

BEFORE THE PUBLIC EDUCATION COMMISSION

STATE OF NEW MEXICO

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

OPEN PUBLIC MEETING

December 16, 2022

9:00 a.m.

Jerry Apodaca Education Building, Mabry Hall

300 Don Gaspar Avenue

Santa Fe, New Mexico

AND

Via Zoom Webinar Video Teleconference

REPORTED BY: Cynthia C. Chapman, RMR-CRR, NM CCR #219

Bean & Associates, Inc.

Professional Court Reporting Service

201 Third Street, NW, Suite 1630

Albuquerque, New Mexico 87102

JOB NO.: 6338N (CC)

2

1 APPEARANCES

2 COMMISSIONERS:

3 REBEKKA BURT, Chair

4 GLENNA VOIGT, Vice Chair

5 MELISSA ARMIJO, Secretary

6 STEVEN CARRILLO, Member

7 MICHAEL CHAVEZ, Member

8 PATRICIA GIPSON, Member

9 KT MANIS, Member

10 DAVID ROBBINS, Member

11

12 PED STAFF:

13

14 CORINA CHAVEZ Director

15 Charter School/Options for

16 Parents and Families Division

17

18 BRIGETTE RUSSELL, Deputy Director, Options for

19 Parents and Families

20 MISSY BROWN Technical Assistance and Support and

21 Training Administrator

22 Charter School/Options for

23 Parents and Families Division

24

25 LUCY VALENZUELA Technical Assistance and

26 Training Coordinator

27 Charter School/Options for

28 Parents and Families Division

29

30 COUNSEL TO THE PEC:

31 JULIA HOSFORD BARNES, ESQ.

32 Barnes Mediation and Law, PC

33 200 W. DeVargas Street, Suite 7

34 Santa Fe, New Mexico 87501

35

4

1 INDEX TO PROCEEDINGS, Continued

2 PAGE

3 16 Report from the Chair 299

4 17 Recognition of Outgoing Commissioners 309

5 18 PEC Comments 342

6 19 Adjourn 343

7 REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE 346

8 ATTACHMENT:

9 1 Meeting Attendance Sheet

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

3

1 INDEX TO PROCEEDINGS

2 PAGE

3 1 Call to Order, Roll Call, 5

4 Pledge of Allegiance, and

5 Salute to the New Mexico Flag

6

7 2 Approval of PEC Meeting Agenda 6

8

9 3 Open Forum 7

10

11 4 Consent Agenda 27

12

13 5 Discussion and Possible Action on Item(s) 28

14 Removed from the Consent Agenda - Moot

15 6 Introduction of New Head Administrators 28

16 7 Discussion and Possible Action on 33

17 La Tierra Montessori School Intervention

18 Ladder

19 8 Discussion and Possible Action on 173

20 Cesar Chavez Community School

21 Education Program Amendment

22 9 Discussion and Possible Action on 261

23 Hózhó Academy Mission Statement Amendment

24

25 10 Discussion and Possible Action on 132

26 Mission Achievement and Success Charter

27 School Enrollment Cap Amendment

28

29 11 Discussion and Possible Action on 272

30 Approval of Amendment Forms and

31 Implementation of Forms on a Temporary Basis

32 (Final Approval of Amendment Forms at a Later

33 Time to Align with New Contract)

34

35 12 Report from Charter Schools Division 275

36

37 13 Discussion and Possible Action on 278

38 PEC Calendar for 2023

39 14 Discussion and Possible Action on PEC 283

40 Legislative Recommendations

41

42 15 Reports from PEC Liaisons 288

5

1 THE CHAIR: All right. Good morning,

2 everybody. Good morning. It is 9:02 a.m., and I

3 will call the meeting to order. And I'll send it

4 over to Secretary Armijo for roll call.

5 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Good morning.

6 Secretary Armijo is here.

7 Chair Burt.

8 THE CHAIR: Here.

9 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner

10 Carrillo.

11 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Here.

12 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Chavez.

13 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Here.

14 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Davis.

15 (No responses.)

16 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Gipson.

17 COMMISSIONER GIPSON: Here.

18 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Manis.

19 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Here.

20 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner

21 Robbins.

22 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Here.

23 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Taylor.

24 (No response.)

25 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: And Vice Chair

6

1 Voigt.
 2 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Here.
 3 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: We have eight
 4 present. We have a quorum.
 5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Secretary Armijo.
 6 Next we'll go to the Pledge of Allegiance,
 7 led by Commissioner Manis, and the Salute to the
 8 New Mexico Flag, led by Commissioner Carrillo.
 9 (Pledge of Allegiance and Salute to
 10 the New Mexico Flag conducted.)
 11 THE CHAIR: All right. The next item is
 12 Approval of the PEC Meeting Agenda. And I will move
 13 to approve the PEC Meeting agenda.
 14 COMMISSIONER GIPSON: Second.
 15 THE CHAIR: Thank you. There's a second.
 16 Any discussion or comment from
 17 Commissioners?
 18 (No response.)
 19 THE CHAIR: Seeing none, Secretary Armijo,
 20 if you could call roll.
 21 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Chair Burt.
 22 THE CHAIR: Yes.
 23 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner
 24 Carrillo.
 25 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Yes.

7

1 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Chavez.
 2 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes.
 3 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Gipson.
 4 COMMISSIONER GIPSON: Yes.
 5 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Manis.
 6 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Yes.
 7 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner
 8 Robbins.
 9 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes.
 10 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Vice Chair Voigt.
 11 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes.
 12 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: And Secretary Armijo
 13 votes yes.
 14 It passes, eight to zero.
 15 THE CHAIR: Thank you. Next item is Open
 16 Forum. I believe we have nine people signed up to
 17 speak.
 18 So we will ask that speakers spend no more
 19 than two minutes on their comments. And I will
 20 allow some flexibility for Ms. Brown to get
 21 people -- we do have people in person and online, so
 22 we'll be moving people in and out that way.
 23 MS. MISSY BROWN: Okay. Thank you, Chair.
 24 We will start with people present in Mabry Hall.
 25 And you'll come up to this microphone, please.

8

1 First, we have Mateo -- and I'm going to
 2 ask you to please spell your last name. I'm not
 3 going to attempt to spell -- to say your last name.
 4 FROM THE FLOOR: Can I sit out for just a
 5 moment?
 6 MS. MISSY BROWN: Is Peter Lorenz, then --
 7 okay. Mateo.
 8 FROM THE FLOOR: I'm Peter Lorenz.
 9 P-e-t-e-r L-o-r-e-n-z.
 10 Good morning, Commissioners. I'm the
 11 Chair of the Board of Directors for the Greater
 12 Albuquerque Chamber of Commerce. I'm also the CEO
 13 of UniRac, which is a leading manufacturer of solar
 14 (inaudible) in North America. And I am a founding
 15 member -- board member of Solare Collegiate Charter
 16 School in the South Valley of Albuquerque.
 17 So good to see you guys again. Hopefully,
 18 I can take five seconds to thank you for your
 19 service. I saw your agenda, and it's very admirable
 20 what you guys do for our kids. Thank you.
 21 I want to express our support for MAS
 22 Charter School and its request for an enrollment cap
 23 increase.
 24 And why am I passionate about coming here
 25 to Albuquerque this morning and express my support?

9

1 Great public schools and great education
 2 leaders need supporters in their corner. They need
 3 people to tell them they've done a good job and
 4 people who encourage and help them expand the impact
 5 they have on others.
 6 That is what the Chamber is to MAS. Our
 7 business community recognizes and values their
 8 success and believes it will make for stronger
 9 children, stronger economy, and a stronger community
 10 in our city.
 11 And we feel you have a similar opportunity
 12 in front of you today as well, to tell a school that
 13 is working wonders for children and families, that
 14 they are appreciated and eagerly will come to serve
 15 and impact hundreds and hundreds of more children.
 16 So a couple of thoughts.
 17 MAS, I believe we all recognize, has an
 18 outstanding track record, and they have a great
 19 leader, a great team, and a culture that has made
 20 for successful expansion.
 21 So for the sake of time, I might cut my --
 22 my comments on the track record short. I'm sure
 23 others will speak on it.
 24 But I want to talk about the school and
 25 the inspirational leader they have in JoAnn

10	<p>1 Mitchell. JoAnn has put the right team in place. 2 She has set the right expectations with her team for 3 what success looks like. And she has built a school 4 culture with teachers, students, and their families 5 that is inspiring. 6 I attended MAS' signing event with seniors 7 and their families last May. 8 MS. MISSY BROWN: That's time. 9 FROM THE FLOOR: It was an inspiring 10 evening and a memory I won't forget. Leaders like 11 JoAnn are hard to find, and we should support her. 12 Thank you. That was a fast two minutes. 13 MS. MISSY BROWN: I'm sorry. And I do 14 wait until after you guys spell your name, so... 15 I'm going to alternate the people on line, 16 so I'm going to move Forrest Verde-Dudek to the 17 panel. 18 Again, please spell your name for the 19 court reporter, and then you have two minutes. 20 FROM THE PUBLIC: I missed what you were 21 saying after you said you were moving me to the 22 panel. 23 MS. MISSY BROWN: Please spell your name 24 for the court reporter and then I will start the 25 timer and you have two minutes.</p>	12	<p>1 governing council, the president of the governing 2 council has cut me off. He has insinuated that I'm 3 out of order for bringing this up in those meetings. 4 There has been no real clear communication 5 from the school from the interim head learner, from 6 the governing council on this matter. 7 The teacher who called me to notify me 8 that my son was assaulted called me on his personal 9 cell phone, because the interim head learner would 10 not call on the official school line to notify me. 11 That teacher who used his personal cell phone has 12 now been fired. He is no longer at the school. 13 The school is in crisis. This is not the 14 only event that took place, but this is the one 15 that's most personal for me. 16 THE CHAIR: Sir, if you could wrap up your 17 comments at this time. 18 FROM THE FLOOR: Yes. Absolutely. 19 Currently, the only recourse we have is a 20 petition to recall the current governing council 21 president. And the only reason why I haven't 22 withdrawn my children from the school is so that 23 their enrollment and my signature still matters on 24 that petition. Thank you for the time. 25 MS. MISSY BROWN: Thank you. Next we will</p>
11	<p>1 FROM THE PUBLIC: Okay. Thank you. My 2 name is Forrest Verde-Dudek. It's spelled 3 F-o-r-r-e-s-t V-e-r-d-e D-u-d-e-k. Thank you. 4 I'm a parent of three students at 5 La Tierra Montessori School outside of Española. On 6 November 2nd, my son, my seven-year-old son, was 7 assaulted by a staff member at the school. 8 It's been six weeks now since the event, 9 and I still have no clear answers from the school 10 regarding the event. 11 The interim head learner and president of 12 the governing council of the school have been very 13 obstructive in this process. 14 Excuse me. I'm sorry. 15 We organized a student walkout of students 16 and parents to -- to address the issue. I've 17 written countless letters to the governing council 18 to step in, because the interim head learner has not 19 provided proper documentation. The staff member who 20 assaulted my son is still on campus with other 21 students. I have had to remove my children from the 22 school for their safety. 23 Excuse me. 24 And every meeting that I've encountered 25 this discussion in trying to address it with the</p>	13	<p>1 go back to in person, and Mateo -- and if you could 2 please -- I'm not going to even try -- if you could 3 please spell your first and last name, and I will 4 start the timer when you're done spelling. 5 FROM THE FLOOR: Thank you. Madam Chair 6 and Commissioners, we truly appreciate all of your 7 work. 8 My name is Mateo Peixinho. It's 9 Portuguese. That's M-a-t-e-o P-e-i-x-i-n-h-o. 10 Thank you. 11 I'm here today with a heavy heart. I have 12 had students enrolled in the school since the day it 13 opened. My daughter is 21, and she's now an 14 educator in Albuquerque. She -- after-school 15 program. She's going to school as well. And she 16 attended NMSA. 17 My 17-year-old is about to graduate from 18 NMSA. And I have my son with me today. He's been 19 following this process quite closely, a lesson in 20 civics. And he's 13 and will be hopefully going to 21 NMSA next year. So this school has been a part of 22 our family for -- since its inception. 23 I'm a general contractor in the Valley of 24 Española. And I was president of the PTA when the 25 school first started and was vice president of the</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">14</p> <p>1 PTA. And I always organized work parties and had 2 great relationships with governing councils -- 3 governing council presidents, of course, had to 4 coordinate with head learners and principals, you 5 know. It's just -- it's part of our community, and 6 a school like this can only function in a community 7 like ours with community support. 8 Unfortunately, we are having a massive 9 crisis of leadership is the only way I can describe 10 it. I have not participated as much in the school 11 as I used to because I also work with the homeless 12 shelter locally and have a company, 18 employees, 13 that I run. 14 And then last June, things just went off 15 track. And I've been monitoring what's been 16 happening and hoping for the best. And, come 17 November, the very beginning of November, when 18 Mr. Krane was put on administrative leave, I just 19 called a group of parents together to hear what -- 20 because we're all hearing rumors from our kids. 21 It's the only information we had. Called parents 22 together -- is that my time already? 23 MS. MISSY BROWN: (Inaudible.) 24 FROM THE FLOOR: Okay. And the list of 25 issues was so huge. No special ed. Lunches are</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">16</p> <p>1 On the -- okay. On the lunches, so, first off, I 2 want to say that I'm a vegetarian, and at the 3 school, there is nothing healthy for me. I am fed 4 breakfast for lunch. When I see my classmates 5 eating burgers every day and raw chicken nuggets, 6 that's when I say I am not going to eat. 7 And there are so many others that have 8 said that, too. 9 And number two, my teacher, whenever he 10 was fired or quit or whatever -- and I don't know 11 the story -- my classmates were willing to protest 12 against the school, because it's not fair that he 13 was fired. 14 And since I don't know the story, I'm not 15 going to speak much on that. But I know it's 16 probably not a good one. 17 MS. MISSY BROWN: Are you finished with 18 your comment? You muted yourself. 19 Okay. We'll move to Benjamin Pearce. 20 FROM THE FLOOR: Good morning. My name is 21 Benjamin Pearce. B-e-n-j-a-m-i-n P-e-a-r-c-e. 22 And I'm another parent with La Tierra 23 Montessori School of the Arts and Sciences. I want 24 to say thank you for your time, honorable council 25 and Commission.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">15</p> <p>1 horrible. My son doesn't really complain about 2 lunches, but -- the -- no one at school to greet 3 children, you know. The place is a mess. We 4 parents are available to help, and we want to help. 5 We want our school to be better. 6 We don't want to waste your time with this 7 conversation. I wish I was saying what the previous 8 presenter said about how beautiful the school is, 9 because that's what I would have said a year ago. 10 We are a community in recovery. We're 11 trying to make our community better. Schools are 12 vital. 13 We appreciate your help. I'm really here 14 to beg your help on how we as a community could 15 recall this head learner and reclaim our school for 16 the purpose of our students, 'cause we love them, 17 you know. 18 Thank you. 19 MS. MISSY BROWN: Next to speak is Ixchel 20 Dudek. And I am promoting you to the panel. Please 21 spell your first and last name for the court 22 reporter. 23 You can go ahead and spell your name and 24 make your comment. 25 FROM THE PUBLIC: I-x-c-h-e-l D-u-d-e-c.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">17</p> <p>1 Our school is in a desperate need -- 2 desperate need of help. The students don't want to 3 go to school. They're not experiencing a full 4 education. 5 The teachers are depressed and dreading to 6 work. 7 The -- the administrative faculty is 8 stressed beyond belief. 9 I would like today to ask the Commission 10 to please, whatever methods are available, if they 11 could provide some guidance and instruction to the 12 governing board to improve our school and bring it 13 to what it should be, what it can be. 14 The past year when we first started our 15 children in the school, it was great. And then 16 there has been a lot of turmoil since the beginning 17 of June that has caused the quality of education, 18 Montessori leadership, Montessori style, to 19 disappear from the school. 20 When parents have gotten together to just 21 talk and figure out what's going on and what we can 22 do to help with the school, we've been met with 23 veiled threats from members of the governing council 24 that have shown there's -- I really don't know what 25 to say about it. It's sad.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">18</p> <p>1 We've reached out to the members of the 2 governing council and asked, "Please -- can we know 3 what's going on. Can somebody speak with us?" 4 And we've been -- we've received letters 5 stating that just by asking the governing council to 6 say something, that a group of private citizens 7 meeting to just try to figure out what's going on 8 and try to figure out some sort of solution and what 9 exactly could be helped, would be interfering with 10 investigations. 11 We have been threatened with violations of 12 FERPA for some reason by the administration, when a 13 parent speaking freely about their child by basic 14 definition and common sense cannot violate FERPA. 15 The governing board -- the governing 16 council of LTMAS desperately needs to be -- to 17 receive guidance, education, and something to 18 restore the faith in the community and the faith 19 that we can send our students to school where they 20 want to go, where the staff isn't walking on 21 eggshells, the administration isn't stressed out and 22 going insane, and more communication from the 23 governing council. 24 I know I'm not as verbose as everybody, 25 but I just need to ask this Commission to please</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">20</p> <p>1 true that Roger Montoya and I are listed as 2 cofounders at the school, there are many more 3 individuals who contributed to the effort in the 4 seven years it took from a vision I had to offer 5 something truly different to the children of 6 Española, New Mexico. 7 One of those individuals was named Noel 8 Amador Madrid, and he called me mom. Though he was 9 the son of my best friend and fellow Montessorian, 10 Prairie Rose Quintana. 11 Noel as a young child was passionate and 12 articulate regarding his views on the rights of 13 children. Guided by his inner voice and other 14 things like the UN Declaration on the Rights of 15 Children and like the framework of the Sudbury 16 Democratic Schools, and like the philosophical 17 foundation of Montessori education, Noel became a 18 passionate advocate for any avenue that the school 19 could put in place that would allow him permission 20 to use his voice, his words, his thoughts, his 21 feelings, his education. 22 He purposed us to make sure that we were 23 including these things in our charter. He demanded 24 it, along with his demands for adults to show him, 25 through actions, how to deal with the realities of</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">19</p> <p>1 help our school and to please, in whatever ways 2 possible, provide better guidance to the governing 3 council. 4 And I would like -- I would like to say 5 again, thank you, honorable Commissioners for your 6 time and for listening to us today. Thank you. 7 MS. MISSY BROWN: Next on the list is 8 Prairie Boulmier. I'm promoting you to the panel. 9 Please spell your name, and you'll have two minutes. 10 FROM THE PUBLIC: Hi. Can you hear me? 11 MS. MISSY BROWN: Yes, we can. 12 FROM THE FLOOR: All right. My name is 13 Prairie Boulmier. P-r-a-i-r-i-e B-o-u-l-m-i-e-r. 14 Got it? 15 MS. MISSY BROWN: Yes. Thank you. 16 FROM THE PUBLIC: All right. I'm going to 17 try and talk fast. And I have written a speech 18 which I hope to be able to get through in two 19 minutes. 20 Ladies and gentlemen, Commissioners of the 21 Public Education Commission of the State of New 22 Mexico, thank you for allowing me to speak. 23 I'd like to outline to you a vision that I 24 have, a Montessori unit lesson in civics. 25 First a little background. While it is</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">21</p> <p>1 the world that he found himself in. 2 When I saw the pictures of the students of 3 La Tierra Montessori school in the Rio Grande Sun 4 with signs saying, "We want Montessori," "Where is 5 our teacher?", "You failed us," I just broke down. 6 We cannot ask Noel what he thinks of the students 7 speaking out democratically for himself because he 8 is gone. He is a lost -- he is a -- a -- a lost 9 soul to La Tierra. He is no longer with us on the 10 planet to ask. 11 MS. MISSY BROWN: Please wrap up your 12 comments. 13 FROM THE PUBLIC: Thank you. Ladies and 14 gentlemen, we are in the middle of a Montessori unit 15 study on civics. And I ask the PEC to -- to allow 16 these children to have a good unit study, where they 17 can see that there is an avenue for their voices to 18 be heard and for them to participate in their own 19 education, according to the charter. And if it 20 cannot be so, I ask that you take steps to revoke 21 the charter of La Tierra Montessori School of the 22 Arts and Sciences. Thank you again for allowing me 23 to speak. 24 MS. MISSY BROWN: Next on the list is 25 Melissa Salazar. Please spell your name for the</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">22</p> <p>1 court reporter.</p> <p>2 FROM THE FLOOR: Good morning,</p> <p>3 Commissioners. Thank you for time to speak. My</p> <p>4 name is Dr. Melissa Salazar. It's M-e-l-i-s-s-a.</p> <p>5 Last name is S-a-l-a-z-a-r.</p> <p>6 Thank you so much for all you do for the</p> <p>7 State of New Mexico and for charter schools.</p> <p>8 I am here as a parent of a fourth-grade</p> <p>9 student at La Tierra Montessori School outside of</p> <p>10 Española. I am speaking on behalf of my</p> <p>11 ten-year-old who is in fourth grade currently, and</p> <p>12 he's actually at school today because he loves the</p> <p>13 school.</p> <p>14 So I'm going to tell you why he loves to</p> <p>15 go there and why I hope this school can recover from</p> <p>16 the crisis it's in.</p> <p>17 He has autism as well as a number of other</p> <p>18 special education needs. And I have had him at five</p> <p>19 elementary schools. This is his fifth elementary</p> <p>20 school.</p> <p>21 We made a pact this year that Montessori</p> <p>22 education was going to be a good fit for him and</p> <p>23 that we would do everything possible to make this</p> <p>24 school work for him.</p> <p>25 He absolutely loves Montessori based</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">24</p> <p>1 it survive, because we don't have any options here</p> <p>2 in Española except for me to leave our community,</p> <p>3 which I refuse to do.</p> <p>4 So I'm here fighting for him to have a</p> <p>5 school where he doesn't have to have a long-term sub</p> <p>6 or no staff at all at the door when we enter.</p> <p>7 MS. MISSY BROWN: That's time. Thank you.</p> <p>8 FROM THE FLOOR: Thank you for your time.</p> <p>9 Thank you.</p> <p>10 MS. MISSY BROWN: Next we have Peter</p> <p>11 Botting. Remember to please spell your first and</p> <p>12 last name.</p> <p>13 FROM THE PUBLIC: Good morning. My name</p> <p>14 is Peter, P-e-t-e-r, Botting, B-o-t-t-i-n-g.</p> <p>15 Am I coming through clearly? Looks like</p> <p>16 it from my end.</p> <p>17 MS. MISSY BROWN: Yes, you are. Go ahead.</p> <p>18 Thank you.</p> <p>19 FROM THE FLOOR: Thank you. Good morning.</p> <p>20 I, too -- as you can see, I'm a parent of an</p> <p>21 LTMAS -- La Tierra Montessori Arts and Sciences --</p> <p>22 as well.</p> <p>23 As you have experienced, there's a pretty</p> <p>24 good presence of us who aren't exactly thrilled with</p> <p>25 the way our school is serving us as parents, its --</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">23</p> <p>1 education, and he has thrived for the very first</p> <p>2 time in his ten years.</p> <p>3 And as a parent -- if any of you are</p> <p>4 parents, you know what it's like when your student</p> <p>5 isn't thriving at school and all the things that go</p> <p>6 with that. He has cried every day of third grade,</p> <p>7 second grade, first grade, and kindergarten. This</p> <p>8 is the first place he doesn't cry.</p> <p>9 So I want the school to succeed. And I'm</p> <p>10 speaking on behalf of seeing a school that is</p> <p>11 collapsing because of the lack of leadership by our</p> <p>12 governing council.</p> <p>13 I am an educator myself. I have a Ph.D.</p> <p>14 in education. I have supervised teachers in the</p> <p>15 Valley. I have trained teachers out of Northern</p> <p>16 College. I have also coached teachers throughout</p> <p>17 Northern New Mexico for the last 15 years.</p> <p>18 I have never seen anything like what I see</p> <p>19 inside the building of La Tierra. I see a lack of</p> <p>20 qualified staff. I see full-time subs that are not</p> <p>21 being communicated to parents, and I see very little</p> <p>22 to no communication to parents about who is teaching</p> <p>23 their children and what is being learned inside.</p> <p>24 So I say all this with this double-edged</p> <p>25 sword. My son loves the school, and I'd like to see</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">25</p> <p>1 the way it's serving our children, and the way it's</p> <p>2 serving lunch.</p> <p>3 Generically speaking, as an observing</p> <p>4 parent, I haven't been trying to do the interactions</p> <p>5 the way some of the former speakers have, just</p> <p>6 because my days are different, you know. I've</p> <p>7 got -- I've got to focus elsewhere.</p> <p>8 My hope is that by sheer numbers and by</p> <p>9 sheer presence that you will choose to, as the</p> <p>10 board, undertake a review of what's going on.</p> <p>11 Part of the biggest problem that we're</p> <p>12 having is we don't know what recourse is. To review</p> <p>13 and recall a member of a charter, it takes</p> <p>14 33 percent of the student body parents, but yet it</p> <p>15 also takes a vote by the people who we're trying to</p> <p>16 recall.</p> <p>17 We merely ask that in your oversight</p> <p>18 capacity that you bring us back to a Montessori</p> <p>19 school where the needs of the kids are provided for,</p> <p>20 the needs of the teachers are supportive --</p> <p>21 supported, and communication with the parents</p> <p>22 becomes more proactive and active.</p> <p>23 Thank you for your time. Thank you for</p> <p>24 your service. And I yield back.</p> <p>25 MS. MISSY BROWN: Thank you. You were</p>

26	<p>1 spot-on your time there.</p> <p>2 Our last speaker today is in person, and</p> <p>3 it is Mr. Matt Pahl.</p> <p>4 MR. MATT PAHL: Good morning, Madam Chair</p> <p>5 and Commissioners. My name is Matt Pahl, M-a-t-t</p> <p>6 P-a-h-l.</p> <p>7 I'm speaking at Public Comment this</p> <p>8 morning, which I don't normally do, because I missed</p> <p>9 the afternoon of the Work Session yesterday.</p> <p>10 And when you went over your forms, I</p> <p>11 thought Patty Matthews gave great feedback on behalf</p> <p>12 of charters at large, and particularly her clients.</p> <p>13 But I did see something in one of the</p> <p>14 forms that I just wanted to share with you as you</p> <p>15 get to that item, which is on the Enrollment Cap</p> <p>16 Increase form. At the very bottom of it, it's like</p> <p>17 the standard documents that must be put in there.</p> <p>18 One of them, at least on the version that I saw on</p> <p>19 the G Drive, said, "Meet NMCI."</p> <p>20 And I don't think there's anything to meet</p> <p>21 there. NMCI is the condition index from PSFA.</p> <p>22 And just wanted to flag it. If it makes</p> <p>23 sense to you all, we can figure that out. But did</p> <p>24 want to flag it, because I think that could be just</p> <p>25 kind of a weird hurdle in the way. So just wanted</p>	28	<p>1 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Manis.</p> <p>2 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Yes.</p> <p>3 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner</p> <p>4 Robbins.</p> <p>5 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes.</p> <p>6 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Vice Chair Voigt.</p> <p>7 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes.</p> <p>8 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Secretary Armijo</p> <p>9 votes yes.</p> <p>10 And Chair Burt.</p> <p>11 THE CHAIR: Yes.</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: That passes, eight</p> <p>13 to zero.</p> <p>14 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Secretary Armijo.</p> <p>15 Seeing as there's no items removed from</p> <p>16 the Consent Agenda, that will take us to Item 6,</p> <p>17 Introduction of New Head Administrators. If there's</p> <p>18 anyone on -- I know we just --</p> <p>19 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Can we (inaudible)</p> <p>20 and come back? Because there is someone that needs</p> <p>21 to be --</p> <p>22 THE CHAIR: Okay. I can try to do that.</p> <p>23 What's the name?</p> <p>24 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: (Inaudible.)</p> <p>25 THE CHAIR: Okay.</p>
27	<p>1 to flag that for your future discussion today.</p> <p>2 And with my one minute left, I'll just say</p> <p>3 thank you for all your work this week. So I'll have</p> <p>4 more compliments for you later today. So thank you.</p> <p>5 MS. MISSY BROWN: Madame Chair, that is</p> <p>6 all the Public Comment.</p> <p>7 THE CHAIR: Thank you so much, Missy.</p> <p>8 All right. That will take us to Item 4,</p> <p>9 which is the Consent Agenda. And I will move</p> <p>10 approval of the Consent Agenda.</p> <p>11 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Second.</p> <p>12 THE CHAIR: Thank you. There's a motion</p> <p>13 and a second.</p> <p>14 Any discussion that needs to happen on</p> <p>15 consent agenda?</p> <p>16 (No response.)</p> <p>17 THE CHAIR: Great. All right.</p> <p>18 Secretary Armijo, if you could take roll.</p> <p>19 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: I can.</p> <p>20 Commissioner Carrillo.</p> <p>21 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Yeah.</p> <p>22 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Chavez.</p> <p>23 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes.</p> <p>24 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Gipson.</p> <p>25 COMMISSIONER GIPSON: Yes.</p>	29	<p>1 MS. LUCY VALENZUELA: Chair Burt, her name</p> <p>2 is Dr. Maria Artiaga.</p> <p>3 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: (Off mic.)</p> <p>4 THE CHAIR: Good morning. All right.</p> <p>5 Dr. Artiaga. Did I say it right? Artiaga?</p> <p>6 DR. MARIA ARTIAGA: Yes, that's correct.</p> <p>7 Thank you. Good morning.</p> <p>8 THE CHAIR: Yeah. Good morning. If you</p> <p>9 could introduce yourself to the Commission, and</p> <p>10 congratulations on your new position.</p> <p>11 DR. MARIA ARTIAGA: Thank you. Good</p> <p>12 morning, everyone. My name is Dr. Maria Artiaga. I</p> <p>13 am from Las Cruces, New Mexico, of course. And I am</p> <p>14 very excited to join Raices del Saber Xinachtli</p> <p>15 Community School.</p> <p>16 I worked with Las Cruces Public Schools</p> <p>17 for 30 years. I recently retired from there and</p> <p>18 coming to work -- back to the workforce.</p> <p>19 I have experience in early childhood.</p> <p>20 I've been a kindergarten teacher and Title I</p> <p>21 coordinator, Head Start director, early childhood --</p> <p>22 the executive director of early childhood and of</p> <p>23 federal programs.</p> <p>24 I've also taught in higher education with</p> <p>25 Doña Ana Community College and New Mexico State</p>

30	<p>1 University, preparing our -- our students to be 2 either educational assistants, teachers. Some of 3 them have gone to social work. 4 So I love education. I'm here to support 5 the students from Raíces del Saber Xinachtli School 6 as best as I can, and parents. And thank you for 7 the invite, and I look forward to participating in 8 more meetings such as this one. 9 And then, recently, I'm in Hawaii. My 10 brother is retiring from the Navy today. So I will 11 be joining you for -- this morning, part of the 12 morning, and then getting ready and heading off over 13 there. 14 So thank you very much. 15 Any questions? 16 THE CHAIR: Commissioners, any questions? 17 Comments? 18 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: (Inaudible.) 19 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Voigt. 20 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes. 21 Congratulations, Dr. Artiaga, on your new post. 22 DR. MARIA ARTIAGA: Thank you. 23 THE CHAIR: All right. Yeah, 24 congratulations. We definitely have an opportunity 25 for you to work with us right away.</p>	32	<p>1 DR. MARIA ARTIAGA: Oh, yeah. Yes. 2 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Thanks very much 3 for getting up so early for us. And 4 congratulations. 5 DR. MARIA ARTIAGA: Thank you. There's 6 one more, No. 7. Do I need to stay for that one? 7 THE CHAIR: You can stay as long as you'd 8 like at this point. But you're free to go join your 9 family again. Make sure and tell your -- tell your 10 father -- correct? -- 11 DR. MARIA ARTIAGA: My brother. 12 THE CHAIR: Your brother. Congratulations 13 on the retirement. 14 DR. MARIA ARTIAGA: I sure will. Thank 15 you so much. 16 MS. MISSY BROWN: Thank him for his 17 service. 18 DR. MARIA ARTIAGA: Thank you. 19 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: If I may also say 20 hello to you, Dr. Artiaga, and just mention that 21 Item No. 7 that you're looking at is actually -- 22 it's No. 4, the governing board member changes, is a 23 Consent Agenda item, where you do not have to be 24 here for that. It's pro forma. 25 So we're just -- you won't need to speak,</p>
31	<p>1 We just introduced our new Academic 2 Performance Framework form. So look on the PEC Home 3 Page and take a look at that. There's also a link 4 for you to comment. 5 So just want to make that plug that we 6 already want to collaborate with you right away, and 7 we want to get your opinions on that. 8 Yeah. How exciting. Hope you have safe 9 travels. We're jealous. We'll be here this 10 afternoon, very likely. 11 So while you're off to Hawaii, we'll 12 continue to be in cold Santa Fe. So we hope you 13 enjoy your trip, and congratulations on your 14 appointment. 15 DR. MARIA ARTIAGA: Thank you so much. 16 Yes, I'm already actually in Hawaii. 17 THE CHAIR: Oh. You're in there, Oh. All 18 right. You're already there. 19 DR. MARIA ARTIAGA: My brother -- I'm 20 there. My brother -- his retirement is in a couple 21 of hours. So it's, like -- there's about 30 of us 22 here from New Mexico joining him. 23 THE CHAIR: Oh. Got it. That's one -- 24 well, congratulations on that. And, yeah, it's very 25 early in the morning for you to be joining us.</p>	33	<p>1 but you're welcome to come to any of the Public 2 Education Commission meetings, and I look forward to 3 seeing you in Las Cruces. 4 DR. MARIA ARTIAGA: Sounds good. Looking 5 forward to seeing you as well. Have a good day. 6 THE CHAIR: All right. Thank you. 7 All right. That takes us to Item No. 7 on 8 our agenda, which is Decision and Possible Action on 9 La Tierra Montessori School Intervention Ladder. 10 And I don't know if there will be people 11 coming in online that need to get moved in. But I 12 will be passing this over to Director Chavez. 13 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: Apologies. I 14 closed my window completely, so I'm going to have to 15 cue everything up. 16 MS. MISSY BROWN: In the meantime, 17 Mr. Casados, is there anybody else from your panel 18 that you would like me to promote? 19 MR. ISAAC CASADOS: I believe Patricia 20 Herrera is on, and Brenda Atencio should be on. And 21 I don't know if Charlie Riddick is on as well. 22 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: Okay. 23 Commissioners, Mr. Casados, and everybody from 24 La Tierra, I'm ready to share that today we're 25 providing an update to the PEC, as per the</p>

34	<p>1 expectations that the PEC set forth in August 29th, 2 2022.</p> <p>3 And so part of that was that the PEC 4 wanted some updates on the expectation for the 5 school obtaining training on the charter school's 6 fiscal policies, the roles of the governing board 7 and financial subcommittee and staff.</p> <p>8 And so the update is that as of the 12th 9 of December, four of the five board members 10 completed all three hours of the fiscal training. 11 And there is one member who did not complete all 12 three hours; they completed two of the three hours.</p> <p>13 And if you have any questions about that, 14 I will defer to Ms. Brown, who could provide 15 clarification.</p> <p>16 Any questions? 17 (No response.)</p> <p>18 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: No? Okay. I'll 19 go on.</p> <p>20 The second was that -- the expectation 21 that the board create a budget development plan.</p> <p>22 And nothing was due this month. Last time 23 I reported, La Tierra did submit the enrollment 24 projections, and that was information provided to 25 the PEC.</p>	36	<p>1 to be resolved at the La Tierra -- at the La Tierra 2 level.</p> <p>3 And last night, I --</p> <p>4 THE CHAIR: Director Chavez, just real 5 quick, just -- if you could clarify, you're not 6 talking about me specifically, but the letter from 7 me on behalf of the Commission?</p> <p>8 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: Yes.</p> <p>9 THE CHAIR: Okay. Great. I saw 10 Commissioner Gipson look over at me like, "You did 11 what?"</p> <p>12 In the letter on behalf of the Commission 13 that went from the Chair?</p> <p>14 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: Absolutely. 15 Right. And so the Chair who has raised the concern 16 about the legitimacy about the La Tierra board 17 minutes was actually the La Tierra board chair. 18 Sorry if that wasn't also clear.</p> <p>19 So Mr. Casados said that he would send a 20 letter in response to the Letter of Concern that the 21 PEC sent.</p> <p>22 I just uploaded that. I got it last 23 night. And I apologize, but things at the school 24 have been progressing on a daily basis, and so I 25 don't think that I have had a chance to fully read</p>
35	<p>1 Item No. 3: Notification is required to 2 be submitted to the PEC through the CSD for all 3 governing board member transitions. And as of 4 December 12th, La Tierra has no additional 5 transitions on the governing council membership.</p> <p>6 No. 4 was in regards to the Early 7 Childhood Education program, the Pre-K program. And 8 the PEC was concerned that SEG was being used to 9 implement that program. And as confirmed when we 10 visited the school in September, the school actually 11 ended the Pre-K program.</p> <p>12 The CSD visited the school again in 13 November on November 3rd and did not observe a Pre-K 14 program. So the school has -- has met the 15 requirement there.</p> <p>16 Other updates that I wanted to share. 17 Everybody knows that the school received a 18 Notice of Concern from the PEC November 15th, 2022. 19 The CSD has met with the head administrator and the 20 governing chair -- governing council chair on 21 November 3rd and again on November 29th to discuss 22 the mission goal implementation. And at that point, 23 the Chair raised a concern about the legitimacy of 24 La Tierra Montessori board minutes, which is in the 25 school's contract. So it was an issue that needed</p>	37	<p>1 and incorporate into the update for the PEC any of 2 the points that were made in that letter.</p> <p>3 I did get another e-mail from Mr. Casados 4 about the board retreat that occurred in -- on 5 December 10th, where they discussed the mission and 6 the mission goals. And they provided some updated 7 information about that. And so I did include in the 8 update to the PEC what the prior charter term 9 mission statement was, what was in the contract, and 10 what the board approved on December 10th. Very 11 similar, but significant.</p> <p>12 Similarly, I included in your update what 13 was in the mission goals for the contract with the 14 mission goals that were approved by the governing 15 board on December 10th.</p> <p>16 I don't believe that the forms that are 17 required to amend the mission has been submitted. I 18 have not had an opportunity to meet with 19 Mr. Casados. As everybody here knows, or should 20 know, we have been in hearings all week. And so, 21 quite frankly, we -- we probably needed the -- the 22 information a week ago.</p> <p>23 But I understand that the board was 24 meeting December 10th, and so this is all very 25 rushed. Nonetheless, PEC has all the information.</p>

