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: No, I know you 2 wouldn't. I understand.</p> <p>3 THE CHAIR: But there are many ways to 4 show academic rigor.</p> <p>5 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Then shouldn't it 6 stand to reason that the "or" should be an "and"? 7 THE CHAIR: That's too many goals, in all 8 honesty. And here's another piece. I could just be 9 as easily persuaded to take that whole section out. 10 Because the bottom line is those goals are 11 completely meaningless, because then we do contract 12 negotiations. And those goals always change.</p> <p>13 So we're asking -- so to me, an academic 14 goal is less important in that application because 15 they don't understand it yet. They haven't gone 16 through a lot of the training for the Implementation 17 Year.</p> <p>18 And then we get to contract negotiations. 19 To me, that mission goal is way more important to 20 see at that moment in time, because that shows me 21 they understand what they want to do with the 22 school.</p> <p>23 But, honestly, any academic goal that's 24 ever been incorporated into the application has 25 never been used in contract negotiations, because</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">115</p> <p>1 how the school is fulfilling their mission and how 2 the school is serving their community.</p> <p>3 So we acknowledge that. We've got all the 4 academic information we need. Now we need to see 5 how the school is fulfilling the promise they made 6 to the students and the community and to us in that 7 application. And that's where the mission goal 8 comes in.</p> <p>9 So that for a school to truly, in the 10 application, show me that they really do understand 11 what their mission is and what part of their job is 12 in showing -- serving that community is creating 13 that mission goal, not just an academic goal. 14 Because a math and reading goal doesn't always show 15 me, many times, that they're fulfilling that mission 16 that they have.</p> <p>17 As an example, an arts school. As an 18 example, an art integrated school. You know, as an 19 example -- you know, I could go on. So that it 20 doesn't show me that the -- that that founding group 21 truly understands how to carry out that mission.</p> <p>22 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Okay.</p> <p>23 THE CHAIR: The academics is there. I am 24 not -- please -- I am not trying to lesson academic 25 rigor.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">117</p> <p>1 it'll go back and say, "That's ridiculous. I mean, 2 that's" -- you know. And we don't spend time -- I 3 hate rating an academic goal, because they don't 4 know yet what they don't know.</p> <p>5 So, to me, focusing in this section on the 6 mission, which is mission. It says it right there 7 in the section. It's mission, not academics. They 8 dig deeper later on in the application for, How are 9 you going to do short cycle assessments? How are 10 you doing your RIT or whatever, you know. That's 11 fully outlined. They have to -- How are you going 12 to train your staff on testing? And they have to 13 set up their testing calendar.</p> <p>14 That's deeply rooted in the other part of 15 the application.</p> <p>16 This piece of the application is mission 17 and vision.</p> <p>18 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: I see. Thank you 19 for the clarity.</p> <p>20 THE CHAIR: David -- oh, yeah.</p> <p>21 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes. And I just 22 want to clarify. My previous comment about 23 standards had nothing to do -- and I probably 24 shouldn't have said it the way I said.</p> <p>25 I think taking the "or" out is important,</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">118</p> <p>1 because this section, we need them to set mission 2 goals that can be evaluated, and objectively. And 3 academics are already there. 4 It's kind of like saying -- you know, you 5 have an Olympic runner. You know, he's going to -- 6 he's going to run for the -- the 200 meter. And we 7 say, "Well, you have to be able to run the 200 meter 8 in such-and-such a time," or, "You have to be five 9 foot tall." 10 What does the five foot tall have to do 11 with being able to run fast? 12 we want them to be able to have a goal 13 that's unique or is -- sets that school up so 14 parents know what the school is trying to do, not 15 just teach the kids to read and write. Because the 16 public schools, traditional schools, district 17 schools are supposed to be doing that anyway. 18 So what is going to be unique about this 19 school? How do you set it up, because it may be 20 we're going to be a -- a nature-based school. So we 21 have a lot of outdoor activities, and we do camping 22 and hiking. 23 Well, great. They have to teach them to 24 read and write and how to do math. But are you also 25 encouraging them to do that natural stuff about</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">120</p> <p>1 "student performance indicators" altogether? 2 THE CHAIR: Yeah. I was taking out the 3 "or student performance indicators," and just say 4 "mission goal." 5 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: I would agree to that 6 also. But if we left it in, if we left in "student 7 performance indicators," we would put "or other 8 student performance indicators." 9 But I would be in favor of taking it off. 10 THE CHAIR: Because like I said, I think 11 if a school's mission is, you know, college, 12 whatever -- college readiness, that would be 13 appropriate for their mission goal. 14 So I don't think it would limit for 15 those -- but I think it would be clearly defined in 16 the school's mission what they were, and the scorers 17 would know, yes, this is an appropriate mission 18 goal. 19 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Right. Yes, I agree. 20 Thanks. 21 THE CHAIR: Director? 22 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: Thank you for 23 this discussion. I agree that removing "or" does 24 not preclude a school from setting an academic focus 25 goal, say, if the school was about college</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">119</p> <p>1 learning about the environment, about, you know, 2 learning about nature? Because if that's their 3 mission goal, and they don't accomplish that, then 4 they haven't really met the need. 5 And so I agree with what Commissioner 6 Gipson was saying. Taking it out completely, but at 7 least removing the "or." Because the academics are 8 scored separately in another area, and they have to 9 meet that anyway. 10 I hope that helped clarify my thinking. 11 Thanks. 12 THE CHAIR: Thanks. I appreciate that. 13 Commissioner Voigt? 14 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes. Thanks. So I 15 know we got a little derailed. But I think -- you 16 know, because this is just the application, this is 17 the New Application Kit, that we do want to look for 18 the uniqueness. And the mission goal provides that. 19 On Page 7 -- I think it was Page 7 -- that's where 20 the assessment piece comes in, you know. 21 Let me look. Yeah, it's Page 7. That's 22 where the -- the assessment piece comes in and all 23 of the other heavier academic pieces. 24 But as far as how this B -- 1B is worded, 25 we could add -- Patti, were you saying take out</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">121</p> <p>1 attendance or some sort of other type of 2 career-focused attainment. 3 I also would ask you not to completely 4 remove it because I think what it does is it allows 5 us to assess the capacity of the applicants to 6 analyze their mission and say, "This is how we're 7 going to be able to demonstrate that we're meeting 8 it." 9 That is -- that is part of the Performance 10 Framework that is written in the annual review 11 process. And we have to go in the schools to see 12 how are they meeting their mission. And this would 13 help us to, in the application process, see how 14 they're thinking. 15 And, certainly, if they turn it into a 16 goal after they've been approved and added it to the 17 contract, it would help us to know how we can assess 18 whether they're meeting their mission. 19 THE CHAIR: Thanks. 20 Commissioner Burt? 21 COMMISSIONER BURT: Thanks. This 22 conversation was super helpful, because it -- and it 23 makes me feel a little bit better, because the 24 reason why I was wanting -- the -- the reasoning 25 behind why I wanted to keep it is I had heard from</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">122</p> <p>1 several different charter leaders -- and I think 2 this is before Corina was here, because I think this 3 was several years ago that this happened. 4 But they are academic-focused schools, and 5 this is, like I said, a couple of different ones. 6 And they actually ended up choosing not to do a 7 mission-specific goal, because they were told they 8 couldn't do something academically; right? And for 9 them, it was, like, "That's our thing; that's our 10 jam; that's what our school's about." 11 So they chose not to do a mission-specific 12 goal back then. That's what I was having in the 13 back of my brain was, like, them having, "Wait. 14 Because that is the mission of our goal -- that is 15 the mission of our school, so we need that." 16 So as long as it doesn't preclude them 17 from being able to do that -- because that's -- that 18 was my concern. So hearing -- hearing this is 19 definitely making me feel better. And so I hope 20 that we just stick to that. Because I don't know 21 who or what or -- I mean, like I said, this is years 22 ago. So I don't know who told them back then that 23 they couldn't do that. 24 So as long as that, you know, leaves it 25 open for flexibility. Because that's what I feel</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">124</p> <p>1 know, the important thing. 2 And I was kind of being facetious in a way 3 about removing it completely, but could have been 4 persuaded, if we didn't take the "or" out, then I 5 wanted it removed, because I didn't want that 6 academic as the fallback. 7 So I am going to move that the Public 8 Education Commission approve the New Application Kit 9 with the amendment of Part C, in Part C of the 10 application, No. 1, Academic Framework, Letter B, be 11 changed to read only "mission-specific goals." 12 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Second. 13 THE CHAIR: There's a motion by 14 Commissioner Gipson, a second by Commissioner 15 Robbins. 16 Is there any further discussion? 17 (No response.) 18 THE CHAIR: If not, roll, please. 19 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Davis. 20 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Yes. 21 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Gipson. 22 THE CHAIR: Yes. 23 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Manis is 24 not present. 25 Commissioner Robbins.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">123</p> <p>1 like I'm ultimately about is, like, leaving it as 2 flexible as possible to where we are not trapped. 3 Our charter leaders are not trapped. CSD is not 4 trapped, because we do want them to fulfill what -- 5 you know, like, if these are founders, they have -- 6 they're going to be the most passionate people about 7 their goal; right? Their mission goal. 8 So if they're feeling like, "Oh, well, 9 that -- I don't want to just make up something." 10 Right? "If our mission is academics, and they're 11 telling me I can't do that, I don't want to just 12 make up something." 13 "Okay. Well, let me just add in this 14 thing, because I can't do" -- then it's just not 15 meaningful for the school. 16 So I appreciate the conversation. You 17 know, I always value CSD's recommendations and the 18 conversation. So, you know, I'm good with it, too, 19 now. 20 THE CHAIR: All right. Thanks. And this 21 doesn't tie them to anything for contract 22 negotiations. So, you know, this is just really for 23 us to try to be able to judge capacity of the -- of 24 the applicant, you know, more than anything else. 25 So, to me, that -- that's always, you</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">125</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes. 2 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Taylor. 3 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Yes. 4 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Voigt. 5 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes. 6 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Armijo. 7 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Yes. 8 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Burt, 9 yes. 10 Commissioner Carrillo. 11 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Yes. 12 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Chavez. 13 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes. 14 COMMISSIONER BURT: All right. That is 15 approved unanimously -- or passes unanimously, 16 nine-zero. 17 THE CHAIR: Thanks. I appreciate it, and 18 I semi apologize for throwing this in as a kind of 19 clunker right now. But I -- you know, yesterday 20 really reaffirmed to me taking a look at it again. 21 So thanks. 22 So I -- once again, we need to go back to 23 No. 5 so that Julia can do the results for us. 24 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: You can put your 25 hand down.</p>

