

2022 Instructional Material Summer Review Institute

Review Team Appraisal of Title

K-8 Arts

This appraisal form is provided for use by educators responsible for the selection of instructional materials for implementation with districts and charter schools across New Mexico to meet the need of their student populations.

[NMPED Adoption Information](#)

Text Title	My Music Journal – Teaching Method for Fourth Grade (One text for SE, TE and SW)	Publisher	Apollo Publishing
SE ISBN	9781733998741	TE ISBN	
SW ISBN		Grade Level/Content	4th Grade Music

Core Instructional Material Designation (*Core Instructional Material is the comprehensive print or digital educational material, including basal material, which constitutes the necessary instructional components of a full academic course of study in those subjects for which the department has adopted content standards and benchmarks.*)

Recommended
(90% and above)

Recommended with Reservations (80-89%)

Not Recommended and Not Adopted
(below 80%)

Total Score - The final score for the materials is averaged between the team of reviewers.

Average Score

29%

Cultural and Linguistic Relevance Recognition - Materials are reviewed for relevant criteria pertaining to the support for teachers and students in the material regarding cultural relevance and the inclusion of a culturally responsive lens. Those materials receiving a score of 90% or above on the CLR portion of the review are recognized as culturally and linguistically relevant.

CLR Recognized

Average Score

4%

FOCUS AREA 6 CULTURAL AND LINGUISTIC PERSPECTIVES:

Instructional materials represent a variety of cultural and linguistic perspectives.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence (from All Content Appraisal tab):

The instructional materials are not written through a culturally and linguistically responsive lens. The knowledge, experiences, and backgrounds of the students are not affirmed in the materials as assets to either the teacher or their peers. Diverse perspectives, non-traditional roles, and marginalized communities are not explicitly discussed in relation to musical representation and relevance. There are songs in the material that reinforce generalizations and stereotypes. There are no supports for teachers on how to value home language as a resource for learning content, recognizing students' background knowledge or interests, or how to activate those for disciplinary learning.

FOCUS AREA 7 INCLUSION OF CULTURALLY AND LINGUISTICALLY RESPONSIVE LENS:

Instructional materials highlight diversity in culture and language through multiple perspectives.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence (from All Content Appraisal tab):

Instructional materials do not include tools and resources that demonstrate multiple cultural perspectives in a specific concept. No explicit teacher guidance is provided to engage students in critical reflection about their own lives and societies, including cultures past and present in New Mexico. Instructional materials do not address multiple ethnic descriptions, interpretations, or perspectives of events and experiences. Materials do not relate the content area to diversity in culture and language, nor provide any guidance to teachers on how to plan for instruction that is culturally and linguistically responsive.

Standards Review - Materials are reviewed for alignment with the state adopted content standards, benchmarks and performance standards.

Average Score
29%

OVERALL ALIGNMENT:

Materials align with the grade level/content area arts standards overall.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

The materials feature musical concepts, opportunities for review and practice, and technical information for performance appropriately at a 4th-grade level. However, the repertoire choices are inconsistently appropriate for this age group. Often songs have been repeated from earlier grade levels, many of which are more appropriate for K-2 grades. There is often no alignment between the standard written verbatim into the teacher instructions and the activity and/or song in the lesson. While these materials are a collection of activities to instruct and inform students about music terminology, literacy and history, the materials lack opportunities for students to make meaningful connections in how to apply their content-specific knowledge to the creative process in music, collaboratively or independently.

ANCHOR STANDARD 1:

Generate and conceptualize artistic ideas and work.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Material is a combined student and teacher text. Opportunities to improvise rhythmic, melodic, and harmonic ideas do not allow for explanation to connect to specific purpose and context. Activities include grade-level appropriate rhythm and melodic creation. The materials include opportunities to generate musical ideas in major key or as rhythmic compositions. Within these composition activities, there is no reference to purpose, context or how creative ideas emerge from a variety of sources.