38	<p>1 The other information that the PEC</p> <p>2 requested that we provide was some updates on our</p> <p>3 site visit and student academic performance from the</p> <p>4 '21-'22 school year.</p> <p>5 So, as I mentioned before, a team of staff</p> <p>6 from the Charter Schools Division visited the school</p> <p>7 November 3rd, 2022. And the CSD team observed a</p> <p>8 stressed school environment. That day, many</p> <p>9 teachers were out, and the current interim head</p> <p>10 administrator was clearly overtaxed with many issues</p> <p>11 that were referenced in reports this morning and</p> <p>12 that you are well aware of.</p> <p>13 She is also responsible for developing the</p> <p>14 school's special education program. And in terms of</p> <p>15 an update on how that's going, I think that it's in</p> <p>16 progress. I'm sure the school could provide a more</p> <p>17 up-to-date report on that.</p> <p>18 We will note that we have seen improved</p> <p>19 board functions at the governing board level,</p> <p>20 despite what seems like a chaotic and distressed</p> <p>21 school environment.</p> <p>22 I want to just quickly give an update on</p> <p>23 student academic performance based on statewide</p> <p>24 assessments for the '21-'22 school year.</p> <p>25 Those indicate that 38 percent of students</p>	40	<p>1 the La Tierra Chair Casados. And so that's 7.b.</p> <p>2 And then the final document in your folder</p> <p>3 is 7.c, which is La Tierra's response to the PEC's</p> <p>4 letter of November 15th, 2022.</p> <p>5 Thank you.</p> <p>6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Director Chavez.</p> <p>7 The next thing that we're going to do is</p> <p>8 go over process with Ms. Barnes, so what has</p> <p>9 happened, and, then what, moving forward, is the</p> <p>10 process and what we're discussing today.</p> <p>11 MS. JULIA BARNES: Thank you,</p> <p>12 Commissioners.</p> <p>13 So let me back up. You know that the</p> <p>14 school had a previous contract. This is one of the</p> <p>15 schools that entered into an amendment of the</p> <p>16 existing contract. And so there's a contract</p> <p>17 document, an amendment document, and an updated</p> <p>18 Performance Framework.</p> <p>19 The updated Performance Framework and the</p> <p>20 amendment -- the amendment made what the school</p> <p>21 presented to the PEC as a slight mission statement</p> <p>22 change. Those were negotiated, as were every single</p> <p>23 contract, with the board chair and the head</p> <p>24 administrator.</p> <p>25 They did provide, as did every other</p>
39	<p>1 scored proficient or above in ELA. This is slightly</p> <p>2 higher than the state average of 34. And 27 percent</p> <p>3 were proficient or above in science, which is below</p> <p>4 the state average of 33.</p> <p>5 We do not -- we have math proficiency as</p> <p>6 less than 20 percent, and early literacy proficiency</p> <p>7 is 5 percent.</p> <p>8 La Tierra's assessment participation rate</p> <p>9 was low, unless that was updated. Was</p> <p>10 La Tierra's -- okay. So we may have an update on</p> <p>11 the exact numbers. But I have a table that shows</p> <p>12 ELA participation rate at 63 percent, math at</p> <p>13 63 percent, science at 69, and ACCESS for ELs at</p> <p>14 61 percent.</p> <p>15 We did get an update yesterday from the</p> <p>16 Assessment Bureau on participation rate. So we're</p> <p>17 verifying that those numbers are actually correct.</p> <p>18 DR. BRIGETTE RUSSELL: Director Chavez,</p> <p>19 the numbers did not change except for the science</p> <p>20 participation rate, which is 61 percent.</p> <p>21 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: Thank you.</p> <p>22 I also want to call to the attention of</p> <p>23 the PEC two additional documents. One is 7.b. So</p> <p>24 that was the update to La Tierra Montessori. 7.b.</p> <p>25 is the memo regarding mission goals that was sent by</p>	41	<p>1 school, minutes, board minutes, showing that the</p> <p>2 board had approved that. And those were attached,</p> <p>3 as were your approvals at the board meeting here,</p> <p>4 where you all accepted the amendment, which</p> <p>5 incorporated the contract and the new Performance</p> <p>6 Framework.</p> <p>7 The new Performance Framework has two</p> <p>8 Mission-Specific Goals, which are directly related</p> <p>9 to Montessori.</p> <p>10 As every -- just this school, as every</p> <p>11 other school, was approached to do a scoring sheet</p> <p>12 for the Mission-Specific Goals, which was how is the</p> <p>13 school going to collect the data and show that they</p> <p>14 are meeting their mission-specific goal?</p> <p>15 And this school has, to my knowledge,</p> <p>16 never completed that. I -- I think that Director</p> <p>17 Chavez could update us on the number of times, but I</p> <p>18 think it is over five times that the school has been</p> <p>19 approached to do a scoring sheet, both by Rachel</p> <p>20 Stofocik, and then Director Chavez joined into the</p> <p>21 process. You do not have that.</p> <p>22 I -- I think you'll need to hear from the</p> <p>23 board as to whether their Mission-Specific Goals</p> <p>24 have been implemented.</p> <p>25 It is my opinion as the lawyer for you</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">42</p> <p>1 that this school has a valid contract and amendment 2 and that they need to be implementing the 3 Performance Framework as written. 4 You issued -- under the Intervention 5 Ladder, you issued a Letter of Concern. On 6 August 29th, they -- at -- following your meeting 7 down in Ruidoso, as part of that letter, it 8 indicated that -- because it -- you had been -- you 9 had received a lot of information about things being 10 kind of chaotic right at the turnover of part of the 11 board. 12 And we specifically -- I'll just read the 13 sentence: 14 "The PEC specifically asked you to work 15 with your lawyer and business manager to provide 16 confirmation that appropriate proce- -- fiscal 17 processes were in place and were followed, budget, 18 financial reports, and educational plans were 19 appropriately created, and the approval of 20 appropriate documents by the board took place." 21 That was a letter of August 29th. 22 I think those issues are still continuing. 23 The board is continuing to make the same comments 24 that things weren't done appropriately. However, 25 the first request that you made of them to correct</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">44</p> <p>1 the safety concerns regarding the children, the 2 concerns about the head administrator potentially 3 not being available, and, overall, putting the 4 school on notice that there is a concern of -- that 5 they're not acting in conformity with the contract 6 on an educational level, fiscal level, and 7 organizational level. Student safety issues were 8 raised, staff issues are continuing, and that there 9 were serious concerns. 10 So that letter went out by Chair Burt on 11 November 15th. 12 The letter also indicated that you might 13 take continuing action at this meeting under the 14 Intervention Ladder. You have issued a Notice of 15 Concern. If you escalated next, the Intervention 16 Ladder allows for you to issue a Breach of Contract. 17 I'm going to go over the provisions of the 18 contract that I think are potentially implicated, 19 and then, if the Commission decides to take action 20 to move to revoke the charter, it is appropriate to 21 do a Notice of Intent to Revoke. That would happen 22 today, putting them on notice of a January 23 discussion on revocation. Not the revocation 24 hearing itself. 25 However, at that time, CSD would compile a</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">43</p> <p>1 anything that was incorrect was August 29th. 2 The -- I think Director Chavez just 3 updated you. There were expectations of the school 4 I think she just went over, where the school is on 5 that. Several of those issues have been resolved or 6 are in process. 7 And then the -- the issues were continuing 8 at the school. 9 So, again, you all took action, and 10 Chair Burt followed up with a letter under the 11 Intervention Ladder that added educational and 12 mission-specific irregularities. Those were not in 13 that letter. 14 So on November 15th, that was expanded to 15 indicate the previous violations of the PEC contract 16 in the school's bylaws, and, then, in addition, to 17 add the fact that the mission and educational 18 program and Mission-Specific Goals, which are 19 related to the Montessori, were not being made. 20 I think that the letter also included what 21 Director Chavez has already indicated, that it's 22 almost a daily report of something else at the 23 school. And you all meet monthly and, actually, in 24 November, only met in a limited -- in a limited way. 25 So those concerns were included, including</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">45</p> <p>1 list of everything that appeared to be a breach of 2 contract and the evidence that you would show -- 3 that they -- that they would show so the school was 4 on notice of what the evidence would be regarding 5 that, and then you would set a date and time for the 6 revocation hearing. 7 So it's not -- it would not happen at the 8 next meeting. 9 You are again in this loop where you -- 10 where you meet monthly. So I think you are at a 11 point where you could indicate, through -- through a 12 motion, that there is a breach of contract. 13 I think it -- the Intervention Ladder 14 allows the school -- and I want to be clear about 15 this -- it allows the school and puts the onus on 16 the school to come up with a Corrective Action Plan. 17 I think that CSD has been working 18 diligently to try to say, "Why don't you try this?" 19 And here's our concerns, that the 20 Intervention Ladder at this point would place that 21 corrective action -- presenting a Corrective Action 22 Plan onto the board, and it would be presented to 23 CSD for them to look at. So there's language in 24 there. 25 I'm going to pause for a second, because I</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">46</p> <p>1 want to turn to what the contract terms are. 2 THE CHAIR: Okay. So any questions about 3 that, in particular, right now? 4 MS. JULIA BARNES: Let me make a -- let me 5 make a comment in terms of what I think is 6 appropriate for your discussion and for the school 7 and everyone to discuss, is what you -- just what is 8 in the contract. 9 And you have received some documents that 10 I felt were not related at all to the contract and 11 that were completely outside of the contract. So 12 those were not put into the -- into the meeting 13 documents. 14 Director Chavez has put into the meeting 15 documents the things that relate directly to the 16 contract. And I believe that all the comments, 17 public comments, were very appropriately towards the 18 issues at the school that you -- that you can look 19 at. 20 So I guess I would urge you not to get off 21 onto something that doesn't have anything to do with 22 the contract. And I think you're often very clear 23 about what is appropriate and what isn't. However, 24 I think Director Chavez gets many things that feel 25 outside of that. And one was forwarded to you that</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">48</p> <p>1 administrator. 2 Section -- the purpose of the school, the 3 mission of the school, the comprehensive educational 4 program of the school, and the Performance Framework 5 are all sections -- the Performance Framework is an 6 attachment to the contract -- are all things that 7 relate to the mission and the educational program of 8 the school. And the Performance Framework is -- 9 is -- has the two indicators, the Mission-Specific 10 Goals, School-Specific Goals, which were both 11 Montessori-related. 12 Section 4.5. I think one board member is 13 slightly out of compliance with board training. 14 But, anyway, that's in the contract. 15 And there's much broader duties of the 16 governing body to comply with all provisions of the 17 contract in law. 18 And then there's many issues at the school 19 right now that have been raised to CSD and to 20 others. That comes into the contract, because the 21 board has to hire and oversee the head 22 administrator. 23 So if the board is not overseeing the head 24 administrator, and the head administrator is not 25 taking many actions that the head administrator</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">47</p> <p>1 I -- I didn't see any connection to the contract. 2 But let me turn to the contract -- sorry. 3 I thought I had it. 4 So let me walk through the elements of the 5 contract that I think have been raised. 6 The contract is very oddly numbered, so 7 sometimes I'm going to say, like 2-2 -- I don't 8 know. And sometimes I'm not sure I got the 9 numbering right. However, it all is in the 10 contract. 11 So the first is the charter school has an 12 obligation to designate a charter representative. 13 And that is both the head administrator and the -- 14 and the board chair during the contract 15 negotiations. Those people were there at that time. 16 And then -- so that's the -- that's under 17 the scope of the contract, a designated charter 18 representative, in contract negotiations with the 19 PEC, and a failure to comply with the contract by 20 the present board in -- in, you know, following or 21 representing that it is through its designated 22 charter representative. 23 We do not e-mail -- in the contract 24 negotiations, we don't e-mail the entire board. We 25 e-mailed, every single time, the chair and the head</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">49</p> <p>1 needs to do or is not available or all of the kinds 2 of things, then that is the only contract provision. 3 You don't have any role in the hiring or firing of 4 staff. But the board does, through the head 5 administrator, which is in your contract. 6 Section 4.6 regarding the operation of the 7 school, Section 2-II, 3-II and 8, is to comply with 8 all federal and state laws relating to the education 9 of children with disabilities, complying with all 10 laws related to safety, and notifying the 11 condition -- the Commission -- of allegations or 12 inappropriate contact with a student. 13 Those are the -- that's -- those are the 14 provisions of the contract that I think relate to 15 safety at the school and, potentially, any incident 16 involving a child. 17 Section 5.2I, II, and IV, relates to the 18 State participating in State-required assessments 19 and meeting the State standard of excellence. 20 That's where I think some of the issues about 21 participation in statewide testing and things like 22 that are referenced in the contract. 23 So I think that should guide the 24 conversation, in my view, on a breach of contract, 25 if that is where you're looking to go.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">50</p> <p>1 And, again, if you move forward on a 2 breach of contract, then I think it's appropriate to 3 move toward a Corrective Action Plan that the school 4 provides, and that the school submits that to the 5 Charter Schools Division. 6 And then in our processes, things -- 7 things are due to you the Friday before. That means 8 that CSD has to have them long before that. 9 So I think both Director Chavez and I, in 10 trying to have complete documentation for you, 11 often, if something comes in late, we make a 12 decision through the Chair as to whether that should 13 be uploaded. 14 But that -- that is added to making your 15 job difficult today, in my view. So that needs -- 16 they need to provide the appropriate documentation 17 on the appropriate forms in the appropriate way. 18 And I've put a -- I put in the proposed 19 motion January 6th, if that's where you need to go. 20 That is in order to give CSD time to meet the 21 deadlines that the Executive Committee has asked of 22 CSD. 23 And then finally, what is not in front of 24 you today is -- but it is in the documents -- is the 25 possible amendment. But it's not on an amendment</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">52</p> <p>1 issues that our head learner has diligently worked 2 on to address many of these challenges are issues 3 that do involve FERPA and do involve issues where we 4 did allude to many of the overview issues. 5 So I want to kind of go down the list that 6 Attorney Barnes did kind of go over, and then I will 7 go back to our response to your letter, because it's 8 important that we have that information as accurate 9 as possible. 10 THE CHAIR: Okay. And, Mr. Casados, as 11 you go, you're more than welcome to just kind of go 12 back and forth between the three of you as you'd 13 like. You don't need me to call on each of you. 14 But I will let you know that for both 15 Ms. Gordon-Brown and Ms. Herrera, we can't see -- I 16 can't see you on my screen. But if your video is 17 off, we're only going to be able to hear you. We 18 won't be able to see you on our screen. 19 So just want to make sure that the two of 20 them know that, that we'll hear you, but no one's 21 going to be able to, like, see that you're on the 22 screen at all. 23 MR. ISAAC CASADOS: Thank you. 24 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: That's all right. 25 I have a disabled camera on my work phone; so --</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">51</p> <p>1 form. It wasn't provided timely. It hasn't been 2 analyzed. So it's not in front of you for 3 consideration. I think it's in front of you to sort 4 of -- because I think the school wants to show you 5 what they're trying to do. 6 Any questions on that? I do have a 7 question as to -- on the form of motion. So if 8 there is a motion that comes out of this 9 conversation, I do want to look at that, and, in 10 particular, so that it gets in the meeting minutes 11 appropriately, and, particularly, for our court 12 reporter. 13 THE CHAIR: All right. I am going to go 14 ahead and now go to Mr. Casados. And I'll let you, 15 if you have any -- I would love to give you the 16 floor at this point for your comments now. 17 MR. ISAAC CASADOS: Thank you so much, 18 Madam Chair, and thank you, Commissioners. We 19 appreciate this opportunity. 20 And I know Delisha and I will probably be 21 going back and forth. So if we can indulge her and 22 allow her in, I think it would be appropriate to 23 call in our head learner, being that a lot of the 24 issues that have been brought up are issues that are 25 kind of beyond the purview of this board. And</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">53</p> <p>1 MR. ISAAC CASADOS: I know on our 2 August 1st meeting we had talked about the designee 3 representative as far as making sure that the chair 4 and/or a head learner was present during that 5 process. And we have worked diligently to assure 6 that there is continuity of instruction at the 7 school. 8 We were thankful that you all had the 9 opportunity to meet Mr. Cliff Tompson. 10 Unfortunately, he did retire, and that was kind of 11 his plan moving forward. We are very fortunate to 12 have Ms. Herrera, as she brings a wealth of 13 knowledge. 14 She did come back out of retirement, which 15 we are thankful for, to take over this post, which 16 is very challenging. She's dealing with a lot of 17 day-to-day issues that could be remedied very 18 quickly, but they seem to -- to continue on a daily 19 level. 20 The board is really only here to provide 21 support to her. We can't involve ourselves in the 22 day-to-day operation, in the hiring and firing of 23 staff. But she is trudging through this process 24 with -- with clarity and purpose. And we thank her 25 for her dedication.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">54</p> <p>1 I know that there was maybe allusion to 2 the idea that she's not doing her job. This woman 3 is putting in hours over her contract and dealing 4 with issues that a head learner should not have to 5 be dealing with because of petty politics and other 6 challenges that are constantly being berated at her. 7 When she's getting threats on campus and 8 you have parents that are coming up to her and 9 threatening her and/or me, that is not a productive 10 environment to be in. All of us are -- for us on 11 the board, we're all volunteers. And -- and I think 12 this week I've put in -- what? -- about 71 hours 13 kind of going back and forth and dealing with 14 responses and other issues. 15 And it's -- it's a vast challenge of 16 trying to figure out how do we do that? So going 17 over Barnes' scenarios, and we'll go into kind of my 18 response. 19 So we have had a designated representee, 20 or representative, on the chartering process. I 21 took over in -- in July of 2022. Ms. Herrera came 22 in right around September, late September, early 23 October, as we began that process. 24 She was already looked at to become a -- a 25 teacher at La Tierra as a special education teacher</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">56</p> <p>1 Montessori Education Center out of Albuquerque to 2 look at how do we best provide educational 3 opportunities to our students, but also our 4 teachers? 5 One of the biggest challenges that we 6 faced in our former board iteration is that there 7 wasn't a lot of training of Montessori occurring. 8 We have had one Montessori educator that was there, 9 our former head learner. And not having a full 10 staff that was trained and certified, this was a key 11 area. 12 You can go back to our minutes that showed 13 I brought this issue up countless times. Where was 14 the training? Where is the certification? And how 15 can we ensure that we're adhering to the mission and 16 the purpose? If we are claiming to be a Montessori 17 school, we need to be at that level. 18 So we are having conversations right now 19 with the Indigenous Montessori Learning Center to 20 provide that coordinated process to ensure that 21 those Performance Framework elements are met. 22 The other part that this board has really 23 focused in on is the idea of providing documentation 24 to our parents and the administration to know where 25 our students currently are scoring on a daily level.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">55</p> <p>1 and has done an incredible job really keeping the 2 body afloat as we move through that process. 3 I know Attorney Barnes had referenced that 4 both the head learner and (inaudible due to audio 5 distortion), through the chartering contract 6 process, received the documentation that was 7 presented to the PEC when we were going through the 8 chartering process. 9 Unfortunately, our board was not provided 10 that information. And a meeting was conducted in a 11 special meeting outside of the Open Meetings Act 12 within -- without the 72-hour notification of 13 members. I wasn't present at that; nor was our 14 secretary at that time. 15 And we still try to figure out where the 16 minutes from that meeting came from, as it was a 17 meeting called by the former chair as well as a 18 former head learner at a -- at a time period that 19 was less than 48 hours, which was deeply troubling 20 to us. 21 As far as the Performance Framework, it's 22 really important to us, to ensure that the mission 23 and the program of the school is successful. I 24 think I have alluded into my contract that the goal 25 is, we have begun discussions with the Indigenous</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">57</p> <p>1 In the contract that we read, we saw that 2 observation was the key area. And that is a tenet 3 of Montessori, to observe, and then not necessarily 4 always report. 5 Through our testing services, through 6 NWEA, through Istation and other areas, it's 7 important that we be able to get those numbers and 8 those statistics and ensure that if there is a 9 challenge in some area, that the board can then ask 10 the head learner to rectify those challenges or find 11 other programs to ensure that that -- that 12 possibility is there. 13 We have tasked that goal and have already 14 had those conversations with Ms. Herrera. And she 15 is a -- coming from the public school environment, 16 she also looks at it from the perspective of, "I 17 need data. I need to be able to know that when a 18 parent is ready to send their kid to New Mexico 19 School for the Arts or another school, area, that 20 they have that opportunity to say that that student 21 is proficient in reading, writing, arithmetic, and 22 science." 23 If we're not doing that job effectively, 24 then we're failing our students, and that is not 25 something that we can do.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">58</p> <p>1 As far as our Mission-Specific Goals, we 2 did rework those. It was kind of a last-minute 3 scenario through our -- through our board retreat. 4 It was the first time that we could really get 5 everybody together. 6 And we did -- if you look at the 7 documentation that we sent you all, our goal was to, 8 one, ensure that the time period that these students 9 were tested. So the first one is kind of the 10 Performance Framework that essentially looks at 11 the -- hold on one second here -- that looks at the 12 mastery and supporting documentation that's provided 13 back to the Charter School Division. 14 And so that is what we've done. We've now 15 added documentation to the family administration 16 supporting such mastery. 17 The planes of development are really 18 important. But there were other planes of 19 development that this board doesn't have any 20 authority over: early childhood development, early 21 scenarios where young children are not in our 22 purview. 23 And so we really wanted to clarify where 24 the school would have an opportunity to participate 25 in that process, but also ensure that if that</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">60</p> <p>1 individual that is requiring board training is a new 2 member of our board. And she is still moving 3 through the new member training process. But all of 4 the remaining board members have completed fiscal 5 training. 6 Delisha, as she mentioned in our last 7 meeting, does come with a large background from the 8 UC systems as far as finances, and she has been very 9 good at helping us kind of repair that budget. And 10 we're thankful to Mike Vigil at the Vigil Group for 11 kind of guiding us through that process and ensuring 12 that if there were challenges in that budget, that 13 we present the appropriate BARs and prepare that 14 budget. 15 We are still dealing with about a \$122,000 16 deficiency. And that deficiency came from a PED 17 error. The good news is we've been able to find 18 ways to balance that area. 19 There are some other additional funding 20 areas that we are looking at reallocating that will 21 help us get to that level and ensure that there is 22 an opportunity there. 23 As far as the oversight of the board, we 24 run everything through the head learner. This was a 25 contention point that was brought up in our August</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">59</p> <p>1 Mission-Specific Goal is to be carried out, that, 2 number one, documentation supports that prerogative, 3 because if we don't have documentation, then we 4 can't act. We can't ensure that there is clarity 5 through that process. 6 Mission-Specific Goal 2 really said that 7 the training opportunities would be outside of our 8 environment. We felt that it's important to draw on 9 the -- the inference -- the technologies, or the 10 techniques, that are being done in community. 11 And that's why the Indigenous Montessori 12 Training Center is so important. Because we are a 13 Montessori school located on tribal -- on a tribal 14 reservation, we felt that this is important to have 15 that coordinated effort, because we do serve an 16 indigenous population, because we are on a tribal 17 reservation, that it's important to have those 18 aspects pulled into the process. 19 And so that all we did was add another 20 area that essentially provides our school an 21 opportunity to be able to have our staff achieve 22 those goals locally instead of out of state, which, 23 locally, costs about \$3,500, out of state, about 24 \$14,000, which is -- and that's per person. 25 As far as board training, the only</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">61</p> <p>1 meeting that -- and I know Commissioner Robbins, I 2 know Commissioner Carrillo and others had brought up 3 this idea that this board may have been stepping on 4 the toes of the head learner. 5 We have allowed the head learner to do 6 what they need to do. And, specifically, when there 7 are ongoing investigations that include personnel, 8 that include children and FERPA, we take a very 9 timid approach to that process, allow that process 10 to play out. And if there are ongoing 11 investigations that occur, we as a board can't 12 necessarily get involved until those investigations 13 are complete, or we are asked or directed by the 14 head learner to get involved. 15 I can tell you thus far that we have 16 included in the response about the child safety 17 issue, there was a police report that was 18 appropriately filed. That report does call into 19 question or discount that the assault did occur. 20 And that was by another staff member. And the other 21 two individuals that were mentioned in that police 22 report provided secondhand knowledge of the incident 23 and never saw it happen. 24 The Sheriff's Office just told us that 25 they cannot corroborate the allegation. And that</p>

1 was something that Ms. Herrera was very diligent in
2 moving through that process, conducting her own
3 internal investigation.

4 As far as the issue with Mr. Krane, I
5 can't speak any more to what that issue is because
6 it is still ongoing. It is now outside of -- of our
7 purview as a school. It is outside of our purview
8 as a -- a head learner or administration is
9 concerned.

10 Ms. Herrera did inform the board and in
11 the executive session as to the elements of that
12 issue. And I can only refer you all to -- to other
13 entities that have taken over that investigation.

14 And we are thankful that Ms. Herrera
15 responded quickly. We are thankful that she was
16 able to ensure that there was continuity through the
17 process, ensuring that there was a substitute, and
18 ensuring that the classroom environment was -- was
19 secure and safe.

20 The other part of this is, yes, we have
21 had to move through the element of subs and staff.
22 And I think there are staff shortages all across our
23 educational system. That was one of the key areas
24 that the LESC looked at a couple of weeks ago as far
25 as where teacher retention is at this current level.

1 to take over that scenario. And Ms. Herrera did an
2 incredible job in ensuring that that process played
3 out.

4 When it is taken outside of our purview,
5 it is something that this board cannot necessarily
6 respond to, because it's outside of our -- our
7 appropriate methods of bylaws and protocol, because
8 it now follows State law, and we then only become
9 a -- a party of and providing and ensuring that that
10 process plays out.

11 As far as statewide testing referenced in
12 the contract, it is incredibly important to us that
13 we see numbers and we see data. That is one of the
14 key areas that this board has really focused in on.

15 We've focused a lot of time in our
16 discussions, not only in our work sessions, but also
17 through how we're looking at Mission-Specific Goals
18 to ensure that that data and that information is
19 provided to the administration and then provided to
20 the board.

21 It was -- it was deeply troubling to us to
22 only see DASH Plan numbers at the beginning of this
23 year. We had asked multiple times to see data, to
24 see information. We were met with, "That's outside
25 of your purview. You're not allowed to do that.

1 We've had the same issue. We've had four
2 staff members, including Cliff Tompson, that have
3 left and/or resigned. But Ms. Herrera is looking at
4 staff that can come back into that -- into our
5 program where our budget will allow.

6 And, as I mentioned, the \$122,000 deficit
7 does not play nice when you're looking at just
8 hiring random staff members. So she has to be very
9 diligent and careful on how she's moving that
10 process, and she updates the board on where her
11 negotiations or discussions are with various
12 individuals that she's looking at bringing forth in
13 this school.

14 As far as the operation of the school and
15 the safety of the school, the school takes -- we as
16 a board take this very seriously. We've had various
17 town hall meetings. We continually open up our --
18 our meetings for open forum and public comment and
19 then take those comments and then go back in our
20 work sessions and say, "Okay, how can we ensure
21 safety and security and ensure that that process
22 is -- is safe and secure for our students?"

23 And I think this issue only elevated
24 because of one student. And as I said, it is an
25 issue that -- that we allow the external individual

1 That's not Montessori."

2 It's those areas -- for me, I'm a
3 data-driven individual. I need to know if we're
4 scoring at 35 percent, 65 percent, 75 percent. What
5 do we need to do to increase those participation
6 numbers from a board perspective? Do we need to
7 write and draft new policies and procedures? And do
8 we need to direct the administration to really look
9 at, okay, what are the performative measures that we
10 need to take to ensure that these processes are
11 guaranteed?

12 And I can say that Ms. Herrera has done a
13 great job in ensuring that that process is playing
14 out.

15 As far as the -- the response and moving
16 through, I have kind of alluded to many of them as
17 far as the Mission-Specific Goals that were alluded
18 to in Chair Burt's e-mail.

19 Non-compliance with the expected outcomes
20 and deadlines that were referenced in the August
21 letter, we have met many of those issues, if not
22 all. And it was important for us to kind of take
23 the bull by the horns and ensure that we addressed
24 every issue as quickly and diligently as possible.

25 We have been in contact with Director

<p style="text-align: right;">66</p> <p>1 Chavez. We have been in contact with Missy Brown as 2 we've moved through these processes, because it's 3 important that we ensure that that process is 4 playing out. 5 As far as -- as our -- our issues where we 6 may not have oversight over our budget and our 7 funding processes and where there was a Pre-K-12 8 program, the Pre-K-12 program has been removed from 9 the program. That was -- after that last meeting we 10 immediately disbanded that program, and the next 11 day, the students received a letter and a notice and 12 they were not allowed to come back to school and had 13 to find another area. 14 Through the leadership of Ms. Delisha 15 Gordon-Brown, who brings expertise to this area, 16 we've been able to ensure that there is full 17 compliance with the budget, ensuring that we have 18 fiscal oversight over that process. 19 Both she and I sit on that committee, and 20 it's helped us to kind of move through that process. 21 As far as the board interfering with any 22 administrative tasks, we don't do that. That's not 23 our purview. That's not our area. 24 And I understand that that can frustrate a 25 lot of parents. But when we respond back and say</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">68</p> <p>1 prior. 2 We -- we ensure that if staff needs to 3 make a comment, they are very vocal. They get onto 4 our meetings and are able to engage. And so our 5 head learner and Ms. Herrera, when she gets on, can 6 speak to that process. If there's an issue that 7 needs to be elevated, she's the person that 8 communicates that issue back and forth. 9 As far as our high staff turnover, that is 10 something I already alluded to, and how that process 11 is playing out, not only with La Tierra, but as a 12 statewide issue as we're moving through that 13 process. 14 As far as board minutes, all of our board 15 minutes, if you go to our website, are up to date. 16 Our board secretary, who is Ms. Gordon-Brown, within 17 24 hours of our meeting, has those board minutes 18 posted. We have two board minutes that will be 19 approved at our December 20th meeting coming up. 20 We also post our town halls as well as our 21 work sessions, because it's important for us to 22 ensure that people have an opportunity to 23 participate through that process. 24 They may not be able to engage, but they 25 do have an opportunity to be able to -- to monitor</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">67</p> <p>1 that is outside of our purview, we do not have 2 authority to do that, we have to move through our 3 head learner, it can be a challenge. 4 But we are thankful that Ms. Herrera 5 constantly looks at where she can make the best 6 impact and then updates the board in areas that she 7 needs help. And we have a very good working 8 relationship. 9 We did address the issue of the 10 altercation between the staff member and the 11 student. And you can read more about that. 12 And disputes between staff and board 13 members. This is a ludicrous accusation. This 14 board has had no interaction, at all, zero, with our 15 staff members. The last time we saw our staff or we 16 engaged with our staff members was at a town hall 17 meeting. And even then, that process, we would call 18 on them and say, "Hey, tell us what you think about 19 this. Tell us what you think about that. Tell us 20 what you think about this." 21 Ms. Herrera is our intermediary between 22 our staff and this board. And the board really took 23 a very hard -- hard look at this process, because we 24 were accused at an August meeting of interfering 25 with staff member issues, which was never an issue</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">69</p> <p>1 the process and then bring those -- that information 2 back to the board as we're moving through. 3 As far as our site visit, we did have a 4 challenge on the day that the administrators from 5 the Charter Schools administration did visit. We 6 had a staff member who had kind of announced a 7 revolution. And many of those staff members, 8 additional staff members attached to that person, 9 called in sick. But Ms. Herrera, as always, 10 responded quickly and made sure that that process 11 played out accurately and without any interruption 12 to the school environment. 13 So with that, I think I've covered most of 14 the areas from both the letter response as far as 15 the issues that Ms. Barnes brought up. 16 And what I'm going to do is pass it on to 17 Ms. Gordon-Brown and then Ms. Herrera. 18 Ms. Gordon-Brown, do you have anything to 19 add to that? 20 MS. DELISHA GORDON-BROWN: Not much to 21 add -- can you guys hear me okay? 22 MR. ISAAC CASADOS: Yes. 23 THE CHAIR: Yes. 24 MS. DELISHA GORDON-BROWN: Other than as 25 far as the budget oversight, I do want to include</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">70</p> <p>1 that. Since I joined the financial committee, we do 2 have complete budget oversight. We have monthly 3 meetings with our business manager, still the Vigil 4 Group, and we work very closely with them. 5 And while their findings are not made 6 public yet, I can say that we worked very closely 7 with the State Auditor during the audit this year, 8 and things are running a lot more smoothly than they 9 have in a very long time. 10 MR. ISAAC CASADOS: Thank you so much, 11 Ms. Gordon-Brown. 12 Ms. Herrera, are you there? Your audio is 13 not working for some reason. 14 MS. PATRICIA HERRERA: Oh, you know what? 15 This computer (inaudible due to audio distortion) 16 this video. I apologize. Can you hear me now? 17 MR. ISAAC CASADOS: I can hear her 18 faintly. I don't know if they can hear her -- 19 THE CHAIR: It's faint. It's faint here 20 as well. 21 MS. PATRICIA HERRERA: Okay. Let me get 22 in on my other computer. I apologize. 23 THE CHAIR: It's actually better here now. 24 I don't know if she's just closer to her microphone. 25 But that was better.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">72</p> <p>1 And I had to explain that we are a public 2 school, and that we still follow -- if not all -- 3 but most of the PED guidelines, even though it's a 4 charter school. So there are some things that are a 5 little different. 6 So the parents, like, "Oh, I thought we 7 were private." 8 And I said, "No, you don't pay tuition, 9 and (inaudible due to audio distortion) to the 10 New Mexico Public Education Department, and I have 11 to follow certain rules and guidelines." 12 We are working on our lunch situation. 13 They're working on trying to get a new RFP and 14 hopefully maybe a different provider. But here in 15 the Valley, it is hard to find somebody to provide 16 meals on such a large scale. 17 I did speak with the person at the McCurdy 18 School the other day and asked about vegetarian 19 meals. And she said they provided some. 20 And I said, "Well, you know, let's look 21 into providing more and probably more -- with more 22 intent on lunch." 23 I am here. I don't know where it is 24 coming from that I'm not ever here. I am a 25 part-time employee, and I actually work beyond my</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">71</p> <p>1 MS. PATRICIA HERRERA: Right there? 2 THE CHAIR: Yes. 3 MS. PATRICIA HERRERA: Okay. I apologize. 4 Okay. So there have been some ongoing issues. And 5 as most of you know, we can't discuss personnel 6 matters with outside entities, parents, or anybody 7 else. 8 As I explained it to a parent, she said, 9 "I want to know what's going on with this teacher." 10 And I said, "Well, didn't you just start a 11 job at this other place?" 12 And she said, "Yes." 13 And I said, "Well, how would you like it 14 if the person who sits next to you was talking about 15 you with an issue that may have occurred last week 16 with somebody on the phone, in discussing a 17 personnel matter that involves your abilities and 18 between you and your supervisor?" 19 So she -- "Like, I didn't look at it that 20 way." 21 And I said, "Well, thank you." 22 So I have had to also explain to a few 23 parents, because there's a misconception that this 24 is a private school. And, "You're taking our rights 25 as parents away, because it's a private school."</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">73</p> <p>1 contract hours that I'm not getting paid for. And 2 I'm not complaining. 3 It is a concern at my home that I'm 4 working more than I should. And I'm just being 5 honest, you know. 6 But I fear for these children. It's all 7 about the kids. It's not about me. It's about 8 staff being here on time. It's about people 9 adhering to the code of ethics that are outlined 10 when we signed our contract. It's sticking to 11 those, to that code of ethics, and making sure that 12 we get things done, that educators know what they 13 need to do on a monthly basis, such as Istation, 14 getting our math testing done in a timely manner. 15 And so we're working on things like that. 16 There were some systems that I feel 17 probably might not have totally been in place. And 18 I've even had to put a note on my door that if I am 19 in here, I'm probably on the phone or in a meeting, 20 and it's private and confidential. 21 I've been approached -- just so you know, 22 I've been approached a few times in the parking lot. 23 I've been yelled at. I've been threatened. I was 24 yelled at one day at one of our grocery stores here 25 in town.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">74</p> <p>1 I am doing the best that I can with what I 2 have. I'm a part-time special ed teacher, part-time 3 administrator. We are getting our ancillaries in 4 place, and I feel that we do have a good placement 5 of them now. And when some of these other issues 6 that I don't have to constantly deal with, with 7 angry phone calls and things from parents or putting 8 out little fires, I am able to do the other job that 9 what -- what I was hired to do.</p> <p>10 And I know that the governing board has 11 had to repost for a head learner, and I was told by 12 a parent the other day, "You're not even a real 13 administrator," and, "You should just go because 14 your 30 days are up."</p> <p>15 When you're approached and treated like 16 that by what's supposed to be a community for 17 children, it's difficult to do your job.</p> <p>18 So in my -- I just needed to respond to 19 some of the things that were being said.</p> <p>20 I feel that this is a great little school 21 and, to me -- I told a friend of mine the other day, 22 "It's The Little Engine That Can. Not that it 23 Could, it Will."</p> <p>24 So with that in mind, I would just like to 25 say that I feel like we have great teachers here.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">76</p> <p>1 coming back month after month and circling around 2 the same issues. You know, we've all received 3 e-mail -- you know, if we're talking about -- we, 4 unfortunately, close schools more often because the 5 adults have misbehaved.</p> <p>6 And the e-mails that we've received from 7 varieties of people about "She said this," "He said 8 that," "You did that," "You did that," is a clear 9 indication that the adults can't behave 10 professionally. And that is going to spill into 11 every moment in the classroom. It is an environment 12 that right now is toxic, and something needs to be 13 done.</p> <p>14 I don't have a good solution for it. But 15 I truly believe at this point in time, to get 16 clarity on the issue, we need a Notice of Breach and 17 Potential Revocation so that we can get clear-cut 18 information once and for all. Are they serving 19 special ed students appropriately? Is the 20 Montessori Program being conducted with fidelity?</p> <p>21 I want absolute assurances in regards to 22 the policies and procedures for protecting the 23 rights of children, what the policies are, and that 24 those procedures were followed appropriately, 25 whether a potential assault took place, you know.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">75</p> <p>1 Not all of them are certified teachers. That was 2 put in place before I came here, and some have left 3 before I came. So the attrition or the exodus of 4 educators was before my presence here in this 5 building, other than other personnel matters that I 6 had to take care of according to the law.</p> <p>7 So thank you.</p> <p>8 THE CHAIR: All right. Thank you, 9 President Casados. Thank you, Ms. Herrera. Thank 10 you, Ms. Gordon-Brown.</p> <p>11 All right. So now we will go to 12 Commissioner questions/comments. And you will just 13 have to help me with directing who your question is 14 specifically for, if it's to CSD Director Chavez, to 15 Ms. Barnes, or to the school themselves, so I can 16 help facilitate who's responding to your questions.</p> <p>17 I have Commissioner Gipson first.</p> <p>18 COMMISSIONER GIPSON: Thanks. Yesterday 19 we talked about --</p> <p>20 THE CHAIR: If you could make sure -- 21 thanks.</p> <p>22 COMMISSIONER GIPSON: Yesterday we talked 23 about indicators of distress and using that. This 24 is clearly a community and a school in distress. 25 I'm in distress over this, that we keep</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">77</p> <p>1 Just -- I am sorry. But just taking the 2 word of someone that, "We handled it 3 appropriately" -- I need documentation of what that 4 policy was, that they followed all those steps, and 5 that, you know, it's been -- it's been cleared one 6 way or the other.</p> <p>7 It is -- I'm very concerned that, you 8 know, if we're looking at providing for the 9 safety -- providing a safe environment at the 10 school, that if staff isn't safe -- because, you 11 know, this is a community in distress over this, 12 so -- and I don't know what the -- I don't know what 13 the answer to that is.</p> <p>14 But I -- you know, I clearly need to know 15 that special ed is being served, that children's 16 rights are being protected, and that the Montessori 17 Program, the issues about "We didn't get the 18 contracts," I'm done with that.</p> <p>19 It's clear. They got -- they received the 20 contracts. We have that documentation. All those 21 documents are clearly on our website. They can be 22 accessed.</p> <p>23 So, you know, they clearly are in 24 violation of the contract if they are not following 25 and conducting the appropriate activities to fulfill</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">78</p> <p>1 their Mission-Specific Goals, because the school did 2 sign that contract.</p> <p>3 So, you know, at this point in time, I 4 don't have any other questions, because we've gone 5 around this before. I think we just have to move 6 forward and get the clarity of information, because 7 all we are asking the same questions time and 8 time again, and we're getting the same responses 9 from the school. So we're getting nowhere in this 10 conversation.</p> <p>11 So thanks, at least for now.</p> <p>12 THE CHAIR: Okay. So Commissioner Voigt, 13 then Commissioner Robbins, then Commissioner 14 Carrillo.</p> <p>15 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you, 16 Madam Chair. Yeah, we've been going in circles 17 since August. And it's apparent that what is said 18 and what is done are two different things.</p> <p>19 I think we're at the point now that we 20 need evidence of what is being done and 21 accomplished.</p> <p>22 This started back when there was no head 23 administrator. Then there was a head administrator. 24 Then there was no Montessori Program being 25 implemented. There was a violation of contract.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">80</p> <p>1 out, not having their concerns addressed.</p> <p>2 I understand you may feel that it's a 3 small segment. But it's a very vocal segment. And 4 I think there are concerns when you've had so much 5 change in head administrators -- and I understand 6 you have a head administrator that's maybe going 7 beyond her contract. But you don't have a full-time 8 head administrator to maybe address some of these 9 issues that are arising.</p> <p>10 And, you know, being able to manage a 11 crisis, being able to manage a difficult situation 12 takes a specific skill set that not every individual 13 and not every individual who's a head administrator, 14 may be capable of doing.</p> <p>15 I am extremely concerned about an 16 allegation. We're said -- we're told that it was 17 clear that the Sheriff's found no evidence. We 18 don't have that evidence ourselves. We have the 19 allegation by a parent that their child was 20 assaulted and that another staff member told the 21 parent that. But we don't have any evidence, you 22 know, that was presented to say, "Here's the police 23 report clearing the situation," or that it was 24 unsubstantiated.</p> <p>25 So I, too, would agree to move forward</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">79</p> <p>1 And all of these issues that we've been talking 2 about for going on five months have not been 3 resolved.</p> <p>4 So I would definitely support a Breach of 5 Contract with a Notice of Intent to Revoke this 6 charter.</p> <p>7 And it's sad to say that, because there's 8 so much promise that could be held for this 9 community in Española. But it's apparent that they 10 need something to help push them into that direction 11 of what needs to be done.</p> <p>12 A lot has been said. Accusations have 13 been made, claims and blames. But at this point in 14 time, we need to see what's been done and what's 15 been accomplished moving forward.</p> <p>16 So that's all I have to say.</p> <p>17 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Robbins.</p> <p>18 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Thank you. I think 19 my concerns are similar to what Commissioner Gipson 20 said and my views. You know, when we have eight 21 parents and, slash, students appearing before us 22 today, many of them actually driving here to talk 23 with us in person, and then numerous letters that we 24 receive, there's clearly a problem, complaints about 25 being stifled by the board, not being able to speak</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">81</p> <p>1 with a Letter of Breach and with possible 2 revocation.</p> <p>3 I hope the governance council and the 4 members would take seriously and respond and 5 continue to act in the best interest of the students 6 and their parents. I don't want to see any charter 7 school fail because of a lack of following their 8 contract, a lack of actually addressing the concerns 9 of parents simply because the way a group wants to 10 do things is different.</p> <p>11 You have to be able to come together, 12 because without the children there, without the 13 parents supporting that school, it will not succeed.</p> <p>14 Thank you.</p> <p>15 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Carrillo.</p> <p>16 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Question first for 17 Director Chavez.</p> <p>18 In the update, we have the '22-'27 19 Contract Mission Statement, and then the column, the 20 third column on the right for December 12, it's the 21 board-approved. So it's clear that that's the -- 22 that's the La Tierra board approved a new statement 23 that has not been brought to us yet to amend the 24 contract. Is that correct? Okay.</p> <p>25 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: That is correct.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">82</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: So, first, my 2 concern with that is it's a very slickly worded 3 mission statement that basically let's you step away 4 from fidelity to Montessori. 5 Because the new mission statement reads, 6 "Integrated public education that includes..." -- 7 and this is the phrase, specifically -- 8 "...Montessori inspired environment." 9 As opposed to the Contract Mission 10 Statement, which is night and day, "Families and 11 authentic Montessori environment that fosters 12 collaboration, that sticks to the Montessori 13 ideals." 14 And I know that we brought this up in 15 August, that this is a Montessori school, not just a 16 brand that you can throw around the name 17 "Montessori." And so that was -- I know that was a 18 concern for me at one of those last meetings, and 19 it's a concern for me today. 20 So we have 93 kids enrolled. And when I 21 look at the number of letters that I've received, 22 which, by the way, anytime someone sends me a 23 letter, I forward it directly to Director Chavez. 24 And, generally, I've explained to the parents that 25 have reached out to me with the same kind of</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">84</p> <p>1 MS. PATRICIA HERRERA: You know that I'm 2 not. 3 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: I know. But some 4 of these things I'm going to ask -- it's like 5 attorneys ask questions that they already have the 6 answer to. You want things to be in the record. 7 That's why I asked what I asked. Yes, I 8 know you're not. But thank you. 9 So how many staff or teachers are budgeted 10 for with -- with your school? And that would be for 11 your or for Mr. Casados? 12 MS. PATRICIA HERRERA: Okay. Well, I have 13 a kinder teacher, first and second grade teacher, 14 third and fourth grade teacher, fifth-sixth teacher, 15 seventh-eighth teacher, (inaudible due to audio 16 distortion). I have a teacher that teaches math, 17 and I have a Spanish teacher. 18 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: So some of it was 19 garbled and I couldn't hear. So was that, like, 20 seven? 21 MS. PATRICIA HERRERA: Correct. 22 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Okay. So how many 23 of those seven are Montessori certified? 24 MS. PATRICIA HERRERA: As far as I know, 25 only one.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">83</p> <p>1 desperation, if you will, that Benjamin Pearce 2 expressed this morning, I always tell them, "There's 3 limits to what the Commission can do. I can't call 4 and intervene. I can't get involved in any of this. 5 What I can do is let the director know what's 6 happening so she's constantly aware of everything 7 that's going on." 8 And I'm certainly aware of what is going 9 on based on these letters from parents. I was 10 very -- I don't know if she's still watching. I'm 11 going to butcher her name -- Ixchel Topete this 12 morning, the student who spoke. I truly hope that 13 whoever decides to -- I think the RFP was around 14 meals -- make sure that there's certainly 15 appropriate food for those people that have dietary 16 restrictions. 17 It's a public school. It's the same thing 18 we certainly do with any district school. 19 The -- so, yes. Definitely, the concern 20 of fidelity to Montessori. And if you want to come 21 to us later at some point with a new -- with a 22 request for an amendment, you're certainly welcome 23 to do so. 24 So -- is Ms. Herrera still on? 25 Ms. Herrera, are you Montessori certified?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">85</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Okay. So I can 2 tell you, that's a grave concern for me. And I know 3 that I -- you know, I probably wouldn't suggest 4 sending any children to a Montessori school that 5 didn't have Montessori people certified. 6 And high turnover, obviously, for staff. 7 A number of the letters that I received, 8 it just seems like a lot of parents are at that 9 point where they want to pull kids, which actually 10 just breaks my heart. 11 So let's see. On the safety issues, just 12 as I believe -- 13 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Carrillo, before 14 you continue, I do see that Mr. Casados put his hand 15 up. But I don't know if you want to -- he wants to 16 answer that question before you move on to another 17 one. 18 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Sure. 19 THE CHAIR: Okay. Great. 20 MR. ISAAC CASADOS: So our budget does 21 call for seven permanent staff members and then EAs. 22 However, in your comment, none of our teachers in 23 our past two years have ever been Montessori 24 certified other than one. Angela Feathers was the 25 only individual that was certified Montessori in the</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">86</p> <p>1 last two to three years. Only one. 2 And she's -- she has been the only one. 3 So I will leave it at that. 4 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Well, that's 5 certainly concerning. But then I also remember when 6 we came back for renewal, there were all these plans 7 and -- to get more people certified, which was 8 really great to hear. 9 There's a reason we approved the renewal, 10 and that's because the Commission had the same hope 11 for the future that the -- that your staff and 12 you -- well, you were on the board, then -- but 13 that, basically, the staff had. 14 So -- and, you know, I'm concerned -- you 15 have a new person on that needs to complete board 16 training, and I would just encourage you, as the 17 board chair, to set a deadline for that. What's not 18 scheduled doesn't get done. So if you have set a 19 deadline, this person will definitely meet that. 20 And since Ms. Herrera is at a .25, as I 21 understand it -- and correct me if I'm wrong -- that 22 would indicate to me, anyway, that you don't have a 23 full-time administrator and essentially haven't had 24 a full-time administrator for months, and because I 25 don't think Cliff counts, given the amount of time</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">88</p> <p>1 this, which is why this has been on our agenda so 2 much. 3 But I would encourage you to look at any 4 action that the Commission takes as an opportunity 5 to right the ship, okay? And -- you know. And if 6 you don't take that opportunity and, you know, we 7 come back 60 days later and things really haven't 8 changed, then, man, it would be heartbreaking to 9 have to revoke your charter. 10 So, you know, when the vote comes along 11 for whatever it may be, I would -- I would support a 12 breach as an opportunity for this school to right 13 the ship. 14 And this -- you know, this might even mean 15 that current board members need to really take a 16 self-inventory and say, "Am I part of the solution, 17 or am I part of the problem?" 18 And are there others that can maybe step 19 in that don't have any baggage with the school, but 20 maybe they have -- maybe it can be somebody who's a 21 corporate consultant in the Española Valley that 22 says, "Look, I've been following this, and here are 23 some steps we can take to get the right people in 24 and procedures we can do as a board and procedures 25 that Ms. Herrera or whoever the head learner might</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">87</p> <p>1 that he was absent and -- the amount of time that he 2 was absent. 3 So, you know, I mean, if there was a vote 4 for breach, I'd probably support it. I really want 5 to make sure to say I want this school to succeed, 6 okay? The Española Valley needs a Montessori 7 school, a true Montessori school. 8 I'm not -- you know, the Commission can't 9 intervene in how this gets done. This has to be 10 left to everybody, you know. 11 And, you know, I use sports analogies all 12 the time. When you want a team to, like, go over 13 .500 and get to .750 or whatever, you can't have all 14 these outside people telling them what to do. They 15 have to come up with a way to do it themselves. 16 And, you know, my hope has, I would say 17 diminished. But that doesn't mean that I don't have 18 hope. I really want this school to pull it 19 together. Española Valley needs La Tierra 20 Montessori. 21 So if there is a vote for a breach, the 22 way I would look at it is not a punishment, not, 23 "Oh, they're coming down on us," and you're victims. 24 No. You're here because you're here, and every one 25 of your board, you did this, okay? All of you did</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">89</p> <p>1 be can institute so that we can better things, you 2 know, one step at a time." 3 And -- but recognize I think that you all 4 need help, probably help from the outside, to help 5 your board do what it needs to do. 6 I'm not familiar with all the board 7 members. I don't -- haven't read all of the 8 minutes. It seems like there's conflict. But 9 perhaps there are board members that should really 10 say, "Is this the right place for me," in terms of 11 the solution. 12 But be clear. I want a solution, and I 13 want this school to be in the Española Valley, okay? 14 Okay. 15 Thank you. 16 THE CHAIR: So I would -- I actually think 17 I have a little bit differing opinion. So I know 18 when I've worked with families across the state 19 before, it's very difficult to explain the various 20 avenues of authority to families. They're, like, 21 "This is my issue. You fix it. I'm talking to you. 22 You care about me and what's happening to my 23 student, and get this done." 24 And it is very difficult to -- we -- to 25 understand what the board is able to do, what the</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">90</p> <p>1 principal is able to do, what CSD and PED are able 2 to do, what the PEC is able to do; right? Like, we 3 have all these avenues that we have an understanding 4 of, but as a family, you're, like, "This is my kid, 5 just fix it"; right? Someone needs to come in, and, 6 like, this is serious issues, and fix it. 7 And so I have a lot of sympathy for 8 families that are going through what they're going 9 through, because for them, it's their whole world; 10 right? This is one of 50-plus schools that we're 11 looking at. For them, this is their whole world 12 that's going through them. 13 First, I want to just say my sympathies to 14 families that are going through something with any 15 student and school. It's a challenging, 16 difficult -- it's very challenging and difficult to 17 go through. 18 The next thing I'll say is I actually -- 19 one of the things that I will say, in working with 20 this particular board since July, when we have 21 written something to them -- and I'm going to say 22 outside of one piece -- when we have had something 23 in writing that we have notified them of, I have 24 received responses, and it's correct. 25 Many of the financial things that we</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">92</p> <p>1 not -- we cannot get involved in personnel matters. 2 We do not want to get involved in personnel matters. 3 That has nothing to do with what we oversee. So I 4 am going to kind of take my comments and put them in 5 the confines of what we are able to do, because I do 6 think we have the ability to take some action that I 7 think, once again, will continue to guide the board 8 on what the expectations are, what maybe we have 9 seen that has gone astray and needs to be course 10 corrected. 11 And I -- before I get into that, my hope 12 is that the -- the teaching community at La Tierra 13 and the head learner come together to create some 14 kind of resolution to the chaos of it and can work 15 together for the betterment of these students, 16 because at the end of the day, it's the families and 17 students. They are being impacted by the adult 18 actions at this school. And it's not the board 19 that's going to come in and fix this. 20 So I do want to -- like, it's not going to 21 happen. The adults in this community, the teachers 22 who are there every day, the principal who's there 23 every day, you all need to get along. I mean, you 24 need to put the stuff that's happened aside, start 25 moving forward, because these kids are suffering</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">91</p> <p>1 talked about, a lot of the things that started this 2 whole process have been corrected or have been 3 verified. Minutes are being posted. Things are 4 being done differently now in response to us 5 becoming involved. 6 I am -- so I don't necessarily think this 7 is a -- the board needs to fix it and you need to 8 get your stuff together and do it differently, 9 because I think it's the adult community in this 10 school. I don't -- I think if there's a tension 11 between the board and the community, I don't think 12 the board is really going to do anything that the 13 community might say looks right. 14 And I think that school -- the school may 15 be in that space where they could do everything 16 right on paper, and I don't know if it's going to 17 feel right to the community at this time. 18 So I'm going to kind of take a step away 19 from, for lack of better words, the drama of what's 20 going on with the documents and the he-said-she-said 21 things, because I do think that is the appropriate 22 space for the principal to be involved, for the 23 different parts of -- the different authorities that 24 are involved to be involved. 25 And I think it is correct that we should</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">93</p> <p>1 because adults cannot get along. 2 And it's not okay. Your community, your 3 kids deserve better. And at some point, I need to 4 be put down. The things that -- there are some 5 things that we have heard about that do need to 6 continue being looked at and dealt with. Those 7 things need to be dealt with in the appropriate 8 avenue. But at the end of the day, this needs to be 9 moved on from from the adults. 10 Now, that being said, there are some 11 issues that I think have been going on that I think 12 we can address and be specific on that I think could 13 really benefit the school moving forward. 14 I agree with Commissioner Gipson. Special 15 education. We keep hearing students are not being 16 served. I think that's something that we need to 17 investigate further, to look into. And we need to 18 get report back from -- I would like Mr. Casados to 19 start looking into that, be able to provide evidence 20 and support of what the special education is doing 21 in the school, that students are being served, IEPs 22 are being looked at, that they're being met, and for 23 Director Chavez to start working with the Special 24 Education department in getting evidence from our 25 side as well.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">94</p> <p>1 The other thing that I also -- I mean, 2 the -- I think there's another misstep that has 3 happened that needs to be corrected. And I think it 4 does lead to a breach of contract because of the 5 level of concern I have. 6 So the mission of the school -- and 7 Mr. Casados, I heard you say -- so it was 8 renegotiated by the school and the PEC and approved 9 in the contract negotiations. That did happen. So 10 there has been a new -- a different mission. 11 And I heard that there were some -- it was 12 unclear where the minutes came from. But I can show 13 you. So if you go to the website, go to your 14 contract, under the contracts in the amendment, on 15 Page -- I'm going to be -- I'm being very 16 specific -- on Page 24 of the amendment, there are 17 minutes from the board that is a vote on the charter 18 renewal and amendment -- so the contract itself -- 19 the amendment itself. And then right below that is 20 the Performance Framework. And it was voted by the 21 board, yes, three to zero, for the three people that 22 were there that day. 23 In that Performance Framework is the 24 mission and the mission goals as were approved. 25 So that is what the school is currently to</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">96</p> <p>1 scoring guide that's ever been done -- I know -- 2 I've seen the communication about mission goals. I 3 know that that's been something that's been asked 4 over and over and over of the school. 5 "Hey, we need the scoring sheet. We need 6 the scoring sheet." 7 Every other school that we've worked with 8 has been able to provide that except for this one. 9 And so the evidence of mission being implemented as 10 agreed to in the contract, for me, has been 11 breached. 12 Evidence of the mission goals being 13 followed and evidence that they are being done 14 effectively is nowhere to be found. For me, that is 15 also a serious concern. 16 And, once again, I'm going back to the 17 fact that this is an incredible opportunity for 18 students in Española. And that's what's so 19 frustrating about this is -- and I know, 20 Mr. Casados, you and I have talked when you're here. 21 I -- this school needs to be in Española. These 22 students deserve to have a quality education option. 23 And they don't have any other if it's not for you, 24 you know? 25 They don't have another opportunity to get</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">95</p> <p>1 be abiding by. So that's number one. 2 So on Page 23-24 of the contract 3 amendment, there are minutes that show that the 4 board approved the change -- the Performance 5 Framework and the charter renewal and amendment. 6 And so that is what is in effect. 7 So before -- I will call on you, 8 Mr. Casados. I promise. 9 So I will say that's the first thing. 10 That is in place. 11 So for me, when I am looking at what is 12 the school to be doing, I'm going to look back on 13 this contract, back on the agreed-to Performance 14 Framework. For me, I have evidence that it is 15 valid. 16 And for me, when I hear that the mission 17 is -- has been adopted differently, that the -- that 18 the mission goals were reworked, to me, that means 19 nothing's been done this semester on what's 20 currently in the contract. 21 And so there has been an entire semester 22 now of students that have gone through the school 23 who have not -- the mission has not been adhered to 24 and the current mission goals are nowhere to be 25 found. There's no evidence of them. There's no</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">97</p> <p>1 a free Montessori education if it's not for your 2 school. And the promise of your school is to 3 provide that to your families. And for me, not 4 having any evidence of that this entire semester is 5 extremely concerning. 6 So I'll stop with that. You don't -- you 7 don't necessarily have to respond to any special 8 education concerns right now unless you want to. 9 But I definitely am -- the mission and mission goals 10 and the Montessori guiding the school doesn't seem 11 to have -- it seems to have been lost in this chaos. 12 And that's in my most kind way of allowing 13 that to be used as a reason to not have done it. 14 But it hasn't happened as far as I can see in 15 evidence. 16 So, Mr. Casados, you're free to respond. 17 MR. ISAAC CASADOS: Chair Burt, thank you 18 so much. And I think I'll comment also to something 19 that both Gipson as well as Carrillo brought up as 20 far as the Montessori methodology. 21 Montessori makes up one third of our 22 entire mission. Our two thirds are arts integration 23 and science. That is something that we have strong 24 fidelity to. 25 And the process is, if you come in as a</p>