126	<p>1 THE CHAIR: Oh. Sorry.</p> <p>2 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: That's all right.</p> <p>3 MS. JULIA BARNES: So, Commissioners, I</p> <p>4 have received a text from each Commissioner</p> <p>5 identifying themselves and giving me their votes.</p> <p>6 The -- Commissioner Burt is elected as</p> <p>7 Chair with a vote of nine to one.</p> <p>8 Commissioner Voigt is elected as</p> <p>9 Vice Chair with a vote of nine to one.</p> <p>10 And Commissioner Armijo is elected as</p> <p>11 Secretary with a vote of nine to one.</p> <p>12 THE CHAIR: Thank you. We are now on to</p> <p>13 Item No. 10, Discussion and Possible Action on The</p> <p>14 GREAT Academy Corrective Action Plan update.</p> <p>15 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: So please let in</p> <p>16 Keisha and Jasper Matthews and whoever else they</p> <p>17 have brought with them to the panel.</p> <p>18 And while they're being brought on, just</p> <p>19 to orient Commissioners, there are -- this is Item</p> <p>20 No. 10. And so there are several bits of material</p> <p>21 that were submitted by the school.</p> <p>22 So it goes through I. So there's nine</p> <p>23 separate documents to align with this item,</p> <p>24 including the final one, I, which is -- includes my</p> <p>25 notes in the Corrective Action Plan.</p>	128	<p>1 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thanks. So,</p> <p>2 Commissioners, once again this is really just</p> <p>3 primarily an update. If there's any questions that</p> <p>4 Commissioners might have in regards to the</p> <p>5 information -- Keisha and Jasper, thanks so much for</p> <p>6 providing that information. So thanks for the time</p> <p>7 that you put into that.</p> <p>8 So are there any questions for them at</p> <p>9 this time? Because this doesn't require an approval</p> <p>10 or anything. It's just -- this was part of the --</p> <p>11 you know, the CAP that there would be this update in</p> <p>12 the January meeting.</p> <p>13 Commissioner Burt.</p> <p>14 COMMISSIONER BURT: Forgot the little</p> <p>15 electronic hand for a second. Thanks.</p> <p>16 I just wanted to ask Jasper and Keisha if</p> <p>17 you all can give us -- if you could give me just an</p> <p>18 update about -- like, your goals -- and I did see</p> <p>19 that your goals kind of shifted. You had, like,</p> <p>20 notes at the beginning of the year and, like, no,</p> <p>21 that's not working, so we're going to pivot and do</p> <p>22 something different.</p> <p>23 Can you talk about just, like, how the</p> <p>24 goals that you've set have transitioned through the</p> <p>25 year to right now and what it looks like for your</p>
127	<p>1 So there's a column that has the date I</p> <p>2 reviewed it and some notes attached to each item.</p> <p>3 So the school largely submitted everything</p> <p>4 that was required. There was one extra bit of</p> <p>5 information that I asked for, and Ms. Matthews</p> <p>6 provided it, and that had to do with the MLSS</p> <p>7 information.</p> <p>8 And so I would say that the -- the DASH</p> <p>9 Plan has been created and the other materials, the</p> <p>10 snapshots, the evidence of Professional Learning</p> <p>11 Community; all of the documents that we have</p> <p>12 requested are there.</p> <p>13 And a lot of the information, because of</p> <p>14 DASH Plan, has -- has been created. But the</p> <p>15 assessment results are not in.</p> <p>16 So I would say that, to a large degree,</p> <p>17 this is baseline. The school is implementing the</p> <p>18 short cycle assessments for middle of the year</p> <p>19 starting January 25th. And so once the results come</p> <p>20 in -- and I am hoping, by the February PEC meeting,</p> <p>21 we'll be able to see some growth indicators' results</p> <p>22 from beginning of the year to middle of the year.</p> <p>23 So I just wanted to orient you. This is</p> <p>24 Item 10A through I. And -- and I will stop talking</p> <p>25 now.</p>	129	<p>1 school and your students?</p> <p>2 I see a lot of work. Like, I read through</p> <p>3 all the meeting minutes and the notes. And I can</p> <p>4 see a lot of work on all of it. So I just wanted to</p> <p>5 get, you know, what's not in black and white. Like,</p> <p>6 what can we not read throughout those conversations?</p> <p>7 MS. KEISHA MATTHEWS: Thank you. Forgive</p> <p>8 me. My voice is kind of failing me today.</p> <p>9 So we, like you said, have been working</p> <p>10 really hard through our PLCs and through our PDs to</p> <p>11 find those minor improvements that can be made and</p> <p>12 fine-tuned that would result in greater academic</p> <p>13 achievement for the students.</p> <p>14 We, in our PLC, did a book study on</p> <p>15 singleton PLCs, because that's what we are. We're a</p> <p>16 small staff, just trying to find ways for us to be</p> <p>17 as effective and efficient in those PLCs as</p> <p>18 possible, looking at those -- breaking down</p> <p>19 processes to skills and focusing on how teachers can</p> <p>20 tweak their instruction to improve upon those very</p> <p>21 necessary skills, also utilizing the levels of MLSS</p> <p>22 and those specific interventions to -- to just help</p> <p>23 push the academic improvement in the right</p> <p>24 direction.</p> <p>25 Did that answer it? I'm sorry. I --</p>

130

1 COMMISSIONER BURT: Yeah. Yeah. No, I
 2 think that does. Because I just -- you can read
 3 through text; right? But it still doesn't give a
 4 great picture of what you guys are actually doing
 5 day by day; right?
 6 And so hearing about the specifics that
 7 you're looking at makes sense.
 8 From the beginning, I've been really
 9 interested in your seniors and how you're going to
 10 graduate them, what support you're going to be able
 11 to give to graduate them. So I was really happy to
 12 see that nine of your ten seniors are on track to
 13 graduate.
 14 My also assumption was that that one
 15 senior was probably already further behind than just
 16 this year. And so maybe it -- you know, it looks
 17 like they don't have too many credits to maybe just
 18 finish really quickly after this semester. But can
 19 you talk a little bit about do you have any concerns
 20 about the seniors or anything that -- I mean, I do
 21 know there's a lot of schools that are going to --
 22 you know, they're shifting back and forth from
 23 online learning and back.
 24 I know your school kind of is prepared for
 25 that because they're doing a lot of their learning