ANCHOR STANDARD 2:

Organize and develop artistic ideas and work.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials use standard notation to document personal rhythmic and melodic musical ideas. Students are given opportunities to demonstrate selected and organized musical ideas for an improvisation, arrangement, or composition to express intent, and explain connection to purpose and context. These opportunities, however, are written into the teacher instructions. They are not explicitly stated as being the lesson objective, and the student activity does not directly address how musicians make creative decisions or how those decisions are influenced by expertise, context or expressive intent.

ANCHOR STANDARD 3:

Refine and complete artistic work.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials do not allow opportunities for students to evaluate, refine, and document revisions to personal music, applying teacher-provided and collaboratively-developed criteria and feedback to show improvement over time. Instructional materials do not offer opportunities for students to present the final version of personally created music to others and explain connection to expressive intent.

ANCHOR STANDARD 4:

Select, analyze and interpret artistic work for presentation.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials include song selections that promote rote learning and identification of content using standard notation. There are opportunities for the teacher to lead the class in reviewing technical singing skills. Expressive qualities, such as dynamics and tempo, are demonstrated in performance, but minimal opportunities are present to convey intent through interpretive decisions. Students have opportunities to demonstrate understanding of the structure and the elements of music (such as rhythm, pitch, and form) in music selected for performance. There are limited opportunities for students to engage with the materials in a meaningful way, to select music for performance, or to demonstrate or explain how such selections are influenced by personal interest, knowledge, and context.

ANCHOR STANDARD 5:

Develop and refine artistic techniques and work for presentation.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials include lessons on voice technique skill development. Rehearsal opportunities in the text refer to technical accuracy of the voice and reference expressive qualities, but do not address performance challenges for the teacher. Students are not provided opportunities to apply teacher-provided and collaboratively-developed criteria and feedback to evaluate accuracy and expressiveness of ensemble and personal performances.

ANCHOR STANDARD 6:

Convey meaning through the presentation of artistic work.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials provide students with opportunities to perform music, alone or with others, with expression and technical accuracy, and appropriate interpretation. Text does not explicitly offer opportunities for students to demonstrate performance decorum and audience etiquette appropriate for the context, venue, and genre. Students are instructed to sing a song while conveying appropriate meaning, but they are not given the chance to decide which meaning is appropriate to the music selection.

ANCHOR STANDARD 7:

Perceive and analyze artistic work.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Material states the standard in the text, but does not offer guidance to the teacher in ways to present content and connect it to the standard. Students are asked to explain how selected music connects to and is influenced by specific interests, experiences, purposes, or contexts. However, those ideas are not applied to demonstrate their understanding through performance. Students are not asked to demonstrate and explain how responses to music are informed by the structure, the use of the elements of music, and context (such as social and cultural). Students are not included in the process for choosing music to perform or experience. All music is selected by the author of the text or the teacher.

ANCHOR STANDARD 8:

Interpret intent and meaning in artistic work.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials allow opportunities for students to demonstrate and explain how the expressive qualities (such as dynamics, tempo, and timbre) are used in performers' and personal interpretations to reflect expressive intent though these opportunities are inconsistent through the course of the material. Most performance opportunities focus on vocal quality, breath control, and rote learning. As an example, one lesson instructs the students to sing *You Are My Sunshine* while conveying the proper mood, but exactly which proper mood to convey is not explicitly stated or collaboratively agreed upon with the students.

ANCHOR STANDARD 9:

Apply criteria to evaluate artistic work.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

The materials do not allow opportunities for students to evaluate musical works and performances, applying established criteria, and to explain appropriateness to the context. Criteria for evaluating a performance is limited to stating which performance the students liked best.

ANCHOR STANDARD 10:

Synthesize and relate knowledge and personal experiences to make art.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

The materials do not allow opportunities for students to demonstrate how interests, knowledge, and skills relate to personal choices and intent when creating, performing, and responding to music. Students are not asked about their personal experiences and knowledge in connection to making music.