98

1 new board president in July, you're essentially left
 2 with the scenario where you're having to mend all of
 3 these challenges in a short duration of time.
 4 I wish I could wave a magic wand, and
 5 tomorrow everything goes back to where it needs to
 6 be. The challenge with that is that's not the way
 7 that process works. It takes time to get us back to
 8 those areas.
 9 And the unfortunate circumstance is if we
 10 were going three, four, five, six years, eleven
 11 years that Montessori was not being adhered to, we
 12 hire a Montessori educator, and now we become the
 13 official Montessori school, when the other two
 14 thirds of what we were doing was also imperative to
 15 the overall structure of that student environment,
 16 where 65 percent -- 60 kids that we've had at
 17 La Tierra have gone to New Mexico School for the
 18 Arts, that is not a Montessori school. None of our
 19 children have the opportunity in Española to go on
 20 to a Montessori school.
 21 The challenge with Montessori in Española
 22 is this. And I believe that it is an incredible
 23 structure. I think the -- the ideology is profound.
 24 But this is the type of educational environment that
 25 provides students an opportunity in Santa Barbara,

99

1 in Palo Alto, in other areas where you have a vast
 2 saturation of Montessori educators and
 3 administrators. We have to pull in all of these
 4 individuals into this state.
 5 And thankfully, the Indigenous Montessori
 6 Teaching Center is coming online to help us with
 7 that process.
 8 And I'm thankful that Director Chavez
 9 said, "Hey, here's a Montessori school doing
 10 something at Kiwa and doing something with language
 11 integration."
 12 How can we bring that process in? I've
 13 reached out to countless other Montessorians that
 14 are doing Native American programs all across the
 15 country, because I want to see how that process
 16 plays out. And they have had to create their own
 17 scenarios and their own framework on how that
 18 process plays out long-term.
 19 Now, going back to the specific mission
 20 and why that process plays out. If you go to our
 21 website, you will not find those board minutes. And
 22 the reason those board minutes were never posted is
 23 because that special meeting was conducted outside
 24 of the Open Meetings Act.
 25 It is a reason why I wasn't on that

100

1 meeting. It was a reason why secretary, at that
 2 time, Brenda Atencio wasn't on, who is an attorney,
 3 said, "We cannot be at a meeting called within less
 4 than 48 hours that was not an emergency meeting."
 5 If it was an emergency meeting, that's
 6 that process. If you go to the contract, it says a
 7 "Special Meeting." And those requirements are
 8 72 hours.
 9 And so that is where we've had an issue
 10 where now we're saying, "Okay, how do we have
 11 fidelity to all three areas of our mission?"
 12 And in that contract, that mission is
 13 incredibly important to us, Montessori, arts, and
 14 sciences.
 15 And so that has been the directive of the
 16 board to Ms. Herrera is "How do we ensure that these
 17 three areas are being met?"
 18 I believe the first one that we're
 19 addressing is through the Indigenous Montessori
 20 Training Center on how we get our teachers to
 21 understand what that process is. If we only have
 22 one certified Montessorian that's at that school, I
 23 have said it, and I said this earlier. You can go
 24 back to all of my minutes going back from the time I
 25 came onto this board, and my questions have always

101

1 focused on the idea, "Why do we only have one, and
 2 what are we doing to satisfy this?"
 3 Now, this isn't what past administrations
 4 have done, because I'm not going to go into that
 5 area. We are now in charge. We now have fidelity
 6 to the school, and we're trying to find remedies to
 7 solve that issue.
 8 The second part is how do we ensure that
 9 the arts integration is performative? And I think
 10 that's where these adult issues have come about,
 11 where Moving Arts Española has been an incredible
 12 asset to this community. They provide that arts
 13 integration through this scenario.
 14 I'm sure you've received an e-mail from
 15 Prairie Boulmier, and you saw the statement from
 16 Representative Roger Montoya sent to all of you.
 17 And it's those issues where we have been really
 18 focused on the idea of removing that toxic
 19 environment out of the process, because we, as a
 20 board, can't respond to any of that stuff. That's
 21 no in our purview.
 22 Whatever those issues are, we don't make
 23 those contracts. I've been accused that the only
 24 reason I'm on the board is to carry out the
 25 Representative's ideology because it's a Moving Arts

<p style="text-align: right;">102</p> <p>1 project. But Moving Arts is the only provider of 2 arts integration.</p> <p>3 As far as the science, we're already 4 beginning to look at how do we include NASA and 5 other areas into that process to make sure that that 6 STEM process is carried out. And thank God we have 7 an incredible educator who's there that is carrying 8 on those STEM processes for those students.</p> <p>9 Those are really the three areas that we 10 are focused on and how that plays out.</p> <p>11 As far as the Performance Framework, that 12 is an area -- and the sheet and the guide -- our 13 first conversation that we had with Director Chavez 14 was in November about this issue. This was 15 something that should have been conducted prior to 16 the actual approval of the contract.</p> <p>17 And then we're saying, "The sheet does not 18 exist."</p> <p>19 So the first part was to get the 20 Mission-Specific Goals addressed, which we did.</p> <p>21 Now the second part is saying, "Okay, what 22 are the Performance Framework scoring methodologies 23 that we need to ensure are adhered to so that that 24 process plays out?"</p> <p>25 And Ms. Herrera and I have dedicated our</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">104</p> <p>1 been passed to us by individuals that can receive 2 those police reports," and then summarize it in a 3 way that presents that information to the 4 Commission.</p> <p>5 So with that, I will stop my comments. 6 Thank you.</p> <p>7 THE CHAIR: Okay. Yeah. Well -- and I 8 guess this is what I'm going to be more clear on. I 9 think, from my understanding, the reworking of the 10 mission goals has recently happened; correct? Like, 11 just several days ago?</p> <p>12 MR. ISAAC CASADOS: On December 10th, 13 during a work session. And that was -- that was 14 something that we are planning on presenting back to 15 the Commission. But we needed to move through that 16 process to ensure that if our mission was 17 inadvertently changed and the board was not informed 18 about that, well, then, we're saying, "Listen, all 19 of -- you go back to all of our board minutes, and 20 they have our old mission statement, because that 21 was what the board was working off of."</p> <p>22 And that was a challenge to us to see that 23 immediate shift. And we're thinking how did this 24 happen, and how did that occur?</p> <p>25 THE CHAIR: Sure. And I guess this is</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">103</p> <p>1 time to ensuring -- going over hours to ensure that 2 that process plays out so that we can now inform the 3 PEC to say, "Okay, here is what we've done, here is 4 how we've carried out these processes."</p> <p>5 And the good part is if we weren't 6 carrying these conversations on with Director Chavez 7 or we were responding to you or ensuring that that 8 process played out, I think then that would be a 9 huge violation.</p> <p>10 But any communication that comes from you 11 or comes from Director Chavez -- Director Chavez 12 calls me at 8:30 at night and says, "Hey, we've got 13 this issue. What do you think is happening here?"</p> <p>14 Or, "What do you think is happening here?"</p> <p>15 And I'll respond or say we'll follow up 16 with an e-mail based upon these areas.</p> <p>17 As far as evidentiary support, we have 18 done whatever has been placed in your official 19 letters. We respond with evidence.</p> <p>20 There are certain areas -- and I know 21 Commissioner Robbins wants to see a police report. 22 We're not allowed by law to give you that. We're 23 not allowed to provide you that information. All we 24 can do is say, "Here is what -- the information 25 we've received, here is the information that has</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">105</p> <p>1 where I'm going to just be very blunt with you. In 2 black and white, there is record of the change, the 3 adoption, the agreement. So until that changes 4 again and it's approved, that had to be adhered to.</p> <p>5 You can't -- like, the current mission, as 6 agreed to -- we do have -- I mean, we can just -- I 7 have it right here in front of me that the board 8 voted on it.</p> <p>9 There's minutes on the website. There's 10 minutes that say that it was looked at. It 11 doesn't -- I will tell you -- and maybe this is 12 where the confusion is when you look at the 13 minutes -- it doesn't say specifically that the 14 mission -- nothing specific about the mission. It 15 says that the contract and the amendment were 16 approved, which the change in mission was a part of.</p> <p>17 And the Performance Framework was 18 approved, which the mission was a part of.</p> <p>19 The mission goals were approved, and the 20 Performance Framework, which the governing board did 21 approve.</p> <p>22 It doesn't look like it's a special 23 meeting, either. So I would like to see an 24 acceptance of what was there. This is what was 25 there.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">106</p> <p>1 If it needs to change, that's -- I -- 2 there's appropriate ways to do that. That makes 3 sense. There's appropriate ways to do it. Having 4 looked at it again, believing there needs to be an 5 update, presenting that to the Commission, that's 6 the appropriate way to do it. 7 But for the past six months, there has 8 been something in place. And, for me, that is 9 what's not been followed yet; right? That's not 10 been followed. 11 You can't even assume that whatever is 12 proposed to the Commission in the future is going to 13 be accepted. 14 So what's in the contract, what's in the 15 Performance Framework now has to be addressed. It 16 can't be abdicated because it doesn't make sense or 17 it's not what's actually in place or it's what the 18 previous folks had agreed to. That had to be 19 followed. 20 And that's just what's in black and white; 21 right? Like, if I take out any of the external 22 conversations, anything extra, there is some -- 23 there's things in here about the mission, mission 24 goals that are very clear. 25 And I will say I actually think there</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">108</p> <p>1 it sounds like this is part of what you're looking 2 at already, it's just not being presented, the 3 evidence isn't being provided, it's that, "Lead 4 Montessori classroom teachers will be Montessori 5 certified by a MACTE accredited program within three 6 years of employment." 7 So that also gives you lead time of 8 figuring -- I mean, you have three years of everyone 9 being employed to do it. So it's mostly just like 10 the plan. And if anyone's been there for three 11 years, are they certified or not, I think those 12 could have been addressed -- right? -- this -- over 13 the course of the six months, instead of looking -- 14 being like, "Oh, that's what they did, and we 15 don't -- we weren't a part of it." 16 It's difficult for me to see minutes that 17 say that the governing board, three members, were 18 there. I, mean I -- and, once again, if there was 19 some -- we did ask in August if there were issues, 20 for it to go back and be corrected. 21 And so evidence of that just hasn't been 22 presented to give me any other knowledge, other than 23 that for this semester, it's just not being 24 addressed. 25 And, once again, I will say, Mr. Casados,</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">107</p> <p>1 could have been fidelity to this during this time. 2 There's just nothing -- there wasn't any evidence 3 that shows there was. That's what's frustrating is 4 it's -- maybe you were doing these things; right? 5 Like, the mission -- the first mission 6 goal was that -- that your primary and lower 7 elementary students with four semesters of 8 attendance -- so already, you're limiting your 9 students who you have the most responsibility for -- 10 and the upper elementary and adolescent community 11 with six semesters will receive and exhibit mastery 12 of Montessori lessons presented for their plane of 13 development. 14 Maybe that's happening. I mean, that 15 could be happening. And I don't think it's taking 16 out what you're doing in the arts and sciences. I 17 don't think that there's -- we're not saying, "Oh, 18 you're doing nothing." 19 But for me, this is really -- that's 20 specific, that there's a specific Montessori plane 21 of development that should have been followed over 22 this last semester. And I just don't have -- CSD 23 hasn't been presented with evidence that that has 24 been happening. 25 Then the second goal, which, once again,</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">109</p> <p>1 I don't think that this is actually -- I think, you 2 know -- I'm clear on what your role is is oversight 3 and just ensuring that these things are happening. 4 It ultimately comes down to your head learner and 5 your teaching community to provide these things. 6 You're just checking up, making sure it happens, 7 coming and talking to us, having to be the face of 8 it -- right? -- when you're coming and talking to 9 us. 10 But I -- and I do think -- once again, I 11 will say when I -- when the PEC has written out and 12 been specific in our expectations of the governing 13 board, I have seen follow-up on 99 percent of it. 14 You know, like, I see those things then change. 15 So I am also encouraged to think that if 16 we talk about, you know, "Hey, we're concerned about 17 these items that are part of your contract and have 18 not" -- we've asked for evidence, or we've asked -- 19 CSD has asked, we haven't gotten it still, it needs 20 to be corrected. 21 I believe you're going to go back and do 22 it. I do think that. I do have confidence that 23 you're going to go back, and you're going to 24 provide, by the time we see you again, how you're 25 going to address these things.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">110</p> <p>1 But it has to be parallel to your plan of 2 changing it, because we do have something set in 3 place right now. So it has to be done in parallel, 4 not waiting for that next part to happen and go 5 along. 6 So I think that's where -- we can go back 7 and forth on the May approval of it or how the 8 contract went into place. And if that's what we 9 want to spend our time doing, we can figure it out. 10 But we do have -- we don't have any evidence or 11 concern that there was anything wrong with the 12 approval of these. 13 So that's where -- that's where I'm kind 14 of standing is I don't see anything where I'm 15 concerned about how these got approved and how it 16 got done. It seems like the process was followed. 17 I do understand if there's 18 miscommunication, misunderstandings. But, once 19 again, that seems like an internal part of the whole 20 chaos that started at the end of the last school 21 year. 22 So that, to me, once again -- and that's 23 where I get concerned about -- you know, I know the 24 head learner changing over is going to cause 25 disruption. I mean, it just is. That's a -- I know</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">112</p> <p>1 of level of consistency to be able to follow 2 through, because I can only imagine if we also had 3 the chair of this board leave and we had a new chair 4 and a new chair and another person come, the lack of 5 response from the governing board would probably be 6 a concern. 7 And it's not. The response from the 8 governing board, they do respond. I just don't know 9 if we're getting the complete responses we need in 10 order to be able to continue moving forward in a 11 positive way. 12 And so I also -- I'm going to support 13 moving to another step, because, once again, I think 14 at this point now, I am concerned about the academic 15 success of the students. And that's what's most 16 concerning. 17 And I also believe -- and, Director 18 Chavez, please, absolutely, correct me if I'm wrong. 19 But I think there were some filings that were missed 20 during this transition of head learners. So I'm 21 concerned about the timeliness of just the school 22 being able to provide the -- just the basic parts of 23 being a school. 24 So let me make sure that that was correct 25 that I had read about that. They're conversing to</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">111</p> <p>1 the board, like, has tried to keep replacing every 2 time someone leaves. 3 But you're going to have chaos. The 4 community will have cha- -- like, the changeover in 5 the head learner is going to create destabilization. 6 I mean, it just is. That's normal -- that's typical 7 with any school. No matter how great the school was 8 before, if it was already having problems or not, 9 it's just going to create fluctuation, in any 10 organization. 11 We know, in business, in anything, if you 12 have four different CEOs in the span of three 13 months, that's utter chaos in any organization. 14 So I -- I am grateful that at least the 15 governing board hasn't changed over more; right? 16 Like, that's -- seems to have stabilized a little 17 bit. And it seems like there's a governing board 18 who, through the chaos, has stayed, which sometimes 19 can be difficult when you have the chaos going on. 20 I mean, governing board members are volunteers, and 21 oftentimes, if they're, like, "I don't need this." 22 Like, "This is -- I don't have to be part of this," 23 and they leave when there's chaos. 24 And I am grateful, I want to say, to the 25 governing board for staying and providing some kind</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">113</p> <p>1 make sure I know what I'm talking about. 2 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: Chair Burt, I 3 think that the negligence in reporting occurred 4 under a prior chair. I feel like the school has 5 right-sized itself in terms of that. 6 THE CHAIR: So the -- since September, the 7 school hasn't missed any PED reporting requirements. 8 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: Correct. 9 THE CHAIR: Okay. So it was prior to 10 that. Okay. All right. So I will apologize for 11 even bringing that up then. 12 But those are the kind of issues that I 13 get so concerned of, like, when there's adult 14 issues, and there's lots of transitions, that 15 sometimes those are the kind of things that slip 16 through the cracks. But right now it doesn't seem 17 like a slip-through-the-crack thing. 18 It seems like the teaching community seems 19 to be butting heads -- once again, I don't know 20 the -- to me, it feels like I don't really know if 21 the governing board could do much right by the 22 families and by the teachers right now, because I do 23 think there's some external factors of people 24 leading some maybe misinformation or information 25 about what's going on or how things are happening</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">114</p> <p>1 that's causing and creating additional chaos instead 2 of coming together to support who is there, who's -- 3 who's leading it. 4 There is a -- there is a governing board. 5 There is a school leader. The community really 6 needs to come together at some point, support the 7 leadership, and be able to start moving forward in 8 what's in the best interests of the kids instead of 9 just constantly butting heads about things that have 10 happened in the past and who should have been hired 11 and fired and how things went. It needs to be 12 settled down and move forward. 13 So I am concerned about the education of 14 the schools and the Montessori-specific. Maybe 15 you're doing the arts and sciences great. 16 I'm concerned about your participation 17 rate of your assessment. So I like that you already 18 said, "Okay, we're going to look at how can we 19 support as a governing board." 20 But hopefully, the principal is the one 21 that's really looking at how do we get more 22 students, making sure we're equitably testing all of 23 our students so we can really see where they're at. 24 But, yeah, this is -- it's difficult 25 because there's some things that are in here that,</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">116</p> <p>1 occurring. And Ms. Herrera has ensured that that 2 process plays out. That's number one. 3 Number two, one of the things that Mateo 4 and I -- so Mateo kind of was part of this ad hoc 5 group that they started. 6 We finally sat down for the first time 7 last night and had it out for about two hours, 8 talked about all of these issues, saying, you know, 9 there are personality issues that are ongoing, and 10 we need to look at what is in the best interests of 11 the school to ensure that there's fidelity in 12 ensuring that two years from now, we may be going 13 through challenges, that we can now turn to it and 14 say, "Hey, this is a Blue Ribbon School. We were 15 able to do X-Y-Z, and we got to this level." 16 And being that the school provides the 17 opportunity for such a marginalized population, it 18 would be a travesty for the school to leave this 19 environment. But the overall opportunity is that 20 this board is doing whatever it can -- when we are 21 addressed with a specific issue, we meet it. We 22 address the issue immediately. 23 It seems like we're constantly berated by 24 multiple issues, and then we come before the PEC and 25 get attacked on with other issues. And we're</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">115</p> <p>1 once again, I'm just going to keep referring back to 2 the contract, what's been agreed to, are you 3 providing evidence that that's what we're following. 4 That's what we're doing. 5 The other things that are happening, the 6 community really needs to come together in a 7 collaborative way, put the fists down, and start 8 working together, because the chaos is going to lead 9 to further issues and to revocation at some point if 10 we can't make it to where the adults come together 11 to educate these students in a good way. 12 Mr. Casados, you can respond. And then 13 we're going to go -- I have Commissioners raising 14 their hands waiting for me to finish. 15 MR. ISAAC CASADOS: Thank you so much, 16 Chair Burt. So I think your comments are taken to 17 heart. It is one of these things where coming into 18 a new position, you're learning about all of these 19 processes as you're moving through it. 20 And I think the Montessori education 21 hasn't changed. What has occurred at La Tierra 22 Montessori School has continued. 23 And we have ensured, if you have the same 24 staff that is there, they're continuing on that 25 specific element of Montessori education that is</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">117</p> <p>1 constantly addressing. Now I understand. If our 2 board says, "Not a big problem. PEC doesn't have 3 authority over us, we can do whatever we want. 4 We're not going to communicate back. Just let them 5 do whatever they're going to do." 6 That's not who we are. Five of us are 7 lock, stock, and barrel. This is probably the most 8 united board that this board has ever been in our 9 history of our school. It is one of the most 10 diverse. 11 I'm the first Native American. We have 12 two members of the LGBTQ community who sit on it. 13 We have an individual who comes from a CYFD 14 background. We have another person who comes from a 15 social work background. I mean, we have another 16 that's an attorney. 17 It's not that we just have random folks 18 sitting on a board. And it is a lot. I mean, this 19 past week it's 71 hours is what I've logged doing 20 this as a volunteer. It's a lot of work. 21 And I don't do this because this is 22 political for me, this is an aspiration for me. 23 This is not something I would recommend that someone 24 do if they want to move in in politics, because 25 you're never going to satisfy everybody's request</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">118</p> <p>1 and everybody's issue.</p> <p>2 But I do it because I want children like</p> <p>3 me, who were born and raised in this community, to</p> <p>4 have an opportunity to one day go to Georgetown</p> <p>5 University like I did, to be able to look at</p> <p>6 themselves and say, "How do I become a leader within</p> <p>7 my community?"</p> <p>8 And we are trying our hardest. I mean, we</p> <p>9 are trying our hardest just to keep this school</p> <p>10 alive. And it's a lot.</p> <p>11 And so with that, I know Ms. Herrera has</p> <p>12 her hand raised, and you can call on her if you'd</p> <p>13 like.</p> <p>14 But it's a lot. And none of what you say</p> <p>15 is taken with a grain of salt. I mean, from what</p> <p>16 Commissioner Carrillo, Gipson, Robbins, and Voigt</p> <p>17 say, we are constantly looking at everything you say</p> <p>18 to find ways that we can rectify these issues as</p> <p>19 clearly and as concisely as possible.</p> <p>20 Thank you.</p> <p>21 THE CHAIR: Yeah. And I -- I -- you know,</p> <p>22 the last thing I'll say is I do -- I think that it</p> <p>23 is the -- yeah, I guess it's just the -- the avenues</p> <p>24 that we have. I think what is difficult is when we</p> <p>25 have folks that come and speak to us and want us to</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">120</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER GIPSON: Okay. Thanks. I</p> <p>2 just want to mention one other thing. The contract,</p> <p>3 the comprehensive educational program that's in the</p> <p>4 contract that has been publicly available since it</p> <p>5 was signed, does not indicate a STEM program and</p> <p>6 does not indicate arts integration.</p> <p>7 It clearly says that there will be arts</p> <p>8 offered weekly, and that the agricultural program</p> <p>9 will be part of it.</p> <p>10 But, number one is essentially the</p> <p>11 Montessori instruction. So that this notion of STEM</p> <p>12 and arts integration, there is nothing in the signed</p> <p>13 contract with the educational program at this moment</p> <p>14 in time.</p> <p>15 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Robbins?</p> <p>16 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Thank you. And,</p> <p>17 you know, Mr. Casados and Ms. Herrera, I appreciate</p> <p>18 the time, and I understand fully that, you know,</p> <p>19 someone will say, "Oh, it's only going to take three</p> <p>20 or four hours a week," and you wind up taking</p> <p>21 20 hours a week to do something, to do it right. So</p> <p>22 I do appreciate the dedication and your commitment</p> <p>23 to it.</p> <p>24 As Ms. Gipson -- Commissioner Gipson just</p> <p>25 said, we have to go with what the contract says</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">119</p> <p>1 help, our avenues of helping are generally not</p> <p>2 positive.</p> <p>3 I don't know how else to explain that.</p> <p>4 Like, our options are to -- like, it will lead --</p> <p>5 like, if things don't get better, our option that we</p> <p>6 have in front of us is school closure. That's</p> <p>7 what -- our extreme ability to help the school, if</p> <p>8 it doesn't correct itself, if the people at the</p> <p>9 school cannot fix these issues, that is the option</p> <p>10 we have is to close the school.</p> <p>11 So I also -- you know, it is the adults at</p> <p>12 the school that have to fix these issues. We as the</p> <p>13 PEC cannot fix these issues. It is the adults at</p> <p>14 the school. It's the people in the community that</p> <p>15 have to come together to fix these issues.</p> <p>16 So I do want -- like, I'm worried, you</p> <p>17 know, that if things get more extreme, that's our</p> <p>18 avenue -- that's what we have as an avenue.</p> <p>19 And I don't think that's what the</p> <p>20 community -- it's not what I'm hearing what the</p> <p>21 community wants is for the school to close.</p> <p>22 So once again, that's why I'm encouraging</p> <p>23 adults to come together and remedy these issues.</p> <p>24 I think I saw Commissioner Gipson first,</p> <p>25 and then Commissioner Robbins.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">121</p> <p>1 right now. And one of the concerns is some of these</p> <p>2 changes that the board approved, nothing has come to</p> <p>3 the Commission as a contract amendment change or a</p> <p>4 renegotiation of the contract.</p> <p>5 So although the board has approved it, the</p> <p>6 school cannot implement those changes until such</p> <p>7 time as the contract has been approved, changed, and</p> <p>8 approved by the Commission.</p> <p>9 You mentioned that you can't give us a</p> <p>10 copy of the police report. Police reports are</p> <p>11 public record. Names can be redacted in order to</p> <p>12 meet FERPA. That's the only requirement that I</p> <p>13 understand in FERPA is that individual identities</p> <p>14 have to be protected. General information and a</p> <p>15 police report is public information.</p> <p>16 Again, I respect your efforts. As</p> <p>17 Commissioner Chair Burt said, the adults have to</p> <p>18 come together. Although this is not my district and</p> <p>19 I understand that there's been some -- an issue</p> <p>20 raised regarding the Commissioners for this</p> <p>21 District -- if invited, I would be willing to come,</p> <p>22 provided I can work that out with my schedule and my</p> <p>23 family's needs, to help mediate, if necessary.</p> <p>24 I don't know if any other Commissioners --</p> <p>25 we don't need a whole group. But to be there to</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">122</p> <p>1 listen and offer advice. But it would not be in an 2 official capacity. We cannot do that.</p> <p>3 But if you wanted to seek that outside 4 experience, you know, that might be something to do, 5 get someone from outside who can actually work with 6 the parties to mediate what's going on.</p> <p>7 You know, as you may know, I'm leaving the 8 Commission in two and a half weeks. So my role on 9 the Commission would no longer be formal, or in 10 helping charters or anything like that, would not be 11 as a Commissioner.</p> <p>12 But I want the school to succeed. I want 13 the students to succeed, and I want the employees at 14 that school, the teachers at that school, to feel 15 that they're accomplishing something, that their 16 work is meaningful for the students and for 17 themselves.</p> <p>18 Because there's nothing more, you know, 19 dissatisfying -- not the best word -- but for 20 someone who's doing a job that they hate or that 21 they don't see that there's a purpose to.</p> <p>22 So, Mr. Casados and Ms. Herrera, 23 Ms. Brown, you know, I wish you the best. I do 24 think the breach is the correct path to take. And 25 as Commissioner Carrillo said, don't view it as</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">124</p> <p>1 that the board has approved those minutes that they 2 provided to us. And that is part of our contract. 3 So I just wanted to clarify those two points.</p> <p>4 And then the third thing is that, 5 actually, in September, September 6th, whenever 6 Deputy Director Russell and I visited the school, we 7 sat down with the then head administrator, 8 Mr. Tompson, and we walked through the contract and 9 the Performance Framework.</p> <p>10 And it is my practice that anytime there 11 is a new head administrator in place, I sit down and 12 make sure they know where the contract is and what 13 it says for that school, and that they understand 14 the Performance Framework that is attached to the 15 contract.</p> <p>16 So, in fact, we have been working with the 17 school to point those things out. There's just been 18 a change in personnel. And Mr. Casados joined me 19 when I met with Ms. Herrera to -- to work on the 20 worksheet that had not yet been complete, and that's 21 when he alerted me to a confusion.</p> <p>22 And I said, "You need to fix it, and then 23 we need to find out how you're going to implement 24 these goals." 25 Also, one final thing is we are within the</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">123</p> <p>1 punishment, but as an opportunity, because this is 2 kind of the path that we have to take in order to -- 3 to work with you to try to correct apparent ills 4 that the school has. Thank you.</p> <p>5 THE CHAIR: All right. Director Chavez, 6 if there's no other Commissioner comments we're 7 going to take just a short break so that 8 Commissioners can talk to Ms. Barnes and make sure a 9 motion is clear.</p> <p>10 Director Chavez.</p> <p>11 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: Thank you, 12 Chair Burt. I wanted to just clarify a couple of 13 points that have been discussed.</p> <p>14 One is a mistake that I made. But the 15 team was able to clarify, when they visited the 16 school in November, and that is the head 17 administrator contract.</p> <p>18 I believe I reported to you that it was a 19 .25; it's actually a .19. And she's also on staff 20 at a .5 special ed teacher contract. So just wanted 21 to clarify that fact.</p> <p>22 The other thing I wanted to clarify is the 23 May 11th minutes that are included in our contract. 24 We did check for evidence that the board had 25 approved those minutes. And there is no evidence</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">125</p> <p>1 time frame for submitting the amendment. Because 2 the school just voted on those things on December 3 10th, they are, Mr. -- excuse me -- Commissioner 4 Robbins, they are still within the time frame to be 5 able to submit the paperwork in a timely manner. So 6 I wanted to make sure that -- that -- yeah, that, 7 you know, we're waiting for the amendment request to 8 come through.</p> <p>9 And I hope that it gets in sooner than 10 later, because it is really hard, Mr. Casados, and 11 it's outside -- I encourage you to read the policy 12 that to be sending us information last minute is not 13 okay. So I would encourage you to work on that 14 paperwork as soon as possible to talk about those 15 amendments.</p> <p>16 And one final thing. I know that somebody 17 mentioned that there's, you know, new things that 18 are being mentioned all the time. And, you know, 19 time marches on. And there's new things that are 20 due; there's new reports that need to be submitted; 21 there's new plans that need to be made, constantly.</p> <p>22 I mean, that's why I think it's so 23 important that the head administrator be attending 24 to what's in the Performance Framework, because it's 25 all there. There's several indicators and several</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">126</p> <p>1 things within that Performance Framework that 2 constantly need to be addressed.</p> <p>3 So just wanted to point that out. It's 4 not like I think we're trying to pile on additional 5 things. It's just that there's plenty of ongoing 6 things that occur, and, you know, time keeps 7 passing, so things keep needing to be due.</p> <p>8 THE CHAIR: Okay. So I think with that, 9 we're going to -- if you all will indulge us, we're 10 going to take hopefully no more than a five-minute 11 little break right now.</p> <p>12 Commissioners, if you're interested in 13 either making a motion or ensuring that something 14 that you have should be in the motion for whoever is 15 going to make it, if you could come over here and 16 meet up with Ms. Barnes?</p> <p>17 And thank you once again, Mr. Casados, 18 Ms. Herrera. We do appreciate you joining us today 19 and speaking with us and giving us information every 20 time we request it. We are grateful for that 21 aspect.</p> <p>22 All right. We'll come back in about five 23 minutes.</p> <p>24 (Recess taken, 11:41 a.m. to 11:48 a.m.) 25 THE CHAIR: All right. Thank you so much</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">128</p> <p>1 authority; or, two, if the designated charter 2 representatives were appropriately acting on behalf 3 of the school, then the present board has failed to 4 comply with the signed contract and implement it.</p> <p>5 Further, if there was an issue with 6 authority to enter into the charter contract, the 7 school failed to remedy any possible issues related 8 to the contract from the time period May to July 9 2022, even after being directed to correct these 10 issues by the PEC on August 19th, 2022.</p> <p>11 Section 4. 12 1. Purpose. 13 2. Mission. 14 4. Comprehensive educational program of the 15 school; and 16 Section 5. Performance Framework. 17 The governing board breached the contract 18 by failing to: 19 1. To institute a Montessori program with 20 trained Montessori staff, to provide documentation 21 to CSD regarding how the Mission-Specific Goals are 22 being implemented, and to fully implement the 23 mission and educational program as negotiated. 24 2. To set up the Mission-Specific Goals 25 and set up scoring sheet for the implementation of</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">127</p> <p>1 for allowing for that quick break.</p> <p>2 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Are you ready for a 3 motion?</p> <p>4 THE CHAIR: It looks like we're going to 5 be ready for a motion. And so Commissioner Gipson.</p> <p>6 COMMISSIONER GIPSON: Okay. So I move 7 that the Public Education Commission issue a Breach 8 of Contract Notice for the breach of the following 9 charter contract provisions -- wait a minute. That 10 doesn't make any sense.</p> <p>11 Should I not put La Tierra Montessori in 12 that first sentence? Yeah.</p> <p>13 So I move that the Public Education 14 Commission issue a Breach of Contract Notice to 15 La Tierra Montessori for the breach of the following 16 charter contract provisions: 17 Section 2. Scope. Paragraph 2, i and ii. 18 "The school must act through the 19 designated charter representatives in its contract 20 negotiations." 21 The governing board breached the contract 22 either, one, by representing to PEC that the charter 23 contract was negotiated by a person with authority 24 and approved by the board when the present board now 25 represents that those people did not have such</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">129</p> <p>1 the Mission-Specific Goals; and 2 3. To timely seek to amend the contract 3 if the board had concerns with the contract when 4 this requirement was requested of them in August of 5 2022.</p> <p>6 Section 4.5 viii and ix. "Comply with all 7 provisions of the contract and law, hiring and 8 overseeing the head administrator and comply with 9 board training and requirements." 10 And Section 4.6, Operation, ii, iii, vi, 11 and viii. "Comply with all federal and state laws 12 relating to the education of children with 13 disabilities, comply with all laws related to 14 safety, notify the Commission of allegations or 15 inappropriate contact with a student." 16 The governing board breached the contract 17 by inadequately overseeing the head administrator to 18 ensure that: 19 1. The educational program is being 20 implemented in the school. 21 2. The school staffing is appropriate, 22 and the staff is trained to implement the mission 23 and educational philosophy; and 24 3. The school is not appropriately 25 working to meet the needs and requirements of</p>

130	<p>1 special education students; and</p> <p>2 4. To address safety and health issues at</p> <p>3 the school.</p> <p>4 Section 5.2 i, ii, and iv. "Participate</p> <p>5 in State-required assessment and meet State</p> <p>6 standards of excellence."</p> <p>7 The governing board breached the contract</p> <p>8 by failing to meet or make substantial progress</p> <p>9 toward achievement of the Department standards of</p> <p>10 excellence or student performance standards</p> <p>11 identified in the charter contract, including</p> <p>12 achieving academic outcomes and participation in</p> <p>13 statewide testing.</p> <p>14 And, further, the school must:</p> <p>15 1. Have a Corrective Action Plan</p> <p>16 submitted to the Charter School Division on or</p> <p>17 before January 6, 2023, fully addressing how each</p> <p>18 issue set forth above will be remedied, and;</p> <p>19 2. If the school wants to request a</p> <p>20 proposed amendment change to the PEC, to submit a</p> <p>21 complete amendment to CSD prior to January 6, 2023.</p> <p>22 The school and CSD are directed to look</p> <p>23 into the compliance with the rights and education</p> <p>24 support for special education students at the school</p> <p>25 and report back to the PEC at the January 20th,</p>	132	<p>1 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Secretary Armijo</p> <p>2 votes yes.</p> <p>3 Chair Burt.</p> <p>4 THE CHAIR: Yes.</p> <p>5 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner</p> <p>6 Carrillo.</p> <p>7 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Yes.</p> <p>8 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Chavez.</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes.</p> <p>10 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: It passes, eight to</p> <p>11 zero.</p> <p>12 THE CHAIR: All right. Thank you.</p> <p>13 Mr. Casados, thank you for coming and</p> <p>14 representing your governing board and school today,</p> <p>15 and I know we'll be in communication moving forward.</p> <p>16 All right. That -- we do have a school</p> <p>17 who is present with us today. And so instead of</p> <p>18 taking a break, hearing a couple of other schools</p> <p>19 that are online first, I think I would like to move</p> <p>20 Item No. 10 up to right now so that we can allow</p> <p>21 them to go back to educating students instead of</p> <p>22 waiting on us. Okay. All right. Great.</p> <p>23 So we're going to go to Item No. 10, which</p> <p>24 is Discussion and Possible Action on Mission</p> <p>25 Achievement and Success Charter School Enrollment</p>
131	<p>1 2023, meeting of the PEC.</p> <p>2 Finally, the school is put on notice that</p> <p>3 the PEC may issue a Notice of Intent to Revoke the</p> <p>4 charter at its January 20th meeting if all contract</p> <p>5 breaches set forth above are not sufficiently</p> <p>6 addressed through a Corrective Action Plan, a</p> <p>7 complete proposed amendment, or any findings of</p> <p>8 issues with the special education compliance at the</p> <p>9 school.</p> <p>10 THE CHAIR: Second.</p> <p>11 I'm sorry. Commissioner Gipson, could you</p> <p>12 repeat that? No.</p> <p>13 All right. Commissioners, any comments?</p> <p>14 (No response.)</p> <p>15 THE CHAIR: All right. Seeing none,</p> <p>16 Secretary Armijo, if you could call roll.</p> <p>17 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Gipson.</p> <p>18 COMMISSIONER GIPSON: Yes.</p> <p>19 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Manis.</p> <p>20 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Yes.</p> <p>21 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner</p> <p>22 Robbins.</p> <p>23 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes.</p> <p>24 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Vice Chair Voigt.</p> <p>25 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes.</p>	133	<p>1 Cap Amendment.</p> <p>2 And so if the school would like to, you</p> <p>3 can start coming down here to our little desk panel.</p> <p>4 And I'll go ahead and hand this over, to start, with</p> <p>5 Dr. Russell and CSD.</p> <p>6 DR. BRIGETTE RUSSELL: Thank you,</p> <p>7 Madam Chair. Mission Achievement and Success</p> <p>8 Charter School is requesting PEC approval to</p> <p>9 increase its enrollment cap for its campus at</p> <p>10 1718 Yale Boulevard from 1,140 students to 1,560.</p> <p>11 The enrollment cap for the second campus</p> <p>12 on Old Coors will remain at 1,140, as that campus is</p> <p>13 still adding a grade a year and has not yet reached</p> <p>14 its cap.</p> <p>15 The proposed change would not require</p> <p>16 additional teaching staff or curriculum resources or</p> <p>17 any additional facilities.</p> <p>18 The school currently has four sections in</p> <p>19 each grade and could accommodate up to 30 students</p> <p>20 per grade for a total of 1,560 students, the cap</p> <p>21 they're requesting in each grade from kindergarten</p> <p>22 to Grade 12.</p> <p>23 So currently, under their enrollment cap</p> <p>24 of 1,140, if students are distributed evenly across</p> <p>25 grade level and there's four classrooms for grades,</p>