131

1 online anyway. Is there anything that you're
 2 looking forward to in this next semester
 3 specifically regarding your seniors?
 4 MS. KEISHA MATTHEWS: I -- we are really
 5 excited, because we -- as we, you know, always --
 6 always have, we have a model of case management.
 7 Excuse me. That sounds similar to mentoring.
 8 Basically, there's just a lot of contact
 9 with the seniors, a lot of interaction, trying to --
 10 especially somebody -- one of the Commissioners
 11 mentioned, you know, because of COVID and because of
 12 the shutdown, some students got jobs and started
 13 working. And you know how kids are once they get
 14 that money in their pocket. So it has been a great
 15 effort to keep them engaged.
 16 We had two FASFA workshops. We have -- I
 17 want to say -- well, nine of our ten students have
 18 their -- scratch that. Eight of the ten students
 19 have their FASFA submitted. The ninth one is just
 20 waiting for Mom to sign off and do the tax part.
 21 And then the one student is just adamant
 22 about not going to college, and so she's refusing to
 23 do the FASFA. But that's the earliest in the year
 24 that we've got students done with their FASFA.
 25 We have one student who has already been

132

1 accepted to UNM. We have students whose next step
 2 is to do their applications. I'm really excited
 3 about our senior class this year and how engaged
 4 they've been against all odds.
 5 COMMISSIONER BURT: All right. Thank you
 6 for that update.
 7 THE CHAIR: Commissioners, if there are no
 8 other questions of Keisha and Jasper, I'm going to
 9 thank them so much for the time. I hope this isn't
 10 the start of something bigger, Keisha, with your
 11 voice. So honey is an elixir. So I want to thank
 12 you and thank you for the time that you put in to
 13 provide all this information.
 14 MR. JASPER MATTHEWS: All right. Thank
 15 you.
 16 THE CHAIR: Have a great day.
 17 We are now on to Item No. 11, which is the
 18 Report from the Charter Schools Division.
 19 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: Thank you, Chair
 20 Gipson.
 21 And we're going to bring on a new staff
 22 person that I hired.
 23 So while that's happening, just a quick
 24 update -- well, there she is. So I'd like for the
 25 Commission to meet Lucy Valenzuela and to allow her

133

1 to have an opportunity to introduce herself, let you
 2 all know a little bit about her.
 3 THE CHAIR: So welcome back, Lucy.
 4 MS. LUCY VALENZUELA: Hi. Nice to meet
 5 you, or see you all again. As Corina mentioned, I'm
 6 Lucy Valenzuela. I just completed one month with
 7 being with the CSD. I was previously, for two
 8 years, in the Office of the Secretary. I was
 9 Secretary Stewart's assistant. And I left the
 10 agency for a couple of months, and I came back, and
 11 so now I'm in this new role with the Charter Schools
 12 Division.
 13 And one of my main priorities and tasks
 14 right now is, actually, I am doing -- taking over
 15 the website. So I will be doing all PEC website
 16 materials. And so that's what I have been doing the
 17 majority of my time with -- with CSD right now.
 18 And I know in the future I'll also be able
 19 to go on site visits and things like that. So I'm
 20 very excited. I'm very excited to be part of the
 21 team.
 22 I do have an extensive background in
 23 charter school education. I formerly worked at Cien
 24 Aguas International School for about three years as
 25 their admin assistant. I was part of, actually, the