ANCHOR STANDARD 11:

Relate artistic ideas and works with societal, cultural, and historical context to deepen understanding.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials state the standard verbatim in the text without any further teacher guidance. No instructional strategies are given to the teacher nor explicit instructions for students to demonstrate understanding of relationships between music and the other arts, other disciplines, varied contexts, and daily life.

Arts Content Review - Materials are reviewed against relevant criteria pertaining to the support for teachers and students in the specific content area reviewed.

Average Score
40%

FOCUS AREA 1 DISCIPLINARY LITERACY:

Instructional materials incorporate reading, writing, and communicating within the arts disciplines.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

While there are multiple opportunities in the materials to perform, color, and craft, instructional materials do not provide students with multiple opportunities to engage with authentic sources that represent the language and style that is used and produced by performers, artists, or technicians in the other arts disciplines of dance and theatre. Instructional materials regularly engage students in speaking/listening, reading/writing, and performing, but there are minimal cultural art activities present in the text. Content-specific vocabulary is taught but there is not a connection to deeper learning. A coherent sequence of authentic sources that use vocabulary and knowledge over the course of study in each of the five arts disciplines is not present. Materials do not address the necessity of using the five arts' disciplines across them.

FOCUS AREA 2 LEARNING PROGRESSIONS:

Instructional materials provide purposeful sequencing of teaching and learning expectations across multiple developmental stages.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Students are not often prompted for reflection or called on to apply critical thinking skills to convey meaning to the presentation of a musical work. Throughout the text, meaning and intent are either dictated by the text or teacher, or not discussed at all. The material exclusively employs cognitive thinking, but does not provide opportunities to enrich the students' connection to the material through social or emotional learning activities. Analysis of musical works, either provided or student-created, is inconsistent in the materials and the text does not contain any explicit frameworks or rubrics to aid in the process. Many lessons revisit the students' learning in foundational concepts, but do not spiral to develop the students' critical thinking or problem-solving skills. The purposeful sequencing of lessons across the materials to foster academic development is not evident. Students are not supported to reflect on their learning, analyze the work of others or discuss works of art with any framework, rubric or criteria.

FOCUS AREA 3 AUTHENTICITY AND RELEVANCE:

Instructional materials are authentic to the five arts' disciplines and relevant to the students of New Mexico.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials make verbatim statements of the standards in the text with no teacher guidance on how they should be presenting the material to students. A supplement to the material was provided that is authentic for New Mexico students but no other opportunities are present in the text to engage students with authentic New Mexico cultural experiences. There are no specific examples of New Mexico artists or their produced artwork.

FOCUS AREA 4 SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORTS:

Instructional materials include instructional strategies that facilitate students' development as they build on prior knowledge and internalize new information.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Teacher materials, which are denoted by a butterfly image, do not provide coherent learning progression across the text. Materials do not specifically include information on the arts disciplines, but do contain coloring pages and instrument crafting. Teacher support in three-dimensional learning and connecting with students' background knowledge in the content area are not explicitly stated. Common student misconceptions and suggestions to address them are minimally addressed and usually focus on vocal technique instead of content standards. Materials include opportunities for speaking, reading, and writing across the text, but there are no opportunities for the teacher to guide students to share their knowledge and experiences in relation to the topic at the beginning of an instructional unit.

All Content Review - Materials are reviewed against relevant criteria pertaining to the support for teachers and students in the material regarding the progression of the standards, lesson structure, pacing, assessment, individual learners and cultural relevance.

Average Score
25%

FOCUS AREA 1 COHERENCE:

Instructional materials are coherent and consistent with the New Mexico Content Standards that all students should study in order to be college- and career-ready.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Instructional materials address the full content in terms of music terminology and academic vocabulary and skills, but do not support students in making meaning or relating context and intent to musical selections. There are opportunities for students to perform, write and analyze notation but these are not presented with coherence or consistency, nor are they meaningfully connected to the standards. The materials do not indicate how students will demonstrate mastery other than the completion of the activities. While the materials use grade-appropriate language and concepts for most musical concepts, the history lessons are at a much higher academic language level.