134

1 the school can accommodate an average of
 2 21.9 students per classroom. So they're not
 3 actually asking for additional classroom space.
 4 The E-Occupancy certificate for the Yale
 5 campus allows a maximum of 1,794, well over the
 6 enrollment cap requested.
 7 So CSD reviewed whether MAS has met the
 8 requirements in the amendment request. And with the
 9 exception of -- I know that the PEC wants three
 10 years of data. What we do not have, the only data
 11 we do not have -- is Organizational Performance data
 12 for the '21-'22 academic year, because MAS renewed
 13 its contract and signed that in 2022.
 14 So we have provided the reading, math, and
 15 science proficiencies for both MAS campuses, which
 16 are above the district and State averages for
 17 '21-'22, as well as the high school graduation rate,
 18 which is 95 percent, well above the State and
 19 district averages.
 20 We have provided screenshots of the
 21 Organizational and Financial Performance Framework
 22 for the years of the contract, which we do have the
 23 prior contract. CSD will answer any questions.
 24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Dr. Russell. All
 25 right. So we will go to the school. If you all

135

1 want to introduce yourself first and then talk to us
 2 about your amendment request.
 3 Hey, I'm right here. Yeah. If you
 4 want -- yeah. Go ahead and talk about your --
 5 MS. JoANN MITCHELL: Okay. So, first,
 6 I'm JoAnn Mitchell, th CEO and founder of MAS. But
 7 just to clarify -- there's just a point of clarity.
 8 It's not a cap increase just for one campus. It's
 9 the charter. And that was our understanding is that
 10 it needed to be. But that's what we want as well.
 11 So I just want to clarify that.
 12 It's not just for the Yale. Yale would be
 13 impacted first -- right? -- because Yale is already
 14 at cap. Old Coors is not at cap, only because we
 15 have it scaled up.
 16 Oh, I thought I just had to hold it open.
 17 Oh, you just push it once? I'm still on. That was
 18 hurting my thumb.
 19 MS. PATRICIA MATTHEWS: That was the old
 20 days.
 21 MS. JoANN MITCHELL: I was, like, that's
 22 fancy. Okay.
 23 So, anyhow, so that -- just to clarify.
 24 So, again, I'm JoAnn Mitchell. I'm the CEO and
 25 founder of MAS and --

136

1 MS. SHERRYE HUBBARD: Hi. I'm Sherrye
 2 Hubbard. I'm the Chief of Schools for MAS Charter
 3 School. Good morning.
 4 MS. JoANN MITCHELL: Introduce --
 5 obviously, Patty Matthews is our legal counsel here.
 6 And we have on the Zoom call David Campbell, who is
 7 an attorney who's done like a lot of the work with
 8 us, like the traffic and things like that, like,
 9 because I know that was a question; and Jim Strozier
 10 and Shawna Ballay with Consensus Planning, who have
 11 also supported us in that process. So we have them
 12 here remotely to answer any questions about that.
 13 So just to tell just a little bit -- you
 14 know about the school a bit, but -- so just -- just
 15 a little history on, especially for folks who maybe
 16 didn't know us and kind of like what happened.
 17 When we first started, we were -- the
 18 intention was to be a secondary school. And it was
 19 in our first couple of years that we recognized
 20 that, like, 80 to 90 percent of the students who
 21 showed up were not proficient in reading or math.
 22 We knew -- I mean, that was really the
 23 intention of our charter was to serve underserved
 24 students. I just don't think we understood the
 25 magnitude of how big the gaps would be and how many

137

1 kids would be impacted by that upon arrival.
 2 So within the first couple of years, we
 3 ended up coming back before the Commission to ask
 4 for expansion to serve the lower grades. And so we
 5 did that. That was approved, and we did that.
 6 At the time, we had asked for -- when we
 7 did it, we had only asked for 60 seats for
 8 elementary. This was just -- I'll be honest -- just
 9 bad thinking, like, never having done this before.
 10 And what we were finding was that the demand for our
 11 school was secondary. There was a huge demand.
 12 And in talking to other charters, we
 13 just -- everybody would say that, you know, the
 14 elementary is not where people are flocking to
 15 charters.
 16 So we thought, you know what? Let's just
 17 go 60 per grade for the elementary grades. And that
 18 would leave 60 open seats for middle school kids to
 19 kind of come from all over.
 20 So then as we worked with folks around the
 21 nation and started working with Charter School
 22 Growth Fund and other folks, they were, like, "Where
 23 did that plan come from? That was not very logical
 24 thinking."
 25 And I was, like, "Well, that came from

<p style="text-align: right;">138</p> <p>1 somebody who had not done this before," and was, 2 like, in my mind, it sounded logical. But what we 3 found and the data showed us was that our kids who 4 were with us, when we disaggregated the data -- so 5 the kids who were with us over time were 6 significantly outperforming the new kids, the kids 7 that came in in fifth and sixth grade -- or sixth 8 grade, seventh grade. 9 And even though our kids would grow 10 substantially, like, in middle school -- right? -- 11 even if they had just started in sixth grade, we saw 12 the data was really improving, it just -- it didn't 13 make sense. 14 And that's where we had to kind of 15 reconsider, you know what? Maybe this was not the 16 most solid plan. And then we also started to run 17 into this weirdness. We decided to flip it, because 18 as you all know, the cap only applies to the number 19 of schools at the end of the day. There's no 20 regulation around, like, how many kids you can have 21 in grade -- I could have them all in kindergarten. 22 It doesn't matter as long as I don't exceed that 23 cap. 24 So what we did internally is we inversed 25 it. We decided we would fill the elementary first.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">140</p> <p>1 all covered in the application. 2 And it's because we already have the 3 staff. The rooms aren't filled right now because 4 the funny way that the cap -- it was brought out by 5 me, the way I presented it originally when we did 6 the elementary, is that those rooms aren't really 7 completely full. 8 So we have the capacity to bring 9 additional kids in, which would bring additional 10 resources to the school. And, quite honestly, with 11 some of the resources -- there is a multitude of 12 things we would do with the increase in funding. 13 But a lot of what we want to do is increase the 14 teacher salary for us. 15 And I think I've shared this with the 16 Commission before. But one of the gaps for us is 17 that we have a significantly longer school day than 18 other schools. And we have -- so the State requires 19 the 990 instructional hours for students in 20 grades -- I think it's K through 6. 21 We provide 1,375. Like, it's a lot more; 22 right? K-5 Plus only asks for 175 more hours. 23 Like, we exceed that by several hundred -- almost 24 several hundred more than what's required, but yet 25 we get no K-5 Plus funding, because the formula</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">139</p> <p>1 But then what happened was, you know, we would start 2 having to, like, just be very mindful about not 3 backfilling any of the grades, the upper grades, 4 because we ran out of space; right? 5 That's, like, what we're looking for with 6 the cap increase is to even it out to where the 120 7 per grade is per grade. 8 To be -- you know, frankly, we probably 9 won't ever hit that number. And you might be, 10 "Well, why are you asking for it?" 11 We need the hypothetical if we never lost 12 a kid and that as we scaled up, I never had to worry 13 about playing the numbers game of making sure I 14 didn't exceed. It's easy not to exceed the 15 original; right? 16 But then if I have 17 120 kindergarteners, and they go to first grade -- 18 and kids don't leave over time. It was making it 19 complicated. 20 So we wanted to, one, serve more kids. We 21 wanted to. We had the space; we had the capacity. 22 To be really transparent, too, from a funding 23 standpoint right now -- we -- and that's as -- I 24 think Brigitte shared that our -- you know, that we 25 didn't need additional staffing and FTEs, and that's</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">141</p> <p>1 allows only for days -- I know that there's 2 conversations now. 3 We've really been pushing for 4 consideration of a change in legislation. But with 5 that, even if they said we're now going to fund up 6 to 175, we're still a couple of hundred more than 7 that right now. And one of the challenges that we 8 find is that it's hard to retain people when they're 9 not getting paid that much more. 10 And you all know this, but people will 11 say, "Well, you have the autonomy to do what you 12 want with the budget." 13 Yes, kind of. But there's only so much 14 money; right? 15 We want to serve more kids. It makes more 16 sense. I explained why we originally asked the way 17 we did. But the increase will help us to be able to 18 provide a bump in salary for our teachers. And I 19 think that will support a reduction in the turnover, 20 because I think we do a phenomenal job with 21 professional development at our school. It's a key 22 part to our organization, a key piece of what I 23 think helps us to put really strong teachers in 24 front of students. And this allows us to do that 25 even better by being able to keep those folks in</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">142</p> <p>1 place.</p> <p>2 And the last thing I'll share -- I think</p> <p>3 most folks are aware of this, and I think I've</p> <p>4 referenced this in the application. But we have two</p> <p>5 teachers in all of our literacy classes and two</p> <p>6 teachers in all of our math classrooms to provide</p> <p>7 intensive instruction to students, like, especially</p> <p>8 our kids who are struggling the most, whether</p> <p>9 they're students with disabilities, second language</p> <p>10 learners, or kids who are just not where they need</p> <p>11 to be.</p> <p>12 Again, the funding -- again, we're slim</p> <p>13 on, like, the admin side. We don't have a heavy</p> <p>14 admin staff. We're not heavy on the ops side. We</p> <p>15 really put our resources in the classroom. So</p> <p>16 this -- and I don't want to make it sound like it's</p> <p>17 just for the funding.</p> <p>18 It's to serve more kids. But this will</p> <p>19 absolutely help us with some of those gaps that we</p> <p>20 have in trying to figure out how do we pay our</p> <p>21 teachers so that we don't have that turnover as</p> <p>22 well. And this really will help us with that</p> <p>23 immensely.</p> <p>24 And the last thing I'll say and then I'll</p> <p>25 stop, there was a reference about not having three</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">144</p> <p>1 best results from, like, this year's data.</p> <p>2 So for our second grade reading results --</p> <p>3 if you look on the website, they will not be right.</p> <p>4 They still have to make an update, because what</p> <p>5 happened was we tested our kids -- so our new</p> <p>6 students, we test them right in the summer, like</p> <p>7 right in July, we start testing. But what happened</p> <p>8 was PED included that in the calculation for the</p> <p>9 Accountability Data.</p> <p>10 Because we were, like, why did our scores</p> <p>11 drop so much? They were counting in the new kids we</p> <p>12 were bringing in for the new school year, if that</p> <p>13 makes sense.</p> <p>14 So once we all figured out the error, they</p> <p>15 fixed it, but I don't know if they fixed it on the</p> <p>16 website.</p> <p>17 But, anyhow, our second grade data:</p> <p>18 77 percent proficient for literacy. The State</p> <p>19 average was 25 percent.</p> <p>20 Our ELA for language arts for fourth grade</p> <p>21 was 46 percent. The State was 36, so about</p> <p>22 10 percent higher.</p> <p>23 Eighth grade -- and we have not had a</p> <p>24 single eighth grade class yet that has come up from</p> <p>25 kindergarten. Right now, our kindergarteners that</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">143</p> <p>1 years worth of data. But I'll just highlight just a</p> <p>2 few things, if I could, and I won't go on. But a</p> <p>3 few things, just to kind of highlight, you know,</p> <p>4 some of our performance.</p> <p>5 I know early on when we -- even when we</p> <p>6 expanded and went to elementary, you know, sometimes</p> <p>7 the conversations that we had -- and expanded to a</p> <p>8 second campus -- a lot of folks would ask, like,</p> <p>9 "Can you sustain the model? Can you become that big</p> <p>10 and still do what you do and do it well"; right?</p> <p>11 And I think that we've really killed the</p> <p>12 narrative on that, that that's not a problem. In</p> <p>13 fact, I think we've done better since we've done</p> <p>14 that.</p> <p>15 We've become more systematized. We've</p> <p>16 learned how to do this better. We've worked with</p> <p>17 folks around the nation to figure out, like, how do</p> <p>18 you scale successfully so that you're not diluting</p> <p>19 the quality as you're getting bigger; right? And</p> <p>20 it's a conversation we always have -- right? --</p> <p>21 like, how do we keep continue to keep focused on the</p> <p>22 mission and don't, like, deviate from what we're</p> <p>23 trying to do. But just a highlight of some of our</p> <p>24 results.</p> <p>25 So, first, I'll just highlight, like, our</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">145</p> <p>1 we started a number of years ago are only in seventh</p> <p>2 grade right now. So these eighth grade scores are</p> <p>3 kids who were with us for either, at the most, two</p> <p>4 years. They would have been with us for six,</p> <p>5 seventh, and eighth grade.</p> <p>6 We were at 51 percent. The State was at</p> <p>7 33 percent. So that's after only two years of</p> <p>8 having kids. At the most, we were almost 20 percent</p> <p>9 higher than where the State was.</p> <p>10 Fifth grade math: 31 for the State. We</p> <p>11 were at 45 percent.</p> <p>12 And eighth grade science: 29 percent for</p> <p>13 the State. We were at 46 percent; right?</p> <p>14 And so I just highlight some of our, like,</p> <p>15 really, really bright spots.</p> <p>16 But just one other piece here.</p> <p>17 You know, and I always share this with</p> <p>18 caution, because it's never meant to be disparaging.</p> <p>19 Sometimes there's the debate about charter and</p> <p>20 public -- you know, traditional public. It's not</p> <p>21 about that. But we do need a reference point to be</p> <p>22 able to say, "Well, how are we doing? Are we doing</p> <p>23 any better?"</p> <p>24 So when we disaggregate the data and we</p> <p>25 look at -- what we did is we looked at APS as a</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">146</p> <p>1 whole, and then we disaggregated our subgroups. And 2 then we disaggregated further, and we looked at 3 about six schools in APS that serve a very similar 4 demographic to ours.</p> <p>5 So when we look at APS as a whole, all 6 grades ELA, we're 12 percent higher than APS, when 7 you look at minority students, for math and English. 8 Students with disabilities, we're 9 percent higher 9 for English, 7 percent higher for math.</p> <p>10 When you look at economically 11 disadvantaged, all ELAs, all grades, 14 percent 12 higher for ELA, 13 percent for math.</p> <p>13 And then English Language Learners, 14 13 percent higher for ELA, 14 percent for math.</p> <p>15 Now when you go apples to apples 16 comparison, and you look at schools that serve 17 almost identical group of students, you know, 18 demographic, it changes substantially.</p> <p>19 So minority students, we jump to 20 27 percent higher for ELA, 23 percent higher for 21 math.</p> <p>22 Students with disabilities, 14 percent 23 higher for ELA, 11 percent for math.</p> <p>24 Economically disadvantaged, 24 percent 25 higher for ELA, 20 percent higher for math.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">148</p> <p>1 MS. JoANN MITCHELL: Thank you. 2 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: I mean, all of that 3 is just exemplary. 4 And I'm glad that you clarified that 5 this -- the enrollment cap increase wasn't just for 6 Yale. Because I was thinking -- huh. But that's 7 great. Because the school that you have on -- is it 8 Old Coors? 9 MS. JoANN MITCHELL: Yes. 10 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: You have a lot of 11 space out there, and people want to come to your 12 school. I mean, they're seeing the results. 13 They're seeing the great program you have. You have 14 such a really diverse teaching staff. The times 15 that I've been there, I've thoroughly enjoyed 16 visiting the classrooms and seeing the curiosity and 17 feeling the learning going on in your school. 18 So I would fully support this enrollment 19 cap increase. I think it's fully justified. 20 MS. JoANN MITCHELL: Thank you. 21 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: And it speaks to the 22 great work that you're doing at your campuses. 23 MS. JoANN MITCHELL: Thank you so much. 24 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Robbins. 25 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Thank you. I also</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">147</p> <p>1 English Language Learners, 18 percent 2 higher for ELA, and 18 percent for math.</p> <p>3 So you also see there's not a discrepancy, 4 either, really, in how we're performing for math and 5 ELA.</p> <p>6 We believe we can continue to do this 7 better. We did this despite COVID. We did this 8 even in the midst of that; right? And we think 9 there's just things that we've done that we continue 10 to look at, like, how do we not just serve more, but 11 our conversation is always how do we serve better, 12 how do we perform better than what we're doing now.</p> <p>13 So I'll stop the data. Okay. 14 THE CHAIR: All right. Thank you. 15 Commissioner questions? 16 Commissioner Voigt. Commissioner Robbins. 17 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Okay. Thank you, 18 Madam Chair. Thanks, Ms. Mitchell, Ms. Hubbard, 19 Ms. Matthews, for being here.</p> <p>20 You certainly don't have to convince me. 21 I mean, your school, it just exceeds every ounce of 22 value, metrics, achievement. And, I mean, it's 23 exemplified in what you have in place as far as your 24 capacity, your sustainability, the grants that 25 you're receiving.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">149</p> <p>1 want to second that, the success of Mission 2 Achievement and Success. It's such an appropriate 3 name for the school. You've lived up to it 4 tremendously, and, actually, beyond, I think, 5 expectations maybe, even beyond the expectations 6 that you had.</p> <p>7 Again, the recognition that you have 8 nationally, and with the extra funding through the 9 grant that you were given, you can do more, 10 improve -- make improvements to the school, or you 11 can do things with your transportation. You can do 12 things -- expanding your parking across the street 13 and everything. That was a great thing.</p> <p>14 And now, hopefully, Mr. Campbell can work 15 with the City to help alleviate some of the 16 neighborhood concerns.</p> <p>17 We haven't heard anything lately. But, 18 you know, again, we need to look at how to help 19 schools fit into the community rather than forcing 20 the schools to accommodate a few loud voices, 21 because, again, I understand. Any school that's 22 near a community -- and most of the elementary 23 schools are in neighborhoods. I mean, there's 24 houses and things, and you have a lot of people 25 driving.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">150</p> <p>1 When I went to the school, you really 2 didn't have parking. When I was in elementary 3 school there was no parking on site. It was all 4 street parking. I walked to school. My brothers 5 walked to school. We walked home, you know. But 6 things have changed. 7 And so the City needs to work. This is 8 one thing that I felt that the City likes to do its 9 own thing. They say the schools do their own thing. 10 The City and the schools and the County, they need 11 to collaborate more. And I think what you've shown 12 with success of your students is admirable. 13 Can you just maybe let us know graduation 14 rates, and, if you're able to follow those students, 15 how many of them go on to either career technical, 16 you know, training or into college? 17 MS. JoANN MITCHELL: Yeah. That's a great 18 question. 19 So before I answer that, if I could just 20 kind of throw out there, too -- and we can pivot and 21 have David and Jim talk, too, whenever you guys are 22 ready to hear, just a little about what's going on 23 with the traffic stuff. 24 But I do want you to know we have come to 25 an agreement with the City, and the City is</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">152</p> <p>1 state, and there's nothing you can do about that. 2 But when they look to make choices locally, we've 3 put that data out there to parents because we really 4 hold them down tight. 5 So for our graduation rates, they're high. 6 When you look at the State, I -- don't remember, I'm 7 sorry -- like, it's -- I know we're up in the high 8 80s, high 80 percent. And you guys know that that 9 comes from that shared accountability model, because 10 when kids leave and don't graduate, they count 11 against you; right? We understand that. That's why 12 we try really hard to not let them leave; right? 13 Sherrye and I, we just got back from 14 New York. We were part of that Yass Prize. MAS was 15 recognized. Out of 2,700 applicants, we made it to 16 the top 32. So we netted \$200,000. 17 Our fingers were crossed. Sherrye and I 18 thought we were walking away with a million or the 19 half a million. But we had to settle for \$200,000. 20 We were very proud to be in the room with such high 21 achievers. When we were talking, though -- that was 22 one of the conversations we had on the plane while 23 we were sitting there -- was just some of the things 24 we want to do to continue to build and improve our 25 high school program; right?</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">151</p> <p>1 designating us as a school zone, finally, and has 2 agreed to all of that, has agreed to the 3 improvements that we're looking to do, has agreed to 4 the parking structure that we're looking to change, 5 and has -- and Jim and David and Patty have been 6 instrumental in helping us navigate -- like, we'll 7 just call it nicely -- the bureaucracy of the 8 process. We'll just call it like that. They can 9 speak more if you all have questions about that. 10 For the graduation -- I didn't cover the 11 actual number. But, like, we have -- we've boasted 12 that 100 percent of the kids who are with us 13 graduate. And what we've found in the data -- 14 because they do the -- you know, they send out 15 the -- I don't remember what it's called -- but like 16 for the shared accountability of graduation. 17 What we find is between 40 and 50 percent 18 of the kids who leave our school, anytime in high 19 school, never graduate. That's what our data has 20 showed consistently over the years since we've had 21 graduating classes. 22 So we do everything we can when we have 23 high school students to not let them leave. And 24 when families want to leave or whatever -- sometimes 25 they have to move -- right? -- like, to another</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">153</p> <p>1 I think we do a phenomenal job with the 2 dual credit. We brag about New Mexico's dual credit 3 program, because not every state has that. And so 4 when we talk to other states, they're kind of 5 surprised that we're able to do what we do. 6 One of the things we've talked about a lot 7 is looking at more at the CTE stuff and getting kids 8 into, like, internships, getting kids -- so we 9 really are trying -- that is one of our biggest 10 pushes and goals right now. And, to your question, 11 to track. People ask us, "What happens when they 12 leave?" We don't know. 13 I'll be really honest. We try our 14 hardest. I'll tell you how many families reach out 15 to us to reach out and tell us their kids are doing 16 well. 17 We had a kid who graduated with us two 18 years ago. And his mom reached out to me, because 19 she wanted her daughter, who's still at our 20 school -- she's in driver's ed -- she wanted the 21 son, who graduated a couple of years ago -- to 22 attend the driver's ed weekend thing, just to be 23 able to learn how to change tires, windshield 24 wipers, all that stuff. 25 So she reached out to me. And in her</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">154</p> <p>1 message, she told me how well her son was doing, 2 about some of the scholarships he continued, and 3 that she went back to school because she was so 4 inspired by what he was doing. 5 We hear stuff like this all the time. So 6 we know that -- we make an impact, not just on our 7 kids, but on our families; right? That's a place we 8 know we have room for growth. That's a place for 9 when we look at -- people are asking, "How are you 10 going to spend that money?" 11 We're, like, we don't have a plan right 12 now to be honest with you, because we're trying to 13 be very strategic. But that's a place we know we 14 need grant funding, because we're, like, how do we 15 track and support kids once they leave. Because 16 that's one of the biggest things we hear from kids 17 is that, "Once I got out, you guys aren't there 18 anymore." 19 We do so much hand-holding. And even 20 though we stretch ourselves and say, "Call," some 21 do, but the other ones that don't, there's not a 22 system. And what we know about some of the highest 23 performing networks around the nation is that they 24 have systems in place to support those kids beyond 25 the, "Give us a call if you need us"; right?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">156</p> <p>1 give a shout-out to Mr. Campbell. I worked with him 2 for one week back in 2011 when he was with the City, 3 and I worked in the Mayor's Office for one week, got 4 to know each other a little bit. 5 I appreciate your efforts, and your 6 experience in the Diplomatic Corps of the 7 United States, I think, has served the school well. 8 I wish you well and I wish the school the best. 9 Thank you. 10 MR. DAVID CAMPBELL: Thank you, 11 Commissioner. 12 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Gipson. 13 COMMISSIONER GIPSON: Thanks. And 14 congratulations once again. 15 MS. JoANN MITCHELL: Thank you. 16 COMMISSIONER GIPSON: You know, you truly 17 are the great example of how you can expand. My 18 concern always is, with the expansion conversation, 19 is there are very few schools that are going to do 20 it the way you do it, you know. That's -- it's, 21 like, yes, you can look at them and say they're a 22 great example. But how many people can sustain the 23 model that you do? 24 And that's what I appreciate from you, the 25 dedication, the commitment, the work that you've put</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">155</p> <p>1 So we're looking to do some of that. 2 Like, that's really a growth area for us over the 3 next couple of years is to really further develop 4 our high school program so that there's more 5 opportunities to get kids into job experiences, 6 internships, like, just let them experience a little 7 bit more. Because we also think if you can get kids 8 experiencing it, then they'll go through the tough 9 part of the classes that feel meaningless sometimes. 10 To be transparent, they do. Sometimes you 11 hear from the kids, "Why do I need this?" 12 And sometimes I have to say, "I'm not 13 sure." 14 It's part of the trajectory, like, you 15 have to do it. I think if kids can feel the 16 career -- and not just a dream in their head, but 17 actually feel it by having that internship 18 experience -- I just think it provides that 19 intrinsic motivation that's needed for them to 20 recognize, okay, there really is a light, and I got 21 to taste that career. And it's worth kind of 22 getting through these four years. 23 Kind of a long answer to your question. I 24 hope it answers that. 25 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: It does. I want to</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">157</p> <p>1 in. 2 And I don't think there's that many that 3 fully understand. You know, it's easy to say this 4 is a great program. And it is. And we -- it should 5 be everywhere. But dig into what it takes to be 6 you, and there are very few entities that are going 7 to do that. There really is. 8 So I hope if people are looking at that, 9 you know, they spend a week with you, you know. 10 MS. JoANN MITCHELL: Thank you. 11 COMMISSIONER GIPSON: And if they think 12 they can stand up to that -- but I think there are 13 very few people that stand up to your standards. I 14 do. 15 So I'm fully in support of the amendment. 16 But, you know, it's just -- and I am so grateful 17 that we're not blown up. 18 MS. JoANN MITCHELL: Me, too. 19 COMMISSIONER GIPSON: I was, like -- I 20 don't have Zoom on my thing. I was, like, "Oh, 21 please." So it's, like, thank you, holiday season. 22 MS. JoANN MITCHELL: Right. We said the 23 same thing. We brought crystals and everything, 24 whatever it takes. 25 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Carrillo.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">158</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Thank you very 2 much for being here, and congratulations to the 3 school. 4 MS. JoANN MITCHELL: Thank you. 5 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: It means a great 6 deal -- for anyone out there listening, it means a 7 great deal to us when people that are pretty 8 nearby -- Albuquerque, I would say, is nearby -- 9 come here to address the Commission and address 10 their concerns. 11 And I can say that I always feel like the 12 Commission is slighted when people don't, when they 13 don't take it seriously to just come see us and meet 14 us. 15 So I have a couple of questions for you. 16 There's no question that you have a very 17 successful school. Oh. By the way, you have a 18 95 percent graduation rate, at least based on the 19 report that I have here. 20 MS. JoANN MITCHELL: Thank you. 21 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: So -- but the 22 thing that I'm -- I'm very supportive of the 23 increase. Okay. Done. 24 But the thing that I'm concerned about is 25 while you're succeeding much more than many other</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">160</p> <p>1 But I'm fully in support. And, clearly -- 2 I mean, I received a couple of letters. There are 3 people that spoke this morning. And you're filling 4 a need for a really serious academic environment. 5 And I love that there's a lot of people 6 who are willing to put in those extra hours and 7 staff, but also kids and parents that see the need 8 for that and how it's benefiting their kids. 9 So thank you very much for your commitment 10 to our kids. 11 MS. JoANN MITCHELL: Thank you. If you 12 don't mind me responding, I just want to share with 13 you that -- Sherrye can vouch for me. Like, this is 14 one of the things I think my staff sometimes think 15 she's never happy, because what I always tell them 16 is when we celebrate and we look at that data, and I 17 say that 51 percent of our eighth-graders are 18 proficient in English, I remind them there's 19 49 percent who are not, so we're not done. 20 This is not to excuse where we are; right? 21 Sherrye can attest for me I am relentless about 22 this. That is somebody's child; that's somebody's 23 future. I'm relentless. Sometimes I think my staff 24 are, like, "She's never happy"; right? 25 But I tell them, "I won't be, because I</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">159</p> <p>1 schools, there are numbers that still, to me, you 2 know, they're challenging when we have proficiency 3 scores -- and I'm sure you've got the same 4 information that I have -- where it's definitely 5 higher than the State and the district. But I know 6 it's not where you want to be. 7 I know you're working hard on that. So I 8 just want to say I'll be looking to the next, you 9 know, couple of annual reports to see that there's 10 progress in these areas. 11 MS. JoANN MITCHELL: Thank you. 12 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Because for me -- 13 and I know that Commissioner Robbins feels the same 14 way -- graduation rates are great, but not if the 15 kids can't fill out a job application when they 16 leave, or, as -- as -- as Commissioner Gipson had an 17 experience where the person couldn't even figure out 18 20 percent of the bill. 19 And it's, like -- and this was here in 20 Santa Fe. So she probably went to Santa Fe Public 21 schools, and I'll own my part of whatever happened 22 in the last however many years. 23 But the kids need to be not just -- or 24 they need to be proficient as opposed to just 25 graduating.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">161</p> <p>1 know what the outcomes are for kids who don't get 2 this" -- right? -- "who don't get there." 3 And so, again, not to excuse the data, but 4 to explain it. We backfill -- and I can tell you a 5 lot of really high performing charter networks 6 around the nation won't backfill after the early 7 elementary grades. 8 We'll backfill all the way up to the high 9 school spots. And that's challenging, because you 10 get kids who come to you in eighth grade -- I'll 11 tell you, our kids -- I should have brought it. 12 But when we disaggregate the data and we 13 look at kids who have been with us for a year, two 14 years, three years, it's substantial the difference 15 in how kids perform the longer they're with us; 16 right? 17 We have mobility; right? I think we're 18 about a 15 percent mobility rate. COVID made it 19 worse. I'll tell you, we've seen more mobility over 20 the last couple of years than we've ever seen in the 21 history of our school. 22 One of the things that we've talked about 23 of how do we kind of address some of this is that 24 we're really trying to address the community part a 25 little bit. And when I say "community," I'm talking</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">162</p> <p>1 about our parent community, because we can work so 2 hard with kids in school, but if we don't support 3 and lift the family as well, we won't ever really 4 make a change.</p> <p>5 We have a trip coming up with some of our 6 grant money -- but this was planned before we even 7 got that funding -- was to visit Harlem Children's 8 Zone. And I don't know if you guys are familiar 9 with Harlem Children's Zone. They're very 10 well-known. Geoffrey Canada. Some of you might 11 have read some of the books, like the Whatever It 12 Takes book.</p> <p>13 But we're going on a visit to Harlem 14 Children's Zone. And it's not just to see the 15 school; it's to see all the community support. 16 That's what they boast the most is community 17 support. Grades, all that stuff is great in the 18 school.</p> <p>19 But what they'll tell you is "We didn't 20 get here from the work in the school. We lifted the 21 community."</p> <p>22 So that's the another one of our shifts, 23 where are we going in the next five to ten years. 24 We're trying to figure out how do we change our 25 community outside of the school setting, how do we</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">164</p> <p>1 some assurance that we're aware, and we're already 2 working toward that.</p> <p>3 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: I appreciate your 4 response very much. There's happy, and then there's 5 content. And we're never content -- we'd be happy 6 all the time, but we're never content until we reach 7 those other kids. That's exactly what you said.</p> <p>8 We had the pleasure, actually, earlier 9 this week, renewing some just phenomenal schools. 10 And, you know, one of the things they all had in 11 common was the parental -- the parental piece, 12 really focusing on -- the day doesn't end at 4:00 or 13 3:00 or whatever it is.</p> <p>14 I love that you guys recognize that as 15 foundational to your success. So thank you very 16 much.</p> <p>17 MS. JoANN MITCHELL: Thank you.</p> <p>18 THE CHAIR: All right. I'll just say -- I 19 mean, I'm easily -- very easily supporting an 20 increase. More students need to be at your school. 21 That's what I believe. More students should be a 22 part of your program.</p> <p>23 One of the things that you said -- and I 24 believe I've heard you talk about before -- it may 25 have been at renewal before and that you said today</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">163</p> <p>1 lift families; right?</p> <p>2 And so it takes funding for that. That's 3 one of the reasons for going is we have to ask, "How 4 did you do it?" Because we've got to find new 5 resources to do this, because it's not the 6 operational dollars of the school that can fund some 7 of these different things; right? And we have 8 ideas. But I know this is going to radically change 9 some of the stuff that we do, at least as far as the 10 outside stuff.</p> <p>11 Because we do a fair amount right now, at 12 least relatively speaking. I know there's so much 13 more we can do, and I think this will help to 14 impact, reduce mobility, and ultimately build those 15 relationships that we need with families to make 16 them so invested in the school that this gets 17 easier.</p> <p>18 Because some of those high performing 19 networks, they'll tell you that "We didn't do it 20 alone with just great teachers; it was the families 21 that become partners in the education."</p> <p>22 And so I think our families are very 23 supportive, but I think we're missing some ways we 24 can get this even better.</p> <p>25 So I appreciate your comments and give</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">165</p> <p>1 that piqued my interest -- was that you'll pay your 2 teachers more because of this increase.</p> <p>3 Because I know you have a much longer day 4 and a longer school year than many traditional 5 schools. And you've been concerned that you need to 6 pay teachers more to be at your school, not -- and 7 just like the time itself, but also I know the 8 standards and expectations for your teachers are 9 also very high. And I know your school is very 10 courageous in ensuring that the right teachers are 11 at your school, and you don't allow teachers to stay 12 at the school that are not, you know, diligent with 13 the standards that you expect.</p> <p>14 And so what do you -- what does this look 15 like for teachers and recruiting in order to have 16 more students providing more money to your school so 17 that you can pay teachers more? What does this 18 increase tangibly look like for that?</p> <p>19 MS. JoANN MITCHELL: That's a great 20 question. We talked about this at a staff meeting 21 this morning. Sherrye and I went to the building 22 first for our staff meeting and came here. We 23 shared what we're doing up here today, and this is 24 part of what we're hoping for the outcome is this 25 will help.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">166</p> <p>1 I don't have a number right yet -- 2 right? -- because that will be contingent. It will 3 be contingent on the K-5 Plus -- a number in JoAnn's 4 head is at least a \$10,000 increase for each person. 5 Because when you mathematically do the hours, when 6 you look at the hours of what our teachers work 7 compared to APS, it is so radically different; 8 right? 9 And it's hard. We lose people, and 10 sometimes -- well, teachers aren't in it for the 11 money. But teachers shouldn't have to work a second 12 job to sustain their families; right? And they're 13 giving so much to other people's children, they 14 should be able to go home and give to their own 15 children. 16 So we pride ourselves, too, that most of 17 our teachers, most of their kids come to our school, 18 which I think says a lot; right? 19 But I think that this will really attract 20 better folks. I think it will retain folks. And I 21 think it'll make our teachers feel like they're 22 valuable professionals; right? Like, they -- what 23 they've gone to school for is valuable; right? And 24 they really make a huge difference. 25 So that's a JoAnn number in JoAnn's head;</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">168</p> <p>1 solution. But I think we'll be able to continue 2 that balance, or maybe even it out a little more and 3 have more teachers right from here, because people 4 won't want to flock to someplace else where they can 5 work a significantly shorter day. 6 I don't want to belabor this, but just to 7 add context. 7:30 to 4:30 is our teacher day. 8 That's long. 7:30 to 8:30 every morning is 9 professional development, 182 hours of professional 10 development, every year, of just that one hour 11 before. 12 That's not counting ten full school days 13 of professional development before the school year 14 even kicks off. 40 hours a week. 80 hours; right? 15 On top of that, five more days built into the year; 16 right? 17 We provide so much professional 18 development, it equates to a 197-day contract for 19 our teachers. That is substantially longer than the 20 public schools. But we can't compensate that much 21 more. 22 And you can only, I think, weigh on the 23 grace of people, like the good heart and the 24 altruistic -- I don't think it's fair to ask people 25 to do that. I think that we are very fortunate to</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">167</p> <p>1 right? But that's going to be -- we'll work very 2 closely with our business managers -- right? -- to 3 make sure that it's a sustainable budget, because we 4 would never want to be in a position where we 5 provide this increase and then we're, like, "Can't 6 hold that"; right? 7 Because, again, when we got the MacKenzie 8 Scott award, a number of people said, "Are you going 9 to give bonuses to everybody?" 10 We're not blowing it on bonuses. That's 11 not what we're doing. We want to be able to make 12 sure that we can provide salary that's sustainable 13 that really recognizes and compensates the high 14 performing folks that we have. 15 We -- during the pandemic, one of our 16 responses to COVID for how do we staff was to go out 17 of the country and find teachers. I think I shared 18 at the renewal that 50 percent of our teachers right 19 now are H-1B or J-1 teachers. 20 We're not worried about the turnover on 21 that. The H-1B's can stay here as long as they want 22 as long as they want as long as we're willing to 23 sponsor their residency here, their permanent 24 residency. 25 And so that's been a really viable</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">169</p> <p>1 find very passionate people, but they deserve to be 2 paid for the work that they do. 3 THE CHAIR: Is that where you primarily 4 see this increase -- I mean, this is going to lead 5 to an increase. And hearing that it's going to 6 require no additional staffing; right? Because then 7 it makes it to where -- because if you're just 8 balancing out, like, you're getting more kids, but 9 you're hiring more staff, then none of that changes. 10 So is that where you see this primarily moving 11 towards? 12 MS. JOANN MITCHELL: I would say a good 13 portion of this. Certainly, we would look at kind 14 of places where we're light on staffing. We're not 15 light in the classroom. I can tell you we're very 16 strong in the classroom as far as the instruction 17 and the depth of that. 18 But, certainly, we would look at some 19 additional supports, like a parent engagement 20 person, somebody to engage. I mean, there's 21 positions that in our minds are critical. 22 A college position is critical, somebody 23 to support our kids -- there are definitely 24 positions that this would support us funding and 25 sustaining the funding; right? So in our minds we</p>