134	<p>1 founding team at Altura Preparatory School back in 2 2018 and 2019. So I am very familiar and well 3 versed on charter schools. And so I'm just very 4 excited to be in this new role moving away from the 5 admin assistant. So I'm excited to be here and 6 working with you all. 7 THE CHAIR: So thanks. And welcome. It's 8 always exciting when there's new staff being 9 onboarded. 10 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: Absolutely. So 11 Lucy sits on the Technical Assistance and Training 12 team. But we have been blurring the boundaries, as 13 you all know, between the TA team and the 14 Authorizing team. So she will be helping with the 15 site visits. And she's already been so much help 16 since she got here. I'm really happy to have her on 17 the team. 18 I've also made an offer to another staff 19 person who is going to start on Monday, the 24th. 20 She's joining the authorizing team as an Ed Admin A. 21 She is coming from the southern part of the state. 22 So that's going to be interesting for us to have a 23 staff person who resides in Las Cruces, but because 24 we have a significant number of schools there and 25 because she has administrative experience as a</p>	136	<p>1 And so those are the staff updates. 2 And I wanted to give an update on the 3 improvement plans for the schools that you just 4 renewed. I know that the motion was to include a -- 5 an improvement plan with part of the charter 6 contract. And in preparation for that, and because 7 schools really were ready to move on putting into 8 place some of the improvements, and my staff was 9 ready to engage with them on the content that you 10 all addressed in the conditions of renewal, all of 11 the schools that got a condition for renewal have 12 been assigned a liaison from my office who has had a 13 Zoom meeting with the school to talk to them about 14 some of the specific action steps, a timeline, and 15 persons responsible for making improvements in the 16 area that was part of the condition. 17 So schools have already begun to implement 18 some of those improvements. I understand that we 19 will be continuing to meet with those schools, 20 follow up to see how they're doing on the action 21 steps that they've put into place for this semester, 22 and that will help inform the improvement plan that 23 is connected and attached to the contract. 24 Schools have asked how long would this be 25 in place, how long will we have this improvement</p>
135	<p>1 principal at a school and as a bilingual educator, I 2 think she's going to be a tremendous asset to the 3 team. So look forward to meeting her in February. 4 Yes, we took her from a district, and I 5 think that she'll be a wonderful addition to the 6 team. 7 There's two other positions that are open 8 right now. And we have had continuous -- they're 9 continuously opened until we fill them. One is for 10 my Admin Assistant position. Just haven't been able 11 to find someone who was still available for an 12 interview and interested in the position by the time 13 we got to interviewing. So we are constantly 14 gauging the applications and interviewing. So 15 that's ongoing. 16 And then the other position that has been 17 open, and we pulled applications and we're waiting 18 for an okay to interview, is for the Charter Schools 19 Program Grants Manager. Right now, Brigitte, who 20 was promoted to be deputy director of the Options 21 for Parents and Families, Charter Schools Division, 22 is wearing two hats. And that's a lot to hold down. 23 So those are two additional positions that 24 I'm hoping to fill before -- you know, as soon as 25 possible, actually.</p>	137	<p>1 plan that we would need to respond to. 2 And my sense is that until we can see that 3 some of the action steps are built into the school 4 system and that the school is doing really well, 5 that I would imagine we would continue to expect the 6 implementation of an improvement plan. 7 But just wanted to share that lots of 8 resources have been shared with the schools. We 9 have engaged them; they've all responded. So we are 10 definitely on track with that. 11 So the next item is around the Notices of 12 Intent. You know that Tuesday was when the Notices 13 of Intent to submit a charter application were due. 14 And we received seven Notices of Intent. 15 A few came in late, and/or the prospective 16 applicant did not notify both us and the district, 17 which is a requirement. So only five of the schools 18 that submitted the Notices of Intent did fill the 19 requirement to notify us by 5:00 on Tuesday and 20 notified the district as well. 21 Those are already posted to the website. 22 So if you are on the PEC's webpage, there is a 23 sidebar link that is called the Submitted 24 Applications Archived. And you will see -- Archive. 25 And you will see that there is a 2022 link that</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">138</p> <p>1 includes the five applications -- or the notices, I 2 should say -- that we received. 3 One is the Academy of Relational Learning 4 based out of Albuquerque. 5 Another is Community Leadership High 6 School proposed to be located in Santa Fe. 7 Explore Academy is submitting a Notice of 8 Intent to open up a west-side school. 9 The Phoenix Learning Academy is proposed 10 to be located in Alamogordo. 11 And the final one is called Compass 12 Charter School, which is proposing to be an online 13 statewide school with an enrollment of, I believe, 14 5,000. 15 So our next step is to engage the founders 16 in some training that our dear Missy Brown 17 facilitates for the prospective applicants. Because 18 we've been working with authorizers of districts 19 that may not have policies and procedures 20 established to the degree that PEC does, we've also 21 invited some authorizers to engage with us in those 22 workshops and to learn alongside us and to 23 collaborate with them if there's any questions they 24 have about the process, should the application be 25 submitted to them.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">140</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: They have the 2 right to submit a Letter of Intent just like anyone 3 else does. 4 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: I have a question for 5 Corina. Corina, I'm looking at the website. I'm 6 not seeing where to find those NOIs. 7 THE CHAIR: Go to the Archive of Submitted 8 Applications. 9 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Okay. Hold on. 10 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: If you're on the 11 Public Education Commission webpage -- 12 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Here it is. It goes 13 20- -- okay, there we are. 2022. Wow. 14 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: Notices of 15 Intent. So they are there. 16 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Okay. Thank you very 17 much. Got it. 18 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: And just 19 curiously, is Phoenix -- maybe they're calling it 20 Phoenix because, you know, Phoenix from the flames 21 and all that. But, I mean, it looks like their 22 directors and things are local down in Alamogordo 23 and from New Mexico? 24 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: It looks to me 25 like they're a couple of educators from Alamogordo.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">139</p> <p>1 And I believe that the first workshop is 2 planned for January 24th. 3 I see Commissioner Carrillo's hand up; 4 so... 5 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: No, thanks. I 6 know I can go online and look at that later. But 7 what was the fifth one that you named? I wanted to 8 write it down as part of my journal, the online one 9 with the 5,000. 10 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: Yes. That one is 11 called the Compass Charter School. And it is a K 12 through 12 online application. The applicant is 13 based out of Wilmington, Delaware. And they are 14 proposing 5,000 students. 15 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Okay. So I 16 just -- based in Delaware, which is, of course, the 17 corporate headquarters for everybody. Compass 18 Charter is, you know, nice and generic. Is this a 19 CMO or -- this just sounds like that. It -- big red 20 flag. 21 You know, we'll approach this when it 22 comes down the pike, you know -- I don't know -- 23 August or whenever it is we do all this. But so -- 24 and you said 5,000 cap. Holy smokes. Okay. 25 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: I have a question.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">141</p> <p>1 What we're doing at this point is if the school 2 would submit the application to the PEC or to the 3 Alamogordo school district, they don't have to let 4 us know. They can debate within themselves until 5 the last minute. When we meet with them and they 6 attend our training, sometimes they disclose that. 7 And, actually, they should be thinking about it 8 sooner than later, because if, for example, 9 Alamogordo had another application kit that they 10 were using, if they wouldn't just rely on ours, the 11 school would want to complete their application kit, 12 not ours. 13 But at times, the local districts ask the 14 schools -- or will accept an application that uses 15 our application kit. 16 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Okay. All right. 17 Thank you for your help here. Appreciate it. 18 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: Yeah. And so 19 because we mentioned the founders of two schools, I 20 can just let you know that we know about Explore 21 Academy, because we have an Explore-Albuquerque and 22 an Explore-Las Cruces. And so Justin Baiardo and 23 his other team members are also the founders of 24 Explore. 25 Community Leadership High School is part</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">142</p> <p>1 of a network of other Leadership schools that are 2 all locally authorized in Albuquerque. 3 And the folks who you might not 4 recognize -- and I don't -- is the -- is the Academy 5 of Relational Learning. 6 So those are the Notices of Intent. And 7 although the online school didn't specify to us 8 where they would be located, and we did make an 9 attempt to call them and ask, I later found out that 10 they submitted a Notice of Intent to Albuquerque 11 Public Schools, which made them eligible for 12 fulfilling that requirement of making the 13 notification to both the PEC and the local district. 14 They haven't specified that that's where their 15 offices will be, but that is the working assumption 16 that I have right now. 17 Any other questions on the Notices of 18 Intent? 19 (No response.) 20 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: All right. All 21 right. So then the next section in my report is 22 just Highlights and Appreciation. You know that I'm 23 ever grateful for my team and the hard work we do 24 and for the schools and how they are pushing through 25 every year -- I mean every day -- during this</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">144</p> <p>1 the religious days. 2 So I think the recommendation for the 3 calendar is to move it to -- I'm sorry, I have to 4 open the calendar -- to April -- I'm on '20-'21, 5 sorry -- to April 8th. Is that it? 6 Yeah. Okay. So I'm going to move that 7 the PEC amend their calendar for the 20- -- their 8 2022 calendar to reflect a change to the meeting 9 date for the work session to be April 7th and the 10 meeting be April 8th. 11 Commissioner Robbins? 12 COMMISSIONER BURT: Second. 13 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Thank you. We 14 tentatively have an additional workday on the 6th. 15 Would that then move to the 30th of March? Or would 16 we just eliminate that, because this is one of the 17 things that we were adding these in as potentials? 18 I don't know if we want three days in a 19 row, you know. If we keep that 6th, then it's three 20 days in a row. That was one reason for moving it a 21 week before our meetings, to have that optional one 22 in there. 23 Do we want to have that moved to the 30th 24 of March, you know, just from a timing standpoint, 25 so that we could discuss things there, get it on the</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">143</p> <p>1 pandemic. 2 I don't really have a whole lot of, beyond 3 that, highlights and appreciation. 4 I think I gave Chair Gipson the 5 appreciation for being the Chair, for being a phone 6 call away every time I have a question and providing 7 her perspective and guidance. And so I think that 8 most of my appreciation right now is going to Patti 9 Gipson for being a wonderful chair. And so I want 10 to say thank you. 11 THE CHAIR: Thank you. 12 Okay. So we're revisiting No. 12, 13 Discussion and Possible Action on the PEC Meeting 14 Calendar. As many times as we've had eyes on this, 15 when I was making my reservations for this upcoming 16 year and I went to April, our April meeting was 17 actually scheduled for Good Friday, which was also 18 the start of Passover. 19 So I -- you know, I don't know how we 20 missed it. So we've got a recommendation to move 21 that. And I think we're -- I don't remember -- are 22 we moving it earlier? 23 Yeah. I think the recommendation was to 24 go the week earlier, because if we went the week 25 later, we were still running into the end of some of</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">145</p> <p>1 calendar, or get it on the agenda if we needed to? 2 THE CHAIR: Yeah, I think that's a good 3 suggestion. So if we could -- Commissioner 4 Carrillo. 5 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: The reason I 6 didn't say anything, because, obviously, I look at 7 all the Jewish holidays is the first -- Jewish 8 holidays begin at sundown. So Passover begins at 9 sundown, technically, on the 15th. And because 10 we're also going to be in the new ridiculous, say, 11 like, Daylight Savings calendar by then, Passover 12 won't begin till probably 7:30 or 8:00. I would say 13 to leave it as it is. 14 THE CHAIR: But Good Friday is all day. 15 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: What? 16 THE CHAIR: Good Friday is all day. 17 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Oh, that's right. 18 Of course. That's -- that's right. I did not look, 19 of course, at that calendar. 20 I have a question. Why -- why can't we 21 meet Wednesday-Thursday instead of Thursday-Friday? 22 THE CHAIR: We can. But the -- the big -- 23 well, we could. Well, it's Holy Thursday, so -- you 24 know. 25 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: That's right.</p>