FOCUS AREA 2 WELL-DESIGNED LESSONS:

Instructional materials take into account effective lesson structure and pacing.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

The material does not provide clear learning progressions that are aligned to the New Mexico Core Arts Standards. A Table of Contents is provided, where the lessons are grouped into units by foundational concepts such as Vocal Techniques and Rhythm. The lessons provided in those units do not always reflect the unit title. For example, there are composer biographies in the middle of a unit that are unrelated to the lesson, and the instructions within a lesson page do not connect to the content. There are no clear and measurable content and language objectives. Objectives are not explicitly stated and must be inferred by the teacher through analysis of the lesson. Content-specific vocabulary is taught in isolation of the text. There is a glossary provided at the end of the book, but it does not contain every content-specific vocabulary word introduced in the material. Cognitive learning strategies are used exclusively in the material; there are no strategies provided for social or emotional learning in connection with the text.

FOCUS AREA 3 RESOURCES FOR PLANNING:

Instructional materials provide teacher resources to support planning, learning, and understanding of the New Mexico Content Standards.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

There is a list of lessons in the Table of Contents. There is no indication how these lessons align or cross-reference with the standards. Estimated instructional time and cogent organization of concepts into chapter and unit are not present. The materials include instructions to the teacher on what to address in terms of guiding students' academic development, particularly with vocal production, but there are no actual strategies for teachers to use. At times the materials include several pages in a row of the same general topic, but the activities do not build on prior knowledge or purposefully sequence the learning activities toward mastery in reference to the standards. There are audio and video recordings to support student learning but no interactive digital components for these materials.

FOCUS AREA 4 ASSESSMENT:

Instructional materials offer teachers a variety of assessment resources and tools to collect ongoing data about student progress related to the standards.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Materials do not provide a variety of assessments that measure student progress in all strands of the standards. Unit instructions do not culminate in formative assessment or allow students to demonstrate mastery of the content. Instructional materials do not provide scoring guides for assessments that are aligned with the standards they address, nor do they offer teachers guidance in interpreting student performance and suggestions for further instruction, differentiation, remediation and/or acceleration. Appropriate assessment alternatives for English Learners, Culturally and Linguistically Diverse students, advanced students, and special needs students are not present. There are audio and video examples for instruction, but technology is not used to collect assessment data.

FOCUS AREA 5 EXTENSIVE SUPPORT:

Instructional materials give all students extensive opportunities and support to explore key concepts.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

There is no reference to diverse student populations in these materials in terms of repertoire, strategies, accommodations or modifications. Within the materials, there are opportunities to read, listen, write, color and move to music. However, there are no specific instructions on how to adapt the materials to accommodate different student populations. There are no specific strategies to meet needs of students working below proficiency or those of advanced learners, nor strategies or accommodations for English Language Learners, culturally and linguistically diverse students, or other special populations. There are no strategies or resources for teachers to inform or engage parents, family members or caregivers about the program or how they can help support student progress and achievement. The materials do not provide opportunities for students that encourage or support creative thinking or effective problem-solving skills.

FOCUS AREA 6 CULTURAL AND LINGUISTIC PERSPECTIVES:

Instructional materials represent a variety of cultural and linguistic perspectives.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

The instructional materials are not written through a culturally and linguistically responsive lens. The knowledge, experiences, and backgrounds of the students are not affirmed in the materials as assets to either the teacher or their peers. Diverse perspectives, non-traditional roles, and marginalized communities are not explicitly discussed in relation to musical representation and relevance. There are songs in the material that reinforce generalizations and stereotypes. There are no supports for teachers on how to value home language as a resource for learning content, recognizing students' background knowledge or interests, or how to activate those for disciplinary learning.

FOCUS AREA 7 INCLUSION OF CULTURALLY AND LINGUISTICALLY RESPONSIVE LENS:

Instructional materials highlight diversity in culture and language through multiple perspectives.