170	<p>1 have ideas of where this would go and stuff.</p> <p>2 And, again, we have a very rough idea of</p> <p>3 what we want to do right now. And once the numbers</p> <p>4 come in, that's when we will stamp things.</p> <p>5 THE CHAIR: That's understandable. You</p> <p>6 actually have to have those seats, the kids in the</p> <p>7 seats, before, you can really figure it out.</p> <p>8 It just -- it made me happy to see that</p> <p>9 that -- because I know your teachers are working</p> <p>10 extra -- and you're right. I know they're caring,</p> <p>11 loving. And teachers know what they're going to get</p> <p>12 paid when they choose it as their ed prep program.</p> <p>13 I'm aware of that.</p> <p>14 But it does -- it's when you're drained at</p> <p>15 the end of the day, and you're, like, "I don't get</p> <p>16 paid enough for this." Then it's, like, "I don't</p> <p>17 get paid enough."</p> <p>18 And I'm sure your teachers are putting in</p> <p>19 everything; right? They're putting in everything.</p> <p>20 So you don't want that to be, like, what they fall</p> <p>21 back on. "And I don't get paid enough. I've had a</p> <p>22 rough day, and now there's this, too."</p> <p>23 Yeah. Easily supporting. Easily</p> <p>24 supporting.</p> <p>25 Okay. So I think we are ready for a</p>	172	<p>1 "either" -- at both campuses?</p> <p>2 THE CHAIR: I'll ask for a friendly</p> <p>3 amendment to "both campuses" instead of "either</p> <p>4 campus."</p> <p>5 You'll accept that?</p> <p>6 Okay. Thank you.</p> <p>7 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you.</p> <p>8 THE CHAIR: We will have comments from</p> <p>9 Commissioners on the amended motion.</p> <p>10 (No response.)</p> <p>11 THE CHAIR: All right. Seeing none,</p> <p>12 Secretary Armijo, if you could call roll.</p> <p>13 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Manis.</p> <p>14 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Yes.</p> <p>15 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner</p> <p>16 Robbins.</p> <p>17 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes.</p> <p>18 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Voigt.</p> <p>19 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes.</p> <p>20 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Secretary Armijo</p> <p>21 votes yes.</p> <p>22 Chair Burt.</p> <p>23 THE CHAIR: Yes.</p> <p>24 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner</p> <p>25 Carrillo.</p>
171	<p>1 motion. And Commissioner Voigt.</p> <p>2 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Okay. Thank you.</p> <p>3 Harlem Children's Zone. That's awesome.</p> <p>4 MS. JoANN MITCHELL: I know. We're</p> <p>5 excited.</p> <p>6 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: I just want to share.</p> <p>7 The most exciting school I -- Tiger Woods Charter</p> <p>8 School in Anaheim. He built his charter school</p> <p>9 right next to the public course where he learned to</p> <p>10 play golf.</p> <p>11 MS. JoANN MITCHELL: Awesome. Very cool.</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: I would like to move</p> <p>13 that the Public Education Commission approve the</p> <p>14 enrollment cap amendment request for Mission</p> <p>15 Achievement and Success Charter School to increase</p> <p>16 the enrollment from 1,140 students to 1,560 students</p> <p>17 at either campus, as long as the students are in</p> <p>18 facilities where there is sufficient E-Occupancy to</p> <p>19 house the students enrolled.</p> <p>20 Was there a --</p> <p>21 COMMISSIONER GIPSON: Second.</p> <p>22 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Okay.</p> <p>23 THE CHAIR: Thank you. Motion and a</p> <p>24 second. Hold on one second.</p> <p>25 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Instead of that</p>	173	<p>1 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Yes.</p> <p>2 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Chavez.</p> <p>3 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes.</p> <p>4 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: And Commissioner</p> <p>5 Gipson.</p> <p>6 COMMISSIONER GIPSON: Yes.</p> <p>7 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: That passes, eight</p> <p>8 to zero. Congratulations.</p> <p>9 MS. JoANN MITCHELL: Thank you, all.</p> <p>10 THE CHAIR: We're going to take lunch</p> <p>11 until 1:15.</p> <p>12 (A recess was taken at 12:37 p.m., and</p> <p>13 reconvened at 1:15 p.m., as follows:)</p> <p>14 THE CHAIR: All right. We are going to go</p> <p>15 ahead and get started again.</p> <p>16 We are on Item 8, which is Discussion and</p> <p>17 Possible Action on Cesar Chavez Community School</p> <p>18 Education Program Amendment.</p> <p>19 And to get us kicked off, we'll go to</p> <p>20 Director Chavez.</p> <p>21 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: Thank you. So</p> <p>22 Cesar Chavez Community School has requested from the</p> <p>23 PEC to approve an amendment for the educational</p> <p>24 program in the contract and to modify the</p> <p>25 curriculum, methods of instruction, and formative</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">174</p> <p>1 and summative assessments.</p> <p>2 And, Commissioners, what you will see in</p> <p>3 the Google folder is the actual request document</p> <p>4 that Cesar Chavez submitted. That's 8.a.</p> <p>5 And 8.b. is the amendment analysis</p> <p>6 conducted by the CSD team.</p> <p>7 So in there, we point out the approval</p> <p>8 factors that are part of the -- so a little</p> <p>9 clarification on timeline is that after the</p> <p>10 mediation, there was an agreement that a draft would</p> <p>11 come to us and we would provide some feedback to the</p> <p>12 school.</p> <p>13 And so that arrived in accordance with the</p> <p>14 timeline that we had agreed upon. And the CSD</p> <p>15 responded also in a timely fashion back to the head</p> <p>16 administrator. And so the document that you see</p> <p>17 that's part of our analysis towards the bottom is a</p> <p>18 box with blue font. And those are the questions,</p> <p>19 because we -- more than anything, we had more</p> <p>20 questions about -- about how Cesar Chavez would go</p> <p>21 about implementing the program. And we also wanted</p> <p>22 to be able to assess the community interest.</p> <p>23 So you'll see that our questions, our</p> <p>24 administrative completeness check was to make sure</p> <p>25 that the school had submitted all of the documents</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">176</p> <p>1 So you'll see in the analysis, Page 3,</p> <p>2 where -- where there's an explanation for which</p> <p>3 indicators are either yellow or red and the reasons</p> <p>4 why.</p> <p>5 We also provided some assessment</p> <p>6 participation rates and proficiencies. And at this</p> <p>7 point -- let's see -- did we do the participation?</p> <p>8 No. Excuse me. That was just the assessment.</p> <p>9 Yeah, it was.</p> <p>10 And I'm going to ask Deputy Director</p> <p>11 Russell to ensure that there's no change to the</p> <p>12 participation rates.</p> <p>13 But you'll see the proficiency for ELA</p> <p>14 math, science, and ACCESS data.</p> <p>15 Also, we provided '21-'22 attendance and</p> <p>16 recurrent enrollment information and graduation</p> <p>17 rates.</p> <p>18 And I would say that when we were looking</p> <p>19 at the proficiency rates, the attendance retention,</p> <p>20 and even recurrent enrollment rates, we were getting</p> <p>21 a little concerned. And then when we looked at the</p> <p>22 graduation rates, we were really encouraged to see</p> <p>23 that the school has actually increased over the</p> <p>24 years the percentage of students that it's been able</p> <p>25 to graduate.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">175</p> <p>1 that are part of the amendment.</p> <p>2 And the school had; although, they were</p> <p>3 pending a board meeting. And then later on, Tani</p> <p>4 did include that information.</p> <p>5 But, really, all of our questions centered</p> <p>6 around the narrative and the questions that were --</p> <p>7 the prompts that are part of the narrative.</p> <p>8 So those were the questions we asked the</p> <p>9 school to respond to.</p> <p>10 In the analysis, you'll see that we pasted</p> <p>11 the -- the approval factors. And those two things</p> <p>12 that are part of the PEC's policies, that the</p> <p>13 educational program amendment request does not</p> <p>14 change the essence of the school's program, and that</p> <p>15 the applicant demonstrates capacity to successfully</p> <p>16 implement the requested change.</p> <p>17 The policy also requires that we present</p> <p>18 to you all Cesar Chavez performance data, including</p> <p>19 academic, organizational, and financial for the last</p> <p>20 three years, similar to the cap expansion.</p> <p>21 So what you'll see in the amendment is a</p> <p>22 paste of the indicator, performance ratings from</p> <p>23 2019-'20 through '21-'22, and an explanation for any</p> <p>24 ratings that doesn't meet standard, and so -- tied</p> <p>25 to each indicator.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">177</p> <p>1 DR. BRIGETTE RUSSELL: (Off mic.)</p> <p>2 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: Yes, please.</p> <p>3 DR. BRIGETTE RUSSELL: Madam Chair and</p> <p>4 Commissioners, the revised participation rates</p> <p>5 changed a little for Cesar Chavez.</p> <p>6 The original participation rates for ELA,</p> <p>7 math, and science, respectively, were reported as</p> <p>8 51 percent, 51 percent, and 57 percent.</p> <p>9 The revised figures that Accountability</p> <p>10 has provided us with are 56 percent, 56 percent, and</p> <p>11 62 percent respectively. The rates went up a bit,</p> <p>12 but they are still in the Does Not Meet the Standard</p> <p>13 category. Thank you.</p> <p>14 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: So we will make</p> <p>15 that correction to the document that's in your</p> <p>16 folder and also replace it with the document that's</p> <p>17 online. Thank you, Dr. Russell.</p> <p>18 We made a notation about the submission</p> <p>19 window, because this was a suggestion to the school</p> <p>20 at the beginning of us understanding that the school</p> <p>21 was wanting to implement its program online. And so</p> <p>22 just wanted to have that for the record, that this</p> <p>23 could have been submitted a while back.</p> <p>24 In terms of professional development, I</p> <p>25 think the school did a good job of describing how</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">178</p> <p>1 they have, to this point, conducted professional 2 development to prepare their students to function in 3 this capacity. 4 They didn't really provide a plan moving 5 forward. I'd say that because Cesar Chavez has been 6 implementing an online school, there are existing 7 capacities that have been developed. 8 And when we conducted the '21-'22 site 9 visit, there was some reflection that there was 10 effective instruction and student engagement that 11 was observed as part of the online classes. 12 In terms of evidence of support, there 13 were parts of the narrative that -- that 14 acknowledged that there were a percentage of 15 students and/or families that were concerned about 16 going to online instruction. 17 And you'll see in the questions that were 18 posed, we wanted to know more about that. We wanted 19 to have a more complete story about what was the 20 survey and what were the responses. 21 And then because the school said that they 22 had created a plan to address those students' needs, 23 we wanted to understand that better. 24 I don't think that we were able to, when 25 we got the final amendment request. I think we</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">180</p> <p>1 Tani, I think it's your show now. 2 MS. TANI ARNESS: Oh, thank you. Thanks, 3 Dan. 4 Hi, everybody. Yes, thank you for 5 understanding that we weren't able to be there. We 6 really wanted to be in person today and had that 7 planned, but we will do our best through the medium 8 that we have. So thank you for providing that 9 medium. 10 We are here today with Nathan Everett, our 11 dean of students, and Anacelie Verde-Claro, our 12 governance council president. Our social worker had 13 wanted to attend with us as well, but due to the 14 timing, had to attend to students. 15 So, again, we are happy to be here today 16 to present our amendment proposal to you and to give 17 you more information and context about the direction 18 of our evolving program at Cesar Chavez Community 19 School. 20 We hope to be able to answer all of the 21 questions that you have. We know that the process 22 of discussing the amendment to our charter has been 23 at times confusing and difficult, and we really want 24 to extend our hand to develop the collaborative 25 process among us and continue moving forward to meet</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">179</p> <p>1 still have some questions about that. And, really, 2 I think that the stakeholder involvement in the 3 decision-making process has been a question that 4 I've had throughout. And so, in conclusion, I feel 5 like there's more questions that are -- that are 6 unanswered. And so that is where I will end the 7 analysis. 8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Director Chavez. 9 Now I'd like to turn it over to Ms. Tani 10 Arness and Mr. Hill. 11 MR. DAN HILL: While we're getting folks 12 online, I wanted to, one, just as a sort of personal 13 matter, say I'm not going to stick around till the 14 end of the meeting. I wanted to thank the outgoing 15 Commissioners for your service. Sad to see you go, 16 so appreciate your time and your service. 17 The other thing I want to say is just the 18 school leaders planned to be in person today. 19 Unfortunately, COVID is still happening, and 20 happening to them particularly. So they're going to 21 be remote for health reasons. 22 I think they're in good enough shape to 23 participate. But, you know, understand that they 24 wanted to be here, but they couldn't because of that 25 unfortunate circumstance.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">181</p> <p>1 the very real needs of our students and our 2 community in quality and exemplary ways. 3 As you know, our school is building from 4 our 19-year history of successfully utilizing 5 flexible learning platforms, including synchronous 6 and asynchronous learning options for students who 7 need that flexibility. 8 Our CCCS community was happy to learn how 9 shifting to high-quality virtual classes actually 10 deepens learning and engagement as well as our 11 relationship to students. That being said, we are 12 also excited to focus on the areas where growth 13 needs to continue. 14 As we have communicated CCCS has an active 15 DASH Plan, a five-year plan, and several committees 16 focused on continuous improvement in areas like 17 equity, attendance, and systems of intervention and 18 support. 19 Cesar Chavez is a school built on the 20 strategy of multiple layers of support and service. 21 And this is an area where we are constantly 22 analyzing our data and reflecting on which academic 23 strategies, structures, and interventions are most 24 effective and where we need to refine our 25 approaches.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">182</p> <p>1 While we are always tracking and focusing 2 on our data, we know today's meeting is not just 3 about data. As you can see in our amendment 4 narrative -- and I do want to clarify that you 5 have -- I think you have our most accurate 6 narrative -- or our most recent narrative, I think 7 it's the 31-page version, not the original draft. I 8 want to make sure you have that, and it sounds like 9 you do.</p> <p>10 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: If I may, Tani, 11 we do. All the attachments are combined, so it's a 12 very long PDF.</p> <p>13 MS. TANI ARNESS: Thank you very much. 14 Appreciate that.</p> <p>15 Yeah. We had another 80-some pages of 16 curriculum samples.</p> <p>17 Thank you all for -- I know you must be 18 tired after your week of all of this information, so 19 we really do appreciate you taking the time to -- to 20 work with us today.</p> <p>21 So, yeah, we -- we -- you've seen that. 22 And you know -- you can see that our ongoing data is 23 in alignment with our pre-pandemic numbers.</p> <p>24 Today we do want to focus on our school's 25 mission and our contract to our families and</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">184</p> <p>1 of witnessing deep personal growth as it 2 concentrates into academic success and then into new 3 dreams and possibilities.</p> <p>4 This student has now already worked with 5 our academic counselor to enroll at CNM and plans to 6 pursue the study of digital arts. Incredible 7 turnarounds such as these absolutely cannot happen 8 unless there are necessary structures and 9 flexibility in place and a school culture of rigor, 10 caring, and trauma-informed response to students.</p> <p>11 Cesar Chavez wants to continue providing 12 these opportunities for academic growth for our 13 students and the community they come from. We want 14 to continue to provide opportunities for community 15 engagement, self-expression, and creativity for 16 students who have been -- who have been dealing with 17 difficult histories, both outside of school and in 18 school.</p> <p>19 At Cesar Chavez, our students are given 20 opportunities to take rigorous core classes as well 21 as creative electives on Zoom. Some of our 22 electives include guitar, painting, pottery, and 23 digital art.</p> <p>24 We've also been able to create new career 25 exploration classes and independent study</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">183</p> <p>1 communities.</p> <p>2 At Cesar Chavez, we have personally 3 witnessed students who have previously refused to go 4 to Albuquerque schools for years. Their reasons 5 include depression, anxiety, health issues, not 6 feeling supported, and personal and family problems. 7 In our online environment, students have been open 8 to engaging with our teachers and social workers for 9 personal growth and support.</p> <p>10 One of my mentees, for example, missed an 11 entire two years of school, both brick-and-mortar 12 school and the first year of the pandemic. Absences 13 started with personal and family problems and, at 14 some point, turned into, "Well, what's the point, 15 anyway?"</p> <p>16 Once at Cesar Chavez, this student was 17 referred and agreed to meet regularly with one of 18 our social workers. He began learning new coping, 19 self-care, and self-regulation skills, and was able 20 to, over time, take actions to shift his situation.</p> <p>21 There was a turning point where he 22 suddenly took off and started getting straight A's. 23 He became a leader in his classes, and is preparing 24 to graduate this May.</p> <p>25 It is impossible to overstate that miracle</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">185</p> <p>1 opportunities where students can design their own 2 elective course in collaboration with their teacher.</p> <p>3 Many of our students come to us feeling 4 lost or hopeless. Cesar Chavez scaffolds learning 5 to provide universal access and help students find 6 their confidence and their voice.</p> <p>7 One student recently wrote and shared a 8 piece for our student creative writing website 9 called "The Drum."</p> <p>10 The beginning reads, "Who am I? That's a 11 question I've gotten asked a few times in my life in 12 different ways, but I never really knew how to 13 answer it. I've always said, 'J'" -- her name -- 14 "or even I don't know. When I would get in trouble 15 with my mom, a question she asked me was, Who do you 16 think you are? And I would tell her, Nobody. But I 17 am somebody." Sorry. This chokes me up. I know 18 this student.</p> <p>19 "But I am somebody. I never really 20 thought about who I was before. I guess it didn't 21 matter. But the more I grow up, I get asked that 22 question a lot. Who are you? I ask myself the same 23 thing. I guess sometimes we just have to dig 24 deeper."</p> <p>25 "Who am I? Well, I am a vessel made up of</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">186</p> <p>1 eleven elements with a brain and a heart that go to 2 war with each other constantly. I am a woman trying 3 to find the true meaning of life." 4 This writing sample goes on, and it's just 5 one example of how our students continue to amaze us 6 in our online environments, once we have established 7 trust, relationship, and a non-authoritarian culture 8 of collaboration. 9 Another example is a student who just 10 graduated. She attended Cesar Chavez before the 11 pandemic and struggled with low motivation and poor 12 attendance. 13 In the virtual classroom, her teachers saw 14 her showing up every day and participating. 15 Then in late 2020, her father passed away 16 from COVID. The family was devastated. 17 Sorry. The school -- the school was able 18 to reach out with condolences and provide social 19 work and counseling support, as was the flexibility 20 of self-paced learning. 21 When the student graduated at the end of 22 last year, she told us she kept going because she 23 knew she had to graduate for her father. She told 24 us how grateful she was for our school and our 25 support. Her younger sibling now attends our school</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">188</p> <p>1 to help her like your school has. I'd like to write 2 a letter to the Governor about how amazing your 3 school is." 4 Our teenage students are also grateful and 5 write notes to teachers and mentors. Two notes we 6 recently received read: 7 "Thank you, guys, all so much. You are 8 all so very helpful. So glad I came here." 9 And, "Thank you for taking times out of 10 your day to teach us students something we thought 11 we couldn't do, what we thought impossible, until 12 you guys made life easier, and I appreciate it." 13 These stories are endless. 14 I would like to conclude with the words of 15 Valerie Martinez, the former director of the History 16 and Literary Arts at the National Hispanic Cultural 17 Center. 18 Director Martinez recently wrote a letter 19 of support, stating, quote, "I write to support your 20 decision to meet the needs of CCCS students through 21 a thoughtful, intentional, effective, and 22 educationally sound online approach for education. 23 CCCS has become a haven for students who are not 24 able to find the options that CCCS provides at other 25 schools. CCCS has a proven record of excellent</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">187</p> <p>1 and is being successful in our online program. 2 In addition, parents frequently tell us, 3 "Thank you so much. My daughter used to hate school 4 but you have given her a love for school again." 5 Another parents shares that her son was 6 going to drop out and get his GED, but he decided to 7 give CCCS a try. He told his mom he liked our 8 school because, quote, "The teachers talk to me like 9 I'm an equal human being." 10 He stayed and graduated last May. 11 Students who came to us with a transcript 12 full of F's tell us now, "My classes are going 13 amazing. I love my teachers." 14 When asked, "So what changed?" 15 This students let us know, "The teachers 16 actually help me here. They care." 17 Our students, through their daily 18 interactions with us, know how much the staff care 19 about them, and our structures support students in 20 ways they have never experienced. We hear this 21 frequently. 22 A grandparent of one of our students last 23 year told our staff mentor, "My daughter has been to 24 a lot of schools over the years, and nobody has ever 25 communicated with us like you do, or ever been able</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">189</p> <p>1 staff, structures, and services, and has cultivated 2 this work for 19 years. You know your students, and 3 you know how to meet their needs. For these 4 reasons, CCCS is indispensable. Without you, where 5 would these students go? It is essential that CCCS 6 continue to exist. I can't imagine the educational 7 landscape in Albuquerque without it." 8 Commissioners, we appreciate your support, 9 and we are excited to continue expanding in our 10 development using new technologies and flexible 11 learning to continually improve how we are serving 12 our students, families, and community. 13 And if I could clarify one other thing. 14 The participation rate on the testing is 15 an ongoing discussion with Lynn Vasquez, our testing 16 coordinator. Traci Silva actually has our science 17 participation rate at 95 percent and our math and 18 reading participation rate at 83 percent. And 19 they're trying to figure out how to get this 20 resolved, and they're going back and forth on names 21 and working on that. So just a side note there. 22 And, again, thank you all for having this 23 discussion and for reading over our proposal. 24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Ms. Arness. 25 All right. So we will go to Commissioner</p>

190	<p>1 questions and comments.</p> <p>2 If you do have any questions about this</p> <p>3 amendment as the outcome of mediation, Ms. Barnes is</p> <p>4 happy to help explain anything about that.</p> <p>5 Otherwise, make sure -- once again, just</p> <p>6 direct your question at someone specifically just so</p> <p>7 I can help facilitate the conversation.</p> <p>8 I have Commissioner Voigt, Commissioner</p> <p>9 Carrillo, Commissioner Gipson, Commissioner Robbins.</p> <p>10 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you,</p> <p>11 Ms. Arness, for that. I really appreciate it.</p> <p>12 So I just had a couple of questions. And</p> <p>13 thanks for all the documentation that you provided</p> <p>14 for us to look over. It's great to see that since</p> <p>15 you've gone blended that you have a big decrease in</p> <p>16 your mobility rate.</p> <p>17 Do you think that's because the students</p> <p>18 feel more safe? Or anonymous? I mean --</p> <p>19 MS. TANI ARNESS: It's interesting. It's</p> <p>20 really interesting. And that was one of the things</p> <p>21 our social worker wanted to talk about today,</p> <p>22 because our social worker has over 20 years of</p> <p>23 experience and has worked at our school, I think,</p> <p>24 for the past five years. So she's seen a lot of</p> <p>25 different things.</p>	192	<p>1 as flexible as possible with students. And, of</p> <p>2 course, if a student can't -- we feel like if a</p> <p>3 student can't attend any classes, we shouldn't keep</p> <p>4 them enrolled in the sense that, like, we don't want</p> <p>5 to be saying we have students who aren't there.</p> <p>6 So what we do is we will sometimes,</p> <p>7 depending on the situation, if they're going for</p> <p>8 treatment or various things, we'll try to get them</p> <p>9 services to help them in any transition they're</p> <p>10 needing. Or we will sometimes disenroll them, and</p> <p>11 then they'll come back when things have stabilized</p> <p>12 in their life.</p> <p>13 So those situations can really -- can</p> <p>14 really vary. And we sit down with, you know, the</p> <p>15 relevant parties, the parents and students and</p> <p>16 staff, and try to help -- really, sometimes it's,</p> <p>17 like, a brainstorming situation, like, "Okay.</p> <p>18 Here's the situation. What can we do?"</p> <p>19 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: So it's really</p> <p>20 individualized, given the kiddos' situation of what</p> <p>21 they might need. Do you provide devices, one-on-one</p> <p>22 devices for kids to have at home?</p> <p>23 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yeah, that's one of the</p> <p>24 nice things at our school is we give every student a</p> <p>25 Chromebook, and we also help them get Internet. So</p>
191	<p>1 And she has found that the students are</p> <p>2 definitely expressing feeling safer, feeling less</p> <p>3 anxious, opening up more deeply in terms of talking</p> <p>4 about the issues at the -- at a core root level of</p> <p>5 what's going on for them. And so that's been really</p> <p>6 powerful. And I think for the particular students</p> <p>7 that we serve, school can be a very traumatic --</p> <p>8 traditional school settings can be a pretty</p> <p>9 traumatic environment for some of these students.</p> <p>10 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Right. I see that.</p> <p>11 And I know before -- because I remember seeing your</p> <p>12 students, and at the campus. And, you know, it was</p> <p>13 fairly crowded. There were bodies everywhere. So</p> <p>14 I'm sure they don't feel as threatened, you know,</p> <p>15 just being in the presence of, you know, another</p> <p>16 student that might give them the mad-dog eyes or</p> <p>17 something. You know what I mean?</p> <p>18 So that's good. That's really great to</p> <p>19 hear, that your mobility is really stabilizing.</p> <p>20 When you mentioned that a class -- like,</p> <p>21 if a student wanted to take a pause on attending</p> <p>22 classes, they wouldn't have to reenroll. So does</p> <p>23 that class just kind of stay open for them and</p> <p>24 available for when they decide to come back?</p> <p>25 MS. TANI ARNESS: You know, we tried to be</p>	193	<p>1 if they don't have Internet, we work with them with</p> <p>2 T-Mobile's Project 10Million, which can give them</p> <p>3 free Internet in most cases for our students.</p> <p>4 Sometimes they'll go through Internet</p> <p>5 Essentials, which is about \$10 a month for Internet.</p> <p>6 And then in some cases, the school actually</p> <p>7 purchases hotspots and then lets them come get a</p> <p>8 hotspot.</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: That's very cool.</p> <p>10 That's awesome.</p> <p>11 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yeah.</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Did your students get</p> <p>13 the Get Out To Vote postcards that I brought by?</p> <p>14 MS. TANI ARNESS: We had to do that</p> <p>15 digitally. So thank you for doing that.</p> <p>16 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Okay. Okay.</p> <p>17 MS. TANI ARNESS: And, yeah. So not the</p> <p>18 actual postcard, but you can get a digital image and</p> <p>19 e-mail that out to folks.</p> <p>20 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Okay. Super. Maybe</p> <p>21 next year. I mean, because they're open for -- in a</p> <p>22 year.</p> <p>23 Thank you, Tani, for making this</p> <p>24 amendment, because I think it's going to be so much</p> <p>25 more suitable to what you're doing successfully</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">194</p> <p>1 right now for your kids.</p> <p>2 And I know starting out, it might be sort</p> <p>3 of trial and error, but it seems like you're off to</p> <p>4 a really great start with it. I commend you and</p> <p>5 your bravery for taking that on and making that</p> <p>6 change. Thanks.</p> <p>7 MS. TANI ARNESS: Thank you, Glenna. I</p> <p>8 really appreciate that support. And I have to say</p> <p>9 we have learned so much in this process about</p> <p>10 there's something about being in, like, a Zoom</p> <p>11 classroom, where it focuses, like, a microscope on</p> <p>12 the teachers' practices, too.</p> <p>13 So we've really learned a lot about what</p> <p>14 kinds of things can be effective. And the students</p> <p>15 have commented on many of the shifts in -- just in</p> <p>16 terms of our pacing and how they're able to respond.</p> <p>17 We can get 100 percent engagement</p> <p>18 responses on things and get instant teacher</p> <p>19 feedback, and they're really liking that.</p> <p>20 So it's been an adventure, and, you know,</p> <p>21 we're actually excited to see -- we feel like we're</p> <p>22 just at the beginning of what is possible with</p> <p>23 the -- you know, there's so many (inaudible) and</p> <p>24 possibilities now.</p> <p>25 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yeah. It's a new</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">196</p> <p>1 And I think that Director Chavez responded</p> <p>2 to some of the feedback that she gave the school.</p> <p>3 But the result was since -- so there wasn't really a</p> <p>4 resolution under the contract, Notice of Dispute of</p> <p>5 Contract, but rather to use the regular amendment</p> <p>6 process.</p> <p>7 THE CHAIR: All right. Commissioner</p> <p>8 Gipson.</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER GIPSON: Thanks. Yeah. I'm</p> <p>10 somewhat confused as well. But -- so I'll just ask</p> <p>11 my questions based on the amendment.</p> <p>12 I have an understanding that blended</p> <p>13 learning is significantly different than online</p> <p>14 instruction. And the amendment, in some of the</p> <p>15 narrative, it talks about online instruction, and</p> <p>16 then in some, it talks about, "We're creating a</p> <p>17 blended model."</p> <p>18 To me, a blended model is either the</p> <p>19 students are in twice a week, they get instruction</p> <p>20 twice a week, or they're in -- part of the -- it's</p> <p>21 asynchronous and synchronous instruction going on on</p> <p>22 the campus during the -- or they -- you know, like I</p> <p>23 said, they've got one or two days a week that</p> <p>24 they're home, and it's online instruction, and one</p> <p>25 or two days a week they're on campus.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">195</p> <p>1 horizon, so that's exciting. Thank you.</p> <p>2 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Carrillo.</p> <p>3 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Thank you. The</p> <p>4 only question I have at this time, because I have</p> <p>5 some things later, is helping us all understand why</p> <p>6 we're doing an amendment here as a result of the</p> <p>7 mediation.</p> <p>8 THE CHAIR: We'll go to Ms. Barnes.</p> <p>9 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yeah. Thanks.</p> <p>10 MS. JULIA BARNES: Thank you,</p> <p>11 Commissioner. As you know, the school had invoked a</p> <p>12 dispute regarding the contract. And that triggered</p> <p>13 the mediation provision in the contract to go there.</p> <p>14 At the mediation, there was not a proposal</p> <p>15 presented that would result in a change of the</p> <p>16 contract. So the mediator kind of worked to see if</p> <p>17 there was something the parties could agree to. And</p> <p>18 the parties could agree to them just bringing you an</p> <p>19 amendment.</p> <p>20 So there wasn't an agreement about how you</p> <p>21 would address the amendment.</p> <p>22 There was an agreement and an opportunity</p> <p>23 that I think the school take advantage of to present</p> <p>24 the amendment -- a draft amendment to CSD and get</p> <p>25 some feedback.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">197</p> <p>1 That's blended learning. You're blending</p> <p>2 online and live instruction, synchronous and</p> <p>3 asynchronous instruction.</p> <p>4 So I'm somewhat confused as to the</p> <p>5 direction this amendment is going, because it speaks</p> <p>6 to both.</p> <p>7 MS. TANI ARNESS: Thank you. Go ahead.</p> <p>8 Sorry.</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER GIPSON: So -- and my concern</p> <p>10 continues when we're looking at the facility, and a</p> <p>11 facility that's being funded for lease reimbursement</p> <p>12 for all the students being on campus. And if that's</p> <p>13 not the case, you know, what's the -- what's the</p> <p>14 long-term plan for that building and the lease</p> <p>15 funding of the building, because I think there has</p> <p>16 to be some notification, not only to us, but to PSFA</p> <p>17 regarding this.</p> <p>18 I think. Commissioner Robbins can</p> <p>19 certainly speak more eloquently to this than I can.</p> <p>20 But that's -- you know, that's part of my</p> <p>21 concern is that I don't deny that this school has</p> <p>22 not served their community fully. Always supported</p> <p>23 that.</p> <p>24 But this -- you know, and the -- in the</p> <p>25 narrative, where there's the discussion about, you</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">198</p> <p>1 know, two years ago, 95 percent of everyone went 2 online, that is very true. But we're in the moment 3 of everyone coming back and us realizing that we do 4 benefit from the human interaction.</p> <p>5 I know there are students that need the 6 anonymity. And online instruction is -- is 7 appropriate for them. I have no qualms about a 8 school saying, you know, "We have one or two 9 students that can't do this."</p> <p>10 That's different than creating a whole 11 different school, which is online instruction.</p> <p>12 And the school, even in their -- in 13 documents that had been presented earlier, was, "How 14 devastating going online was."</p> <p>15 So the shift is, you know, truthfully 16 difficult for me. But I don't see this as a blended 17 learning model. And that's what really concerns me 18 through this amendment being couched as a blended 19 learning model.</p> <p>20 MS. TANI ARNESS: Thank you for that 21 question, Commissioner Gipson. I really appreciate 22 it, because we have looked into this quite a bit.</p> <p>23 And there are a lot of models for blended 24 learning. It can really look a lot of different 25 ways. And I don't think there's one particular</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">200</p> <p>1 need an explanation, a detailed explanation of how 2 that -- you know, daily opportunities are, "Do I 3 just get to drop in if I need to?"</p> <p>4 Or there -- to me, there's no real 5 direction in any of this as to, A, what those 6 opportunities are, how many students are being 7 served daily at the -- at the building, how many 8 opportunities for direct instruction are coming on 9 campus on a daily basis.</p> <p>10 Just, I appreciate any and all supports 11 that are given to students: counseling, social 12 working, whatever. I appreciate that.</p> <p>13 And I acknowledge those opportunities. 14 But like I said, online learning, blended, it is 15 clear that blended learning is a blend of 16 synchronous and asynchronous. And it's not, just, 17 we offer opportunities for the asynchronous. 18 That's -- that's what I'm not seeing.</p> <p>19 MS. TANI ARNESS: Okay. Yeah. Thank you. 20 And so we did put into the amendment that 21 there would be daily synchronous Zoom classes; 22 right? And then we said that there would be a -- a 23 selection from a list of different supports, 24 including tutoring. Assessments, of course, will 25 have to be on campus. Certain special education</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">199</p> <p>1 accepted definition that fits everything.</p> <p>2 But what I will say is, you mentioned a 3 blended synchronous and asynchronous. And that is 4 often a part of the blended. And we are doing that.</p> <p>5 So I think one way to look at this is to 6 think about how it's different from a more 7 traditional, purely virtual, online schooling, like 8 maybe eCADEMY or Connections.</p> <p>9 So we are offering daily synchronous Zoom 10 classes. Our live instruction is six hours a day 11 available for students. And then we also offer them 12 some asynchronous opportunities.</p> <p>13 We have our campus open for various 14 supports and learning opportunities. We had 15 students in there last week doing WorkKeys 16 assessments.</p> <p>17 So we're using a very flexible model. 18 Knowing our students, we want to leave some 19 in-person supports available to students. So we're 20 setting our model up to say that, "Yes, we will do 21 some in-person and virtual. We're going to have 22 these daily synchronous Zoom classes. And then 23 we're going to leave this flexibility in there to 24 respond to needs of students as they arise." 25 COMMISSIONER GIPSON: But see, to me, I</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">201</p> <p>1 supports. So it's really going to be part of their 2 individualized scheduling plan and part of what we 3 work out with the student to meet their needs.</p> <p>4 COMMISSIONER GIPSON: Yeah. And I saw 5 that. That's what -- and that's what concerned me. 6 Blended learning is a blend of synchronous and 7 asynchronous instruction, not other opportunities.</p> <p>8 And I appreciate all the efforts on 9 tutoring and everything else, and I acknowledge 10 those supports and I commend you for them. But 11 that's not direct instruction.</p> <p>12 And that's -- that's what I said I did not 13 see in the plan. I read the rest of it; so -- but I 14 appreciate your response.</p> <p>15 MS. TANI ARNESS: Okay. And just to 16 clarify again. The asynchronous instruction right 17 now is mainly through Edgenuity, and the synchronous 18 instruction is mainly through Zoom.</p> <p>19 Thank you.</p> <p>20 THE CHAIR: All right. Commissioner 21 Robbins.</p> <p>22 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Well, getting to 23 that synchronous/asynchronous, can you break down -- 24 because you say daily? What percentage of 25 instruction is synchronous versus asynchronous?</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">202</p> <p>1 MS. TANI ARNESS: So that depends on 2 student choice depending on how they do their 3 schedule. 4 However, our teachers are teaching a full 5 load of synchronous Zoom. So the Zoom classes are 6 set up much like they were pre-pandemic, where we 7 have first, second, third, fourth, fifth period, and 8 students sign up for a Zoom class at various times. 9 And so the teachers are -- it's not where 10 some of the models have teachers only doing, you 11 know, very limited live lessons. Our teachers are 12 in their Zoom classrooms doing direct instruction, 13 you know, all day, daily, besides their planning 14 period. And they have some time to work in 15 intervention and tutoring time with the students. 16 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Okay. What 17 percentage of your student population is special ed, 18 and what percentage is English Language Learners? 19 MS. TANI ARNESS: Right now, our special 20 ed population is about 21 percent, and our English 21 Language Learners is, I believe, about 31 percent. 22 It varies usually between, like, 30 to 34 percent on 23 the ELLs. 24 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: So it's higher than 25 the district and higher than any charter schools,</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">204</p> <p>1 I very much respect a focus on proficiency 2 and rigor. I really believe that every school needs 3 to earn their place with our community. 4 And we -- our mission is to reach out to 5 students who need intensive supports and need to 6 reconnect to school. And we actually reach out to 7 local high schools and ask them to send us their 8 dropout students and their failing students. 9 And that is what they do. And we work 10 with those students to try to help them reconnect 11 and reengage. And so it's a -- it's a distinct 12 population that we are reaching out to to serve. 13 Of course, we're open to anybody. But 14 that is part of our mission is to specialize in what 15 kinds of supports are needed for students to 16 reconnect and reengage with high school. 17 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Thank you. Getting 18 to the building usage, you have a 27,000 -- almost 19 27,000-square-foot building. And, you know, if you 20 only have 25 percent of your students on campus at 21 any one time -- what is the maximum number of 22 students that you have on campus at any one time? 23 MS. TANI ARNESS: We don't have a cap on 24 it. But, I mean -- 25 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Not a cap. What is</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">203</p> <p>1 and I understand that. 2 Of the special ed, how many are physically 3 disabled? Do you know? I mean, without getting 4 into HIPAA problems. I mean, is it a significant 5 portion of them significantly mobility impaired, or 6 is it some other reason for being in special ed? 7 MS. TANI ARNESS: We do not have a 8 significant mobility impaired population right now. 9 We are wondering, you know, if -- if that -- this 10 may be appealing to students who are mobility 11 impaired in terms of the accessibility of the online 12 is quite simple. But at this time, we do not have 13 significant numbers of -- I don't think we have any 14 right now that are mobility-impaired. 15 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Thank you. You -- 16 your results are actually worse in many cases than 17 APS and lower than many charter schools that are 18 even nearby. So I would assume, although you may 19 have a slightly higher ELL population and special ed 20 population than some charter schools, the general 21 demographic is similar to some charter schools that 22 have much higher proficiencies than Cesar Chavez. 23 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yeah. Let me tell you a 24 little bit about that. It's a great question, and I 25 respect that.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">205</p> <p>1 the maximum number of students that you've had on 2 campus this year at any one -- 3 MS. TANI ARNESS: Oh, this year. 4 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: This year. 5 MS. TANI ARNESS: Probably 30, maybe, 6 something like that. 7 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: So you have a 8 campus of 27,000 square feet for 30 students, 9 basically, and some administrators. 10 Yeah. I would venture to say that you 11 probably don't need more than 5,000 or 6,000 square 12 feet, if that's all you ever -- if that's the max 13 you've ever had on campus. 14 So I would strongly urge -- and one thing 15 that I've been talking with people on the PSCOC -- 16 is having a policy in place that building 17 utilization has to be sufficient to warrant lease 18 assistance. 19 You're receiving a substantial amount of 20 money for a building lease. And for two years -- 21 almost three years now -- you've gone to online. I 22 understand for the first year and a half or so, it 23 wasn't really much of an option because the State 24 required for a few months. They encouraged students 25 to go back in 2021. You didn't. 2022, they've</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">206</p> <p>1 really kind of dictated, "You will be live unless 2 there is a reason not to be on campus." 3 And just because you have a lease in 4 place, if you only have 30 students on campus, 5 whether they're special ed or some other reason, it 6 seems to me that the State is paying a substantial 7 amount of money for a building lease that is unused. 8 And that goes contrary to constitutional 9 provisions of making a payment for something that is 10 not used and useful for the public. 11 So how do you answer that? And what's -- 12 what steps are you taking to reduce the size of your 13 lease or move to a campus that is more in line with 14 the physical needs of the students being present? 15 MS. TANI ARNESS: Thank you, Commissioner 16 Robbins. 17 Yeah, I think that's a really good 18 question. And it's something that we are definitely 19 looking at and that we have been looking -- 20 researching. 21 And we are committed to falling within, 22 you know, correct parameters on how to -- how to 23 navigate the building use. 24 It is also part of our five-year plan in 25 terms of how to expand, possibly, building use, how</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">208</p> <p>1 it -- "Well, we use it for two or three hours." 2 That, to me, is insufficient to warrant, 3 you know, \$160,000 almost -- which would be this 4 year -- \$160,000 in lease assistance for somebody 5 that could be a fraction of that. 6 Thank you. 7 MS. TANI ARNESS: Thank you. We will -- 8 we do make a commitment to continue following up on 9 that, Commissioner Robbins. 10 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Manis. 11 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Thank you for the -- 12 answering the questions. I had similar questions. 13 My questions are more in line with what Commissioner 14 Gipson was asking about. 15 The first question that I have is 16 regarding the -- do you have any attendance 17 requirements for your synchronous sessions that you 18 say occur daily? 19 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yes. Thank you for that 20 question, because this is something that's 21 interesting, actually. As we've been researching 22 other online schools, we've noticed that a lot of 23 the traditional online schools say, "Well, we just 24 don't look at seat time." 25 With -- we are continuing to look at seat</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">207</p> <p>1 to get community input on building use, and where we 2 want to go with that piece of things. So it's -- 3 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: But, understand. 4 Building use for community purposes is not what 5 lease assistance is for. 6 The lease assistance is for the school. 7 Opening it up for activities in the evening or the 8 weekend or something like that -- it's for school 9 activities. So I want to know. What are you doing 10 to reduce the number of square feet that is needed 11 for actual school instruction? 12 Because, I mean, you don't need 27,000 13 square feet when you only have 30 students on campus 14 at one time. 15 MS. TANI ARNESS: Right. And I appreciate 16 that. And this is something that's in process in 17 terms of talking with all invested parties and 18 calculating a plan for next steps. 19 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Well, I don't feel 20 you sufficiently answered the question. And I 21 think, you know, the school needs to, and the 22 governance council needs to take immediate steps to 23 come in line with the intent of lease assistance and 24 not be paying for, you know, 20,000 or more square 25 feet that's unused and unnecessary, even if you use</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">209</p> <p>1 time to some degree. We are building in 2 flexibility, like I said, in some areas. 3 But our Zoom classes, we take daily 4 attendance just like we would in any other class. 5 And so that's -- attendance is an 6 interesting area for reengagement students 7 nationwide. It's -- there's -- a lot of the most 8 high quality research actually supports the idea 9 that you should not hold reengagement students 10 strictly to seat time, that it's not the best use. 11 You should be using a mastery-based learning 12 approach with flexibility tied into the structure. 13 So we do use mastery-based learning and 14 flexibility. However, we have not fully let go of 15 the seat time thing, because we feel that that helps 16 get more teacher-student face time. 17 And so we're trying to really make sure 18 that we have access to our students with as much 19 direct instruction as possible. 20 So we tell students that they are required 21 to, you know, attend class every day in their Zoom 22 classes and if they're in an Edgenuity. And if they 23 do have an absence -- and this is where the 24 mastery-based learning comes in -- if they have an 25 absence, they need to then meet with that teacher to</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">210</p> <p>1 make up that absence and what they missed in that 2 class.</p> <p>3 And all of our students are held to 4 turning in all of their assignments, projects, and 5 assessments so that we're making sure that even as 6 students may be struggling with life issues that are 7 making attendance difficult for them, we do not want 8 to short them on the learning that they need.</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Thank you for that. 10 How -- what has been your attendance 11 percentages? Do you have kind of like a -- on 12 average, what percentage of students are actually 13 attending those live lessons, and, for those that 14 are not, how many are actually following up with the 15 instructors later on?</p> <p>16 MS. TANI ARNESS: The students who are 17 signed up for Zoom classes are -- I would say, all 18 of them are attending, because they cannot earn 19 credit in that class unless they are attending. 20 So when I say they're able to make up work 21 that they've missed, we don't say, "Well, you can 22 just make up the entire semester that you weren't in 23 class." 24 We say, like, "If you missed a day, you 25 can make up the work."</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">212</p> <p>1 time." 2 So I guess I'm a little confused on that. 3 MS. TANI ARNESS: That is correct. It's a 4 mandatory thing. You get your Zoom link. You need 5 to be there a certain time. And it's the same time 6 each day. 7 So if you have a 10:00 Zoom class, you go 8 to that 10:00 Zoom class each day. 9 So that's how that works. It's not -- 10 it's a little different than the more kind of what 11 I'm calling now traditional online school is the 12 ones that have been around for a while with 13 different models. They are doing more of a you show 14 up once in a while for some face-to-face 15 instruction, and maybe you sign up for it. 16 Ours is much more -- again, we're trying 17 to focus on consistency that our students need. And 18 so ours is at the same time each day. You log in, 19 you do the whole class period with the teacher. 20 It's not an optional thing. 21 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Okay. So is the -- 22 just also additional question for clarification. 23 The -- if a student signs up for a Zoom 24 class, is there an asynchronous component within 25 that -- that course? Or is that course strictly a</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">211</p> <p>1 So they are required to attend, and they 2 are attending. 3 If a student is not attending classes for 4 whatever reason, we meet with them and try to 5 problem-solve and work on what they're needing. So 6 some of those students might take an independent 7 study class along with maybe a Zoom class and an 8 Edgenuity class. 9 So, again, we try to really work with 10 students to figure out what can work for them, but 11 also with the goal that we want to maximize quality 12 learning time. And we don't think that the most 13 quality learning time is in a canned curriculum. 14 COMMISSIONER MANIS: So I just want to be 15 clear, I guess, for my understanding. You have -- 16 the students, they sign up each week or each day 17 whether or not -- 18 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yeah -- I'm sorry. 19 COMMISSIONER MANIS: -- they -- or how 20 does the sign-up work? Because I guess -- 21 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yeah. 22 COMMISSIONER MANIS: -- the attendance 23 part, I was thinking, like, it's more of a -- like, 24 it's a mandatory thing. Like, "You're sent out a 25 Zoom link. You should be there at such-and-such</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">213</p> <p>1 Zoom class? 2 And also do you have some courses that are 3 more of the Zoom-oriented class, and some classes 4 that are more strictly like an asynchronous-based 5 class? 6 Because I want to understand the blended 7 aspect as much as possible. 8 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yeah. Thank you. 9 Again, I really do appreciate these questions, 10 because I know what we're doing is unique. 11 The Zoom classes, the asynchronous 12 aspect -- if you want to look at it that way -- of a 13 Zoom class is the Google Classroom. So our Zoom 14 classes are built around a Google Classroom, where 15 they load in different assignments. 16 And we've also learned some innovative 17 lessons around best ways to use Google Classroom for 18 our population. 19 So they will put assignments in Google 20 Classroom, and the students have access to that. 21 And then when they come into Zoom, the teachers are 22 interacting with the students doing some direct 23 instruction about the material that's in the Google 24 Classroom, sharing a screen, doing demonstrations, 25 doing Jamboards, conversations, asking questions,</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">214</p> <p>1 assessing students as they work.</p> <p>2 So a student can open their Google Doc in</p> <p>3 their Google Classroom, and the teacher can have --</p> <p>4 will have a tab open that shows all the students</p> <p>5 working in all of their Google Docs, so they can</p> <p>6 just click on each one and see exactly what's</p> <p>7 happening in real-time.</p> <p>8 That's really nice. The students and the</p> <p>9 teachers like that, because you can get in there and</p> <p>10 write a comment to the student and say, "Hey, this</p> <p>11 is really great, try and add a little more detail</p> <p>12 here," or, "I like the way you're thinking about</p> <p>13 this logic problem, here's a question to consider."</p> <p>14 And they're jumping into different</p> <p>15 documents and interacting with students in</p> <p>16 real-time.</p> <p>17 And then they can come and -- they've got</p> <p>18 the Zoom open at the same time so they can talk to</p> <p>19 each other and do verbal discussions as well and</p> <p>20 group activities.</p> <p>21 So it's really cool, actually. Like this</p> <p>22 a whole new world that's been opened up in terms of</p> <p>23 what's possible.</p> <p>24 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Yeah. I really like</p> <p>25 some of the aspects of Google, the options that are</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">216</p> <p>1 question that I have is related to the -- what --</p> <p>2 are there any requirements associated with students</p> <p>3 having to have cameras on and interaction with the</p> <p>4 instructor?</p> <p>5 Do they -- are they required to have their</p> <p>6 camera on so they can have some of that face time</p> <p>7 that they are missing by being in person?</p> <p>8 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yeah. So another good</p> <p>9 question. This has been an interesting issue that's</p> <p>10 been evolving over the years, too. We've been</p> <p>11 reading a lot of different research on it as well.</p> <p>12 And one of the things that we find is that</p> <p>13 the interaction with the teacher is essential for</p> <p>14 our students, so that real-time interaction.</p> <p>15 So our policy is that if you are not</p> <p>16 responding to a teacher during class time, you will</p> <p>17 be counted absent.</p> <p>18 And so how they choose to respond, the</p> <p>19 teacher and the students work that out together as a</p> <p>20 class.</p> <p>21 So some students want to use cameras, and</p> <p>22 they'll work that in there. Some students don't,</p> <p>23 and then they give them microphone options or</p> <p>24 different ways to respond.</p> <p>25 We do address that need for social</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">215</p> <p>1 on there for students.</p> <p>2 As far as each Zoom session, how many</p> <p>3 students are -- are in a Zoom session at a time?</p> <p>4 Like, what's the student-to-teacher ratio?</p> <p>5 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yeah. Good question.</p> <p>6 So we will do a Zoom class as we could do, like -- I</p> <p>7 think we had a special ed class that was, like, four</p> <p>8 students. So it could be really small. And then we</p> <p>9 would max it out at 15.</p> <p>10 But where we find kind of a sweet spot for</p> <p>11 our students in terms of participation is maybe that</p> <p>12 10 to 12, where you can really spend a lot of time</p> <p>13 with each of the students. So it depends on the</p> <p>14 scheduling need of which students are needing which</p> <p>15 classes, because some of the classes might be bigger</p> <p>16 than others and that kind of thing. But I would say</p> <p>17 that's right in the ballpark we're in.</p> <p>18 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Okay. Yeah. And I</p> <p>19 think that that's great, because some of the classes</p> <p>20 that I've taught, they're college classes, but I've</p> <p>21 had upwards of 30 to 40 students on a session. And</p> <p>22 it can be challenging to -- to address every</p> <p>23 student's needs with that large of a class size.</p> <p>24 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yeah. For sure.</p> <p>25 COMMISSIONER MANIS: I think the last</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">217</p> <p>1 connection in a lot of other ways as well. So</p> <p>2 they're seeing and hearing each other in some aspect</p> <p>3 in the classroom. And then we're also having that</p> <p>4 one-on-one time with students. And we can go into</p> <p>5 breakout rooms; we can do pairings.</p> <p>6 So there's different ways to really be</p> <p>7 flexible with how that works.</p> <p>8 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Okay. Thank you. I</p> <p>9 guess thinking about it, you know, you had said your</p> <p>10 class sizes are 10 to 12. I understand that some</p> <p>11 may have COVID concerns still. But if you have</p> <p>12 those smaller class sizes, via Zoom, and you have</p> <p>13 such a large facility, it seems to me that the</p> <p>14 facility and in-person instruction could actually be</p> <p>15 okay with such small classes sizes, because you are</p> <p>16 in small groups.</p> <p>17 So it -- it seems kind of conflicting to</p> <p>18 me, because I know that whenever I taught college</p> <p>19 courses during the height of the pandemic, we had</p> <p>20 enough social distance in a classroom. It was --</p> <p>21 it's -- a typical class size, I think it was, of</p> <p>22 about 30 students could actually fit in that class.</p> <p>23 But due to COVID restrictions, social distancing and</p> <p>24 whatnot, it could only accommodate eight students.</p> <p>25 So I notice that based on classroom sizes,</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">218</p> <p>1 typical classroom sizes, the class sizes that you're 2 mentioning would facilitate well for those small -- 3 for that small group instruction. 4 MS. TANI ARNESS: Right. Yeah. Thank you 5 for that. And, yeah, we have looked at a lot of 6 those considerations as well. 7 Again, I want to emphasize our class sizes 8 do vary. And so it kind of moves around a little 9 bit on that. 10 But the other piece here is that while 11 this did start, of course, with COVID, what we have 12 found is that the benefits of this program are what 13 is keeping us going in this direction in the 14 long-term capacity. We're seeing a lot of value in 15 what we're creating, and we're getting a lot of 16 positive feedback from -- from our community. 17 So -- so we're really looking at this from 18 a lot of different angles. 19 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Okay. Because I 20 guess -- it may have been my misunderstanding. But 21 I thought the reason for staying primarily online 22 was still due to COVID concerns; so... 23 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yeah. Thank you for 24 that. Yeah, I would say that's one factor that we 25 look at as we're looking at whole picture. I would</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">220</p> <p>1 that. And, yeah, I acknowledge that the first part 2 of the amendment proposal is a lot of narrative. 3 And then, as you get deeper into it, there is more 4 data embedded in there. 5 And we have been collecting data 6 throughout the pandemic years. 7 And we are seeing our short cycle 8 assessment growth rise. We are seeing our mobility 9 rates decline. We're seeing our attendance around 10 the same. 11 We're seeing -- we did see a different 12 graduation -- the first year of the pandemic, I 13 think, was the hard year, where everyone was a 14 little bit flipped out from the pandemic. And then 15 as we worked and learned more strategies, we really 16 stabilized and had a much stronger year last year in 17 some of these areas. 18 And all of our subgroups are showing 19 strong growth. 20 We've got -- we're meeting our 21 mission-specific indicators. We're able to really 22 see the feedback from families and students 23 overwhelmingly positive. It's really -- it's really 24 been interesting going through the data. 25 THE CHAIR: All right. So one of the</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">219</p> <p>1 say our main focus right now has really been looking 2 at the needs of our students and families and 3 figuring out what program is going to best meet the 4 most needs. 5 And we really feel that this online 6 program that we have developed is the way to go. 7 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Thank you. 8 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yeah. 9 THE CHAIR: All right. Hi, Ms. Arness. I 10 have some questions as well. 11 So I'm going to be just really succinct 12 and get right down to -- I do like data. I want to 13 see numbers. 14 And I think, you know, the amendment 15 provided a lot of narrative, and so I'm hoping to 16 get some data you have to support some of the 17 narrative that you've provided. 18 So the first thing that -- and what I've 19 heard you talk about, a couple of different times, 20 is that you've -- you've seen a lot of value and 21 success. 22 What data are you using to support that? 23 What is being used and measured to show that it is 24 successful and that it has value? 25 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yeah. Thank you for</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">221</p> <p>1 things that I'm also interested in is, you know, I 2 can imagine there's going to be families who, as you 3 made this transition, they're, like, "You know what? 4 It is best for me." The students are, like, "This 5 would work for me." 6 But what was your re-enrollment rate over 7 the last three years, because I'm wondering how many 8 students left your school because of this choice, 9 and so they're not being served by another -- you 10 know, by as -- maybe as great of a reengagement 11 school as yours, or maybe they are not -- you know, 12 because you made this choice, I'm interested in how 13 many students are not being served any longer that 14 may have been served by a quality school at 15 Cesar Chavez in person? 16 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yeah. That's a great 17 question as well, Commissioner Burt. Thank you. 18 This is something we track. We look at 19 all of our withdrawal data. I don't have the exact 20 number on hand with me at this moment. 21 But what we found was there was -- gosh, 22 I'm going to say maybe five students who -- four or 23 five students who went to an in-person school. Nate 24 may know this. 25 And then we did have students -- the</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">222</p> <p>1 larger thing that we saw, the larger trend that we 2 saw over the last three years were students that 3 went to get their GED, because they needed to work 4 full time. 5 And the financial impact of the pandemic 6 on our families was very intense. And students were 7 juggling family responsibilities and working full 8 time and trying to figure out how to walk through, 9 really, a crisis period for a lot of our families. 10 So that would be -- I think the bigger 11 exodus was just students who left to -- because they 12 were working full time. And we tried to work with 13 them, like, "Okay, we're going to flex with you. We 14 know you're working full time, but maybe we can fit 15 a class in here and a class in there, and we'll work 16 with you." 17 And some of our students are doing that. 18 We have an actually significant number of students 19 who are working full time and are being -- working 20 with us to create a flexible schedule that can allow 21 them to stay in school. 22 Other students just were exhausted, I 23 think, was really the truth of it. They would work 24 all day, and then they'd have a class after work, 25 and they'd be, like, "I'm too tired, I can't do it,</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">224</p> <p>1 my mind of how hard we have tried to work with that 2 number, and the incredible life situations that we 3 have witnessed with our students that have been 4 pulling them in and out of school. 5 So it's a very real issue in New Mexico 6 and Albuquerque, and particularly with this 7 population. 8 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you. 9 And then my next one is going to be kind 10 of a similar question about graduation rate, the 11 historical graduation rate. 12 So over the last three years -- and, 13 Ms. Arness, if you know that, you're welcome. I 14 know CSD will have those numbers for sure as well. 15 So if you don't have them off the top of your head, 16 I can defer to CSD instead. 17 MS. TANI ARNESS: Thank you. So what I 18 will tell you that we have is our graduation 19 recovery rate. And so if you're unfamiliar with 20 reengagement high schools and some of the ways of 21 accountability for our type of school, four-year 22 cohorts for a reengagement high school is not an 23 accurate measure of success, because 95 percent of 24 our students come to us behind in credits. And the 25 four-year cohort that we deal with is, at our</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">223</p> <p>1 Miss," you know, that kind of stuff. 2 So we were -- we were seeing, I think, the 3 majority of our withdrawals were due to students who 4 had some kind of family crisis/work situation. 5 THE CHAIR: Okay. And I am wondering if 6 maybe CSD has, like, the numbers. 7 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: I do. 8 THE CHAIR: Okay. Great. 9 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: So we ran the 10 numbers real quickly through the S.T.A.R.S. 11 What we looked at was the student count 12 from prior year enrollment, we subtracted the 13 student count that withdrew, and then divided by the 14 total. 15 So for what we see as a steady increase in 16 student retention rate from 2019-'20, 53 percent; 17 2021, 66 percent; and '21-'22, 76 percent. 18 MS. TANI ARNESS: And I have to say -- 19 thank you for that, Director Chavez. I apologize 20 for not having those numbers right here. But that 21 aligns with what we've been seeing. 22 And I've been at this school for 18 years. 23 And that 53 percent was pretty standard over the 24 entire history of the school. And I -- I only 25 laugh, because I'm thinking back over the years in</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">225</p> <p>1 school, for an average of about a year and a half of 2 those four years. So -- and they're out of the 3 school -- 4 THE CHAIR: Yeah. And I'll be clear. I 5 guess I'm not looking for -- I'm not looking for it 6 to base it off of what the number is itself. I'm 7 really looking at has your graduation rate increased 8 or decreased. And, understandably, yeah, not the 9 number itself, per se, is meaningful to me as have 10 more or fewer students historically been graduating 11 over the last three years. Like, is it going up, or 12 is it going down? 13 MS. TANI ARNESS: So, again, I only have 14 my graduation recovery rates in front of me, because 15 that's what we focus on. 16 THE CHAIR: Totally fine. 17 MS. TANI ARNESS: Those have gone up. 18 Again, it was -- 2019-'20, it was higher. It dipped 19 in that first year of the pandemic, and then it went 20 up again last year. 21 So the -- yeah. So that's the data we 22 have on graduation recovery rates. 23 Do you want the actual percentages? 24 THE CHAIR: No. I can actually -- I'll go 25 to CSD, because I know PED does have specific</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">226</p> <p>1 numbers.</p> <p>2 So I'm okay -- I appreciate what you have,</p> <p>3 but just the -- just the trajectory from you is</p> <p>4 completely fine. Yeah.</p> <p>5 MS. TANI ARNESS: Thank you. Yeah. So</p> <p>6 I'll just tell you, in 2020, it was an 86 percent</p> <p>7 recovery rate. 2021, it dropped to 64. And then</p> <p>8 2022, it rose back up to 81 percent.</p> <p>9 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you. Director</p> <p>10 Chavez, with PED information?</p> <p>11 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: Right. We're</p> <p>12 pulling three-year-trend data. But what we did put</p> <p>13 in the report is the cohort data. So the four-,</p> <p>14 five-, and six-year rate.</p> <p>15 THE CHAIR: For last year.</p> <p>16 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: Yeah.</p> <p>17 THE CHAIR: Yeah. So -- and really</p> <p>18 what -- just to be transparent, why I'm asking, is</p> <p>19 I'm just trying to see the data to support the</p> <p>20 impact on your students; right?</p> <p>21 Like, if the -- if the choice this is</p> <p>22 making is negatively impacting students, that --</p> <p>23 'cause I know one of the -- one of the approval</p> <p>24 factors is that there's a demonstrated capacity to</p> <p>25 successfully implement the requested change; right?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">228</p> <p>1 of data to show that being in person at a school is</p> <p>2 actually the best place to be in a community.</p> <p>3 So I'm glad that that's -- it's not that</p> <p>4 people are scared to get COVID at school. That's</p> <p>5 why we're doing it.</p> <p>6 I am concerned as well about, you know,</p> <p>7 the -- I guess -- I think it's -- when I've looked</p> <p>8 at -- I mean, there are a couple of successful</p> <p>9 blended learning models in our state already, for a</p> <p>10 decade-plus. There's one in Taos, and there's one</p> <p>11 in Rio Rancho. They've been doing blended learning</p> <p>12 for a long time, and successfully doing blended</p> <p>13 learning.</p> <p>14 However, their students are not given the</p> <p>15 option of coming in; right? So they're required to</p> <p>16 come in as well, have that in-person check with a</p> <p>17 physical teacher. Even though they're doing a lot</p> <p>18 of their instruction online, they're doing their</p> <p>19 assignments online, they're doing almost everything</p> <p>20 online, they're still required to come in and have</p> <p>21 touchpoints with adults.</p> <p>22 And so I think the only thing that my</p> <p>23 concern with, and especially knowing that -- you</p> <p>24 know, we have some online-only campuses who struggle</p> <p>25 with retention, they struggle with graduation rate.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">227</p> <p>1 I think for me, it's "successfully."</p> <p>2 Like, can you successfully do it?</p> <p>3 And to me, success is outcomes and data</p> <p>4 and numbers that we can see as well. So I</p> <p>5 appreciate -- yeah, that's my intention behind</p> <p>6 asking for at least the last three years --</p> <p>7 right? -- to prove that.</p> <p>8 One of the other things that -- I mean, I</p> <p>9 understood what -- I actually -- it was interesting</p> <p>10 when Commissioner Manis brought up, is, like, the</p> <p>11 use of COVID to support online learning versus</p> <p>12 in-person learning.</p> <p>13 But there's just so much data to show that</p> <p>14 schools were actually the safest places in</p> <p>15 communities all throughout the pandemic, from the</p> <p>16 beginning of the pandemic all throughout. It was</p> <p>17 actually the transmission rate, the getting COVID at</p> <p>18 school was not where people were getting COVID,</p> <p>19 because we have an -- I'm going to say -- because</p> <p>20 educators and school staff and people at schools</p> <p>21 care so deeply about the health and safety of kids</p> <p>22 that the cleaning and the measures that were taken</p> <p>23 to keep kids safe across the country were probably</p> <p>24 at its highest at school.</p> <p>25 So it actually -- you know, there's a lot</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">229</p> <p>1 You know, it's -- it's a deeper struggle when it's</p> <p>2 online-only with students, regardless.</p> <p>3 And I just look at your students, and I'm,</p> <p>4 like, they're coming to you for reengagement. Like,</p> <p>5 they need you the most of anyone. I just see --</p> <p>6 your students need the success that you provide more</p> <p>7 than most kids. And so I want them to have access</p> <p>8 to that.</p> <p>9 So I'm just -- I'm interested in how the</p> <p>10 conversation went of allowing it to be optional.</p> <p>11 Why is it optional to do the in-person aspect, you</p> <p>12 know? 'Cause I -- and I also am coming as a mom of</p> <p>13 teenagers, who if someone -- if there's an adult in</p> <p>14 there, they're, like, "You tell me, you reach out if</p> <p>15 you need help," they're never going to do that.</p> <p>16 That's never going to happen. I'm going</p> <p>17 to willingly go in and get some help. It's just --</p> <p>18 we're talking about teenagers; right? It's just</p> <p>19 not -- maybe there are some special ones that are</p> <p>20 going to; right? There are. Not mine. Not many.</p> <p>21 So why -- what led to the governing board</p> <p>22 conversation, your conversation with your school</p> <p>23 staff about allowing it to be optional, those</p> <p>24 in-person opportunities?</p> <p>25 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yeah. Thank you for</p>