146	<p>1 Yeah. I get it.</p> <p>2 THE CHAIR: It gets --</p> <p>3 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: No, I understand.</p> <p>4 Got it. Thank you.</p> <p>5 THE CHAIR: I keep reminding people I'm a</p> <p>6 recovering Catholic. But those dates stick with me.</p> <p>7 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Got it. Thank</p> <p>8 you.</p> <p>9 THE CHAIR: So I think the Thursday could</p> <p>10 be a little problematic, you know.</p> <p>11 So -- and it's also -- for schools, they</p> <p>12 often take -- not necessarily their spring break;</p> <p>13 they've already taken that. But they take an</p> <p>14 extended weekend for the -- for that -- I'm going to</p> <p>15 say Easter break -- spring -- you know.</p> <p>16 So if we have schools that we do need to</p> <p>17 speak to, they may not be in session for those days.</p> <p>18 So that becomes a little difficult, too.</p> <p>19 But it's a good point about not wanting</p> <p>20 the three days in a row. So I'm going to move that</p> <p>21 the Commission amend their calendar for a work</p> <p>22 session to be April 7th, PEC regular monthly</p> <p>23 meeting, April 8th, and the possible work meeting</p> <p>24 for March 30th, Wednesday -- well, actually it</p> <p>25 doesn't have to be a Wednesday, but we've been using</p>	148	<p>1 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes. And I changed</p> <p>2 the Google Doc.</p> <p>3 COMMISSIONER BURT: That passes, ten-zero.</p> <p>4 THE CHAIR: Thank you so much. Thank you.</p> <p>5 We are on to Item No. 13, which is</p> <p>6 Discussion and Possible Action on Legislation.</p> <p>7 I'll just give you a brief update on what</p> <p>8 has been prefiled so far and just a heads-up.</p> <p>9 HB 42 is the Public Project Revolving</p> <p>10 Fund. There are three charter schools that have put</p> <p>11 in for funds for that. So if you're looking at it</p> <p>12 and you want to provide comment to support charter</p> <p>13 schools and schools -- you know, it's schools and</p> <p>14 municipalities. But the ASK Academy, Media Arts</p> <p>15 Collaborative, and 21st Century Public Academy have</p> <p>16 put in for capital outlay money through that funding</p> <p>17 stream.</p> <p>18 HB 43, we've discussed with -- when Matt</p> <p>19 Pahl has been here and supporting -- and HB 43 is</p> <p>20 the prefiled charter school facility improvements.</p> <p>21 So that's that bill to help support schools getting</p> <p>22 into their own facilities.</p> <p>23 And so far in -- on the Senate side, there</p> <p>24 hasn't been anything of significance right now</p> <p>25 prefiled that coincided with the priorities that we</p>
147	<p>1 Wednesdays -- so Wednesday, March 30th.</p> <p>2 COMMISSIONER BURT: Second.</p> <p>3 THE CHAIR: A motion by Commissioner</p> <p>4 Gipson and a second by Commissioner Burt. If</p> <p>5 there's no further discussion, roll, please.</p> <p>6 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Armijo.</p> <p>7 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Yes.</p> <p>8 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Burt,</p> <p>9 yes.</p> <p>10 Commissioner Carrillo.</p> <p>11 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Yes.</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Chavez.</p> <p>13 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes.</p> <p>14 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Davis.</p> <p>15 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Yes.</p> <p>16 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Gipson.</p> <p>17 THE CHAIR: Yes.</p> <p>18 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Manis.</p> <p>19 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Yes.</p> <p>20 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Robbins.</p> <p>21 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes.</p> <p>22 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Taylor.</p> <p>23 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Yes.</p> <p>24 COMMISSIONER BURT: And Commissioner</p> <p>25 Voigt.</p>	149	<p>1 had set up, with one possibility.</p> <p>2 There is a prefile, but the Senate doesn't</p> <p>3 have bill numbers yet. So I can't give you a bill</p> <p>4 number. But there is a prefile by Senator Gonzales,</p> <p>5 I believe, a Senate bill limiting the growths of</p> <p>6 administrative expenditures with public schools.</p> <p>7 So -- and the link to the bill itself is</p> <p>8 not accurate. It doesn't link you to that bill. So</p> <p>9 I've been unable to actually see what -- you know,</p> <p>10 what that limitation is. But just to keep a</p> <p>11 heads-up.</p> <p>12 There's -- there will be more legislation</p> <p>13 that will be filed, but that's what's been prefiled</p> <p>14 so far.</p> <p>15 So we're on to Item No. 14, which is</p> <p>16 Reports from the PEC Liaisons.</p> <p>17 I indicated to you that I went to the</p> <p>18 November LESC. As you go through the prefiled</p> <p>19 legislation, you can see those pieces of legislation</p> <p>20 that have been supported by the LESC. And there</p> <p>21 will be no meetings now that Session will be</p> <p>22 beginning.</p> <p>23 Commissioner Davis, do you have anything</p> <p>24 with the Indian Education Advisory Council?</p> <p>25 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: No, there have been</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">150</p> <p>1 no meetings.</p> <p>2 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thanks.</p> <p>3 Commissioner Burt?</p> <p>4 COMMISSIONER BURT: No update.</p> <p>5 THE CHAIR: Okay.</p> <p>6 Commissioner Robbins?</p> <p>7 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Of course I have an</p> <p>8 update. And there are a lot of things to update the</p> <p>9 Commission on.</p> <p>10 I appreciate having the bill numbers on</p> <p>11 the House bills dealing with capital and the</p> <p>12 Revolving Fund. That's one of the things that I've</p> <p>13 been trying to push and will work with legislators</p> <p>14 in that capacity on also.</p> <p>15 The -- the Public School Capital Outlay</p> <p>16 Council and PSFA have had a lot of changes and will</p> <p>17 be probably having more changes this year. There's</p> <p>18 a new executive director. Jonathan Chamblin took a</p> <p>19 position with Los Alamos National Labs. You know, I</p> <p>20 think you heard last year that they have about a</p> <p>21 \$5 billion build-out and renovation there. So he</p> <p>22 was hired. He is a licensed architect.</p> <p>23 Martica Casias was the executive director.</p> <p>24 She was hired by the council to become the new</p> <p>25 executive director effective back in December. That</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">152</p> <p>1 very restrictive, that, you know, schools obviously</p> <p>2 have to have bathrooms. But unless you conduct a</p> <p>3 class in there, guess what? That square footage</p> <p>4 gets pulled out of their allowable square footage</p> <p>5 for lease assistance.</p> <p>6 There's a cap on a per member, which was</p> <p>7 raised to \$762 per student per year. But the most</p> <p>8 economically challenged district in this state</p> <p>9 spends closer to \$2,000 per year on capital. So</p> <p>10 charter schools are at a distinct disadvantage</p> <p>11 there.</p> <p>12 One of the schools that is our charter</p> <p>13 school, the Albuquerque Sign Language Academy, is</p> <p>14 proposing to work with Bernalillo County. They're</p> <p>15 in a county building right now, and the county only</p> <p>16 requires them to pay a lease assistance that the</p> <p>17 State will provide, so they don't have to take any</p> <p>18 of their education dollars.</p> <p>19 But they want to move into a larger</p> <p>20 facility. They have a facility that's less than</p> <p>21 10,000 square feet. They have over 100 students.</p> <p>22 You can imagine that's less than 100 square feet per</p> <p>23 student. And that includes their administrative</p> <p>24 space.</p> <p>25 The minimum standards for an elementary</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">151</p> <p>1 was done. And I think her experience from her prior</p> <p>2 position as deputy director, she really did take</p> <p>3 over the reins in October and really started moving</p> <p>4 and making some changes that are important, one of</p> <p>5 which is looking at internal processes that, you</p> <p>6 know, schools have to face with regard to just the</p> <p>7 whole process of getting a school application into</p> <p>8 PSFA, getting it approved, getting the construction</p> <p>9 done, and working with yet another State agency,</p> <p>10 because you have to work with Regulation and</p> <p>11 Licensing, the Construction Industries Division,</p> <p>12 zoning, local zoning, and things like that.</p> <p>13 There are so many different pieces in the</p> <p>14 schools, and even charters. They complain about how</p> <p>15 long it takes to get things done when you're</p> <p>16 building public buildings, and we're trying to</p> <p>17 streamline that.</p> <p>18 My subcommittee, the Administration and</p> <p>19 Maintenance Standards, obviously, standards is one</p> <p>20 of those things, and we've been asked to review the</p> <p>21 standards. And one of the things I'm trying to</p> <p>22 press, and I would appreciate any support from you</p> <p>23 in talking with your charter schools, is to look at</p> <p>24 the definition of what a school space is, or an</p> <p>25 education space. Because, previously, it has been</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">153</p> <p>1 school is closer to 130 square feet per student.</p> <p>2 So, you know, students, their halls, their</p> <p>3 bathrooms, their janitorial closets, even though</p> <p>4 they have to have these things, their IT space, you</p> <p>5 know, for the servers, none of that counts as</p> <p>6 education space.</p> <p>7 So I'm going to try to work to change</p> <p>8 those things.</p> <p>9 Albuquerque Sign Language has applied for</p> <p>10 a waiver. Right now charter schools, in terms of</p> <p>11 any capital assistance, there is a State match. So</p> <p>12 if the school comes in asking for assistance,</p> <p>13 capital dollars, there's a formula that's used that</p> <p>14 looks at their bonding capacity and how much is</p> <p>15 bonded for property taxes.</p> <p>16 For schools in APS for this current year,</p> <p>17 it's a 23 percent match. In other words, the State</p> <p>18 will -- the State will only give you a portion of</p> <p>19 what you want. And, you know, that's -- that hurts</p> <p>20 an awful lot. The State will only give you</p> <p>21 23 percent of the cost of your building.</p> <p>22 So if you have a \$16 and a half million</p> <p>23 building, you have to come up with over \$12 million</p> <p>24 yourself from other funding.</p> <p>25 Now, you can imagine a school that has</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">154</p> <p>1 100 students, how long would it take them to pull a 2 little bit of their education dollars and set it 3 aside to come up with \$12 million. It would 4 probably take them anywhere from one to two 5 centuries.</p> <p>6 So that I think charter schools should not 7 be penalized, because they're in a district that has 8 a high tax base and a high tax rate, to be penalized 9 in terms of any capital assistance.</p> <p>10 And, you know, hopefully, HB 42 and 43, 11 they can address some of those things. But that 12 fund is not sufficient for someone like Albuquerque 13 Sign Language, because, you know, the fund is not 14 \$12 million to fund them. So that's one of the 15 things we're looking at.</p> <p>16 And revising the standards, we'll be doing 17 that over the next couple of months. And, again, 18 working with your schools, ask them to provide 19 input, and we'll be soliciting that through the 20 PSFA, Public Schools Facilities Authority.</p> <p>21 Real quick, a broadband update. The PSFA 22 was authorized, and they did put out a Request for 23 Proposals, for a state education network. The 24 Legislature last year authorized an Office of 25 Broadband in the Department of Information</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">156</p> <p>1 setting the basics of that up.</p> <p>2 And they're working with Higher Ed, the 3 colleges and universities around the state, and 4 working with schools to try to get enough support 5 and everything on that.</p> <p>6 The last thing -- you know, as we go 7 through this year, I would, you know, invite any of 8 you that want to attend the meetings. I mean, they 9 have phone-in. But they've been meeting live.</p> <p>10 There was a meeting or two that we had in 11 December simply because of different issues. One of 12 them was PSFA had a network that went down, and so 13 they weren't able to get everything ready for a 14 subcommittee meeting to drive up to Santa Fe and get 15 everything in place.</p> <p>16 But, you know, PSFA and the PSCOC have 17 been meeting live since last June, and it's been 18 very beneficial, I think. You know, I usually sit 19 right next to David Abbey. And so we share things 20 and discuss -- are able to discuss some things.</p> <p>21 And these are things that I think are 22 helpful to have, you know, maybe another 23 Commissioner just come and observe if you're so 24 inclined.</p> <p>25 I know, Commissioner Carrillo, you live in</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">155</p> <p>1 Technology. They have still not hired a director. 2 The Governor's Office hired an adviser, 3 but they don't have a director for that office, and 4 it's now almost a year since the legislation was 5 passed.</p> <p>6 With all this urgency and everything, yet 7 we still don't have a unified State plan. And so 8 PSFA was going forward with this Request for 9 Proposals.</p> <p>10 That closes out next week. Whether or not 11 we'll be able to award any contracts for helping to 12 build that out is yet to be seen.</p> <p>13 Schools can still apply for E-Rate. This 14 is a federal program where they help provide that 15 last connection that provides for the servers and 16 things in the school that can provide the computers 17 and things like that. But it cannot provide the 18 fiber optic connections to, you know, the Internet 19 network. And that's where the SEN is really 20 designed to look at that.</p> <p>21 And you can go to the PSFA website and 22 look at that. It's a very good plan. I think their 23 IT individual, Ovidiu Viorica -- he's from Romania, 24 and he spent about a month out of country because 25 his mother was ill -- has done a very good job in</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">157</p> <p>1 Santa Fe, might be possible for you to come. If 2 you're interested, I'll be happy to give you the 3 dates and times of when those meetings are.</p> <p>4 Long update. But that's really all I 5 have. Thank you.</p> <p>6 THE CHAIR: Thank you. NMPSIA.</p> <p>7 COMMISSIONER MANIS: We have not had a 8 meeting since December.</p> <p>9 THE CHAIR: Okay. And you typically take 10 January off, anyway, with Session.</p> <p>11 COMMISSIONER MANIS: That's correct, yes.</p> <p>12 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thanks. Commissioner 13 Carrillo.</p> <p>14 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: We have a board 15 meeting, the School Boards Association, on 16 February 3rd, when they are going to be -- it looks 17 like it's all going to be here in person, you know, 18 when they do their annual thing at the Eldorado 19 Hotel.</p> <p>20 So on the agenda for that, so I'll have 21 something to report -- should have something to 22 report for February's meeting.</p> <p>23 THE CHAIR: Wow. How exciting.</p> <p>24 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Even if just that 25 they shun me completely. I never know; so...</p>