Statements of appraisal and supporting evidence:

Instructional materials do not include tools and resources that demonstrate multiple cultural perspectives in a specific concept. No explicit teacher guidance is provided to engage students in critical reflection about their own lives and societies, including cultures past and present in New Mexico. Instructional materials do not address multiple ethnic descriptions, interpretations, or perspectives of events and experiences. Materials do not relate the content area to diversity in culture and language, nor provide any guidance to teachers on how to plan for instruction that is culturally and linguistically responsive.

Reviewers' Professional Summary - These materials are reviewed by Level II and Level III educators from across New Mexico. The reviewers have brought their knowledge, experience and expertise into the review of these materials. They offer here their individual summary of the material as a whole.

Reviewer #: 55

Background and experience:

Reviewer #55 is a Level III-A TESOL certified teacher with a Bachelor of Arts in Music and a Master of Arts in Teaching. Reviewer #55 has been a New Mexico teacher for 21 years, with experiences in teaching K-12 general music, band, choir, and guitar. They currently teach elementary general music, elementary band, and elementary choir.

Professional summary of material:

My Music Journal for Fourth Grade has lessons that address basic music concepts such as beat, rhythm, and vocal technique. There are activities that allow for students to compose and improvise musical ideas. Students do not have an opportunity to choose their own music based upon their preferences, the audience, or the intended purpose. Opportunities for modification or adaptation of the material to meet the needs of different levels/types of learners is not evident. *My Music Journal for Fourth Grade* contains material that is grade level appropriate, such as tempo and dynamics, but there are also songs and lessons that have already appeared in the lower grade level texts and are repeated, leading to a lesson that is below grade level. Composer biographies are placed in musical units without any connection to the unit theme, and are written at a reading level that is above grade level. The material contains several lessons for which class access to a piano lab is necessary, something that is very rare for the average general music classroom. The materials are not written through a cultural and linguistically responsive lens.

Reviewer #: 56

Background and experience:

Reviewer 56 has taught K-5 elementary music for 12 years. They have a Bachelor's and Master's in Music Education. Reviewer 56 is certified in Orff-Schulwerk, Kodaly, World Music Drumming, First Steps in Music, and Conversational Solfege.

Professional summary of material:

The instructional materials focus on singing technique. There are numerous references to proper posture, breathing, and diction. Vocal technical skill development is present throughout the materials. Many lessons are devoted exclusively to developing the singing voice in the middle of an unrelated instructional unit. There are errors throughout the materials in vocabulary definitions and composer biographies. As a combined student and teacher text, student narratives are written academically and above appropriate grade-level literacy. In teacher directions, guidance is limited and non-specific in how the teacher is to present material to students to support critical thinking. Movement activities are unrelated to the sequence of content being taught in the lesson. There is no scope or sequence given in the materials, no suggestions of lesson duration, and no clearly marked lessons. Materials do not offer accommodations for English Learners, Culturally and Linguistically Diverse students, advanced students, and special needs students.

Reviewer #: R57

Background and experience:

Reviewer #57 is a Level III-A TESOL certified teacher with a Bachelor of Music Education and a Master of Arts in Music Theory. They have taught PreK-5/6 elementary general music mainly in dual language and bilingual schools in New Mexico since 2007 as well as elementary band and choir. This reviewer wrote and presented elementary general music curricula for arts organizations in New Mexico and California for 7 years.

Professional summary of material:

This volume of *My Music Journal* includes a wide range of content-specific vocabulary and musical concepts appropriate to grade 4. There are opportunities for reading, writing and performing throughout, as well as historical and stylistic information about various composers and genres of music. There is a lack of any connection to context, purpose, and engagement with music. There is little opportunity for representation of students' home language or culture or evidence of culturally or linguistically responsive pedagogy, nor are there strategies for supporting diverse student populations via alternative lessons, content or assessments. The materials are a collection of songs and activities that are at a variety of grade-levels. These materials support students working below grade level or at a more advanced level. Although technical and content-specific concepts are covered, the manner in which creativity is informed by experience and related as an art form through expressive and technical understanding of music is not included in these materials.