230

1 that question, and I 100 percent agree, this is a
 2 key thing that we drill into all new staff at our
 3 school is saying to students, "Let me know if you
 4 need some help" is not an effective intervention.
 5 So we 100 percent agree that you need to
 6 come to students with the services.
 7 As far as I know, other blended learning
 8 schools aren't doing the same Zoom structures that
 9 we're doing. And so I think that makes a big
 10 difference. Zoom has really changed the landscape
 11 to where you do have real connection between
 12 teachers and students and students and students in
 13 that classroom.
 14 And so we have found that we are building
 15 relationships with students by working
 16 collaboratively in those Zoom settings.
 17 THE CHAIR: Okay. I think that's -- I
 18 feel good about it.
 19 I actually have Commissioner Chavez has
 20 his hand up. And then I can start going back around
 21 if we need to.
 22 So Commissioner Chavez. And then
 23 Commissioner Carrillo.
 24 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Thank you,
 25 Chair Burt.

231

1 And I've just got to say that you took the
 2 words right out of my mouth as far as schools being
 3 the safest place.
 4 And, you know, I think -- I agree with a
 5 lot of those comments. And -- and, you know,
 6 there's been a lot of talk -- just to add to all
 7 that, you know, one of the things that we learned
 8 from the pandemic is -- and being on online virtual
 9 instruction -- is how far back our kids regressed in
 10 their academic performance.
 11 And so there's been a lot of talk over the
 12 year since then on learning loss. And that's really
 13 big, from our legislators all -- just across the
 14 board, our -- everywhere.
 15 Anyways, I -- I am a big proponent of
 16 direct instruction and face-to-face, in-person. And
 17 I think that's where kids belong.
 18 But I won't repeat, you know, everything
 19 that Chair Burt already talked about.
 20 But I do want to ask about -- you
 21 mentioned that your -- your EL population is about
 22 30 -- was it 34 percent? 35?
 23 MS. TANI ARNESS: Oh. Our ELL right now,
 24 I believe, is 31.
 25 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: 31. Okay. So just

232

1 under a third of your population is ELs. And as I
 2 go through this document -- and I'm looking at all
 3 your different strategies, and I see some academic
 4 support for comprehensible input. What I don't see
 5 is academic language development.
 6 And so when you've got -- when you've got
 7 a third of your population that are ELs, I guess my
 8 question is, is -- because we also know when we talk
 9 about learning loss, the kids that regress the most
 10 were your at-risk kids, your SpEd kids, the kids
 11 that need most support, your SpEd kids, your EL
 12 kids, your kids of poverty, extreme poverty.
 13 But when I look at this, I don't see in
 14 your strategies any type of -- of strategies that
 15 address that.
 16 And so I'm just -- I'm kind of curious,
 17 because I'm familiar with Edgenuity. And I know
 18 they don't offer any type of EL support. And so I'd
 19 like to just ask how are you addressing the language
 20 needs of kids in this model?
 21 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yeah. Thank you so
 22 much. That's a really important question, and we
 23 are very focused on our EL students. It's a large
 24 part of our school culture.
 25 We have an ELD class that we offer on Zoom

233

1 for English Language Development. And we also do
 2 targeted professional development, so that all
 3 teachers are trained in SIOP, sheltered instruction
 4 practices, that they can use in their classrooms to
 5 help build language.
 6 And it's very interesting. There was
 7 reports that came out -- I don't know if you saw
 8 them. But Secretary Steinhaus addressed them at one
 9 point with NAEP testing during the pandemic. ELL
 10 students in New Mexico scores went up. They
 11 outperformed other subgroups, at least the
 12 eighth-grade ELL courses -- group. So that was
 13 really interesting to me.
 14 There -- there is something, I think, for
 15 ELL students about having the screen in front of
 16 them where things are interacting in writing. So by
 17 sharing the screen, it's very direct. And the
 18 teachers can put vocabulary scaffolds right there on
 19 their document as they're working. They can put
 20 them in their lesson presentation very easily.
 21 We also have adopted a new curriculum
 22 called Language Tree, where it's an asynchronous
 23 English Language Development program that students
 24 can work on. And they are enjoying that. It's
 25 something that's being used in California.

<p style="text-align: right;">234</p> <p>1 And so this -- we also have pullout 2 supports. We have an ELL specialist who works with 3 our ELL students to offer one-on-one and small-group 4 supports. 5 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: I didn't see any of 6 that. I might have missed it, but I didn't see any 7 of that in your narrative. 8 MS. TANI ARNESS: I'm trying to -- I 9 apologize if I didn't highlight that as much as I 10 should have. We were in a little bit of a time 11 crunch. I'm trying to remember off the top of my 12 head. I may have not mentioned all of these things; 13 so... 14 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Do you have data on 15 your ACCESS for ELL scores? 16 MS. TANI ARNESS: We have a gap in our 17 data for ACCESS. We did get our scores from last 18 spring, and we had strong participation in that. 19 But we don't have comparison factors right now 20 because of the gap for a few years before that. 21 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Okay. Well, there's 22 two factors with ACCESS for ELLs. One is growth; 23 the other is reclassification. And so I understand 24 that you might not have growth data. But what was 25 your reclassification rate?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">236</p> <p>1 like we're forgetting that they were -- that the 2 school was just thumbing your noses at the direction 3 of PED and PEC in coming back. 4 And, you know, the thing -- one of the 5 things we learned this week in doing the renewals is 6 all of these schools stressed and did everything 7 they could under the sun to get kids back together 8 again with their teachers. 9 That was their -- I mean, they bent over 10 backwards to be able to do that, and, I think, 11 because they know it's better, in-person 12 instruction. 13 The -- this is kind of maybe a snarky 14 comment. But given that you haven't been using your 15 facility, and you said it's in process relative to 16 your lease reimbursement, what part of your plan is 17 going to be reimbursing the State for monies that 18 you received for a building you weren't using? 19 I don't expect you to have an answer for 20 that. But I'm asking that question, because it -- 21 obviously, it upsets me. 22 And I know that Commissioner Robbins was 23 even looking into, you know, we've got to get -- do 24 something about this, because that's wrong. That's 25 taxpayer money for this big building that's not</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">235</p> <p>1 MS. TANI ARNESS: Oh. That is a good 2 question, and I would have to look that up and get 3 back with you. 4 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Okay. Thank you. 5 MS. TANI ARNESS: Yeah. 6 THE CHAIR: All right. Commissioner 7 Carrillo. 8 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Thank you. So 9 some notes that I had first that are comments. 10 You talked about not using canned 11 curriculum. That's what Edgenuity is is canned 12 curriculum. 13 Another note that I have -- I'll get to 14 that. 15 So the Governor and PED's order was around 16 18 months ago. You know, the concern that hasn't 17 been brought up at all by anyone is why are we here 18 at this point, and the defiance of the Governor, 19 PED, and PEC in just being determined to do your own 20 thing for the last 18 months? 21 And while I appreciate you did the 22 mediation piece, I've done mediations with different 23 schools when I was part of SFPS, it's, like, we're 24 forgetting that. 25 I mean, to me, as a Commissioner, it seems</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">237</p> <p>1 being used, and very intentionally so. 2 You didn't answer Commissioner Manis's 3 question, I think, directly, and I'm going to ask it 4 directly as a yes-or-no question. 5 Is there a requirement for students to 6 have their camera on? 7 MS. TANI ARNESS: No. That is left -- 8 that is -- they are required to participate. And 9 they work with their -- the students and teachers 10 create a plan together in the class for how they are 11 going to do that. 12 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Okay. So that was 13 a "no" answer. Okay. Terrific. 14 And then I'm on the application. I'm 15 looking at the page -- it looks like -- Page 7 16 around Surveys. So it's always interesting to me 17 when people publish survey results without enough 18 information. How many were surveyed? And like this 19 says, in 2020, 62 reported learning. 62 percent of 20 what? 21 What was the possible -- what was the 22 number of surveys that went out? 23 And then you add what were the number of 24 surveys that were returned. Because here we then 25 have 62 percent of those that were returned.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">238</p> <p>1 So with all due respect -- it's funny. 2 Somebody was talking about that phrase, "with all 3 due respect." 4 Basically, this survey information doesn't 5 mean anything because the other numbers aren't 6 there. That's just -- you know, they just don't. 7 When you have 86 percent reported learning 8 and engaging as much more, 86 percent of what? Ten 9 people of 100 could have, you know, returned the 10 surveys, and 8.6 said, "Hey, this is great." 11 So my suggestion in the future, anyway, is 12 if we're going to -- if you're going to use any kind 13 of survey data, it's got to have those three points: 14 Number in the pool, number of the pool that 15 responded, and then the percentage of those that 16 answered a question one way or another, because for 17 me, this just renders the survey of no consequence 18 whatsoever. 19 In your -- I don't have the exact page and 20 paragraph -- I wrote paragraph 3, but I forgot the 21 page number -- the difference between offering 22 online classes and being a virtual school, okay? 23 What I understand here is that the 24 amendment is really basically to end up being a 25 virtual school and not having -- not being a school</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">240</p> <p>1 the -- what I see over the last 18 months -- now, it 2 would be one thing if all these numbers came back 3 and they were just off the charts. It's, like, "Oh, 4 my God, they really are doing well with this 5 format." 6 But they're not. And, you know, I just -- 7 I think it's kind of clear what direction I'm going 8 relative to the amendment. 9 But the other thing -- so I was thinking 10 about this the other day in coming up with kind of 11 an analogy. It's, like, over the last ten months, 12 you just kept robbing the bank, and now you're 13 coming to us to ask for a withdrawal. 14 You were just doing your own thing, and 15 now you're coming back -- it's easier to say I'm 16 sorry than it is to get permission; right? 17 But this is an egregious situation where 18 it's taxpayer dollars directly affecting kids. So I 19 take a super duper hard line at that. 20 Just looking at my notes. 21 I mean, that's all I have for now. And 22 I'm very concerned that we are not talking about the 23 last 18 months and anything that is -- just what 24 price is there to pay -- not just your school -- 25 what price is there to pay when a school just thumbs</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">239</p> <p>1 where somebody comes maybe Monday, Wednesday, 2 Friday, and they do more online learning at home. 3 Yeah. They have one, too. And I'm glad 4 somebody pulled that up, because those are -- I 5 don't know if you can see it, Tani. But there's the 6 high school graduation rate slide up. 7 And, you know, those are not great results 8 by any stretch whatsoever. And the kids can 9 actually -- students -- because some of them aren't 10 kids -- can actually do their learning on their own 11 and at home. 12 Not only is this not a good number at all, 13 because this data -- as Commissioner Robbins and I 14 say all the time, graduation is not a reflection of 15 actually being able to fill out a job application 16 and being proficient. And so those scores are 17 really honestly terrible. 18 And then when we look at the attendance 19 rate, it's among the lowest attendance rates in the 20 State of New Mexico. 21 So here we have a school where you're 22 making attendance as easy as possible, and you still 23 have among the lowest attendance rates in the entire 24 state. 25 That causes grave concern for me. And</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">241</p> <p>1 its nose at procedure and contract with the Public 2 Education Commission? 3 I kind of take offense to that. We're an 4 elected body. We're the steward of these children 5 and of taxpayer dollars. And it's not just 6 Cesar Chavez. There are other schools that we're 7 dealing with. 8 But they're just, like, "Ah. That's what 9 PEC says, but, you know, we'll get around it. And 10 if they press the issue, you know what we're going 11 to do? We're going to call our attorney. They'll 12 love that." 13 That's kind of the way things have been 14 going in the two years that I've been on this 15 Commission. It's very disheartening that that is 16 kind of the trend. 17 So none of these are questions. They were 18 statements. A lot of the questions were asked. I 19 appreciate your candor in answering them. I 20 appreciate that you did want to be here in person, 21 because, as a Commissioner, when people are close 22 by -- and I would say 90 minutes or less -- I expect 23 them to come before the Commission. 24 You know, Hózhó, which is three hours 25 away, they were -- they were in their seats sitting</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">242</p> <p>1 in here, you know, at 8:30 for a 9:00 hearing. And 2 I just have a great deal of respect for that. 3 So that's where I am on this. And we'll 4 see what's next. 5 THE CHAIR: Okay. I think there's going 6 to be a motion made. 7 And so, Commissioner Voigt -- I was going 8 to -- I was pausing in case there's any other 9 questions that need to be asked before the motion is 10 made. 11 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Okay. Thank you, 12 Madam Chair. 13 I move that the Public Education 14 Commission approve the Educational Plan Amendment 15 Request for Cesar Chavez Community School, which 16 clarifies the spectrum of learning platforms, 17 modalities, and environments that are utilized at 18 the school, including online learning, and reaffirm 19 all other requirements and agreements in the 20 contract. 21 The school must discuss the school's lease 22 reimbursement funding amount with PSFA to ensure 23 that the school is not receiving lease reimbursement 24 to which it may not be entitled and shall report the 25 result of that discussion at the January 20th, 2023,</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">244</p> <p>1 THE CHAIR: Okay. Any other comments? 2 Questions? Okay. 3 The one thing I'll say is, for me, the 4 reenrollment rate -- I -- you know, is a reflection 5 of student family choice. And when I look at 6 re-enrollment rates, and I think of what a community 7 is wanting and what a community is choosing, I'm not 8 going to vote against that community. 9 And for the reenrollment rates to 10 drastically increase after the school used this 11 model and continued it after the pandemic, to me, 12 that shows that this is what the students are 13 choosing. They choose with their feet; right? The 14 students choose, families choose, with their feet. 15 The re-enrollment rate has gone up 16 drastically. I will not vote against a community. 17 What I will do is hold this model 18 accountable, that -- to rigorous measures, and it 19 needs to have the best student outcomes, just as if 20 it was the old model. 21 And that, for me, is what I am going to 22 care about the most is that this model shows success 23 for its student in the future, and that's where I 24 feel my accountability, responsibility, as a 25 Commissioner will come into play, that this model</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">243</p> <p>1 PEC meeting. 2 THE CHAIR: Second. 3 There's a motion and a second. 4 Any discussion from commissioners? 5 Commissioner Carrillo. 6 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Can you read the 7 sentence again in the motion regarding clarifying? 8 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Sure. Hold on. You 9 want the whole motion? 10 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Sure. 11 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Can Cindy read that 12 back? 13 (The record was read as requested.) 14 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you. 15 THE REPORTER: You're welcome. 16 THE CHAIR: Any PEC comments? 17 Commissioner Carrillo. 18 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: I've just got to 19 hand it to the writer of the motion. To me, what is 20 a really convoluting -- the sentence with the 21 combination of learning platforms, modalities, and 22 environments. My understanding is you have an 23 amendment to become a virtual school, and that's not 24 what your contract says, and this is a lot of fancy 25 language.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">245</p> <p>1 needs to serve these students and increase 2 graduation rate, increase student proficiency, 3 increase growth. And that's what I'm going to see 4 myself holding this school accountable for in years 5 to come. 6 Commissioner Gipson. Then Commissioner 7 Voigt. 8 COMMISSIONER GIPSON: Kind of in response 9 to that, we've said time and time again that if a 10 school was a school for the arts, and they decided 11 to turn themselves into a STEM school, that's -- 12 that's not what the -- that's not what they were 13 authorized to do. 14 The school was not author- -- now, the 15 community may say, "Hey, we want them to be a STEM 16 school." That's not what they were authorized and 17 contracted to do. 18 If this school wants to be a virtual 19 school, then they need -- we've already said to 20 another school who wanted to create a virtual model, 21 you need to put in an application, because it's a 22 whole new school. 23 And that's where I'm concerned. I 24 appreciate the fact that the community may want 25 this. But that's not what the school was contracted</p>

246

1 to do. And you can't contract and apply to be this
2 school and then say, "No, we've changed it, and now
3 we want to do this, because this best serves this
4 community."

5 That's -- I think we're opening ourselves
6 up to a lot for that. So I can't support this
7 amendment for a variety of reasons. That, I can't
8 support. But this flies in defiance to the
9 Governor's order, to the direction that was given by
10 the PEC and CSD for schools to go back in person.
11 And I can't come to grips with that.

12 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Voigt. Then
13 Commissioner Robbins. Then Commissioner Manis.
14 Commissioner Carrillo.

15 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you. So I see
16 this as a major pivot that the school made during a
17 catastrophic time. And I think that the -- the
18 mission of the school is not changing. It's the
19 modality and the environment and the learning
20 platform that is changing and, hence, the amendment.

21 I don't feel that it's necessary at this
22 time to go back and shame the school. I think the
23 Public Education Commission really needs to move
24 away from that, and that if we're going to grow
25 and -- as a supporter of our public charter schools,

248

1 I believe they've been disingenuous with
2 the PSFA and PSCOC, an existing lease
3 notwithstanding. So as worded now, I cannot
4 support -- even though it's just a change in
5 modality, I cannot support the full motion as
6 written.

7 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Manis.

8 COMMISSIONER MANIS: One of my biggest
9 concerns with the change in modality is who will be
10 the community that is actually being served (audio
11 distortion due to connectivity issues).

12 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Manis, if you can
13 hear me, we cannot hear you.

14 COMMISSIONER MANIS: (Audio distortion due
15 to connectivity issues) at that point.

16 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Manis, we lost
17 you for a moment, so you're going to have to
18 restart. I apologize.

19 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Not a problem. Can
20 you hear me now?

21 THE CHAIR: Yes, I can hear you now.

22 COMMISSIONER MANIS: My biggest concern
23 with this amendment is that who will their community
24 be once they're approved to be a primarily -- or
25 solely a virtual online school? Because it would be

247

1 we have to get away from that type of thinking, that
2 we can go back and shame our schools.

3 Cesar Chavez is doing what they're needing
4 to do by amending their charter and bravely going
5 forward with a new type of curriculum delivery. And
6 they are doing it by trial and error at our request.
7 So I give them kudos. I think this is very brave of
8 them going forward. They have retained students
9 within their new online method. So I think they're
10 doing a great job, and I would support this motion.

11 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Robbins.

12 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Well, I'm
13 conflicted, because I understand that they changed
14 modality, but they had a contract for one modality,
15 and they did not work with us in good faith over the
16 last year and a half.

17 The other thing is, you know, we've heard
18 terms here: blended, online, this and that. You
19 know, if they want to be a virtual school, use the
20 term they're going to be a virtual online school,
21 period. That would clarify a lot. And if the
22 motion were clarified that this school was moving to
23 be a virtual online school, period, that would also
24 help answer the lease assistance question, because I
25 believe they've been disingenuous with us.

249

1 my understanding that anybody in the State of New
2 Mexico that's of age to be in school as part of
3 their school could essentially be part of their
4 school community.

5 So I know we've talked about community a
6 lot. And it might be -- it may or may not be
7 supporting their community. I think based off some
8 of the data, it's not.

9 But it's concerning that the community is
10 actually -- could potentially get a lot bigger than
11 the community that they've been serving (audio
12 distortion due to connectivity issues).

13 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Manis, we lost
14 you again. It seems like at least it ended at a
15 complete sentence. It looks like right now your
16 microphone is muted.

17 Okay. I'm going to come -- I'm going to
18 come back to Commissioner Manis if he needs to.

19 But I think we do understand that concern.

20 Commissioner Carrillo.

21 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Okay. Since the
22 word -- I just jotted this down right now -- since
23 the word "community" was mentioned, I don't see that
24 this school is providing community services that a
25 community school provides online with a virtual

250

1 school. Because "community school" means a very
2 specific thing in terms of the wraparound services
3 you provide for your students.

4 The -- one of the things I'm concerned
5 with -- and we can -- maybe this is something that
6 we speak with -- but it led us right here -- is in
7 my experience, when we did mediation, you know,
8 they -- you know, the -- after we -- and I was on
9 the panels -- after it we went then to the board and
10 said what we had decided on, and the board could
11 accept or reject that next step that would have been
12 made.

13 It seemed like that step was missed here,
14 that the three -- the people that were in the
15 mediation kind of just made a decision on behalf of
16 the entire Commission without giving us the chance.
17 Now, you're there as the three people that were
18 appointed to be in mediation. But then when you
19 come up with what you think is a solution, in my
20 experience, that solution would be brought to
21 whatever board it would be before it would have been
22 brought to the school.

23 I know that's what we did with Turquoise
24 Trail years ago. Anyway, that was -- and we can --
25 I don't know -- but that around later. It's just a

252

1 If the school is committed to providing
2 the same exact education program and now doing the
3 same exact education that they would have done in --
4 on campus only, now they're doing it online, and
5 then wraparound services at the school, I feel like
6 that is a choice that a charter school should be
7 able to propose to us in an amendment, which -- and,
8 once again, I think if they had -- if the education
9 program would have changed, the actual what they're
10 teaching, that would have concerned me.

11 From my understanding in this amendment,
12 what they're teaching is not changing. How they're
13 teaching is what's changing. And so I'm trying to
14 not conflate this to more than what it is.

15 And, once again, I just -- I mean, I
16 already said this. But there's data to support that
17 they're making this decision based off of the best
18 needs of their kids. And that is what we ask
19 charters to do every day. And that is why we have
20 charter school autonomy, so that they can pivot and
21 move and propose an amendment to us, should they
22 need to, when they have evidence to show that
23 there's something that's working for their kids.

24 I also -- I go -- I still -- like, I
25 understand the frustration of how we got to

251

1 concern of mine.

2 Yeah. The community school piece, I don't
3 see how that can even be implemented.

4 THE CHAIR: Yeah. I'm -- I guess I -- I'm
5 trying to figure out -- because I do think --
6 actually, the one part of this amendment application
7 that was most clear to me was that there were going
8 to be kids still on campus at times and receiving
9 those services there, that all the same things that
10 the school's been doing, they will continue doing on
11 campus.

12 I mean, that was -- that piece was clear
13 to me in the -- I didn't know about the learning
14 versus -- online versus in the school. That's,
15 like, the actual direct instruction, which I think
16 has been clarified today, that the direct
17 instruction is online. The wraparound services and
18 support is what's on campus. That seems clear to
19 me.

20 And so, once again, I just -- I think -- I
21 just don't want to get into the business of -- I
22 think this -- to me, this is becoming more clear to
23 me that it's more of a school autonomy piece. I
24 don't think this is a whole new school. I just
25 don't see it.

253

1 December. I don't know if we need to necessarily go
2 backwards. But I actually think this should have
3 been proposed last spring.

4 I mean, I do think that this should have
5 happened last spring. And I think that would have
6 been more appropriate. I think this should have
7 been thoughtful that, it going into this school
8 year, we should have had this conversation already.
9 It should have been filed, and then this school year
10 should have started with this amendment having been
11 proposed and gone the right way.

12 I do think that procedure did not get
13 followed appropriately. And that is frustrating to
14 me, because I do think there's processes for
15 reasons, and there's reasons why we do things, and I
16 don't think that was followed.

17 But we are here right now. So if looking
18 at this alone, I don't think this is a new school.
19 I don't think this is a different school. I do
20 think they're providing the same education online
21 that they were in the -- in the classroom. And,
22 once again, all the same -- for me, the outcomes,
23 the goals, what -- how they're being measured,
24 should stay exactly the same.

25 And if the school doesn't live up to its

254

1 measurements, then we have accountability -- places
2 in place -- to take action that way. But right now,
3 there's no -- there's nothing that shows that this
4 is harming any students. There's nothing.

5 And, actually, even when we saw that
6 graduation rate, you do have to remember that
7 follows exactly what Ms. Arness was saying, that the
8 graduation rate was -- did look like that the
9 previous two years, the year of the pandemic, which
10 was the last year that the PED released data. It
11 dropped. And her expectation, and from the tracking
12 she does, is that 2022, which we won't have until
13 the spring next year, it should go back up again.

14 Once again, I don't see any data to show
15 harm to students. So if it's about process or
16 about -- I mean, we can -- I don't understand using
17 process to go against what the community -- and by
18 community, I mean the students at the school --
19 want. I think we are going to harm these students
20 by voting against it and telling them they all have
21 to come back in person. I think their re-enrollment
22 rate is going to go down. They're going to have
23 dropouts at that time.

24 We just saw they went from 53 percent
25 re-enrollment to 76 percent re-enrollment last year.

255

1 They're going to -- they will have students leave
2 based off of our actions, and I will not support
3 that.

4 Commissioner Voigt, and then Commissioner
5 Carrillo.

6 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: I have a couple of
7 questions. (Off mic.)

8 THE CHAIR: No. You would -- if you want
9 to amend the motion, you would need to do that now.

10 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Okay. I would like
11 to amend the motion that I made.

12 I move that the Public Education
13 Commission approve the Cesar Chavez Community
14 School, authorizing the school to provide direct
15 instruction through an online platform with students
16 that reside in the Albuquerque school district, and
17 reaffirming all other requirements and agreements in
18 the contract.

19 The school must discuss the school's lease
20 reimbursement funding amount with PSFA to ensure
21 that the school is not receiving lease reimbursement
22 to which it may not be entitled, and shall report
23 the result of the discussion at the January 20th,
24 2023, PEC meeting.

25 THE CHAIR: I'm concerned about the "they

256

1 must live in Albuquerque."

2 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: It's APS.

3 THE CHAIR: They're in Albuquerque. But,
4 oftentimes, we have kids that come from -- yes, yes.
5 So I don't think I would support that part of it. I
6 know it's acknowledging Commissioner Manis's
7 concern, but I wouldn't support that.

8 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: While you're
9 working on a new motion -- but I imagine that's what
10 Julia is typing up right now -- Chair Burt, using
11 your line of reasoning, RioGAFA can come back here
12 next year and say they want to be a STEM school.
13 What do we do then, where they're changing the
14 entire nature of their school?

15 THE CHAIR: First of all, I would use
16 data. If they have a good reason to support an
17 entire change of their education program, I will
18 listen to them.

19 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: What were you
20 referring to?

21 THE CHAIR: However -- sorry. Sorry. I'm
22 talking about the reengagement data I was given --
23 or the re-enrollment rates over the last three
24 years.

25 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Okay.

257

1 THE CHAIR: And so this is not -- to me,
2 this is not an entire change from their ed program.
3 They're doing the exact same education programming
4 now using online. They have the same mentorship
5 program. They have the same curriculum that they
6 were using. They're using all the same exact
7 things, just doing it online.

8 I would be open to listening to a school
9 about any -- we have an education program amendment
10 for a reason. Schools are allowed to change their
11 education program. They're allowed to propose a
12 change. I will consider that from any school.

13 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: I hear what you're
14 saying. I disagree with you, and I see, as their
15 re-enrollment went up, their graduation rate also
16 went down. I'm looking at it right here.

17 THE CHAIR: We don't have this last year's
18 data.

19 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: I hear what you're
20 saying. But it reflects to me on the performance of
21 the school at large. Did you come up with a --
22 sorry.

23 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Voigt.

24 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Okay. Thank you.

25 I just want to reiterate, though, that

258

1 this is not a mission change. The school is not
 2 amending their mission. They're amending their
 3 instructional modality.
 4 Okay. Granted, this is something that is
 5 finally being done that they're realizing needs to
 6 be done.
 7 They're doing it. It's an instructional
 8 modality change. It is not their mission change.
 9 So your example of RioGAFa, that would be
 10 a mission change. This is not a mission change.
 11 Just to clarify.
 12 THE CHAIR: Very soon.
 13 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Madam Chair, if I
 14 could, I would like to call the question --
 15 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Robbins.
 16 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: -- to end
 17 discussion.
 18 THE CHAIR: Yeah. We are just waiting on
 19 a motion.
 20 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: I'm not aware that
 21 previous motions have actually been tabled or
 22 withdrawn.
 23 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Voigt was
 24 amending her motion.
 25 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: But was that motion

259

1 either amended or withdrawn?
 2 THE CHAIR: It's being amended. She is
 3 trying to amend her motion currently. There is a
 4 motion on the table. Commissioner Voigt is working
 5 to amend it.
 6 (Brief pause in proceedings.)
 7 THE CHAIR: All right. Commissioner
 8 Voigt.
 9 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Thank you. And thank
 10 you, Ms. Barnes.
 11 Okay. Here is the amended motion.
 12 I move that the Public Education
 13 Commission approve the Cesar Chavez Community
 14 School, authorizing the school to provide direct
 15 instruction through an online platform, providing
 16 supplemental instruction at the school location, and
 17 reaffirming all other requirements and agreements in
 18 the contract.
 19 The school must discuss the school's lease
 20 reimbursement funding amount with PSFA to ensure
 21 that the school is not receiving lease reimbursement
 22 to which it may not be entitled, and shall report
 23 the result of the discussion at the January 20th,
 24 2023, PEC meeting.
 25 THE CHAIR: Second.

260

1 All right. There's an amended motion and
 2 a second.
 3 Any further discussion?
 4 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Can I just say one
 5 thing?
 6 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Voigt.
 7 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: I just want to
 8 reiterate that this is not a virtual school. This
 9 is not a virtual school. Blended does not equal
 10 virtual.
 11 THE CHAIR: Yeah. Sorry. We need to
 12 vote.
 13 Commissioner -- Secretary Armijo.
 14 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Vice Chair Voigt.
 15 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes.
 16 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Secretary Armijo
 17 votes yes.
 18 Chair Burt.
 19 THE CHAIR: Yes.
 20 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner
 21 Carrillo.
 22 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: No.
 23 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Chavez.
 24 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: No.
 25 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Gipson.