158	<p>1 THE CHAIR: All right. Thanks. The 2 Library Commission? Commissioner Armijo? 3 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: We have not had a 4 meeting since November, and I don't -- haven't seen 5 a notification for one. But I think they meet on a 6 quarterly basis, so I'm assuming I'll be getting a 7 notification soon. 8 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thanks so much. 9 So we are on to Item No. 15, Report from 10 the Chair. 11 I think I mentioned yesterday -- but I 12 just wanted to let people know -- I had -- I want to 13 thank Julia for doing all the work for the -- for 14 the rulemaking. It was a tremendous amount of work. 15 And it took a lot. So I truly appreciate all of 16 that. 17 And I also want to thank PED, because the 18 Cabinet Secretary and I had a phone call, I think 19 facilitated by the Director, to see how they could 20 help us in accomplishing the rulemaking being 21 posted. 22 And we had a little bit of difficulty and 23 a snag with getting the PO. So I want to thank the 24 cabinet secretary for helping with that so that 25 we -- and also John Sena and Heidi in getting it on</p>	160	<p>1 it. So I wanted to say congratulations to them. 2 Monte del Sol. 3 One of our new schools, Pecos Cyber 4 Academy won an award. 5 The Southwest Aeronautics and Mathematics 6 and Science. 7 Taos Integrated. 8 Taos Academy. 9 And the ASK Academy. 10 And also I think there were two or three 11 district charters. And Commissioner Armijo's Mark 12 Armijo Charter School was one of those schools that 13 won an award. 14 This year, I didn't. I've attended other 15 years. And it's just exciting to watch those kids 16 and incredible how innovative they are. It's really 17 exciting to see them participate and the excitement 18 that they have. 19 So I just wanted to say congratulations. 20 I also wanted to extend my condolences to 21 the Turquoise Trail community. They lost a longtime 22 board -- former board member now -- Floyd Trujillo. 23 Floyd was a constant. When our meetings were live, 24 Floyd was a constant in Mabry Hall. He attended all 25 the time. I think he might have been a founder of</p>
159	<p>1 the Sunshine Portal. So it was a -- it was a really 2 helpful conversation. 3 I also did mention to him -- because as 4 you know, he's still kind of new at the job -- about 5 the MOU, because he has not had -- he had not had an 6 opportunity to read it. So I just asked him to look 7 at it. 8 We've had multiple talks here at the 9 Commission of possibly opening it up and taking a 10 look at it again, because it is the first year that 11 we've had this. So I thought it was important for 12 him to also have eyes on it to see what his 13 perspective might be on it. 14 You know, it's always good to get 15 different lenses. So that's been -- you know, I 16 think the rulemaking has been -- ate up a tremendous 17 amount of the time in December. 18 I want to thank -- oh, no -- I want to say 19 congratulations to a number of schools. Down here 20 in Cruces, it's sponsored by NMSU. But for three 21 years now they've had this STEM Challenge, the 22 Governor's STEM Challenge. 23 And there were 300 students that 24 participated in it. And we had seven, actually, 25 State charter schools that received awards through</p>	161	<p>1 Turquoise Trail, but he served on Turquoise Trail 2 charter board for many, many years. And he, 3 unfortunately, passed away last week. 4 So I wanted to extend my condolences to 5 the Turquoise Trail community for that loss. I 6 think every time I was in Santa Fe after he was off 7 the board, I ran into him on the Plaza. I thought 8 he was the mayor of the Plaza there for a while 9 because I couldn't be on there without running into 10 him. So he certainly will be missed by many. 11 We are on to -- I think that's it for me. 12 We are on to PEC Comments. 13 Commissioner Robbins? 14 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Thank you. I wish 15 the new officers well. They take office at the end 16 of this meeting. I will try to support you in any 17 way I possibly can, if it's asked for. Look forward 18 to working with you over the next year. I just look 19 forward to a fruitful year and working with all of 20 you to try to further education in New Mexico. 21 Thank you. 22 THE CHAIR: Thanks. Commissioner Burt. 23 COMMISSIONER BURT: Actually, can you come 24 back to me? My dog is very upset right now. 25 THE CHAIR: Sure.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">162</p> <p>1 Commissioner Voigt. 2 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: The Association of 3 School Business Officials, the ASBO conference, I 4 noticed conflicts with our February meeting. It's a 5 great conference. Guess I won't be going. But -- 6 but just wanted to put that out, because I think 7 everyone got the e-mail about that conference. 8 It's a very good conference, and a lot of 9 governing boards get their hours for training during 10 that conference as well. 11 I wanted to thank Commissioner Robbins for 12 mentioning E-Rate, because that is something that is 13 so available for charter schools to apply for. And 14 those funds do help out, even in a small sense, for 15 maintenance and transition with technology. 16 So I hope -- and I don't know if the 17 Charter School Division even talks about that with 18 the new charter schools, about that E-Rate 19 potential. But it's definitely worth it once you 20 get in. We used to get it every year. I don't know 21 if your schools do that, Mike, down there in Hatch? 22 E-Rate? 23 Cool. Great. Good. 24 And then I just want to thank everyone for 25 a '20-'21 year of work. It was a great year. We</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">164</p> <p>1 comments yet. I'm sure next month I may have more. 2 But I just wanted to mostly say thanks to -- thank 3 you, Patti, for your service and all the time and 4 effort that you have put in. And now I know I'll 5 get a taste of what that looks like. So thank you. 6 THE CHAIR: Thanks. Commissioner Davis. 7 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Yes. So I want to 8 acknowledge Patti Gipson as well. So you have such 9 a great storehouse of knowledge and your willingness 10 to share that knowledge. And for my first two years 11 on this Commission, you were just so kind to me and 12 helpful. And every time I had a question, you 13 answered me truthfully, honestly, and respectfully. 14 And I just appreciated that so much. 15 THE CHAIR: Thanks. I was only kind the 16 first two years? Geez. 17 Thanks so much. 18 Commissioner Armijo. 19 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Ah, yes. I too want 20 to acknowledge Patti and thank her for her service. 21 You are a wealth of knowledge, and you know so much. 22 So I hope you will be available to me when I have 23 questions, because I'm sure I'm going to have a lot 24 of questions, as well as thank you, Commissioner 25 Robbins, for saying that you would be available as</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">163</p> <p>1 got a lot done, a lot in the can to do for this 2 year. 3 And, Patti, you're a rock. Thanks for 4 everything you did. This is my third year on the 5 Commission, and you have been just -- I want to say 6 this -- a chingona. And everyone can look that up 7 on their own. But it's -- yeah. 8 So thanks for everything you've done and 9 all the time that you put in. 10 THE CHAIR: Thank you. Thanks. I don't 11 have to look it up. 12 Commissioner Voigt, are we dog-friendly? 13 I'm sorry. Commissioner Burt? 14 COMMISSIONER BURT: Yeah, we're good now. 15 So, yeah, first I just want to say thanks 16 for Patti for all the service, not just last year, 17 but for the last several years that she's stepped up 18 to be the Chair. And I'm very grateful to have had 19 this last year to do an enormous amount of learning, 20 knowing that I still have much more to come. So I'm 21 very grateful for what I have been able to 22 experience so far. I'm looking forward to a really 23 great year moving forward. So thank you to everyone 24 for that. 25 And I'm -- I really don't have any</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">165</p> <p>1 well. Because I think I do want to learn a lot more 2 about PSCOC and PSFA. 3 I want to thank all the Commissioners who 4 voted for me for secretary. I am humbled. And I 5 thank Glenna for her nomination. It was a shock. 6 And, like I said, again I'm truly humbled. 7 I also want to thank the CSD for their -- 8 the training yesterday. I was really, really 9 impressed with Teresa Cordero and her wealth of 10 knowledge and her ability to convey that knowledge 11 with such grace and a sense of urgency of what needs 12 to be addressed in our society. So I really 13 appreciated that training very, very much. 14 Thank you, Commissioner Gipson, for 15 mentioning the Mark Armijo Academy. They did 16 receive that Governor's Award for their STEM 17 Challenge, and it was the most amazing thing for the 18 school itself. 19 The -- this is -- I hope I can say this on 20 this forum. But every one of that STEM team have an 21 IEP. So it was really, really an impressive award 22 for them to receive. 23 And also they -- from what they came from, 24 as I mentioned before, their demographic was at risk 25 students back in 2001. And in 20 years' time, they</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">166</p> <p>1 have just come such a long way. So I'm really, 2 really proud of that school. 3 And I think that's about it. Just thank 4 everybody for such great, you know, back and forth 5 with us. We are a very diverse group here, and I 6 just appreciate all of our input. Thank you so 7 much. 8 THE CHAIR: Thanks. 9 Commissioner Taylor? 10 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Thanks. I'm using 11 my iPad. So every time you call on me, my big hand 12 comes to turn the mic on, so I'm sorry for that. 13 But, Patti, I know this is something 14 that -- I don't want to sound like a broken record. 15 And I feel like I've been under your leadership on 16 this Commission for -- for over a year, right at a 17 year now. And I've never met you in person. So I 18 look forward to the time when we can actually sit 19 down and shake hands and maybe share a beer or 20 something. 21 So I do -- I do want to -- I just do want 22 to say that every meeting, I was impressed with 23 the -- with the knowledge and the experience and the 24 insight that you brought to -- to the different 25 issues. And I would -- I'd go away from every</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">168</p> <p>1 don't want to be on that old white guy, you know, 2 side of -- of the issue. 3 So I really did appreciate the -- the 4 insight that she offered and for you guys sponsoring 5 that. So thank you very much. 6 THE CHAIR: Thanks. 7 Commissioner Chavez. 8 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Well, Patti, I 9 just -- I want to echo what everybody else has said. 10 You know, I came on at the same time that Glenna 11 did, and so for three years, just watching you work. 12 And I have to just echo what Commissioner Taylor 13 just said. I was always amazed and always just 14 blown away at your knowledge. 15 And I always ask myself, gosh, could I do 16 that? 17 And, you know, I always came back and 18 said, "No, I don't think I could," just because of 19 your knowledge and the wealth of just information 20 that you brought to the table. And so thank you for 21 your leadership the last three years. But I know it 22 goes much further than that. 23 But I also have a great amount of respect 24 for also your decision to not move forward. I think 25 you said something like you need to know when not to</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">167</p> <p>1 meeting thinking, man, she must -- she must be 2 working every single day from morning till night on 3 this, because of the amount that you accomplished 4 and the amount of time that you put into it. 5 So thank you very much. You've been a 6 good example for the rest of us. 7 So I am looking forward to the new 8 executive council. I'm looking forward to Bekka, 9 really, and Glenna having the experience of being on 10 the board for a while, and Bekka bringing a new 11 perspective and a new energy. And so I think 12 that -- I'm excited about what you all are going to 13 lead us into. And right, exactly. It'll be great. 14 I do want to echo also what Commissioner 15 Armijo said about the training yesterday. You know, 16 for -- I'm in that obvious category of old white men 17 that get -- that have been trained and -- and so 18 many things have just been -- have crept into our 19 lives, or we've been subject to our environment and 20 so forth. 21 I appreciated the way that she approached 22 the training and was -- her perspective was, yeah, 23 this is good. It's starting a dialogue. We need to 24 be talking about it, because I'm not -- I want to be 25 open to that. I want to learn. I want to -- I</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">169</p> <p>1 go to the party or something like that. And, you 2 know, that -- that takes a lot as well, you know, to 3 make that decision. 4 And being in leadership is certainly 5 difficult. And, you know, you're always -- you 6 always have a target on you; right? 7 And -- but it's also -- and so you rise up 8 to that challenge. And -- but just as important is 9 knowing when to -- to step aside and let other 10 people come on board. And so I sure do respect 11 that -- the decision that you made there. 12 I want to say, Bekka, just, you know, I -- 13 anything that we could do to support you and looking 14 forward to your leadership, and, of course, Glenna 15 and -- and, you know, you're such a wealth of 16 knowledge as well and what you bring to the table. 17 And, Commissioner Armijo, looking forward 18 to, you know, having you just step up as well. It's 19 not easy stepping up. And so I commend all of you 20 for doing so. 21 Beyond that, I just want to say -- I just 22 want to remind everybody -- I do this every time, I 23 think -- just remind everybody that, you know, we 24 still are dealing with the virus out there in our 25 public schools. And it's difficult. It's extremely</p>

170	<p>1 difficult.</p> <p>2 And so I just want to encourage everybody</p> <p>3 that when you do have the opportunity to visit with</p> <p>4 a teacher, to visit with an administrator, to visit</p> <p>5 with support staff, to please just encourage them,</p> <p>6 because it's not easy right now. It continues to be</p> <p>7 a challenge, and especially, I would say, in the</p> <p>8 last month with this new variant.</p> <p>9 And I'm suspecting it's the new variant</p> <p>10 because it has spread like wildfire. So I believe</p> <p>11 every school in our state, and probably every school</p> <p>12 in the nation, is dealing with this in some form or</p> <p>13 another.</p> <p>14 And so, you know, this is just a time that</p> <p>15 we really need to be supportive of the people in</p> <p>16 education. And I just -- thank you. Thank you,</p> <p>17 everyone. I really appreciate how this Commission</p> <p>18 has gelled over the course of the year. And it's</p> <p>19 been good. It's been good. So thank you, everyone.</p> <p>20 THE CHAIR: Thanks.</p> <p>21 Commissioner Carrillo.</p> <p>22 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Yes. Of course</p> <p>23 echoing what others have said. Patti, your</p> <p>24 dedication to kids and public schools in New Mexico,</p> <p>25 unsurpassed, and just thank you very much for your</p>	172	<p>1 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Thank you. Going</p> <p>2 after everyone, I think, I could easily just say,</p> <p>3 "Yeah, ditto."</p> <p>4 But definitely thank you, Commissioner</p> <p>5 Gipson. I feel like even though we've only had</p> <p>6 virtual interactions, it has been a learning</p> <p>7 experience being on the Commission, learning from</p> <p>8 you, learning from all the other Commissioners,</p> <p>9 especially those who have had experience not only on</p> <p>10 the PEC, but on other boards and being involved in</p> <p>11 other aspects of education.</p> <p>12 I'm thinking I'm probably the youngest</p> <p>13 Commissioner on the Commission. So I am the most</p> <p>14 green and have learned a lot, I think, from all of</p> <p>15 you, which is -- has really been beneficial over the</p> <p>16 past year.</p> <p>17 And I guess to conclude, I'd just like to</p> <p>18 say my well wishes to the executive committee and to</p> <p>19 all the Commissioners as they go throughout their</p> <p>20 respective duties throughout the year, including</p> <p>21 being on the Commission. So thank you so much.</p> <p>22 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thanks, everyone. I</p> <p>23 feel like I've been eulogized. I'm a head full of</p> <p>24 minutiae. People have always said that. There's a</p> <p>25 lot of crap up there in my head.</p>
171	<p>1 years of service, your years as chair, and I just</p> <p>2 hope you -- with all this time -- you golf. We</p> <p>3 talked about that once. You golf down there; right?</p> <p>4 Just the time that you're going to have to just</p> <p>5 enjoy life. So just, you know, I mean, just relish</p> <p>6 that.</p> <p>7 And to Bekka, you're not going to have a</p> <p>8 life anymore. So thank you for stepping up -- no,</p> <p>9 you will, of course. I wish you and the new</p> <p>10 executive committee all the best.</p> <p>11 And nothing really to echo.</p> <p>12 Michael, thank you for your comments just</p> <p>13 about how -- the difficulty and just for us</p> <p>14 acknowledging people when we see them.</p> <p>15 Mark Armijo School, congratulations.</p> <p>16 I really don't have any other comments.</p> <p>17 Thanks very much. Last year was a great learning</p> <p>18 year. It's exciting. I'm looking forward to all</p> <p>19 the work we're going to accomplish this year,</p> <p>20 especially because we have gelled more, and wishing</p> <p>21 you all a great long weekend.</p> <p>22 Thanks to CSD, always. Director Chavez,</p> <p>23 you and your staff, Brigitte and the others, you all</p> <p>24 do such an exceptional job. Thank you very much.</p> <p>25 THE CHAIR: Thanks. KT?</p>	173	<p>1 So I appreciate everyone. Thank you. And</p> <p>2 congratulations to everyone. That being said, I</p> <p>3 will entertain a motion for adjournment.</p> <p>4 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: I move we adjourn.</p> <p>5 THE CHAIR: There's a motion to adjourn.</p> <p>6 We have to take roll on this.</p> <p>7 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Armijo.</p> <p>8 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Yes.</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Burt,</p> <p>10 yes.</p> <p>11 Commissioner Carrillo.</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yeah.</p> <p>13 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Chavez.</p> <p>14 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes.</p> <p>15 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Davis.</p> <p>16 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Yes.</p> <p>17 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Gipson.</p> <p>18 THE CHAIR: Yes.</p> <p>19 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Manis.</p> <p>20 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Yes.</p> <p>21 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Robbins.</p> <p>22 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes.</p> <p>23 COMMISSIONER BURT: Commissioner Taylor.</p> <p>24 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Yes.</p> <p>25 COMMISSIONER BURT: And Commissioner</p>