261

1 COMMISSIONER GIPSON: No.
 2 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Manis.
 3 COMMISSIONER MANIS: No.
 4 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner
 5 Robbins.
 6 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: No.
 7 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: That does not pass,
 8 five to three.
 9 THE CHAIR: All right. The motion fails.
 10 Thank you, Mr. Hill, for being here.
 11 Ms. Arness, thanks for joining us.
 12 Mr. Everett, thank you.
 13 All right. That will take us to Item
 14 No. 9, Discussion and Possible Action on Hózhó
 15 Academy Mission Statement Amendment.
 16 DR. BRIGETTE RUSSELL: Thank you,
 17 Madam Chair. The Hózhó Academy has -- requests PEC
 18 approval to amend their mission statement from the
 19 one in their contract to the one that they have been
 20 using since their governing board -- we have another
 21 belated amendment situation here, as we discussed at
 22 Hózhó's renewal hearing.
 23 There is a document, the CSD analysis, in
 24 the PEC's folder and on the website that lists the
 25 new -- the original mission in the contract and the

<p style="text-align: right;">262</p> <p>1 proposed mission.</p> <p>2 And CSD, while, obviously, a school has</p> <p>3 the right to -- to revise its mission, and this is a</p> <p>4 matter of charter autonomy, and CSD is -- wants to</p> <p>5 be very careful that we are not overstepping, and we</p> <p>6 are not, you know, suggesting that we have the --</p> <p>7 the right to tell a school what its mission</p> <p>8 statement should be, CSD does have one suggestion</p> <p>9 if -- Hózhó might want to consider for their revised</p> <p>10 mission.</p> <p>11 There's a -- and this is because when the</p> <p>12 school was founded, given their demographics,</p> <p>13 50 percent, approximately, Native American, located</p> <p>14 very near to the Navajo Reservation, even the</p> <p>15 school's name reflects Navajo culture: Hózhó.</p> <p>16 And so the original mission of the school</p> <p>17 emphasizes student culture. And the mission</p> <p>18 approved by the governing board in April omits any</p> <p>19 mention of culture.</p> <p>20 And so CSD would suggest to the school,</p> <p>21 which they may choose to ignore and PEC may choose</p> <p>22 to -- to tell us that we're overstepping, we would</p> <p>23 suggest that the school might want to consider</p> <p>24 replacing the phrases "Improve the hearts and</p> <p>25 strengthen the bodies" with "Improve the hearts,</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">264</p> <p>1 implemented and signed, was different.</p> <p>2 The last portion of the amendment was left</p> <p>3 off. And so the mission statement used to read,</p> <p>4 "And honor the cultures of our students in the Four</p> <p>5 Corners area."</p> <p>6 So that part, for us, didn't make a lot of</p> <p>7 sense, because we don't serve people in the Four</p> <p>8 Corners area, specifically, just Gallup, because we</p> <p>9 don't have transportation. And I wasn't exactly</p> <p>10 sure how to -- what that wording was really focused</p> <p>11 on.</p> <p>12 And so when we were trying to think about</p> <p>13 the mission statement, the other portion of the</p> <p>14 mission statement, the beginning, if you read -- if</p> <p>15 you read it, it's, like, "We are committed...", and</p> <p>16 the next line says, "We are committed..."</p> <p>17 And it was repetitive. And I felt like</p> <p>18 our students didn't know the mission statement, and</p> <p>19 our staff didn't know the mission statement.</p> <p>20 And so we wanted to make the mission</p> <p>21 statement something that we could memorize and say</p> <p>22 on a daily basis.</p> <p>23 So we crafted the language to try to</p> <p>24 reflect and capture what we were trying to do. And,</p> <p>25 honestly, it didn't occur to me that the specific</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">263</p> <p>1 strengthen the bodies, and honor the cultures," in</p> <p>2 that revised mission statement, respectfully.</p> <p>3 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: Chair Burt. I</p> <p>4 want to further add that the mission statement</p> <p>5 amendment is for schools that want to do small</p> <p>6 changes, grammatical changes, the way that the</p> <p>7 policy reads right now. And we felt that this was</p> <p>8 significant enough that it wasn't a small</p> <p>9 grammatical change, which is why it has moved from</p> <p>10 the consent agenda to a larger decision item. And</p> <p>11 so I think as Deputy Director Russell explained, and</p> <p>12 as is evident in our analysis, we feel like this is</p> <p>13 a significant change. Thank you.</p> <p>14 THE CHAIR: All right. So I think at this</p> <p>15 time we'll go to Ms. Hillock. If you want to -- if</p> <p>16 you can go ahead and present your amendment to us.</p> <p>17 MS. JULIANE HILLOCK: Thank you. It's</p> <p>18 good to see you all again so soon.</p> <p>19 The amendment originally was because --</p> <p>20 there's a couple of things that I wanted to point</p> <p>21 out. The -- the charter states our mission</p> <p>22 statement. But it's different than the mission</p> <p>23 statement that we submitted in our application. And</p> <p>24 so all of our applications and all of our documents</p> <p>25 up to the time of the -- the charter being</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">265</p> <p>1 culture piece was left off, because when we say</p> <p>2 "improve the hearts," that's what we're talking</p> <p>3 about is honoring each other, respecting each other,</p> <p>4 being responsible citizens. And that, to me, felt</p> <p>5 like it had included that.</p> <p>6 Other things were left off as well,</p> <p>7 including rigorous curriculum. But, I mean, I don't</p> <p>8 think that there is a problem -- I think CSD didn't</p> <p>9 make a recommendation about that, because maybe</p> <p>10 perhaps they assumed that that would be covered.</p> <p>11 But for me, I felt like respecting cultures was</p> <p>12 something that was a given within that mission</p> <p>13 statement already.</p> <p>14 And so I didn't think about saying it</p> <p>15 specifically, because I was just trying to think of</p> <p>16 a way to craft the mission statement in such a way</p> <p>17 that people could memorize it and it had some power</p> <p>18 behind it. And so the wording that we tried to come</p> <p>19 up with was the wording that we have suggested.</p> <p>20 So -- but whatever the Commission</p> <p>21 recommends. I don't oppose what the CSD's</p> <p>22 suggestion is to bring that back to the board. But</p> <p>23 at the same time, it isn't something that I felt</p> <p>24 like we needed to specifically say or else we</p> <p>25 wouldn't otherwise do. But I feel like we already</p>

266

1 do that and continue to do that, and it's really one
2 of our pillars.

3 THE CHAIR: All right. Thank you.

4 So we'll go to Commissioner questions and
5 comments.

6 Commissioner Carrillo.

7 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Thank you. It's
8 very nice to see you again so quickly. Still
9 thinking about Fratelli's Alfredo fries.

10 And I would ask Dr. Russell if you would
11 please, if you could read that change that you were
12 suggesting one more time.

13 DR. BRIGETTE RUSSELL: Of course.

14 Madam Chair, and Commissioner Carrillo,
15 the first line of the mission is, "The mission of
16 Hózhó Academy is to train the minds, improve the
17 hearts, and strengthen the bodies of our students
18 through a classical education...," et cetera,
19 et cetera.

20 And we recommended -- and as I say, it is
21 only a suggestion -- adding after -- changing
22 "improve the hearts and strengthen the bodies,"
23 to -- find where I have it -- "improve the hearts,
24 strengthen the bodies, and honor the cultures."

25 So it's an addition of three words to the

268

1 this in no time flat.

2 All right. Thank you very much. And it
3 is so nice to see you again.

4 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Robbins. Then
5 Commissioner Voigt.

6 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes. Well, unless
7 they're going to withdraw the application, we have
8 the application as is. I don't think they can
9 change it here without going -- getting their board
10 to change. So we either accept or reject this as it
11 stands.

12 But my position is, you know, they've
13 discussed it. Their governing council has discussed
14 it. The students have discussed it. I would accept
15 it the way it is. If they want to add to it the
16 next month or the month after to add "culture" at
17 any time, that would be fine.

18 Shortening it to what she proposed would
19 be a good first step. Consideration of what CSD has
20 proposed would be great. But that's -- leave that
21 up to the school if they want to come back.

22 But I support the change as it is, because
23 I think it -- you know, "the hearts" -- and the
24 students were great. I watched it online and it was
25 just a wonderful, wonderful heartwarming video that

267

1 mission.

2 And I understand Ms. Hillock's desire for
3 it to be sort of short and sweet so that kids can
4 memorize it.

5 And, you know, our thinking at CSD was --
6 well, it's up to the school and the PEC. Thank you.

7 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Thank you.

8 So, Ms. Hillock, I kind of like it, the
9 addition. Unless you had a strong opposition to it,
10 I could go either way. But I really like the
11 addition of the three words, if that's something
12 that you're amenable to.

13 MS. JULIANE HILLOCK: We are. I don't
14 object to that. The only thing is retraining
15 students, because, you know, we just had -- started
16 using that mission statement, which I know is
17 another issue that we want to talk about.

18 But I don't object to that, because that
19 is what we do. It was just a matter of trying to
20 find balance with the wording to make it not sound
21 awkward. So -- and I appreciate their contribution.
22 I don't object.

23 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Well -- and I have
24 every confidence, after hearing the kids recite the
25 Pledge in four different languages, that they'll get

269

1 we saw.

2 Thank you.

3 MS. JULIANE HILLOCK: Thank you.

4 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Voigt.

5 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: I like the addition
6 of the -- it's actually four words. But I think in
7 order for that to go forward with the CSD's
8 recommendation, this would have to be tabled for the
9 governing board to approve the new language --
10 correct? -- and then come back as an amendment?

11 But, again, I think it's the school's
12 choice. But I do feel that the addition of
13 "honoring the culture" is important, and it would
14 be -- should be important to their mission.

15 THE CHAIR: Director Chavez.

16 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: I was going to
17 suggest that the school could also choose to
18 withdraw at this point and come back next month.

19 THE CHAIR: I'll go back to Commissioner
20 Carrillo. But before -- I'll support this one. If
21 the school comes -- if the school has a conversation
22 and decides not to, we just wasted their time, and
23 they have to come back to us anyway.

24 This is what the school talked about. The
25 governing board approved it. I feel comfortable

270	<p>1 with how it is. If they want to come back and 2 revise it, I'm comfortable with that, too. It takes 3 the same amount of effort to come back again, either 4 way. If they choose -- if the school feels like 5 it's best to leave it as is, I don't want them to 6 have to come back again. And I'm okay with it being 7 as is.</p> <p>8 So I'll support this one today, and then 9 looking into that recommendation and then working 10 with the governing board and seeing if that's what's 11 best for the school later.</p> <p>12 Commissioner Carrillo.</p> <p>13 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: I concur with you 14 and with Commissioner Robbins. Keep it simple.</p> <p>15 THE CHAIR: All right. So with that, I'll 16 move that the Public Education Commission approve 17 the amendment to Hózhó Academy Mission.</p> <p>18 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Second.</p> <p>19 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Second. Third. 20 Fourth.</p> <p>21 THE CHAIR: Thank you for a motion and 22 second. Commissioner Voigt for discussion.</p> <p>23 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Sure. So thanks. 24 Did the school have an opinion on this? I 25 know they can't respond. I'm just throwing it out</p>	272	<p>1 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Voigt. 2 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes. 3 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Passes, seven to 4 zero.</p> <p>5 THE CHAIR: Thank you. All right. Thank 6 you. Have a good weekend.</p> <p>7 MS. JULIANE HILLOCK: Thank you. You, 8 too.</p> <p>9 THE CHAIR: Happy holidays. 10 MS. JULIANE HILLOCK: You, too.</p> <p>11 THE CHAIR: Okay. Item No. 11, Discussion 12 and Possible Action on Approval of Amendment Forms 13 and Implementation of Forms on a Temporary Basis 14 with Final Approval of Amendment Forms at a Later 15 Time to Align with New Contract.</p> <p>16 Ms. Barnes.</p> <p>17 MS. JULIA BARNES: Thank you. We 18 discussed this yesterday at the Working Session. I 19 won't go into much detail.</p> <p>20 I will let you know that it feels 21 important to allow CSD to take a look at those for 22 non-substantive changes and formatting changes. 23 And I have taken consideration and made 24 minor changes based on what Matt Pahl said this 25 morning and just eliminated those -- it was actually</p>
271	<p>1 there. So if we have leave it up to the school to 2 accept this and/or come back next month, I'm just 3 throwing this out there.</p> <p>4 THE CHAIR: I can withdraw my -- I can 5 withdraw my motion to where we can allow for her to 6 respond.</p> <p>7 Okay. All right. We'll go ahead and -- 8 any -- any comments or discussion from 9 Commissioners?</p> <p>10 Okay. All right. 11 Secretary Armijo, if you can call roll.</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Secretary Armijo 13 votes yes. 14 Chair Burt.</p> <p>15 THE CHAIR: Yes. 16 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner 17 Carrillo.</p> <p>18 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Yes. 19 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Chavez. 20 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes. 21 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Manis. 22 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Yes. 23 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner 24 Robbins. 25 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes.</p>	273	<p>1 in two different sections. 2 And, again, we're going to look at this 3 for alignment with the contract and part of -- we'll 4 just see if other issues come up as we use these 5 forms.</p> <p>6 I am anxious to use these forms ASAP. 7 THE CHAIR: All right. Any questions from 8 Commissioners? CSD?</p> <p>9 All right. Okay. I would say with that 10 modification being made based on the public comment 11 from Matt Pahl, I will move that the Public 12 Education Commission approve the amendment set forth 13 at Documents 11.a.1. through 11.b.7. for immediate 14 use.</p> <p>15 These forms may be revised when a new form 16 of the charter contract is approved as needed, and 17 the CSD is authorized to make formative and 18 non-substantive changes and post these forms on the 19 PEC website.</p> <p>20 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: I'll second. 21 THE CHAIR: Thank you. A motion and a 22 second. 23 Any discussion by Commissioners? 24 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Right at this 25 moment, I don't know if KT is on. We don't have a</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">274</p> <p>1 quorum just this second, because two people just got 2 up. 3 COMMISSIONER MANIS: I am here, but I 4 didn't hear the motion. 5 THE CHAIR: I can repeat the motion, KT. 6 I move that the Public Education 7 Commission approve the amendment form set forth as 8 Documents 11.a.1. through 11.b.7. for immediate use. 9 These forms may be revised when a new form of the 10 charter contract is approved as needed. 11 The CSD is authorized to make formatting 12 and non-substantive changes and post these forms on 13 the PEC website. 14 That was the motion. 15 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Thank you for that. 16 THE CHAIR: Yeah. Absolutely. Seeing no 17 hands up, Secretary Armijo, if you could call roll. 18 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Chair Burt. 19 THE CHAIR: Yes. 20 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner 21 Carrillo. 22 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Yes. 23 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Chavez. 24 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes. 25 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Manis.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">276</p> <p>1 a powerhouse, working with HR. 2 So you'll see that indeed we have been 3 able to increase staff for the Division. And we did 4 a little bit of reorg in terms of reporting. 5 But when you come next month, you'll get 6 to meet my brand new administrative assistant, 7 Samantha Ramirez. 8 You'll also get to meet Ms. Kimberly 9 Gonzales, who was taking Melissa Sanchez's place as 10 the data and financial analyst administrator. 11 And you'll get to meet Kyle Wood, who is 12 the authorizing practices coordinator. 13 This is a brand new created position. So 14 we're super excited that there will be two 15 administrators in the authorizing team who can focus 16 on financial performance of schools. 17 We also reclassified -- if you recall, we 18 reclassified a position so we would have a Financial 19 Coordinator A. And Ms. Ruby James has confirmed 20 that she will be joining our team. 21 We have a vacant position -- that's 22 Felicia's position -- to fill. And I believe there 23 were interviews today. 24 And the other one is the PEC Liaison, 25 which we are moving forward with. So that is the</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">275</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Yes. 2 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Vice Chair Voigt. 3 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes. 4 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: And Secretary Armijo 5 votes yes. 6 That passes, six to zero. 7 THE CHAIR: All right. That'll bring us 8 to Item 12, which is Report from Charter Schools 9 Division. 10 If you don't mind -- actually -- yeah, go 11 ahead. I was thinking about moving the calendar up 12 just to make sure we have enough people to vote on 13 the calendar. But I think we'll be fine. 14 So, Director Chavez, Item No. 12, Report 15 from Charter Schools Division. 16 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: Okay. Thank you. 17 I know by the time we get to my report, people are 18 fatigued. But I have great news to share. And if 19 you're looking at the screen, you can see the 20 revised organizational chart for the Charter Schools 21 Division that I wanted to just make sure that you 22 were aware of. 23 I want to thank my staff who have been 24 involved in all the interviews and vetting of 25 candidates, and especially Mr. Louie Torres, who is</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">277</p> <p>1 update on the PEC -- excuse me -- CSD staffing. 2 I wanted to talk about improvement plans 3 for schools renewed with conditions. We are 4 absolutely on track with providing the schools 5 reminders of any documents or plans that they need 6 to provide to us as part of their condition for 7 renewal. And thank Martica for working on that. 8 The 2022 Notice of Intent form was posted 9 to the website. And on -- and we have four sessions 10 that are currently planned to provide training and 11 support for anyone that submits a Notice of Intent. 12 Again, they are due the second Tuesday in 13 January. The training dates are in January, 14 February, March, and April, from 9:00 to 12:00. 15 I would just like to, in closing, just 16 express my appreciation for the outgoing 17 Commissioners. I know this is the last meeting that 18 we will have Commissioner Robbins, Commissioner 19 Chavez, and Commissioner Voigt here. I know 20 Ms. Davis is not here with us, but I just want to 21 thank you all personally for your service on this 22 Commission for all the work that you do and wish you 23 all the best. Thank you. 24 THE CHAIR: All right. Thank you, 25 Director Chavez.</p>

278

1 All right. The next item is Discussion
2 and Possible Action on the PEC Calendar for 2023.

3 So we just made some updates, and you can
4 see them as Item No. 13 in your drive.

5 The only question I had, we did add -- we
6 made sure -- we feel very confident that we'll be
7 doing contract negotiations in April. So we know
8 that we don't need them in March, because we
9 won't -- we need that time for the Performance
10 Framework and contract.

11 We did add some optional work days in
12 here. These are going to be -- right now, they're
13 specific for the Performance Framework and any work
14 we need to do in order -- on feedback or things that
15 we need to do for Performance Framework in order to
16 lead up to that March approval.

17 So that's where you'll see those optional
18 work days. We may use them; we may not. The only
19 question I had that I don't know if it got
20 solidified that we probably need solidified today
21 for sure is the training date for new Commissioners,
22 and if any other Commissioners wanted to attend,
23 either.

24 At first we had it on the 11th. I know
25 it's, for sure, not the 11th. I know we looked at

280

1 give us some flexibility.

2 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: If you want to
3 keep it there, with the possibility it would be
4 canceled. But that's super soon. And, you know, we
5 have not been able to confirm with the -- with the
6 candidate -- or excuse me -- the incoming
7 Commissioners if that date works.

8 THE CHAIR: Okay. I would say, just for
9 the sake of having it on a calendar and giving
10 flexibility for it to be confirmed later, let's --
11 what if we made the yellow as possible training
12 dates and then do -- because I remember -- I'm
13 trying to remember the day -- okay. Dr. Russell.

14 DR. BRIGETTE RUSSELL: Yes, Chair Burt.
15 The dates I wrote down as possible replacements for
16 January 18th (verbatim) were January 6th and
17 January 18th. Those were the dates that we were
18 going to confirm with new Commissioners. But we
19 haven't yet.

20 THE CHAIR: Okay. So let's go ahead and
21 we'll make both of those as an option. That way, we
22 can do that after. But that way, it's approved.

23 And I do think, especially with -- I know
24 the changeover in e-mail sometimes or Google Drive
25 or things happen with current Commissioners. So we

279

1 either January 6th or one other date. Right now
2 it's January 6th, but I just wanted to confirm that
3 that's correct before we vote.

4 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: I don't believe
5 that that is correct. I think that we -- because it
6 is with the four new Commissioners that are coming
7 on board and not for the entire Commission. If we
8 could just remove that, and we would need to work
9 directly with the Commissioners that are new -- I
10 don't know if they're on Zoom in the audience and
11 able to comment.

12 But I don't think that -- you know, we
13 had -- we had some people that were sick that were
14 anticipating being here and that sort of a thing.
15 So that was not something that we were able to
16 confirm.

17 THE CHAIR: Okay. I'm -- do you know if
18 there were a couple of dates that are being
19 considered that we could put onto here and figure it
20 out later?

21 I know that we're -- this is a new
22 Commissioner training. But we were planning on
23 opening it for any Commissioners that needed
24 additional supports or wanted a refresher as well.
25 So I wonder if I could put a couple of holds and

281

1 do want to make it to where there could be a
2 possible quorum that day.

3 If the old Commissioners -- I hate saying
4 that -- like -- but like the older -- the
5 recurring -- want to join as well, and even just to
6 have that training with the new Commissioners,
7 they're welcome to come. Not required.

8 Okay. So we'll do 6th and 18th.
9 Commissioner Carrillo, any other questions about the
10 calendar?

11 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: I'm curious.
12 April 5th and then 7th. So 5th, I know, is the
13 first night of Passover. 6th is the second. The
14 second is the one -- not that we have a meeting
15 then, but I'm just curious as to why -- is the one
16 that is often observed with Seder and everything
17 else. I'm just puzzled as to why the 7th is there.

18 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Maybe green the 5th
19 and the 6th, then, not the 7th.

20 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: That's what I
21 would recommend.

22 (Question asked off mic.)

23 DR. BRIGETTE RUSSELL: Sorry. The 7th is
24 Good Friday. Yes.

25 THE CHAIR: So that -- all three. Great.

<p style="text-align: right;">282</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: There you go. 2 THE CHAIR: Okay. All right. 3 So I will move to approve the PEC 2023 4 Calendar, as seen as Item No. 13. 5 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Second. 6 THE CHAIR: Questions? Comments? 7 (No response.) 8 THE CHAIR: Great. Secretary Armijo, if 9 you could call roll. 10 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: I can. 11 Commissioner Chavez. 12 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Yes. 13 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Manis. 14 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Yes. 15 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner 16 Robbins. 17 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes. 18 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Vice Chair Voigt. 19 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes. 20 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Secretary Armijo 21 votes yes. 22 Chair Burt. 23 THE CHAIR: Yes. 24 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: And Commissioner 25 Carrillo.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">284</p> <p>1 Commissioner Carrillo. 2 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: It was brought up 3 yesterday -- and Mr. Pahl might be able to talk 4 about this -- what -- is there anything to do about 5 a charter that knows they're not going to be renewed 6 with one entity or another just fleeing and then 7 going to the other, even though the reason they 8 weren't going to be renewed is that they were awful, 9 or they had financial challenges or whatever it 10 might be? 11 THE CHAIR: So I think it would be a 12 statutory change would be needed in order to do 13 that. 14 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: That's why I -- is 15 that something that Mr. Pahl and the group would get 16 behind? Or is it -- because they represent all 17 charters, do they want to give one of those fleeing 18 charters with their tail between their legs a second 19 chance? 20 THE CHAIR: Do you know what we're talking 21 about? Okay. Great. 22 MR. MATT PAHL: Madam Chair and 23 Commissioner Carrillo, we -- for those kind of 24 things, the devil is in the details. 25 I think the biggest piece that we would be</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">283</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Yes. 2 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: That passes, seven 3 to zero. 4 THE CHAIR: Thank you. All right. We're 5 on to Item No. 14, which is Discussion and Possible 6 Action on PEC Legislative Recommendations. 7 I did ask -- there is a memo -- it is Item 8 No. 14 in your drive -- that is succinct and clear 9 as to what we have already voted on. If we have 10 anything that needs to be updated, that's what this 11 is for. 12 We didn't know if anything would come up 13 between last meeting and this meeting, as we had a 14 while between the last one. So that's what this 15 agenda item is for is just for any last-minute 16 changes. 17 But I think we do know that we can't 18 really put new things on at this time. So if 19 there's anything that you've heard about that you 20 believe is coming up into the Legislative Session 21 that you think the PEC might want to support, I 22 think that would probably be the most appropriate 23 thing to add at this time. 24 But always open for your ideas and 25 discussion.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">285</p> <p>1 interested in -- because this has happened in the 2 past -- I don't know if it happened with Cottonwood 3 this time who switched authorizers -- is make sure 4 the application to the new authorizer, that they had 5 all the information from the previous one, because 6 if a new -- a new authorizer, based on their values 7 and what they want to see in their schools, should 8 make a decision based off of that. 9 But if they don't have information from 10 the prior authorizer, that they don't know these 11 kind of things -- so we would be more in the realm 12 of wanting authorizers to have full transparency of 13 what the track record was and let them make the 14 decision. 15 Because, you know, for example, years ago 16 we had number up dropout reengagement schools flee 17 the PEC to get authorized by APS. APS accepted them 18 because they recognized they're fulfilling a need in 19 their community -- well, I don't know all the 20 reasons. But I do think it was acceptance for those 21 reasons. 22 And so now I don't know if they had their 23 full -- full transparency behind the data sharing. 24 But I think we should let authorizers make their 25 decisions based on their values, and then just</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">286</p> <p>1 ensure that they have the information they need. 2 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: So then it might 3 just be legislation that says a requirement to 4 disclose? 5 MR. MATT PAHL: (Indicates.) 6 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: If we don't ask, 7 then shame on us, or -- I like the idea of a 8 requirement to disclose. 9 Okay. No one can hear you because your 10 mic's off. 11 MR. MATT PAHL: Authorizer-jumping is not 12 really addressed in statute. And so there might 13 just be kind of something to look into this as far 14 as the authorizer requirements. 15 And then I'd just say, Madam Chair, 16 Commissioner Carrillo, it's just we'd bring that to 17 our membership to decide if we supported it or not. 18 But just gave you general parameters first of how we 19 view it. 20 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: I hear you. Thank 21 you. 22 MR. MATT PAHL: Yes. 23 THE CHAIR: Anything else on Legislative 24 Agenda that anyone would like to bring up at this 25 time?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">288</p> <p>1 So that will take us to Item 14, 2 Discussion -- or sorry -- Reports from PEC Liaisons. 3 So LESC and LFC. 4 LESC did meet over the last couple of 5 months. They -- I know everyone -- they have it in 6 different communities. I just -- one thing I'll say 7 about them is they have -- they do a really great 8 job of integrating people from the community into 9 their meetings. 10 So they often have students. They'll 11 always have superintendents, principals, teachers, 12 come speak to them. And I think it's just a really 13 valuable way for Legislators who, for the next 14 couple -- they'll be up in Santa Fe stuck in the 15 Roundhouse, to actually get a better feel for the 16 schools and how they're going. 17 There haven't been specific PEC or charter 18 school topics that they've been broaching. It's 19 really been a lot of teacher retention, a lot of 20 work on teachers and teacher education, the school 21 finances, which, obviously, all these things affect 22 charters. But there hasn't been, I would say, 23 thankfully, charter-specific items that I think 24 would -- are looked at to be negatively impacting 25 the PEC work that we're doing.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">287</p> <p>1 Commissioner Robbins? 2 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Thank you. I was 3 curious. On Page 4 -- and I don't know -- we had 4 talked about this. "Change of legislation to modify 5 travel reimbursement from posted duties to be..." -- 6 is that a PED recommendation and it's just added on 7 here? PEC endorsement? But we haven't talked about 8 that; is that correct? 9 THE CHAIR: No, we did discuss it. And 10 we -- I think when we talked about it, we said if 11 it's something that someone else brought up at the 12 Legislature, that we would support it. But we 13 weren't going to be, like, actively pursuing it on 14 behalf of anyone else. 15 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Was this related to 16 the issue that we had a contract person in 17 Las Cruces and everything? 18 THE CHAIR: Yeah. 19 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Okay. Okay. I do 20 remember that now. Okay. Thank you. 21 THE CHAIR: Yeah. Okay. 22 I think that's -- I think that's it for 23 that. We don't need a motion and vote. This has 24 already been done; so it was only if there was 25 anything updated that needed.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">289</p> <p>1 So we'll be looking at communicating with 2 them in January and continue watching and following 3 what they're doing and seeing if any of their 4 priorities are ending up as bills that are aligning 5 with what we have done in our Legislative Agenda as 6 well. 7 Next item is Item B, the Indian Education 8 Advisory Council. Secretary Armijo. 9 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Thank you. So the 10 last meeting we had, there was not a quorum, so we 11 just went over some broad general items. 12 And then there was actually a -- the G2G 13 Meet and Greet with Tribal Educators and Education 14 Cabinet Secretaries. But it happened to be on the 15 same day as the Public Charters of New Mexico 16 conference. So I was not able to attend that, 17 unfortunately. 18 So I look forward to going to our meetings 19 that start in January of 2023. 20 THE CHAIR: Thank you. I feel like this 21 next one, we should say on hold, just like we have 22 do the subcommittees. 23 But the New Mexico -- NMCEL. 24 Vice Chair Voigt? On hold? 25 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: I did, in passing,</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">290</p> <p>1 mention to Traci Filiss, who is on the board of 2 NMCEL that, as the PEC liaison to NMCEL, I was never 3 notified of any meetings. 4 She just said something like, well, she'll 5 see what she can do about it. 6 So there you have it. 7 THE CHAIR: All right. Best of luck to 8 who's replacing you next year; correct? 9 PSCOC. Commissioner Robbins? 10 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Thank you. I'll 11 try to keep them brief, but you know I always have 12 something to say, and I think it's important. 13 Albuquerque Sign Language Academy did 14 receive their additional \$6 million. So they now 15 have a total of \$28 million from the PSCOC for 16 building. 17 They have a \$3 million loan arranged 18 through the Mortgage Finance Authority. 19 So, you know, they are, I think, a go. So 20 I'm very happy for that and pleased. 21 The State Education Network, called SEN, 22 SEN -- too close to S-I-N, I think, you know. But 23 anyway, \$117 million in federal money for broadband 24 in New Mexico. 25 They're -- the Office of Broadband is</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">292</p> <p>1 And one of the things that -- it can be 2 canceled at any time if there's conflicts or 3 anything like that. But right now, we don't foresee 4 any of that. 5 The Legislature is proposing -- or there's 6 been proposals made to the Legislature -- to cut 7 local matches from anywhere from 30 to 50 percent. 8 Right now, there's a formula that says a local 9 school -- and charters are eligible for this -- 10 local schools that want funding, there's a local 11 match for almost everything. 12 And let's say you have a 50/50. The State 13 will put up 50 percent; the local school puts up 14 50 percent. They're looking at cutting that local 15 match. 16 If it's a 30 percent cut, that -- instead 17 of being a 50 percent, it would only be 35 percent. 18 So they take away 15 -- that's a huge -- a huge 19 advantage. 20 And a lot of the local matches for the 21 better well-to-do districts are in the area of 80 or 22 90 percent. 23 So if you talk about a 30 percent 24 reduction of our 80 percent match, now it becomes 25 more feasible and less burdensome to take advantage.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">291</p> <p>1 looking at using a good portion of that for schools 2 and helping schools, which would be good, and using 3 a portion to help build out what's called the nodes. 4 A node -- you're the last mile, the consumer. When 5 you're here, the last mile gets you here. 6 But then you have a node that you connect 7 to, and that node connects to the Internet, to the 8 Worldwide Web. It's the nodes that need to be 9 expanded and everything like that in order for the 10 network to be done. So that's moving forward. 11 The annual report for this last fiscal 12 year is being finalized and should be available for 13 anyone who wants to get a copy of it or anything, 14 they can contact PSFA. 15 We did approve -- the PSCOC did approve a 16 Joint Powers Agreement with the Office of Broadband 17 and Access Expansion. 18 They will actually assist the PSC -- PSFA 19 in executing a contract to get these nodes built out 20 and everything for the State Education Network, 21 which is a big step, because PSFA doesn't 22 necessarily have the technical expertise and legal 23 expertise in house. And so the Office of Broadband 24 will be able to help tremendously with that. And 25 they can provide supports.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">293</p> <p>1 And there's about \$1 and a half billion over the 2 next couple of years available through the 3 short-term severance bonds that will be available 4 for this funding. 5 So we're hoping schools would apply, and 6 then that would go forward through the Legislature. 7 Another proposal is to eliminate offsets. 8 An offset is when a legislator gets money directed 9 to a school. And for whatever reason, PED didn't 10 keep track if it was for an eligible project, you 11 know, a school project, or if it was for band 12 uniforms. They just tallied up the total. 13 So it may have been band uniforms -- 14 PS- -- PSCOC and PSFA, they don't fund those things 15 anyway. So that technically shouldn't have been 16 part of the offset, but it was calculated as part of 17 the offset. 18 They're looking at just doing away with 19 offsets. One of the school districts that would 20 benefit the most from that would be APS, because 21 they have about a \$36 million offset right now. I 22 think the next largest school district is only about 23 \$9 million. But that's -- that will probably be 24 debated and everything. 25 That's all I have for that, except the</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">294</p> <p>1 PSCOC admin committee that I chaired meets on 2 January 3rd. I will not be there unless Chair Burt 3 wants me to stay on until a permanent replacement 4 could stay. Even though I won't be a Commissioner, 5 you have the discretion to appoint someone. 6 But Stewart Ingham -- he was a former 7 project manager with APS, he's shown an interest in 8 doing that. 9 The other thing is that PSCOC will have a 10 meeting -- I believe it's the 10th of January. 11 They -- next meeting will be after the Legislature, 12 so it won't be until April. So if you don't appoint 13 someone to go to that meeting, they're going to be 14 four months with no one on the PSCOC. 15 There will be things they can interact 16 with with PSFA and everything if they're the 17 designated liaison. So just to have a discussion 18 with the incoming or existing Commissioners to see 19 if anyone wants to be, you know, nominated to be 20 selected for that. Thank you. 21 THE CHAIR: Thank you. Thank you so much 22 for that. And I know your work on PSCOC, I think, 23 is -- not to diminish all the rest of our work, us 24 being liaisons. But the work that you have done 25 over the course of your term on PSCOC is, like, such</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">296</p> <p>1 surprised I didn't wear it to the next meeting, you 2 know. It was, like, in December a couple of weeks 3 ago. 4 And I said, "Well, why would I wear it?" 5 They said, "Well, yeah, you're right. We 6 never gave one to anyone before who chaired the 7 subcommittee." 8 THE CHAIR: Very cool. Very cool. 9 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: That was really -- 10 people wrote little things. They gave me a nice 11 card and everything. 12 So I felt very privileged that Chair 13 Guillen, from New Mexico School Board, who chairs 14 PSCOC, actually had the confidence in me to put me 15 on that committee. And I worked very closely with 16 him and David Abbey, had a good working relationship 17 with them. 18 And I think, hopefully -- you stated 19 this -- but, hopefully, I elevated the role of the 20 PEC with the PSCOC. So thank you. 21 THE CHAIR: Absolutely. And I think it's 22 easy for charter schools to be forgotten if there's 23 not someone there advocating for them. Yeah. Thank 24 you. 25 Mr. Ingham, soon to be -- or I should say</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">295</p> <p>1 a bright, shining spotlight on behalf of the PEC, I 2 feel like it's really made us -- you have made us 3 look good by you being on it and you representing 4 the PEC. 5 And the effect that you have on it is so 6 tangible. And so I know we're all very grateful for 7 that and, once again, the care and passion you have 8 for it, and especially right now, letting me know 9 that we need to get someone on it right now. 10 So, actually, I don't want to waste any 11 time doing that. And so is there any way -- would 12 you mind promoting Stewart Ingham to the panel real 13 quick? 14 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Are you there, 15 Stewart? 16 While you're doing that, if he's still 17 there -- 18 THE CHAIR: Yes, please. 19 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: -- I would like to 20 say thank you for that. At the last AMS 21 subcommittee that I chaired for two and a half 22 years, they gave me a hardhat with everybody's names 23 written on it and everything. I had to -- being 24 very careful, I took it home and spray-painted clear 25 coat on so it wouldn't rub off. Then they were</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">297</p> <p>1 Commissioner Elect Ingham, are you able -- are you 2 able to say hi really quick? 3 COMM.-ELECT INGHAM: Yes, I am. 4 THE CHAIR: Okay. Great. You can hear 5 me. 6 I would love to ask, on a temporary basis 7 until appointments are made for the next year, if 8 you would be willing to serve on the PSCOC starting 9 January 3rd and work with Commissioner Robbins on 10 that transition in the meantime. 11 COMM.-ELECT INGHAM: I would absolutely be 12 privileged. There is only one little problem. And 13 that is that they've -- what do you call it? -- when 14 I get sworn in for January 3rd, of course. So I 15 don't know how I can work that. I will figure out a 16 way, though, okay? 17 THE CHAIR: Yeah. And you can work with 18 Commissioner -- now I'm volunteering you past your 19 term. But I know Commissioner Robbins will help you 20 to figure out the timing of that. Hopefully, it 21 could overlap in the best way possible. If 22 January 3rd doesn't work, Commissioner Robbins, I 23 would like you to attend on January 3rd. 24 And -- but by January 10th, Mr. -- 25 Commissioner Elect Ingham, if you could go ahead and</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">298</p> <p>1 represent us on that. And then when we do our next 2 meeting, and I ask for roles, we'll do the official 3 appointment for next year at that time.</p> <p>4 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Thank you, I'd be 5 happy to. And I have been working with Commissioner 6 Ingham, and also Commissioner Elect Beck, who will 7 be replacing me in my position from District 2, and 8 he's been texting me during the day, giving me 9 little comments and things like that.</p> <p>10 So, obviously, anything that I can share, 11 if it's worthwhile, I'd be happy to do that. I will 12 miss working with you, and I'll leave that for later 13 comments. But thank you.</p> <p>14 THE CHAIR: Absolutely. All right. Thank 15 you, Commissioner Elect Ingham. So we'll have you 16 figure that out and get you serving. Like I said, 17 we'll do it on a temporary basis until after the 18 January appointments for the whole year, and, that 19 way everyone knows it can still be looked at. But I 20 definitely don't want that representation to be 21 lacking after what Commissioner Robbins has built up 22 over there, so we don't want to miss a beat.</p> <p>23 COMM.-ELECT INGHAM: Agreed.</p> <p>24 THE CHAIR: All right. Thank you.</p> <p>25 Next is NMPSIA and Commissioner Manis.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">300</p> <p>1 So we will be updating that right away and 2 getting that back out.</p> <p>3 But, yeah, Christmas Eve, gentle reading, 4 if that's what people feel like doing, please feel 5 free to go ahead and start that process, because we 6 do want -- we want feedback. We want to continue 7 doing this updating process over the next couple of 8 months to make sure we have the buy-in and support 9 and as much collaboration as possible to get it 10 done.</p> <p>11 And next is the Report from Public Charter 12 Schools of New Mexico, and Mr. Pahl.</p> <p>13 MR. MATT PAHL: Thank you, Madam Chair, 14 members of the Commission. It's been a long week. 15 I won't take too long.</p> <p>16 Our conference was a hit. We had over 17 300 folks there. We always strive to do a mix of 18 elevating folks in our community and letting them 19 share what's going on in their schools, but also 20 bringing in some national folks.</p> <p>21 Dr. Howard Fuller was our keynote speaker. 22 And he is someone who will help you reaffirm the 23 things you believe in, challenge some of the things 24 that you thought you believed in. It was really, 25 really special.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">299</p> <p>1 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Thank you. I 2 attended the NMPSIA meeting virtually this last 3 meeting. It was held last week on Thursday. I 4 don't have much to report, other than that the 5 majority of our discussion surrounded financial 6 matters and updates on financial reports and 7 rebalancing our investment portfolio, given the 8 changes in volatility in the stock market.</p> <p>9 Thank you.</p> <p>10 THE CHAIR: Thank you. And last we have 11 the NMSBA. Commissioner Carrillo.</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Nothing to report.</p> <p>13 THE CHAIR: Okay. All right. So that'll 14 take us to the Report from the Chair. The only 15 updated PEC issue that I'm going to take the next -- 16 every chance I can, anytime I have the ability to 17 talk about it -- is going to be the Draft 18 Performance Framework is on the website. There is a 19 link right underneath it.</p> <p>20 Please take a look at that. The 21 Performance Framework, I do want to say for anyone 22 listening right at this moment, the Performance 23 Framework Working Group will be meeting Tuesday to 24 collect input from the Commission that was just 25 heard.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">301</p> <p>1 We're excited to -- and then just I'll 2 also note, people meeting each other for the first 3 time. They've been on Zoom for a year. It was a 4 really, really nice event for our schools. And I 5 want to give a shout-out to Lauren Hunter and Angela 6 Lopez. You know, we're only 2.5 FTEs, and so 7 lifting up a conference like that is a big deal, and 8 our board really helped out as well.</p> <p>9 We're excited to amplify the July Charter 10 School Conference from CSD. And we've begun to do 11 that, because we want this to be this cadence of 12 twice a year getting the charter school community 13 together would be really powerful.</p> <p>14 Wanted to tell you a couple of things on 15 my platform from my presentation in front of LESC.</p> <p>16 One is there's a lot more things in play 17 with the announcement of a lot of billions of 18 dollars that are now in play in Session.</p> <p>19 So the scope within K-12 ed seems to be 20 expanding by the day here. So it's just like a note 21 for all of us to be watching that.</p> <p>22 We -- based on member feedback, we started 23 having this conversation about ensuring that student 24 support staff gets funded in the formula. I'm going 25 to get technical for a second, because I know a few</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">302</p> <p>1 of you really know this.</p> <p>2 Back when we had T&E, you were getting</p> <p>3 funded for social workers, counselors, all of these</p> <p>4 kind of student support staff that are still on that</p> <p>5 three-tiered licensure. The TCI system doesn't do</p> <p>6 that anymore. So we're literally providing a</p> <p>7 disincentive to hire experienced social workers and</p> <p>8 counselors.</p> <p>9 And when we presented it, it was such an</p> <p>10 ah-ha for folks that have been involved with this</p> <p>11 for a while. I really think there's some potential</p> <p>12 to provide that funding. And don't be fooled. Some</p> <p>13 folks will respond to a proposal like this and say,</p> <p>14 "Well, we have at-risk funding, like, that at-risk</p> <p>15 money can be used for those students."</p> <p>16 After the pandemic, every single kid needs</p> <p>17 access for counselors, to the student support staff.</p> <p>18 And that's something that's resonating and</p> <p>19 generating a lot of conversation in a short amount</p> <p>20 of time.</p> <p>21 Regard- -- you know, there's the battle</p> <p>22 around what Extended School Year looks like, the</p> <p>23 stage is set.</p> <p>24 I'll just tell you what we think in</p> <p>25 general principles around that. It does also seem</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">304</p> <p>1 have 1,040 hours for your elementary school</p> <p>2 students? Check, and you get the money. I think it</p> <p>3 could be that simple, and we should do it simply.</p> <p>4 Speaking of simple things, you guys kept</p> <p>5 the simple things simple this week. You hit some</p> <p>6 home run renewals, and you just treated them like</p> <p>7 that. And I just want to tell you I appreciate</p> <p>8 that.</p> <p>9 That doesn't always happen. Sometimes we</p> <p>10 can get in -- the conversation takes us to wild</p> <p>11 places. I just want to note, particularly on the</p> <p>12 renewals, how -- how it just was really good. It</p> <p>13 felt like we were scoped in on what you have</p> <p>14 authority over to hold schools accountable to, and</p> <p>15 schools felt good after the process.</p> <p>16 So thank you for those renewals. They</p> <p>17 were great. Kept the simple things simple, and I</p> <p>18 think you're giving deep conversation to, like, some</p> <p>19 complex problems. Some of them were today. So</p> <p>20 thank you for that.</p> <p>21 I also want to thank you for talking about</p> <p>22 schools -- about expanding. You know, I think</p> <p>23 you've now gone through enrollment cap increases to</p> <p>24 understand that the schools themselves are actually</p> <p>25 more conservative than I think we gave them credit</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">303</p> <p>1 we're moving from this idea of tacking on days to</p> <p>2 switching to hours. That's a positive. That's</p> <p>3 something we've been advocating for with, largely,</p> <p>4 the education implementers in the state for the last</p> <p>5 three years.</p> <p>6 What I would say is when we get to the</p> <p>7 nitty-gritty here, we care that there's local</p> <p>8 discretion on our school calendar. So the idea we</p> <p>9 get to allocate the hours -- remember. Your</p> <p>10 schools, your highest performing schools, don't</p> <p>11 actually have Extended School Years by calendar.</p> <p>12 They have Extended School Days. And it's just --</p> <p>13 this is something we can offer to the conversation.</p> <p>14 These schools -- and some of them, you</p> <p>15 heard from today -- they're having longer days, and</p> <p>16 it's purposeful, and I think we should bring that to</p> <p>17 the conversation.</p> <p>18 So local discretion of the calendar. We</p> <p>19 want this to be above the line. We want to take</p> <p>20 away the paperwork between PED and school districts</p> <p>21 and charter schools. I think a lot of other folks</p> <p>22 feel that way. There are some proposals that say</p> <p>23 this is kind of like an application process.</p> <p>24 To me, if the new hours are 1,040, let's</p> <p>25 just do it during the budget process. Okay, you</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">305</p> <p>1 for in the past.</p> <p>2 They worry about this. So by the time</p> <p>3 they come to you, you know -- and a little nudge for</p> <p>4 those schools. The best way we're going to get more</p> <p>5 kids who really need these educational models are by</p> <p>6 getting more seats for them to obtain that</p> <p>7 education.</p> <p>8 So I just appreciate that. It'll be the</p> <p>9 schools' decision whether they bring you an</p> <p>10 enrollment cap increase, and we'll be there to</p> <p>11 support them to try and get that portable or</p> <p>12 whatever they can facility-wise, because we know</p> <p>13 it's such a challenge.</p> <p>14 But these are big steps forward for the</p> <p>15 Commission, and I just want to commend all of you</p> <p>16 for that.</p> <p>17 Thank you to -- I want to thank</p> <p>18 Commissioner Robbins. Thank you for your service on</p> <p>19 the Commission. Thank you for -- I think it was</p> <p>20 actually encapsulated really well just a moment</p> <p>21 ago -- your commitment on the facilities side</p> <p>22 elevated us with that group. And we've made</p> <p>23 significant strides forward in your tenure.</p> <p>24 And ASLA is a great beneficiary -- like,</p> <p>25 individual beneficiary. But we've all benefited</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">306</p> <p>1 from that. Thank you for your advocacy, and I know 2 you and Commissioner Ingham will work to continue 3 that tradition with PSCOC. 4 Commissioner Chavez, thank you. You 5 run -- you're bringing the pragmatic perspective of 6 someone who actually runs a school and talking to 7 folks who run a school -- you run more than one 8 school. But the perspective could be felt with your 9 presence on the Commission, and we appreciate that. 10 I also want to thank you for bringing your 11 expertise on English Learners every month. It's 12 something that we can never afford to skip over. 13 And when we have somebody that really has that 14 in-depth knowledge, you could tell from your 15 questions. And they were valuable and they brought 16 a level of spotlight on the issue in a way that -- 17 that we may miss in the future, because your 18 expertise is deep. 19 So thank you, Commissioner Chavez, for 20 your service on the Commission. 21 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Thank you, Matt. 22 MR. MATT PAHL: Commissioner Voigt, thank 23 you for bringing your charter perspective. Thank 24 you for being an advocate for charter autonomy. You 25 all have different opinions on all these things, and</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">308</p> <p>1 So thank you to all of you. 2 I will submit a calendar for Performance 3 Framework feedback sessions to Corina and Bekka 4 before I close my computer today. We're going to do 5 those during the day, some in the evening, just to 6 try and hit folks when it's convenient for them. 7 So that will be coming, and you all can 8 share that with the rest of the Commission as 9 appropriate. 10 The last thing I'll just note, in January, 11 as we -- as we get going with Legislative Session, 12 watch our social media. We have some School 13 Spotlights that are newly produced that, you know, 14 they just get to some of the things that we really 15 need to get across with our charter community, which 16 is some of the basics, you know, that we're public, 17 we're open to all, and that we're doing innovative 18 things in education. But it also tells the story of 19 the school. 20 And so, like, to the extent you're active 21 on social media, follow us and share those things so 22 other folks can see. 23 Thank you, Madam Chair. Thank you, 24 Commission. 25 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mr. Pahl. Happy</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">307</p> <p>1 that's why there are ten of you. 2 But, Commissioner Voigt, charter schools 3 could really feel something with you up there, 4 having been one of them in the not too distant past. 5 And I know that I'm really thankful for the 6 partnership we've had over the last really seven or 7 eight years, and know that we'll continue on in the 8 future -- or hope that we'll continue on in the 9 future. So thank you, Commissioner Voigt. 10 I also want to thank Commissioner Gipson. 11 She's been around for a little bit, and she decided 12 to give it another go. There's real value in that. 13 And so I'm saying that to those who are joining us 14 in January and further on, is it's not always pretty 15 up here, and it's a lot of time, and to choose to 16 run again is a benefit for our schools. 17 You learn -- like, every year, you all, 18 like, have got another year of experience that you 19 bring to this Commission. And we have -- we've had 20 a lot of turnover on the Commission. I'd love to 21 see folks run for second, third, fourth terms, and 22 just want to thank those who are exiting because 23 your service was really valuable, but encourage 24 those of you who didn't just run a campaign to run 25 another campaign in another 18 months here.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">309</p> <p>1 holidays to you and your family and the Public 2 Charter Schools of New Mexico staff as well. They 3 did do a great job. The conference was amazing, 4 well-run, organized. 5 I know that's, like, what they would care 6 to hear most; right? 7 It felt like it to us. So it was great. 8 It was wonderful, a great mix of lots of different 9 things. And many school leader-led initiatives, 10 which was really cool to see, too. So thank you for 11 that. 12 All right. Thank you. All right. The 13 next item is going to be Item No. 17, Recognition of 14 Outgoing Commissioners. 15 So we have Secretary Armijo is going to 16 give out some appreciation gifts that we were -- we 17 all pulled together and got some thank yous for 18 them. 19 Commissioner Chavez, we'll get yours to 20 you. We promise. 21 So I would like to start with Director 22 Chavez. If you would like to start us off, and then 23 we'll go around to other Commissioners, and we'll 24 end with those of you who are leaving us. You all 25 are going to talk last.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">310</p> <p>1 Director Chavez. 2 DIRECTOR CORINA CHAVEZ: Sure. I'll start 3 with Mr. Chavez, over in Hatch, and say I'm sorry I 4 didn't get to see you much in person, and I just -- 5 again, I -- I echo what Matt Pahl said. Every time 6 that you spoke to your reality of running a school 7 district at this really difficult time, I was 8 just -- I was just so appreciative of how you -- how 9 you brought that reality to the PEC. 10 Thank you. And I know that you are doing 11 wonderful things in Hatch. Keep up the good work, 12 and we will see you around for sure. 13 Commissioner Robbins, you challenged me at 14 times. And there were times when I was sitting here 15 saying, "yes" when you were speaking. 16 So thank you for your service on the 17 Commission. I know that you worked really hard in 18 the facilities, PSCOC as well, and advocated for 19 charter schools. Thank you so much. I wish you and 20 your family all the best. 21 Glenna, I'm going to miss you a ton. 22 Glenna -- oh, my gosh -- bringing the charter school 23 perspective, also having been the first State 24 charter school start-up, head administrator, I just 25 have so much respect for you and what you bring to</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">312</p> <p>1 I almost raised this at another meeting. 2 We are deeply divided as a country politically. And 3 sometimes you guys are deeply divided. But I was so 4 appreciative when Commissioner Carrillo -- so -- so 5 boldly raised the wonderful work you did, 6 Commissioner Robbins, on PSCOC. And I thought it 7 was a shining example of unity in politics. 8 And I almost raised it, and I thought, 9 You're the lawyer, don't say that. But I'm not 10 speaking as a lawyer now. So I appreciate both of 11 you for that. 12 Okay. Glenna Voigt. I was -- I'm going 13 to say something personal, which is I was thinking 14 to myself, because I always want public service to 15 be part of my legal career. And I was knowing, 16 actually, that Speaker Egolf was thinking about not 17 running for office again. 18 And I was, like -- I was, like, I need to 19 do something else in the public sector, so I'm going 20 to keep my eyes open. 21 And then I get a text from Glenna Voigt. 22 And she says, "I don't know if you will remember 23 me." 24 And I was, like, "I do remember you." 25 She said, "Would you like at -- we're</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">311</p> <p>1 any environment that you're at. 2 And I've had a chance to see you do that 3 in multiple places. And I know whatever you do 4 next, wherever you go and, just, in life, you're 5 going to bring a shining light. Thank you so much. 6 (Indicates.) 7 THE CHAIR: Ms. Barnes. 8 MS. JULIA BARNES: If I can go around 9 quickly, Commissioner Robbins, I've got to say, I 10 often sat here and thought, I agree with him. I 11 agree with him. I agree with him. And I know I've 12 put that on the record several times. 13 So I appreciate the legal fiscal mind that 14 you have. And I appreciate the responsiveness and 15 how many times you pick up my call, and I will miss 16 you. 17 Commissioner Chavez, I know several people 18 have said this. But you have spoken with such 19 integrity over the really serious issues that our 20 students have faced. And there's something when 21 someone speaks from that place of integrity, it was 22 just undeniable. So I feel like I wish we weren't 23 losing that voice. 24 Glenna Voigt is looking at her present. 25 Oh. I'm going to go back for just one second.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">313</p> <p>1 looking for a lawyer, and will you look at 2 applying?" 3 And I thought -- well, I just said to 4 myself I would keep my options open. And so I 5 looked at the application. 6 And I'm grateful to you -- I'm grateful to 7 you for flagging that and thinking of me and 8 remembering me. 9 So I will miss you. 10 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Carrillo. 11 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Commissioner 12 Chavez, you bring a wealth of information. And 13 whenever you spoke, even if I may have had ideas one 14 way, I would listen to you and your words -- your 15 words and your foundational knowledge always. Even 16 though it may not seem like it sometimes, I'm 17 listening. I'm taking it in. I'm reevaluating 18 my -- whatever position I may have had. 19 And always it's a result of exactly what 20 Julia said, the kind of foundational integrity in 21 terms of who you are in the world. 22 And I just admire your commitment to kids. 23 I didn't know that your wife was also a 24 superintendent. Holy smokes. It's like -- I 25 just -- yeah. The amount of dedication in your</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">314</p> <p>1 family to children.</p> <p>2 I appreciate -- you know, I was always</p> <p>3 disappointed when you weren't going to be here, but,</p> <p>4 at the same time, I understood. You're a</p> <p>5 superintendent, you know.</p> <p>6 And I want to thank you just very much for</p> <p>7 your service and in your school and with the</p> <p>8 district, just being -- your 100 percent commitment</p> <p>9 to kids, because that's ultimately what it's all</p> <p>10 about.</p> <p>11 And what's your wife's name?</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Vickie.</p> <p>13 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: I don't know if</p> <p>14 you ever make it up to Santa Fe for a weekend, like</p> <p>15 in summer. But if you're ever up here, I would love</p> <p>16 to go out for a margarita with you just to just meet</p> <p>17 you, because you're now the only Commissioner that I</p> <p>18 haven't met in person. I had the pleasure of</p> <p>19 meeting Mike a couple of times. And KT came up</p> <p>20 today.</p> <p>21 So I would just love to meet you and</p> <p>22 Vickie if you find yourself in the neighborhood.</p> <p>23 Thank you so much for your dedication to</p> <p>24 kids and the Commission.</p> <p>25 David, learned so much from you. You</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">316</p> <p>1 Commission -- or on Zoom. And, I mean, I know who I</p> <p>2 am, and you call me out on it. And I totally</p> <p>3 appreciate that.</p> <p>4 But more than anything, just my respect --</p> <p>5 you're such a smarty-pants. My respect for how much</p> <p>6 knowledge you have, you know, about all of these</p> <p>7 different -- I don't even know what -- you guys are</p> <p>8 throwing out acronyms, and I'm, like, "Whoa", and</p> <p>9 then, finally, I don't ask. I kinda wait and then</p> <p>10 they're explained.</p> <p>11 But it's just -- to have that as part of</p> <p>12 this Commission is so remarkably valuable. And --</p> <p>13 and I appreciate the -- the soft hand with which you</p> <p>14 attempt to put me in my place sometimes. And --</p> <p>15 'cause you're always kind about it.</p> <p>16 And I wish you the very best. You said</p> <p>17 you're going to Southeast Asia, to Vietnam. Just</p> <p>18 have a wonderful trip. And whatever's next, you</p> <p>19 know, I don't suggest public office. I suggest</p> <p>20 doing things that are not as consuming and things</p> <p>21 that, you know -- just being -- going for two</p> <p>22 months, maybe three, whatever. Just take advantage</p> <p>23 of this to whatever's next. Open the clean slate</p> <p>24 and the wide open horizons.</p> <p>25 But just as Julia said, I can't -- maybe</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">315</p> <p>1 know, there -- there needs to be a plaque on the --</p> <p>2 on the new school that everything is going to be</p> <p>3 built out with your name on it and a dedication.</p> <p>4 I know you say no. But you have no idea</p> <p>5 the legacy that you leave and the work that you've</p> <p>6 done. And I hope Stewart is as much of a</p> <p>7 smarty-pants as you are on all of these financial</p> <p>8 elements on PSCOC.</p> <p>9 And he's a great guy. We got -- well, of</p> <p>10 course, we got to meet him at renewals.</p> <p>11 Going to miss your insights. And we --</p> <p>12 you know, we disagreed on issues now and then, but</p> <p>13 who cares, because we -- it's all about kids first.</p> <p>14 But, really, the wealth of knowledge that you have</p> <p>15 in the areas that you bring. You know, it's a big</p> <p>16 gap. Stewart's got really big shoes to fill, big</p> <p>17 snowshoe-size shoes to fill.</p> <p>18 David, thank you so much. I know you're</p> <p>19 only a ride down the hill away. Sometime when I'm</p> <p>20 down there in the hinterlands, again, we should</p> <p>21 definitely have a cup of coffee or a lunch or</p> <p>22 something.</p> <p>23 Glenna, you're so much fun. I know that</p> <p>24 we spar. And I -- sometimes I -- I feel your eyes</p> <p>25 roll from across the -- from across the</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">317</p> <p>1 it was about being the first charter school and all</p> <p>2 the wealth of knowledge that you bring to the table,</p> <p>3 and, again, the integrity. No one could ever, ever</p> <p>4 question your commitment to kids, all kids, no</p> <p>5 matter what.</p> <p>6 Thank you. Really going to miss you.</p> <p>7 Going to miss the three of you a lot. Two years</p> <p>8 wasn't long enough to just hang out. But thank you.</p> <p>9 THE CHAIR: Secretary Armijo?</p> <p>10 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: All right. So I</p> <p>11 will start with Commissioner Chavez as well.</p> <p>12 You know, I think we were -- we -- during</p> <p>13 the pandemic, we did that interview on Cafecito</p> <p>14 Carron (ph) -- Cafecito whatever it was -- because</p> <p>15 we were the Commissioners of Hispanic background or</p> <p>16 whatever. That was my first meeting with you, and I</p> <p>17 was, like, Oh, my God, that man has so much stuff</p> <p>18 going on, I can't even imagine all the stuff he's</p> <p>19 got going on.</p> <p>20 I want to echo what everyone says. Your</p> <p>21 commitment to kids in New Mexico is second to none.</p> <p>22 I am honored to have sat on a board with you. Thank</p> <p>23 you so much for your commitment to New Mexico kids,</p> <p>24 and your wife's as well. That happens in pairs. I</p> <p>25 know my late husband and I were sort of the same</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">318</p> <p>1 way, doing things in different realms. So I think 2 that's really cool.</p> <p>3 So thank you very much. Like I said, I 4 was honored to sit on a Commission with you.</p> <p>5 Commissioner Robbins, I -- we probably 6 don't see eye to eye on a lot of things, as 7 everybody has mentioned before. But your commitment 8 to kids and to making sure that everyone is taken 9 care of is what I take from you. And I really 10 appreciate the fact that you will go to bat for 11 everybody. And I like that a lot. I really 12 appreciate it.</p> <p>13 It's been an honor to serve with you. I 14 was lucky enough to get to see the full hardhat that 15 he was gifted with at -- I happened to be in 16 Santa Fe that day, and he came out and showed it to 17 me. So that was really, really special. That was 18 really, really cool.</p> <p>19 So congratulations, and thank you so much 20 for your commitment.</p> <p>21 And then there's Glenna. I -- Glenna and 22 I go back way back, way back. We were Emerge 23 sisters. We are Emerge sisters. We both went 24 through Emerge New Mexico, and we are 2018 25 graduates. And that's where I got to learn of all</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">320</p> <p>1 I may not have said it outright during the 2 Commission meeting, but I have learned from your 3 perspectives, and I believe that each of you have 4 left your mark on the Commission in different ways, 5 and those ways are not going to be forgotten.</p> <p>6 I think the perspectives and the mindset 7 that you've left, it's left something that we can 8 all keep in mind as you leave the Commission and go 9 about your respective things that you're doing in 10 the future.</p> <p>11 So just thank you for all that you've 12 done, and thank you for the perspectives and things 13 that you've brought to this Commission during your 14 years of service.</p> <p>15 Thank you.</p> <p>16 THE CHAIR: Thanks, Commissioner Manis. 17 Commissioner Chavez, I did know your wife 18 Vickie very well before I met you. And I feel -- I 19 was, like, well, I mean, I guess he's probably going 20 to be pretty great, because if Vickie likes him, he 21 must be pretty cool.</p> <p>22 But, I mean, what about -- really, 23 genuinely, a power couple down there.</p> <p>24 You are just a spectacular person. But 25 also the level of knowledge that you're able to</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">319</p> <p>1 of Glenna's work.</p> <p>2 And then, plus, prior to that, you know, 3 got to know of her in the charter realm because of 4 all the charter school work that she has done.</p> <p>5 And so many people are like, Glenna Voigt? 6 Glenna Voigt? She's the one who created this? She 7 did this. She did this.</p> <p>8 So as a mentor and as just a friend, I'm 9 going to miss you the most. And I -- it was a 10 pleasure serving on the board with you, and I know 11 our friendship will not end here because we will 12 always be connected.</p> <p>13 And I thank you so much for your 14 dedication to students in New Mexico and just this 15 entire process. So thank you so much.</p> <p>16 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Manis, if you 17 have service.</p> <p>18 COMMISSIONER MANIS: I will make mine 19 short. My service is kind of spotty.</p> <p>20 I would just like to thank each of you. 21 I'm not going to -- I think everyone has said many 22 comments that I really agree with. But I have 23 learned a lot, this being -- really, I would say my 24 first elected position, I've learned a lot from all 25 three of you.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">321</p> <p>1 provide to us as a superintendent, not only -- I 2 should say your historical knowledge you have of 3 schools elevated up to a superintendent, that 4 perspective is massively valuable to us. And I am 5 very much going to miss it.</p> <p>6 The perspective you have of small rural 7 schools is oftentimes very similar to what charter 8 schools have. So you being able to bring that into 9 our minds, especially those of us living in the more 10 urban areas, that is really, really, really, really 11 invaluable information for us to consider, because 12 how it impacts -- we always have to remember that 13 New Mexico has all these different pockets of how 14 people are living across the state.</p> <p>15 And your knowledge of your community, your 16 district, is spectacular, and I'm so grateful to 17 have had the privilege to have worked with you. I 18 really, really don't -- I do not try to complain 19 about working and having this position when I think 20 about the fact that you're a superintendent and also 21 have this position.</p> <p>22 I'm, like, I'm good. Like, Commissioner 23 Chavez is a superintendent and doing this job.</p> <p>24 I know your life has drastically changed 25 from the time you ran to now. So thank you. I</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">322</p> <p>1 think your service to charter school students on top 2 of the service that you're already giving to your 3 traditional schools, it's just a place in which it's 4 very challenging to do both. And I think you have 5 really given a level of expertise and knowledge and 6 background to the Commission that's going to be 7 very, very missed.</p> <p>8 And, especially, I will say, with both you 9 and Commissioner Voigt going off at the same time, 10 I'm very upset about it. I'm not going to lie. For 11 us to not have any, you know, charter or school 12 leaders on our Commission starting next year, I 13 think we're going to need, like, a phone-a-friend 14 option if we need to call you still.</p> <p>15 So -- but I do think, kind of like what 16 Matt said, is when you're able to talk about your 17 students and schools in the way that's so personal 18 and passionate for you, it does resonate with other 19 folks. It resonates with other school leaders.</p> <p>20 That's a perspective that I'm sure it's 21 very hard to listen to me talk to them. It's, like, 22 "What you do you know? What are you talking about?"</p> <p>23 You are able to talk about it. You're in 24 the same boat with them. You understand. You're 25 able to give that level of care and personalization</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">324</p> <p>1 projector right between us all the time. Let me -- 2 all right. Let me come over here.</p> <p>3 Commissioner Robbins, I can say I have had 4 so many great conversations with you, you know, 5 during Commission meetings, offline Commission 6 meetings, and being able to hear your perspective, 7 hear where you're coming from.</p> <p>8 Once again, I always know you have the 9 heart of kids -- your heart is for kids, for the 10 school leaders, what's best for schools, what's best 11 for New Mexico. I mean, it's clear. And it's never 12 been something that I've ever had to consider, 13 "Well, where is he coming from in this?"</p> <p>14 I know where he's coming from. 15 It's always been easy to hear your 16 perspective, always been able to listen to your 17 ideas, consider everything. You've convinced me of 18 many things. Sometimes you don't convince me. Many 19 times you have.</p> <p>20 We've been able to really come to terms 21 with a lot of different things. And I really 22 appreciate -- I love being able to have open, 23 honest, frank conversations and being able to come 24 here and work together and collaborate. 25 And I know you're always willing to do</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">323</p> <p>1 to students I'm really grateful for.</p> <p>2 I've always known that you're always a 3 phone call away, always willing to talk, always 4 willing to be open to considering what's best. And 5 I know, for me, thinking about you, the one -- I 6 would always say you're kid-first. And that's 7 something that I really appreciate about you, 8 Michael.</p> <p>9 Like, you are so honed in on the kids and 10 what's best for them. And I know you make your 11 decisions based off what's best for kids in the 12 state of New Mexico. And your service on the 13 Commission and to your community and to your schools 14 is, once again, tangible, and it makes a positive 15 impact on many, many kids.</p> <p>16 And I think when you're at the level 17 you're at, it probably feels a little lonely up 18 there. But do remember that, you know, it does 19 impact kids, you know.</p> <p>20 So in those moments, just remember, you 21 have had great impact on students' lives, even if it 22 feels farther away than whether you were a teacher.</p> <p>23 Great. Well, thank you, and we will miss 24 you on the Commission. 25 Commissioner Robbins, I always have this</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">325</p> <p>1 that. You're always willing to work together to do 2 what's best for the -- what's best for schools, 3 what's best for kids.</p> <p>4 And I appreciate that you've always been a 5 massive advocate for the PEC. I mean, it -- you 6 are. And I'm so -- I'm grateful the -- the level of 7 service that you were willing to offer, not just 8 being on the Commission, but putting in the extra 9 time and effort that is not required of you -- you 10 know, no one makes you do all these things. And for 11 you to put in the level of services that you were 12 able to provide for charter schools in New Mexico 13 is -- is awesome.</p> <p>14 I mean, it's just -- it's awesome and 15 great, and thank you. And it's the true heart of a 16 public servant to really go out of your way. You 17 know, you have -- every time you go to a meeting, 18 you are -- your family sacrifices a little bit. 19 Everyone who's around you, you're sacrificing a 20 little bit. So to do that and just know that all 21 those sacrifices your family and you have made, it 22 impacts kids in New Mexico all over.</p> <p>23 And I know it's a lot. You know, it's a 24 lot to do. And you have to have something special 25 in you to do all the work that you've done and keep</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">326</p> <p>1 going and keep going and keep fighting. 2 It's so, so important and a great example 3 for those of us as we continue in liaison positions 4 to strive to elevate those positions that we have to 5 being extremely meaningful, that our advocacy for 6 charter schools, we can -- you have given us a 7 proven example. We have data to support us that we 8 can elevate these liaison positions to help elevate 9 charter schools that maybe hadn't happened before. 10 So thank you so much for serving on the 11 Commission. And, yeah, you're going to be missed. 12 All those finances -- I also want to say thank you. 13 I know that you have, once again, gone out of your 14 way to start bringing in new folks, helping them get 15 ready for January to where they're not starting off 16 at Ground Zero. 17 And I think that's also, once again, the 18 heart of a public servant to care, you know, make 19 sure you're leaving people in the best positions 20 that they can be. 21 And, once again, just thank you for that 22 extra effort, the extra time, the extra mile that 23 you go on everything you do. So thank you. 24 Commissioner Voigt, I have had just the 25 most absolute greatest time having you as vice chair</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">328</p> <p>1 to overstep, and you bringing it back, reining it 2 back in and really making sure that the authority 3 and the role that we play is clear and defined. 4 And the care you have for charter autonomy 5 I think is the one thing that has sunk in with me 6 the deepest. And understanding the why of it is one 7 thing that you have deeply engrained in you is the 8 why of everything. 9 And anything that we've talked about, we 10 can always go back to a why, and you're -- you have 11 a deep engrained belief in a why behind everything 12 you do. 13 And, once again, it's always kids. You 14 know, it's kids and the success of kids and making 15 sure people are supported, cared for, loved, you 16 know, in every way, and making sure they're ready 17 for the world. And I know that that's who you are 18 inside. And the amount you give of yourself to 19 others, I mean, I just don't know if I've met 20 someone who's so willing to give wholeheartedly to 21 another school, to -- to every little agenda item, 22 wholeheartedly, you know. 23 And I really appreciate that. And you 24 have been a spectacular colleague, a great mentor, 25 and I'm so grateful to have had this -- the last two</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">327</p> <p>1 this year. I have leaned on you in so many ways 2 that I can't even -- I can't even start to, you 3 know, think about all the personal ways that I've 4 leaned on you as well. 5 But every time I needed something, all I 6 knew I had to do was give her a quick call. She's a 7 "yes" woman for me, and I'm so grateful for that, 8 because it's been so helpful. 9 I feel like, unnecessarily and very much 10 unwarranted, you are my biggest cheerleader 11 throughout this time, and I'm very grateful for it, 12 the support that you've given to the EC, to me, 13 specifically. You don't have to do that, and you 14 did, and I'm grateful. 15 Your knowledge of charter schools -- 16 everyone's already said it. Your knowledge of 17 charter schools is going to be sorely missed on the 18 Commission. I mean, the fact that -- your 19 dedication to charters in New Mexico, I think, is 20 going to be something that -- you know, I do know 21 that you're -- I can't imagine you're leaving it 22 behind, so I'm grateful for that, knowing that 23 you're going to be around, we're not losing you. 24 But on the Commission, I think being able 25 to, you know, maybe feel like we -- sometimes I want</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">329</p> <p>1 years, but this year, working with you as chair, has 2 been absolutely spectacular. And I am so grateful 3 for all of the -- you know, all the really great 4 things that we've been able to work on and all the 5 really challenging things we've worked on, too. 6 And I'm so grateful for all of those -- 7 those and the in-betweens. And just appreciate you. 8 Okay. Now, I -- yes, now, it's your turn. 9 So, Commissioner Chavez, I feel like we came to you 10 every time first so you get to go first now. 11 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: All right. What do 12 you say after all that, you know? 13 Thank you, everyone. It's -- it's been 14 great. But, you know, I've got a couple of notes 15 here, because I don't -- as you know, I don't always 16 communicate very well. And so I appreciate the -- 17 the -- you know, the kind words. 18 But, you know, I just want to go back. 19 You know, when I came onto the Commission, you know, 20 I know there was a lot of questions that were 21 generated with my coming on board, both from the 22 charter school community that thought, "Well, you 23 know what? What's this guy that's in public -- in 24 traditional public education, what's his motive? 25 What's his agenda?" You know.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">330</p> <p>1 And then I had other people in traditional 2 schools, my fellow administrators, that say, you 3 know, "How can you work in traditional schools and 4 be supportive of charter schools?" 5 And, you know my response was always the 6 same. 7 And I'm so glad that several of you that 8 shared your kind words, you know, shared this, 9 because that's always been what I -- you know, my 10 whole purpose of being on the Commission. And that 11 is for kids, period. Because I support kids. And I 12 don't -- and I support kids being in great 13 educational programs, whatever that -- whatever that 14 looks like. 15 And so that's what I'm all about. And so 16 I'm glad that people have picked up on that, because 17 that really is -- I'm all about kids. 18 But, you know, I -- I -- I like old 19 Westerns. But my favorite is -- my favorite actor 20 is Clint Eastwood. Some people like The Duke, but 21 I'm a Clint Eastwood guy. But the one I really like 22 is, The Good, The Bad, and The Ugly, because that's 23 so much what we go through in life is the good, the, 24 bad, and the ugly. 25 In that spirit, I would just like to say</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">332</p> <p>1 is what it is. 2 However, I sometimes felt like it was the 3 lawyers that were benefiting from that whole 4 process. So that was the ugly part. 5 But I'd like to go back to the good and 6 just say I think the best thing I could say about my 7 participation on the Commission, and that is I am a 8 better educator, and I am a better leader for 9 serving on this Commission. And for that, I just 10 want to say thank you to all of the Commissioners 11 present and past. 12 I also want to say thank you for people 13 that I've met along the way, new friends. Beverly, 14 I know you're on there. Thank you so much for your 15 patience with me. I know there was -- I know there 16 was times where she was frustrated with me with 17 getting my forms in and whatever. And I'm still, 18 you know, a flake when it comes to that. 19 But Beverly was so, so patient. And so I 20 really appreciate your friendship, Beverly. 21 Pattie, I just want to say thank you for 22 your leadership. As Matt Pahl pointed out, you've 23 been there a while. And, Pattie, I've learned so 24 much from you, and more than you know. And so 25 Pattie, thank you for your leadership over the</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">331</p> <p>1 the good that I experienced on the Commission was 2 seeing all the incredibly strong and innovative 3 programs that are out there, our successful charter 4 schools and -- holy cow -- I just -- I would sit 5 back sometimes and just see the incredible work that 6 is being done and the -- and the kids and what they 7 were producing, and it was just amazing to me, and 8 it was a whole new world. 9 And so that's -- that's -- you know, that 10 was the good. 11 You know, the bad, I think it was we saw 12 an example of that today. And that is, you know, 13 when the adults can't get things together. And, 14 unfortunately, there was times, you know, in the 15 last four years where we saw, you know, some of 16 that, you know, the bad. 17 And, of course, the ugly was, you know, 18 there are some schools that just -- let's be 19 honest -- they shouldn't be in operation. 20 And I think Commissioner Carrillo 21 mentioned this earlier, and that is, you know, 22 something about, you know, lawyers getting involved. 23 And, really, you know, when we get to that point, 24 you know, it -- and -- you know, I know lawyers do 25 their job, and they work for their clients, and, it</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">333</p> <p>1 years. 2 Rebekka, thank you for your leadership, 3 because you stepped up. And it takes courage. It 4 takes courage to step up. And you've done that. 5 And you've taken the torch and -- and there's a lot 6 of great things that you're doing. And so continue 7 to do those things. 8 Julia, thank you for the kind words, also, 9 and I certainly -- you know, when I was talking 10 about lawyers a little while ago, that didn't apply 11 to you. 12 Julia, thank you. Thank you for all the 13 work you do as well. 14 And I do want to -- I know I'm going to 15 leave out people. So I apologize if I've left you 16 out, but I do want to say, Director Chavez, thank 17 you so much. You know, I don't think I got a chance 18 to see you in person. And although I knew of you 19 and -- but I want to commend you for your leadership 20 and the team that you have built. 21 And, you know, I think one of the 22 successes of a good leader is the people that want 23 to work with you as a leader. And you certainly 24 have developed a strong team. So kudos to you and 25 to all the staff -- all your staff.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">334</p> <p>1 Continue to do just what you do, and I 2 know we're going to continue to see great things in 3 the future. 4 Thank you so much, everyone. And thank 5 you for your kind words. I'm going to miss working 6 with you. 7 Thank you. 8 THE CHAIR: Thanks, Commissioner Chavez. 9 Commissioner Robbins. 10 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Thank you. I, too, 11 have a couple of notes. But I just want to thank 12 people individually before I talk about that. 13 Beverly kind of took us by the hand when 14 we started four years ago -- and, for me, it was 15 five and a half years ago when I was appointed -- 16 but took me by the hand, showed me the ropes of the 17 way things are done here, and filling out forms and 18 everything. She was so nice because she'd bring us 19 our travel forms pre-filled out. All we had to do 20 was basically look at it and sign it and give it 21 back to her. 22 That was easier than DocuSign, you know? 23 DocuSign is good. I'm not putting it down. But, 24 boy, she took care of us. She spoiled us. She 25 really did. So thank you to her.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">336</p> <p>1 Going through -- Pattie is not here. But 2 her knowledge and everything was so valuable. And 3 when I first came on the Commission, because of 4 different political views and things like that and I 5 was appointed by the Governor, and people -- when I 6 was on here, I remember the first thing she asked 7 me. "Are you an educator?" 8 And I said, "Well, I was on the 9 Albuquerque School Board for four years, and I was 10 an adjunct professor at UNM for a period of over 11 15 years." 12 "Oh, okay." 13 That gave me some credence, I guess, you 14 know, that I was coming in with some sort of 15 approval. 16 Georgina is not here, but I appreciated 17 working with her, Ms. Davis, Commissioner Davis, and 18 the knowledge that she brought and the supports for 19 the Four Corners area and that area of the state. 20 Michael Taylor. Wasn't ever able to meet 21 him in person. I didn't get down to Ruidoso for 22 that meeting, and I am sorry that we would -- I was 23 happy to meet KT yesterday and today, and, you know, 24 will always be available for them and others. 25 Michael down there in Hatch and</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">335</p> <p>1 Corina and Brigitte, your leadership over 2 the last year or so, appreciate that. 3 Brigitte, you've done a yeoman's job of 4 going through all the forms and the editing and the 5 wordsmithing and -- oh, my goodness. I can't 6 imagine the hours that you've had to put in to do 7 that, but get us to where things make sense and get 8 rid of a lot of redundancies and things that weren't 9 necessary. 10 Corina, keeping us on track. Again, we 11 didn't always agree, but that's okay. I appreciate 12 your service. I appreciate your forward looking on 13 things and working to resolve issues and everything. 14 Missy, thank you. Appreciate keeping us 15 online when I've had to text you saying, "Hey, can 16 you bring me on the panel?" Or, "Hey, I've lost it, 17 I'm going to have to call in," or something like 18 that, you know, making sure that I had some sort of 19 connection when my Internet at home flaked out or my 20 router or something flaked out. It was always great 21 to know that you were there to help and everything. 22 I even want to give a shout-out to Tomás 23 down in IT. If I had issues or anything, I could 24 send him an e-mail or something like that, and he 25 was helpful, too.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">337</p> <p>1 everything, I really did appreciate working with 2 you, your knowledge, your expertise as a teacher, an 3 educator, a superintendent, boy, it's a wealth of 4 knowledge, and it really is appreciated. 5 Bekka -- Rebekka, Commissioner Burt, thank 6 you. I appreciate the kind comments that you gave 7 me. 8 We probably -- you probably are kinder 9 than I deserve, because I think sometimes our 10 conversations weren't -- didn't always end on a -- 11 you know, an up note. We agreed to disagree 12 sometimes, and that's okay. 13 That's one thing my mom -- she hated my 14 brothers and I. I had five brothers, and we would 15 always get into these discussions. And she'd say, 16 "You're yelling and you're arguing." 17 That's what you do when you're passionate, 18 okay? And so it's okay. Just don't be offensive. 19 Don't be cruel in your comments and things like 20 that. 21 Glenna, thank you for your knowledge, for 22 your background. You know, when I was on the APS 23 Board I know the charter school that you were at, 24 Media Arts, we had a little bit of interaction, or 25 you were aware of me, at least, because we were an</p>

338

1 authorizer then.

2 And I guess I left for last -- I'm going
3 to leave Steven for last.

4 But, Matt, I appreciate your support. I
5 appreciate -- Matt was one of the people that
6 interviewed me when the Governor was going to
7 appoint me. I mentioned that to him today that I
8 remember that five and a half years ago. So I get
9 to blame you for this, 'cause one of the things he
10 asked me was, "Are you willing for run for election
11 in 2018 if the Governor appoints you?"

12 Do you remember that comment? And I
13 paused, and I said, "Yeah, I guess so."

14 But thank you. And thank you for your
15 support for charter schools, and schools in general,
16 because education, I think, is the focus.

17 Melissa, thank you. Appreciate it.
18 Appreciate your nice comments, even though we didn't
19 get to work together a whole lot and everything,
20 just the last two years, and part of that was
21 virtual. I did appreciate and do appreciate what
22 you bring to the Commission.

23 Steven, last but not least, thank you, my
24 friend. I do call you a friend. I'm a Believer, a
25 Christian. And as a Jewish person, you're right up

339

1 there with me, man.

2 I -- you're one of my -- I consider you a
3 friend, you know. We can have those differences.
4 We can have different religious views. We can have
5 different political views and still get along with
6 people.

7 And I think that's -- we don't have enough
8 of that, getting along with people. You can have
9 differences and things like that. I did want to
10 just say, you know, those are my off-the-cuff
11 remarks.

12 I did prepare something. But there's a
13 quote that I wanted to use that George Washington
14 gave in his Farewell Address.

15 And I don't want to it taken in the wrong
16 way, because you have to remember the way things
17 were in this country 240 years ago, okay? And the
18 initial institutions in this country, the colleges,
19 Yale, Harvard, they were started as schools of
20 divinity; okay?

21 But George Washington said this, "Whatever
22 may be conceded to the influence of refined
23 education on the minds of peculiar structure, reason
24 and experience both forbid us to expect that
25 national morality can prevail in exclusion of

340

1 religious principle."

2 It doesn't mean you have to be rigid. But
3 having something that's beyond yourself that's
4 driving you, something that's beyond yourself that
5 you believe in is so important.

6 And that's the thing where I look at we
7 are all image bearers, bearers of a creator. And
8 that's how I view people. I don't view people as
9 black or white or green or yellow or anything. I
10 look at people that they were created in God's
11 image, the same as I. They are no greater, and
12 especially no lesser than I am.

13 One of the principles to ensure students'
14 engagement and success is for students to have a
15 passion in the material to which they are exposed.
16 I know I have at times been overbearing and
17 aggressive and pressing for certain issues and
18 principles. Some may have misinterpreted my
19 demeanor as anger.

20 But it is passion, passion to fulfill the
21 range of duties and obligations of an elected Public
22 Education Commissioner, passion to press for the
23 best educational outcomes for our students and their
24 families, and passion for accountability to the
25 students of New Mexico, the citizens of New Mexico,

341

1 and for continuing the investments in education.

2 We have not always been in agreement, and
3 every decision -- with every decision in this
4 Commission, and I respect the diverse views and
5 appreciate the opportunity to learn from and work
6 with each of you, because I have learned.

7 You know, one of the things that I said
8 years ago, life is a learning process. You don't
9 stop learning just because you graduate high school
10 or graduate from college. When you stop learning,
11 you stop living. So continue to learn, each and
12 every one of you.

13 Best wishes and prayers to each of you.
14 Merry Christmas, Happy Hanukkah, and Happy New Year.
15 God bless you.

16 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Commissioner
17 Robbins.

18 And Commissioner Voigt.

19 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Okay. Thank you.
20 I'm just going to say that never in my life did I
21 ever think I would serve on the PEC.

22 I used to sit down at that table. I
23 thought, Oh, my God. But it's been -- it's been a
24 great experience. I've truly enjoyed it. I've
25 learned a lot. I've learned a lot of patience and a

342	<p>1 lot of tolerance, and it's been -- it has been fun. 2 It's been a great experience. And I love everybody 3 at this table and on the screen. 4 I'm going to lose it, okay? Am I the 5 first Commissioner that's ever cried at a meeting? 6 Okay. Good. Good. I don't want to have that 7 reputation. 8 I just want to say education and knowledge 9 are really important. But without action, they're 10 meaningless. So just put that in your back pocket 11 for the weekend. 12 But I appreciate everyone. I don't want 13 to take a lot of time. I gave you all personalized 14 cards, so that's really where my heart is. But I 15 thank each and every one of you, and I love you. 16 THE CHAIR: Good job, Commissioner Voigt. 17 And I don't know if you know, but you have 18 cried before already. 19 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: I was going to say -- 20 THE CHAIR: So, okay, I don't know why 21 today would be different. I'm just throwing that 22 out there. Yeah. You're good. All right. 23 Okay. Well, that'll take us to Item 18, 24 PEC Comments. This is no discussion or action taken 25 Ken. If any Commissioners would like to speak,</p>	344	<p>1 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Forgot, and I shut 2 down everything. So yes, hold on. 3 Secretary Armijo votes yes. 4 Chair Burt. 5 THE CHAIR: Yes. 6 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner 7 Carrillo. 8 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Yes. To adjourn? 9 Sure. 10 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Commissioner Chavez. 11 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: I'm going to vote 12 no. 13 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: For the record, a 14 vote no? Is that for real? 15 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: No, no, no. I'll 16 vote yes. Let me change that. 17 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Is Commissioner 18 Manis still on? Commissioner Manis. 19 COMMISSIONER MANIS: Yes. 20 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Thank you. 21 Commissioner Robbins. 22 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: Yes. 23 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: Vice Chair Voigt. 24 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Yes. 25 COMMISSIONER ARMIJO: That passes, seven</p>
343	<p>1 please raise your hand. 2 Commissioner Robbins? 3 COMMISSIONER ROBBINS: I think I left out 4 Julia. 5 Thank you. No. I gave you a card. But 6 in my comments, I forgot to thank you for your 7 support of this Commission and listening to me. 8 Thank you for that. 9 THE CHAIR: All right. Seeing no other, 10 any discussion of any business topics for the next 11 agenda? Commissioner Carrillo. 12 COMMISSIONER CARRILLO: Okay. Mabry 13 update. 14 THE CHAIR: Mabry update. I'll second 15 that. 16 I also want to just confirm Commissioner 17 Gipson and I had talked about an -- a, quote, review 18 of Epicenter and an Epicenter presentation. So if I 19 could get a second on that. 20 COMMISSIONER VOIGT: Second. 21 THE CHAIR: Thank you. Okay. 22 So that'll be January meeting. 23 And last is adjourn. And I move to 24 adjourn. And, Secretary Armijo, if you could take 25 roll.</p>	345	<p>1 to zero. Thank you. 2 (Proceedings adjourned at 4:54 p.m.) 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25</p>

BEFORE THE PUBLIC EDUCATION COMMISSION
STATE OF NEW MEXICO

REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE

I, Cynthia C. Chapman, RMR, CCR #219, Certified Court Reporter in the State of New Mexico, do hereby certify that the foregoing pages constitute a true transcript of proceedings had before the said NEW MEXICO PUBLIC EDUCATION COMMISSION, held in the State of New Mexico, in the matter therein stated.

In testimony whereof, I have hereunto set my hand on December 29th, 2022.

Cynthia C. Chapman, RMR-CRR, NM CCR #219
BEAN & ASSOCIATES, INC.
201 Third Street, NW, Suite 1630
Albuquerque, New Mexico 87102
License Expires: December 31, 2023

Job No.: 6338N (CC)

RECEIPT

JOB NUMBER: 6338N CC Date: December 16, 2022

PROCEEDINGS: Open Public Meeting

CASE CAPTION: Transcript of Proceedings

ATTORNEY: MS. BEVERLY FRIEDMAN, NMPED

DOCUMENT: Transcript / Exhibits / Disks / Other _____

DATE DELIVERED: _____ DEL'D BY: _____

REC'D BY: _____ TIME: _____

ATTORNEY:

DOCUMENT: Transcript / Exhibits / Disks / Other _____

DATE DELIVERED: _____ DEL'D BY: _____

REC'D BY: _____ TIME: _____

ATTORNEY:

DOCUMENT: Transcript / Exhibits / Disks / Other _____

DATE DELIVERED: _____ DEL'D BY: _____

REC'D BY: _____ TIME: _____

ATTORNEY:

DOCUMENT: Transcript / Exhibits / Disks / Other _____

DATE DELIVERED: _____ DEL'D BY: _____

REC'D BY: _____ TIME: _____

1 BEFORE THE PUBLIC EDUCATION COMMISSION

2 STATE OF NEW MEXICO

3
4
5 REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE

6 I, Cynthia C. Chapman, RMR, CCR #219, Certified
7 Court Reporter in the State of New Mexico, do hereby
8 certify that the foregoing pages constitute a true
9 transcript of proceedings had before the said NEW
10 MEXICO PUBLIC EDUCATION COMMISSION, held in the State
11 of New Mexico, in the matter therein stated.

12 In testimony whereof, I have hereunto set my
13 hand on December 29th, 2022.

14
15
16 *Cynthia Chapman*

17 Cynthia C. Chapman, RMR-CRR, NM CCR #219
18 BEAN & ASSOCIATES, INC.
19 201 Third Street, NW, Suite 1630
20 Albuquerque, New Mexico 87102
21 License Expires: December 31, 2023

22
23
24 Job No.: 6338N (CC)

25

SANTA FE OFFICE
119 East Marcy, Suite 110
Santa Fe, NM 87501
(505) 989-4949
FAX (505) 843-9492

BEAN
& ASSOCIATES, Inc.
A
PROFESSIONAL COURT
REPORTING SERVICE

MAIN OFFICE
201 Third NW, Suite 1630
Albuquerque, NM 87102
(505) 843-9494
FAX (505) 843-9492
1-800-669-9492
e-mail: info@litsupport.com