1 Voigt.
 2 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes.
 3 COMMISSIONER BURT: All right. That
 4 unanimously passes.
 5 THE CHAIR: Stay safe, everyone. See you
 6 in February.
 7 (Proceedings concluded at 12:57 p.m.)
 8
 9
 10
 11
 12
 13
 14
 15
 16
 17
 18
 19
 20
 21
 22
 23
 24
 25

1 RECEIPT
 2 JOB NUMBER: 6171N CC Date: 1/14/22
 3 PROCEEDINGS: PUBLIC MEETING
 4 CASE CAPTION: In re: Public Meeting of the Public
 5 Education Commission
 6 *****
 7 ATTORNEY: MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN - PED
 8 DOCUMENT: Transcript / Exhibits / Disks / Other ____
 9 DATE DELIVERED: _____ DEL'D BY: _____
 10 REC'D BY: _____ TIME: _____
 11 *****
 12 ATTORNEY:
 13 DOCUMENT: Transcript / Exhibits / Disks / Other ____
 14 DATE DELIVERED: _____ DEL'D BY: _____
 15 REC'D BY: _____ TIME: _____
 16 *****
 17 ATTORNEY:
 18 DOCUMENT: Transcript / Exhibits / Disks / Other ____
 19 DATE DELIVERED: _____ DEL'D BY: _____
 20 REC'D BY: _____ TIME: _____
 21 *****
 22 ATTORNEY:
 23 DOCUMENT: Transcript / Exhibits / Disks / Other ____
 24 DATE DELIVERED: _____ DEL'D BY: _____
 25 REC'D BY: _____ TIME: _____

1 BEFORE THE PUBLIC EDUCATION COMMISSION
 2 STATE OF NEW MEXICO
 3
 4
 5
 6

7 REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE

8 I, Cynthia C. Chapman, RMR, CCR #219, Certified
 9 Court Reporter in the State of New Mexico, do hereby
 10 certify that the foregoing pages constitute a true
 11 transcript of proceedings had before the said
 12 NEW MEXICO PUBLIC EDUCATION COMMISSION, held in the
 13 State of New Mexico, in the matter therein stated.

14 In testimony whereof, I have hereunto set my
 15 hand on January 25, 2022.
 16
 17
 18

19 _____
 Cynthia C. Chapman, RMR-CRR
 New Mexico Certified Reporter #219
 BEAN & ASSOCIATES, INC.
 20 201 Third Street, NW, Suite 1630
 Albuquerque, New Mexico 87102
 License Expires: 12/31/2022
 21
 22
 23
 24
 25

Job No.: 6171N (CC)

1 BEFORE THE PUBLIC EDUCATION COMMISSION

2 STATE OF NEW MEXICO

3
4
5
6
7 REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE

8 I, Cynthia C. Chapman, RMR, CCR #219, Certified
9 Court Reporter in the State of New Mexico, do hereby
10 certify that the foregoing pages constitute a true
11 transcript of proceedings had before the said
12 NEW MEXICO PUBLIC EDUCATION COMMISSION, held in the
13 State of New Mexico, in the matter therein stated.

14 In testimony whereof, I have hereunto set my
15 hand on January 25, 2022.

16
17
18 *Cynthia Chapman*

19 _____
Cynthia C. Chapman, RMR-CRR
New Mexico Certified Reporter #219
BEAN & ASSOCIATES, INC.
20 201 Third Street, NW, Suite 1630
Albuquerque, New Mexico 87102
21 License Expires: 12/31/2022

22
23
24
25 Job No.: 6171N (CC)

SANTA FE OFFICE
119 East Marcy, Suite 110
Santa Fe, NM 87501
(505) 989-4949
FAX (505) 843-9492

**BEAN
& ASSOCIATES, Inc.**
PROFESSIONAL COURT
REPORTING SERVICE

MAIN OFFICE
201 Third NW, Suite 1630
Albuquerque, NM 87102
(505) 843-9494
FAX (505) 843-9492
1-800-669-9492
e-mail: info@litsupport.com